

THE SCOTTISH CONTEXT OF L.M. MONTGOMERY

JENNIFER H. LITSTER

**PhD
The University of Edinburgh
2000**



Contents

Abstract	iv
Acknowledgements	v
Abbreviations	viii

INTRODUCTION

“The Diamond in the Coronet”	1
------------------------------	---

PART I. L.M. MONTGOMERY AND SCOTLAND

i. No Place Like Home?	20
ii. “The Fates and a Woman’s Will”	34
iii. “The Chosen People”	65

PART II. CLAN OR COMMUNITY NOVELS?

i. “Stories of the Days Gone By”	107
ii. “Greats and Grands of Every Degree”	139
iii. Love Thy Neighbour?	182

PART III. BELIEF IN L.M. MONTGOMERY’S FICTION

i. “Matters of Predestination”	232
ii. “Onward into Fairy Land”	256

PART IV. SCOTTISH “VOICE” AND “PLACE”

- | | |
|---|-----|
| i. “As the Scots Would Say” | 279 |
| ii. “Heather doesn’t grow in America, does it?” | 307 |

CONCLUSION

Road from the Island	336
----------------------	-----

Bibliography	348
--------------	-----

Appendix A. “An Annotated <i>Anne</i> : The History and the Dream.”	367
---	-----

Appendix B. “The End of Canadian Innocence: L.M. Montgomery and the First World War.”	378
---	-----

Abstract

This thesis is the first full-length study to assess the impact of the Scottish diaspora in Canada through the writing of Canadian author L.M. Montgomery [1874-1942]. Scottish legacies are key to Montgomery's identity, and a pivotal force in her writing.

L.M. Montgomery's clan and community genealogies are retraced in a threefold examination of roots. Family legends are analysed with reference to Scottish migration to Prince Edward Island, Montgomery's native province and favoured fictional setting. This thesis aims to provide a more accurate picture of Montgomery's background, and questions some of her assumptions about her Lowland Scots heritage. Integral to each strand is the Canadian context that endorses Montgomery's Scots progenitors as "a chosen people".

This legacy becomes the central motif in Montgomery's fiction. This thesis establishes a new critical framework to facilitate the study of this superiority complex, classifying Montgomery's books as either *community* or *clan* novels. It argues that Montgomery's first novel, *Anne of Green Gables* [1908], is not a model for *all* her subsequent fiction, only those books where community is primary. She diversifies from the "Anne" genre in novels where clan is central, and Scottish family history and folklore increasingly important. This trend is consolidated in the autobiographical "Emily" trilogy, where Scottish roots are expressly an essential component of the heroine's Canadian identity.

L.M. Montgomery achieved commercial success partly by attuning her work to existing literary markets. Her antecedents in popular *juvenile* literature are significant, but her books and stories also appealed to an *adult* audience conversant with "local color" writing. This thesis finds parallels between Montgomery's "regional idylls" and those of the popular Scottish authors, J.M. Barrie and Ian Maclaren. Montgomery perceives elements of her Canadian childhood in their books, but adds ironic subtexts when echoing the "Kailyard" world in her fiction.

The Scottish milieu in Montgomery's work is neither static nor sentimental. The First World War had an enormous impact on Montgomery personally and on Canadian society. Montgomery's fiction grapples with a new focus on national identity instigated in post-war Canada. In some books, old country antecedents recede, or become contrived. More often, Montgomery imports a darker, more divisive, and less idealistic Scottish heritage, particularly as regards Scottish Presbyterianism.

In the inter-war years, Montgomery advocated the preservation of family lore and oral history in order to protect and celebrate Canadian diversity. Scottish customs—Presbyterian faith, folk beliefs, literary and linguistic traditions, clan and community connections—lie at the heart of her Canadian romance and Canadian realism.

Acknowledgements

The length of the following list is not only evidence of an overlong production period, but of the generous and enthusiastic help I have found offered at every turn in the world of L.M. Montgomery scholarship and from the world of L.M. Montgomery readers, from more people, indeed, than can possibly be named below.

Thanks go firstly to my funding bodies: to the University of Edinburgh who awarded me a Vans Dunlop Scholarship for the first year of study, and to the Student Awards Agency for Scotland, for two years of funding and a travel grant for my research trip to Canada in 1994, to which the Centre of Canadian Studies also made a contribution.

In Edinburgh, the greatest debt is owed to my thesis supervisors, Owen Dudley Edwards and Dr. Margaret Bennett, who have consistently provided eager support, intelligent discussion, and, just as importantly, many laughs. Furthermore, students in Owen's North American Literature and Society classes have contributed several insights on *Anne* and *Rilla* over the years, and Margaret's course in Scottish Custom and Belief was a vital part of my learning. Thanks in this respect are also due to Edinburgh University's Centre for Canadian Studies, especially Prof. Ged Martin and the 1992-3 team, who allowed me to sit in their classes, where my compatriots in Canadian Studies, particularly Alison, Charlie, and Heather, were boon companions. I have received considerable encouragement from the staff in the History Department, both as an undergraduate and postgraduate, and latterly from my colleagues and students in American History. The "Scotch films" club of fellow historians and parlour-game enthusiasts, lauded now as Drs Stephen Bowd, Mog Grenby, and Henry Knox, kept me sane (if having to wear a plastic moustache on St Uncumber's Day can be described as sane) and remain wonderful sparring partners and true friends. Staff in Edinburgh's University Library, Central Public Library, and the National Library of Scotland have, of course, been an essential resource.

In Prince Edward Island, I am grateful to the organisers and delegates of the 1994 International Symposium on L.M. Montgomery, particularly Anna Macdonald and Dr. Elizabeth Epperly at the L.M. Montgomery Institute, and indeed to all who have worked at the LMM Institute since its inception in 1993 (Dr. Claire Fawcett, Dr. Irene Gammel, Deirdre Kessler, Heather Ludlow, Dianne Morrow). No one could wish for a better companion than Annika Brånemark when searching for Herman Leard's grave. Thanks also go to Harry Baglole and the Institute of Island Studies, Kevin Rice and the Confederation Centre Museum, staff at the Provincial Archives, the PEI public and university libraries, the Hon. Heath Macquarrie and Mrs Macquarrie, Father Bolger, and my roommate Heidi Macdonald (for introducing me to Bill's Country Jamboree). Ken MacKinnon of St Mary's University, and George

Bennett, drove me to various Island locations in search of Scottish folkways. Thanks also to those connected with the L.M. Montgomery museums and heritage sites—George Campbell and family at Park Corner, Edith Smith at Montgomery Manor, and especially John and Jennie Macneill, whose recollections of old Cavendish have shaped some of this thesis, and whose sympathetic preservation of the site of L.M. Montgomery's Cavendish home is an inspiration to us all.

Since I first thrust a dictionary of the Scots language into her hands in Charlottetown, Dr Mary Rubio has willingly offered advice, encouragement, and friendship, moreover the opportunity to be involved with work on the publication of Montgomery's journals. My visit to Guelph was made all the more academically and personally productive with her help. The late Jerry Rubio was an inspiration, and a chef of the highest order, who will be sorely missed by all who knew him. Prof. Elizabeth Waterston has also been extremely supportive and a fun and rewarding person to work with. The English Department at Guelph—especially Cathy Kerrigan, Katie Donohue and Kristyn Dunnion—made me very welcome throughout my stay. Thanks also to the staff at the Archives of the McLaughlin Library at Guelph, which houses the L.M. Montgomery Collection, to Bernard Katz (Head of Archival and Special Collections) for his work in wading through my oceans of journal quotations, to Marian Hebb (Lawyer for the L.M. Montgomery Estate) and to the Macdonald family, particularly Ruth Macdonald and Kate Macdonald Butler.

In cyber-space, the Kindred Spirits e-mail list serve, moderated by the LMM Institute, has offered thought-provoking discussions and hectic arguments (“did they or didn’t they?”!) whenever I’ve tuned in. There are far too many stalwarts of this list (and of Jason’s, Yuka’s, and Ben’s LMM academic list) to mention each by name, but KS-ers Carol “Spud” Dobson, Ona Bjornson, and Gabrielle Ceraldi were keen benefactors, as were all who sent me cookie recipes in my hour of need. Also integral to this thesis were those who have swapped information by e-mail, or answered my (usually fatuous) questions: Kevin McCabe at Brock University, Jack and Linda Hutton in Bala, Paul and Hildi Tiessen, Gabriella Åhmannson, and Beth Cavert, whose “Isabel ellipses” had me in stitches. Most of all, much gratitude, love, and appreciation go out to Benjamin Lefebvre, my cyber-space-husband-of-sorts and a true Josephian—watch out for “Anne’s House of Horrors”!

My friends are long-suffering. I owe most of the following lunch, and two lunches to those who put down their Harry Potters long enough to read *Anne of Green Gables*: David Adger and Anson Mackay, Evan Jones, Elaine Wilson and Mark Campanile, Lizzie Cadogan (my computer benefactress with stars round her name), Mary Macleod, Karen Ingram, “my cousin Lynn”, Ian Marlee, Moya Wilkie, Michael Bradley, Eddie McCann, Shari Trewin, Marwan Zoubie, Lee Adger and family, Waterstone’s ca. 1994, the Focal Point gang, Anna Dunwoodie, the many residents and friends of 87 Micklegate York, Della and Ian next-door, Nadia Jones, Stuart Raine, Linda Jackson, Louise West and James Evans, Erica Randall, Fiona Stalker, and Christopher Bryant. Lastly, poor Kate Moss—“the miserable cat”—who has tolerated (just about) my inferior housekeeping from A to Z of this thesis.

The consolation my friends have is that my family have suffered longer, and, in the case of my parents, Tom and Alison Litster, to greater financial detriment. To them, and my sister Andrea, I owe many thanks in many ways.

Quotations from *The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery*, Volumes I, II, III and IV © 1985, 1987, 1992, 1998 University of Guelph, ed. by Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston, and published by Oxford University Press Canada, are reproduced with the permission of Mary Rubio, Elizabeth Waterston and the University of Guelph, courtesy of the L.M. Montgomery Collection, Archival and Special Collections, University of Guelph Library.

Quotations from the unpublished *Journals* of L.M. Montgomery, © University of Guelph, are reproduced courtesy of the L.M. Montgomery Collection, Archival and Special Collections, University of Guelph Library.

Quotations from the unpublished ms. of "The Blythes are Quoted", © Ruth and David Macdonald, are reproduced with kind permission of the Heirs of L.M. Montgomery.

This thesis is dedicated, with much love and admiration, to Owen Dudley Edwards.

Abbreviations

Nora Lefurgey	NL
Ewan Macdonald	EM
George Boyd MacMillan	GBM
L.M. Montgomery	LMM
Ephraim Weber	EW
Public Archives of Prince Edward Island	PAPEI
University of Guelph	UG
National Archives of Canada	NAC
University of Prince Edward Island	UPEI
<i>Canadian Children's Literature</i>	<i>CCL</i>
<i>The Island Magazine</i>	<i>IM</i>
<i>The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery</i>	<i>SJ</i>
<i>Harvesting Thistles</i>	<i>HT</i>
<i>Anne of Green Gables</i>	<i>AGG</i>
<i>Anne of Avonlea</i>	<i>AA</i>
<i>Kilmeny of the Orchard</i>	<i>KO</i>
<i>The Story Girl</i>	<i>TSG</i>
<i>Chronicles of Avonlea</i>	<i>CA</i>
<i>The Golden Road</i>	<i>TGR</i>
<i>Anne of the Island</i>	<i>Als</i>
<i>Anne's House of Dreams</i>	<i>AHD</i>
<i>Rainbow Valley</i>	<i>RV</i>
<i>Further Chronicles of Avonlea</i>	<i>FCA</i>
<i>Rilla of Ingleside</i>	<i>RI</i>
<i>Emily of New Moon</i>	<i>ENM</i>
<i>Emily Climbs</i>	<i>EC</i>
<i>The Blue Castle</i>	<i>TBC</i>
<i>Emily's Quest</i>	<i>EQ</i>
<i>Magic for Marigold</i>	<i>MFM</i>
<i>A Tangled Web</i>	<i>ATW</i>
<i>Pat of Silver Bush</i>	<i>PSB</i>
<i>Mistress Pat</i>	<i>MP</i>
<i>Anne of Windy Willows</i>	<i>AWW</i>

<i>Jane of Lantern Hill</i>	<i>JLH</i>
<i>Anne of Ingleside</i>	<i>Aln</i>
<i>The Road to Yesterday</i>	<i>TRY</i>
<i>The Doctor's Sweetheart, and Other Stories</i>	<i>TDS</i>
<i>Akin to Anne: Tales of Other Orphans</i>	<i>ATA</i>
<i>Along the Shore: Tales by the Sea</i>	<i>Shore</i>
<i>Among the Shadows</i>	<i>Shadows</i>
<i>After Many Days: Tales of Times Past</i>	<i>AMD</i>
<i>Against the Odds: Tales of Achievement</i>	<i>ATO</i>
<i>At the Altar: Matrimonial Tales</i>	<i>Altar</i>
<i>Christmas with Anne, and Other Holiday Stories</i>	<i>CWA</i>
<i>Across the Miles: Tales of Correspondence</i>	<i>ATM</i>
<i>The Alpine Path</i>	<i>TAP</i>

INTRODUCTION

“The diamond in the coronet”

Prince Edward Island is the smallest province in the Dominion—the diamond in the coronet of our colonial empire [...] It is a land where nobody is very rich and nobody is very poor. A land which, being somewhat out of the beaten track, is, it may be, a bit old-fashioned. A land where you are born into a certain political party and live and die and go to heaven in it. A land where you can still find real grandmothers and genuine old-maid aunts. A land where it is still held to be a great feather in a family's cap if it has a minister among its boys; a land that has a trick of raising university presidents and international ambassadors for export; a land where the ten commandments are still considered fairly up-to-date; but a land where it would be safer to smash all those commandments at once than be caught without three kinds of cake when company comes to tea.¹

Prince Edward Island, one hundred and thirty miles long and between two and thirty-five miles wide, is Canada's smallest province. Beautiful for situation, a few miles from the coasts of Nova Scotia and New Brunswick in the Gulf of St Lawrence, Île St Jean was formally ceded from French to British rule under the Treaty of Paris in 1763.² At this date the colony supported few inhabitants. Some native Mi'kmaq people continued to live in “Abegweit”, along with around three hundred Acadians, who escaped a forced expulsion in 1758 by hiding in the dense forest which then covered the island later crowned as “The Million Acre Farm”.

On 23 July 1767, after various proposals had been rejected—notably memorials presented by would-be laird, the Earl of Egmont—a ballot was held to distribute the Island, neatly divided into sixty-seven 20, 000 acre lots, between the

¹ L.M. Montgomery. Reply to the PEI Toast, Canadian Women's Press Club Triennial, June 1926 (*SJ* III [June 28, 1926] 296).

² The Mi'kmaq name for the Island is Abegweit. Known as Île St Jean during French occupation this was translated to the Island of St John (and occasionally St John's Island) on transfer to British rule. In February, 1799, royal approval was given to the name Prince Edward Island (after Prince Edward, Duke of Kent, son of George III), a change principally taken to avoid confusion with the many other “St John” place names on the eastern seaboard (A.B. Warburton. *A History of Prince Edward Island*. St John, N.B., 1923: 268). Prince Edward Island is commonly referred to (and this thesis follows suit) as “PEI” or “the Island”.

many claimants.³ As terms of ownership, the new proprietors agreed that quitrents would be paid to the Crown, land on each lot would be set aside for church and glebe and schoolmaster, and each lot would be settled within ten years, proportional to one person per two hundred acres. These settlers could be Protestants from outwith the British Empire, or else American Protestants, who could resettle on the Island providing they had been resident in those colonies for two years or more. Proprietors who failed to settle one-third of their lot within four years would forfeit their land.

Neither the fulfilment of these conditions, nor mass forfeiture, took place. The proprietors, mostly absentee, encouraged few settlers. The subsequent struggles over rent payment and land-ownership—commonly referred to as “the land question”—were to be a central feature of Prince Edward Island’s history until her confederation into the Dominion of Canada in 1873.⁴ By 1798, the population of PEI was only 4,372.⁵ Furthermore, as those proprietors who did bring settlers ran contrary to stipulation, Prince Edward Island became populated principally with Scottish, English, and Irish people, of Roman Catholic as well as Protestant faith. These settlers in turn encouraged and enticed more citizens from the British Isles, who moved to the New World as individuals, families, and sometimes entire communities. Others came under their own volition, and the attitude of the home government, once so fearful of depopulation, suffered a sea-change to accept and later “assist” this migration.

From these inauspicious beginnings, certainly in terms of the British government’s early colonial strategy, PEI gradually prospered until it became the most densely populated Canadian province, totalling 103,259 souls in 1901. Of these, Scots, or those of Scottish descent, were by far the largest ethnic group, numbering 41,753 to the English 24,043, Irish 21,992 and French 13,867.⁶ Scots came to Prince Edward Island in large numbers from the Western Highlands and Islands, Northern Argyll and Perthshire; in lesser numbers from the low-lying regions

³ These divisions were fixed by cartographer, Samuel Holland, in his 1765 survey of the Island.

⁴ In 1867, Prince Edward Islanders voted to reject the 1864 Quebec Resolutions for Confederation. However, massive debts, largely occasioned by an over-ambitious railway building project, forced a reconsideration and confederation six years later.

⁵ The census of 1798 is missing, but the figures survive in Duncan Campbell. *History of Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: Bremner, 1875. In 1798, Scots aggregated roughly half the population. Basing his conclusions on surnames, Andrew Hill Clark calculated that of the 2,124 Scots listed, 1,814 were Highlanders, and 310 Lowlanders. *Three Centuries and the Island: A Historical Geography of Settlement and Agriculture in Prince Edward Island*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1959: 60-61.

⁶ *Encyclopaedia Britannica* 11th edition. Most Irish and French settlers, as well as around a third of Scottish settlers, were Roman Catholics, making Catholicism the largest religious denomination in 1901. Figures for religious denominations as of 1901 are: Roman Catholic—45,796, Presbyterian—30,750, Methodist—13,402, Church of England—5976, Baptist—5905.

of Dumfriesshire and Kirkcudbright.⁷ Today, PEI still can class itself as the most “Scottish” of Canadian provinces, with one third of the population claiming to be of Scottish extraction.⁸

In 1908, *Anne of Green Gables*, a novel written by a PEI woman of Scots descent and set in a Scottish-Presbyterian Island community, put Prince Edward Island “on the literary map of the world” (*SJ* I, xiii). An instant best-seller, *Anne* merited five editions in as many months, clocking up sales of 20,061 in 1908; a figure which doubled the following year.⁹ The orphan protagonist, Anne Shirley, has become “a bona fide hero: a free-standing character who is not simply contained in a work of the imagination but ranges across the cultural landscape”.¹⁰ Her “scope for imagination” and “kindred spirits” and “Anne spelled with an e” are phrases as famous in children’s literature as “Please, sir, I want some more” and “just being glad” and “I’ll thcream and thcream and thcream till I’m thick”. The image of her white freckled-face with red pig-tails under a brown sailor-hat is now an icon on license plates, postage stamps, and bags of potato chips. This face is even a registered trademark.

The author of *Anne*, L.M. Montgomery, was born on 30 November—St Andrew’s Day—1874, in the village of Clifton (now New London), on the north shore of Prince Edward Island. The daughter of Hugh John Montgomery and Clara Woolner Macneill, Lucy Maud Montgomery (always called Maud, never Lucy) was born into two proud families that traced their Island roots back to the earliest days of British settlement. L.M. Montgomery was, in her words, “of Scotch ancestry with a dash of English from several ‘grands’ and ‘greats’” (*TAP* 11), a lineage, an upbringing, and a sensibility that would prove of central importance to her writing. Her Island years were largely spent in the village of Cavendish, founded by her ancestors in 1790 and “settled with the descendants of old Scotch (Lowland) emigrants—Macneills, Simpsons, Clarks, McKenzies, Robertsons, Stewarts—don’t they smack of the heather” (*My Dear Mr. M* 6-7).

⁷ Mike Kennedy. *Is Leis an Tighearna An Talamh Agus An Lan (The Earth and all it Contains Belongs to God): The Scottish Gaelic Settlement History of Prince Edward Island*. PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1995. Kennedy identifies five Scottish regions whence large numbers of migrants to PEI came: the Catholic Gaidhealtachd of Moidart, Morar, Lochaber, the Small Isles, Barra, South Uist, Benbecula; the Sound of Raasay—east Skye, Raasay, Rona, north west Inverness-shire, Wester Ross; Northern Argyll—Mull, Colonsay, Coll, Morvern; Perthshire; North West Sutherland. Non-Gaelic migrants came chiefly from Dumfriesshire and Kirkcudbright.

⁸ Boyde Beck. *The Isle of Contentment: The Scots on PEI*. Charlottetown: Prince Edward Island Museum and Heritage Foundation, 1991: 1.

⁹ Figures from L.M. Montgomery’s [hereafter LMM] Book Sales’ Ledger, University of Guelph [UG]. The sales figure for 1909 was 43,754.

¹⁰ Adèle Geras. “Just Wild About Harry”. *The Scotsman*. 8 July 1999: 13.

This thesis examines the Scottish background informing the life and work of the woman who became, in her time, Canada's most famous author.¹¹

An Author's Life and Writing

Clara Woolner Macneill died on 14 September 1876, aged twenty-three. Hugh John Montgomery, twelve years her senior, did not assume the task of rearing their only child. Twenty-one month old Maud was fostered out to her maternal grandparents in Cavendish. Alexander Marquis Macneill [1820-1898] and English-born Lucy Ann Woolner [1824-1911] had raised six children of their own and were apparently disinclined to raise a seventh. In their mid-fifties, they were apparently set in ways their ebullient and imaginative granddaughter would find both intolerant and cold-hearted. Her childhood was not "actually unhappy [...] but never as happy as childhood should be" (*SJ I* [Jan. 2, 1905] 301), for what this environment lacked in love it made up for in carping and control. The "impulsive, warm-hearted, emotional" child escaped into "the world of nature and the world of books" (*ibid.*).

Already periodically separated from his young daughter on a series of ill-fated vocations, Hugh John Montgomery migrated permanently to the Canadian West in 1881. He settled in Prince Albert, N.W.T. (now Saskatchewan) and married Mary Ann McRae in 1887.¹² Hugh John's contact with "Maudie" before his death in 1900 was limited, although she protested, "we never grew apart, as some might have done" (*SJ I* [May 1, 1900] 249). She made one long trip west [1890-91], but due to immediate mutual hostilities with her step-mother decided not make to a new home there. On the Island, however, she was not isolated from her father's family. She particularly enjoyed the company of her elderly grandfather, Senator Donald Montgomery [1808-1893], and her Campbell cousins at Park Corner, who were related to both Macneills and Montgomerys.¹³

¹¹ In 1923 LMM noted that she had been made a "Fellow" of the Royal Society of Arts of Great Britain, "the first Canadian woman to whom this honor has been offered" (*SJ III* [Jan. 28, 1923] 111) and that the readers of the *Toronto Star* had voted her one of the twelve greatest women in Canada: "I am not 'great' and neither are most of the twelve. But of course if the competition had been avowedly what it really was, a questionnaire as to the most *widely-known* woman in Canada, I certainly am one and perhaps *the* most widely known" (*SJ III* [Apr. 1, 1923] 120). In 1935 she was elected to the Literary and Artistic Institute of France, and awarded an O.B.E. by George V, on the recommendation of PM Stanley Baldwin. In a December 1999 CBC internet poll, LMM was voted the most influential twentieth-century Canadian writer.

¹² Hugh John had four children with his second wife—Kate, Bruce, Ila, and Carlyle.

¹³ John Campbell was the son of Senator Montgomery's sister Elizabeth. His wife, Annie Macneill, was Clara Woolner Macneill's sister. Their children Stella, Clara, George, and Frederica (Frede) Campbell were LMM's first cousins; the "merry cousins" as she styled them.

Maud Montgomery's personal diplomacy notwithstanding, considerable animosity flourished between the two clans. The Macneills and the Montgomerys shared Scottish ancestry and a long Island history, but swore opposing political allegiance (the Macneills were staunch Liberals, the Montgomerys Conservatives) and differed in the strictness and practice of their Presbyterian faith. L.M. Montgomery explained these incompatibilities as deep-seated, and believed they bequeathed to her "a very uncomfortable blend in my make-up—the passionate Montgomery blood and the Puritan Macneill conscience" (*SJI* [April 8, 1898] 213). Both puritanism (or vigorous but dour Presbyterianism) and passion (or romance) became pivotal Scottish legacies and cultural markers in L.M. Montgomery's fiction.

Maud Montgomery was educated in a one-room school in Cavendish. In 1893 she entered Prince of Wales College, Charlottetown, to study for her teacher's certificate. Her first teaching post [1894-1895] was at Bideford, in western PEI. Using one hundred dollars saved from her salary (and additional financial help from her Grandmother Macneill) Montgomery enrolled at Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia in September 1895. She registered for a specially selected course in English, thinking it would nurture her long-held ambition to be a writer, enable her to secure better schools, and perhaps lead to a post in journalism.¹⁴ In Halifax, Montgomery received her first payment for a story. Back on the Island in the summer of 1896, her spare hours were increasingly occupied with writing verse and stories.¹⁵ From 1896-1897 Montgomery taught in Belmont, PEI, to pupils she considered poor, rough, and ignorant. Compounding her misery, she accepted a marriage proposal from her second cousin, Edwin Simpson. She instantly regretted her decision, but unable to extricate herself, fell headlong into the first serious depressive episode of her life.

Montgomery spent the summer of 1897 in Cavendish before eventually securing her next teaching post on the Island's south shore.¹⁶ Lower Bedeque was mainly populated by descendants of United Empire Loyalist (UEL) settlers. Maud Montgomery fell in love with the son (Herman Leard) of the farmer at whose home she boarded. She would always described this "romance" as the most passionate and powerful of her life, yet insisted in her journal that marriage to this "nice, attractive

¹⁴ LMM later came to regret the whole Halifax experiment as "a waste of time and money" (*SJI* [Jan. 7, 1910] 390) and is curiously vague about the city in *Anne of the Island*.

¹⁵ LMM was not paid for her first short-story, "A Baking of Gingersnaps", published in the *Toronto Ladies Journal* in July 1895. Her second published story, "Our Charivari", earned the sum of five dollars from *Golden Days* of Philadelphia.

¹⁶ Alexander Macneill had scant regard for teachers as a class—female teachers in particular—and contrived to make it difficult for his granddaughter to present herself in person before trustees by refusing to lend her a horse.

young animal” (*SJ I* [Apr. 8, 1898] 209) was never a possible outcome. Virtue still intact, Montgomery returned to Cavendish in March of 1898, in the wake of her Grandfather Macneill’s sudden death. She ended both her engagement and her illicit affair at this time.¹⁷

Alexander Marquis Macneill willed the old Cavendish home to his son, John Franklin, with the proviso that his widow could continue living on the homestead. Now in her early seventies, Lucy Woolner required assistance from her young granddaughter. The narrow round of village life often left Maud Montgomery frustrated and unhappy, but she persisted with her writing career, and was rewarded with increasing success. From September 1901 to June 1902, cousin Prescott Macneill was seconded into the Macneill homestead while Montgomery was employed as “a proof-reader and general handy-man” (*SJ I* [Nov. 13, 1901] 264) on the *Halifax Daily Echo*.¹⁸ Montgomery relished the all-male environment of the newsroom, but as Grandmother Macneill and Prescott had wearied of each other’s company, could not accept an extension to her contract, and her journalistic career folded.

Back in Cavendish, Montgomery found little intellectual stimulus among her neighbours and friends. Her social life was curtailed in due proportion to her grandmother’s increasing frailty and irritability. Lacking genial companionship, Maud Montgomery felt imprisoned, particularly in the winter months. Her courtship with Cavendish’s young Highland-Scots minister, and even the critical and phenomenal popular success of her first novel, only temporarily alleviated her depressions. Montgomery became engaged to the Rev Ewan Macdonald [b. 1870] in October 1906, although marriage was postponed until such a time as Maud would be free. Ewan Macdonald left Cavendish that year to study in Scotland.¹⁹

“Grandma Macneill” died of pneumonia on 10 March 1911. Maud Montgomery left the old home instantanly, and decamped to the Campbell farm at Park Corner. She and Ewan were married there on 5 July, and left the Island the following day for Montreal, whence to Liverpool, for a two month honeymoon in England and Scotland. Ewan had accepted the charge of Leaskdale and Zephyr early in 1910, and it was in Leaskdale, some sixty miles north-east of Toronto, that the couple spent the next fifteen years. Their first three years there were largely contented ones and

¹⁷ Herman Leard died of influenza in the summer of 1899, at the age of twenty-eight. Edwin Simpson married twice and died in 1949.

¹⁸ Under the by-line “Cynthia”, LMM scribed a weekly column, “Around the Tea-Table”, for the newspaper.

¹⁹ Ewan Macdonald (hereafter EM) returned to PEI in April 1907, but settled in the west of the Island at Bloomfield, so LMM seldom saw him.

Montgomery gave birth to their first child, Chester Cameron, on 7 July 1912. In 1913 she visited the Island on the first of many vacations back “home”.

The outbreak of war on 4 August 1914, and the still-birth of their second son, Hugh Alexander, nine days later, ushered in years of despair. The birth of the Macdonalds’ third child, Ewan Stuart (known as Stuart), on 7 October 1915, brought some sunshine. Yet even the armistice proffered no more than cursory respite, for the “Spanish flu” epidemic was sweeping Canada. Maud Montgomery almost died in December 1918, and her most-beloved cousin, Frede Campbell, did die, on 25 January 1919. Montgomery had scarcely begun to grasp this shock when, in May 1919, Ewan Macdonald displayed symptoms of a severe “nervous breakdown”. Ewan was suffering from “religious melancholia” and when so afflicted laboured under the apprehension that he was eternally damned. The ramifications of these two events, particularly Ewan’s recurrent mental health problems, would be dramatic and long-reaching.

In these Leaskdale years, L.M. Montgomery juggled the onerous and tiresome duties of a minister’s wife with motherhood and writing. By 1921, Montgomery had earned around one hundred thousand dollars by her pen (*SJ* II [Feb. 10, 1921] 401). Authorship and fame were not all plain sailing, however. From 1916 until 1928 Montgomery was involved in legal quarrels—and after 1919, litigation—with her publisher, L.C. Page & Co. of Boston, attempting firstly to extricate herself from a meagre contract, and secondly to halt the publication of the short-story collection, *Further Chronicles of Avonlea*.²⁰ In 1919 she sold the royalty rights to her books published by Page for \$17, 880: consequently, she received no share of the profits for either the 1919 or 1934 movie versions of *Anne of Green Gables* (*SJ* II 428).

After a car collision in 1921, the Macdonalds were also dragged through the courts by a compensation-hungry Methodist from Zephyr. A Toronto judge found against them in November 1922, and the incident both soured the Macdonalds’ feelings toward many of their parishioners and strengthened their resolve in opposing the proposed union of Presbyterian, Methodist, and Congregational Canadian churches. Amid the fall-out of the union vote in 1925, and faced with the Unionist stance of the “Zephyrites”, Ewan preached successfully for the Presbyterian charge of Norval and Union. In February 1926 the family flitted to Norval, thirty miles west of Toronto. Ewan’s mental health was better than it had been for many years and

²⁰ LMM had submitted short stories to Page, many of which appeared, with modifications to include glimpses of Anne Shirley, as *Chronicles of Avonlea*. Those stories not used in this collection were returned, but Page kept copies, and published them as *Further Chronicles of Avonlea*, against LMM’s wishes. LMM complained that Page, “mangled one of the stories by crude interpolations, in one of which a character is made to do an absurd and impossible thing” (*SJ* II [Apr. 10, 1920] 376).

Montgomery soon acclimatised to her new home. Norval had a railway station, meaning that Toronto's shops, social life, authors' meetings, and friends, were more easily accessible. In October 1930, Montgomery returned to old haunts and old friends in Saskatchewan for an invigorating vacation.

However, ripples from US stock-market crash of 1929 caused L.M. Montgomery's investments to shrink dramatically. She had loaned money to various friends and family members, few of whom were able to repay the interest let alone the capital, and she now came under increasing financial strain. With a poorly-paid minister husband, and two sons in private education, the family was dependent on her continuing commercial success. For several years after 1930, Montgomery was also plagued by the unwanted romantic attentions of an ardent female fan. The heaviest blow fell in December of 1933 when Chester announced that he had been secretly married for a year to a Norval girl.²¹

This news precipitated in part a further serious collapse in the Rev Macdonald's nerves, and in 1934 he was hospitalised for two months in Guelph. This breakdown, together with various church wrangles, forced him to retire from the ministry in 1935. Ewan and Maud Macdonald moved to Toronto that April and remained there until their deaths. There were some happy times in the city, and Montgomery was delighted to own her first home, but she faced mounting worries over her sons' academic and vocational progress, and marital prospects. Chester's first marriage headed toward the divorce courts and Ewan slipped into senility. Montgomery had confided her personal problems in a journal for years, but this escape was eventually exhausted bar occasional and cryptic entries. After a catastrophic slump in her physical and mental health, catalysed by worries that both her sons would enlist, L.M. Montgomery Macdonald died on 24 April 1942. She was buried in Cavendish.²²

* * *

L.M. Montgomery wrote twenty novels, around five hundred short stories, and some five hundred poems.²³ *Anne of Green Gables* sold over half-a-million copies by

²¹ Chester Macdonald and Luella Reid were actually married in November 1933, not 1932, as they told LMM and EM. LMM's first grandchild, Luella, was born on May 17, 1934.

²² EM died in 1943 and was buried with his wife.

²³ LMM's ledger lists 517 short stories. Rea Wilmshurst calculated that there were actually around 506, and traced over 400 of these ("Afterword", *Across the Miles* 259). For original publication details of stories, see Ruth Weber Russell, D.W. Russell, and Rea Wilmshurst. *Lucy Maud Montgomery: A Preliminary Bibliography*. Waterloo, ON: U of Waterloo Library, 1986. In this thesis, some publication details will be given in the text and notes, but the bibliography should be consulted for full details. Scrapbook references are taken from tabulation in Russell *et. al.*

1935, and launched seven “Anne” sequels, published between 1909 and 1939.²⁴ The “Emily” trilogy,²⁵ written in the 1920s, is semi-autobiographical, and has lately begun to steal a march on *Anne* in terms of critical acclaim. Two “Story Girl” books, a “Kilmeny”, a “Marigold”, two “Pat” books, and a “Jane” complete the ranks of L.M. Montgomery “girls’ books”²⁶—that is, books about young heroines increasingly marketed at young would-be heroines. *The Blue Castle* [1926] and *A Tangled Web* [1931] were intended for adult readers, the former being Montgomery’s only novel not set, at least in part, in Prince Edward Island.

The majority of L.M. Montgomery’s short-stories appeared originally in North American magazines and periodicals. Only two collections were published in her lifetime—*Chronicles of Avonlea* [1912] and *Further Chronicles of Avonlea* [1920]—but a further ten volumes have been issued in recent years. In *The Road to Yesterday* [1974], E. Stuart Macdonald gathered stories his ailing mother had intended as material for a ninth “Anne” book. Catherine McLay selected fourteen stories for *The Doctor’s Sweetheart, and Other Stories* [1979]. Rea Wilmshurst edited eight volumes of stories that she typed from Montgomery’s scrapbooks and old publications.²⁷

One advantage to fame, and to her negotiations with a Canadian publishing-house, was that L.M. Montgomery could bargain for her poetry to be published although it did not “pay” commercially (*SJ* II [Mar. 21, 1916] 181). Ninety-four of her poems were collected in 1916 (by McClelland and Stewart of Toronto) as *The Watchman and Other Poems*.²⁸ Again, today’s readers can find L.M. Montgomery’s poems in a modern selection.²⁹ This thesis concentrates on Montgomery’s novels and stories, not her poetry. Although, as Elizabeth Waterston reminds readers, Montgomery “gave herself A++ for all her poetry” (81),³⁰ her verse is in truth marred by over-ornate diction and an undistinguished style.

²⁴ i.e. *Anne of Avonlea* [1909], *Anne of the Island* [1915], *Anne’s House of Dreams* [1917], *Rainbow Valley* [1919], *Rilla of Ingleside* [1921], *Anne of Windy Poplars* (UK title, *Anne of Windy Willows*, and referred to as such in this thesis) [1936], and *Anne of Ingleside* [1939].

²⁵ i.e. *Emily of New Moon* [1923], *Emily Climbs* [1925], *Emily’s Quest* [1927].

²⁶ i.e. *The Story Girl* [1911], *The Golden Road* [1913], *Kilmeny of the Orchard* [1910], *Magic for Marigold* [1929], *Pat of Silver Bush* [1933], *Mistress Pat* [1935], *Jane of Lantern Hill* [1937].

²⁷ LMM’s twelve story scrapbooks are owned by the Confederation Museum Centre of the Arts in Charlottetown, and are available on microfilm in the Public Archives of Prince Edward Island (hereafter P.A.P.E.I.). LMM also kept scrapbooks of memorabilia, clippings, and reviews: UG owns four such scrapbooks, kept between 1910 and 1937, and a scrapbook of press reviews. The Confederation Museum in Charlottetown owns two memorabilia scrapbooks.

²⁸ As LMM predicted, this volume, although well-received by critics, sold few copies compared to her novels. LMM’s Books Sales’ Ledger [UG] notes that 931 copies were sold.

²⁹ John Ferns and Kevin McCabe. *The Poetry of Lucy Maud Montgomery*. Markham, ON: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1987.

³⁰ Elizabeth Waterston. “The Poetry of L.M. Montgomery”. *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1999: 77-84. See also,

Since 1985, Montgomery's private journals have become accessible to a public readership: four selected volumes have been published to date, with a fifth and final volume pending.³¹ Montgomery's new best-sellers—drawn from ten hand-written volumes kept between 1889 and 1942, and a typed, edited copy prepared in the 1930s³²—have enhanced her literary reputation and historical gravitas. From the age of nine, Montgomery had kept a diary, modelled on Metta Victoria Victor's *A Bad Boy's Diary: By Little Georgie* [1880] (*SJ I* [May 12, 1902] 281). On 21 September 1889 (*SJ I* 1), aged fourteen, she began her adult journal, possibly influenced by the popular success of the *Journal of Marie Bashkirtseff* [1888].³³

L.M. Montgomery initially journalised in a series of odd-sized notebooks. In the winter of 1918-1919, she began the task of transcribing these books into five-hundred page long, legal-size ledgers.³⁴ Her descriptions, anecdotes, and meditations were now illustrated with photographs of scenes and people. Although she insisted that each notebook entry was copied faithfully, it is by no means certain this was the case. Montgomery also occasionally altered the uniform copy, by, for example, removing and substituting pages or by inking in comments as situations changed and doubts were realised. Maud Montgomery's journal was her grumble book and "silent friend".³⁵ She prized these volumes above her dukedom, and the personal and psychological worth to her cannot be underestimated.

However, the pressure of potential audience (whether descendants or literary heirs) on Montgomery's presentation of events and moods cannot be ignored, especially in the years when her life was fraught with worries. The ninth volume begins almost three years after the end of the eighth, with the interim years filled in at

John Ferns. "'Rainbow Dreams': the poetry of Lucy Maud Montgomery." *CCL*. 42 [1986]: 29-40; Kevin McCabe. "Lucy Maud Montgomery: the person and the poet." *CCL*. 38 [1985]: 68-80.

³¹ *The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery, Volume I: 1889-1910, Volume II: 1910-1921, Volume III: 1921-1929, Volume IV: 1929-1935*. Ed. Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 1985, 1987, 1992, 1998. In this thesis, references to the published volumes are cited as *SJ I*, *II*, *III*, *IV*, followed by the date of diary entry, and page number.

³² These journals are now owned by UG [XZ5 MS A001]. References to unpublished, handwritten journals give date, U for unpublished, followed by the volume, and where available page, number. The edited script was most likely intended for publication after her death and is also owned by the UG [XZ5 MS A021].

³³ LMM did not read this book—the posthumously published diary of a Russian artist who died of tuberculosis, aged twenty-four—until 1924, but was well aware of the "tremendous sensation" that greeted the volume, and "longed to read it" (*SJ III* [June 6, 1924] 187). Like Wilde's Cecily Cardew, LMM probably considered her own journal to be, "a very young girl's record of her own thoughts and impressions, and consequently meant for publication".

³⁴ On 2 September 1919, LMM noted that she began this task "[l]ast winter". *III* with "Spanish flu" in October of 1918, nursing the Campbells of Park Corner over the same in November, in the Boston courts in January 1919, it is unlikely that LMM began until after Frede Campbell's death. Indeed, it seems probable that this trauma propelled Montgomery "back into the past" (*SJ II* 341).

³⁵ Elizabeth R. Epperly. Review of *SJ I*. *The Island Magazine* (hereafter cited as *IM*) 19 [Spring-Summer 1986]: 38.

a later date from temporary notebook entries, and the tenth volume is witness to a similar hiatus. Rubio and Waterston speculate that Montgomery will “resist writing about deeply unpleasant events in her family until there is no chance of a reprieve or a reversal” (*SJIV* xxvii).

One further body of L.M. Montgomery’s writing has been consulted for this thesis: her voluminous letters to her pen-friends, Ephraim Weber, and George Boyd MacMillan.³⁶ All three were initially correspondents of Philadelphia-based writer, Miriam Zieber, who imagined herself to be a leader in literary circles. Zieber encouraged the two men to write to Montgomery (but not to each other) and although Zieber dropped her correspondence with all three (she married, which seemed to put an end to her blue-stockings aspirations) Montgomery kept acquaintance with MacMillan and Weber for over forty years.³⁷

Ephraim Weber was born in 1870 in Bridgeport, Ontario, and raised by his German-speaking Mennonite family in an environment he considered uneducated and uncultured.³⁸ Weber broke with his farming destiny to train as a teacher but, frustrated by this vocation, elected to try his hand at writing. He moved to the United States in 1902, seeking to break into the American literary market. This plan failed and he returned, in 1904, to the Alberta farm where his family had relocated. He later resumed his education, training as a German tutor, and embarking on a PhD, but eventually became a school-teacher in Saskatchewan. Weber’s sole publications before his death in 1956 were two articles on his famous correspondent, and a few poems.³⁹

George Boyd MacMillan—who, at twenty-two, was seven years Maud Montgomery’s junior when he first wrote to her in 1903—was a Scottish journalist from Alloa, Clackmannanshire. Mollie Gillen discovered Montgomery’s letters to

³⁶ The complete surviving letters to Ephraim Weber [cited as EW] and George Boyd MacMillan [GBM] are housed in the National Archives of Canada [NAC], Ottawa. Wilfrid Eggleston, a former student and friend of Weber, edited LMM’s letters to EW from her Cavendish years in the collection *The Green Gables Letters: From L.M. Montgomery to Ephraim Weber 1905-1909*. Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1960. A complete collection of the letters to EW was prepared by Paul and Hildi Tiessen at Wilfrid Laurier University for publication in April 2000. LMM’s letters to GBM were selected by Francis W.P. Bolger and Elizabeth R. Epperly and published in 1980 as *My Dear Mr. M: Letters to George Boyd MacMillan from L.M. Montgomery*. 1980. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1992.

³⁷ LMM met MacMillan once in 1911, Weber three times in 1928, 1930 and 1935.

³⁸ Eggleston cites a letter from EW to LMM: “Our race are not at all for intellect and culture. My parents have never heard of Shakespeare” and “I was twelve before I spoke an English sentence. I didn’t read anything until I was an adult. Such was my heredity and environment, and to this day I suffer from it” (*The Green Gables Letters* 9).

³⁹ i.e. Ephraim Weber. “L.M. Montgomery as a Letter Writer”. *Dalhousie Review*. [Oct. 1942]: 300-310; “L.M. Montgomery’s Anne”. *Dalhousie Review*. 24.1 [1944]: 64-73. Gabriella Åhmansson notes that EW’s wife collected and published his writings in *Musings By the Way*. Victoria: Moriss Printing Co., 1957. (Gabriella Åhmansson. *A Life and its Mirrors: A Feminist Reading of Montgomery’s Fiction*. Vol. 1 Uppsala, Sweden: U of Uppsala, 1991: 30n.)

MacMillan and made good use of them in her 1975 biography of Montgomery, *The Wheel of Things*.⁴⁰ MacMillan wrote for the *Alloa Journal* and sold several items to publications such as *Punch* and the *Strand Magazine*. According to Gillen, MacMillan enjoyed a prestigious local reputation and was esteemed as a brilliant man, but never achieved the real success this potential promised, remaining all his life in Alloa, perhaps because he was prone to hypertension (Gillen, 50, 95-96).⁴¹ He never married, and died in 1953 at the age of seventy-two.

Critical Responses

As Mary Rubio notes, L.M. Montgomery's fiction, along with other works classed as "romances," "regional idylls", or "domestic fiction," was originally marketed to a wide audience and reviewed as general fiction in the press (2).⁴² However, the prestige of "popular" novels floundered amid the changing literary fashions of the post-First World War years. Montgomery's work, for example, was increasingly classified as literature for children—more specifically, literature for girls—with the result that she became "marginalized when academics professionalized reviewing and literary study" (5) in the 1920s. Indeed, it is perhaps the "girls' fiction" label that was most damaging to Montgomery's subsequent literary reputation. Books ostensibly "for" children, by writers such as Mark Twain, Kenneth Grahame and Rudyard Kipling, had a large and vocally appreciative adult readership.

This reclassification is unsurprising given the hiatus between Montgomery's focus on children, adolescents, and women and the male adjudication of the literary canon. Perversely, it may also have partly safeguarded Montgomery's work from obscurity. As "wholesome" reading material for *girls*, her books remained in print, where, as "popular" novels for a *general* audience, "maturing" tastes might have consigned her novels permanently to the dustbin of literary history. Consequently, Montgomery's books stayed favourites with readers, regardless of critical disdain, and their popularity continues to grow, partly due to the many small screen

⁴⁰ Mollie Gillen. *The Wheel of Things: A biography of L.M. Montgomery, author of Anne of Green Gables*. Don Mills, ON: Fitzhenry & Whiteside Ltd., 1975. rpt. Halifax, N.S.: Goodread Biographies, 1983.

⁴¹ According to Gillen, GBM suffered a nervous breakdown during the First World War which prevented him from enlisting.

⁴² Mary Henley Rubio. "Introduction: Harvesting Thistles in Montgomery's Textual Garden". *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery, Essays on Her Novels and Journals*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. Guelph, ON: Canadian Children's Press, 1994: 1-13 [hereafter *HT*]. LMM's work was reviewed, for example, in the "novels" section of British publications such as *The Times*, *The Spectator*, *The Scotsman*, and *Punch*.

adaptations of her books.⁴³ (The editions of her journals have, of course, brought a new and, once more, broad, audience to her work.)

Critical reassessment of Montgomery's fiction began in the late 1960s, spurred on in large part by Elizabeth Waterston's article, "L.M. Montgomery", in *The Clear Spirit* [1966].⁴⁴ In 1976, John R. Sorfleet edited a collection of essays drawn from *Canadian Children's Literature*, the Guelph-based journal at the forefront of Montgomery-related scholarship.⁴⁵ Most academic attention until very recently has focused primarily on *Anne of Green Gables*. A number of essays on *Anne*, many originally published in the journal *Children's Literature Association Quarterly*, were collected by Mavis Reimer in *Such a Simple Little Tale* [1992].⁴⁶

As a female author of fiction that appeals to women, and a keeper of journals that are rich resources for women's history, Montgomery has been fêted by feminist critics, who have restored her reputation as a serious and sophisticated writer. Gabriella Åhmansson's 1991 feminist reading of Montgomery's fiction was the first full-length study of the author's work. Elizabeth R. Epperly's *The Fragrance of Sweet-Grass* [1992] examines Montgomery's heroines and "romance".⁴⁷ Insights

⁴³ Sullivan Films Inc. are the main protagonists in the field of LMM TV adaptations. This company made *Anne of Green Gables* (1985: co-produced by CBC and PBS), *Anne of Green Gables: the Sequel* (1987: CBC, PBS and the Disney Channel), *Lantern Hill*, a very free adaptation of *Jane of Lantern Hill* (1990: co-production for CBC, Disney and PBS), and *Road to Avonlea* (co-produced by CBC and the Disney Channel). *Road to Avonlea* first aired on 7 January 1990 to 2.5 million viewers: ninety-one episodes of this series—suggested by characters and stories from *The Story Girl*, *The Golden Road*, *Chronicles of Avonlea*, and *Further Chronicles of Avonlea*—were screened over a seven year period, and a reunion movie, *Happy Christmas Miss King* aired in December 1998. A final instalment to the "Anne" mini-series, *Anne of Green Gables: The Continuing Story*, screened in Spring 2000. A television adaptation of the "Emily" trilogy, co-produced by Salter Street Films of Halifax and CINAR Films of Montreal for WIC Entertainment was broadcast on CBC, 4 January 1998. This show is scheduled to run for at least three years and appears by all accounts to bear only a passing resemblance to LMM's books. A film company, Talisman Films and independent filmmaker Eleanore Lindo, are planning to shoot a movie version of *The Blue Castle*. (Information by personal communication from Benjamin Lefebvre; Jack Hutton, Bala; and Heather Ludlow, UPEI.) A silent movie of *Anne of Green Gables* was released in 1919. The star of the 1934 "talkie" thought it bankable to change her name from Dawn O'Day to Anne Shirley. A musical *Anne of Green Gables*, by Don Harron and Norman Campbell, has played each summer in Charlottetown since 1965, and around the world. A musical of *Emily* opened in Charlottetown in 1999.

⁴⁴ Elizabeth Waterston. "Lucy Maud Montgomery". *The Clear Spirit: Twenty Canadian Women and Their Times*. Ed. Mary Quale Innis. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1966. 198-200. Waterston has also written a fine study of *Anne of Green Gables: Kindling Spirit: L.M. Montgomery's Anne of Green Gables*. Toronto: ECW Press, 1993. See Gabriella Åhmansson, *A Life and its Mirrors*, Ch. 1, for a résumé of Canadian criticism of LMM's work prior to Waterston.

⁴⁵ John R. Sorfleet. ed. *L.M. Montgomery: An Assessment*. Guelph, ON: Canadian Children's Press, 1976.

⁴⁶ Mavis Reimer. ed. *Such a Simple Little Tale: Critical Responses to L.M. Montgomery's Anne of Green Gables*. Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, 1992. The title is taken from LMM's modest description of *Anne* (SJ I [Oct. 15, 1908] 339).

⁴⁷ Elizabeth R. Epperly. *The Fragrance of Sweet-Grass: L.M. Montgomery's Heroines and the Pursuit of Romance*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1992. See also, Genevieve Wiggins. *L.M. Montgomery*. Twayne's World Authors Series. New York: Twayne Publishers, 1992.

from schools of feminist theory (and from scholars of children's literature) offer instructive and rewarding analysis of L.M. Montgomery's inter-textual manipulation of, and departure from, the domestic romance genre, explaining why her "sentimental stories" have been, and continue to be, an empowering force for girls and women.

In 1994 the first biennial International Symposium on L.M. Montgomery's work was convened by the L.M. Montgomery Institute at the University of Prince Edward Island. *Harvesting Thistles*—a collection of essays examining L.M. Montgomery's novels and journals—was launched at this conference. A volume of critical essays and reflection pieces (drawn in part from the proceedings of the 1996 and 1998 symposia), *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* [1999], was gathered by Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly.⁴⁸ This latest collection is the "first systematic attempt to investigate the question of the Canadianness of Montgomery's writing" (5), which its editors hope "reclaims Montgomery within the realm of Canadian literary and cultural studies" (12).

Methods and Framework

In examining the Scottish context of L.M. Montgomery's writing, this thesis emphasises the appeal of her work to a general readership, including children, but also adults conversant with popular North American and British literature. Although Montgomery sometimes colluded with the opinion that her work was "simple",⁴⁹ she knew that her books were appreciated by grown-ups. Indeed, she "took a great deal of pains" with her style, partly to ensure that her literary skill was conveyed to a mature audience.⁵⁰ That she latterly wrote two novels for adults is symptomatic of the frustration she felt at finding her books placed on the children's shelves where they would elude adults.⁵¹

L.M. Montgomery's displeasure at being "classed as a 'writer for young people' and that only" (*SJ* II 390) sprang not only from her knowledge that she was capable of writing for grown-ups, but from the fact that she included material in her work *specifically* intended for the entertainment of an adult, *not* a juvenile, audience.

⁴⁸ Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly, eds. *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1999.

⁴⁹ LMM warned Weber, "Don't stick your ears up now, imagining that the great Canadian novel has been written at last," when *Anne* was accepted. Letter to EW, dated May 2, 1907, *The Green Gables Letters* 51.

⁵⁰ Letter to EW, dated Sept. 10, 1908, *The Green Gables Letters* 73. LMM's many stylistic revisions are evident from her hand-written manuscripts which she preserved from *Emily of New Moon* onward. See Elizabeth R. Epperly, "Approaching the Montgomery Manuscripts." *HT*. 74-83.

⁵¹ cf. Mary Rubio *HT* 2.

(Readers are told that the tale of Peter Kirk's funeral in *Anne of Ingleside*, is "certainly no story for children" [*AIN* 202].) This is not to say that adult readers cannot find enjoyment in *all* aspects of Montgomery's work. They can and do. But there is also much in her work, in narrative and subtext, which is intended to appeal to an adult sense of humour, an erudite, bookish readership, an audience acquainted with the gamut of ethnic, religious, and caste complexities, and minds which compass a sophisticated understanding of community. These elements are often directly informed by L.M. Montgomery's Scottish antecedents, or steered by the Scots-Canadian milieu.

In examining the Scottish diaspora in Canada through her fiction, this thesis redirects the critical focus away from L.M. Montgomery's eponymous juvenile heroines to the people and the places they try to become "of". This is not to ignore the importance of her individual, independent, intelligent characters; after all, there is a decidedly Scottish influence at play in Montgomery's lasses and lads "o' pairts". But the adventures of the central protagonists also reflect the psychological and social history and development of the community or clan. As the action of many of Montgomery's stories follows patterns of friction, fight, and final resolution, each incident writes the rules, regulations, and parameters of the Scots-Canadian world. An extensive range of interactions between society and the individual are explored when the powers that be, be they pious church elders or clan grande dames, try to rear children in their own image.

David Weale describes Montgomery's Avonlea as a dossier of "compliments and complaints" (3).⁵² Ultimately for "happy endings", that which unites her characters is as important as that which divides them. Montgomery's narratives breed a gradual recognition of similarities and connections. This harmonious outcome is made possible partly by investing each body with a common heritage. More often than not this is a Scottish identity of shared customs and traditions imparting "the power to fight—to suffer—to pity—to love very deeply—to rejoice—to endure" (*ENM* 10). These attributes are, of course, endemic to most cultures. But Montgomery frequently chose to ally them to Scottish blood, and in so doing, endows the humanity, pathos, tragedy, triumph, and humour of her novels—the parts with "adult" appeal—with Scottish roots.

Montgomery's fiction is chiefly set in small, rural communities governed by institutions that are Scottish in conception, structure, and practice. Although they reflect the Cavendish world Montgomery grew up in to a large extent, these Canadian

⁵² David Weale. "No Scope for Imagination: Another Side of *Anne of Green Gables*". *IM*. 20 [Fall-Winter 1986]: 3-8.

communities are unrepresentatively (in the context of the Island's ethnic and religious diversity) dominated by Scottish Presbyterians with a non-Gaelic heritage.⁵³ This thesis treats Montgomery's writing as a historical resource, but recognises that her fictional environment is selective and biased. Montgomery edited and embroidered her personal and community history, emphasising a particular Scottish legacy as she did so. Here she was influenced by the images of Scotland afloat in the popular and literary imagination. Although like her writer-heroine, Emily Byrd Starr, Montgomery *had* to write and *loved* to write, she also wrote books to become "famous and rich" (ENM 298).⁵⁴ She regarded writing as a profession, where success was partly achieved through understanding "form" and market forces.⁵⁵

Montgomery's work outwardly conforms to certain genre criteria. Her novels were published not only alongside popular American "girls' books" (Kate Douglas Wiggin's *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm* [1903], Eleanor H. Porter's *Pollyanna* [1912], Jean Webster's *Daddy-Long Legs* [1912]) but in the same period as the best-selling, albeit in most cases less long-lived, "regional idylls". This category includes the novels of Canadians Ralph Connor and Marian Keith, American "local color" writers Sara Orne Jewett, Mrs Deland, and Mary E. Wilkins and, importantly, the Scottish "Kailyard" authors J.M. Barrie, S.R. Crockett, and "Ian Maclaren". Scottish literature, from Burns through the Kailyard and beyond, was immensely popular in North America, and for many readers delivered up the only Scotland they knew. Montgomery's fiction may reproduce the lives of the Scots-Islanders, but also invokes a particular Scottishness of proven appeal.

* * *

This thesis comprises of four parts. Part I—"L.M. Montgomery and Scotland"—is fronted by an introductory section, "No Place Like Home?", that centres on L.M. Montgomery's 1911 visit to Scotland, "a land", she explained, "which I always heard referred to as 'Home,' by men and women whose parents were Canadian born and

⁵³ The majority of LMM's short-stories are set in PEI, but others are clearly located on the mainland, or even in the States. A significant minority are set in western Canada, e.g. "Margaret's Books" [1902], "Tannis of the Flats" [1904], "A Soldier of the Queen" [1905], "How We Went to the Wedding" [1913], "The Genesis of the Doughnut Club" [1907], "The Quest of a Story" [1902], "The Jenkinson Grit" [1905].

⁵⁴ In her introductory letter to GBM, LMM wrote, "I am frankly in literature to make my living out of it. My prose sells and so I write it, although I prefer writing verse. I know that I can never be a really great writer. My aspiration is limited to this—I want to be a *good workman* in my chosen profession" (*My Dear Mr. M* 3).

⁵⁵ As Epperly writes, "reading early examples of Montgomery's stories, we see how thoroughly she imitated the patterns of the day—dramatic reversals of fortune, suddenly discovered long-lost relatives, sentimental love scenes, and purple patches of description [...] she wrote what the public wanted to read. She adapted material to the form or formula that would sell" (*Fragrance* 5).

bred" (*TAP* 11). Section two, "The Fates and a Woman's Will", analyses Montgomery's Scottish ancestry by rereading the family histories she told and retold in various media throughout her lifetime. The lessons enforced by this personal mythology emerge as key to Montgomery's individual identity and clan pride. Section three, "The Chosen People", considers these legends, and their probable factual bases, within the wider context of Scottish migration to, and settlement in, Prince Edward Island. These three sections examine L.M. Montgomery's perceptions of Scotland and identify some origins for the Scottish images and influences depicted in her fiction.

Part II—"Clan or Community Novels?"—turns to L.M. Montgomery's fiction. The introductory section, "Stories of the Days Gone By", traces developments in Montgomery's literary style, by labelling her books as *community* novels or *clan* novels. This classification isolates two distinct ways in which Scotland both provides a framework for Montgomery's fiction, and a touchstone for the Canadian identity she portrays. Section two, "Greats and Grands of Every Degree", examines her fictional families in more detail, exploring the origins and machinations of clanship, and the nature of the rural elite. Section three, "Love Thy Neighbour?", considers the changing face of Montgomery's fictional communities, from the pre-war haven of Avonlea to the war-time upheaval of Glen St Mary, and identifies a shift from Kailyard sentiment to a bleaker, yet still essentially Scottish, perspective.

Parts I and II form the bulk of this thesis. Part III—"Belief in L.M. Montgomery's Fiction"—takes a short look at two co-existing creeds. Section one, "Matters of Predestination", focuses on Presbyterianism, specifically Calvinism; section two, "Onward into Fairy Land", on folklore and superstition. Each belief system as it surfaces in Montgomery's stories has a foundation in Scotland, of course, and Christianity and "paganism" are not mutually exclusive in daily community and clan life. However, where Montgomery's fictionalisation of Presbyterian dilemmas grows considerably more complex with time (culminating in justified murder in one of her final stories), her later dealings with fairyland sometimes betray a tired and hackneyed "Celticism".

"As the Scots Would Say", the first section of Part IV—"Scottish 'Voice' and 'Place'"—turns to rural speech and oral narrative, and considers L.M. Montgomery's use of Scottish dialect and accent in the context of popular literary conventions. These "voices" are a window on her fictional portraits of Highlanders, and Scottish character in general. The second section, "Heather doesn't grow in America, does it?", examines the developing relationship between Montgomery's regional

narratives, the national story, and literary identity through a comparison with similar Scottish trends. In Montgomery's descriptions of the "voice" and "place" of Prince Edward Island there are Scottish antecedents, of course, but she increasingly writes a Canadian story onto the Island landscape and the history of Island people.

* * *

The commanding power of Presbyterian doctrine, and the gloomy perimeter of Calvinist thought, shape L.M. Montgomery's conservative and often censorious communities of the unco guid. Pride in Scottish ancestry and in being pioneers, love of family and loyalty to clan, fierce intelligence and poetic spirit, ensure that these communities are more than just rigidly righteous, in short, fine places to "belong" to. Scottish superstitions, customs, beliefs, and oral culture form the basis of her Scots-Canadian characters' identity and expression. Scottish antecedents construct complex social and clan structures, naming patterns and cultural mores. Through her use of this old world heritage, Montgomery made her Canadian environment familiar (hers was no land of snows, wilderness, and wild beasts) and stressed the connections between mother country and colony, no doubt contributing to her popularity with British readers and British statesmen such as Earl Grey, Stanley Baldwin, and Ramsay MacDonald.⁵⁶

L.M. Montgomery wanted to plant the "romance" of Scotland in Canadian soil. In spirit, in personality, in struggle, and (somewhat intangibly) in humour, a Scottish flavour spices L.M. Montgomery's writing. Some contemporary reviewers labelled her the "Jane Austen of Canada",⁵⁷ and Montgomery, like Austen, peppers tales of courtship and marriage with a wealth of secondary characters who personate "the comedy that ever peeps around the corner at the tragedy of life" (*AHD* 231).

⁵⁶ Albert Henry George Grey, the fourth earl, was the Governor-General of Canada from 1904-1911. He invited LMM to join his group on the PEI leg of his 1910 visit across Canada (where LMM, incidentally, also met John McCrae, whose poem "In Flanders Fields" would prove an inspiration for her novels written during the First World War). The Earl and LMM afterwards corresponded and exchanged books. Stanley Baldwin, on a 1927 visit to Canada, wrote to LMM requesting an opportunity to thank "you for the pleasure your books have given me" (*SJ* II 342); as this could not be arranged on PEI soil they met at a royal garden party (hosted by the Prince of Wales, later Edward VIII, and Prince George, later George VI) in Toronto. (LMM subsequently praised Baldwin's handling of the abdication crisis.) LMM also heard through friends that Ramsay MacDonald was a fan of her work, but as this comment was reputedly made shortly before his death she remarked, "Probably his mind had weakened ...!" (Letter to EW, dated Feb. 13-27, 1940 [NAC]: see also Gillen, 157).

⁵⁷ e.g. "L.M. Montgomery, in her 'Anne' books, pictures the purely Canadian rural community as it may be seen today, and it is no mere figure of comparison to say that L.M. Montgomery holds a place in Canadian literature corresponding to that of Jane Austen in English literature. She has rare imaginative and creative gifts and she uses them in enabling us to see the beauty, the humour, the pathos that lies about our daily paths" (1921 clipping, review scrapbook, UG). LMM noted the comparison of her work to Austen's in a journal entry of March 1, 1930 (*SJ* IV 40).

Scottishness often materialises in the stories of all sorts and conditions of men and women, and much of the Scottish “atmosphere” is conveyed in their faults and foibles.

Montgomery’s little bits of ivory are therefore painted with a rainbow of “Scottish” traits. Montgomery wrote novels of limited (and limiting) environments, set against a Scottish-Canadian background, yet they engender recognition in many cultures. From the youth of the Polish resistance movement in the 1950s who used *Anne of Green Gables* a source for code names,⁵⁸ to the thousands of Japanese fans who have travelled half-way round the world to PEI on *Anne*-inspired pilgrimages, Montgomery’s books have proved to have a universal appeal.⁵⁹ All her books have been translated into several languages, have inspired and heartened, cheered and consoled a global readership.

In 1926, L.M. Montgomery wrote that the diverse Island population—“the fire and romance of the Celt, the canny commonsense of the Lowlander, the thrift of the English, the wit of the Irish”—was “beginning to be blended into something that is proud to call itself Canadian”.⁶⁰ The Canadian identity that is developed in her fiction concentrates on the Scottish side of the British inheritance, and her Irish characters seldom have wit as their defining quality. L.M. Montgomery’s Canada is anglophone, Presbyterian, and treading a balance between the rock of Old World allegiances and the hard place of Stateside “freedom”.

Yet despite these incongruities, Montgomery’s fiction is actually highly realistic and profoundly sophisticated—much more so than those who have dismissed her work as “romantic” or “sentimental” have allowed. In her novels, stories, letters, and diaries, a picture of *one kind* of lifestyle in Canada, from Confederation to the Second World War, emerges. The academic focus on Montgomery’s appeal to specific readerships—children and women—has meant that this Canadian context has largely been assigned a secondary role. By using the Scottish milieu, and the general audience it appealed to, as the primary critical consideration, this thesis seeks to establish the work of L.M. Montgomery as a viable historical resource, providing insight into the lifestyle, culture, and identity of the Scots in Canada.

⁵⁸ For insights on LMM’s popularity in Poland, see Barbara Wachowicz. “L.M. Montgomery: at home in Poland.” *CCL*. 46 [1987]: 7-36.

⁵⁹ Waterston, *Kindling Spirit* 25.

⁶⁰ LMM. “I Dwell Among my Own People” (memorabilia scrapbook, UG). LMM used similar language in her reply to the PEI toast: “this land where English and Scotch and Irish are all beginning to be blended into something that is proud to call itself Canadian” (*SJ* III [June 28, 1926] 296-297).

No Place Like Home?

"You and the doctor must come down soon and tell us all about your trip [to Europe]. I suppose you've had a splendid time."

"We had," agreed Anne. "It was the fulfilment of years of dreams. The old world is very lovely and very wonderful. But we have come back very well satisfied with our own land. Canada is the finest country in the world, Miss Cornelia."

"Nobody ever doubted that," said Miss Cornelia complacently.

"And old P.E.I. is the loveliest province in it and Four Winds is the loveliest spot in P.E.I.," laughed Anne, looking adoringly out over the sunset splendour of glen and harbour and gulf. She waved her hand at it. "I saw nothing more beautiful than that in Europe, Miss Cornelia."

Rainbow Valley 17-18

"Kilmeny, Kilmeny, where have you been?"

L.M. Montgomery's Kilmeny, unlike her Scottish namesake, could only truthfully respond to Hogg's question with a silent "nowhere". Her grandfather James Gordon returned to Scotland from PEI to pick a second wife; Kilmeny simply tarries in the orchard. Marigold Lesley's clan at Cloud of Spruce still boast of their Scottish pioneer ancestors after five generations. Emily Byrd Starr's great-great grandmothers heroically crossed the Atlantic from Scotland. Ilse Burnley reaps her trousseau from two great aunts "in the same historic land" (*EQ* 194). Yet only Anne Shirley from "goodness knows where" (*AGG* 82)—the waif "without kith or kin" (*Als* 78)—visits the old world home. Judy Plum, the Irish maid at Silver Bush, gets as far as the boat train from the Island to "Ould Ireland". But in general L.M. Montgomery's characters revel in their British heritage while showing a remarkable tenacity to stay put in Canada.

In *Rainbow Valley* [1919], "home" for Anne is Four Winds, P.E. Island, Canada: community, province, nation, in this order of affiliation. Subsequent Montgomery heroines repeat Anne's fidelity to maple leaf, root and branch. In the aftermath of the First World War, Canadian patriotism enjoyed renewed vigour and

new expression in the drive to identify a national literature that could convey Canadianness to readers at home and abroad.¹ Valancy Stirling, in *The Blue Castle*, finds freedom from the family compact in nature books written by an enigmatic author who nevertheless “must be a Canadian” (*TBC* 9).² Emily Byrd Starr, the heroine of L.M. Montgomery’s *Künstlerroman* trilogy, elects to be a Canadian author: not a “Yankeefied” exile like Janet Royal, but an ensign for the literature of her own country.³ However, Emily also learns as she climbs that “a thousand ancestors” (*EC* 91) echo through her own creativity. The romance, fortitude, pathos, and mystery of her Scottish heritage are integral to Emily’s “Canadian tang and flavour” (*EC* 315), no less so, the perfectionism exacted by generations of Scots-Presbyterian introspection.

“Belonging” in L.M. Montgomery’s writing is traced in the pursuit of places called “home”. From the first chapter of *Anne of Green Gables*, where Marilla Cuthbert—child of Scots-born parents, native of a province but recently confederated into the Dominion of Canada⁴—prioritises the Island and Nova Scotia, over *England* and the States, Montgomery signals that, for Canadians, these connections to “home” are potentially complex. Marilla is a loyal Islander where invasions of foreign “street arabs” are concerned, and a hearty supporter of the Conservative Canadian Premier, John A. Macdonald, but in thought and deed she clearly hails from an old world perspective that appears to sit uncomfortably with this avowed new world allegiance. (Of course, this said, John A. was a Scotsman.⁵) Her brother treasures a “Scotch rose-bush” (*AGG* 338), which adds a saving blush of Old Country romance to his commonplace existence. These intricacies are, of course, indicative of strong Scottish participation in Canadian nation building, and the potency of Scotland in emergent Canadian identity.

Concurrently, though, they reveal inherent and continuing divisions in the outward homogeneity. Regionalism is one aspect of this. Not only do Montgomery’s

¹ E. Holly Pike examines LMM’s participation in the “Can. Lit.” debates of the 1920s—as evidenced in the “Emily” trilogy—in “(Re)Producing Canadian Literature: L.M. Montgomery’s Emily Novels.” *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* 64-76.

² Many of the passages that Valancy quotes from “John Foster’s” nature books are taken from four articles LMM wrote on woods for *The Canadian Magazine* in the summer of 1909 (cf. Letter to EW, dated Sept. 2, 1909, *The Green Gables Letters* 92).

³ Six months before she started writing *Emily of New Moon*, LMM held “crass, blatant Yankeeism” [*SJ* II (Feb. 22, 1920) 373] responsible for corrupting her own work, in the silent movie of *Anne of Green Gables*.

⁴ See Edwards and Litster. “The End of Canadian Innocence”, Appendix B.

⁵ LMM does not name John A. Macdonald in *Anne of Green Gables*, but it is clear from Marilla’s remark about the size of the Premier’s nose (*AGG* 167), that he is the politician referred to. (“A rum un’ to look at, but a rare un’ to go,” as he said himself.) Canadian Premier 1867-1873 and 1878-1891, John A. Macdonald, visited PEI in 1890. (LMM met the Premier and his wife through her grandfather, Senator Donald Montgomery [*SJ* I (Aug. 11, 1890): 25].)

fictional Islanders extol their “sea-girt” province as “the only Island there is”, Montgomery personally believed there was:

a subtle difference between life in the Gulf Province and life in other Canadian provinces, a difference which is more a difference of personality than of actual conditions. Owing to its isolation Prince Edward Island still keeps its original types and traditions more clearly defined than has been possible on the mainland, where races have amalgamated.⁶

PEI’s “original types”, original *immigrant* types that is, were therefore “hyphenated” Canadians—Scots-Canadians, French-Canadians, English-Canadians and so forth—the second side of a divided nationality. Two homelands were split by an ocean and joined by a band; both lands claimed a degree of fealty. An essential part of “Canadianness”, for Montgomery herself and for her fictional characters, was proclamation of “type”. After five generations, the country of origin still tugged at the heartstrings. How much more so, where that “native” land could offer a literature and history of romance, fortitude, pathos, and mystery that Canada appeared to lack.

Unlike Marigold or Emily, orphan Anne Shirley has no mother-land and no forefathers beyond the colony, leastwise none that she can name. Yet from the moment she arrives in Avonlea, declaiming the poetry of Campbell and Scott and Aytoun, L.M. Montgomery announces Anne’s latent Scottish credentials:

“I can read pretty well and I know ever so many pieces of poetry off by heart—‘The Battle of Hohenlinden’ and ‘Edinburgh after Flodden,’ and ‘Bingen on the Rhine,’ and lots of ‘Lady of the Lake’ and most of ‘The Seasons’ by James Thomson. Don’t you just love poetry that gives you a crinkly feeling up and down your back? There is a piece in the Fifth Reader—‘The Downfall of Poland’—that is just full of thrills” (AGG 54).⁷

Notably, Anne’s nature stirs to battle-verse of Scottish production and European setting: Montgomery sends Anne and Gilbert to Europe in the months before the turn-of-the-century action of *Rainbow Valley* begins, to savour a world ravaged by battle in her own time. Maud Montgomery was acutely responsive to war-time anxiety and drew some succour from her belief that such a “baptism by fire” would “purge away [Canada’s] petty superficialities and lay bare the primal passions of humanity”. Only after the deluge could “the great Canadian novel or poem” be born

⁶ Newspaper article, “Tells of the Life Among the Islanders”, pub. Nov. 1, 1913, quoting LMM. Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁷ “The Battle of Hohenlinden” and “The Downfall of Poland” are poems by Glaswegian writer Thomas Campbell [1777-1844]. Edinburgh-born William Edmonstoune Aytoun [1813-1865] wrote “Edinburgh after Flodden”. James Thomson [1700-1748] was born in Roxburghshire; Caroline Norton, author of “Bingen on the Rhine”, was not Scottish (she was the granddaughter of Irish dramatist, Richard Sheridan) although she married Scottish historian Sir William Stirling-Maxwell in 1877, the year of her death.

(*SJ* II [Aug. 27, 1919] 339-40).⁸ It is therefore partly an agency of the First World War that Anne returns from “seeing moonlight on the far dim hills of Scotland . . . over Melrose” (*AIn* 251) affirming her love for Canada.⁹

Anne does not “home returning, soothly swear,/ Was never scene so sad so fair” (*The Lay of the Last Minstrel* II.i.17-18) but her itinerary in Scotland is plainly directed by the literary heritage that comprises her “history”. Pale moonlight over Melrose shines in Walter Scott’s romantic vision of a border-land shaped by the wizard Michael Scott (II.i.1-2). Lacking parents to give her a pedigree, Anne has fostered a past from her reading and so-armed with *The Lady of the Lake* and “Edinburgh after Flodden” it is small wonder that she sees “scope for imagination” in Avonlea’s Scots settlers. Writers in the territories united as “Canada” in 1867 and after produced literature before the First World War, of course, but little that was felt to have a national cohesion or resonance, either by those who asked in the 1920s, “Is There a Canadian Literature?”,¹⁰ or by critics of the 1960s and 70s, such as Northrop Frye and Margaret Atwood, who sought a Canadian mandala in environment dislocation.¹¹

According to Frye, the “failure” of Canadians to unite in the shared geographic space meant the Canadian imagination was parochial and apologetic, not universal and assured. Canada sparked no internal mythology and the colonial Canadian imagination was thus over-reliant on the literary forms of the mother country. In their respective essays for *The Canadian Imagination* both Frye and Atwood cite Earle Birney’s poem “Can. Lit.”—which ends, “it’s only by our lack of ghosts/ we’re haunted”—as an important image of “Unmagical Canada”.¹² Atwood argues against this perception to some extent, by exhuming some Canadian monsters, but notes that, in the “popular mind”, the term “Canadian Literature” conjures thoughts, not of magic, but of “ordinary life” (98). Certainly Anne Shirley takes from the

⁸ In this journal entry LMM quoted an article she wrote four years before the war, in 1910.

⁹ The route taken by Anne and Gilbert appears in the “prequel” to *Rainbow Valley*, *Anne of Ingleside* [1939].

¹⁰ Title of a 1929 article (published in the *Commonweal* Nov. 6) by Canadian critic, Douglas Bush. See David Staines. “Introduction: Canada Observed.” *The Canadian Imagination: Dimensions of a Literary Culture*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 1977: 10.

¹¹ See Northrop Frye’s conclusion to Carl F. Klinck, ed. *Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1965: 821-849; Northrop Frye. *The Bush Garden: Essays on the Canadian Imagination*. Toronto: Anansi Press, 1971; Margaret Atwood. *Survival: A Thematic Guide to Canadian Literature*. Toronto: Anansi Press, 1972. Frye coined the term, “garrison mentality”, to explain the crisis in Canadian literary identity: faced with a threatening environment the Canadian imagination was isolated, or garrisoned, in a zone of spacial security. Atwood wrote that “single unifying or informing symbol” at the Canadian core was “survival” (31).

¹² Margaret Atwood. “Canadian Monsters: Some Aspects of the Supernatural in Canadian Fiction.” *The Canadian Imagination* 97-122. Frye’s essay in the same collection is entitled, “Haunted by Lack of Ghosts: Some Patterns in the Imagery of Canadian Poetry.”: 22-45.

Royal Readers a “magic” that is British, and she is inspired neither to glory or to dream by Canadian verse.

The “Fifth Reader” syllabus reflects the marked Scottish bias in the Canadian educational system (as well as the ongoing cultural appeal of Scotland to expatriates and their descendants).¹³ L.M. Montgomery was schooled with the Royal Readers herself and her writing abounds with references to Scottish authors: Robert Louis Stevenson, James Thomson, Thomas Campbell, James Hogg, and in particular Walter Scott and Robert Burns, of whose work she had known large amounts since childhood and would quote and recite, in turn encouraging her own children to do likewise. Montgomery particularly revelled in the “Kailyard” novels of J.M. Barrie and “Ian Maclaren”, reading and rereading these works from their fashionable heyday in the 1890s to their obscurity in the late 1930s. Later she read theological works by Henry Drummond and Allan Menzies, and David Hume’s *History of England*. George Boyd MacMillan posted her Scottish newspapers, clippings, verse, and novels by writers as diverse as Ian Hay, Janet Beith, and Neil Gunn.¹⁴

L.M. Montgomery was a proud Islander and a patriotic Canadian but she could still share the sentiment with her Scottish pen-friend, that:

Scotland seems almost a homeland to me, partly from the fact that my great-grandfathers on both sides come from there and partly from the fact that my childhood was saturated with Scott’s novels and poems and Burns’ poems. I would rather visit Scotland than any other land on earth and hope to some day.¹⁵

Montgomery did visit Scotland (and England) in 1911, and what she found there is emblematic of these twofold alliances. Crucially, however, for all that her lineage gave her the secure Scottish pedigree that Anne Shirley lacks, L.M. Montgomery also lamented the fact that her ancestors “seemed to be cut off from the old land” after emigration and preserved “no stories or memories of friends in the old country” (*SJ* IV 126).¹⁶ Her family’s Scottish ancestry partly explains her saturation in Scottish authors (and was the reason the poetry of Burns and Scott could be found on the sparsely-populated Macneill bookshelves). But with no concrete connection to the

¹³ The “Royal Readers” were British text books, published by Thomas Nelson and Sons, for use in Canadian schools. See Wendy E. Barry, Margaret Anne Doody, and Mary E. Doody Jones. *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables*. New York, Oxford: Oxford U P, 1997: 89, 433, 457.

¹⁴ Ian Hay’s *The First Hundred Thousand* [1915], Janet Beith’s *No Second Spring* [1933] and Neil Gunn’s *Morning Tide* [1930] were all sent by GBM.

¹⁵ Letter to GBM, dated Nov. 9, 1904 [NAC].

¹⁶ Some of LMM’s Macneill relatives went to Britain: her uncle, the Rev Leander Macneill, studied at Edinburgh University, and her Grandfather Macneill and Uncle Chester “went to England to a great Exhibition held there” c.1886: “I remember the delight and excitement when grandfather and uncle returned—the gifts and pictures and souvenirs they brought and the wonderful tales they had to tell” (*SJ* I [Jan. 7, 1910] 382).

old land other than genealogy, Montgomery was perhaps more than ordinarily susceptible to Scotland's romance. As will be noted from Montgomery's account of her honeymoon, in some respects the "homeland" she sought in Scotland existed in no place bar her imagination.

Part I of this thesis looks back at Scotland from Canada to analyse the impact of the Scottish "homeland" on L.M. Montgomery in terms of personal, clan, and community antecedents. Just as Anne travels to Scotland and then reaffirms her Canadianness—the value of which becomes clear when her sons are shipped to the European battlefields—Montgomery's trip to Scotland forms an introduction to the nature of her Canadian, or Scots-Canadian, identity. Therein sit important links between Montgomery and other Canadian authors, writers who have been more readily accepted into the "Can. Lit." canon. For many years, Montgomery's novels were pushed outside this hallowed circle: they were for children, they were regional, they were optimistic; she was, despite her Canadian birth, "formed by alien influences".¹⁷ Tongue-in-cheek, Margaret Atwood urges those not enticed by "neurotic or morbid", *serious* Canadian literature, to "settle down instead for a good read with *Anne of Green Gables*" (but adds in parenthesis, "though it's about an orphan").¹⁸ Yet Montgomery's books have proved hugely influential to Canadian writers, and many critics have noted echoes of *Anne* in Atwood's own novels, *Lady Oracle* [1976] and *Cat's Eye* [1989] in particular.¹⁹

In *Survival*, Atwood calls literature "a map, a geography of the mind". Through learning to read the map of literature, "members of a country or culture" gain the necessary knowledge of "who and where [they] have been" (18-19). Montgomery's literature maps Canada through eyes which have gazed on Scotland, both literally and in literary dreams. This does not mean, however, that her "map" is relevant only to those who share her "original type". As Adrienne Clarkson—a Hong Kong refugee who has become a leading Canadian broadcaster—recalls, Montgomery's books gave her "a profound understanding of what Canada is":

for me, the immigrant child, the world of the Cuthberts, the Lyndes, and the Barrys was the world of Canada—rural, rooted, and white—a world to which I would never have had

¹⁷ "Archibald MacMechan argues that even works having a Canadian subject are not Canadian if they 'were formed by alien influences'" (E. Holly Pike., op. cit., 64., citing MacMechan's *Headwaters of Canadian Literature* [1924]).

¹⁸ Margaret Atwood. *Survival* 35.

¹⁹ See, for example, Catherine Sheldrick Ross. "Calling back the Ghost of the Old-Time Heroine: Duncan, Montgomery, Atwood, Laurence, and Munro." *Studies in Canadian Literature*. 4.1 [1979]: 43-58; Temma F. Berg. "Sisterhood is Fearful: Female Friendship in L.M. Montgomery." *HT* 36-49. The author-heroine of *Lady Oracle* is called Joan Foster, echoing "John Foster", the author who inspires Valancy Stirling. The two girls in *Cat's Eye* are Elaine and Cordelia; each is the name of an alter-ego of Anne Shirley.

access any other way [...] the depth of understanding, the texture of generations of feuds and forgettings, the nature of the Scots-Irish [*sic*] Presbyterianism, constituted a reality that only fiction could convey [...] L.M. Montgomery understood emotions and she understood motivation; her people *are* Canada (x).²⁰

Scotswoman's Return

In July of 1911, the newly married Maud Montgomery Macdonald “returned” to the land her ancestors left behind some hundred and forty years earlier, in an age when Johnson and Boswell were touring the Highlands and watching the new emigration dance called “America”. The Macdonalds spent around a month in Scotland; in Glasgow and Edinburgh, naturally, but also as far west as Iona and north to Inverness. They visited George Boyd MacMillan in Alloa and toured the Border country from their base in the capital. Granted this was also Ewan Macdonald’s honeymoon, but it seems unlikely that his ministerial salary, his reading, or the force of his personality, would have dictated the couple’s plans. His wife had long dreamed of visiting Britain and thought the money spent on her Dalhousie education would have been better invested in a “cheap little run over England and Scotland” although her neighbours would have considered the jaunt “crazy and extravagant” (*SJ* I [Jan. 7, 1910] 391). From Montgomery’s first encounters with Scottish literature onward, a busman’s holiday was probably brewing in her mind; after *Anne*’s success she could afford to fulfil her dreams in a lengthy and rambling vacation.²¹

Montgomery’s “homecoming” was chiefly a pilgrimage to literary “shrines”; to her favourite authors’ homes at Abbotsford, Alloway, Kirriemuir, and to settings made famous by Scott—Ellen’s Isle and the Trossachs, St. Mungo’s Cathedral, Melrose Abbey, and Roslin Glen. In fact, Walter Scott’s landscapes dominated Montgomery’s visit: St Mungo’s Cathedral, Glasgow and Aberfoyle (*Rob Roy*), the Trossachs (*The Lady of the Lake*), Melrose Abbey and Roslin Chapel (*The Lay of the Last Minstrel*), Jeanie Deans’ house (*The Heart of Midlothian*), the Scott Monument in Edinburgh’s Princes Street and the writer’s grave at Dryburgh Abbey. (This pattern continued in England, with Berwick and Flodden [*“Marmion country”* as she styled it], Castle Rock in the Lake District [*The Bridal of Triermain*], and Kenilworth Castle.²²) Scott’s romantic verse and novels cradled the Scotland Montgomery understood and the Scotland she wanted to encounter.

²⁰ Adrienne Clarkson. “Foreword.” *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*: ix-xii.

²¹ In a letter dated 4 May 1911, LMM told GBM, “I want to see the Scott country, especially the *Marmion* and *Lady of the Lake* district. I want to go to ‘Kirriemuir’ and see the scenes of Barrie’s novels—in short I want to see every notable place, I’ve read about” (*My Dear Mr. M* 58).

²² Anne and Gilbert also visit Kenilworth.

None of these places—Kirriemuir aside—were unusual stops for fairly affluent (they stayed, after all, in hotels in Princes Street, and London’s Russell Square) North American tourists “doing” Britain: the Macdonalds even joined an organised “Cook” tour to Ayr and “Alloway’s auld haunted kirk”. But no actual “literary site”—saving J.M. Barrie’s Kirriemuir, which was as yet off the travellers’ beaten track²³—could rival the mental picture Montgomery had conjured from her reading: “And I resented the difference as one would resent a change made in his childhood’s home on going back to it after a long absence” (July 30, 1911: U.3.216). Time and technology were at work in the “storied land” as elsewhere, and the “silver strand” of Loch Katrine had dwindled to “a narrow strip of gray bank with a few white pebbles scattered over it” through the efforts of the Glasgow water works.²⁴ Montgomery was disappointed to find that Scotland was not what she had tricked it out to be in her imagination. “I think I shall keep the Loch Katrine of my dream in my geography of the *Lady of the Lake*,” she wrote, after her day in the Trossachs. “I like it better than the real one” (July 30, 1911: U.3.216).

The Macdonalds also followed the tourist trail around Scotland’s historic and geographic landmarks. In Glasgow, they attended the Scottish Historical Exhibition, where Montgomery considered the two most interesting relics to be “the cradle of Mary, Queen of Scots and a letter written by William Wallace” (July 19, 1911: U.3.207). They sailed from Oban, via Fingal’s Cave on Staffa, to Iona, and were impressed by the simple graves of the Scottish kings. In Edinburgh they visited the Forth Bridge, Arthur’s Seat, the Castle, and Holyrood Palace, although Montgomery was indifferent to the room wherein Rizzio was murdered, as to so much of what old Scotia’s grandeur had to offer, as she was continually preoccupied with her sufferings from cystitis.

She reckoned Inverness and the surrounding area the finest scene on their Scottish tour: they had travelled out to Culloden, with a “delightful broad Scotch” driver, and Montgomery gathered purple heather from the graves of the clans.²⁵ Further battlefields at Bannockburn and Sherriffmuir fell to the Macdonalds’ view from the top of the Wallace monument, near Stirling, “the bulwark of the North”, where they also visited the castle. Later in England, the newlyweds went to Keswick,

²³ Kirriemuir, near Forfar, was fictionalised by Barrie as “Thrums,” the setting for many of his novels, including *Tommy and Grizel* [1900], *A Window in Thrums* [1889], and *The Little Minister* [1891].

²⁴ Letter describing her honeymoon (the Macdonalds arrived in Liverpool on 15 July 1911 and left Britain on September 21), dated March 30, 1913, from LMM to Eva Macneill [LMM Collection, UG]. LMM wrote a similar letter (dated Jan. 30, 1912) to Fannie Wise Mutch, a friend from P.W.C., which was reprinted in the magazine *Kindred Spirits*, March 1993: 37-38.

²⁵ Letter to Eva Macneill, March 30, 1913.

York (and Haworth Parsonage), London (the British Museum, the Tower of London, St Paul's, Westminster Abbey, Crystal Palace, Hampton Court, Windsor Castle), Warwick Castle, Stratford-upon-Avon, Salisbury Cathedral, Stonehenge, and Oxford. This trip included nothing out of the ordinary and, save the fact that many tourists start in London and work their way to Scotland, this road is still taken by North Americans today.

It is hard not to feel some pity for the uncultured husband dragged through this honeymoon by his wife's bookish enthusiasms. In truth, however, this literary itinerary was fairly typical in its time.²⁶ Scott's writing in particular had been instrumental in popularising Scotland—especially the Highlands—as a destination for travellers. In Edwardian Britain, Victorian tourist trails through places famous in song and story were well-blazed, and the Macdonalds joined the legion of “sight seers” seeking a piece of Scotland's historical romance, although Montgomery might gripe about tour guides and having to visit monuments.²⁷ This is not to say that Montgomery thought of Scotland only in romantic terms: her “Scotch” upbringing was clearly another side to the culture of the land that inspired *The Scottish Chiefs* and *Rob Roy*, further books among her earliest Scottish readings. But nothing on this tour—except their visit to the Forth Bridge, “one of the greatest engineering wonders in the world”²⁸—was likely to modernise or demystify Montgomery's prior impressions of Scotland; other, that is, than the failure of the real Scotland to satisfy her Canadian dreams.

By expedition, L.M. Montgomery did not pursue her clan connections with Scotland, nor did she mention them in her journal account and letters relating to her honeymoon, save to say that she had an “at home” feeling in Glasgow, surveying the “names on the shops [...] McKenzie's, McLeods, Simpsons, Macneills, and so on, just like an Island street” (*SJ* II [July 18, 1911] 69).²⁹ At four generations remove from her clans' Scottish days, Montgomery seemed uninterested by the few ancestral haunts and halls that her family history told of. The “homeland” L.M. Montgomery

²⁶ When LMM first visited the States (in 1910) the “most delightful day” of her trip was spent visiting literary “shrines” in Massachusetts: the houses of Hawthorne, Emerson, Alcott. LMM commented, “It gave a strange reality to the books of theirs which I have read to see those places where they once lived and labored” (*SJ* II [Nov. 29, 1910] 32-33). Ironically, LMM had very mixed feelings about “fans” visiting her own “literary shrines”: she was glad when the Macneill farmhouse was torn down (“It would not please me to think of it being overrun by hordes of curious tourists” [*SJ* III 141]).

²⁷ “[W]e went to the Burns' Monument—just because it was on the list of ‘sights’ and the guide would have been aghast if we hadn't gone. I have no interest whatsoever in monuments. They bore me horribly” (July 30, 1911: U.3.213-4).

²⁸ Letter to Eva Macneill, Mar. 30, 1913.

²⁹ EM's family were from Skye, a place also not on their itinerary, although EM may possibly have visited Skye when living in Glasgow, 1906-1907.

sought in Scotland was the Never Land of Sentimental Tommy and Highland Mary, Roderick Dhu and Jeanie Deans. In England, by contrast, she swapped her tourist's hat for that of the investigative genealogist. Montgomery traced the Woolner (her Grandmother Macneill had been an English-born Woolner) family trail to Dunwich, Suffolk. She sniffed out the fantastically named Samuel Scarlett from "the most hopelessly stupid people I have ever tried to extract information from" (*SJ* II [Sept. 18, 1911] 78), graced his palm with "a half sovereign", and found her grandmother's old house. In so doing, an emotional Montgomery "had the strangest sensation of *coming home*" (*SJ* II 79).

Montgomery's clan connections with Scotland were less tangible than her links to Suffolk—as a boy, Mr Scarlett had attended the Woolner roup in 1836 and Montgomery learned new details of Woolner history from the Dunwich folk. But it still seems a little odd that a Canadian who wore pride in her Scots ancestry on her sleeve made no effort to explore her personal roots in Scotland, especially as her trip had the air of a "once in a lifetime" opportunity. This, at the very least, suggests that these roots were so far back in the past that she considered them lost from sight. Montgomery's return to the land of her forefathers could have been that of anyone with a erudite interest in Scotland and a Scottish pen-friend to travel with. The "romance" of Scotland—the ruined castles, the "relics", the "quaint inhabitants",³⁰ the bluebells,³¹ Tomnahurich cemetery in Inverness³²—unquestionably made an impression on Montgomery, yet she patriotically concluded, as Anne Shirley later would, that "beautiful as the old world is, the homeland is the best" (July 20, 1911: U.3.212).

In the years that followed she rarely referred to her honeymoon in her journals (the fall-out, perhaps, of a less-than-happy marriage). Surprisingly, for a writer whose work is predicated on the legacies of the Scottish diaspora in Canada, she also made few cultural comparisons between Scotland and Canada. ("Tea", she noted, by way of exception, on the Scottish side of Berwick's Union Bridge, "doesn't mean here what it means at home!" [*SJ* II (Aug. 20, 1911) 74]. Doubtless, not enough cake was forthcoming. Nor was the Sunday preaching any finer in Edinburgh.³³) The

³⁰ July 20, 1911: U.3.212.

³¹ "Scottish bluebells are certainly the sweetest things. They seem the very incarnation of Scotia's old romance" (July 30, 1911: U.3.217-218).

³² "[Tomnahurich] a Gaelic word meaning 'the hill of the fairies' and surely it must once have been a spot meet for a fairy kingdom and the revels of Titania [...] I said to Ewan as we roamed about it 'When I die bring me over here and bury me'—and if it were not that it is so far from home I think I should have meant it" (Aug. 6, 1911: U.3.224).

³³ "Sunday we went to hear two noted Edinburgh preachers and heard two very good sermons, but not any better than, if as good, as the sermons we would hear in our own Canadian cities". Letter to Eva Macneill, Mar. 30, 1913.

modern Scotland of 1911, railway strikes apart, does not appear to have captured Montgomery's attention. If asked "Stands Scotland where it did?", in her imagination at any rate, then excepting that the "centuries of romance" (*SJ* II 70) had become a little tarnished, her answer would most likely be yes. Certainly, her trip to Scotland had little discernible impact on the *Scottish* context of her writing, Anne Shirley Blythe's trip to Europe aside. The atmosphere of Scotland and "the Scotch" which she employed and evoked in her fiction seems therefore to be set by her Canadian experience—the family folk-tales, the ways of Scots-Canadians, the Scottish literature they imported—not by her own "stories or memories of friends"—and places—"in the old country".

Fathers and Forefathers

Not all critics have bemoaned the alien form in Canadian-produced literature.³⁴ In May 1991 the Centre of Canadian Studies at the University of Edinburgh held a conference on the "Scottish Influence in Canadian Literature", proceedings from which were published in the *British Journal of Canadian Studies* in 1992 (Vol. 7.1). Papers were presented on diverse Canadian authors such as Aubert de Gaspé, Alistair MacLeod, Earle Birney, and bpNichol. Janice Kulyk Keefer examines the work of four Canadian women writers who shared "ancestral links to Scotland"—Margaret Laurence, Mavis Gallant, Alice Munro, and L.M. Montgomery—in a paper entitled, "Writing and Fathers and Daughters and Death".

In these women's writing Keefer discerns a "long-established paradigm in Canadian fiction": the obsession with a dead father by a literary daughter, who in parallel, lacks a supportive mother (150).³⁵ Keefer observes that Emily Byrd Starr's love of books is a "direct inheritance" from her father, and that Emily's best writing, in *Emily of New Moon* at least, is addressed to this dead parent. (*Anne of Green Gables* was dedicated to the memory of Montgomery's mother and father.) This paper explores an interesting correlation between Montgomery's novel, and stories by more recent and more esteemed "Can. Lit." authors. It does not however (aside from a throwaway remark about the possible "inherent morbidity of the Scottish

³⁴ For an overview of some Scottish influences in Canadian writing see Elizabeth Waterston. "The Lowland Tradition in Canadian Literature." *The Scottish Tradition in Canada*. Ed. W. Stanford Reid. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1976: 203-231.

³⁵ Janice Kulyk Keefer. "Writing and Fathers and Daughters and Death." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 148-162. Kulyk Keefer discusses LMM's *Emily of New Moon* in conjunction with Laurence's "To Set Our House in Order" and "A Bird in the House", Gallant's "In Youth is Pleasure" and "Voices Lost in Snow", and Munro's "The Moons of Jupiter".

temperament" [151]) offer an explanation as to why this paradigm is discovered in the work of Canadian women with Scottish roots.

Keefer makes a passing reference to Margaret Laurence's novel *The Diviners* [1974] and to the heroine's problematic relationship with a daughter who is closer artistically to her Métis father (a song-writer) than to her authoress mother (152). But Morag Gunn, the heroine, is also a daughter; the adopted daughter of Christie Logan. Both Christie and Morag are of Highland extraction, and Christie strengthens this connection in Morag's childhood by telling her tales of the "Piper Gunn", who led their Highland ancestors from Sutherland to the Red River settlements.³⁶

In the novel, Morag travels to London where she has an affair with Daniel McRaith, a Highlander from the Black Isle. She follows him to Scotland, intending to visit the area the "Bitch-Duchess" evicted her forefathers from. When the opportunity comes, though, Morag declines to go, in a oft-quoted discovery of her Canadianness:

"I thought I would have to go. But I guess I don't after all."

"Why would that be?"

"I don't know that I can explain. It has to do with Christie. The myths are my reality. Something like that. And also, I don't need to go there because I know now what it was I had to learn here."

"What is that?"

"It's a deep land here, all right," Morag says. "But it's not mine, except a long way back. I always thought it was the land of my ancestors, but it's not."

"What is, then?"

"Christie's real country. Where I was born".³⁷

As Clara Thomas notes, "the entire McCraith [*sic*] episode becomes little more than a preparation for Morag's necessary visit to Scotland and her climactic recognition of her true homeland".³⁸

Morag Gunn "belongs" in the land of her father, not the land of her forefathers. Montgomery did not have a writer-father (although Keefer detects "an idealized portrait" [154] of Hugh John Montgomery in Douglas Starr) but like Morag Gunn she was raised in her clan and community mythology by the male "minstrelsy" in her connection. Her family claimed the minor Scottish poet, Hector Macneill [1746-1818], as a collateral ancestor, and among her Macneill relatives in Prince Edward Island were numbered several poets, who spouted their verse on local characters and events when the spirit moved at clan gatherings. Montgomery's sense of "home" was

³⁶ See Flora Alexander. "The Idea of the Highlander in *The Diviners*." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 83-90.

³⁷ Margaret Laurence. *The Diviners*. 1974. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1988: 415.

³⁸ Clara Thomas. "Margaret, Morag, and the Scottish Ancestors." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 91-101.

inspired by the oral narratives of these “fathers”, as much, or perhaps more so, as it was by the female relatives (most especially her Aunt Mary Lawson) she customarily named as progenitors. These story-tellers were Canadian, but heavily influenced by Scottish form. (Montgomery styled her Uncle Jimmie as a “mute inglorious Milton—or rather Burns” [Jan. 28, 1912: U.3].) Again, this signals a dual place in Montgomery’s psyche for Canadian fathers and Scottish forefathers (her favourite Scottish authors were predominately male), both sets bequeathing a versification of “homeland”.

Clara Thomas, referring to the consolidation of Margaret Laurence’s own literary nationalism in the 1960s, writes of Laurence’s repudiation of colonialism: “She rejected totally the negative implications of Earle Birney’s ‘it’s only by our lack of ghosts we’re haunted,’ a line that was bandied about a good deal at that time” (93). Laurence lived in Somaliland and Ghana in the 1950s and her nationalism was deeply influenced by the oppressive colonialism she witnessed there. (*The Diviners* presents analogies between the fates of the clearance Highlanders and the dispossessed Métis.) Laurence confronted some Scottish ghosts (her own and other people’s), in “an early working-out, in non-fiction, of a theme I would later in *The Diviners*, express in fiction” (145).³⁹

In this 1966 essay, “Road from the Isles”, Laurence recalls her own ancestry:

as a child I was extremely aware of my Scottish background. No one could ever tell me whether my family had been Lowlanders or Highlanders, because no one in the prairie town where I grew up seemed very certain exactly where that important dividing line came on the map of Scotland. I decided, therefore, that my people had come from the Highlands. In fact, they had not, but Highlanders seemed more interesting and more noble to me in every way. My concept of what Highlanders were was based upon Alan Breck in *Kidnapped* (146).

“[G]radually”, Laurence continued, “I began to perceive that I was no more Scots than I was Siamese. Whatever of the Old Country had filtered down to me could roughly be described as Mock Scots” (147).

When Laurence visited Scotland, armed with her adult-learned knowledge of the “reality of the Highlanders” (148) and of the Clearances, she thought to find “what personal meaning all this could have for me” (149).⁴⁰ Like Morag Gunn, Laurence discovered there was no “personal sense of connection”, beyond the familiarity of place and clan names, “ghosts [...] of another kind” (155). (“Weirdly, encountering

³⁹ Margaret Laurence. “Road from the Isles.” *Heart of a Stranger*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1976: 145-164.

⁴⁰ See also Colin Nicholson, “‘There and not there’: Aspects of Scotland in Laurence’s Writing.” *Critical Approaches to the Fiction of Margaret Laurence*. Ed. Colin Nicholson. London: Macmillan, 1990: 162-176.

them in Scotland, they seemed unreal there, or else derived, because to me they are Canadian names" [156].) She reflects that:

one's real roots do not extend very far back in time, nor very far forward. [...] I care about the ancestral past very much, but in a kind of mythical way. The ancestors, in the end, become everybody's ancestors. But the history that one can feel personally encompasses only a very few generations.

So, finally, the mock Scots retain as much emotional hold on me as the real Scots [...] These things are genuinely mine (156-157).

Laurence [d. 1987] was born in 1926, so was fifty years, or two generations younger, than L.M. Montgomery. Montgomery's ancestors were pioneer migrants to Canada, however, and the two writers lived at a similar generation gap from their Scottish forefathers. (Indeed Laurence was closer, her grandfather having been born in Scotland [146].) Both women assumed a Scottish heritage commensurate with their Scottish lineage, although Laurence took the Highland road, and Montgomery the Low. Laurence's Highland "roots" were produced by her imagination and RLS, and bookish Montgomery's professed Lowland heritage should never be accepted unquestioningly. The following exploration of homelands raises the heritage of the "mock Scots", and the literary forefathers, as well as "real roots", because all these ancestors were genuinely Montgomery's, and worked their emotional hold, no matter how "real" they were.

Taking the boat from the British Isles, Montgomery did not return to her "ain countree"⁴¹ and write an essay confirming her Canadian identity, as Margaret Laurence did (and also Hugh MacLennan, with "Scotchman's Return"). But like Anne Shirley she came back to Canada "very well satisfied" with her own land and eager to furnish her manse and put down roots in Ontario. In September of 1911, she also came back to a country that was soon to be meet the crisis of war, and a turning point in national and literary identity: a forerunner of the centennial debates Margaret Laurence returned to in the late 1960s.

⁴¹ *SJ* II [Sept. 24 1911] 80: the irony here being, of course, that LMM chooses to quote from a Scottish song by Allan Cunningham ("It's hame and it's hame") to describe Canada.

“The Fates and a Woman’s Will”

“I can’t help carrying my head at a certain angle and I can’t help feeling it is a great thing to have a century of traditions and considerable brains behind you. Not like the Potters—upstarts of yesterday!”

Emily Climbs 79

“No one can be free who has a thousand ancestors,” said Cousin Jimmy in the eerie tone in which he generally said such things.

Emily Climbs 91

L.M. Montgomery threatened to “haunt” Ephraim Weber should he ever write her biography. “Biography is a *screaming farce*” she snarled. “No man or woman was *ever* truly depicted”.¹ Certainly, the biographic “sketches” of Montgomery that appeared in her lifetime were frothy stuff; often spilling into farce when the biographers, like Florence Livesay in a 1927 article for the *Toronto Star*, insisted that among old friends, “She’s Still ‘Lucy Maud’” (a name by which Montgomery was never known).² Be they froth or farce, these biographies consistently supported a “wholesome” image of L.M. Montgomery that she in turn colluded with, hardly surprising given her troubled private life. This image has survived to some extent in the half-century since Montgomery’s death: Hilda M. Ridley’s *The Story of L.M. Montgomery* [1955] was quintessentially “nice”.³ Despite the publication of less wholesome details, in Mollie Gillen’s biography, in Profs Rubio and Waterston’s short volume, *Writing a Life* [1995],⁴ and in Montgomery’s journals themselves,

¹ Letter to EW, dated Nov. 10, 1907, *The Green Gables Letters* 58.

² Memorabilia Scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG. Livesay caused LMM particular consternation by quoting “lies” told by LMM’s detested school-teacher, Izzie Robinson Warren, now taking pride in the pupil she once ridiculed. After reading this article LMM commented that she would “give up believing anything I see in ‘de paper news’ about anybody!” (*SJ* III [Oct. 29, 1927] 358).

³ Ridley had no access to either LMM’s letters or journals, although she was able to interview LMM’s friends and relatives, including Chester Macdonald.

⁴ Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. *Writing a Life: L.M. Montgomery*. Toronto: ECW Press, 1995. This is a taster for Mary Rubio’s forthcoming biography which promises to be definitive. One other biography has been published: Harry Bruce’s *Maud: The Life of L.M. Montgomery*. Toronto:

many fans still treasure an image of Montgomery that accords with the happy endings in her novels.

L.M. Montgomery's life story was first made known to her fans through the Page firm's various promotions. Some five months after the publication of *Anne*—not quite awakening to find herself famous but certainly incredulous at her “best-seller” status—Montgomery recorded that “Page” had written “asking for my photo and a personal sketch of how ‘Anne’ came to be written to give to ‘inquisitive editors’” (*SJ I* [Oct. 15, 1908] 339). American interest in her “biography” (and dress and demeanour) had been fuelled by Montgomery's trip to Boston in November 1910. Montgomery was the guest of Lewis and George Page, who arranged interviews with the *Herald*, the *Post*, the *Traveller*, and the *Republic* (*SJ II* [Nov. 29, 1910] 29-30).⁵ The *Post* article seems typical of the rest and concentrated (topics of dress and demeanour over) on Montgomery's impressions of Boston, her novels past and future, and her opinion on the subject Bostonians were deliberating that month, women's suffrage.⁶ These articles were short and saccharine, and contained little of “real-life” apart from to state that Montgomery hailed from Prince Edward Island and set her books there. (This had, incredibly, eluded some contemporary reviewers.⁷)

When she “flitted” to rural Ontario, L.M. Montgomery was more accessible to columnists and the “facts” of her life were exposed to increasing, if still artless, attention. Toronto journalist Marjorie MacMurchy, who met Montgomery in PEI in 1910 (Aug. 10, 1910: U.3), penned an effusive article on L.M. Montgomery, “as she appears to those who know her in her home-life as Mrs. Ewan MacDonald [*sic*], a

Seal Bantam, 1992. The dust jacket promises readers the story of “a vibrant young woman who was so attractive to men that she was pursued and proposed to frequently [but] never wed the one man she truly desired”!

⁵ LMM almost consistently misspells “Lewis” as “Louis” Page. LMM spent a fortnight in Boston, in which she “lived more, learned more, enjoyed more” than in the previous twelve years (*SJ II* [Nov. 29, 1910] 19).

⁶ “Says Woman's Place is Home: Authoress Gives Views on Suffrage.” Memorabilia scrapbook [Red 1], LMM Collection, UG: “No, I am not a suffragette,” she declared. “Do you know I was told that question would be asked me just as soon as I arrived in Boston. I am a quiet, plain sort of a person and while I believe a woman, if intelligent, should be allowed to vote, I would have no use for suffrage myself. I have no aspirations to become a politician. I believe that a woman's place is in the home”.

⁷ LMM joked that, “Geography is not a strong point with some critics”. She listed various locations identified as the setting for her books: “The scene is laid in Nova Scotia”—“A girl adopted into a New England family”—“rural life in New England”—“The country of the novel is New Brunswick”—“The scene is Avonlea peninsula jutting out into the Gulf of St. Lawrence”—“Life on Victoria Island near Nova Scotia. So far away one might doubt the actual existence of Victoria Island but one has the testimony of the geography to the existence of Nova Scotia”—“This detached portion of land near Newfoundland”—“A story of life in a Breton fishing village”—“The scene is laid in Scotland”—“The scene is laid in Cape Breton Island”—“A Prince's Island college”—“A play of American farm life”—“*Western* Canada is a charming setting for this story”—“a story of American girlhood” (*SJ IV* [March 1, 1930] 40-41).

charming wife and mother as well as the writer of many delightful books".⁸ (This article followed soon after a speech, "Prince Edward Island", given by Montgomery to the Women's Canadian Club in Toronto in November 1913.) Importantly, MacMurchy's self-proclaimed "task"—other, that is, than serving syrupy prose about PEI, the "dear place" of fairies and sunshine and "promise-of-good-coming-true"—was to "trace the connection between Miss Montgomery's gift as a story writer and Prince Edward Island". To do so, MacMurchy summoned Montgomery's ancestors, espousing the literary strain of the Macneills and the determination and success of the Montgomerys.

The tales of Montgomery's forebears were given their first published airing by MacMurchy.⁹ As vague (MacMurchy gave Montgomery's birth-date as sometime in the "seventies or eighties of the nineteenth century") and obsequious as this article is, it nevertheless appears to reflect L.M. Montgomery's way of *speaking* (in public) about her early cultural environment, and anticipates the ways in which she would describe this influence in *The Alpine Path*, a six-part sketch—subtitled "The Story of My Career"—published in the Toronto magazine, *Everywoman's World* in 1917.¹⁰ Both accounts find the source of Montgomery's talent and success in her clan inheritances, thereby linking her literary creativity to Scotland.

What Everywoman Knows

L.M. Montgomery often complained that she was tormented by fans asking if her characters were based on "real" people.¹¹ Yet, when she came to write her short "autobiography" at the age of forty-one, she played to the crowd by filtering her life-story through her books. The stories she told of her upbringing were such as could be easily correlated by an "inquisitive editor" to the adventures of Anne and the cousins in the "Story Girl" books. (Perhaps by way of explanation, Montgomery prefaced these sketches by claiming that in her literary apprenticeship she had learned to accommodate "the whims of editors to [...] an inveterate degree"

⁸ Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG. Marjorie MacMurchy (later Lady Willison) was the author of *The Child's House* [1923] and *The Longest Way Round* [1937].

⁹ Marjorie (and her sisters Helen and Bessie) remained "acquaintances" of LMM, but she considered them "baffling and inhuman", "the inhabitants of another planet", and "with passing years [...] much less amusing and much more disagreeable" (*SJ* II [Apr. 15, 1917] 215).

¹⁰ LMM started writing her autobiography in October 1916. The six articles that comprise *The Alpine Path* were published in *Everywoman's World* between June and November 1917. They were collected and reprinted in book form in 1974.

¹¹ LMM claimed that her characters were composites or inventions but acknowledged that she had "woven a great deal of reality" into her books, such as "real places and speeches" (*SJ* II [Jan. 27, 1911] 38).

[TAP 9].) *The Alpine Path* attended to the golden age of childhood, and Montgomery passed swiftly over her adult-life by transcribing journal entries from her stint on the *Echo*, and her honeymoon.¹² As she explained:

I have written at length about the incidents and environments of my childhood because they had a marked influence on the development of my literary gift. A different environment would have given it a different bias. Were it not for those Cavendish years, I do not think *Anne of Green Gables* would ever have been written (TAP 52).

The Alpine Path took its title from a piece of magazine verse Montgomery had pasted into one of her memorabilia scrapbooks: “all through my childhood and girlhood it was more of an inspiration to me than all Milton’s starry splendor” (SJ III [Nov. 22, 1926] 316-317). Latterly “The Fringed Gentian” echoed as a mantra for success—both for Montgomery and her heroine Emily Byrd Starr—a literary feminist equivalent of Coué’s formula:

Then whisper blossom in thy sleep
How I may upward climb
The Alpine path, so hard, so steep
That leads to heights sublime.
How I may reach that far-off goal
Of true and honored fame
And write upon its shining scroll
A woman’s humble name.¹³

This was one of three literary signposts Montgomery invoked in *The Alpine Path* to bolster her clan inheritances.

The text also cites Keats’ *Endymion*, which warns, “He is ne’er crown’d/ With immortality, who fears to follow/ Where airy voices lead” (Book II, l. 213). These “airy voices” are analogue to Emerson’s “dialogue divine”—the words the “poet” hears, and must chase.¹⁴ Montgomery compared the pursuit of these “random words” of the gods to Christian’s journey to the Celestial City in *The Pilgrim’s Progress*:

¹² The honeymoon passages are wrongly ascribed to 1912, the year that LMM copied these details from notebook to journal proper. Journal entries for 1911, after 4 March, are sub-entries of a large section dated 28 January 1912.

¹³ I have cited the last of the poem’s four verses. LMM did not know the author’s name. Genevieve Wiggins cites an article from *Kindred Spirits* magazine (by Carol Gaboury) identifying the poem as part of a serial, “Tam, the Story of a Woman” by Ella Rodman Church and Augusta De Budna, published in *Godey’s Lady’s Book*, March 1884.

¹⁴ Ralph Waldo Emerson, “The Poet”: “The gods talk in the breath of the woods,/ They talk in the shaken pine,/ And fill the long reach of the old seashore/ With a dialogue divine/ And the poet who overhears/ Some random word they say/ Is the fated man of men/ Whom the ages must obey.” LMM makes repeated use of this verse (often in conjunction with “The Fringed Gentian”) in the “Emily” series.

We must follow our “airy voices,” follow them through bitter suffering and discouragement and darkness, through doubt and disbelief, through valleys of humiliation and over delectable hills where sweet things would lure us away from our quest, ever and always must we follow, if we would reach the “far-off divine event” and look out thence to the aerial spires of our City of Fulfilment (*TAP* 95-95).¹⁵

These are markers for Montgomery’s literary career. She has fallen heir to a divine gift which she has accepted, although this may not have been a matter of choice; this legacy was ultimately a blessing, but could bring struggle and disappointment before the reward was reaped; integral to the pursuit of this gift was her womanhood.

The parallels between these literary allusions and Montgomery’s clan heritage are made concrete. The “airy voices” (“my knack of writing and my literary tastes” [*TAP* 13]) are part of the Macneills’ creative legacy, a gift from the gods, fuelled in turn by the “traditions and tales on both sides of the family” (*TAP* 11). Her own “poetry” was equally inspired by “the little Province that gave us birth” (*TAP* 10), where the Montgomerys would not have settled, had not “the fates and a woman’s will [taken] a hand in the thing” (*TAP* 11-12). But in her progress to fulfilment she faced challenges and humiliations from the tongues of her relatives, whose alleged conceit, pride, and vainglory were proverbial. Belying its outward sweet simplicity, then, *The Alpine Path* has a crafted structure. It ships the reader from the emigration of L.M. Montgomery’s forebears, through their endeavours and successes on Canadian soil, to the pinnacle of literary success, the reception of *Anne*. Montgomery then journeys back to Scotland again, describing her pilgrimage to the land of her forefathers. The readers of 1917 would be left in no doubt as to the importance, strength, and vitality of L.M. Montgomery’s Scottish roots.

Yet L.M. Montgomery was later to write in her journals, “I’m a queer mix racially—the Scotch Macneills, the English Woolners and Penmans, the Irish of Mary McShannon (Hugh Montgomery’s wife) and that far-off French descent” (*SJ* III [June 27, 1929] 398). This was to glamorise matters somewhat. Montgomery thought that Mary MacShannon “ought to have been Irish from her name” (*SJ* IV [June 2, 1931] 130), but had no other reason for thinking so. By “French descent”, she referred to the Gallic origin of the Montgomeries who followed William the Conqueror to England, whence to Scotland.¹⁶ Four or five generations away from the old country, Montgomery could never give more than a limited ancestral history in

¹⁵ The quote “far-off divine event” comes from Tennyson’s *In Memoriam A.H.H.* “Epilogue” l. 143.

¹⁶ LMM prepared genealogical papers tracing the Montgomery family were back to Normandy (*SJ* I xiii).

The Alpine Path. The seductive mosaic of inheritance was sacrificed: Montgomery's primary objective was to name her parents and chase their lineage.

By her account here, L.M. Montgomery's paternal ancestors left Scotland destined for *Quebec*. Their ship docked in P.E. Island to replenish supplies, but the family were forced to remain there when Mary Montgomery, who was hopelessly sea-sick, refused to re-embark.¹⁷ Montgomery illustrated both her indebtedness to a strong female ancestor, and the debt of her fans, for, wanting Mary's obstinacy, there would have been no Montgomerys in PEI, and consequently no *Anne of Green Gables*. This story was one which Montgomery "told [...] a hundred times" during her life, to "account for [her] 'good fortune' in being born in P.E. Island, instead of Quebec".¹⁸ Maud Montgomery's tenacity in persisting with her chosen career became the atavism of her great-great-grandmother Montgomery's resolution. She augmented this with the tale of her great-grandmothers, Nancy and Betsy Penman, a story familiar to readers as, "How Betty Sherman Won a Husband" (*TSG* Ch. 7). As this title suggests, the anecdote of how Donald Montgomery tricked his sometime friend, David Murray, leaving David drunk and snoring and Donald free to propose to the object of their affections, Nancy Penman, is superseded by a companion piece: Nancy's sister Betsy ("Betty Sherman") proposed to the spurned David, occasioning, reputedly, the happier marriage of the two.¹⁹

Turning next to the Macneills, Montgomery mentioned (as MacMurchy did) the reputed cousinship between the first PEI Macneill, John Macneill [c.1750-1815] and poet Hector Macneill [1746-1818]. It is hard to credit that many readers of *The Alpine Path* (or of anything else for that matter) would be familiar with his verse, almost their only notoriety (as Montgomery acknowledged) being that they were commended by Byron in *English Bards and Scotch Reviewers*,²⁰ and sometimes attributed to Robert Burns [1759-1796]. Nothing daunted, Montgomery repeatedly trumpeted her "connection" to the author of the lyrics, "I lo'ed ne'er a laddie but ane", "Come under my Plaidie", and "Saw ye my wee thing, saw ye my ain thing", and projected Hector Macneill as a benefactor of the poetic strain in the Macneill

¹⁷ LMM learned in 1931, "that Mary MacShannon Montgomery *bribed* the captain of the vessel with a *bottle of whiskey* to set her onshore that day of days! After all, prohibition may not be an unmixed blessing!" (*SJ* IV [Sept. 6, 1931] 148). LMM does not speculate on the high improbability that Mary Montgomery would have a full bottle of whisky after two months of sea-sickness.

¹⁸ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 12, 1939, *My Dear Mr. M* 197.

¹⁹ LMM's Grandfather Montgomery was the son of Donald and Nancy, and the Senator's first wife, Anne Murray, the daughter of David and Betsy. LMM therefore had only seven sets of great-great grandparents. (Donald Sr.'s brother, Hugh Montgomery, married Christy Penman, a third sister, although LMM never alludes to this match.)

²⁰ i.e. "Yet still some genuine sons 'tis hers to boast,/ Who, least affecting, still affect the most:/ Feel as they write, and write but as they feel—/ Bear witness Gifford, Sotheby, Macneil" (l. 815-818).

family.²¹ Late in life she confessed that Hector Macneill, “wrote three of the loveliest lyrics in the world—and nothing else worth mentioning. All the rest of his poems are trash” (Feb. 28, 1939: U.10). Perhaps she waxed sarcastic when writing that she credited the connection because “all our Macneills had the literary strain in them and some of them composed poetry quite as good as Hector Macneill’s” (*SJIV* [June 2, 1931] 123)?

This Macneill history called to mind L.M. Montgomery’s great-uncles James (Jimmie) and William, who both won a local reputation for their political, satiric, and mock-heroic oral poetry; and her great-aunt Mary Lawson, the clan raconteur to whom *The Golden Road* is dedicated.²² All three were siblings of Montgomery’s stern grandfather, Alexander Marquis Macneill, who seems to have had his own “poetic” gifts, although Montgomery, resentful of her treatment at his hands, seldom acknowledged them.

L.M. Montgomery told how John Macneill had emigrated to Prince Edward Island in 1775: an adherent of the “unfortunate” Stuart cause he decided that “a change of climate would probably be beneficial” (*TAP* 13). Both this story and the detail that James Townsend “received a grant of Prince Edward Island land from George III, which he called Park Corner, after the old family estate in England” (*TAP* 14), were taken from a letter about the Macneills written by Mary Lawson (who died in 1912) to a great-nephew in July 1909.²³ (John Macneill’s eldest son, William Simpson Macneill [1782-1870], married James’s granddaughter, Eliza Bliss Townsend.²⁴)

As to the connection with the Stuart cause, this is “unfortunate” in that there appears to be some confusion as to which Stuart family Macneill actually followed. Mary Lawson edged nearer the truth when she wrote that “[John Macneill’s] ancestors had followed the house of Stewart till their defeat at Culloden and when one of their ancestors got the appointment of Judge of the Island he cast in his lot with them and came here from Argyllshire”. The Stewart family of Campbeltown,

²¹ Montgomery parodied this last lyric in “How We Went to the Wedding”, originally published in *Housewife* April, May 1913. Two versifying cousins travel across the Canadian prairies. Their Indian guide absconds with the girls’ pork ham, thus their song: “Saw ye my wee ham, saw ye my ain ham, / Saw ye my pork ham down on yon lea? / Crossed it the prairie last night in the darkness / Borne by an old and unprincipled Cree?” (*ATO* 118).

²² “To the memory of Aunt Mary Lawson who told me many of the tales repeated by the Story Girl”. LMM described Mary Lawson as a “splendid conversationalist” celebrated for her “tales and recollections of her youth; and all the vivid doings and sayings of folks in those young years of the colony” (June 9, 1911: U.3.194-195).

²³ Letter from Mary Lawson to Harold MacDougall, LMM Collection, UG (XZ1 MS A098018). LMM preserved this copy for her son Stuart.

²⁴ William was known locally as “Speaker Macneill”, having been the Speaker in the PEI Legislature for sixteen years.

Kintyre were infamous in PEI's early history.²⁵ As their "exile" had its roots in the Campbeltown herring business, the truer story is notably lacking in the romance of Charlie o'er the water and the chevalier's defeat at Culloden. But had Montgomery known this Stewart history—and it is probably safe to assume she did not—it is likewise near certain that it would *not* have found its way into *this* story of her career.

Clan history in *The Alpine Path* is streamlined, simplified, snobbish even. Far from being a "queer mix" of races, Montgomery presents herself as "of Scotch ancestry with a dash of English from several 'grands' and 'greats'".²⁶ The English Woolners are absent and the Macdonalds' honeymoon trip to Dunwich—"the most interesting of all our expeditions" (*SJ* II [Sept. 18, 1911] 78)—is overlooked. Montgomery favours her airy Scottish literary voices over such a tangible—and unpoetic—ancestry. Her English "dash" is instead supported by the Townsend line, which could boast of Old World estates, PEI proprietorship, and loyal service to the British king. The Townsend family even had strong willed women in their ranks: Eliza's grandmother, Elizabeth Townsend, kept her bonnet on for weeks after landing in PEI, hoping that she could go home.²⁷

Omissions notwithstanding, *The Alpine Path* showed that L.M. Montgomery felt her ancestry to be special and that she believed it conferred a special status on her. Indirectly confronting the archetype of the exiled Highland Scot, she portrayed her forebears not as negligible, poor or desperate, but distinctive, fortunate, and commanding. Her ancestors were neither anonymous colonists stripped of their heritage, nor clearance victims stripped of their livelihood. Rather they were bursting with traditions and customs and "romance". Concurrently, she portrayed her family as farmer-poets and home-bodies, who told stories and fell in love and were "loyal, clannish, upright, God-fearing folk, inheriting traditions of faith and simplicity and aspiration" (*TAP* 18): for all the world, then, like the "hardy sons of rustic toil" that Burns immortalised in "The Cotter's Saturday Night", a favoured recitation piece of Montgomery's (*SJ* II [Dec. 22, 1919] 359). In emphasising the Scottish influence on her childhood environment, she placed Scotland at the heart of her literary gift and style. Stories, folk-tales more than fictions, were at the core of her personal history:

²⁵ See James P. Lawson's "The Princetown Pioneers, 1769-1771: The Anatomy of a Migration." *IM*. 38 [Fall/ Winter 1995]: 7-14; J.M. Bumsted. "The Stewart Family and the Origins of Political Conflict on PEI." *IM*. 9 [Spring-Summer 1981]: 12-18; F.L. Pigot. *John Stewart of Mount Stewart*. Summerside, PEI: Prince Edward Island Heritage Foundation, 1974.

²⁶ LMM may have wanted to emphasise Scottish-Canadian connections and the strength of Empire ties in the midst of the Great War. The supposed Irish origin of Mary MacShannon is suppressed and she is referred to as Mrs Montgomery.

²⁷ LMM later asked, "I wonder if it is from her I inherit the agonizing nostalgia that has gripped me so often in life" (*SJ* IV 124).

clan mythology was revealed as a powerful psychological force in her life and her work.

Much of *The Alpine Path* is, of course, toffee. Although Montgomery faithfully answered every fan-letter, gave recitations to groups of school-girls, spent hours signing autographs and explaining to the devotees that no, "Anne," was not a real person, she made enough references to the "freaks" who considered themselves "kindred spirits" to raise doubts as to how seriously she regarded the task of writing this "autobiography".²⁸ If this casts aspersions on a perfectionist with a literary reputation to maintain, perhaps it is more judicious to say that Montgomery did not treat the demands of *this* audience too seriously and understandably did not want to compromise either her privacy *or* her public image. Montgomery selected only stories the fans of her novels would recognise and which, for their part, incorporated aspects of her personality that readers could associate with a capricious idea of what a minister's wife who wrote "wholesome" fiction should be.²⁹ (Importantly, each clan story also served to distance the "author of Anne" from her rootless orphan.)

The Alpine Path is an instructive portrait of L.M. Montgomery's public face: the image it fixed was carried by newspaper sketches and magazine articles for years. But *The Alpine Path* also delivered up the story of Montgomery's Scottish ancestry for public consumption, and is therefore testament to the anticipated Canadian perception of such a Scottish heritage, especially one that appears to have a Lowland bias. Clearly readers of *Everywoman's World* were expected to accord with Montgomery that her Scottish heritage was something to be proud of; indeed, that she was raised in the crème de la crème of Canadian rural society.

²⁸ LMM wrote to EW, "I wish I'd never written about 'kindred spirits' in my book. Every freak who has written to me about it claims to be a 'kindred spirit'. I am going to dedicate my new book to 'kindred spirits'. *You*, therefore, will have a share in it. But many folks will *think* they have who *haven't*" (Gillen 60).

²⁹ "Judging from the letters I get, my readers, at least the young and romantic portion, seem to imagine that I never do anything, except sit, beautifully arrayed, at a desk and 'create' 'Annes' and 'Emilys'! They might admit that I sometimes washed dishes or dusted a room but I'm sure they'd never think I cleaned horse stables!" (*SJ* III [May 26, 1924] 185). For another wholesome sketch of LMM see Ethel Chapman, "The Author of Anne". *MacLean's Magazine*. 32 [October 1919]: 102, 104, 106.

Feeling at Home

The existing letters from L.M. Montgomery to Ephraim Weber contain few references to Montgomery's Scottish ancestors. To be sure, her first letters, which would have included a personal introduction of sorts, are missing, but there may be more to this.³⁰ Reading their correspondence it becomes rapidly clear that although both were Canadian writers trying to carve a niche in a literary market dominated by the United States, their cultural backgrounds were very different. In particular, Montgomery possessed a literary heritage that Weber lacked. She gushed to Weber about receiving tansy from the Black Dwarf's grave (courtesy of MacMillan), but in her next letter explained, obviously in response to Weber's bewilderment, that *The Black Dwarf* was a novel by Walter Scott.³¹

Again, in one of her last letters to Weber, Montgomery referred to the death of J.M. Barrie, asked Weber if he was familiar with JMB's work, and added, "I have a sneaking suspicion that you might not care for it" (June 18, 1937 [NAC]). Earlier, in a letter dated 16-30 July 1933, Montgomery told Weber that she had been re-reading Ian Maclaren's novels. She added, however, that because Weber had "no 'Scotch'" in [his] veins and [had] never heard the 'Doric' talked" she thought he might not enjoy them. (Interestingly, she felt that Mrs Weber [*née* Annie Campbell Melrose] "would feel more at home with them".) She may, whether consciously or unconsciously, have felt that tales of her Scottish ancestors, and their Scots-Canadian lifestyle, would not be something that her Germanic, Mennonite Canadian correspondent would feel "at home" with. (He certainly always seemed to be out-of-step with her novels.³²) It is interesting that the ancestry and environment that Montgomery considered a defining influence on her fiction, played such a small role in a correspondence founded on a shared literary career.

By contrast, Montgomery correctly presumed that MacMillan had read *Rob Roy*: "I understand it is an insult to a Scotchman to ask him if he has read Scott's novels!"³³ Montgomery's letters to MacMillan are frank, friendly, and initially even flirtatious. (She mislead him into thinking she was twenty-six, not twenty-nine,

³⁰ No letters survive from LMM before that dated 7 March 1905, EW having initially written to LMM on 12 March 1903.

³¹ Letters to EW, March 7, 1905 and May 8, 1905 (*The Green Gables Letters*).

³² Whereas the correspondence with GBM is littered with discussions on LMM's novels, plot-lines, and literary influences, and GBM seems an ardent and interested fan—by the end of 1936 GBM had seen the "talkie" of *Anne of Green Gables* seven times, three times more than LMM herself—the EW correspondence contains fewer such deliberations.

³³ Letter to GBM, Jan. 12, 1905 [NAC].

when she first wrote to him, and paraded her feminine accomplishments [*Mr Dear Mr. M* 2-4].³⁴) Their fraternity grew in part from her perception of their shared cultural heritage. Montgomery enthused about her own “Scottish” background in order to illustrate her personal connection with MacMillan’s native land. Her introductory letter launched immediately into her joy at having a correspondent in Scotland—“the most delightful and interesting land on earth” (*My Dear Mr. M* 2)—and announced her own Scottish credentials:

I am Canadian born and bred but my forefathers on both sides were from Scotland. Our family of Montgomery claim kinship with the Earls of Eglinton. My mother was a Macneill, which is even “Scotchier” still.³⁵

In her Cavendish letters to MacMillan, Montgomery referred to a wealth of Scottish subjects: language and literature, history and geography. By return of post she gloated rapturously over the postcards MacMillan mailed her of Scottish views.³⁶

Once again, though, the dual homeland comes into play. Montgomery delighted in her Scottish connections but also seemed keen to educate her Alloa friend about Canada. (She may even have expressly adopted this role, for at one stage MacMillan considered emigration.³⁷) In their “literary” friendship Montgomery and MacMillan discussed the “classic” works and contemporary books that captured their interest, or proved illustrative of the other’s culture. Each Christmas they exchanged books and Montgomery purposefully sent MacMillan Canadian works—poetry by Ethelwyn Wetherald, Robert Service, Bliss Carman, Marjorie Pickthall, and Wilson Macdonald, books on Canadian life such as *The Book of Ultima Thule*, *Winter in Canada*, and *Spinning Wheels and Homespun*—receiving from him Scottish novels, poems and papers, and British books, including *The Flower-Patch Among the Hills*, *The Golden Age*, and *The Wind in the Willows*.³⁸

³⁴ GBM’s letters to LMM do not survive.

³⁵ Lest GBM failed to note this reference, LMM repeated the claim in a letter of Nov. 9, 1904: “By the way have you ever been near Eglinton Castle, the habitat of the Montgomeries, earls of Eglinton. We claim descent from them” (*My Dear Mr. M* 7). A letter of Aug. 23, 1905 [NAC] finds LMM thanking GBM for the picture of her “ancestral halls”: a Montgomery seat perhaps?

³⁶ These cards often had a literary connection, e.g. the “Douglas Room”, Loch Lomond, “Edinburgh Cathedral” (LMM alludes to the “Prentice Pillar,” so perhaps refers to Roslin), Ayr, Perth, the Gypsy Glen—“It made me think of Barrie’s Scotch novels” (Letter to GBM, Nov. 9, 1904 [NAC])—the Birks of Aberfeldy. LMM used “Lake” postcards from GBM to illustrate her copy of Scott’s poems (Letter to GBM, Jan. 12, 1905 [NAC]).

³⁷ LMM responded to GBM’s plan in a letter of Dec. 27, 1910 [NAC].

³⁸ *The Book of Ultima Thule* [1927], by Archibald MacMechan (LMM’s English Professor at Dalhousie University), describes Nova Scotia. LMM thought Helen E. Williams’ *Spinning Wheels and Homespun* [1923] would give GBM a good idea of Canadian country life (Note to GBM, dated Mar. 14, 1924 [NAC]). *The Flower-Patch Among the Hills* was written by Flora Klickmann.

Montgomery also described the customs and culture of Prince Edward Island. She referred to the differences between Lowland and Highland Scots communities on the Island, and commented on the continuing influence of Scottish ways in each. Montgomery shared anecdotes about the Gaelic language, Highland superstition, and sects of Presbyterian belief. Montgomery's citation of these Scottish traditions in Canada was complex. She preserved stories about PEI's Highland communities because they described something unfamiliar to her; yet she nonetheless perceived a shared heritage, at some level, between herself and the anecdote and MacMillan.

For example, early in their friendship, MacMillan asked Montgomery (presumably after she made a reference to Ian Maclaren) what she thought of "the Doric". Montgomery replied that she loved it, although she had "never heard it spoken" (contradicting a plethora of comments she makes elsewhere). She continued by recalling a recent trip to a Highland settlement in PEI, where she stayed with a friend whose mother-in-law spoke only Gaelic. This sounded like "fearful gibberish" to Montgomery.³⁹ Although it emerged that Montgomery's encounter with "gibberish" was even thus more acquaintance than MacMillan had with Gaelic, she obviously intended this story to be a topic of mutual interest, *despite* the fact that the experience was remarkable precisely because it was alien to *her* Scots-Canadian upbringing.

Montgomery demonstrated through the unfamiliar, what her familiar environment was; that is, a Scottish community that was non-Highland and non-Gaelic. (This anecdote is testament both to the settlement separation of culturally dissimilar Scottish migrants in PEI, and, with the detail that Mary Beaton's three-year-old son could understand the Gaelic language *but would not speak it*, places this separation, and *preservation*, at the point of change.) Importantly, she described as "odd" the fact that heard more Gaelic than the Scotsman. An upbringing in Canada's smallest province, where different ethnic groups often dwelt in separate townships but were, nonetheless, geographically close, probably exposed Montgomery to a greater variety of Scottish cultural complexities and experiences than she would have had on native soil.

Paradoxically, the letters to MacMillan contain few clan stories, more awash with direct Scottish references than any of Montgomery's work though they are. She made no allusion to Hector Macneill, John Macneill or the Stuart cause. Although

³⁹ Letter to GBM, dated Jan. 12, 1905 [NAC]. In the fall of 1904 (cf. unpublished journal entries of October 5 and 24) LMM went to O'Leary, PEI, to visit her P.W.C. friend, Mary Campbell, who married a "solid-looking Highlander," Archie Beaton, in 1900 (*SJ* II [Aug. 5, 1900] 252).

the Nancy Penman story had an early airing,⁴⁰ Mary MacShannon's tale was not recounted to MacMillan until Montgomery's last lengthy letter to him, in 1939, and even then its interest was as a "coincidence", tales of the unexpected that appealed to them both.⁴¹ Montgomery seemed keener to explore the ongoing and evolving manifestations of Scottish ways in Canada, and what she described was often beyond personal history. Montgomery, envious of MacMillan's "storied land",⁴² sought to capture PEI's spirit of place, whether through the legends of the shore (Cape Leforce, the "Yankee Storm," the *Franklin Dexter*), her nature descriptions, or her tales of Scots-Canadian folk.

* * *

All Montgomery's writing, whether correspondence, fiction, journal-keeping, or journalism, entails the recycling, repetition, alteration, and selection of core stories and incidents. As is apparent from *The Alpine Path*, L.M. Montgomery could adapt these stories to occasion or audience. Although Montgomery once wrote that she wished "it were permissible to write fiction about oneself, when asked for an 'autobiographical sketch'" (she was "so tired of writing the same old facts over and over" and "could imagine a heap of things [...] far more interesting than what I know"⁴³) her retelling of these ancestral stories was in truth an imaginative practice through which she explored her personal mythology. For the story of her career, this uncommon birthright was portrayed as a direct precursor to both her literary gift and her creativity.

Written not for everywoman but the audience of two male authors, her correspondence covered common ground. The three writers communicated (at least initially) for mutual-aid and sympathy in their chosen vocation: that so many of their letters focus on this *toil* may have partly precluded reference by Montgomery to the fortunate kismet of her gene-pool. Although many passages in the letters to MacMillan and Weber are identical,⁴⁴ Montgomery's friendship with each man is a distinctive thing, and nowhere more so than in the contrasting dearth of (Weber) and delight in (MacMillan) her Scottish heritage. Whereas *The Alpine Path* loses its

⁴⁰ When LMM wrote that she would "like anything in praise of Burns" she was reminded of her of her great grandfather's statement that he'd "love a weasel if it was named Nancy": "thereby hangs a tale", she wrote, before repeating the "family romance". (Letter to GBM, dated June 5, 1905, *My Dear Mr. M* 9-11.) LMM included a map of the area where the peculiar courtship happened.

⁴¹ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 7-24, 1939, *My Dear Mr. M* 191-198.

⁴² Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910 [NAC].

⁴³ "How I Became a Writer". Published c. 1921. Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM collection, UG.

⁴⁴ Over the years, with escalating demands on her time and the once frequent letters becoming biennial events, Montgomery relied more heavily on her journal entries for source material for these letters, thus the overlap.

impetus after the arrival of *Anne*, Montgomery's career as told to her correspondents was a continuing story, where pride and distinction lay not in the Scots pioneers who had gone before, but in an evolving Canadian identity. With Weber she shared nationality but not identity. With MacMillan, their common ground was the Scottish inheritance which informed Montgomery's Canadian identity.

"Too Delicious to be Lost"

In 1930, L.M. Montgomery was "amused" to read that an Ontario youth group was staging a play telling the story of her life: "amused" because the public knew little of her life, which was "just as well—both for me and for their illusions" (*SJ* IV [April 9, 1930] 45). (Ironically, many of her difficulties were exacerbated by her attempts to conform to this public image.) She wrote that the "real *me*" and her "real life" could only be found in her journals (*SJ* I [Nov. 10, 1908] 342). In other words, her journals were the "key" to her real life, where "key" means clue or code, presumably. The journals were an outlet for Montgomery's less socially-countenanced emotions and outbursts, as well as the receptacle for a story she felt unfit for public consumption (in her lifetime)—a book form of Dorian Gray's picture—and many friends and relatives who have read the diaries cannot recognise the woman locked in the pages as the likeness of someone they knew.

However, as Judy Simons warns, "the awareness of who might read the personal journal determines both its subject matter and its approach and consequently calls into question the whole status of the diary as a private literary construct" (2).⁴⁵ Montgomery's journal was physically locked, but not private. An antidote to her "silly" childish it-rained-today-diary, what originated as an account of life-events "worth writing about", became a potential publication when celebrity gave rise to public curiosity in her "story". This transformation was worked in stages where Montgomery addressed an audience of her children, descendants, readers, and literary heirs. While the growing possibility of a prospective readership was damaging to accuracy and objectivity, it also made the diary a secure place for material "too delicious to be lost" (*SJ* IV [Sept. 6, 1931] 148). In her journal she could preserve stories "against any accident" (*SJ* IV [June 2, 1931] 122).

In her study of literary women's diaries, Simons finds that "women frequently took upon themselves the role of family historian, their diaries providing a communal

⁴⁵ Judy Simons. *Diaries and Journals of Literary Women from Fanny Burney to Virginia Woolf*. London: Macmillan, 1990.

chronicle of domestic life" (5). The first uniform volume (Sept. 21, 1889-Apr. 19, 1897) of Montgomery's hand-written journal contains little family history and few reflective entries.⁴⁶ The second volume (Apr. 25, 1897-Feb. 7, 1910) has an increasing number of these "records"—such as her descriptive tour of the Cavendish homesteads (Oct. 8, 1898)—which read as stylistic experiments. Elizabeth Epperly finds that in these early volumes, "Montgomery is deliberately entertaining an audience, even testing different voices and techniques, as much as she is revealing truths about herself" (181).⁴⁷ Her journal thus functioned as "a professional source book" (*SJ* II xi), with memories of childhood, of course, proving especially valuable to her fiction. Although we find some short biographies of family members (usually living), until 1908, however, L.M. Montgomery's journals chiefly had an "audience" of one.

Literary success changed this. On 7 January 1910, the penultimate entry in this volume, she prefaced a lengthy recollection of childhood and adolescence with the statement: "I am always being bothered by publishers and editors for 'information' regarding my childhood and 'career', and it will be handy to have it all ready for them at the cost of copying out" (*SJ* I 386). Importantly, then, this *journal* "biography" was created for a *public* audience. She opened the third volume (Feb. 11, 1910-Mar. 11, 1916) with a pledge: "I mean to try, as far as in me lies, to paint my life and deeds—ay, and my thoughts—truthfully, no matter how unflattering such truth may be to me. No life document has any real value otherwise" (*SJ* II [Feb. 11, 1910] 1). There is every possibility that this passage was actually written during the process of recopying the odd notebooks into uniform ledgers. Her conception, therefore, of the journal as a valuable "life document" (for others as well as herself) may not belong to this date, but to the period 1919-1922, in which the journals were reshaped.⁴⁸

In February 1910 Montgomery was thirty-five years old, single, and still caring for her elderly grandmother. She must have felt it possible that her material or matrimonial circumstances would not change until she was past child-bearing age. Montgomery first addressed her grandchildren (and great-grandchildren) in 1917 when writing for them, and for herself, the "true" story of her love-life denied to the

⁴⁶ The main exception to this is LMM's reminiscences about the Nelson boys' time in Cavendish (Aug. 1, 1892), an entry copied almost verbatim into *The Alpine Path*.

⁴⁷ Elizabeth R. Epperly. "L.M. Montgomery and the Changing Times." *Acadiensis*. XVII.2 [Spring 1988]: 177-185.

⁴⁸ LMM would have been copying the entries commencing Vol. 3 sometime between the end of January 1921 (copying Sept. 1909 events) and Mar. 13, 1921 (finished copying Cavendish years).

editor of *Everywoman's World*.⁴⁹ When Montgomery started to name her prospective readers she initially equated the audience with her descendants. She first referred to her "literary heirs" on 16 April 1922 (*SJ* III 51). In 1926 she addressed "a great-grandchild of mine—or somebody else's" (April 2, 1926: U.7). The journals seem increasingly aimed at a wider and public readership—for example, they become progressively dominated by plot-lines and constructed story-telling—thus her claim that the diary is no longer the appropriate place to write of that which is distressing or personally damaging.

* * *

The chain of events (March to July 1911) which closed the Prince Edward Island chapter of L.M. Montgomery's life precipitated a glut of family history narratives in her journal, under the umbrella entry of 28 January 1912. (Montgomery counteracted stress by "writing herself out" and the presentation of these tales at this time is symptomatic, for they are, in the main, tangential to her unfolding story.) After Lucy Woolner Macneill's death, Montgomery told her grandmother's history, the passage working in much the same way as an obituary would. (Montgomery had *not* employed a similar technique when writing about the deaths of her grandfathers or father.) This prompted a history of the Macneill clan, which was followed by a parting "tour" of Cavendish, on this occasion descriptive of residents not homesteads. A visit to the Townsend graves at Park Corner inspired a short account of that family and in turn of a history of the Montgomerys, which she expanded on changing her name to Macdonald. *The Story Girl* was published when Montgomery was resident at Park Corner and she listed the incidents in her fourth novel that were drawn from life.

Finally, her honeymoon visit to Dunwich, sparked another entry on the Woolner family history. Robert Woolner and his wife Sarah Kemp, her grandmother's parents, had come to the Island in 1836. Sarah brought with her "the Woolner jug", which L.M. Montgomery treasured among her prized family heirlooms. Family lore told that the jug had been commissioned in Amsterdam for Harriet Kemp, Sarah's sister, by her sailor lover. He had been drowned on his voyage home, but the jug, painted with verse and the date 1826, had been returned to Harriet, who unromantically gave it to Sarah, whereby it came to Canada.⁵⁰ The

⁴⁹ Accommodating whims did not mean, as LMM wrote to the unfortunate editor, that she would "open the portals of sacred shrines to the gaze of the crowd" (*SJ* II [Jan. 5, 1917] 202).

⁵⁰ In 1932, LMM showed the jug to a reporter and learned that the jug was actually "Sunderland" ware, made in England, therefore the story of the origin of the jug must have gone awry at some point (*SJ* IV [Sept. 18, 1932] 201-202).

Woolner family migration (Lucy Ann Woolner was twelve) was highly organised: a year prior to departure, Robert and Sarah's sons, Chester and George, left London for Prince Edward Island on a recce to find a suitable farm.⁵¹

Woolners aside, these stories provide the blueprint of family history as told in *The Alpine Path*. As with the childhood recollections of 7 January 1910, this diary entry was a document which could later be poached for biography. It contained the first journal reference to the Hector Macneill connection and to the legend that William "Speaker" Macneill was the first *English* male child born in Charlottetown. Montgomery copied the Townsend gravestone inscription into her journal,⁵² told of the homesick Elizabeth Townsend, and of Mary MacShannon's obstinate strain: all appear in *The Alpine Path*. Her entry about *The Story Girl* gave the Penman girls' real story, somewhat less romanticised than that told in *Everywoman's World*, for Donald flies to Nancy on a steer-driven sled.

That *The Alpine Path* has a Scottish bias is again suggested by the edits that Montgomery made. For publication, the English Woolners faded into the shadows as did Montgomery's tentative attempt to account for her paternal clan's transition from French knights to Scottish lairds ("They settled [in Scotland] and eventually became so 'Scotticized' that they had a tartan of their own" [Jan. 28, 1912: U.3.200]). Readers were also spared supposition of their cadetship to the Earls of Eglinton. (Although Montgomery always questioned this fanciful association, she *did* mention it rather often and even wrote an early poem under the pseudonym "Maud Eglinton".⁵³ Hugh John Montgomery, somewhat pretentiously, named his house in Prince Albert, "Eglintoune Villa".) The omission of this story serves to emphasis the common touch in *The Alpine Path*.

This journal account and *The Alpine Path* also have a crucial difference in tone. *The Alpine Path* pandered to public expectation by depicting L.M. Montgomery's family history as distinctive, literary, romantic, and charmed. The journal version was not without elements of this, but, written in an atmosphere of upheaval and distress, the same stories were overlaid with an image of decline. The Montgomery history followed Maud's visit (May 7) to the old Montgomery house at Park Corner, where lived two of her cousins, one described as "reckless and dissipated", the other, "awkward and lumpish" (U.3.178): a degeneration reinforced by the

⁵¹ Personal communication from Mary Rubio. They travelled on the *Amelia*, 16 May 1835. See, Orlo Jones and Douglas Fraser. "Genealogy: Those Elusive Immigrants, Part Two." *IM*. 17 [Summer 1985]: 32-37.

⁵² The Townsend tombstone has been moved from Park Corner to the Geddie Memorial Church, Springbrook, PEI.

⁵³ "On the Gulf Shore", *Ladies' Journal* 1895.

citation of their aristocratic origins. As the description of Cavendish makes clear, Montgomery imagined change and decay in all around when she left Prince Edward Island.

Who, then, were the intended readers for such gloomy predictions? In the 28 January 1912 entry, Montgomery used a journalising technique that became increasingly common in later years: daily notebook items were transcribed into one overarching entry which included a retrospective narrative commentary. Although this particular history was in keeping to some extent with earlier entries where biographic value was expediential, it also marked the beginning of a stylistic change in Montgomery's journal, formalised by her reference to her "dear unborn grandchildren" (*SJ* II 202) on 5 January 1917. Montgomery was consciously becoming a social historian. The description of Cavendish may have been written for her amusement and be prejudiced by her misery at having to leave, but it was also Montgomery's first experiment at writing a warts-and-all overview. She stood apart from the subject as an historian, casting her all-seeing eye over Cavendish to record a particular side of its history in one definitive passage. Similarly, her family histories are a documentation of clan mythology, but also an attempt to give these tales a social context.

As she adapted stories of her ancestors to suit audience and purpose, L.M. Montgomery isolated different lessons each time. Thereby her Scottish antecedents acquired varying hues. For the demands of the female Canadian readership of her war-time autobiography, Mary, Donald, Hugh, John, and even poor Hector, were exhumed and clothed in the romantic garb of a courageous, hardy race who thrived in the new land, reciting poetry, telling tales, and fearing God as they did so. L.M. Montgomery inherited their culture, traditions, perseverance, and independence. For her public, L.M. Montgomery's vigorous Scottish links were portrayed positively and admiringly (and were not a little clichéd). But in her journal, L.M. Montgomery, a hard and uncompromising judge at the best of times, recognised chiefly deterioration in the young clansfolk. The noble Scottish traditions were receding into the distance, not for Montgomery herself of course, but for those who would carry on the family names in PEI. She appeared to find little in the living clans of Montgomery and Macneill that was expressive of their plucky Scottish heritage.

* * *

In 1912, L.M. Montgomery gave no hints that anything in this *ancestry* might have caused the clans' reported demise. However, her Campbell family history (4 August

1918) opened the way for less salubrious stories.⁵⁴ Although this account followed the now established pattern, by beginning with details of the first Campbell to settle in PEI then continuing through a series of family anecdotes, its cornerstone was not celebration but “what’s bred in the bone comes out in the flesh”. Weary after four years of war, Montgomery sought respite at the Park Corner home of her Campbell cousins.⁵⁵ She was bitterly disappointed to find an “unhappy state of affairs” (*SJ* II [Aug. 4, 1918] 260) pertained there, and blamed her cousin George Campbell for mismanaging the farm following her Uncle John’s death the previous year. She detected in his behaviour the “little taint” that in her opinion had dogged the Campbell family, and supported her conviction by digging up the ancestors.⁵⁶

The Campbell history focused on the spear-side, with the *forefathers* isolated as the agents of George’s downfall. Montgomery moved from Captain Campbell, to his son, James Campbell (who married two different women called Elizabeth Montgomery⁵⁷), to *his* son, her Uncle John Campbell, and finally to cousin George. Montgomery emphasised that, like all her clans, the Campbells were a “good old family”. (They were rumoured to be “Breadalbane Campbells”, perhaps even heirs to the earldom [*SJ* II 261]). According to “family tradition”, the first of the clan to migrate to PEI, Captain Campbell, “made an unhappy marriage in the old land, eventually left his wife and came to Canada, where he passed himself as an unmarried man” (*ibid.*).⁵⁸

The second Elizabeth Montgomery, a hardy woman who felt tired for the first time at the age of *seventy*, survived the untimely deaths of six of her children and a husband who “took to drinking and drank himself into the grave” (*ibid.*).⁵⁹ James’ son John was “one of the best men that ever lived” but Montgomery lingered over

⁵⁴ LMM’s mother’s sister, Annie Macneill, married John Campbell, but there was an earlier connection between the two families: “Speaker” Macneill’s brother, Malcolm, married Sally Campbell, daughter of Captain James Campbell.

⁵⁵ The Campbells had married into, and owned land formerly belonging to, the Townsend family.

⁵⁶ LMM’s use of the term “little taint” actually came in a later entry (Jan. 28, 1920: U.5.28) in which she again mentioned the “taints” of James and John Campbell and hinted at similar manifestations in the Campbell family.

⁵⁷ LMM explains that the first Elizabeth Montgomery was a sister of “Little Donald” Montgomery, the second, a sister of LMM’s paternal grandfather—and “Little Donald’s” cousin—“Big Donald” Montgomery.

⁵⁸ LMM notes that Cpt Campbell married “Miss Townsend”, a sister of LMM’s great grandmother Macneill. Captain James Campbell actually married Eliza Ann Townsend, the aunt of Eliza Bliss Townsend, LMM’s great grandmother.

⁵⁹ George and Hugh Campbell were drowned at sea (1860) in “the prime of young manhood” (*SJ* II 261). As LMM noted, four of James and Elizabeth’s children died of cholera: gravestones at the Geddie Memorial Church list the deaths of Robert, Edward, Mary Jane and Sarah in 1846. Another young child, Geddie, died of cholera two years later. (Fred. W. Dimond. “Descendants of Alexander Campbell.” *The Island Register* <www.isn.net/~dhunter/index.html>. Cited with kind permission of the author.)

his faults. He had no business acumen, no frugality, and the family tendency to imbalance that revealed itself in a religious conversion Montgomery equated with James' dipsomania.⁶⁰ Her exasperation at his financial ineptitude was intensified by disapproval of the fact that John and Annie Campbell raised their four children against the "traditions of birth and breeding" (*SJ* II 263).⁶¹ Clara had been permitted to work as a domestic servant,⁶² Stella's temper was allowed to rage unchecked, and George, mastered by "the worst qualities of both parents", was the coddled only son (*ibid.*). (Frede, a "cat who walked by herself", was above reproach.) Poor George's inheritances were summarised as "a taste for liquor, eventually resulting in drunkenness and immorality, a distaste for steady effort, and the temper of a fiend" (*ibid.*).

This journal entry is a shade *too* prophetic. Three months later George Campbell died in the 1918 flu epidemic. By portraying him as a hot-head, a drunkard, and worse in *August* Montgomery prepares any *reader* for the relief with which she met this event (*SJ* II [Dec. 1, 1918] 271-272). Montgomery was attentive to the drama and structure of her unfolding life story and in reshaping her journals may have placed the Campbell clan history where it would have the desired sensational impact. It is notable that the Campbell "taints" were those stereotypically applied to Scots—especially Highland Scots—indolence, alcoholism, and the propensity to zealously embrace puritanical religion.

The practical problems at Park Corner were thus enclosed within the genre of family history. Montgomery cast George, and his father, and his father's father, as victims of a hereditary "taint" symptomatic in the male line. To the clan women then, in this case Maud and Frede, fell the task of maintaining the more noble clan traditions, both on an ideological level and in the day-to-day management of the farm. (This was a relevant sentiment for Montgomery to impart in 1918, when the Great War had thrust new roles on rural women.) Montgomery felt a personal responsibility toward safekeeping the clan traditions of Park Corner (the model for "Silver Bush") partly because the farm's former glory was a treasured memory of childhood.

L.M. Montgomery's keen pride and interest in ancestry made her an obvious tradition bearer, and the inscription of family history into her journal emerges as an

⁶⁰ John Campbell was converted by an emotional evangelist and became rabidly religious for two or three years, after which time the intensity passed and only his new habit of saying grace, prefaced by "an unearthly groan" remained (*SJ* II 261-262).

⁶¹ Montgomery had loaned and would continue to loan large sums of money to the extended Park Corner family giving her licence to opine on the running of the homestead.

⁶² This appalled LMM for she considered the Campbells in a class above such occupations: she justified her verdict by recording that Clara had married in a "low class".

integral part of this role. With Montgomery's literary success came a growing personal—and public—perception that she was *the* chronicler of Prince Edward Island life. When the First World War brought rapid transformation to the traditional rural environment Montgomery became aware of the importance of committing the old ways and old stories to paper before they were forgotten by those who did not uphold the traditions of birth and breeding. But as more stories were preserved over time, the nature of their telling changed. Montgomery appears to take licence, either from the changing times or her changing relationship to the Island and to her family, to write a clan history far less glorified than that which appeared in *The Alpine Path*.

Births, Deaths, Marriages, Scandals

In the summer of 1931, L.M. Montgomery was brooding up a new heroine (Pat Gardiner) who shared her “queer mix” of ancestry: this perhaps veered her attention to family history once more.⁶³ Montgomery returned to the subject of the Macneill and Montgomery clans on 2 June 1931, at a time of considerable anxiety: “I have no appetite—I sleep poorly—I feel a dreadful nervous unrest all the time” (*SJ* IV [June 1, 1931] 122).⁶⁴ (Had she suffered less from a nervousness only alleviated by writing, our knowledge of her family and community history would likely be far poorer.) Montgomery copied two genealogical sketches into her journal: the letter written by her Aunt Mary Lawson referred to in *The Alpine Path*, and an account of her Montgomery ancestors by George Montgomery.⁶⁵ Each was a guide to family history and an index to family pride, but Montgomery also appended her own comments, adding personal recollections of clansfolk she had met and “family traditions” connected to those she had not. She imagined herself in their days, speculated on their “true” stories, subverted her narrators, and dredged up scandals expurgated from these accounts.

⁶³ “Maybe it’s only the mixed blood that makes her quare. Frinch and English and Irish and Scotch and Quaker . . . ’tis a tarrible mixture, I’m telling ye” (*PSB* 3). LMM began writing *Pat of Silver Bush* on 2 April 1932.

⁶⁴ Prior to this, LMM wrote another short account of the Macneills in October 1919, prompted by the death of a Bay View resident, Walter Simpson [1847-1919]. LMM elegised not the individual lost but the loss of an old life: the Macneills were now disappearing from Cavendish. She also acknowledged that the clan, as well as being clever, were renowned as tyrants and martinets (Oct. 16, 1919: U.4.471). LMM corrected a piece of information from this history in 1932, indicating that the 2 June 1931 entry was transcribed in 1932.

⁶⁵ All quotes from these letters and from LMM’s commentary are taken from a journal entry dated June 2, 1931 (*SJ* IV 122-135). The sketches are included as appendices A and B of *SJ* IV, pp. 415-422.

Both narrators commenced with a profile applauding, respectively, the role of the Montgomerys in the “early settlement, development, political and social history and educational progress” of PEI (*SJ* IV 420) and the role of the Macneills (and Simpsons⁶⁶) in the “moral, intellectual and religious development of the country” (*SJ* IV 415). (Typically, the Macneills would emphasise religion where the Montgomerys would not.) George Montgomery’s sketch was principally a list of marriages and, faced with one hundred and eighteen first cousins in the third generation, elected to concentrate on the “Fox Point” (Donald Montgomery and Nancy Penman) branch. Mary Lawson’s account is also a family tree, but one written in idiosyncratic prose. Suffering from the “family failing” of believing herself to be “above the common herd”, Mary Lawson apologised for her egotism in describing her “talented” father, “sainted” mother and her “physically, morally and mentally [...] above the average” brothers.⁶⁷

Montgomery opened her commentary by recording:

It has always seemed to me a curious thing that we have absolutely no documents either in the Macneill or Montgomery families connecting them with the relatives they left behind in the Old Land. There must have been letters exchanged, even if they were few and far between. But there is not a trace of any such. To all seeming, when those families came to Canada they were cut off at once and forever from all connections with the friends they had left behind (*SJ* IV 123).

Impoverished of written records, oral tradition was vital. Yet spoken history was unreliable and “facts” could be lost (not to mention distorted) by word of mouth. Of John Macneill, Montgomery knew only that he had emigrated from Argyllshire in 1775, but no one remembered from which parish. (The Simpson family possessed heirloom evidence in the form of a reference of character for their ancestors.⁶⁸)

Still, because of this vagueness, Montgomery could describe John Macneill as “almost a mythic personage” (*SJ* IV 122).⁶⁹ She may have found it curious that no

⁶⁶ The Simpson family were the founders of Cavendish. John Macneill’s marriage to Margaret Simpson “was the first in a long line of intermarriages between the Macneills and Simpsons [...] It was not easy to find suitable mates in those days [...] a good many of the migrants who came out then were of a type very inferior to the Macneills and Simpson. When a Macneill or a Simpson wanted a bride his choice was restricted almost to his own clan” (*SJ* IV 123).

⁶⁷ This account has the texture of oral narrative, for example: “this being a family failing, you will pardon my egotism, seeing from whom I am descended [...] my respected father [...] was the eldest and I think the most talented in the connection. Pardon my egotism. You see I have warned you and you will be prepared for all that follows” (*SJ* IV 415).

⁶⁸ Dated 4 May 1775 and written by a local minister, the certificate states that the Simpson family were resident in the parish of Rothes (in Morayshire) for one and a half years and that the minister “knows no reason” for them not to be accepted in a new Christian settlement (LMM felt there was a “Scotchman’s caution” behind this hesitant statement [*SJ* IV 123]).

⁶⁹ LMM does not repeat the claim about the “unfortunate Stuart cause” in this account. Instead she corrects Mary Lawson’s statement that John Macneill had travelled to PEI with the *first* Chief Justice

documents survived, but curiosity did not kill the scent of a story, and “mythic” ancestors were meat for conjecture. She *thought* that John Macneill had travelled to PEI on the same ship as his future wife, Margaret Simpson (then a girl of sixteen) and imagined the couple talking on board “of the strange new land to which they were going” (*SJ* IV 123). Not finding cause to speculate here on John Macneill’s reasons for migrating to Canada, Montgomery posited instead that the Simpson family (William and Janet and their eight children) abandoned Scotland because only “pinching poverty” lay ahead of them (*ibid.*). Although this was the prosaic reason behind many an emigration, Montgomery projected poverty as the source of the desperate *courage* it needed to move a large family to the “wildwoods of North America”. Thereby, these Simpson ancestors were “not colorless or negligible” but an intrepid group who could be thus considered above the “common herd”.

The mythic John Macneill, after fathering twelve children, died rather averagely in mid-life from appendicitis (or as it was then, even less mythically known, “inflammation of the bowels”). Montgomery kept her romance, however, by allowing herself the indulgence of imagining John and Margaret’s futile horseback dash to Charlottetown for a doctor. Nevertheless from this point onward, romancing gave way to tattle-telling. (She seemingly believed with the narrator of *Emily’s Quest* that “the materials of story-weavings are the same in all ages and places. Births, deaths, marriages, scandals—these are the only really interesting things in the world” [*EQ* 8].) Margaret Simpson Macneill had a “sorry break” in widowhood and married “some old man, poor and of a lower social class” whom neither Simpsons or Macneills favoured.⁷⁰ This tale was a natural springboard to recalling Margaret’s more human than mythic sons; Malcolm, who “had the renowned Macneill temper”, and Neil, who “got his housekeeper ‘into trouble’ and married her” (*SJ* IV 124).

Montgomery’s annotations were written in a spontaneous style where mention of one relative resurrected dormant memories of others. David Macneill, a son of John and Margaret, flew in the face of family tradition by marrying, not a Simpson, but a Dockendorff lady, from a good but “queer” family of Dutch descent.⁷¹ This story touched “a spring in [her] memory”: two of David’s brothers

of the Island, writing that Peter Stewart was actually the *second* to occupy that office, the first being Duport (122).

⁷⁰ LMM wrote that Margaret Macneill was buried in the Cavendish graveyard but that her stone made no mention of her second marriage. The inscription reads, “Margaret, relict of the late John McNeill of Cavendish, d. Nov. 22, 1849, Ae. 90. This stone erected by her affectionate sons” (Cavendish Presbyterian/ United Cemetery Lot 23-1. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society).

⁷¹ David Macneill was the only child of this generation that LMM met: “It gives me an odd sensation to reflect that I knew well a man who was the son of Margaret Simpson Macneill who was

also married Duckenduff (as mispronounced by the Scots of Cavendish) brides (*SJ* IV 125). Montgomery blamed these weird sisters for introducing an “odd streak” into the Macneill clan (Macneill temper and pride, like intelligence and memory, were their own bequest) which “came out very strongly” in their offspring. But Montgomery also carped at her own: she reconstructed the glowing account of Mary Lawson’s father, “Speaker Macneill”, to add that he “let his farm go to seed while he hob-nobbed with politicians in Charlottetown” (*SJ* IV 125). Furthermore, she added that the Speaker’s brethren conspired against him to prevent a rumoured knighthood—marking jealousy as an additional Macneill characteristic. (Montgomery, perhaps jealous herself, joked that thankfully, as a result, “we, his descendants, are not burdened with living up to a title” [*ibid.*])

Yet L.M. Montgomery by-passed the most political element to Mary Lawson’s sketch. Mary Lawson praised her brother, W.S. Macneill, who “was a born Liberal and when the country threw off the Family Compact [...] took up the side of the Tenant League and helped to free this country from the tyranny of landlordism”. Formed in May 1864, the League agitated with civil disobedience (and latterly violence) for the sale of proprietary lands to the tenants who farmed them.⁷² The saga of “the land question” (largely settled by Confederation in 1873⁷³) was of little immediate relevance in Montgomery’s work, but it is interesting that Montgomery saw nothing in William Simpson Macneill’s stand against the “tyranny of landlordism” that was expressive of a *Scottish* heritage, particularly when “landlordism” had spelled destitution for many Scots exiled to Canada.⁷⁴

Montgomery noted in referring to the Townsends: “Like all the rest they seemed to be cut off from the old land. There are no stories or memories of friends in the old country” (*SJ* IV 126). Given *her* Macneill memory it is not surprising that

born in 1759” (*SJ* IV 124). David Macneill was the father of David and Margaret Macneill, the elderly brother and sister who lived in the house now known as Green Gables.

⁷² The League gained rapid and widespread support and was rumoured to have 11, 000 members by the end of 1864. Violence ensued when attempts were made to prevent writs being served on those who had not paid rent and British troops were despatched from Nova Scotia to PEI in August of 1865. Tenant League support for the Liberal party was instrumental in the Conservative election defeat of February 1867 and thus for PEI’s decision not to confederate. The Tenant League was especially active in Queen’s County (where Cavendish is situated), with skirmishes in the nearby Hazel Grove Road and New Glasgow areas in the fall of 1865. See Peter McGuigan. “Tenants and Troopers: The Hazel Grove Road, 1865-68.” *IM*. 32 [Fall-Winter 1992]: 22-28; Ian Ross Robertson. *The Tenant League of Prince Edward Island, 1864-1867: Leasehold Tenure in the New World*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1996.

⁷³ LMM’s father was chairman of the commission which valued land for sale to tenants in 1875 (Gillen 3).

⁷⁴ see T.M. Devine. “Landlordism and Highland Emigration.” *Scottish Emigration and Scottish Society*. Ed. T.M. Devine. Edinburgh. John Donald, 1992: 84-103.

Montgomery thought it strange that old country memories had been forgotten.⁷⁵ Her comments suggest that ancestral amnesia swiftly took hold: by recording the surviving history in her journal Montgomery halted this process. Additionally, her annotations preserved the “tragedies” (and comedies) that lay behind the “dry records of births and deaths in old families” (*SJ* IV 128). Aunt Jane’s “attacks of insanity” (*SJ* IV 127), Aunt Phemie’s marriage to and separation from a “scalawag”, Alexander Marquis Macneill’s “cruel, unjust speeches and blighting looks” (*SJ* IV 129): all were grist to Montgomery’s story-weaving mill.

However, for all that she was ensuring that her own “heirs”, whether descendants or readers, inherited a history more colourful than that bequeathed her by Mary Lawson, L.M. Montgomery ultimately consolidated her great aunt’s family pride. Montgomery concluded, “All in all, in spite of human faults and shortcomings they *were* a fine race and I need not be ashamed of my ancestry” (*SJ* IV 129, my italics).

* * *

George Montgomery’s sketch was also “full of burned-out emotions between the lines of sober facts” (*SJ* IV 130). “It doesn’t matter anyhow” (*ibid.*), but George Montgomery had omitted to mention the Earls of Eglinton, Mary MacShannon, or the courtships of the Penman girls; consequently Montgomery did.⁷⁶ (He had included details about the Penman family that she did not know—that they arrived in PEI in 1758 with Lord Rollo⁷⁷—indeed that were at variance with her lore of their UEL origins.⁷⁸ She inclined toward George Montgomery’s explanation, perhaps because it established the family in PEI at so early a date.) Emotions were certainly raised when Montgomery resurrected the scandal surrounding Mary Montgomery—a daughter of Donald and Nancy—whose husband, the Rev Edward Pidgeon, had an

⁷⁵ As if to emphasise her own powers of recollection LMM quoted some Macneill family poetry (in Scots) she had heard her Grandfather Macneill recite: verse by her great-great Uncle Charles, a skit on Sir John A. Macdonald written by her Great Uncle William, and two lines by her Great Uncle Jimmy, “composed upon a local feud in New Glasgow”, and possibly inspired by the Hazel Road Grove incident mentioned above (*SJ* IV 126-127, and unpublished).

⁷⁶ LMM gave two pieces of “circumstantial evidence” for the Eglinton connection. Her Grandfather Montgomery had twice been mistaken for the Earl of Eglinton, once by a woman who had been engaged to the Earl, once by the Earl’s nephew. However, she added that her grandfather was said to resemble his mother, Nancy Penman, very much, “which doesn’t exactly harmonise with the Eglinton story!” (*SJ* IV 130, 133).

⁷⁷ Lord Rollo was sent to Île St Jean after the fall of Louisbourg (1758) to destroy the French settlements and eject the population.

⁷⁸ In 1783 eighteen PEI proprietors offered 426, 000 acres of land (about a quarter of their holdings) to UELs. The Island’s Governor, Walter Patterson, was particularly keen to encourage Loyalist settlement, for he hoped to garner support in his disputes with both the British government and other Island proprietors.

affair with a woman in his congregation, and was cast out and forced to live in a hut until, with Old Testament vengeance, he collapsed and died in a church pew.⁷⁹

Montgomery speculated as to the hidden history behind this miserable story. “Was it,” she wondered, “as sordid as it seems? Was Mr Pidgeon all to blame or was he swept off his feet by some sudden temptation? Was ‘the woman in the case’ a common vamp or was she the innocent victim of a Don Juan or of an overwhelming passion? Was it a cheap intrigue or a great love? Was Mary Montgomery partly to blame or was she not? What were the reverend outcast’s reflections during the rest of his life? Nobody now knows or ever will know” (*SJ* IV 132). Montgomery retracted some of this compassion with a gibe about Edward’s grandson, “who played such a prominent part in the [Church] Union disruption”,⁸⁰ but similar questions stood at the heart of her fascination with family history. Montgomery’s ancestors intrigued her because they were simultaneously mythic and human.

Evidently Montgomery knew far fewer anecdotes about her father’s family, partly because she was raised by Macneills (Alexander Marquis Macneill was only slightly less hostile to the Montgomery family—and perhaps to Montgomery stories—than he was to the Simpsons), partly because her Grandfather Montgomery was very deaf, making conversation, let alone detailed clan discussions, difficult, and partly because she had known far fewer of the Montgomery old-timers. (She met only two of her grandfather’s siblings, one being the indefatigable Elizabeth Montgomery.⁸¹) The second set of annotations have a child’s eye view: the games she played in the old Montgomery house at Park Corner, her Bible readings with Great Aunt Rose McCary.⁸² With the exception of Mary Montgomery’s marriage, these stories lack the adult secrecy of the Macneill anecdotes of shotgun weddings, marital separations, and alleged insanity.

⁷⁹ George Montgomery only commented that the Rev Pidgeon was “the first Presbyterian sent to the Island from the mother country”. LMM thought he was a Congregationalist which “agrees better with the statement that he was sent out by the London Missionary Society. No Presbyterian would have been sent from London in those days” (*SJ* IV 132). G. Harry Kielly records that the Rev Pidgeon was a minister of the Dutch Reformed Church, who came to the Island in 1796 (*History of the Montgomery Settlers and others at Stanhope—Covehead—Brackley Pt., 1770-1970*. Stanhope: Stanhope Women’s Institute, 1970.)

⁸⁰ “Loyalty, whether to church or marriage vow, does not seem to be part of the Pidgeon equipment” (*SJ* IV 132). Dr George C. Pidgeon wrote a history of church union (*The United Church of Canada* [1950]).

⁸¹ LMM repeated the lore about Elizabeth Montgomery Campbell, and added that the cholera which had killed four of her children in one week was the “black cholera,” so called because it was allegedly carried to PEI by a “Negro” aboard a ship.

⁸² Rose McCary married James Townsend Montgomery, brother of “Big Donald”, and was George Montgomery’s mother. The McCarys were “very religious”. Rose’s sister, a “typical old maid of fiction”, regaled young Maud with stories “of how the Roman Catholics persecuted her father and his family while he was a minister in Ireland” (*SJ* IV 135).

She had assigned the Macneills a series of clan “traits”, even taints. The Montgomerys were less easily characterised. The Senator had been “handsome [...] stately and impressive” (133) and there may have been a physical Montgomery “look”.⁸³ Montgomery also wrote that the Montgomery girls were precocious (which might make them antecedents of the Gillis girls in the Avonlea books⁸⁴) and made a charged, but here unsubstantiated, comment that the Montgomerys were not known for their religion: “They were decent, God-fearing folk who stood by their church as became them but I fear John Wesley would have considered them as little better than brands yet unplucked from the burning” (*SJ* IV 135). Whereas the Macneills were renowned for forbidding intelligence and temper, the Montgomerys were remembered for gregariousness. George Montgomery described Fox Point as a seat of “true *Highland* hospitality” (*SJ* IV 422, my italics).

Montgomery’s concluded her Macneill stories by *implying* that the glory days were over. As Fox Point was now in the hands of a “queer old mortal with no children,” Montgomery stated emphatically that the world described was gone:

So passes the glory of this world—and the loves and hates and hopes and fears of it. And nobody cares now whether Donald Montgomery cut David out with Nancy Penman or no, and no tears are shed over the four little Campbell children who died together in that black week. Elizabeth Montgomery’s tears have been dried long since and Grandfather Montgomery’s stately figure walks among the ghosts (*SJ* IV 135).

This closing remark was, of course, disingenuous. By preserving these stories in her journal Montgomery showed not only that she cared, but that she saw in these “loves and hates and hopes and fears” important lessons for her heirs, as well as entertainment.

Matters were not quite sealed. She made one final revision to the Montgomery clan archive in December 1938. For the first time in her journal—although she inferred this was a staple of her public addresses—Montgomery revealed that *three* Montgomery brothers and their wives left from Scotland. (It is curious to say the least that there is no previous written citation of this story.) After telling the diners at a Toronto banquet that Hugh’s brothers (“their names were not known to my generation”) had travelled onto Quebec, Montgomery had been approached by a Mrs Colclough who claimed to be a descendant.⁸⁵ One brother, Alexander, had returned to Scotland. The other, Richard, had settled in Ontario where one of his grandsons

⁸³ Elsewhere, LMM commented on the Montgomery “family peculiarity” of blue eyes which look black (*SJ* II [Dec. 13, 1920] 392).

⁸⁴ “Mrs Lynde says that if ever a Gillis girl thought about anything but the boys she never showed it in her walk and conversation” (*AA* 275).

⁸⁵ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 7-24, 1939, *My Dear Mr. M* 196-197.

“was the ‘General Montgomery’ who figured in the war of 1812 and ‘Montgomery’s Tavern,’ famous in Ontario history was kept by another” (*My Dear Mr. M* 197). Mrs Colclough (a great-great-great granddaughter of Richard) also claimed that “Eglinton Avenue” in Toronto was so-named by one of Richard’s descendants to honour the family connection.

Montgomery’s reaction to this story was one of “delight and surprise” (*ibid.*). That there were twenty-seven years between her first journal account of the Montgomery migration and the appearance of these brothers out from the mists of time highlights the extent to which family history was dependent the selection and manipulation of material. That one of the missing siblings had been “proved” to have a Canadian legacy of no little import probably accounts for the belated preservation.

“Pride” in family was the controlling factor in L.M. Montgomery’s journal histories—scandals notwithstanding—either in praising past clan achievements like Richard’s, or by setting standards of behaviour (and censure) based on traditions of birth. (L.M. Montgomery was a firm believer in heredity and judged from breeding what people would or *could* become.) Stories were included to *ensure* their preservation, but Montgomery also *assured* that these stories had a right to be safeguarded, whether as social history, as entertainment, or as a lesson to the epigones.

Conclusion

What “facts” about L.M. Montgomery’s ancestors emerge from these various accounts of her family history?

L.M. Montgomery knew that John Macneill emigrated from Argyll to PEI in 1775. To her knowledge, he did not travel with family members but was attached to the Stewart family who were prominent in the early political life of the colony. She believed that Hugh Montgomery and his family intended to travel from an unspecified location in Scotland to Quebec in 1769 or 1770. They detoured to Prince Edward Island that “day of days”, whereby the family was split and no further contact ensued between the brothers Hugh and Richard and Alexander Montgomery. The Simpson family (ten in total), founders of Cavendish, migrated from Morayshire in 1775, possibly on the same ship as John Macneill. Captain Campbell, another Scot, whose descendants were to be linked by marriage to both the Montgomerys

and Macneills, was a pioneer migrant to the colony, and possibly hailed from the Breadalbane area.⁸⁶

Montgomery learned from the Townsend tombstone that this family had also journeyed to the Island in 1775. The Townsends had been granted land in Prince Edward Island in the proprietary lottery, which they named “Park Corner” after their estate in Berkshire. (Both the Townsend and Campbell patriarchs had military connections.) The Penmans were perhaps United Empire Loyalists, and possibly “had been people of birth and wealth in the U.S. but having forfeited all their property were miserably poor” (*My Dear Mr. M* 10). The Woolner family, the last of Montgomery’s clans to come to PEI, left England in 1836. The least “mythic” branch of ancestors, this family was largely discarded from Montgomery’s folktales.⁸⁷

What patterns emerge from these dry records? Firstly, the clans to which Montgomery claimed allegiance (excepting the Woolners) settled in the Island of St John during the earliest years of British colonisation. They were thus established on the Island before the outbreak of the American War of Independence put a temporary halt to emigration and effectively blockaded a small number of colonists within an island of meagre society.

Secondly, these families appear to have excommunicated themselves from their British past when migrating to Canada, drinking of the Lethe when crossing the Atlantic. No credible or authenticated reasons were given as to why this migration took place. No connection was drawn by Montgomery between her Scottish clans and the Highland Clearances or any less infamous cause of emigration, which might have been expected as a refuge in lieu of other explanations. Indeed, the accounts of her Scottish ancestors oppose the idea of forced displacement by stressing power and independence and mettle.

Thirdly, Montgomery’s knowledge of the geographic origin of her Scottish ancestors was sketchy. In the case of the Montgomerys, no birthplace was given other than Scotland. Montgomery believed that her Scottish ancestors were Lowlanders, but rarely expressed even this level of geographic, let alone cultural, awareness. Lack of records leaves Scotland open to become a mythic land—like a “mythic personage”—onto which the past can be written.

⁸⁶ After the massacre of Macdonalds by the Breadalbane Campbells at Glencoe in 1692, this was the branch of Clan Campbell that LMM was most likely to have heard of.

⁸⁷ LMM did recount to GBM a tale that “Grandmother Macneill’s mother was sent out a dress pattern by some friend in England, in whose home, as was afterwards known, there had been a death from typhoid fever. The pattern crossed the Atlantic, carrying death with it. Grandmother’s father and her oldest brother took the deadly infection and died”. Letter to GBM, dated August 26, 1926 [NAC].

Lastly, Montgomery's Scottish and English ancestors were never associated with any wider community emigration. They travelled as individuals or as nuclear families. They established their new homes on bestowed land or in townships with new relatives, not with old neighbours and friends of former days. This contributed the descendants' belief they were above the "common herd".

However, the paucity of records and stories and memories did not prevent Montgomery from characterising her traditions of birth and breeding. She attributed her career success, her pride, jealousy, temper, intelligence, her literary skill and flashing black eyes, nostalgia, obstinacy, and independence to these ghosts of the past. Given that Montgomery's ancestors were overwhelmingly Scots an obvious consideration is the extent to which she identified these inheritances as *Scottish* traits. Did she interpret these aspects of family personality as ethnic inheritances and subsequently employ them as such in her fiction? For Montgomery, some of these emotional bequests were as valid a Scottish legacy as the Gaelic tongue and step-dancing would be to other Scottish migrants.

Montgomery believed that writers, as tradition bearers, should preserve oral heritage: in her fiction, correspondence, and most especially in her journals, she made space for a story she recognised was in danger of being lost. Montgomery's family histories wove legends, scandal, gossip, and folk-tales—the stuff of oral narrative—into the historical fabric. All were created by—and in turn created—personal and clan identity. There are doubtless elements of stereotyped ethnicity here, working in tandem with a deficit of actual cultural ties. Montgomery's accounts endorsed the belief that what people remembered as having happened, and thus conceived of as their history, was more important than any simple truth, even if this history was a "mock" heritage.

* * *

Days after copying the Macneill and Montgomery sketches into her journal, L.M. Montgomery wrote, "I hate to think of all the lovely things I remember being forgotten when I'm dead" (*SJ* IV [July 11, 1931] 140). She also hated to think that the texture of the past, with its old world heritage, would be forgotten by a new generation of "standardised" Canadians. Although Montgomery's snobbery and pride meant she remembered her own distinguished "good old stock", from the 1920s she zealously campaigned for *everyone* to preserve the "many little historical and romantic happenings" that "would be lost forever" were they not written down.

Tales from old-timers were a part of the national history that she personally preserved, "not because they pertained to her people or to herself but because they

represented a part of Canadian life which had now almost entirely disappeared and of which the citizens of Canada would know little or nothing unless the grown-ups of today wrote them down and kept them for the younger folks".⁸⁸ In addition to being the substance of national identity, she believed these stories contained "a tremendous amount of literary material" for Canadian writers.⁸⁹ Thus, for Montgomery, both history and literature were to be found in the lives of *ordinary* people. This is an important observation, for critics more often focus on the *extraordinary* heroines of her fiction.

Montgomery was irritated by the presumption of readers and fans that her characters were based entirely on real people. In the 1930s she was equally exasperated by reviewers who commented that she must have paid great attention to the old folks of PEI, to be able to relay their sayings and doings. Angered because she said these anecdotes were in the main her own inventions, she also acknowledged that there was an "unconscious compliment" in such reviews. Underscoring these little tales of births, deaths, marriages, and scandals, loves and hates and hopes and fears, lay the recognisable reality of "Canadian life".

⁸⁸ Review of LMM's speech to the Women's Canadian Club, Prince Albert on Oct. 9, 1930. "Writer Tells of Old Times in Maritimes." Black Scrapbook 2, 1931-1937, LMM Collection, UG.

⁸⁹ "Old-Timers' Stories Source for Author: Family Histories Rich in Material for Canadian Artists, Advises L.M. Montgomery." Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM collection, UG.

"The Chosen People"

"Why don't you like me?" she asked directly.

There was no reply. Emily looked straight at Chestnut-curls and repeated her question. Chestnut-curls felt herself compelled to answer it.

"Because you ain't a bit like us," she muttered.

"I wouldn't want to be," said Emily scornfully.

"Oh, my, you are one of the Chosen People," mocked Black-eyes.

"Of course I am," retorted Emily.

Emily of New Moon 72

In his essay "Scotchman's Return", the Cape Breton writer, Hugh MacLennan, describes his "return" to his ancestors' homeland in the Scottish Highlands, to visit the Kintail area whence his paternal great grandparents "were driven" during the Highland Clearances.¹ Feeling that he belonged to "the last Canadian generation raised with a Highland nostalgia" (10), MacLennan [b. 1907] sought to understand "the accumulated weight of our ancestors" (4). He reflects that the Highlanders brought to their new world homes:

that nameless haunting guilt they never understood, and the feeling of failure, and the loneliness of all the warm-hearted, not very intelligent folk so outmoded by Anglo-Saxon success that they knew they were helpless unless they lived as the Anglo-Saxons did, failures unless they learned to feel (or not to feel at all) as the Anglo-Saxons ordained (8).

Like Margaret Laurence, MacLennan's journey *from* Scotland "made it possible for [him] to think of Canada as home" (11).

For MacLennan, sentiments of exile and defeat are central to the "Scotch" legacy his father inherited. As the critic T.D. MacLulich writes—and the historian

¹ *Scotsman's Return, and Other Essays*. London: William Heineman, 1961: 1-12. In this UK publication, the essay and book title were changed from the "Scotchman's Return" of the Canadian original.

James Hunter endorses—MacLennan's personal identity and literary work are rooted in his "sense of belonging to a wronged people".²

Nothing could be more alien to the legacy L.M. Montgomery inherited from her Scottish ancestry. Although she shared with MacLennan a Scottish heritage, and the bugbears peculiar to artists who experience a strict Presbyterian upbringing,³ Montgomery's personal identity and literary work are rooted not only in a sense, but in a *conviction*, of belonging to a *chosen* people.

On the face of it, this terminology directly conflicts with the familiar image of the Clearance Scot MacLennan employs, but both are related idioms for the Scottish migration experience. MacLennan portrays the Gaels as unintelligent, impotent and, above all, uncivilised. Yet he also tells a story of an Edinburgh man who, confronted with an American tourist's rancorous observation "that in the United States there's not even a village as quiet" as Edinburgh on a Sunday, concurred and thus "assumed incorrectly that the American understood both himself and his country had been rebuked" (5).

The Scots, despite numerous defeats on the battlefield or football pitch, retain a sense of being a chosen people.⁴ For Sabbath-keepers this distinction equates Scots-Presbyterians with the elect of God. For Scots who migrated to new lands of promise, exiled by landlords from their fathers' land, or under the aegis of friendlier patrons, a common metaphor for their experience was the exodus of the children of Israel from persecution in Egypt.⁵ Images of "a wronged people" and "a chosen people" had Biblical warrant for travelling together.

Motifs and mythologies from the Scottish past have a potent influence. Memories of injustice were the defiant vestiges of an exported people, evoked in discourse on the migration of Scots to North America, whether folklore, popular history or academic debate, since migration days themselves. L.M. Montgomery was

² T.D. MacLulich. *Hugh MacLennan*. Boston: Twayne World Authors Series, 1983: 3. James Hunter. *A Dance Called America: The Scottish Highlands, the United States and Canada*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1994: 146-148.

³ MacLulich links MacLennan's fiction to that of his Canadian contemporaries Sinclair Ross, Ernest Buckler, and W.O. Mitchell, in depicting "characters who resist the inertia and restrictiveness of a Philistine society and who labor under the inhibitions left by a puritanical family background" (op. cit. 1-2).

⁴ Scotland being a nation of dualities, a Scottish inferiority complex also exists. For a discussion of inferiorism and its archetypes (the Inarticulate Scot, the Drunken Scot, the Repressed Scot, the Mean Scot) see Craig Beveridge and Ronald Turnbull. *The Eclipse of Scottish Culture: Inferiorism and the Intellectuals*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1989.

⁵ In a letter written in 1772, John "Glenaladale" Macdonald referred to a fellow Scot's opinion of migration: "He is positive this scheme was inspired by Providence—It would make you laugh to hear how he Applies to this case, the story of Jacob, Joseph, Egypt, Moses, etc., etc., in different ways—It has driven the Pretender out of his Nodle entirely". Cited in Iain R. Mackay. "Glenalladale's Settlement, Prince Edward Island." *Scottish Gaelic Studies*. 10 [1965]: 16-24.

raised in a Canadian province where half the British settlers were Scots, the majority of them Gaels. She was writing at a time when interest in Island community and family history was on the increase. Often its practitioners were repeating the tales of hardship, famine, and disease associated with those chosen to go beyond the Atlantic roar.⁶ Yet her “family histories” make it clear that no memories of injustice on Scottish soil—the highly dubious allegiance of John Macneill to the House of Stuart aside—echoed in the ancestral halls of Macneill and Montgomery.

Obviously, it can be inferred from this that L.M. Montgomery’s forebears were not “a wronged people”. They were not remembered as Highlanders cleared from their land, nor was there any suggestion that they belonged to a people gradually robbed of their culture in the wake of the ’45. Nevertheless, as no stories or memories of the old land survived, it cannot be assumed that the Macneills and Montgomerys (and the Campbells and the Simpsons and the Clarks) were Lowlanders because their identity lacks this popular motif. In any case, patterns of migration from the Scottish Highlands to Prince Edward Island reveal a different face to the Highland exodus.

Although Montgomery stated, on the rare occasions that she specified ethnicity, that the Cavendish clans were Lowland Scots, her ancestors in actual fact came from areas of Scotland—the Kintyre peninsula and Perthshire for example—that were in the Highlands or bordering the Highland line. Gaelic language and culture persisted in these areas during the latter half of the eighteenth century despite the inroads of Anglicisation. The Macneills and Montgomerys were rapidly assimilated into the English-speaking milieu of PEI, as their role in Island politics and business shows, but even this is not categorical evidence of Lowland and non-Gaelic origins. Many facets of their stories concord more with Highland (indeed Gaelic) emigration than Lowland emigration, whatever dissimilarities transpire on Canadian soil.

The following section studies the discernible facts and fancies of their migration to, and settlement in Prince Edward Island, in the light of both academic analysis of Scottish migration and popular images of Scottish migration, to interpret and understand the personal and clan identity bequeathed L.M. Montgomery by the accumulated weight of these ancestors. The central motif in Montgomery’s fiction is that of “Chosen People”, whether the chosen clan or the chosen community, and this is more than a matter of predestination. Of course, it is crucial to bear in mind that

⁶ *The Prince Edward Island Magazine* was published monthly from March 1899 to 1904, with a further edition in 1905. H.T. Holman writes that the most popular features were the histories of PEI’s communities and settler groups (“The Prince Edward Island Magazine.” *IM*. 2 [Spring-Summer 1976]: 18-19). The successful modern successor to this magazine, *The Island Magazine*, has been published biannually since 1976.

Scots-Canadian identity was shaped by Canadian events as well as Scottish legacies. As James Hunter writes of migrants to Glengarry County, Ontario:

Glengarry sense of identity, as far as the country's Scots-descended families are concerned, is certainly Highland in origin. But that same sense of identity [...] is also rooted in experiences which owe little or nothing to Scotland; in the act of emigration; in the loyalist exodus from the Mohawk Valley; in the years, the lifetimes really, spent turning forest into farmland; in all the myriad happenings which have made Glengarry County what it is today (*The Dance Called America* 87).

Models of Migration

In his 1982 work, *The People's Clearance*, J.M. Bumsted analyses Highland emigration to British North America between 1770 and 1815.⁷ Data from Prince Edward Island (known as the Island of St John until 1799) assumes a central role, for the colony was second only to Nova Scotia in popularity as a destination for Scots in these years.⁸ Stating his intention to consider the opinions, choices, and actions of the Highlanders themselves, not just the landlords and authorities, Bumsted claims to take a new approach by pursuing neither of the established standpoints on Highland migration. His study neither sympathises broadly with the economic and demographic pressures on lairds in a changing Scotland—emigration is thereby a positive, indeed necessary measure⁹—nor pities the exploited and abandoned tenantry—emigration as a grim imposition.¹⁰ Bumsted considers the latter view to be “fed by the Highlanders’ own mythology, which tends to emphasise suffering and a constant nostalgia for the homeland” (xiii). He warns against trusting folk-tradition, and ascribing paradigms from the later period of large-scale clearances to this earlier migratory phase.

Bumsted deduces from ships’ passenger lists, contemporary newspaper accounts, and so forth, that Highlanders in this period migrated mainly in *family*

⁷ J.M. Bumsted. *The People's Clearance 1770-1815: Highland Emigration to British North America*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1982. Migration between 1770 and 1815 was not continuous due to wartime hostilities. Rather it took place in four periods: 1770-1775; 1790-1793; 1801-1803; 1805-1811.

⁸ Of the 14, 987 migrants recorded in ships’ lists, 4, 755 went, at least in the first instance, to PEI. Around 80% of the 14, 987 Scots were from the Western Highlands and Islands (228). Prior to this book, J.M. Bumsted published several articles on Highland migration to PEI: see, “Lord Selkirk of Prince Edward Island.” *IM*. 5 [Fall-Winter 1978]: 3-8; “Captain John MacDonald and the Island.” *IM*. 6 [Spring-Summer 1979]: 15-20; “Settlement by Chance: Lord Selkirk and Prince Edward Island.” *The Canadian Historical Review*. LIX.2 [June 1978]: 171-188; “Sir James Montgomery and Prince Edward Island, 1767-1803.” *Acadiensis*. VII.2 [Spring 1978]: 76-102.

⁹ see e.g. Michael Flinn. *Scottish Population History, from the Seventeenth Century to the 1930s*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1977.

¹⁰ see e.g. James Hunter. *A Dance Called America*. John Prebble. *The Highland Clearances*. London: Secker and Warburg, 1963.

groups, in vessels chartered by themselves or through contractors. (Lowlanders were less likely to travel in families.¹¹) Costs had to be met by the Highlanders themselves (assisted passages were comparatively rare) therefore emigrants were chiefly from more *affluent* sections of the community. In post-1745 Scotland, threats had been made to a traditional way of life by rising rents, changes to land tenure agreements, population pressures on acreage, and the imposed destruction of the clanship system. If this was not impetus enough to push Scots across the Atlantic, many of the North American colonies offered the pull of a land with no landlords, and a large degree of isolation. Far from replacing superfluous tenants with sheep, local and governmental forces were hostile to migration¹²; they feared the loss of a population valuable to modernisation, and felt economically threatened by the rival colonies.

Bumsted concludes that the clearance from Scotland was *instigated by emigrants* enticed by New World prospects. In turn, he infers from his data, and from the high numbers of Catholics and Gaels among the voyagers, that migration was the *conservative* response of those “[s]eeking most of all to be left alone to continue their old pastoral way of life” (221).¹³ Although Bumsted emphasises that these Highlanders were “not so much innocent victims, as conscious actors, makers and masters of their own destiny in the New World” (*ibid.*), this was, he writes elsewhere, the inflexible destiny of “early rebels against economic planning and unconsidered modernization”, who found in “the wilderness regions of the Maritimes” (85) the perfect secluded environment to frame their traditional idyll.¹⁴

Subsequent research has concurred with J.M. Bumsted’s conclusions on the *composition* of this migrant body. Using terminology the American historian Bernard Bailyn coins in *Voyagers to the West* [1986], this is described as “provincial stream” migration; that is, rural families in groups of approximate gender balance, leaving

¹¹ Prior to 1775 the majority of Lowland migrants were young (on average the head of household was 24.8 years old), unaccompanied artisans, travelling to what is now the US. The majority of Highlanders were older (32.4 years), from an agricultural background, and travelling in family units (*The People’s Clearance* 11).

¹² The Passenger Vessels Act, 1803—partly introduced because Highland Society landlords fearful of depopulation lobbied parliament—aimed ostensibly to regulate conditions on board emigration ships. Following this act, the cost of a passage more than doubled, making migration even more so the preserve of more prosperous Highlanders.

¹³ Bumsted’s hypothesis echoes pro-migration arguments advanced by the Earl of Selkirk in 1805. Lord Selkirk advocated the New World as a preservation site for “all those peculiarities of customs and language which [Highlanders] are themselves so reluctant to give up, and which are perhaps intimately connected with many of their most striking and characteristic virtues”. Earl of Selkirk. *Observations on the Present State of the Highlands of Scotland, with a View of the Causes and Probable Consequences of Emigration*. 1805. Edinburgh: Constable & Co., 1806: 3.

¹⁴ J.M. Bumsted. “Scottish Emigration to the Maritimes, 1770-1815: A New Look at an Old Theme.” *Acadiensis*. X.2 [Spring 1981]: 65-85.

Scotland (and the north of England) from ports near their homes, in ships engaged specifically for this purpose.

However, Bumsted's verdict that Highland Scots were motivated by an innate conservatism has not gone unchallenged. Dissenters cite his failure to adequately capitalise on the Gaels' views, his focus falling instead either on English-speaking commentators, or those who organised and agitated.¹⁵ He is also criticised for undertaking no follow-up analysis of the North American communities these emigrants established. Marianne McLean remarks in *The People of Glengarry* [1991] that her own research on Highlanders who emigrated to Ontario shows they left Scotland with "a willingness to take advantage of new opportunities available to them in Canada" (5).

McLean studied Highlanders from Lochiel, Glengarry, Knoydart, and Glenelg, who migrated to Glengarry Country, Ontario, between 1785 and 1802.¹⁶ McLean views their exodus as a direct response, by "a people in transition" (4), to changes in land use, predominantly the creation of sheep farms (xii). McLean contends that Bumsted's methodology "led him to underestimate the effect of clearances for sheep and to misinterpret the clansmen's motives for emigration" (5). Her investigation of the Highlanders and their Canadian communities leads McLean to conclude that, far from originating "in a desire to retreat into the past" (5), Glengarry was settled by those, who, "[r]ather than be exploited, [...] left—the action of a proud and self-reliant people" (208). Unwilling to become a labour force of "declining status and comfort," the clansmen's emigration "registered a radical protest against the impact of the economic transformation in the Highlands" (ibid.).

Mike Kennedy's doctoral research on the migration of Scottish Gaels to Prince Edward Island—some eighty percent of Scots in nineteenth-century PEI were Gaels (7)—accords with McLean's conclusions. He argues that:

Gaels were generally rejecting unacceptable forms of social control which threatened the well-being of their communities. The impression given by this evidence is that a confident community made a positive choice to leave the Highlands in order to maintain some control over the management of their own affairs (46).

In rejecting Bumsted's theory of Highland conservatism, Kennedy also emphasises that clues to motivation are to be found in the New World communities, and his

¹⁵ Marianne McLean. *The People of Glengarry: Highlanders in Transition*, McGill-Queens UP, 1991: 4-5; Mike Kennedy. *Is Leis an Tighearna An Talamh Agus An Lan (The Earth and All It Contains Belongs to God): The Scottish Gaelic Settlement History of Prince Edward Island*. PhD Thesis, U of Edinburgh, 1995: 39.

¹⁶ Around 3, 500 Scots came to Glengarry between 1773 and 1853. Most migrated between 1785 and 1802. Although McLean devotes one chapter to post-1815 migration, *The People of Glengarry* largely examines the same period as *The People's Clearance*.

study is informed by PEI's local and family histories, written and oral. He argues that "this human context is absolutely vital to the understanding of history" (57) as "family stands at the centre of the Gaelic historical view" (56). Importantly, Kennedy identifies *Cavendish* as "a predominantly Highland Scottish settlement, stressing the Old World Gaelic heritage of the early settlers" (166).

McLean labels Bumsted's opinion—in her words, that "self-critical Highland emigrants *invented* clearances for sheep as the cause of their emigration in this period"—the "logical conclusion" to a tradition (represented by scholars such as Margaret Adams and Eric Richards) "which has denied the significance of the clearances" to migration (207).¹⁷ Mike Kennedy's research on Prince Edward Island Gaels finds that, "contemporaneous Gaelic accounts tend to be quite precise in their depiction of conditions, mentioning clearances where they are an issue and ignoring them when they are not. The archetypal 'cleared Highlander' [...] is not a product of Gaelic sources" (128).

* * *

Nevertheless, the image of the "Cleared Scot"—or the "Exile Scot"—remains the primary archetype of Scottish emigration and has entered the popular imagination with greater force than the "Explorer Scot", the "Entrepreneur Scot", and the "Soldier Scot". These types (associated with individual men such as Sir Alexander Mackenzie, Simon Fraser, and Simon McTavish) do not go unrecognised. But the clearance victim—often in the generic guise of the fretful exile—is a dominant cultural touchstone for Scots-Canadian identity. In the literature of the Canadian eastern seaboard the voice of the "Exile Scot" is particularly strong. The "wronged people" infiltrate the work of Hugh MacLennan, just as they permeate the stories of fellow Cape Breton writer, Alistair MacLeod.¹⁸ Prince Edward Island received considerably fewer refugees from the large-scale clearances than Upper Canada or other Maritime areas, yet the unwilling exile remains an influential image in some accounts of the Island's early migrants.

Prince Edward Island has no *Mayflower* or *Hector*, that is, no *single* emigrant ship has been mythologised. A folklore is attached to several pioneer ships, such as *Falmouth*, the *Annabella*, the *Alexander*, and the *Polly*, but these vessels arrived over

¹⁷ Margaret Adams published articles in the *Scottish Historical Review* between 1919 and 1922 attacking the sentimentality of previous studies and arguing that emigration from the Highlands was instigated by tacksmen not landlords. Eric Richards comments that Bumsted's work revives some of Adams' theories. See *A History of the Highland Clearances. Volume II: Emigration, Protests, Reasons*. London: Croon Helm, 1985: 105.

¹⁸ Alistair MacLeod. *The Lost Salt Gift of Blood*. 1991. London: Flamingo, 1993. *As Birds Bring Forth the Sun*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1986.

a number of years, from 1770 to 1803.¹⁹ Each ship carried a distinct group of settlers, from Sir James Montgomery's Lowland indentured servants (his "white negroes"), to Glenaladale's Roman Catholic refugees, and the Earl of Selkirk's Hebrideans. No *one* voyage commands superiority through cause, chronology or posterity. This mosaic of "founders" is reinforced by the patterns of settlement which established separate pioneer groups in various Island districts. Community memoirs indicate that family status is claimed in descent from early voyagers, but geography and religion vie with timing for importance.²⁰

David Craig devotes one chapter of *On the Crofters' Trail: In search of the Clearance Highlanders* [1990] to Prince Edward Island.²¹ Craig constructs his narrative from the vigorous family lore of Scottish crofters and their Canadian kin: "[t]he memory of so genealogical and tradition-minded a people could not have lost the image of so momentous a turn in their history" (9). His visit to PEI persuades him that, "the people proudest of their immigrant lineage were those whose families had arrived on the *Polly* in 1803" (85).²²

This emigration inspired a Gaelic song that now bestows added prestige on the Selkirk descendants. Skye bard and *Polly* passenger, Calum Bàn MacMhannain [1758-1829], composed *Imrich nan Eileineach* ("Emigration of the Islanders"), which

¹⁹ The *Falmouth*, carrying Perthshire and Argyll settlers recruited by David Lawson on behalf of Sir James Montgomery arrived in PEI in June 1770. (See Andrew B.W. MacEwen. "The 'Falmouth' Passengers." *IM*. 10 [Fall-Winter 1981]: 12-19.) The *Annabella*, owned by the Stewart family of Campbeltown, brought Argyllshire settlers in September 1770. (See James P. Lawson. "The Princetown Pioneers, 1769-1771: The Anatomy of a Migration" and for a refutation of some of Lawson's conclusions, Earle Lockerby's letter "The Princetown Pioneers' Re-Visited." *IM*. 39 [Spring-Summer 1996]: 43-44.) The *Alexander* brought 210 or 214 Roman Catholics from South Uist, Arisaig and Moidart, under the aegis of John "Glenaladale" MacDonald, and arrived in June 1772. (See James P. Lawson. "Passengers on the 'Alexander'." *IM*. 29 [Spring-Summer 1991]: 34-39; J.M. Bumsted. "Highland Emigration to the Island of St John and the Scottish Catholic Church, 1769-1774." *Dalhousie Review*. 58 [1978]: 511-527; Iain R. Mackay. "Glenalladale's Settlement, Prince Edward Island." op. cit.) The *Polly* was one of three ships brought by the Earl of Selkirk to PEI in 1803, taking a total of around eight hundred Highlanders from Skye, Mull and Uist. The *Polly* carried the largest number of Selkirk settlers, and was the first of his ships to arrive in PEI: it has therefore acquired greater status than the *Oughton* and the *Dykes*.

²⁰ There are fewer such stories about pioneers from England, Wales, and Ireland. An exception would be the lore surrounding Robert Clark's Quaker settlement at New London (est. 1773). PEI's first Governor, Walter Patterson, antagonistically said that Clark considered himself a "second Penn". J.M. Bumsted. *Land, Settlement, and Politics on Eighteenth-Century Prince Edward Island*. Kingston & Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 1987: 62-63.

²¹ "The Isle of Contentment." *On the Crofters' Trail: In search of the Clearance Highlanders*. 1990. London: Jonathan Cape Ltd., 1993: 78-94.

²² See also article by "M.A.C.", "The Lord Selkirk Settlers in P.E. Island." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. 4.7 [Sept. 1902]: "To have ones [*sic*] ancestors come out in the *Polly* seems to be considered quite a distinction by many Prince Edward Islanders. It is mentioned with much the same degree of reverent pride that marks the boast of so large a number of our cousins in the United States who claim that their forefathers came out in that marvellously large passenger ship, the *Mayflower*. One thing can be said with all confidence and gratification. It is that the settlers brought out by Lord Selkirk were, with but few exceptions, men that none need blush to own descent from" (252).

depicts a scavenging Scottish bailie (“a haughty, harsh brute without clemency for the tenantry, without compassion, mercy or pity”), and includes the frequently cited description of PEI as “the isle of contentment”.²³ The *Polly* migrants were escaping—“I’ll go to sea; I’ll follow others in search of a place to dwell”—and were “not exactly cleared” (79).²⁴ That *Imrich nan Eileineach* is evoked in a study of Clearance Highlanders underlines what Craig himself describes as the “fraught distinction between eviction and free emigration” (80).

Craig trails almost two hundred years of family folklore but vigilance is required where Canadian experiences might bias Scottish legacies. For example, traits that Hugh MacLennan ascribes to his father’s Scotch “doom” can assume Canadian inflections, for doggedness and regret might come to *any* people forced to hew their living from the woods of Canada. The Cape Breton of Alistair MacLeod’s stories is as simultaneously dreich and majestic as any haunted Highland scene, and a new generation of Cape Bretoners would learn about exploitation in the local coal mines.²⁵ In much the same way, it seems logical that the lore surrounding the exploitation of tenants by landlords in Scotland would have resonance in Prince Edward Island given the troubled century of “the land question”.

The clearances perhaps acquired ongoing expression as harbingers of Canadian wrongs. Calum Bàn MacMhannain’s optimism—“We’ll get new land which can be bought outright and we’ll not be charged a shilling for it [afterwards]”—was soon dashed. Most Islanders could not buy land and all tenure was precarious. (Lessons from the homeland possibly influenced the challenges tenants made to this system.²⁶) Thus Island experience offered its own archetypes of the impotent tenant, ruthless landlord, and sinister British legislators:

²³ The song was translated by Murdoch Lamont for *The PEI Magazine* in December, 1902. A full copy of this song (the translation I use) is printed in Margaret MacDonnell’s *The Emigrant Experience: Songs of the Highland Emigrants in North America*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1982. See also Margaret MacDonnell. “Bards on the ‘Polly’.” *IM*. 5 [Fall-Winter 1978]: 34-39.

²⁴ The Selkirk migrants were *not* evicted however much they suffered at the hands of their landlords. Nevertheless, A.B. Warburton links his discussion of the Selkirk migration to the “Highland Clearance” (271) and Susan Hornby writes that the Selkirk migrants were “the first major collection of exiles of the clearances to arrive” in PEI, and adds, “they would, through the years, become a symbol of this province’s Scottish immigrants”. *Celts and Ceilidhs: A History of Scottish Societies on Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: The Caledonian Club, 1981: 6-7.

²⁵ See Alistair MacLeod. “In the Fall”. *The Lost Salt Gift of Blood*: 20-34. Also, Ann-Marie MacDonald’s novel, *Fall on Your Knees*, describes the coal-miners’ fate in language that invokes images of the Highland Clearances: “Outbreaks of disease were far from uncommon but this was something else, this was an epidemic brought on by the miners’ strike. Rows of company houses sat empty, their striking tenants evicted, yanked naked some of them, pulled of the crapper and out of the cradle, credit cut off at the Company Store. Pinkerton guards and special company constables went door to door till there was more furniture in the streets than in the houses. Even miners who had bought their own homes were evicted”. *Fall on Your Knees*. London: Jonathan Cape Ltd., 1996: 47.

²⁶ Ian Ross Robertson argues that the response of Irish and Highland Scots settlers to neo-feudal land tenure—the organisation of the Tenant League to fight for escheat—was conditioned by pre-migration

the seeds of feudalism, a system of lands and vassals that was falling apart in Europe and would soon bathe France in blood, was carried across the sea and planted in the virgin soil, and the scandalous system of tenure [...] was foisted upon the Island to throttle its progress for more than a hundred years.²⁷

“Regrettably,” Bumsted argues, the legacies of the unique 1767 lottery have become “almost an obsession,” which has “trapped” historians in “the Island’s own mythological sense of its past” (x).²⁸

This “mythology” was one that L.M. Montgomery was surely familiar with. She likely read Duncan Campbell’s *History of Prince Edward Island* [1875] and A.B. Warburton’s *A History of Prince Edward Island, 1534-1831* [1923], both of which view the Island’s colonial past chiefly “in terms of the struggles between landlords and tenants” (ix).²⁹ The “Exile Scot” was an established archetype in Montgomery’s time. Most familiar from the lament of the “Canadian Boat Song,” the image of the Scots as children banished by degenerate Lords boasting of sheep, was firmly enshrined in folk memory, and the popular consciousness.³⁰ Montgomery herself makes use of the boat song’s lyrics in *Anne of Windy Willows*, where schoolteacher George MacKay, whose “grandfather was Isle of Skye”, is said by Anne to have an accent suggestive of “low shielings and misty isles” (*AWW* 28). Montgomery’s husband, Ewan Macdonald, belonged to a Skye family who migrated to PEI amid the clearing times in 1841.

experiences, and complicated by the new ethnic and religious diversity of Canada. (“Highlanders, Irishmen, and the Land Question in Nineteenth Century Prince Edward Island”. *Comparative Aspects of Scottish and Irish Economic and Social History, 1600-1900*. Ed. L.M. Cullen and T.C. Smout. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd., 1977: 227-240.) Robertson’s view is disputed by Rusty Bitterman, who views the escheat movement as a great departure from agrarian protest in south-east Ireland, where most of PEI’s Irish population originated: “the challenge of coping with ethnic diversity, favoured Island-made traditions and Island-born precedents. Local history was, or could be, shared; Old World referents were potentially divisive” (106). (“Agrarian Protest and Cultural Transfer: Irish Immigrants and the Escheat Movement on Prince Edward Island.” *The Irish in Atlantic Canada, 1780-1900*. Ed. Thomas P. Power. Fredericton, NB: New Ireland Press, 1991: 96-106.)

²⁷ Lorne C. Callbeck. *The Cradle of Confederation: A brief history of Prince Edward Island from its discovery in 1534 to the present time*. Fredericton, NB: Brunswick Press, 1964: 54.

²⁸ In Ch. 1 of *Land, Settlement and Politics*, J.M. Bumsted re-examines the eighteenth-century history of PEI, and demystifies the 1767 lottery by contextualising it alongside the Proclamation of 1763 vis-à-vis colonial policy.

²⁹ J.M. Bumsted. *Land, Settlement and Politics*. See also J.M. Bumsted. “‘The Only Island There is’: The Writing of Prince Edward Island History.” Smitheram, Vernon, David Milne, and Satadal Dasgupta. *The Garden Transformed: Prince Edward Island, 1945-1980*. Charlottetown: Ragweed Press, 1982.: 11-38.

³⁰ This song—most famous for the lines: “From the lone shieling of the misty island/ Mountains divide us, and the waste of the seas—/ Yet, the blood is still strong, the heart is Highland,/ And we in dreams behold the Hebrides”—was published in *Blackwoods Edinburgh Magazine*, September 1829. Its authorship is most commonly attributed to John Galt, but has also been ascribed to John Gibson Lockhart, Walter Scott, and “Christopher North.”

Importantly, an accessible vocabulary and recognised symbolism designating the Scots (and Scots-Canadians) as “a wronged people” existed, which an author—especially an author of popular fiction—could invoke. The recurrence of such Scottish motifs in popular fiction is satirised by Canadian author, Stephen Leacock, in his story, “Hannah of the Highlands, or, The Laird of Aucherlocherty” [1911].³¹ Hannah McShamus lives in a Scotch glen where most of the memorable (and, clearly, romantic) events of the Scottish past have happened:

here in the Glen Bonnie Prince Charlie had lain and hidden after the defeat of Culloden. Almost in the same spot the great boulder still stands behind which the Bruce had lain hidden after the Battle of Bannockburn; while behind a number of lesser stones the Covenanters had concealed themselves during the height of the Stuart persecution. Through the Glen Montrose had passed on his fateful ride to Killiecrankie; while at the lower end of it the rock was still pointed out behind which William Wallace had paused to change his breeches while flying from the wrath of Rob Roy (95-96).

Leacock continues, “Grim memories such as these gave character to the spot.”

“Grim memories” characterise the Scots: “the wronged people” and the “Exile Scot” are in perfect symmetry. This is not to dispute the validity of these memories, but in the popular imagination the actual experience of some can become the grim memory of all.³² Montgomery was no stranger to these images, no stranger to studying the form of other popular writers, and always awake to Scotland’s “romance”, grim or otherwise. However, the voice of the exile and the voice of the wronged people are wholly absent from her family histories, and in turn, George MacKay aside, from her fiction. This no doubt reflects the actual experiences of her ancestors, but it is nevertheless important that L.M. Montgomery did not employ popular and accessible conventions when describing her forebears and their migration. Predictably, the ancestral backgrounds of her heroines reflect her own heritage, but even minor characters seem untinged by “exile”.

The rugged beauty of Alistair MacLeod’s Cape Breton Island, and elegiac sway of his prose, are perfectly suited to the Cape Bretoners’ exiled past. The same history would sit uneasily with Anne Shirley’s “bloomiest place”, unless that history were to be distorted into trite romance. Anne may do so in removing the smart from the “Canadian Boat Song”, taking the beauty of the Scottish scene without the sting of exile, but Montgomery does not.

³¹ Stephen Leacock. *Nonsense Novels*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart (New Canadian Library), 1969.

³² *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables*, includes an essay by Wendy E. Barry on “The Settlers of PEI” which places Scottish migration to PEI entirely against the backdrop of the Highland Clearances and “repression, starvation, and disease” (419), with no indication that LMM did not have this background. See my article, “An *Annotated Anne*”, Appendix A.

* * *

L.M. Montgomery's ancestors were portrayed by her as heroes; not heroes triumphing over adversity or injustice with their fellow Scots, but individual personages distinct from the "common herd" of migrants. In terms of popular images these stories are atypical. In the context of Scottish emigration to Prince Edward Island, L.M. Montgomery's *stories* of her clan origins describe a minority experience: they were Presbyterians from outwith the Western Highlands and Islands, who travelled with a degree of independence from their fellow Scots, maintained no contact with those left behind, nor encouraged others to follow, and settled with new acquaintances, not countrymen.

L.M. Montgomery's ancestors left Scotland for Canada during the pre-1815 emigration phase associated with Highlanders whose relative affluence allowed them to make choices respecting their future. Prior to considering the connection between the stories and the discernible facts and the context of Scottish migration it is expedient to describe the new home Montgomery's ancestors found. Montgomery tells no stories of her Scottish forebears before they migrated and recounts no aspects of their voyages. Recollected family history began in Prince Edward Island. This suggests that L.M. Montgomery's history of her ancestors is guided by these PEI years. It is important to bear in mind that Montgomery's clans departed from Scotland before the outbreak of the American War of Independence, an event which J.M. Bumsted identifies in *Land, Settlement and Politics* as critical to the fortunes (or rather failings) of the fledgling colony.³³

The Insulated Perspective

If those awarded townships in the 1767 lottery had complied with the original terms of their grant, the population of the Island of St John would have been around 7, 000 by 1777, even with little natural increase. Quitrent payments (2, 4 or 6 shillings per hundred acres, subject to quality of land) would have raised sufficient capital for the Island's administration costs and the salaries of her officials.³⁴ The colony's first

³³ In addition to Duncan Campbell and A.B. Warburton's histories of PEI, there are several other useful book length studies which cover this period of Island history, including Andrew Hill Clark. *Three Centuries and the Island*; F.W.P. Bolger. *Canada's Smallest Province: A History of Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: PEI Centennial Commission, 1973; Errol Sharpe. *A People's History of Prince Edward Island*. Toronto: Steel Rail, 1976.

³⁴ St John's Island was originally to be governed by Nova Scotia, but fearing this would result in annexation, the Island proprietors petitioned for separate government. The Board of Trade (who shared their apprehensions and were tired of Nova Scotian capers draining money from the Treasury) agreed

Governor, Walter Patterson, an Irish-born officer and Island proprietor, arrived in 1770. Initially ruling with the help of a council, Patterson passed legislation regulating sea cows and liquor, and petitioned the home government for financial aid in the construction of public buildings and defences, a task not budgeted for in quitrent revenues. The Island's first Assembly, "a damned queer parliament" of eighteen resident Protestants, met in July of 1773.³⁵

Despite grant obligations settlement was slow. American colonists were reluctant to resettle in a outpost where land was not freely available, making it difficult for those proprietors interested in settling their holdings to comply with their grants. Britons were not sanctioned as potential settlers, of course, but the majority of the small population came from Britain nonetheless. (J.M. Bumsted writes that an *island* "tended to attract those who sought to promote particular visions for the oppressed".³⁶ The remote Island of St John pulled emigrants from areas of Britain racked by poverty or persecution: "Irish Catholics, Scottish Highlanders [often Catholic], urban artisans often converted to dissenting sectarianism, and displaced farm workers" [46].³⁷ An island offered the prospect that the "like-minded could be moulded into a coherent group" [47].) In 1777, the population of the Island of St John totalled around 1, 500 (including Acadian and Mi'kmaq families): the number of settlers had in fact *decreased* since 1775 and would continue to do so for the duration of the American War.³⁸

The colony was further hindered by financial mismanagement and fraudulent land sales. The sum raised from quitrent payments fell far short of projections. As early as 1771 attempts were made to recover unpaid money, and an ordinance introduced to allow the sale of lands owned by defaulting proprietors.³⁹ Yet, J.M.

in 1769 that the Island should have its own civil government. Proprietors had been granted an initial five year amnesty from quitrent payments. When separate government was secured, the proprietors agreed to pay half the amount due in 1772 from May 1769 to fund this administration (*Land, Settlement and Politics* 30).

³⁵ This first assembly reflected the resident landholding interest and was soon dissolved as unrepresentative. The high ratio of Roman Catholic settlers meant that a considerable segment of the adult male population were excluded from the vote or holding public office. (After failed attempts in the late 1820s, Roman Catholic emancipation was granted in PEI in 1830, in line with British legislation of 1793 and 1829.)

³⁶ *Land, Settlement and Politics* 47.

³⁷ Bumsted cites the Scottish Catholic Church's direction of the "Glenaladale" migration, wherein the concept of the Island as a refuge was integral.

³⁸ No Island census was taken during British rule until 1798 so figures—taken from Bumsted, *Land, Settlement and Politics* 64, 66—are approximate.

³⁹ The budget for salaries was calculated based on full quitrent payment: the shortfall in revenue meant a loss of pay. The ordinance of 1771 was passed by the Island's first assembly in 1773, but revised by the Board of Trade in 1774. When lots were sold in 1781, Walter Patterson and his colleagues did not pay for the land they purchased, but took them in lieu of salary arrears, from 1767 and 1777. From the latter date the British government agreed, as an emergency war measure, to pay the Island's officials from the civil list.

Bumsted argues there was nothing particularly absurd or ill-fated in the colonial policy as originally devised and that even the failure of proprietors to comply with their grants was not inherently catastrophic. Although few of those proprietors who retained their allotted land (probably over a quarter of lots changed ownership by 1775⁴⁰) either brought settlers or paid quitrents, Bumsted contends that in 1775 the Island of St John was “teetering on the brink of success” (64).

The revolt of the American colonies halted emigration (legislation was enacted to stop migrants leaving Scotland in September 1775). Sea-travel in the Gulf of St Lawrence became hazardous due to rebel raids. Without trade, settlers could not pay rents and proprietors had further reason for withholding quitrent payments. (Many lot-owners were on active service in the British forces, a circumstance that had already reduced their involvement with their holdings.⁴¹) The harsh winter of 1775, one of the worst on record, exacerbated hardship as did various petty acts of plunder on supply ships. The Island was isolated. Communities stagnated, revenues slumped, and the political infrastructure was rocked when privateers abducted the colony’s Irish Attorney General, Phillips Callbeck, and several other officials, in 1775.⁴²

Deprived of effective leadership, the war years witnessed a growing factionalisation in Island politics, as opponents of the gubernatorial regime gravitated to Patterson’s deputy, Thomas Desbrisay. Desbrisay (another Irishman) arrived on the Island in 1779 to replace Callbeck as acting governor, and made swift allegiance with Chief-Justice Peter Stewart.⁴³ In 1780 they attempted to sequester land in Charlottetown for themselves, whereafter Patterson set wheels in motion for selling lots whose quitrent payments were in arrears.⁴⁴ Disputes arising from this highly irregular sale (which would ultimately lead to Patterson’s dismissal in 1787) created opposing camps out of absentee proprietors and resident landowners, landlords and

⁴⁰ Andrew Hill Clark lists the original grantees and changes made until 1810. *Three Centuries and the Island*. Appendix B, 263-269.

⁴¹ Captain John MacDonald argued successfully to the British Government that quitrents were excessive for military proprietors whose active service meant they were ignorant of Patterson’s proceedings against them in 1781.

⁴² George Washington was under-impressed when presented with the bounty and sent Callbeck and company back to the Island again. Walter Patterson left the Island in 1775, on what became a five year trip to Great Britain.

⁴³ Stewart and Desbrisay both had large families which intermarried. They were also allied to Major Timothy Hierlihy (another Irishman) who had effective control the man of the Island’s military. All three were land-hungry.

⁴⁴ Several lots were sold by Patterson in 1781, ostensibly for proprietary non-payment of quitrents. The potential for overturning these sales was provided by Lord North, who legislated in 1783 that defaulting proprietors could buy back their land if they compensated the purchasers. As the Governor and his land-hungry cronies were the main beneficiaries of these sales (and had engineered them for their own ends) Walter Patterson ignored British directives and obfuscated sales by settling Loyalists on escheated lands.

tenants, Island officials and British legislators, Patterson's list and the Stewart-led "Country Party". The ground was laid for the altercations which would impede Prince Edward Island's political, economic and social advance for almost a hundred years.

J.M. Bumsted argues that in the years the resident Islanders adopted a "peculiarly insulated perspective" (66) consequent to their isolation.⁴⁵ Forced back on their own resources, they felt proud of their endurance, although island life had been proved demonstrably precarious. The Island's resident elite, in particular, were convinced of their own martyrdom. Unlike absentee proprietors, they had suffered in their commitment to the Island's welfare. As a result they felt themselves entitled to land these absentees ignored, thus Patterson's action in 1781.⁴⁶ Bumsted emphasises that these years of conflict and hardship also had a psychological impact on the ordinary settler.

These ordinary Islanders included L.M. Montgomery's ancestors. John Macneill, the Montgomerys, the Penmans, Captain Campbell, the Townsends, the Simpsons were all resident in the Island of St John by 1775.

The Voyage of the *Elizabeth*

Thomas Curtis was recruited by Robert Clark for his New London settlement (Lot 21). Curtis emigrated to the Island of St John on the *Elizabeth* in September 1775, hoping to establish himself in the clothing trade. However, he discovered that the "famous New London" (39) of Robert Clark's boosterism consisted of sixteen wooden huts and, firmly convinced that he had been deceived as to the Island's prospects, he determined to leave immediately for England. Safe home once more Curtis composed an amusing, vitriolic, and utterly biased account describing his voyage from England and desperate attempts to quit the Island.⁴⁷

Thomas Curtis's account is invaluable to a study of L.M. Montgomery's family history. His fellow passengers on-board the *Elizabeth* included the *Townsend* family of Park Corner, Captain James *Campbell*, later of Lot 21, Chief-Justice Peter Stewart and his family of Campbeltown, Kintyre, and therefore by repute John

⁴⁵ See also J.M. Bumsted. "The Patterson Regime and the Impact of the American Revolution on the Island of St. John, 1775-1786." *Acadiensis*. XIII.1 [Autumn 1983]: 47-67.

⁴⁶ Bumsted writes that, feasibly, "Islanders had become so inward looking that they failed to appreciate the hazardous course on which they were embarking" (86), but more credibly, Patterson was probably exploiting war conditions to enact measures which would, in peace time, have been impossible.

⁴⁷ Curtis's account is republished in D.C. Harvey, ed. *Journeys to the Island of St. John, or Prince Edward Island, 1775-1832*. Toronto: MacMillan, 1955.

Macneill. Its importance is further stressed in Curtis's anecdote of the kindness shown to him by a Malpeque settler by the name of *Montgomery*.

The *Elizabeth* sailed from Gravesend to Cork whence to the Island of St John ("an Entire Wood as far as we could see" [29]). She was wrecked on the sandbars off Malpeque in November: most of her cargo was lost. Her passengers, weak after a rough voyage, were forced to camp on the beach, where the cabin passengers constructed their own separate dwelling. After nine days—in which Curtis deliberated "the consequence of going many days longer Sutch as eating the Dog & then casting lots who should be Eat first" (31)—rescuers arrived from Malpeque. The female passengers, and some men, left with them for New London. The next day the remaining men (save three crew who stayed to guard the *Elizabeth*) departed for Malpeque. Having rested one night here with a man called Montgomery, Curtis travelled on to dystopian New London. He returned soon after to Malpeque, and eventually fled the Island in the spring of 1776.

Curtis wants to convince his readers firstly that he was duped, and secondly that the Island of St John was, as William Cobbett would later describe it, "a rascally heap of sand, rock and swamp [...] in the horrible Gulf of St. Lawrence".⁴⁸ His account is stamped with bitterness, pessimism, and a degree of sensationalism akin to that found in early North American "captivity narratives". He likely employs a degree of artistic licence and Curtis's comments relevant to Montgomery's ancestors should be treated with due caution. Yet, there is little reason to suppose that Curtis invented the tenor of hardship, however much he may have tweaked the scale. Certainly his description of the poverty in New London is perfectly in keeping with that given by Benjamin Chappell: "No rum, no bread, no meat, no beer, no sugar in the stores".⁴⁹

What, then, does Curtis's account add to L.M. Montgomery's family history? In what ways do their versions differ?

For the voyage itself, Curtis concentrates on sea-sickness and storms. Livestock was swept overboard, fights broke out, the drinking water was "stinking". Curtis remarks that Elizabeth Townsend—Elizabeth with the bonnet in family lore—"was very ill and kept her little Cabbin nearly all the passage" (18). (James Townsend, "who had never been at sea before" [18], was not sick at all.) Perhaps Elizabeth Townsend's hopeless sea-sickness was appropriated for Mary

⁴⁸ William Cobbett. *The Emigrant's Guide* [1829-30]. Cited in Duncan Campbell. *History of Prince Edward Island* 78. Cobbett writes that the Scots travelling to PEI are "poor, and cannot pay their passage, or can rake together only a trifle" (ibid.).

⁴⁹ Benjamin Chappell's diary, 18 February 1775. Cited in *Land, Settlement and Politics* 63. Chappell, an English wheelwright and sometimes itinerant Methodist preacher, was also recruited by Robert Clark. He later moved from New London to Charlottetown to work as a carpenter.

MacShannon? The Townsends, Captain Campbell, and so forth likely experienced a degree of comfort unknown to many of those participating in the large-scale migrations, but the passage was rough, their possessions were lost, and they were forced to live for over a week on a Canadian beach in November.

Thomas Curtis does *not* name John Macneill as a fellow passenger.⁵⁰ Only clan tradition places John Macneill and Chief-Justice Stewart on the same vessel.⁵¹ Still, Curtis's claim that the Stewart family had a male servant, and that three young men travelling on their own account embarked with them, allows for the possibility that Macneill was in their entourage.⁵² The fact that John's son, "Speaker" Macneill, would marry the granddaughter of *Elizabeth* passenger, James Townsend, strengthens, although it does not prove, the family tradition.

A significant number of the *Elizabeth*'s passengers had connections to New London and the ship transported supplies and livestock from Cork to Lot 21. Campbell, indeed, was an agent for Robert Clark (and at first his business partner, Robert Campbell) who together bought Lot 21 from the original owners in 1770.⁵³ (Captain Campbell was among the 1767 beneficiaries, granted half of Lot 25. Contrary to tradition, James Townsend is not listed among the 1767 proprietors. There may have been some confusion with the members of the *Townshend* family who were.) Campbell's migration in 1775 was not his first voyage to the Island. He gained employ in England as a secretary to Governor Walter Patterson, and was resident on the Island from 1770 to 1773.⁵⁴ It is likely that the Townsend family were also linked to Robert Clark. The Townsends and James Campbell could afford to travel as *cabin* passengers.⁵⁵

⁵⁰ Walter Simpson records that John Macneill travelled on the same ship as the Townsends of Park Corner, which therefore also places Macneill on the *Elizabeth*. "Cavendish in the Olden Times". *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. 1:11 [January 1900].

⁵¹ John Macneill is not named on any existing passenger lists for this period. David Dobson lists John Macneill as emigrating from Argyllshire in 1773 (his source W.J. Rattray, *The Scot in British North America*. Toronto, 1880) in his *Dictionary of Scottish Settlers in America* (Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing, 1984). The second volume of Donald Whyte's *Dictionary of Scottish Emigrants to Canada before Confederation* has two confused references: firstly to John McNeil, migrating to PEI c. 1790; secondly to John McNeill, probably travelling to PEI on the *Annabella* in 1770 (Toronto: Ontario Genealogical Society, 1986).

⁵² Chief-Justice Peter Stewart wrote that the "lower sort of people" in Argyll had a "passion" for emigration, and that he would have no problem recruiting servants to come to the Island of St. John. See Ian Adams and Meredyth Somerville. *Cargoes of Despair and Hope: Scottish Emigration to North America, 1603-1803*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1993: 59.

⁵³ Andrew Hill Clark 265.

⁵⁴ See Fred B. Dimond. "The Descendants of Alexander Campbell." *The Island Register*.

⁵⁵ Curtis records that one of the Townsend daughters was left in England because she had small pox. If this was the case she must have joined her family in PEI at a later date, for the names of three daughters—Rachel, Mary, and Eliza—appear on the Townsend tombstone.

James Townsend, of Longcot in Berkshire, and James Campbell (who married James's daughter, Eliza Ann Townsend, in 1775) both came to own large amounts of land in Lot 21: the Campbelltown area of this lot was named for the Captain, who served with the St John's Volunteers during the American Revolution.⁵⁶ Both Townsend and Campbell became members of the Island assembly. Although Campbell was from Perthshire, baptised in the Milnn of Finlarg in 1743,⁵⁷ his employment and status indicate that he was acclimatised to English culture and elites. Truly, there was little of the "common herd" (of fact and fable) about either emigration.

Other passengers had links with Malpeque or Princetown. The ship's captain, Captain Russell, lived there. So too did several relatives of the new Chief-Justice including his brother-in-law, Robert Stewart. (Lt. Col. Robert Stewart, Peter Stewart's *brother*, had been awarded half of Lot 18 [which includes the Princetown area] in 1767, and Peter Stewart was appointed Chief-Justice through the influence of both Robert Stewarts.⁵⁸) According to Curtis, the passengers boarding in Cork "came from Scotland to settle on the Island" (17). The Stewart family—Peter, his second wife, Sarah, three daughters and two sons, including John who would later justifiably earn the sobriquet, "Hellfire Jack"—were cabin passengers.

Curtis's memorial is unclear, but there appear to have been, crew aside, around thirty-three emigrants on the *Elizabeth*, fourteen of them Scots. This number is small compared to other migrations in this period: there were around two hundred Scots on both the *Annabella* and the *Alexander*. The passengers on the *Elizabeth* migrated as individuals (like Curtis) or nuclear families (like the Townsends). Some had prior links to the colony and a greater likelihood of picking up more realistic descriptions of the Island's conditions than Curtis. It is thus highly probable that passengers like the Townsends were making an educated choice about their future. A new colony must have opened the prospect of increased status and opportunity to these men. Several would come to play prominent roles in the Island's political affairs.

Captain James Campbell belonged to the Patterson faction. (He testified that the 1781 land sales had been lawfully conducted. As part of the governor's council, he was named as liable for prosecution by Captain John MacDonald when then legality of these sales was questioned.⁵⁹) Provided John Macneill was indeed allied

⁵⁶ There is an alternative theory that Campbelltown, PEI, was named by Argyll settlers, for Campbeltown, Kintyre. See Alan Rayburn. *Geographic Names of Prince Edward Island*. Ottawa, 1978; Mike Kennedy 1995, 508.

⁵⁷ See Fred B. Dimond. "The Descendants of Alexander Campbell." *The Island Register*.

⁵⁸ James P. Lawson. "The Princetown Pioneers" 13.

⁵⁹ *Land, Settlement, and Politics* 126, 162.

with Patterson's bitterest enemies, the Stewarts of Campbeltown, then the animosity between the various clans L.M. Montgomery was descended from, could have had an early genesis. Her ancestors were no strangers to the Island's land problems. It is plausible that they suffered less physical hardship during the war years than the average settler; it is also feasible that as part of the Island's elite they experienced the psychological fallout Bumsted associates with the American Revolution. This raises the possibility that some of the family inheritances Montgomery describes—conceit, independence, pride, all aspects of an insulated perspective—were symptomatic of Canadian experience, not just Scottish character.

Curtis stayed with a family named Montgomery, "poor Creatures" who had nothing but water to drink. Nonetheless, he praises the hospitality of Montgomery, who gave him "Salt Ells and Potatoes" for dinner and "the best sleep I ever had in my life" on straw under "Several blankets—I believe Ten" (38). Curtis made a gift of clothes to Mr Montgomery's eldest son, and returning to Malpeque after his New London disappointment, stayed once more with "friend" Montgomery, for three days on this occasion, for no snow shoes could be had on which to leave. The 1798 census for PEI lists only two Montgomery households—both in the Royalty of Princetown—those of Hugh Montgomery and Daniel Montgomery (Campbell 1875, 211). Hugh Montgomery was L.M. Montgomery's paternal great-great grandfather, husband of Mary MacShannon. Daniel was their son, also known as Donald—*Daniel* would be an English translation of the Gaelic *Dòmhnall*—who married Nancy Penman.

Thomas Curtis believes that this outpouring of what George Montgomery might term "true Highland hospitality" was fuelled by empathy: "This man [...] seemd to have a feeling of my situation as he was once cast away and sufferd mutch" (38). Curtis has every interest in exposing the hardships experienced by Islanders and there may be nothing more to his comment than this. There is no knowing to what he referred by "cast away": to the fact of leaving one's native shore; to being on the Island and not in Quebec; to arriving in a less-than-promised land; to a shipwreck? Whatever his intent, Curtis's comment suggests that there was perhaps more to the Montgomery migration than a story of the fates and a woman's will.

Although the Montgomerys were "poor creatures" they were able to provide Thomas Curtis (and a companion) with food and shelter a month into an exceptionally hard winter. Weeks later, they repeated this hospitality. Given that other accounts of this starving time, although doubtless hyperbolic, spoke of new migrants being forced to eat their children,⁶⁰ the Montgomery family appear, if not

⁶⁰ *ibid.* 67.

prosperous, then at least relatively secure by contrast. Some four years into their Island history they were established in a home, and had a reputation for sharing this shelter with others. Lastly, it is important to note that the Hampshire man, Thomas Curtis, records no difficulty communicating with the family. Presumably the Kintyre Montgomeries were not monoglot Gaels.

The Montgomery Myths

Referring to the Mary MacShannon story, A.B. Warburton notes that the family emigrated three or four years after those Campbeltown migrants who arrived on the *Annabella* in October 1770 (153n). He does not elucidate further on the source of this “well founded” tradition, although mention of the “well known authoress Louise [*sic*] Maud Montgomery” suggests one. George Montgomery’s sketch places the Montgomeries on the Island of St John in 1769, making Hugh Montgomery the first “*English speaking settler in Princetown*” (*SJ* IV 420, my italics).⁶¹ This story is reproduced in a community study of French River and Park Corner.⁶² L.M. Montgomery’s narratives have wielded a guiding hand over succeeding histories. The legends that she told so often are frequently repeated, as fact, in local histories, doubtless because she is the Island’s most famous daughter. Unsurprisingly, then, Hugh Montgomery’s elusive brothers, Richard and Alexander, linger in subsequent histories, and a publication by the Malpeque Historical Society relates the fates of all three as learned by Montgomery in 1939.⁶³

The lore that the Montgomeries did not intend to settle on the Island, and the date of 1769, may owe their persistency to consonance with two myths attached to the Scots settlers of Princetown. Firstly, there have been occasional (and unfounded) reports that some Scots families were resident in the Malpeque area before the arrival of the *Annabella*.⁶⁴ Given the tendency of descendants to assign early migration dates to their forefathers, the 1769 date may originate in this rumour. A more

⁶¹ Mike Kennedy points out that there is a recurring tendency in PEI documentation to ascribe to Gaelic settlers traditions wherein they are described as English or English-speakers. It will be remembered that William Simpson Macneill was the first “English” child born in Charlottetown.

⁶² Eldon and Evelyn Foster. *French River and Park Corner History, 1773-1973*. n.p.: Coronation Women’s Institute, 1973. Island researchers have produced a rash of local studies—Mike Kennedy estimates that there are around 100 community histories, as well as family histories—many, like this, marking the Confederation centenary.

⁶³ *Malpeque and its People*. Summerside, PEI: The Malpeque Historical Society, nd.

⁶⁴ James P. Lawson states that this is a persistent tradition (“The Princetown Pioneers, 1769-1771” 7). Earle Lockerby, writing in response to Lawson’s article, refutes this, claiming that the rumour of this early settlement “is virtually unknown to people in the Princetown region, and is manifest only in rare instances of the Island’s historical literature” (Lockerby “‘The Princetown Pioneers’ Re-Visited” 43).

established tradition (albeit one fastened on several Maritime communities⁶⁵) is that the *Annabella* was heading for North Carolina when she was wrecked at Princetown, and her passengers were deceived into staying there: consequently, the tradition among the Scots of Lot 18 that PEI was not their chosen destination. The sinking of the *Annabella*, and the loss of part of her cargo, could surely have created a tradition that these Kintyre settlers were “cast away and sufferd mutch”.

But Hugh and Mary MacShannon Montgomery did not migrate to the Island of St John on the *Annabella* with other settlers from Campbeltown and Kintyre.⁶⁶ Helen Montgomery Ramsay, youngest daughter of Hugh and Mary, died in 1853, at the age of eighty-five. Her gravestone inscription states that she was a native of Argyllshire and that she migrated to the Island in 1771.⁶⁷ (Her husband, Archibald Ramsay, migrated with his parents, nine siblings, and two cousins on the *Annabella*.⁶⁸) L.M. Montgomery made use of Cavendish and Park Corner cemetery inscriptions when compiling her family histories, but it is possible that she had not read this memorial: she was an infrequent visitor to Malpeque, although she lived there for three months when she was thirteen. Nevertheless, it is curious that the place of origin and date were not incorporated into family legend, for many Montgomerys are buried at Malpeque.⁶⁹

In 1995, a ship’s passenger list was discovered in the Scottish Record Office, which identifies the Montgomery family’s migration.⁷⁰ The list for the *Edinburgh*—cleared for departure from Campbeltown on the 27 July 1771—was published in *The Island Magazine* in 1996, with a commentary by Mike Kennedy.⁷¹ Names for heads of parties, numbers of emigrants in each party, the rate and total fare for each whether cabin or hold passengers, are registered. The (incomplete) list names twenty-eight, and accounts for sixty-one, emigrants. Leading the list is Hugh Montgomery, head of a party of five hold-passengers, each paying a fare of seventy shillings. Hugh Montgomery was also creditor for the second named hold-passenger, Neill

⁶⁵ Earle Lockerby. “The Princetown Pioneers’ Re-Visited” 44.

⁶⁶ A plaque commemorating the *Annabella* pioneers, erected in 1964, mistakenly names the Montgomery family as part of this group. For plaque see James P. Lawson. “The Princetown Pioneers” 13.

⁶⁷ Malpeque Princetown Presbyterian Cemetery, Lot 18-2. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society.

⁶⁸ Donald Whyte. I. 365.

⁶⁹ There is no surviving stone for Hugh and Mary Montgomery.

⁷⁰ The list was unearthed by a researcher in a bundle of documents relating to Campbeltown, and identified by archivist Hugh Hagan. It is now filed in the SRO: SC 54/2/106.

⁷¹ Michael Kennedy. “Emigrants on the *Edinburgh*, 1771: A New Passenger List for Prince Edward Island.” *IM*. 39 [Spring-Summer 1996]: 39-42.

Montgomery. The *Edinburgh* was bound for the Island of St John, where Hugh Montgomery had organised to pay part of Neill Montgomery's fare.⁷²

Church registers from Lephonstrath in the Parish of Southend, Argyll, record christenings for two children of Hugh Montgomery and Mary MacShannon: Helen (mentioned above) on 28 June 1768, and Hugh on 9 August 1770.⁷³ These parish records have been rightly cited by some researchers as evidence that the Montgomerys did not emigrate prior to 1771.⁷⁴ (The *Annabella* passengers grouped during July 1770 [Lawson 1995, 11].) However, all family traditions record that six children were born to Hugh and Mary Montgomery in Scotland. One daughter, probably called Nellie (as later their youngest daughter would be) died in infancy. The five surviving children—Donald (Daniel), Margaret, John, Helen, and Hugh—all have established Canadian histories. (There is no indication that Hugh and Mary had further children in PEI.)

As the *Edinburgh* list contradicts this family tradition, Kennedy concludes both that “only three or possibly four children” of Hugh and Mary travelled on the *Edinburgh*, and that Neill Montgomery “may have been an adult son or a close relative” (41). Mary MacShannon—registered at birth as Mary McShenag, daughter of Duncan McShenag and Katherine Fleming, she clearly had Gaelic antecedents⁷⁵—was christened on 11 May 1729, in Campbeltown. As Donald (Daniel), Hugh and Mary's purportedly eldest son, was born in 1760, it seems unlikely that they would have had adult son by 1771. Neill Montgomery might then be Hugh's brother—although not the Alexander and Richard of legend—or cousin perhaps. Whatever the relationship, Neill Montgomery is not listed on the 1798 PEI census: the other adult

⁷² A letter from Earle Lockerby (*JM*. 42 [Fall-Winter 1997]: 2) records new details of the voyage unearthed by researcher, Frank Bigwood. The sailing instructions indicate that the *Edinburgh* was to collect fish in PEI to take to Oporto, Portugal, and then return (most likely with a cargo of salt) to Campbeltown. Plans changed when there were no fish to collect in PEI: the *Edinburgh* went to North Carolina to collect flax seed and flour, which was transported to Newry, Ireland. Lockerby writes that this new information clearly proves the legend that the Montgomerys were bound for Quebec to be untrue and that “[a]s Kennedy suggests, perhaps the story has some grains of truth with respect to some other family which came to the Island, most likely later than 1771, and that this story somehow attached itself to the Montgomerys”.

⁷³ Birth records taken from the International Genealogical Index compiled by the Church of the Latter Day Saints.

⁷⁴ e.g. *Malpeque and Its People*; R.C. Montgomery. *Down the Years with the Montgomerys*. published privately.

⁷⁵ As Kennedy points out, one passenger on the *Edinburgh*, Hector MacShenaig, may have been a relative of Mary. He also notes that “[t]he O'Senógs were one of the families of hereditary harpers in Kintyre who had been granted lands by the MacDonald Lords of the Isles for their services. Although still known colloquially in Kintyre as ‘Shenogs,’ their name, like many from Kintyre, has appeared in a large number of forms over the last 500 years, such as McMaschenag, McCosenach, McShinnocht, McIschanoch, McCochennan, MacShenaig, MacShannon, and Shannon” (42). See also Robert H. McShannock. *McShenoig-McShannon of Southend and Campbeltown: A Study of Our Family*. published privately, 1986.

male Montgomery must either have died, or moved on, by then (which could in itself have spawned the lore that not all the family settled permanently in PEI).

But what of the missing children? Also named on the *Edinburgh* list is James Woodside, head of a party of two. The Woodside family would be linked by marriage both to the Montgomerys and the Cavendish Simpsons. James Woodside, born in 1736 in Irvine, Ayrshire, was a tailor and a farmer. He married a Campbeltown woman, Ann Love, in 1765. Their son Robert was christened in Campbeltown in November 1770, and died on Lot 18, PEI, in 1812. James and Ann Woodside probably had three other children who were born in Scotland.⁷⁶ As with the Montgomerys, the *Edinburgh* register does not list these children, although all have traceable histories in Prince Edward Island.

It seems reasonable to suppose that young children (perhaps those under the age of five) were not included on the passenger list. (If this is the case then the number of migrants arriving on the *Edinburgh* was higher than sixty one.) Certainly the very youngest children in each family were babies, presumably unweaned, who must have used little of the seventy shillings worth of hold-space and food migrants paid for. The only vaguely plausible alternative theory (granted that all the Montgomery and Woodside children eventually arrived in Canada) is that these nuclear families migrated in separate waves. This would be highly unusual to say the least.

The Stewart family of Campbeltown organised the voyage of the *Edinburgh*. When the *Annabella* was wrecked and supplies intended for Lt. Col. Robert Stewart's settlement on Lot 18 lost, his brother Peter (who was Provost Marshall of Campbeltown) chartered the *Edinburgh* to carry further provisions (Kennedy 1996, 40). Several of the *Edinburgh* passengers were linked to this family. Of the others, Kennedy writes that the majority were travelling in family groups, "which was typical of Highland emigration, but less usual of emigration from other areas during this period" (ibid.). It is unclear if the Stewart family actively recruited these migrants. Lt. Col. Robert Stewart, Peter Stewart, Dugald Stewart (who captained the *Annabella*) and Annabella Stewart (wife of the other Robert Stewart, and possibly a passenger on the *Edinburgh*) were all children of the Rev. Charles Stewart, one-time minister of the Highland Congregation of Kintyre in Campbeltown. James P. Lawson notes that there is nothing in Church of Scotland records to indicate that these migrants were recruited by the church: nevertheless, it has been suggested that many

⁷⁶ Woodside genealogy from "The Descendants of James Woodside." *The Island Register*. This page lists three other children born in Scotland: John (born 1766), James (born 1767) and Rebekah (born 1769).

of the *Annabella* migrants (and by implication the *Edinburgh* migrants) were members of this congregation (Lawson 1995, 11).

In the latter half of the seventeenth century settlers from Lowland areas migrated to the Kintyre peninsula where land was readily available. (The region was depopulated by the battles and plagues of the 1640s.) According to a Campbeltown historian, Charles MacTaggart, “the Presbyterianism of the settlers was of a far more strict type than that of the local Highlanders and the services in the Parish Church here were then entirely in Gaelic, a language the settlers did not understand”.⁷⁷ Hence, a separate Lowland church was formed in 1654, and a degree of hostility thrived between the two congregations. If there is any basis to the supposition that the Highland Church of Campbeltown (Charles Stewart died in 1765) was a recruitment site for the Stewart family’s ventures, the affiliation of both John Macneill and the Montgomery family to the Stewarts, places L.M. Montgomery’s ancestors on the Highland side of the Kintyre cultural divide. (A stricter Lowland church might have preached the type of Presbyterianism which discouraged emigration as disobedient, defiant, and unaccepting of fate [Kennedy 1995, 50].)

Several studies of the Montgomery clan have attempted to delve yet deeper into the genealogy of Hugh Montgomery. The community history of Malpeque, R.C. Montgomery’s *Down the Years with the Montgomerys*, and a history of the clan by James W. Montgomery of Wetaskiwin, Alberta (their data may be mutually derived) name the parents of Hugh Montgomery as Hugh Montgomery and Mary Boes. Mary Boes was the daughter of the Rev James Boes, inducted as minister to the Campbeltown *Lowland* Church in 1694.⁷⁸ This lineage therefore contradicts some implications of the Stewart connection. Christened in Campbeltown on 16 September 1697, Mary Boes married Hugh Montgomery on 11 April 1715. Hugh Montgomery was the Provost of Campbeltown, and collector of customs and taxes. His father, Hugh Montgomery [d. 1728] of Broomlands (in the parishes of Irvine and Dreghorn, near Ayr), claimed connection to the *Earls of Eglinton*.

Hugh Montgomery [d. 1766] compiled the “Broomlands Manuscript”, a family tree of immense proportions, since lost. Tracing his family back to William Montgomerie of Greenfield—third son of Hugh Montgomerie, the first Earl of Eglinton—the Broomlands clan claimed to be heirs of the earldom, under the

⁷⁷ Charles MacTaggart. “The Lowland Church of Campbeltown from its foundation in 1654 till the Disruption.” Reprinted from *The Campbeltown Courier*, 3 December 1924.

⁷⁸ MacTaggart writes that Campbeltown tradition makes the Rev. Boes either the son, or grandson, of one of Cromwell’s Ironsides, and therefore of English descent. James Boes had formerly been a teacher near Lochgilphead: he remained the minister of Campbeltown until his death in 1749. There is a weight of folklore attached to the Rev. Boes, who reputedly had the second-sight and regular converse with the devil.

supposition that the Lainshaw branch was extinct.⁷⁹ William's grandson, Hugh Montgomery of Stane, bought the Broomlands estate from John Peebles, Provost of Irvine. Hugh [d. 1658] was succeeded at Broomlands by his son George [d. 1700].⁸⁰ George was succeeded by his son, Hugh Montgomery, who married Jean Brown. Hugh [1645-1728] and Jean [also 1645-1728] had at least eight children, including George, Robert and Hugh. George Montgomery migrated to Jamaica.⁸¹ Robert, their eldest son, inherited the Broomlands estate, but died childless in 1740. Into the breach stepped brother Hugh, and his wife Mary Boes, who returned to Ayrshire from Campbeltown. When Hugh Montgomery died, the estate passed to his son Charles [b. 1730], who was appointed Merchant Burgess of Glasgow in 1754.⁸²

If L.M. Montgomery's family legends are to be integrated into this genealogy, then Hugh and Mary Boes Montgomery would be the parents of Hugh Montgomery *and* his brothers Alexander and Richard. Five children are registered to Hugh and Mary in Campbeltown: Jean, Elizabeth, Mary, James and Charles.⁸³ Their birth dates range from 1717 (Jean) to 1730 (Charles). No children are registered to them between 1722 and 1729. As the Broomlands estate passed to Charles, it seems likely that he was the eldest male heir in 1766. Montgomery histories and histories of Ayr agree that the estate passed to Jean when Charles died. (Charles Montgomery never married.) This rather discredits the idea of Hugh Montgomery being a son of Hugh and Mary Boes Montgomery, let alone one of three additional sons, lest all had been cast away from the family record (and Broomlands manuscript) and suffered much.

Obviously, Hugh was a common name in the Broomlands family (and Alexander was not unknown) but there were no Richards in the connection. Richard does not exactly "smack of the heather".⁸⁴ Family history is hazardous, and records

⁷⁹ Hugh Montgomery, the fifth Earl of Eglinton, died without issue. The estate was settled on his relative Alexander Seton, thus disinheriting the earl's cousin, Sir Neil Montgomery of Lainshaw, probably because Lady Lainshaw had been implicated in the murder of the fifth earl's father, Thomas Harrison Montgomery. *Genealogical History of the Family of Montgomery including the Montgomery Pedigree*. Philadelphia: private circulation, 1863. See also B.G. de Montgomery. *Origins and History of the Montgomerys*. Edinburgh, London: William Blackwood, 1948. This history notes that the Broomlands manuscript was allegedly based on copies of family papers destroyed when Eglinton Castle was razed in 1528. The author notes that the manuscript is not always reliable.

⁸⁰ Dates here are taken from a tombstone transcription in James Paterson's two volume *History of the County of Ayr*. Ayr: John Dick, Paisley: Robert Stewart, 1852.

⁸¹ See David Dobson, *Vol. II* 156.

⁸² Confusingly, Dobson, lists Charles Montgomery, son of Hew Montgomery of Broomlands and Mary Boes, as having emigrated from Scotland to Jamaica in 1758, dying there in 1766. This contradicts other accounts of the family which have Charles living into the 1780s.

⁸³ Elizabeth "Betty" Montgomery married Rev. David Campbell, minister of Southend, in October 1746. Mary Boes was Hugh Montgomery's first wife. He also married Margaret Learman: they had no children.

⁸⁴ The International Genealogical Index records no Richard Montgomerys on the relevant Scottish registers.

are far from complete, but it appears improbable that L.M. Montgomery's ancestors were the Broomlands' Montgomerys (from Ayrshire). Why posterity should have been deemed them so is not hard to understand. A family that could produce a Canadian senator, and that carried a great sense of its own worth, is easily rooted to aristocratic connections. There were many Montgomerys—and many Hugh Montgomerys—in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Argyllshire⁸⁵: the Broomlands' Montgomerys are distinctive because their genealogy is well-documented.

Mrs Colclough's family history seems equally dubious. If Alexander Montgomery returned to Scotland, he left little trace of his restoration. (He certainly did not attempt to reclaim the supposed family seat.) John Montgomery, owner—he also fought in the War of 1812—of the tavern on Yonge St, Toronto frequented by William Lyon Mackenzie's rebels, was born in New Brunswick in 1788, the son of Alexander Montgomery of Stamford, Connecticut. Alexander had come to the Maritimes in the wake of the American Revolution, making his connection to Richard Montgomery, reportedly an Ontario settler, fairly doubtful.⁸⁶ John Montgomery may well have been connected to the earls of Eglinton: L.M. Montgomery may also have been, but there is little proof, aside from the family resemblance, to accredit the latter.

What evidence there is indicates that Hugh and Mary MacShannon Montgomery migrated with five small children, from Campbeltown, Kintyre, as hold-passengers (not wealthier cabin passengers) on the *Edinburgh* in 1771. The ship's passengers were bound for the Island of St John not Quebec. These emigrants followed in the wake of others from Campbeltown who travelled to Lot 18 the previous year and originally settled in the same township as their countrymen. Do all the Montgomery family legends then lie in tatters? To a large degree the answer is yes. The *Edinburgh* list refutes the tradition that Hugh Montgomery was the first English speaker at Malpeque, that the family intended to migrate to Quebec, and that there were two adult brothers.

At the very least, Montgomery family history is testament to a vigorous oral culture among these Scots-Canadians. Some aspects of this Montgomery lore suggest that amalgamation with other family and community tales may have taken place. (George Montgomery notes, for example, that young Rose McCary [wife of James Townsend Montgomery] and her family "sailed from Dublin on the ship 'Hannah'

⁸⁵ Some branches probably had their roots in lands to the south of Kintyre, in North and South Ayrshire. Mike Kennedy points out that the name Montgomery had been in the Highlands long enough to acquire its own Gaelic form, "MacGumerait" (162, 42n).

⁸⁶ *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Vol. X.

bound for Quebec” when storms forced them to land in PEI [SJ IV 421].) For a study of L.M. Montgomery’s life and work, these legends have an influence irrespective of their authenticity.

Yet the true story of these migrants is far from irrelevant. Geographic origins in Scotland suggest the cultural background of the immigrants. These origins were a determining factor in Canadian settlement patterns, which in turn influenced social environment, marriage choices, and so forth. Reasons for leaving Scotland identify not only the migrants’ material circumstances, but also their expectations, and their self-perceptions. Each story makes an impression on the identity descendants inherit and consequently has an impact on the course of L.M. Montgomery’s fiction.

* * *

The April 1798 census finds Hugh and Mary MacShannon Montgomery still living in the Royalty of Princetown where they had settled twenty-seven years earlier. Although their three sons were by this time grown men, only the eldest, Daniel (Donald), is listed as a head of a household.⁸⁷ (He is named as Daniel Montgomery, *Esq.*, a title reserved in this register for those of some social standing.) Hugh and Mary lived with five other adults, two females and three males, as well as a girl under sixteen years of age. Their son John was married by this date, with one daughter; their son Hugh’s first child was not born until 1799 and he was probably single: it is reasonable to assume that all were still living with Hugh and Mary. Their daughter Helen’s husband, Archibald Ramsay, appears as a head of household containing five children: the other two adults in Hugh Montgomery’s household were possibly Margaret Montgomery and her spouse.

From this it would seem that the Montgomery children lived with their parents until they were able to obtain land on which to build their own homes, a reminder of the problems of land tenantry. When John Montgomery and Hugh Montgomery Jr. did acquire homesteads, they did not settle alongside their parents, but in the vicinity of their in-laws. This may have been a course dictated by their wives, but more probably resulted from the fact that Lot 18 including Princetown, one of the Island’s three designated towns, was comparatively densely populated.⁸⁸ John Montgomery married Ann Hooper, and established his branch of the family in the

⁸⁷ The census as reproduced names the heads of household in each lot, the number of males and females under the age of 16, between 16 and 60, and over the age of 60, as well as the total number of residents in each household. There were a total of 4,372 Islanders in 1798, 2,335 males and 2,037 females. Over fifty percent of the population were under sixteen years of age.

⁸⁸ The Island was divided into three counties, Prince, Queens, and King, and each county had a projected town (Princetown, Charlottetown, and Georgetown). Approximately ten percent of the Island population (431 people) lived in Lot 18 and the Royalty of Princetown in 1798.

Bedeque area of PEI (Lot 26). Hugh Montgomery Jr. married Christy Penman, sister of Nancy Penman, and lived in Richmond Bay on Lot 13. He died when he was in his mid-forties (in 1811) and was the father of "Little Donald" Montgomery of Port Hill (Lot 13), who was a member of the provincial legislature for many years.

Only Helen Montgomery married a Kintyre migrant: she remained on Lot 18 at Beech Point, south of Malpeque. Ann Hooper was born in New Jersey in 1770. Her family were United Empire Loyalists, who settled with other UEL families in Lots 25 and 26. (Her father, Thomas Hooper, was a supporter of Walter Patterson's faction, and one of the "Fletcher List" of pro-Patterson candidates named in the July 1787 election.) Nancy and Christy Penman, were (as George Montgomery states) the daughters of George Penman, paymaster of the British garrison that came to the Island in 1758 to oversee the Acadian expulsion. Although some accounts state they were born in New England, the Penman girls were most likely Islanders (Nancy was born ca. 1768).⁸⁹ Their father settled on Lot 13, at Port Hill, where Hugh Montgomery Jr. leased 300 acres from the proprietor in 1806.⁹⁰ As the place names Bideford and Northam indicate, migrants to Lots 12 and 13 came from south-west England. (Port Hill was named for a residence in Northam, Devon, of the Saltern Willets.⁹¹) Margaret Montgomery married, firstly, a Captain McLeod, who was drowned, and secondly, a "Scotch merchant and ship-builder" (SJ IV 420), Thomas Archibald, of Rose Hill, Lot 16.⁹²

* * *

The Montgomerys emigrated as a family group. They were able to pay their own passage, although at the cheaper hold rates. They travelled on a ship carrying supplies and migrants chartered by a family connected to a larger, organised, community exodus. There is much here that accords with Highland emigration patterns, although a minority of Lowlanders also migrated as family units in this period. However, Highland communities generally encouraged ongoing chain

⁸⁹ "Donald Montgomery, a native of Argyleshire, Scotland, died Feb. 2, 1845, Ae. 85; Also his wife, Nancy, died Aug. 2, 1937, Ae. 69." Malpeque Princetown Presbyterian Cemetery, Lot 18-2. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society.

⁹⁰ Basil Greenhill & Ann Giffard. *Westcountrymen in Prince Edward's Isle: A Fragment of the Great Migration*. 1967: Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1975: 46. Greenhill and Giffard note that George Penman died about the time of the Battle of Trafalgar: the next year Hugh Montgomery leased his 300 acres from the Seymours, in return for the payment of £90, plus 15 shillings a year and rent to the Crown. Greenhill and Giffard add that Hugh Jr did little with the property, including either living on it or paying rent: consequently, squatters occupied the land. For more on George Penman, see Douglas Sobey (ed.). "A Journey Across Lot 13 in 1793." *IM*. 42 [Fall-Winter 1997]: 25-34.

⁹¹ Greenhill & Giffard, op. cit. 22.

⁹² Curiously, LMM's three teaching jobs were in these areas. LMM visited her cousins at Port Hill when in Bideford (SJ I 119).

migration, and these Kintyre migrants did not. Hugh and Mary Montgomery's descendants would have power, influence, independence, and wealth: the trappings of opportunity. Like other Scots coming to the Island of St John, a primary reason for leaving Scotland was presumably the apparent lack of such opportunities in their native land.

From their history in Prince Edward Island some tentative speculations on the wider circumstances of their migration can be proposed. Initially Hugh, Mary and their young family settled near those who had also migrated from the Kintyre peninsula. (When in Scotland it is possible that Hugh Montgomery arranged to lease land on Lot 18 from Robert Stewart.) In doing so, they may have been motivated by cravings for familiar society, but in 1771 the Island was covered in dense forest, and the possibilities for venturing further afield were limited, not to mention hazardous. For nearly thirty years the nuclear family remained in this township. This decision may have been influenced by a temporary want of alternatives, resulting from the Island's system of land tenure.

Subsequent history suggests this decision was unlikely to spring from a conservatism that spurred them to continue a traditional pastoral lifestyle with like-minded friends. There was scant choice of marriage partners, admittedly, but the Montgomery children did not limit themselves further by marrying only in their community. They did not settle with fellow Kintyre migrants, or even fellow Scots, but instead according to potential for opportunity and prosperity. Their destinies reveal their ambitions to lie in ship-building as well as farming, in the political and judicial arena, and in enterprise, often outside the Island; in other words, in the manifold possibilities that new colonies presented. Within a generation they were active in Prince Edward Island's political arena.

Before turning to the Cavendish clans, it is pertinent to remember that L.M. Montgomery cleaved the legacies of her Argyll ancestors. When pulled between the extremes of ardour and a guilty conscience, she blamed her antipathetic forebears—"the passionate Montgomery blood and the Puritan Macneill conscience"—for her confused emotions. Montgomery considered the Macneills (and their Lot 23 neighbours) to be Lowlanders. Perhaps more than geography, their puritanical characteristics conflated with stereotypes of hard-hearted and hard-headed Lowlanders—and her actual experience of Highland communities that preserved their Gaelic culture—to produce this classification. Her well-loved Montgomery relatives bequeath a different inheritance. Their passionate blood may have been allied with a different cultural stereotype: the ardent Highland Scot. This is not to imply that

L.M. Montgomery considered the Montgomerys to be Gaels. She did not. But she clearly recognised more than one kind of Scottish inheritance blended in her make-up.

The Cavendish Litany

John Macneill was born in 1750, in Campbeltown, Kintyre, the son of Malcolm Macneill and Euphemia (Euffen) McAlaster. He was a young man of twenty-five when he (in all probability) cast in his lot with the Stewart family and migrated to the Island of St John. Shortly afterwards Macneill settled in Charlottetown. Little is known of his early days in the capital, save a legend that felled several trees in the town with which to build his log cabin, much to Governor Walter Patterson's displeasure. When Patterson's lackey reprimanded Macneill, Macneill promptly felled the messenger.⁹³ No matter how true this tale is, the telling of it plainly installs Macneill as an opponent of the Patterson regime, and asinine colonial authority in general. Posterity has enhanced this interpretation by adding that Macneill's cabin stood where the present day Legislative Building now stands.⁹⁴

Macneill spent the war years in Charlottetown.⁹⁵ In 1780, he married a twenty-one-year-old Scots girl, Margaret Simpson, and the couple's first child, William, was born in Charlottetown in 1781. In 1791, John Macneill agreed to lease 100 acres of land in Lot 23 (he leased a further 400 in 1803), thereby joining his wife's parents, and some of her siblings, in the new community they had established the previous year. John and Margaret had likely not lived solely in Charlottetown before this final relocation: there is a tradition that they stayed for a time in Pisquid (which neighbours Mount Stewart, the residence built in 1789 by John "Hellfire Jack" Stewart). John and Margaret Simpson raised eleven children (probably five were born before they moved to Lot 23), and seven of these eleven established their families in Cavendish.⁹⁶

William and Janet Simpson, Margaret's parents, probably migrated within their native Morayshire, for their Scottish born-children—eight from a total of ten—are registered in several parishes. The certificate of character that William, a tailor, brought to his new home, states that the family had been resident in the parish of

⁹³ Bumsted notes that legislation was introduced in 1780 to prevent trees being cut without permission of the proprietor, as much timber was being wasted. *Land, Settlement, and Politics* 81-82.

⁹⁴ e.g. Harold H. Simpson. *Cavendish: Its History, Its People: its founding families, Simpsons, Macneills, Clarks and their Kin*. Nova Scotia: published privately, 1973: 72. Mollie Gillen, 3.

⁹⁵ The PEI Land Registry Index shows John Macneill leasing land in Charlottetown in 1780 (H.H. Simpson 81).

⁹⁶ Only one son, Charles, moved from the Island (to Raleigh, Ontario): a second son James, may later have moved to Chatham, Ontario, but his family were raised, and some stayed, in Cavendish.

Roths for only one and a half years.⁹⁷ This suggests their move across the Atlantic was but the final stage of a subsistence migration. William was most likely one of twins, born to Walter Simpson and Elspeth Man, in the Haugh of Arndilly in 1733. Janet Simpson was probably born in 1735 in Fochabers, the daughter of James Winchester and Helen Bowman. William and Janet married in 1758. A family legend, repeated in Harold H. Simpson's Cavendish history, and seemingly entirely without reason or foundation, is that Janet was the disinherited daughter of the Marquis of Winchester, effaced from the family record for eloping with her father's groomsman, William Simpson.

Back in the real world, ten Simpsons and forty-two other migrants boarded the *John and Elizabeth* for North America in 1775.⁹⁸ According to oral records, this ship was wrecked somewhere between Point Prim and Flat River (Lots 58 and 60) in August: other sources state that the *John and Elizabeth* was deliberately driven onto the shore at Orwell River (Lot 57). Whatever the circumstances, the migrants were in a sorry state, having lost some of their possessions, off a particularly hostile and at that stage unpopulated, district of the Island. That November their supply ship became a spoil of war for American privateers. No help from proprietors was forthcoming, and the settlers' destitution was such that it begat the later hyperbolic rumours of cannibalism. The Simpsons appear to have moved to Charlottetown during the winter of 1775. Again, there are few anecdotes relating to the Simpsons in Charlottetown. One worthy of repetition is that William is reputed to have owned one of the first horses in the capital, which he refused to lend to the Governor for hauling wood, because it was the Sabbath. The Simpsons, it seems, gained an early reputation for Bible-thumping.

Until 1790 the Simpson history is sparse. Moves were made to lease land in the Royalty of Princetown, but only Thomas Simpson [b. 1760] was living there in 1798.⁹⁹ Family tradition holds that William Simpson worked in Charlottetown for some years, before the family quit for the Covehead area of the North Shore (Lot 34).¹⁰⁰ Lot 34 had originally been granted to John Dickson MP, but when he died in 1767, was added to the holdings of the Scottish Lord Advocate, Sir James Montgomery.¹⁰¹ David Lawson was engaged to hire and oversee the indentured

⁹⁷ H.H. Simpson 28.

⁹⁸ *ibid.* Also *Land, Settlement, and Politics* 67.

⁹⁹ H.H. Simpson cites Provincial Land Registry records from September 1780 wherein William and Janet's sons, William Jr., James, Thomas, and John, leased land in Princetown. In 1798, Thomas Simpson was head of a household of five on this lot: he moved to New Brunswick the following year.

¹⁰⁰ For a history of this area see G. Harry Kielly, *History of the Montgomery Settlers and others at Stanhope—Covehead—Brackley Pt., 1770-1970*.

¹⁰¹ Andrew Hill Clark 266.

servants who were to work this land for four years, after which time they were entitled to the farms on 1,000-year leases. These migrants, recruited from Perthshire and Argyll, left Greenock on the *Falmouth*, in April 1770, arriving in the Island of St John in early June. Passengers included the Rev William Drummond, whose diary is descriptive of early conditions on the Island and has been used in the partial construction of a passenger list for the 120 *Falmouth* emigrants.

William Simpson Jr. married (in 1790) Mary Miller, a native of Crieff, Perthshire, a *Falmouth* passenger, and a Stanhope (Lot 34) inhabitant.¹⁰² Helen Simpson, daughter of William and Janet Simpson, was a resident of Covehead when she married William Clark, the paterfamilias of the third branch of the Cavendish triumvirate. Mary Clark and William Clark, their children, married siblings John and Margaret McEwen, children of *Falmouth* passengers Duncan and Jean (McLaren) McEwen.¹⁰³ Interestingly, Duncan McEwen, who served as a member of the Island House of Assembly in 1784 and 1803, was described by another of his children, Edward MacEwen, as a Gaelic speaker (MacEwen 1891, 14).¹⁰⁴ The Simpsons did not remain long on Lot 34. In August 1789, William Simpson leased 500 acres on Lot 23 from the proprietor, William Winter.¹⁰⁵ This land was divided between himself, his sons James and William Jr., and his son-in-law, William Clark.

William Clark was a native of Clackmannanshire. Like John Macneill, he migrated to the Island alone. The family legends H.H. Simpson ties to William Clark are confused as well as romantic, but intimate that Clark escaped a press-gang by jumping a ship bound either for Quebec, or the thirteen colonies. He reputedly made his way to Boston, and witnessed the Battle of Bunker Hill in June 1775, whereafter he decided to make his way to more loyal territories.¹⁰⁶ William Clark's gravestone inscription states that he was seventy-seven when he died in 1831, therefore born in 1754.¹⁰⁷ A ship list for the *Commerce*, travelling out of Greenock in 1774, names William Clark, a twenty-year-old shoemaker from Glasgow, as one of the passengers

¹⁰² Donald Whyte. I. 335.

¹⁰³ Donald Whyte notes that Duncan McEwen, from Muthill, Perthshire, lived firstly in Stanhope, then St. Peters, then Campbelltown, PEI (222). Jean McLaren was also from Perthshire.

¹⁰⁴ Mike Kennedy notes that although many *Falmouth* settlers were ostensibly from the Highlands, Lot 34 is generally described as having Lowland settlement (153). There may have been some Gaelic migrants, but the community experienced a high degree of Anglicisation. Kennedy also notes that there may be some significance to the fact that Duncan McEwen reputedly "could speak" rather than "spoke" Gaelic (159, 35n). McEwen "could speak" English well enough to be an assemblyman, and speak out against Jack Stewart. *Land, Settlement, and Politics* 111.

¹⁰⁵ A newspaper article published on the centenary of Cavendish comments that, in 1790, "Wm. Simpson and family landed on the Cavendish shore, the solitary *English* settlers within many miles" (H.H. Simpson, 145, my italics).

¹⁰⁶ This information is repeated by Donald Whyte. II. 54.

¹⁰⁷ Cavendish Presbyterian/ United Cemetery Lot 23-1. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society.

bound for New York.¹⁰⁸ Parish registers from Alloa do record the birth of a William Clark (to a father, Francis, a name that would be used for one of William's sons) but in 1751, not 1754.¹⁰⁹ Whether from Alloa or not, it is possible that Clark had already moved to Glasgow in search of work, before migrating further afield.

J.M. Bumsted notes that during the American War, influential citizens from rural areas moved to Charlottetown, as the capital offered more security, and also, once the British garrison arrived, the possibility for reaping some prosperity (*Land, Settlement and Politics* 70). This new busyness was advantageous to the isolated colony: however, the soldiers, the bustle, and doubtless, the drinking, must have given Charlottetown an air of the ungodly. Behind the foundation of Cavendish lies the belief that the Simpsons left immoral Charlottetown because of their religious convictions. As a tailor, not a farmer, urban Charlottetown should have offered greater possibilities to William Simpson and his artisan son-in-law, William Clark, than a sparsely populated rural township: the capital however, had a reputation for "wickedness".¹¹⁰

The Island's civil list included the stipend for a minister, but the first appointed clergyman, Ernest Caulfield, never took up his post. (The Church of England was the established church.) After much argument between Patterson and Thomas Desbrisay, an assistant was appointed; the Rev Theophilus Desbrisay, Thomas' son.¹¹¹ Theophilus arrived in Charlottetown in 1775 to find no church, no manse, and no prospect of being paid and instead took up work as a ship's chaplain. He returned to the Island in 1777, when Walter Patterson's war-time visit to Britain secured payment of the civil list, and consequently Rev Desbrisay's salary. Rev Theophilus Desbrisay was the only Protestant clergyman on the Island for most of the remainder of the century, and served the Presbyterian as well as the Anglican population. For the first twenty years of his ministry he elected not to live in Charlottetown, although he preached there, but in a rural community in the north of the Island—Covehead (Warburton 389-390).

Hence, it is not unreasonable to suggest that the Simpsons' relocation to Covehead might have been partially influenced by Rev Desbrisay's presence. In addition, Covehead had an established, Scottish population and better communication

¹⁰⁸ V.R. Cameron. *Emigrants from Scotland to America, 1774-5*. Baltimore, 1965.

¹⁰⁹ William Clark, son of Francis Clark and Janet Galloway, christened May 5, 1751, in Alloa, Clackmannanshire.

¹¹⁰ See the Rev T.F. Fullerton. "Precis of the History of the Presbyterian Church in Prince Edward Island." *Past and Present of Prince Edward Island*. Eds. D.A. MacKinnon and A.B. Warburton. Charlottetown: B.F. Bowen & Co., nd. Fullerton cites an account written by PEI's first Presbyterian missionary, Dr McGregor, who notes that Parson Desbrisay did not live in Charlottetown because "It is a wicked place and he is more retired and happy in the country" (306a).

¹¹¹ *Land, Settlement, and Politics* 43.

links with Charlottetown than any other community. (The Island's first road was built between the two.¹¹²) Quite why they moved on from here is unclear, but they perhaps experienced difficulties in procuring land from James Montgomery or David Lawson. After the godless Charlottetown, and rural Covehead, the Simpsons, by this time united in marriage to both Macneill and Clark, set out to build their own "city upon a hill". In 1798, twenty-eight of Lot 23's forty-five residents, were Simpsons or Macneills or Clarks.¹¹³ Many of William and Janet's descendants stayed in the community of their forebears, marrying their cousins, and second cousins.¹¹⁴ For over a hundred years the three clans would dominate Cavendish, and in turn, her sister community, Bayview.

* * *

William and Janet Simpson's children William Jr, James, Helen, and Margaret remained in Cavendish. Helen married William Clark, Margaret married John Macneill, and William Jr married Mary Miller: these were to be the three principal branches of the Cavendish clans: Clark, Macneill, and Simpson. James Simpson and his wife, Nancy Woodside (daughter of James Woodside and Ann Love, the Montgomerys' fellow-migrants on the *Edinburgh*), initially lived in Cavendish, but moved to neighbouring Bayview (Lot 22) in 1812, thereafter the main Simpson habitat.

At the centenary of the settlement Cavendish comprised of twenty-seven households. Two of these belonged to Simpsons, two to Clarks, and eleven homesteads were owned by Macneills. Confusingly, three of the Macneill families were unrelated, except by marriage, to John Macneill of Campbeltown, hailing rather from Perthshire whence one Charles *Macneill* and family had migrated in 1804.¹¹⁵ The founding clans had been joined by *Mackenzies* (in 1890 there were 3 households), *Lairds* (also 3 households), a family of *Robertsons*, a family of *Harkers*, and one of *Stewarts*: all Scots.¹¹⁶

¹¹² G. Harry Kielly. *History of the Montgomery Settlers*.

¹¹³ The other residents were Lot 23's proprietor, Captain Winter, head of a household of 7, John Grant, and Jacob Buskirk, head of a household of nine.

¹¹⁴ e.g. seven of James Simpson and Nancy Woodside's ten children married. Three married their first cousins; four married their first cousins once removed.

¹¹⁵ An obituary for Alexander Macneill (who died in 1862) reads, "Recently at Cavendish, 62 years old, Alexr Macneill, youngest son of Charles, who emigrated from Perthshire to this Island in 1804" (H.H. Simpson). Parish registers for the Port of Monteith record the baptism of a child, Alexander Macneill, to parents Charles Macneill and Janet MacIntyre, on April 8, 1800. See also Donald Whyte, II. 259. Mike Kennedy notes that several groups of Perthshire migrants came to PEI in 1803, 1804.

¹¹⁶ There were also two manses, Presbyterian and Baptist, and George Hillman's forge.

Alexander Laird, who died in 1902 at the age of ninety-one, was a native of Kilmacolm, Renfrewshire.¹¹⁷ According to Harold H. Simpson, the Stewart brothers who settled in Lot 22/ 23 in 1858—Alexander at Cavendish and John at Bayview—came from a family who left Scotland for Quebec in June 1818, whence to PEI, settling first in Brackley Point (Lot 34), and then among the pioneer group founding New Perth (Lots 51/ 52). As this suggests, the Stewart clan also had their origins in Perthshire.¹¹⁸ George Harker, or Harken, [b. 1796] came to PEI from Lanarkshire, in 1820.¹¹⁹ The origins of the Mackenzies and the Robertsons are obscured, but it seems likely that the Robertsons were also from Perthshire. All these Cavendish families appear to have settled in Prince Edward Island before 1820; that is, before extreme poverty in Scotland became a chief reason for migration.

L.M. Montgomery sometimes directed contemptuous words at the “poor white trash” (*SJ* III 344) families in Bayview, or Cavendish Road (now Mayfield), or Cavendish Capes, which stem from her clans’ conviction that they were above the average. The Cavendish clans appear to have made clear distinctions between classes of migrants. Later migrants who settled into the area were strangers and treated as outsiders: none of this is in keeping with Gaelic settlement patterns which fostered chain migration. In addition to Irish settlers at Hope River and French-Canadians at Toronto, Cavendish Road, Bayview, Cavendish Capes, and North Rustico were populated by other Scots (McKinstries, McLures), English settlers (Moore, Wyands, Toombs), and various families L.M. Montgomery considered not “born to the purple” (Houstons, Bernards, Jacks, Grahams).¹²⁰

After a hundred years Cavendish had few amenities: a post-office in Lucy Woolner Macneill’s kitchen, a village hall, a school, and two churches. The nearest store was kept by the Jacks at Cavendish Road: riverside Bayview and Hope River

¹¹⁷ Alexander Laird was christened on 27 January 1811, the son of Alexander and Agnes Laird. Donald Whyte speculates that Laird possibly migrated to PEI with his parents in 1818 (II 144). Whyte’s first volume lists an Alexander Laird, farmer and Liberal politician, from Renfrewshire, emigrating to the Island in 1819. This Alexander Laird was seemingly the father of Alexander, a politician, and David (1833-1914) Lt. Gov. of the North West Territories (I. 158). (Whyte’s source is W.J. Rattray, *The Scot in British North America*.) This may not exactly square LMM description of “Old Sandy” Laird as “drunken and licentious” (Jan. 28, 1912: U.3).

¹¹⁸ A family of Stewarts travelled to Quebec on the *Jane* in 1818 (Dobson, II. 190-193). Donald Whyte records that James Stewart and wife, Christianna (the mother of John and Alexander Stewart was Christian MacLure), originally from Perthshire, came to PEI in 1819 (II. 354).

¹¹⁹ Donald Whyte. II. 119.

¹²⁰ Florence Livesay of the “She’s Still Lucy Maud” biographic sketch intensely annoyed LMM by questioning “how I ever got a start [in Cavendish] where there seemed to be nothing whatever of literary atmosphere or background”. LMM snorted in her journal about her own background compared to that of the Cavendish families Livesay knew: “To be born a Macneill was to be born to the purple in Cavendish and in those days the Moores and Grahams were very ‘poor white trash’ indeed [...] Even today, one would think, she might clearly see that the Grahams were not in the same class as the rest of Cavendish” (*SJ* III [July 17, 1927] 344).

diversified business with a saw mill and card mill and lime kiln.¹²¹ The Scots of Cavendish, as in the beginning, were mainly farmers, who now fished less for mackerel in the Gulf than before. (Early settlers owned tracts which ran inland in strips from the shore. Newer, and often poorer inhabitants—for instance those at Cavendish Road—had land with no immediate access to the sea.) For a hundred years, Cavendish had been largely self-sufficient and self-contained. Inter-marriage between village families, and inside village families, was common. By 1890, however, Cavendish life stood on the brink of change: the community could no longer provide a livelihood for its offspring, the clans were in decline.

* * *

Cavendish was “no cultural backwater” (*SJI* xv) and many raised in Cavendish went out from it to notable success in the wider world. Yet there is more than a little of the “peculiarly insulated perspective” about Cavendish as a community, which leads to questions as to how this perspective arose. Specifically, was the structure and identity of this rural community in any way the outcome of the founders’—particularly the guiding lights, the Morayshire Simpsons—emigration, or was it born from Canadian experience?

The little that is known about William Clark’s emigration harmonises with J.M. Bumsted’s model of typical Lowland migration in the 1774-1775 period: “a movement of young people, usually with artisan skills, travelling alone to begin a new life in the thirteen colonies” (*The People’s Clearance* 10). Clark’s timing was skewed, and the American Revolution sent him northward. John Macneill was likewise young, amenable, and single, and gravitated toward the Island’s urban hub, such as it was. Both Macneill and Clark married into the Simpson clan, who were driven to the capital by the privations of war, and perhaps driven from Charlottetown by the same.

Living in Charlottetown, the Simpsons and John Macneill (but perhaps not Clark) were better positioned to find out about other settlements, and land availability, than migrants isolated in outlying communities. They were also in a position to witness first-hand the worst the Island had to offer, whether from internecine politics or billeted Hessian soldiers. The Simpson family considered the option of settling in the Island’s most stable communities—Princetown and Covehead—populated predominately by non-Gaelic Scots. Free of other ties, Clark joined them in Covehead, and Macneill finally followed them to Cavendish.

¹²¹ 1880 Property map of Cavendish, reprinted in H.H. Simpson, 56-57.

Evidently these Island circumstances led the Simpsons to their eventual destination, but perhaps also influenced the cast this community would assume.

The settlement of Cavendish was not a product of happenstance. Walter Simpson comments that one resident, John Lockerby, was persuaded by the Macneills to become Cavendish's first blacksmith.¹²² Possibly the founding clans encouraged other Islanders to join them. More likely, finding themselves unable to vet the calibre of incomers, they sought to dictate the impact these new residents had on *their* settlement. On a local scale, the founding fathers of Cavendish were highly influential. As H.H. Simpson feels honesty-bound to admit, "among the descendants of William and Janet there was a feeling of superiority, that intellectually and morally they were superior to the 'lesser breeds without the clan'" (219-220). Thus the supplication of the unchosen: "From the conceit of the Simpsons, the pride of the Macneills, and the vainglory of the Clarks, Good Lord deliver us" (*TAP* 18).¹²³

This attitude toward the "lesser breeds without the clan"—and often the littler folk within the clan—is a mechanism for control that is omnipresent in L.M. Montgomery's novels. Local politics guide behaviour. In Cavendish, as H.H. Simpson comments suggest, and Montgomery's observations and prejudices bear out, there was a division between the "chosen people" and those not similarly favoured by Providence—which is not to say that those without the clan were suitably humbled. A "true story", published in *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*, told of a schoolteacher's attempt to go sailing on a squally day. Alexander Marquis Macneill, righteously knowing better, had tried to prevent him. David Jack [of Cavendish Road] informed the dominie: "That's the way with those McNeills [*sic*]. They think that nobody knows anything but themselves. They are jealous of me and that's all there is to it".¹²⁴

However, the founding clans were often at loggerheads among themselves, which the schism in the Presbyterian church consolidated. Simmering quarrels over dogma were channelled toward a "psychological moment" when the Cavendish schoolchildren horrified their elders by playing at "Lazarus," complete with shallow

¹²² Walter Simpson. "Cavendish in the Olden Times." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine* 1:10 [Christmas 1899]. The Lockerby family came to PEI, from in Annan, Dumfriesshire, via New Brunswick, in 1821. By 1862 the Lockerby name had gone from Cavendish: but Jane Lockerby, John's daughter, married Alexander Laird.

¹²³ See Robert Chambers, *Popular Rhymes of Scotland* [1870] 319-21 for similar Scottish litanies, e.g. Maxton of Cultoquay's Litany: "From the greed of the Campbells, From the ire of the Drummonds, From the pride of the Grahams, From the wind of the Murrays, Good Lord, deliver us!" LMM adapted the Cavendish litany for the over-harbour community in *Anne's House of Dreams*.

¹²⁴ J.H. Fletcher. "A Reckless Adventure." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. 1:7 [Sept. 1899]: 255-258.

grave. The subsequent outrage culminated in the formation of a separate Baptist church in 1869. As Montgomery recalls in her journal:

The Baptists and Presbyterians had nothing to do with each other but the Baptists, not to have too dull a time of it, soon started to have a lovely shindig in their own church. I don't know what it was about but "Big" George Macneill and Arthur Simpson were the leaders of the two factions and remained bitter foes all their lives, despite the fact that they were brothers-in-law. Mr Freeman [the Baptist minister] sided with Big George and politely referred to Arthur as Mr. A.(S.)S., bestowing an entirely gratuitous initial on the latter (*SJ* IV [Feb. 11, 1932] 168).

This is Scottish cultural transfer *par excellence*, of course, at least one supposed archetype of Scots behaviour: theological pedantry. There were clearly gaps in the uniformity of the Cavendish Scots.

The image of "the chosen people" is central in Cavendish and the founding clans had a talent for religion, especially the Simpsons.¹²⁵ It would be a leap of faith, however, to assume from this that religious fervour caused the Simpsons to leave Scotland, no matter how much religious separatism was integral to other emigrations to North America. L.M. Montgomery's conclusion that "pinching poverty" compelled them is probably closer to the mark, even if the conceit, pride, and vainglory of posterity neglected to deem it so. Fifteen years spanned the gap between the migration from Morayshire and the foundation of Cavendish: fifteen years of learning from Island ways, and fifteen years in which the Simpson brood matured from young Scots children to Scots-colonial adults.

Obviously, the Simpsons, Macneills, and Clarks did not compute wartime isolation in the same way that the resident proprietors did, by showing a growing disregard for British legislators (although it may have influenced their political allegiances). But stepping off the *John and Elizabeth*, or the *Elizabeth*, onto a wooded, hostile shore; losing belongings, nearly starving, and realising that no external help would be forthcoming, must have been a devastating and epiphanic experience for these Scots, and a startling baptism into the New World. They were cast upon their own resources, and survived despite appalling circumstances. Immured on the Island, they must also have become rapidly aware of the disadvantages to living on an island, cut off from the outside world, with people one would not always choose to be cut off with.

This North American situation could, reasonably, have left the Simpsons, and in-laws, feeling superior, and desiring separation. This is not to imply that Walter

¹²⁵ Cavendish boys made good include Rev Dr Albert Benjamin Simpson, Rev Dr John Thomas Macneill, Rev Leander Macneill, Rev Edwin Simpson, Rev Burton Simpson, Rev Douglas Simpson, Rev Benjamin Franklin Simpson; not to mention the many missionaries, male and female, in the connection.

and Janet Simpson were insouciant socialites, democratic and tolerant, before shipwreck soured their outlook. But an assessment of the identity consequent to L.M. Montgomery's roots and upbringing must be open to the possibility that "Scottish" legacies can spring from a cultural hybrid where the Canadian environment is crucial. As a discussion of the Scottish context of Montgomery's work engages with national identity, care must be taken, where stereotypical traits are in evidence, that the Canadian context is not overlooked.

Conclusion

As Scotland's geography is a faulty guide to cultural identity, Mike Kennedy works backwards from Canada to evaluate the Gaelic diaspora in Prince Edward Island. Whereas it is possible to classify many parts of eighteenth-century Scotland with certainty, others elude unequivocal statements. Kennedy writes that "very early emigration from Campbeltown and Lowland Perthshire presents the most difficulty in Prince Edward Island" (5, 6n). Migration from these areas has characteristics common to Highland migration, yet settlement patterns conflict with those of Gaelic-Canadian communities. Kennedy's study of PEI's local histories leads him to conclude that, for Perthshire settlers in Covehead, and Kintyre settlers in Malpeque, "[i]t is impossible to say that there was a transfer of a Gaelic community [...] even if the language may have been transmitted to some degree" (169).

L.M. Montgomery's paternal clan connections in Malpeque concur with this conclusion. There are Highland elements to the Montgomery migration, and Gaelic echoes in their names. George Montgomery obviously inherited the belief that he came from Highland stock. But unlike the history of the Simpsons or the Macneills or the Clarks, Montgomery clan identity is not secured to a specific locale or equated with a specific community.¹²⁶ In their marriage patterns and settlement patterns, personal betterment seems to take precedence over any community idyll. Highlanders they may be, but they were not part of a transferred Gaelic community.

Kennedy also infers from local accounts that Cavendish was "a predominately Highland Scottish settlement, stressing the Old World Gaelic heritage of the early settlers". Clearly the Lairds from Renfrewshire, the Harkers from Lanarkshire, Clark from Clackmannanshire, and the Cavendish man who named his homestead

¹²⁶ LMM spent time in her childhood at her Grandfather Montgomery's Park Corner home, and with the Montgomerys at Fox Point, John and Emily Montgomery (*née* Emily Macneill, a sister of LMM's mother), as well as her "Montgomery" first cousins in Charlottetown (children of her father's sisters, Margaret, who married Robert Sutherland, and Mary, who married Duncan McIntyre).

“Rutherglen Farm” after the old hometown,¹²⁷ were not Gaels. However, the Macneills, the Robertsons, the Mackenzies, the MacLures, all have names or origins less easily quantified in terms of Highland and Lowland, Gael or non-Gael. The role of the clan in the community suggests Highlanders: L.M. Montgomery said they were Lowlanders. Kennedy judges that “Gaelic appears to have been firmly subjugated to English in the Kintyre settlements” (168) with Gaelic language usage most likely ceasing within two generations. Some hundred and fifty years after John Macneill migrated from Highland Campbeltown, his great-great granddaughter described the word “ceilidh” as unknown in Cavendish until imported by a Nova Scotian minister.¹²⁸ Is it possible, then, that the rapid disappearance of some Cavendish settlers’ Gaelic heritage took with it any memory of the Highland past; and if so, how did this heritage come to be reinstated in local lore?

Harold H. Simpson, describing the history of Presbyterianism in Cavendish, refers to a linguistically-based church squabble. The Cavendish congregation initially worshipped with settlers from along the North Shore at Yankee Hill, in a log church built in 1816 to serve the Presbyterian communities of the New London area, including Bayview and Stanley Bridge.¹²⁹ In 1826, Cavendish and New London formed their own separate church, inducting the Rev Hugh Dunbar in 1827. After some years, disputes broke out between the two communities, which centred in the fact that Cavendish services were conducted in English, because *few* Gaelic-speakers lived there, whereas New London had a substantial Gaelic congregation, and both Gaelic and English were preached. The two groups felt they had conflicting interests: the Rev Dunbar resigned in 1835 and part of the congregation, chiefly Gaels, seceded.¹³⁰ Notably, then, a Gaelic-speaking community once existed in the Cavendish area, and apparently, although small, in Cavendish itself.

¹²⁷ LMM wrote, “a great-uncle Macneill came from or near Rutherglen and called his P.E. Island farm in Cavendish *Rutherglen Farm* after the old hometown”. Letter to GBM, dated Oct. 25, 1933, [NAC]. This accords with the supposed hometowns of neither sets of Macneills.

¹²⁸ LMM writes, “Mr Spurr, the Baptist minister, introduced the word [‘calie’] into Cavendish. When he came over from Nova Scotia [in the 1880s] he brought it with him and it soon became quite at home in our vocabulary. ‘Off on a calie’ or ‘gone calieing’ is a common expression there to this day. Of course that is not the right way to spell it” (Mar. 1, 1925: U.6). It is plausible that the word “ceilidh” had been in use in Cavendish, had passed out of the vocabulary, and was then reintroduced: importantly, LMM retains the true meaning of the word “ceilidh,” not the modern distortion of “evening dance”.

¹²⁹ It appears that an earlier church was actually in existence here, probably having been built around 1810. Families from Park Corner would also have worshipped in this church. To get to Yankee Hill, the “Presbyterians of Cavendish walked or rode on the beach along the chain of dunes for about five miles to its tip. Then they took the ferry over to the church”. Chester B. Stewart. “Roadblock 1810.” *IM*. 13 [Spring-Summer 1983]: 14-18.

¹³⁰ H.H Simpson notes that this congregation “connected themselves with the Kirk of Scotland [and] now form the pastoral charge of the Rev. A. Sutherland of the Free Church”, although the original congregation was also, surely, connected with the Church of Scotland.

Walter Simpson's 1899-1900 history of Cavendish casts no light on this aspect of the village's past. (Walter Simpson, like his cousin once-removed, Harold Simpson, relies on Mary Macneill Lawson for much of his information.) A newspaper review of the centenary celebration comments that, "the older speakers gave some interesting scraps of history and reminiscences of the early pioneers of the place. But all expressed regret that records were not kept and that so little was now known of the earliest settlers" (146). This is not exactly testimony to the strength of oral narrative and oral history among the Scots in Cavendish, although it could, at a stretch, indicate that a cultural dislocation took place in which the spoken word was ousted as the primary conduit of community lore.

Once the initial hardships of establishing a pioneer settlement were conquered, it must have been apparent that colonial life offered the Cavendish clans many opportunities, in politics, in business, and in social-climbing. Add to this equation the rising numbers of impoverished Scots settlers, impoverished *Gaelic* settlers, and the accompanying press clamour about destitute Clearance Highlanders, and a situation exists where a divide was created between Scots migrants. An image of the exiled Highland Scot, drawn especially from the thousands who arrived in starvation and sickness at Grosse Île in the 1830s and 40s, represented one picture of nationality—an "inferior" class of migrant—which some established, prosperous Scots-Canadians might have wished to be distanced from. (As the 1840s also brought thousands of destitute Irish *Catholics* to Upper Canada, an additional motive for well-to-do Scots *Presbyterians* to disassociate themselves from the new exiles emerges.)

In one way, the Scotland of the 1830s and 40s must have seemed very distant to these earlier Scots-Canadians, whose families had been established in the colony since the 1770s. In another, successful Scots whose tangible connection with any Highland past had been lost or obfuscated, must have felt culturally removed from these later Highland Scots, and identified standard images of Lowland Scots (sober, successful, civilised and so forth) as more representative of their own status. (Although Scott's novels, and later Queen Victoria's Balmoral holidays, made the Highland area fashionable, this was sourced in landscape features as much as the character of the natives.)

This is not to say that the Cavendish clans deliberately and consciously erased their roots, in order that they might not be mistaken for Highlanders. But their lack of records and lore about the old land meant that their Scottish roots were subject to changing external definitions of Scottishness. L.M. Montgomery, in her introductory letter to Alloa-born George MacMillan, presents a particular image of herself. She

lops three years from her age, and tells MacMillan that the “Scotch” Macneills, and Mackenzies, and Stewarts, and Roberstons, were Lowlanders. From their names alone MacMillan might have come to a different conclusion. If Montgomery’s statement of her *Lowland* roots was a considered part of her introduction—why did she feel it so necessary to mention this, when announcing her Scots-Canadian identity?—it is a fascinating comment on her perceptions and prejudices. It could also shed light on the way that Scots-Canadians are portrayed in her fiction.

This said, Maud Montgomery’s soul was always alive to the romance of the Highlands. In her journal in May 1939, she recorded that she and Chester had been to see *The Drum*, a movie based on the novel by A.E.W. Mason.¹³¹ “The Highland pipes were in it,” Montgomery wrote, “I always thrill to them”. Then, she added in reflection, “It must be in my blood”.

¹³¹ Directed by Alexander Korda, produced by Zoltan Korda, in 1938.

II.i.

“Stories of the Days Gone By”

I feel like the magician in the Eastern story who became a slave of the “jinn” he had conjured out a bottle. If I’m to be dragged at Anne’s chariot wheels the rest of my life I’ll bitterly repent having “created” her.

Letter to Ephraim Weber, September 10, 1908.¹

After twelve years of often thankless hack-work, and twelve years spent perfecting a literary style that was original and artistic but also marketable,² L.M. Montgomery’s “scribbling” hit the publishing big time in June 1908.³ Montgomery was made aware of her success, not only by merit of sales figures, and the mounting piles of letters addressed to herself and to “Miss Anne Shirley, Green Gables, PEI”, but because adults—reviewers, readers, and fellow-writers⁴—paid *Anne of Green Gables* serious attention.

Anne Shirley swiftly became an icon of courage, spirit, and affection. Much bemused, Montgomery described to Ephraim Weber one of Page’s advertising strategies for their latest “girls’ story”.⁵ Her publisher circulated a tale of some drunken Bostonian Orangemen who besieged the Page building believing themselves

¹ *The Green Gables Letters* 74.

² LMM learned from the school of hard knocks. *A Golden Carol*, a story of a rebellious but resourceful heroine who is forced by her mother’s death to keep house for her father and brother, was rejected by the Presbyterian Board of Publications, Philadelphia, and the Congregational Publishing Society of Boston. After a scaled-down version was declined by a number of juvenile periodicals, LMM burned the manuscript. LMM acknowledged that had *A Golden Carol* been accepted, she “could never have risen above it; and it would probably have committed me to a lifetime of writing ‘series’ similar to it” (*SJ* III [July 16, 1925] 240).

³ LMM’s first short-story acceptance came in 1895. The MS of “Anne” was completed around January 1906, and rejected by four American publishing houses that year (Bobbs-Merrill, Indianapolis; Macmillan Co., New York; Lothrop, Lee and Shepard of Boston; and Henry Holt Co., New York). It was finally accepted by L.C. Page in April, 1907 (*SJ* I [Aug. 16, 1907] 330-331).

⁴ Most famously, “Mark Twain” had his secretary forward his comments about *Anne* to LMM: “In ‘Anne of Green Gables’ you will find the dearest & most moving & delightful child since the immortal Alice” [XZ1 MS A098013 UG].

⁵ Letter to LMM from L.C. Page, accepting MS of *Anne of Green Gables*, dated Apr. 8, 1907 [XZ1 MS A098012 UG].

insulted by the *Green Gables*, but adopted Anne “as their mascot” upon finding out that she was *orange*-haired.⁶ In later years, Montgomery was tickled to hear of a young fan who alternately read chapters of *Anne* and the *Bible* at bedtime (*SJ* II 181), and of another who, in a school test, listed Anne of Green Gables among Henry the Eighth’s unfortunate wives (*SJ* IV 79). Promoting their 1934 *Anne of Green Gables* “talkie”, RKO described Montgomery’s book as the “Glorious Romance of Canadian Life that has Thrilled Millions” (“you’ll want to see it again and again”).⁷

However, barely three months after her mostly irrepressible, sometimes irascible and, for sixty out of sixty-six critics,⁸ completely irresistible orphan bounded out the doors of Boston’s Page firm, Maud Montgomery already feared she had unconsciously unleashed a demon. She swiftly realised that her heroine had won the hearts of an adoring public who would demand more adventures. Yet, far from wanting to see Anne “again and again”, Montgomery wanted to write different kinds of books for different kinds of people. This observation is a crucial starting point for the overview of L.M. Montgomery’s novels offered below.

American Tastes and Canadian Writers

When Montgomery embarked on her literary career, Canada could offer authors few periodicals with reasonable rates of payment, and only a small book market, incapable of yielding the profits to be had in the States. It was usual, and indeed necessary, for Canadian writers to approach American publishers in Boston, Philadelphia, and New York. (Canadian houses additionally experienced difficulties infiltrating the US market.⁹) As Carole Gerson notes, several Canadian writers of juvenile fiction set their work in America. For example, Margaret Marshall Saunders [1861-1947], Canada’s first million-selling novelist, transferred the setting of *Beautiful Joe* [1894] (a doggy counterpart to *Black Beauty*) from Meaford, Ontario, to Fairport, Maine.¹⁰ Other writers, such as poet Bliss Carman and his cousin Charles

⁶ *The Green Gables Letters* 74. In 1924, *The Delineator* declined to publish an “Emily” story which featured a Catholic priest, for fear of provoking the wrath of the Ku Klux Klan! (*SJ* III [July 10, 1924] 193).

⁷ Advertising feature, Review Scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁸ Letter to GBM, dated Aug. 31, 1908, *My Dear Mr M.* 38.

⁹ For an account of Canadian authors’ relations with their American publishers and readers, with reference to *Anne* and sequels, see Carole Gerson. “‘Dragged at Anne’s Chariot Wheels’: L.M. Montgomery and the Sequels to *Anne of Green Gables*.” *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada*. 35.2 Fall 1997: 143-159.

¹⁰ *Beautiful Joe* was the prize-winning entry in an American Humane Society competition. See Gwendolyn Davies. “Margaret Marshall Saunders: Making Regionalism International.” *Literature of Region and Nation*. Ed. Winnifred M. Boggaard. Saint John, NB: SSHRC/ U of New Brunswick,

G.D. Roberts (both published with Page) felt sufficiently marginalised to relocate (temporarily) to the United States.

Years after her own success came, Montgomery stated that, "Canada is the hardest country in the world for a young writer to make a start in".¹¹ Although novels with a distinctive Canadian setting—adventure yarns of the frozen North or western Rockies, tales of Mounties getting their man, sentimental stories of Glengarry—sold well, Canadian authors often felt pressurised to subdue their "national emphasis" (Gerson, 146, 147). Montgomery acknowledged that her own early stories were predominately "written to suit the American taste".¹² Some of these convey an American setting. Only a handful, a story of the Riel Rebellion for instance,¹³ contain a "national emphasis" so strong as to conceivably ostracise US readers.

Although there is some evidence to suggest that Canada's "mystery" was a source of increasing appeal in the years before 1914 (Gerson, 146), a first-time novelist mailing her manuscript to American publishing houses would be foolish to ignore "the American taste". Montgomery does not explain whether she felt this taste to be a parochial outlook, or perhaps a disdain for British conventions. But her early short-stories often focus on children with "grown-up" obligations and commitments, a feature associated with American child-life in literature, and quite at odds with "English style of family story" Gillian Avery identifies, wherein children experience a "sheltered, leisurely childhood" (168).¹⁴ Avery argues that American childhood was rarely secluded from the adult world. American children's books were frequently optimistic and domestic. Additionally, American authors for children were expected to keep "a much closer grip on reality" than were their British counterparts (211).

Montgomery's characters often must work from an early age. Younger family members pull together for the collective good, for example to repay a foreclosed

1998: 143-156 and "Capturing the British Literary Market: Marshall Saunders and Late Nineteenth Century Canadian Writing". *Imperial Canada, 1867-1917*. Ed. Colin M. Coates. Edinburgh: Centre of Canadian Studies, 1997: 166-176.

¹¹ Newspaper article entitled, "Canadian Public Cold to Its Own Literature", reporting on LMM's speech to the Canadian Women's Business Club. Red Scrapbook 2, 1913-1926, LMM Collection, UG.

¹² LMM thought this was one reason why her work might meet with indifference from British editors. Letter to GBM, dated Jan. 12, 1905 [NAC].

¹³ i.e. "A Soldier of the Queen", published in *Classmate*. 20 May 1905 (Scrapbook 12, labelled 1905-1916, New London Birthplace Museum & UG).

¹⁴ Gillian Avery. *Behold the Child: American Children and their Books*. London: The Bodley Head, 1994. Avery argues that Coolidge's "Katy Carr" books are more like English than American novels in this respect, although there is actually much of the *Little Women* tradition in Coolidge's series.

mortgage.¹⁵ “The mortgage”, in particular, was a conventional North American plot device that Montgomery’s pot-boilers of the 1890s and 1900s often exploited (along with striking family resemblances and sudden bequests).¹⁶ PEI was not without its share of foreclosed mortgages and child labour—in the 1890s economically motivated out-migration was in full swing—so neither circumstance was an American preserve. Realistically having only American or British markets to choose between, however, Montgomery was clearly practised at adapting her Canadian material to the former, although her own literary tastes inclined to England and Scotland.

* * *

Anne of Green Gables is undeniably and expressly a Canadian novel. Furthermore, Montgomery did not shy clear of including anti-“Yankee” sentiments, even if these are uttered by intolerant Mrs Lynde.¹⁷ However, Anne Shirley, like most literary orphans, can claim *some* British antecedence. The glimpses of Anne’s early servile drudgery and asylum-life, and Marilla’s deprecating remarks about British Barnardo boys (AGG 15),¹⁸ are suggestive of David Copperfield and Oliver Twist, who also suffer at the hands of guardians and institutions. It is implied that the intoxicated Mr Thomas may have been, for Anne, a Mr Murdstone of sorts (and later, orphaned Emily Starr will rage at Murdstone’s villainy [EC 121] when reading *David Copperfield*). Indeed, Anne is truly more orphaned than the archetypal orphan Oliver: with no possibility of mysterious relatives surfacing to claim her, she is absolutely alone in the world.

Marilla can “read between the lines” (AGG 55) of the sketchy history Anne provides, because her story is familiar. Had Anne been the expected boy, it is probable that the Cuthberts would have treated him not as a child, but as cheap farm

¹⁵ e.g. “By Way of the Brick Oven”, published in six parts in *East and West*, October, November 1908 (Scrapbook 12).

¹⁶ Stephen Leacock satirised “the mortgage”, long-lost sons, and unexpected fortune, in “Caroline’s Christmas; or The Inexplicable Infant” (*Nonsense Novels* 122-136).

¹⁷ Such sentiments grow in LMM’s novels, especially after her relationship with Page soured. *Rilla of Ingleside* encountered problems when publisher Frederick Stokes (New York) “subtly” intimated to LMM that she “had not ‘taffied up’ the U.S. enough in regard to the war” (SJ II [Mar. 5, 1921] 404).

¹⁸ Margaret Bennett estimates that between 1870 and 1930, 100,000 children, between the ages of 5 and 14, were emigrated to Canada by about fifty British agencies, the largest being Dr Barnardo’s. In the Eastern Townships of Quebec, as elsewhere in Canada, these children were commonly known as “Home” boys or girls, even into old age (Margaret Bennett. *Oatmeal and the Catechism: Scottish Gaelic Settlers in Quebec*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1998: 31). See also, Mary E. Doody Jones. “The Exceptional Orphan Anne: Child Care, Orphan Asylums, Farming Out, Indenturing, and Adoption.” *The Annotated Anne* 422-429; and for a fictional treatment of the abuse of “Home” children in Newfoundland, and Canada, E. Annie Proulx. *The Shipping News*. 1993, London: Fourth Estate, 1994: 166-170.

labour.¹⁹ Anne's declaration that Mrs Thomas "brought [her] up by hand" (AGG 53) brings to mind another of Dickens' orphans, and Marilla and Matthew certainly might have proved to be to the boy what Mrs and Joe Gargery respectively are to Pip in *Great Expectations*. In her (supposed) plain looks, Anne recalls plain Jane Eyre, another orphan whose imagination marks her as an alien in her adoptive household.

Still, in *juvenile* antecedents, Montgomery drew most heavily from her American predecessors when writing *Anne*. As Constance Classen and others note, Nova Scotia's Anne Shirley has much in common with Maine's Rebecca Rowena Randall, the heroine of a 1903 popular best-seller by Kate Douglas Wiggin [1856-1923].²⁰ The echoes of *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm* in *Anne* are many—for example, in the journeys both under-nourished, ill-clad girls make with kindly male guides to their new homes, wherein reside women who are initially hostile to them—sparking much debate as to which book makes better use of similar basic ingredients and literary style.

There *are* contrasts between the two novels that suggest divergent American and Canadian childhoods. Wiggin's heroine, as her name suggests, is raised on *Ivanhoe*, and also *The Scottish Chiefs*, but the novels Rebecca reads, by Charlotte M. Yonge, Maria Cummins, and so forth, are not such as Anne includes on her list of literary material, which is, overwhelmingly, Scottish verse.²¹ Aside from references to *Ben Hur* (AGG 274), the works of "Pansy" (AGG 136)²² and Marietta Holley [1836-1926] of "Samantha" fame (AGG 347), Anne's reading is seldom other than poetry or Shakespeare, especially after the "fascinating and creepy" (AGG 275) *Lurid Mystery of the Haunted Hall* is wrenched from her hands. Poetry was more acceptable reading material under stricter Presbyterian prohibitions against novels and story-books, even "improving" romances, such as Cummins' *The Lamplighter*.

¹⁹ Fourteen years later, Marilla wonders "what became of the boy we would have got" (AHD 10), and it seems sure that he had a fate worse than Anne.

²⁰ Constance Classen. "Is *Anne of Green Gables* an American Import?" CCL. 55 [1989]: 42-50. *The Spectator*, reviewing *Anne* on March 13, 1909, called the book, "the perfect Canadian companion picture to *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm*" (*Annotated Anne* 489). See also, Anne Scott MacLeod. *American Childhood: Essays on Children's Literature of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries*. Athens, GA: U of Georgia P, 1994: Ch. 1; Jacqueline Berke. "'Mother I can Do it Myself!': The Self-sufficient Heroine in Popular Girls' Fiction." *Women's Studies*. 6.2 [1979]: 187-203.

²¹ "'Oh, I've read lots of books,' answered Rebecca casually—'father's, and Miss Ross's, and all the dif'rent school-teachers', and all in the Sunday-school library. I've read 'The Lamplighter,' and 'Scottish Chiefs,' and 'Ivanhoe,' and 'The Heir of Redcliffe,' and 'Cora, The Doctor's Wife,' and 'David Copperfield,' and 'The Gold of Chickaree,' and Plutarch's 'Lives,' and 'Thaddeus of Warsaw,' and 'Pilgrim's Progress,' and lots more'". Kate Douglas Wiggin. *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm*. 1903. London: A & C Black, 1929: 20.

²² "Pansy" was the pseudonym of Isabella Alden [1841-1930], a writer of improving fiction for youngsters.

Another novel of 1905, *A Little Princess*, was expanded by Frances Hodgson Burnett [1849-1924] from her serial, "Sara Crewe, or what happened at Miss Minchin's", first published in *St Nicholas* in 1887. This book straddles American and British literary traditions.²³ Brought up in the British Raj by her widowed father, Sara Crewe is nonetheless a recognisably *American* heroine; confident and self-sufficient, cheerful, independent, and in her friendship with Becky the scullery-maid, tentatively democratic. (The novel's ending does not, however, elevate Becky above the position of Sara's equerry.) Four years after she is brought to school in England by Captain Crewe, Sara is abruptly transformed from Miss Minchin's "show pupil" to a "little beggar",²⁴ after the Captain dies in penury, leaving only an incoherent message regarding his daughter's future. Sara is a "child full of imaginings and whimsical thoughts" (20), which buoy her spirits when she is relegated to the attic and earning her keep. Now an orphan, Sara is imprisoned in the customarily hostile world of the British boarding school: the "select seminary" (10) is, for Sara, Lowood Institution with Miss Minchin as its Brocklehurst.

Like *Rebecca*, *A Little Princess* was conceivably a contemporary children's book that L.M. Montgomery might have read to tap into public taste.²⁵ (The final chapter of *A Little Princess* is entitled "Anne", the name of a hungry little orphan waif adopted by the bun-woman from the baker's shop.²⁶) Anne Shirley like Sara Crewe, surnames a character of her daydreams, Montmorency,²⁷ and pins her affections on a fat, unimaginative schoolgirl with a "story-book" name (28). (Sara's bosom chum quivers under the appellation of "Ermengarde St John", a name Anne could expect for an actual kindred spirit only in her wildest dreams, having had the misfortune to end up in Scotch Avonlea, where "Diana" was outlandish enough in all conscience [AGG 30].²⁸)

Whether Burnett's work specifically influenced *Anne* or not, Sara's "type" of American "orphan"—like Lowood's inmates, charity cases need not have lost both

²³ Frances Hodgson Burnett was born in Manchester, England in 1849, and moved to Tennessee in 1865. Although Burnett lived and married in America, her books, such as *Little Lord Fauntleroy* [1886] and *The Secret Garden* [1911], were mostly set in Britain (see *Behold the Child* 156).

²⁴ Frances Hodgson Burnett. *A Little Princess*. 1905. Harmondsworth: Puffin, 1985: 76-77.

²⁵ LMM reread Burnett's *Little Lord Fauntleroy* in 1902, having first encountered the story as a child, when it was serialised in the *Montreal Witness* (Jan. 21, 1902: U.2). GBM sent LMM a copy of *The Secret Garden* for Christmas 1927: she remarked that she had not read it for years. Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 6, 1928 [NAC].

²⁶ In name, Sara Crew may be an antecedent of Sara Stanley.

²⁷ cf. *A Little Princess* Ch. 10; AGG Ch. 26.

²⁸ Diana was named by a schoolteacher who boarded with the Barrys. Anne wishes that there had been "a schoolmaster like that around when I was born" [31], unmindful of the fact that both her parents were schoolteachers. Anne fantasises about being called "Cordelia": a schoolteacher called Cordelia Munn taught in LMM's locality (*Kindred Spirits*, Autumn 1993).

parents, and Rebecca Randall, whose mother is alive although with no great vigour, is an orphan in this sense—from Ellen Montgomery in *The Wide, Wide World* [1850] to Dorothy in *The Wonderful Wizard of Oz* [1900], including boys such as Gene Stratton-Porter's *Freckles* [1904],²⁹ and Mark Twain's Tom Sawyer and Huckleberry Finn, are clear antecedents for Anne's plucky resourcefulness, "unbounded energy and optimism".³⁰

The Chariot Wheels

The success of American writers like Louisa May Alcott, Martha Finley, and Susan Coolidge,³¹ must have prepared Montgomery for the scenario where further adventures would be demanded if "Anne" took off.³² *Anne of Green Gables* was ostensibly planned as a solitary novel, but was open-ended enough to be instantly and effortlessly drafted into the girls' series genre. Page & Co., who had, for example, published the "Little Colonel" series by Annie Fellows Johnston,³³ were foresighted enough to request from Montgomery "a second story dealing with the same character", before the first was printed.³⁴ Page was aware that "hooked" readers immediately wanted "more"; in this case "what further happened to Anne and Gilbert".³⁵ Female readers, in particular, like to project their own happy futures in the grown-up life of a fictional character, first met when that character is about their age.³⁶

This trend guaranteed Montgomery a captive audience—and a financial return for herself and Page, who cemented their initial enthusiasm by contracting her talents

²⁹ For links between Anne, and another Stratton-Porter heroine, Elnora Comstock, see Clara Thomas. "Anne Shirley's American Cousin: *The Girl of the Limberlost*." *HT* 58-63.

³⁰ Gillian Avery identifies these as two of the dominant qualities of American children's books of the nineteenth century (1).

³¹ Louisa May Alcott [1832-1888] wrote four novels about the March family of Plumfield: *Little Women* [1867], *Good Wives* [1869], *Little Men* [1871], and *Jo's Boys* [1886]. Under the pseudonym of "Martha Finley", Martha Farquharson wrote twenty-eight "Elsie Dinsmore" books, the first of which was published in 1867. Susan Coolidge (the pseudonym of Sarah Chauncey Woolsey, 1845-1905) was the author of the "Katy Carr" series, *What Katy Did* [1872], *What Katy Did at School* [1873], and *What Katy Did Next* [1886].

³² In 1904, L. Frank Baum had reluctantly turned to Oz again with *The Marvellous Land of Oz*.

³³ see *SJ* II [July 30, 1916] 188. *The Little Colonel* was published in 1896, the year that the Page Co. was established.

³⁴ Letter to LMM from L.C. Page, dated Apr. 8, 1907, op. cit.

³⁵ Letter to GBM, Oct. 16, 1914, *My Dear Mr. M* 73

³⁶ For reader responses to *Anne*, see Catherine Sheldrick Ross. "Readers Reading L.M. Montgomery." *HT*, 23-35. One reader commented, "I suppose that's how you see yourself, as being the poor little girl ... and then things worked out; she lived happily ever after" (28).

for five years (*SJI* [Aug. 16, 1907] 331)³⁷—but also bound her to one character *and* to a potentially smothering conventional format. The courses of girls' series ran exceedingly smooth indeed, and minor dramas aside, readers would expect Anne Shirley to continue her education, marry Gilbert Blythe, and raise a brood of little Annes. Montgomery's novels brought her letters from all over the world, and these offer a résumé of what readers and sycophantic devotees expected, as well as what some eccentrics thought of her.³⁸ Montgomery had little faith in the judgements of her "public": just the "idea" that *Anne of Avonlea* might "take" with them made her "sick".³⁹

Shortly after completing *Avonlea* [1909], Montgomery was "afraid" that she would have to remove "detestable" Anne from girlhood and "write her through college".⁴⁰ If Montgomery thereafter felt less than "kindredly" toward her fans it was hardly surprising. Louisa May Alcott could not conceal *her* fatigue with the "Little Women" series, when in conclusion to the last, *Jo's Boys*, she wrote: "It is a strong temptation to the weary historian to close the present tale with an earthquake which should engulf Plumfield and its environs so deeply in the bowels of the earth that no youthful Schliemann could ever find a vestige of it".⁴¹

Montgomery could not realistically or reasonably kill off her most famous creation, as Arthur Conan Doyle [1859-1930] had done in "The Adventure of the Final Problem" [1894], although she does engulf *Avonlea* in a hail-storm (*AA* Ch. 24), and bring Gilbert Blythe within a whisker of death (*Als* Ch. 40). Conan Doyle, at any event, was forced by reader pressure to resurrect Sherlock Holmes, firstly in the retrospective *Hound of the Baskervilles* [1902], and eventually, in 1903, from beyond the grave itself.⁴² But Montgomery, like Conan Doyle, felt pigeon-holed—in

³⁷ This contract contained a "binding" clause whereby the Page Co. had first refusal of all LMM's books, and held her to the niggardly financial terms of their initial agreement (10% royalties to the author on the wholesale price, rather than the normal cut of 15% of the retail price). This contract was renewed for a further five year period when LMM visited Boston in November 1910, much against LMM's instincts, but she felt obliged to the Pages for their hospitality.

³⁸ e.g. "Yesterday was filled with many things. One was an amusing letter from a very adoring girl who signs herself 'your devoted slave'" (*SJ* III [Oct. 5, 1926] 309). "Had a weird letter from some woman in the U.S. who thinks I must be 'obsessed with birthmarks' and gives me a fearful calling down for endowing 'Mr. Morrison' in *Emily Climbs* with a blood-red hand. She adjures me to stop and think what untold harm I may do to future generations by putting such things in my stories!" (*SJ* III [Apr. 7, 1926] 292).

³⁹ Letter to EW, Sept. 10, 1908, *The Green Gables Letters* 74.

⁴⁰ *ibid.*

⁴¹ Louisa May Alcott. *Jo's Boys*, Ch. XXII "Positively Last Appearance."

⁴² Anne Shirley and Sherlock Holmes share the distinction of being characters frequently mistaken for real people, living at a famous address, and ultimately being more famous than their authors. Holmes has more use for London "street Arabs" than Marilla Cuthbert however (cf. "no London street-Arabs for me" [*AGG* 15]; "as he spoke there rushed into the room half a dozen of the dirtiest and most ragged street Arabs that I ever clapped eyes on" [*A Study in Scarlet* Ch. 6]).

her case as a “‘writer for young people’ and that only” (*SJ* II [Aug. 24, 1920] 390)—and longed to do “something so much more worthwhile” than “another Anne book” (*SJ* II [Sept. 27, 1913] 133). In her future work she sought to rise above the problem of the popular hero, and the American girls’ series.

* * *

Those who view *Anne* as an exceptional example of Montgomery’s work, conclude that Montgomery “hit upon” (not necessarily “developed”) a successful formula with her first novel, which was then, less-than-artistically, dredged up for her subsequent writing. This opinion is complicated further when certain aspects of Montgomery’s life—her parentless state, her lonely childhood, her austere grandparents, her imaginative escapism, her misalliance—are assimilated to the lives of each of her heroines in turn, making her books a continuous and scarcely varied attempt to solve in fiction that which was insoluble in life.⁴³

Indeed, Elizabeth Epperly asserts that *Anne of Green Gables* “established the pattern for all her novels and their heroines” (*Fragrance* 17). Epperly is correct to identify a general *theme* common to Montgomery’s works, namely that each of her heroines learns “to value herself in relation to the surrounding community and culture [...] to love and create a home for herself” (7). Yet, a broad thematic analysis can overlook crucial differences between L.M. Montgomery’s novels, and neglect changes in her style and literary identity. Montgomery was unable (and occasionally unwilling) to escape the “jinn” in some respects—and was working on a ninth “Anne” book in the months before her death⁴⁴—but also claimed to be desperate to break with an unfulfilling character and genre. Montgomery had much to thank Anne for, not least fame and wealth, but feared she would be dragged at Anne’s chariot wheels into literary mediocrity.

Maud Montgomery did not judge herself a literary heavyweight, but she was discerning enough to know that her novels were more meritorious than “mush”⁴⁵ like

⁴³ LMM’s journals invite biographic interpretations of her novels. T.D. MacLulich argues that LMM had “only one story she *needed* to tell: the story of an imaginative and emotional girl who loses her beloved parents, enters the world of stern and old-fashioned new guardians, eventually earns the affection of her surrogate parents, yet does so without effacing her own personality” (91). “L.M. Montgomery’s Portraits of the Artist: Realism, Idealism, and the Domestic Imagination.” *Such a Simple Little Tale* 83-100.

⁴⁴ “The Blythes are Quoted” MS comprises of fifteen short stories set around Glen St Mary and linked by scenes set at Ingleside. The action of the first half takes place before the First World War, the second in the years after. “The Blythes are Quoted” also includes a number of LMM’s poems, many previously published, attributed for the purpose of the story, to Anne Shirley and her son, Walter Blythe (XZ1 MS A098001/ XZ1 MS A098002 UG).

⁴⁵ Aug. 19, 1928: U.7.

the “Elsie” and “Pansy” books of her predecessors. For the sake of her literary reputation, it was essential that she avoid the doldrums hit by girls’ series authors like Finley and Alden, or even their less sanctimonious, more highly-esteemed, colleagues. Part of her quarrel with “the series” was that it permitted artistry and honesty in describing child-life, but balked when it came to the teens: “when you come to write of the ‘miss’ you have to depict a sweet, insipid young thing—really a child grown older—to whom the basic realities of life and reactions to them are quite unknown” (*SJ* III [Jan. 20, 1924] 157). As authors’ inspiration dried up, the sequels in girls’ series were regularly pale imitations of the first.

But as Montgomery concluded in 1924, she could not “afford to damn the public” out of hand (*ibid.*). She had to continue to satisfy her readership. Nevertheless, L.M. Montgomery had learned from *Anne* to avoid creating heroines who attain “perfection” (and thus tediousness) so young. Only Sara Stanley, Pat Gardiner, and Emily Byrd Starr, have sequels written about them, and Emily alone merits more than one sequel. (In fact, these stories seem single books issued in volumes rather than series.) Sara’s, Jane’s, and Marigold’s stories leave them at the chrism of womanhood: Kilmeny, Pat, and Emily are taken to engagement, but no further. More tales of happy perfect unions producing happy perfect families were, presumably, damnable.

However, *Anne*’s success was of pivotal importance to Montgomery’s subsequent novels in one vital respect. L.M. Montgomery was delighted that the “busy world” had stopped long enough to listen to “such a simple little tale, *written in and of a simple P.E.I. farming settlement*” (*SJ* I [Oct. 15, 1908] 339, my italics). Although she was “disappointed” that the contradictory claims of reviewers prevented her future writing benefiting from their wise opinions,⁴⁶ Montgomery *did* realise that her descriptions of “simple P.E.I.” were universally thought integral to *Anne*’s charms. Critics and readers alike were smitten by the Island.⁴⁷ As *The Spectator*, London, gushed in 1909:

no better advertisement of the charm of [P.E.I.’s] landscape could be devised than the admirable descriptions of its sylvan glories which lend decorative relief to the narrative. Miss Montgomery has not merely succeeded in winning our sympathies for her *dramatis personae*; she makes us fall in love with their surroundings, and long to visit the Lake of

⁴⁶ “I had hoped to *learn* something from the reviews. I knew the book must have faults which its author could not perceive and I expected the reviews would point them out. But there is no agreement. What one critic praises as the most attractive feature in the book another condemns as its greatest fault—and therefore I am no wiser than before.” Letter to GBM, dated Aug. 31, 1908, *My Dear Mr M.* 39.

⁴⁷ Stanley Baldwin, for example, wrote to LMM in 1927, begging a meeting with the author and “hoping that I shall be allowed to go to Prince Edward Island for I must see Green Gables before I return home. Not that I wouldn’t be at home at Green Gables!!” (*SJ* III [July 14, 1927] 342).

Shining Waters, the White Way of Delight, Idlewild, and other favourite resorts of 'the Anne-girl'.⁴⁸

In 1905, it must have been unclear how any book of Canadian childhood would be received in the States, let alone a book set in a sleepy Canadian province no-one had much heard of. *Anne's* success demonstrated that PEI's farming settlements could present "scope for imagination" and scope for book sales, for a global readership not only "'wanted more' about Anne",⁴⁹ they wanted more about PEI. (This trend shows no sign of abating. *Anne of Green Gables* has launched a multi-million dollar tourist industry on the Island and thousands visit each year in search of Anne's haunts.⁵⁰ They can even be married at "Silver Bush", in a ceremony that replicates Montgomery's own, strangely not viewing the Macdonalds' marital problems as the herald of a just impediment.⁵¹)

As the failure of some critics to place Prince Edward Island on the map had so evidently illustrated, readers were also ripe for instruction. A Boston reviewer of 1908 noted that "Prince Edward Island has not figured in fiction", and was churlish enough to comment that, although Montgomery was to be "congratulated on her maiden effort", she "might have made more of her background".⁵² Writing for *The New Yorker* in 1996, in an article that takes a side-ways look at some of the responses to the rising demand for Anne-related "literary sites", Calvin Trillin makes the canny observation that L.M. Montgomery's "books are so imbued with the look and feel of Prince Edward Island that the province itself practically qualifies as one of her characters".⁵³

⁴⁸ *The Spectator*, March 13, 1909 (*Annotated Anne* 489).

⁴⁹ Dedication for *Anne of the Island*, the third "Anne" book: "To all the girls all over the world who have 'wanted more' about Anne".

⁵⁰ See Kathleen Hamilton and Sibyl Frei. *Finding Anne on Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown, PEI: Ragweed, 1991; Shelagh J. Squire. *Tourist Development and a Literary Landscape: L.M. Montgomery's Prince Edward Island*. Ottawa, np., 1988.

⁵¹ As with Haworth in Yorkshire, visitors from Japan are a significant part of PEI's literary tourist trade: a newspaper article published in 1994 calculated that around 15,000 Japanese people travelled to PEI that year, including around 30 nuptial couples (Greg McCune. "Japanese couples wedded to Canada's island classic." *The Guardian*. July 18, 1995). *Anne of Green Gables* was first translated into Japanese by Hanako Muraoka in 1952 (as *Akage no An*, "Red-haired Anne") and remains phenomenally popular in that country for many reasons (see Yuko Katsura, "Red-haired Anne in Japan." *CCL* 34.5 [1984]: 57-60; Douglas Baldwin. "L.M. Montgomery's *Anne of Green Gables*: The Japanese Connection." *Journal of Canadian Studies* 28.2 [1993]: 123-133; Yoshiko Akamatsu. "Japanese Readings of *Anne of Green Gables*." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* 201-212).

⁵² Anne Benszen Bradfird. "New Books." *Boston Budget and Beacon*. August 8, 1908. Cited in *Annotated Anne* 486. LMM subscribed to a clippings agency and so most likely read all her North American notices.

⁵³ Calvin Trillin. "Anne of the Red Hair: What do the Japanese see in *Anne of Green Gables*?" *The New Yorker*. August 5, 1996: 56-61. Trillin notes that 70 Montgomery wedding packages were sold in 1996.

Initially having little experience of life elsewhere, Montgomery was almost bound to write about PEI. Still, reader response to *Anne* seems to have presented her with an invitation to expand this picture. Successfully launched on her career as a novelist, and as PEI's *only* internationally recognised novelist, her work shows an escalating mandate to describe, through stories, the *history* and *culture* of the land that made Green Gables. The regional setting was attractive to the general reader. Montgomery's novels were easily classed with the wave of local color writing popular in North America from the 1880s, and Avonlea was added to a string of fictional locations that had struck a chord with adult readers.

Anne of Green Gables is, in several ways, Montgomery's finest hour. However, with reference to regionalism, Montgomery appears to be *finding* her voice as a Canadian writer, and the Island's spokesperson in *Anne*, rather than setting these things in stone: the picture of PEI, while far from shallow, is more simplistic than in Montgomery's later books. Regardless of the fact that several recurring themes have their inception in *Anne*, Montgomery's first novel does not establish the pattern from which she would shape the three "republics" of her novels; that is, her heroines, households, and neighbourhoods. Anne is an orphan from Nova Scotia, Matthew and Marilla have no family, Avonlea is uniformly Presbyterian: each circumstance is singular in Montgomery's fiction.

Montgomery thought that her first novel was successful because it was written in her "own style"⁵⁴—unlike many of her earlier "pot-boilers"—but in terms of her literary ambitions, *Anne of Green Gables* was her first acceptance, *not* the cornerstone of her career. In other words, she did not envisage that she could become the author she wanted to be on the strength of *Anne*'s sequels. With each subsequent project she unleashed a new and lurking aim: to write more "mature" literary work, to write for adults, to write "a psychological study of one human being's life" (*SJ* II [Aug. 24, 1920] 390). She hoped the "Anne" series would set her on this path by generating enough money to allow her to damn the public and please herself: if in the process she managed to steer the "Anne" books away from dullness, then all well and good.

As it would happen, the outbreak of war in 1914, gave new purpose and vigour to the "Anne" series. Montgomery discovered that her popular heroine and her brood were the perfect vehicle for conveying the spirit of Canada's war effort to a mass audience. Montgomery considered *Anne's House of Dreams* [1917]—"more for 'grown-ups' than the others"⁵⁵—"the best [book] I have ever written not even

⁵⁴ Letter to GBM, dated May 21, 1909, *My Dear Mr. M* 44.

⁵⁵ Letter from LMM to Muriel Smith, dated July 20, 1917. P.A.P.E.I. 2541/ 133a.

excepting *Green Gables* or my own favourite 'The Story Girl'" (*SJ* II [July 21, 1917] 222). She began gathering ideas for her next book twelve days before hearing that a Leaskdale boy had been killed in the trenches. *Rainbow Valley* [1919], dedicated to the memory of Godwin Lapp, and two other local boys who also died in the conflict, praises the heroism and spirit of Canada's youth, and encourages the soldiers of the future. *Rilla of Ingleside* [1921], dedicated to Maud's late cousin Frede, is the only contemporaneous fictional account by a Canadian woman of life on the home front.⁵⁶ The "Anne" phenomena thereby managed to evade the mediocrity that Montgomery dreaded.⁵⁷

The Storied Lands

The first true diversions from the "Anne" books are evidence of a deliberate attempt on L.M. Montgomery's part to escape Anne's legacy.⁵⁸ Maud Montgomery treasured memories of childhood days spent with two orphan boys, Well and Dave Nelson, who boarded at the Macneill homestead for three years.⁵⁹ Freed from her emotional and social starvation for a time, the spirit of these golden days inspired *The Story Girl* [1911] and *The Golden Road* [1913].⁶⁰ These books are again set in rural Prince Edward Island, and extol a female child whose imaginative prowess divides her from her peers. In format and flavour, however, these two novels are quite unlike the first two "Anne" books. Firstly, the group of children is equally divided along gender lines in what appears to be a step away from the *girls'* book. These books are a bid to appeal to all children: additionally they, like Edith Nesbit's "Bastable" books, are narrated by a male.⁶¹

The King cousins in the "Story Girl" books are raised in a similar Scots-Presbyterian environment to Anne, and their youthful exuberance is prey to similar

⁵⁶ see Owen Dudley Edwards. "L.M. Montgomery's *Rilla of Ingleside*: Intention, Inclusion, Implosion." *HT* 126-136. LMM later commented that *Rilla* was "the best book I ever wrote" (July 13, 1936: U.9).

⁵⁷ For the dwindling of Anne as a character, see Gillian Thomas. "The Decline of Anne: Matron vs. Child". *CCL* 1.3 [Autumn 1975]: 37-41.

⁵⁸ A volume of short-stories, *Chronicles of Avonlea*, was published in 1912. *Kilmeny* and the "Story Girl" books were the only non-Avonlea books that LMM wrote before closing the Avonlea series in 1920. *Kilmeny* was adapted from a short story, "Una of the Garden", written before *Anne* was published.

⁵⁹ Wellington and Dave Nelson lived with the Macneills when LMM was aged seven to ten (*SJ* I [Aug. 1, 1892] 82), and are understood to be the prototypes of Felix and Beverley King.

⁶⁰ cf. *SJ* I [Jan. 7, 1910] 377: "Materially, I was well cared for. Mentally I had the power of foraging for myself to a certain extent. It was emotionally and socially that my nature was starved and restricted".

⁶¹ L.M. Montgomery and E. Nesbit published under names that could be mistakenly attributed to male authors.

strictures, but they learn their lessons more from games-gone-wrong and less through persistent questioning of their elders. The King aunts and uncles are all busy farmers keen to limit their exposure to the small fry, leaving the youngsters free to keep house, poison themselves, and explore the Land of Nod. Some of the King cousins and their friends have lost a parent, or have been deserted, but this "orphanhood" seldom causes distress. Unfeeling and unsympathetic adult intervention brings about a series of minor hurts, and even full-scale terrors, as when the children believe themselves to be on the very brink of Judgement Day.

Although there was enough potential in *The Story Girl* characters to merit a sequel, by concentrating on six cousins—a story-teller (Sara), a writer (Bev), and a home-maker (Felicity), a fat kid (Felix), a bolshy kid (Dan), and an angelic kid (Cecily)—Montgomery appears to guard against the possibility that readers would identify with *one* child they could demand "more" of. At any rate, *The Golden Road* seals the children's fates (even Cecily's early death) with the Story Girl's flurry of predictions. The summer is ended, the cousins are separated, childhood and "The Story Girl" novels are left behind.

Aside from occasional (and sentimental) intrusions by adult Beverley the books express a child's point of view and exhibit a child's understanding. The witty, sarcastic, mocking, and knowing narratorial voice that Montgomery assumed for Avonlea is replaced by the voice of recall. Montgomery capitalised on her perfect memory of the fears and joys of her young life once again in these books, but *not* at length on the solitude, nor on her feelings of abandonment. Adult characters only rarely and fleetingly drift onto "the golden road of youth": when they do it is as the ogres, harlequins, and romantics of a child's imagination.

There is plenty of "reality" in these books, but more "make-believe" than was thought to appeal to American tastes. They share with Booth Tarkington's *Penrod* [1914] something Gillian Avery describes as a "rarity" in US children's fiction, "a background in which it is possible to be dreamy and detached" (212). Indeed, it seems not improbable that in wishing to do something different—and to disassociate herself from Anne-type characters and Anne-type stories—Montgomery turned from America to the "sheltered, leisurely childhood" and fairylands of British family tales for her models.

* * *

For Christmas in 1909, George Boyd MacMillan had sent Montgomery Kenneth Grahame's *The Golden Age* [1895].⁶² Montgomery enjoyed this book, and its sequel *Dream Days* [1898]. (She told MacMillan, "I don't think these books are known on this side of the pond at all".⁶³) On 1 September, 1910, as she celebrated finishing her fourth novel, Montgomery remarked to MacMillan that *The Story Girl* would likely not be as popular as "Anne"—although from a "literary point of view" it was *better*⁶⁴—and that she thought it had something in common with both *The Golden Age* and *Dream Days*.⁶⁵

Kenneth Grahame [1859-1932] was born in Edinburgh, and lived his first five years near Loch Fyne. On their mother's death, the four Grahame siblings were sent to live with their grandmother in Berkshire and Grahame's books, whether in the names of protagonists, or in toadish antics, are often English in flavour, despite sundry Scottish phrasing. His first novels, *The Golden Age* and *Dream Days*, were written at the instigation of W.E. Henley, who had been intrigued by the opening sentence of Grahame's essay, "The Olympians": "Looking back to those days of old, ere the gate shut to behind me, I can see now that to children with the proper equipment of parents these things would have worn a different aspect". Henley saw scope for imagination in this, and the two books Grahame produced as a result—"The Olympians" forms a prologue to the first—mark the start of something new in the brand of fiction that appealed to child *and* adult readers.⁶⁶

In Grahame's books, five orphan children, fostered on their aunts and uncles in a large country house, live in their own world of imagination and escapades, involving fairy-tales, farmers, pets, and (the perennial objective in British kids' literature) pocket-money. The books' originality lies in their evocation of childhood, and a child's view of grown-ups. Adults—the Olympians—are pitied by the narrator and his siblings because they no longer see or understand the child's world: "grown-up people are fairly correct on matters of fact; it is in the higher gift of imagination that

⁶² Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 20, 1910 [NAC]. GBM sent LMM Grahame's *The Wind in the Willows* [1908] for Christmas in 1913 (Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 19, 1914 [NAC]). Later in life LMM referred to it as "the most charming fairy tale in the world", which she had read "a score of times and could read [...] as many more" (May 7, 1937: U.10).

⁶³ Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910 [NAC].

⁶⁴ *My Dear Mr. M* 51.

⁶⁵ Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910 [NAC].

⁶⁶ *The Penguin Kenneth Grahame: The Golden Age, Dream Days, The Wind in the Willows*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1983. Introduction by Naomi Lewis, p. viii.

they are so sadly to seek".⁶⁷ Grahame is credited with being the first author to use a child's standpoint "as the main theme of a book intended for adult reading".⁶⁸ These books were hugely influential on Edwardian children's writers bent on escaping the pious didacticism of their predecessors, and the ministering children they created.

Among these British writers were Rudyard Kipling, J.M. Barrie (with his play, *Peter Pan, or The Boy Who Would Not Grow Up* [1904]), and E. Nesbit. Kipling's *Puck of Pook's Hill* [1906], and its sequel *Rewards and Fairies* [1910],⁶⁹ tell history through a parade of "people of the old days", where Dan and Una are guided by "Puck, *alias* Robin Goodfellow, *alias* Nick o' London, *alias* Lob-lie-by-the-Fire, the last survivor in England of those whom mortals call Fairies".⁷⁰ Montgomery much admired these books—in the 1930s, she thought that they would still be read in a hundred years time⁷¹—and Sara Stanley is a Puckish character of sorts, guiding her cousins through their family myths by conjuring up the presence of ancestors dead and gone.

Edith Nesbit [1858-1924], also wrote about independent children from a child's point-of-view. The chronicles of the "fallen fortunes" and better fortunes of the six Bastable children and their father, are told by Oswald of that house in *The Story of the Treasure Seekers* [1899], *The Wouldbegoods* [1901], and *The New Treasure Seekers* [1904]. Nesbit, like Montgomery (and Grahame) lost a parent in her early years (her father died when she was four) and remembered her childhood as a time where happiness was split with acute suffering.⁷² Nesbit's attitude toward children, summed up by W.W. Robson, could hold, just as legitimately, for L.M. Montgomery:

she undermines the normal contrast between adult and child: they are both alike because they are both human. Children may have more limitations, they are physically weaker, exposed to some kinds of exploitation, material and moral, that adults may be able to avoid. But they can have all the adult qualities, both admirable and unadmirable: they can be clever, witty, temperamental, greedy, naïve, ingenious, as adults can".⁷³

⁶⁷ *Dream Days*, *The Penguin Kenneth Grahame* 23.

⁶⁸ *The Penguin Kenneth Grahame* introduction, ix.

⁶⁹ "Rewards by the way is pronounced 'ru-ar-ds.' They are a variety of fairies," noted LMM, admitting that "[n]ot knowing this when the book came out I couldn't see the significance of the title at all" (Letter to EW, dated June 18, 1937 [NAC]). The title of Kipling's book comes from Richard Corbet's poem, "Farewell, Rewards and Fairies".

⁷⁰ Rudyard Kipling. *Rewards and Fairies*. 1910. London: Pan, 1986: 10.

⁷¹ Jan. 18, 1936: U.9.

⁷² see Julia Briggs. *A Woman of Passion: The Life of E. Nesbit, 1858-1924*. London: Hutchison, 1987, Ch. 1, "The Pangs of Childhood".

⁷³ W.W. Robson. "E. Nesbit and *The Book of Dragons*." *Children and Their Books: A Celebration of the Work of Iona and Peter Opie*. Ed. Gillian Avery and Julia Briggs. 1988. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990: 251-270.

Montgomery never referred to Nesbit's books, but it is not unlikely that she read them, for she loved British children's books, by diverse authors from Beatrix Potter to Talbot Baines Reed. There are some parallels between Montgomery's and Nesbit's work: for example, both the Bastables and Marigold Lesley play with a cousin of Queen Victoria, whom they do not believe to be an actual princess.⁷⁴ The Society of the Wouldbegoods may have influenced the Meredith's Good Conduct Club (*Rainbow Valley*), although the English Bastables notably do not incorporate punishment into their society with the gusto of the Rev John Knox Meredith's offspring.

In one of their treasure-seeking exploits, the Bastables decide to take up journalism and produce their own newspaper.⁷⁵ Their *Lewisham Recorder* was probably inspired by the March sisters' *The Pickwick Portfolio* (*Little Women*) and both seem antecedents for the King cousins' periodical, *Our Magazine*. Viewed side-by-side the *Lewisham Recorder* and *Our Magazine* show that, at the very least, children on both sides of the Atlantic were reading similar papers (and similar books) and responding in a similar manner. News was not at a premium. Advice ("C-c-l-y:—No it is not polite to use 'Holy Moses' or 'dodgasted' in conversation" [*TGR* 37]), "instruction" ("It only takes four hours and a quarter now to get from London to Manchester; but I should not think anyone would if they could help it"⁷⁶), and atrocious "serials" were. The two papers are so alike, and the basis of the jokes (on the authors' part) so attuned, that Montgomery may have been expanding upon Nesbit's original for the structure of *The Golden Road*.

* * *

The family name King may be a nod to the British heritage of the cousins, both in terms of literal ancestors and fictional antecedents. Beverley, in one of his more syrupy philosophical moments, observes:

There is such a place as fairyland—but only children can find the way to it. And they do not know that it is fairyland until they have grown so old that they forget the way. One bitter day when they seek it and cannot find it, they realize what they have lost; and that is the tragedy of life. On that day the gates of Eden are shut behind them and the age of gold is over. Henceforth they must dwell in the common light of common day. Only a few who remain children at heart can ever find that fair, lost path again; and blessed are they above mortals. They, and only they, can bring us tidings from that dear country where once we sojourned and from which we must evermore be exiles. The world

⁷⁴ cf. *The Story of the Treasure Seekers*, Ch. 6, and *Magic for Marigold*, Ch. 10.

⁷⁵ E. Nesbit. *The Story of the Treasure Seekers*. 1899. London: Armada, 1982, Ch. 8: "Being Editors".

⁷⁶ *ibid.*, 80.

calls them its singers and poets and story-tellers; but they are just people who have never forgotten the way to fairyland. (TSG 111)

Syrup, undeniably, but Montgomery clearly hailed from the same fairyland-stable as J.M. Barrie ("Do you believe in fairies? Say quick that you believe! If you believe clap your hands"), or Kenneth Grahame, or George Macdonald [1824-1905]. Montgomery read Macdonald's *At the Back of the North Wind* [1871] a dozen times or more, and his personification of the north wind is an obvious forerunner of Emily Byrd Starr's "Wind Woman".⁷⁷ All these writers were, of course, Scotsmen.

Montgomery remarked of her own childhood, "I had, in my imagination, a passport to fairyland. In a twinkling I could whisk myself into regions of wonderful adventures, unhampered by any restrictions of reality".⁷⁸ In this respect, Montgomery was clearly at one with her British counterparts, and not with American writers like Morris Bishop [1893-1973], who in verse, as Avery cites, "squashed/ The God damn little fool" of an "elf man" who talks fairy "drool" to him in the woods.⁷⁹ Montgomery's protagonist children carry a (British) passport to fairyland which distinguishes them from some of their peers, and most of their elders.

Anne of Green Gables contains some elements of this, for Anne is ever-poised on the border of escape from prosaic Avonlea, but her brush with the Haunted Wood scares her into contentment with commonplace places (AGG 191). *The Story Girl* and *The Golden Road* take childhood out of the "here" into the "everywhere". The King cousins trail clouds of glory and Beverley's intimations confirm Wordsworth's belief that childhood was a time of rare and uncommon insight. Sara Stanley is an exceptional child, yet her average little friends can also make magic for themselves from unpromisingly mundane circumstance.

The children of *The Golden Age* build their fantasies upon an *English* past of Lancelot and Sir Tristram, Roundheads and Cavaliers, Nelson and Grenville. L.M. Montgomery's Canadian children share the English child's love of classical mythology, but their daydreams substitute Prince Edward Island's folklore and family-lore for knights and soldiers and naval commanders. PEI could hardly offer a dramatic (and militaristic) history in any case. ("I'll never like [Canadian history]—it's so dull. Not just at first when we belonged to France and there was plenty of fighting, but after that it's nothing but politics" [ENM 243].) But the King cousins are no poorer creatively for their games being *home-grown*: they command a history

⁷⁷ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 31, 1930 [NAC]. Both Anne and Emily refer to reading *At the Back of the North Wind*.

⁷⁸ LMM. "How I Became a Writer." Review Scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁷⁹ *Behold the Child* 211. The poem, "How To Treat Elves", is included in Donald Hall. *The Oxford Book of Children's Verse in America*. New York: Oxford UP, 1985: 232-233.

that stretches back to Scotland, and the emigration of their ancestors. For all that their immediate King relatives are not interested in their little world—least of all sardonic Uncle Roger—the King cousins are fascinated by *family*. That is, they are aware that the collective past of the Kings (and their neighbours) can keep pace with their imaginative expectations. Their immediate Islander relatives may be prosaic, but history offers promise.

In *The Story Girl*, Beverley speculates that the “glamour of old family traditions and tales” gave “magic to all sights and sounds around us” (TSG 12). The Old World origins of the Kings are critical to the children’s gift of creation. They inhabit a world that is out of the ordinary, and out of time, because they understand and appreciate the force of their history. In childhood, Montgomery’s own parents were dead or gone, leaving her alone in one sense, but she was also a fully-fledged clan member with centuries of traditions behind her. Anne apart, Montgomery’s orphaned or semi-orphaned children always belong to a lineage. They are encouraged to “belong” in the clan, partly by responding imaginatively to its mythology. L.M. Montgomery found a place for her family stories in the “Story Girl” novels that was wanting in the first two “Anne” books.

In doing so, she seemed to find her niche as a novelist. By fusing legends and folklore and history with a child’s play and fancies, she made her own fairyland, which could compete for charm with England’s dream days, Diamond’s travels at the back of the north wind, or Barrie’s Never Land.⁸⁰ On occasion Montgomery let slip that Canada, being “a new land” (PSB 132), might be thought to lack the relevant romantic credentials for fairyland.⁸¹ Her vision, however, is intrinsically Canadian for all that, and such as only Canadian experience could produce. In Montgomery’s Prince Edward Island, family, in all its generations, stands at the cornerstone of identity. Echoing through the generations were the customs of an Old World past, planted in the New World, and breeding new beliefs betimes.

From the late nineteenth century onward, tales of children who half live in fairyland, have enjoyed a literary credibility in Britain. Welsh poet, Vernon Watkins, writes of Grahame’s books, “One cannot for a moment accept *The Golden Age* and *Dream Days* as children’s books. Wherever they are found in the juvenile section of a library, they are mistakenly placed there”.⁸² Given her fears that the “Anne” sequels

⁸⁰ For some discussion of LMM’s fairylands, see Jane Cowan Fredeman. “‘The Land of Lost Content: The Use of Fantasy in L.M. Montgomery’s Novels.’” *CCL*. 1.3 [August 1975]: 60-70.

⁸¹ Never was Canada’s failure to hit the right “poetic” note more clearly espoused than in Johnny Plummer’s poem, “he’d writ on a squirrel drowned in a pail of maple syrup” (*Aln* 117), said squirrel doubtless finding out, like Walpole’s favourite cat, that not all that glisters is gold.

⁸² Vernon Watkins, foreword to *The Golden Age and Dream Days*. New York: Signet Classics, The New American Library, 1964: vii.

would never set the heather on fire, Montgomery may have turned to British models in order to improve her literary standing with *adults*. She thought *The Story Girl* a more mature work than *Anne* from “literary point of view”, thus worthy of a more “sophisticated” readership. (She must have craved the status given to male writers of fiction ostensibly for children, such as Mark Twain or Lewis Carroll.) *The Story Girl* and *The Golden Road* are not novels of plot but self-proclaimed contemplative studies of the nature of childhood.⁸³

For this reason, L.M. Montgomery perhaps felt these books better equipped to travel to the other “side of the pond” than *Anne*, although if this was the case, she was to be disappointed. (Sales of Montgomery’s books in the UK were not strong until the mid-1920s. Certainly, by 1919, the first four “Anne” titles were out of print in Great Britain, and *Anne of the Island* was considered a “publishing failure”.⁸⁴) However, in reviewing *The Golden Road*, *The Scotsman* commented that, although the “American origin of the book is unmistakable [...] young people of school age in Charlottetown or Carlisle are pretty much the same in temperament, disposition, inclination, and desire as the young people of Birmingham or Edinburgh”.⁸⁵

Montgomery’s novels describe an universal childhood. But *The Story Girl* and *The Golden Road* bring Montgomery’s work closer to an idea of a British Empire childhood than had been evident in the first two “Anne” books. (The King cousins adapt Nelson’s “England expects that every man will do his duty” for *Our Magazine*’s motto [TGR 4].) Just as the Bastables’ adventures are an education for the modern reader on what little middle-class English children ate and read and played at in 1899, Montgomery’s books illustrate the background, doings, and prospects of a group of Canadian youngsters whose allegiances are, in truth, little different to those young people of Birmingham or Edinburgh in the Old Country.

Montgomery may have over-egged the pudding in some ways—on *her* side of the pond all the children seem to know, probably unrepresentatively, their Carroll and Grahame and Macdonald—but her portrait of Canadian childhood appears increasingly to veer away from slaving to “Yankeefied” tastes. Montgomery’s growing documentation of family history and old-timers’ stories in her fiction emphasises a cultural transfer between Britain and Canada, thus strengthening the

⁸³ When planning *The Story Girl*, LMM commented to GBM, “It is to be about children and will have very little plot” (Letter to GBM, dated Aug. 29, 1909 [NAC]).

⁸⁴ “Publisher’s Postscript” to Hilda M. Ridley. *The Story of L.M. Montgomery* 141-143. W.G.H. [i.e. Harrap] noted that 9,000 copies of *Green Gables* were sold in the first three years of publication. (Originally LMM’s work in the UK was published by Isaac Pitman, then Hodder & Stoughton.) In 1924 the “Anne” books were reprinted by George G. Harrap in cheap editions, and sales mushroomed.

⁸⁵ *The Scotsman*, Feb. 26, 1914. Review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

ties of Empire, and the idea of the British Empire as a family affair (*RI* 45). As Jem Blythe declares, with Kipling-like spirit, before joining up to fight in August 1914, "We're the cubs—we've got to pitch in tooth and claw if it comes to a family row" (*RI* 28).

Four years before the watershed events of August 1914, L.M. Montgomery prophesied that only under "some great crisis of storm and stress" that "fused her varying elements into a harmonious whole" would Canada produce a literary "expression of our national life as a whole" (*SJ* II 339-40). Nonetheless, Montgomery had already effected several changes in her fiction in the aftermath of the phenomenon that was *Anne of Green Gables*. She expanded her picture of PEI to include the "then" as well as the "now". She demonstrated her ability to write family stories and, more importantly, the fact that she enjoyed doing so. Thus, when Montgomery decided to throw another orphan heroine at the world, the result was quite different to *Anne of Green Gables*. *The Times* of London certainly detected *Canadian* diversity in this new work: "No less interesting is the account of the lives and the peoples of the province, like us because essentially British in habits and feeling, yet unlike us because [in *Emily of New Moon*] we have English, Scots, Irish, and French all living an intermixed and closely associated life".⁸⁶

Murrays vs Cuthberts

By 1920, L.M. Montgomery had six "Anne" novels under her belt. Finishing *Rilla of Ingleside*, Montgomery swore "a dark and deadly vow" that she was through with the red-haired orphan "forever" (*SJ* II [Aug. 24, 1920] 390). She had fallen under the spell of another girl, with "black hair and purplish gray eyes" (*ibid.*), embryonic in her mind for almost a decade.⁸⁷ Four months later she began collecting material for her "'Emily' books" in the plural,⁸⁸ always planning that there should be more than one volume, although she embarked on books two and three with markedly less enthusiasm.⁸⁹ The three novels in "The New Moon Trilogy"—*Emily of New Moon*

⁸⁶ *The Times*, Sept. 13, 1923. Review Scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁸⁷ "She has been 'Emily' for the past ten years during which time I have been carrying her in my mind, waiting for the time when I could put her into a book. She has 'grown' just as 'Anne' did and so ought to be just as well-beloved" (*SJ* III [May 11, 1921] 6).

⁸⁸ *SJ* II [Dec. 13, 1920] 391.

⁸⁹ "Began work today collecting material for Emily II. I am sure I won't be able to make it anything as good as Emily I but the publishers want a series and it pays so I'll carry it on" (*SJ* III [May 22, 1921] 56). "Emily III" took two and a half years to write: "I've never had such a time writing a book [as *Emily's Quest*]. Thank heaven it is the last in the Emily series" (*SJ* III [Oct. 13, 1926] 310).

[1923], *Emily Climbs* [1925], and *Emily's Quest* [1927]—follow the heroine's pursuit of literary success.

When Ephraim Weber wrote to L.M. Montgomery, praising the new star of her tenth novel, he expressed his delight that, in "Emily", she had created another "Anne". Whereas poor, bumbling Weber doubtless intended to compliment his friend, he merely earned himself a biting retort from Montgomery that, if he was correct, "I have entirely failed in my attempt to 'get her across' to my readers". "In my mental conception of her," Montgomery snapped, "there was a big difference between reserved *Emily* with her background of family and tradition and the hail fellow-well-met little orphan from nowhere".⁹⁰

Her gibe at Weber deliberately slights the orphan with neither traditions or family. Anne shared Montgomery's imagination. The "Emily" trilogy also resonates with autobiographic elements from her own "inner life",⁹¹ but Montgomery was additionally fictionalising her career. Montgomery's first portrait of herself as an artist, *The Alpine Path*, placed clan legacies at the heart of her writing. Emily Byrd Starr inherits much of Montgomery's personal birthright, from both spear and spindle. Emily's family background is essential to her writing, and the traditions she accrues are integral to her growth as an author. In ensuring that Weber noted the "big difference" between Anne and Emily, Maud Montgomery was marking developments in her own fiction. She distinguished between her orphan heroines in terms of their *history*.

With *Anne's House of Dreams* L.M. Montgomery changed publisher, having grown increasingly frustrated with the dishonourable tactics and unjust terms of the Page Co.⁹² In March 1916 (*SJ* II 180), Montgomery met with the proprietors of the Toronto firm, McClelland, Goodchild, and Stewart, with a view to acquiring a publisher for her books in Canada (previously Page held world rights to her work). Montgomery had grown in business acumen since 1907: living in Ontario she was also closer to the Canadian centres of business and literary circles than to those of Boston.⁹³ McClelland, acting as her literary agent, held negotiations with Lewis Page: Page threatened lawsuits, the option to publish Montgomery's books was put on the open market, and Frederick Stokes of New York emerged triumphant in December 1916 (*SJ* II [Dec. 16, 1916] 198).

⁹⁰ Letter to EW, Nov. 1-Dec. 14, 1924 [NAC].

⁹¹ "New Moon is in some respects but not all my own old home and 'Emily's' inner life was my own, though outwardly most of the events and incidents were fictitious" (*SJ* III [Aug. 29, 1923] 147).

⁹² LMM's contract with L.C. Page expired when *Anne of the Island* was published in the summer of 1915 [*SJ* II (July 26, 1915) 171].

⁹³ LMM did not abandon the US circuit entirely: she joined the Author's League of America in 1916.

Anne's House of Dreams was written in record time (less than four months) a time-frame perhaps contracted by the need to test Page's menaces. (Montgomery briefly outmanoeuvred Page by suing for lost royalties.) In the years that followed, Montgomery's Canadian sales greatly increased,⁹⁴ and her involvement with fora such as the Canadian Women's Press Club (formed 1904) and Canadian Authors' Association (formed 1921) was solidified. Her work was less often compared to English writers like Jane Austen, or American ones like Kate Douglas Wiggin, than to her Canadian peers. Both Montgomery (in *Magic for Marigold*) and Mazo de la Roche [1879-1961], with the prize-winning *Jalna* [1927]—which spawned fifteen further chronicles in the Whiteoaks family-saga—created crabby Canadian matriarchs. Montgomery's *Pat of Silver Bush* and Nellie McClung's *Clearing in the West* [1935] introduced Irish women servants with a wealth of folklore in their noddles.

Anne's appeal is global, but Emily's story enjoys particular resonance in Canada, particularly with Canadian women writers. (The New Canadian Library editions of the trilogy have introductions by Alice Munro [b. 1931], Jane Urquhart [b.1949], and P.K. Page [b. 1916].) Naturally the response of *creative* girls and women to these books—whether readers identify with Emily's struggle, or thrill with her success—partly springs from their subject matter. But Emily is a *Canadian* heroine in a way that Anne is not. Whether a fall-out of Anne's success, a product of Montgomery's move to Ontario, a result of the changes wrought by war and new publishers, or symptomatic of the growth and importance of a new national literature—Archibald MacMechan's *Headwaters of Canadian Literature* was published in 1924—the Emily books consciously advance a Canadian identity.

As V.B. Rhodenizer noted in 1930:

The Emily series shows an improvement over the Anne series in that there is a more logical relation between the character and the plot. Not only is the plot what it is because the people are what they are, but also we know why the people are what they are: the relation between characters and heredity and environment is so clearly traced that the books of the series, individually and collectively, produce the impression of organic unity.⁹⁵

More specifically, the "Emily" books articulate a *Scots-Canadian* identity. Emily's relationship to her Scottish roots is an essential part of her personality, her social status and, most importantly, her creative skill. By placing her heroine—and literary

⁹⁴ LMM noted that Canadian advance orders for *Anne's House of Dreams* amounted to 12, 000 copies, whereas Page seldom sold more than one or two thousand (*SJ* II [July 21, 1917] 222).

⁹⁵ V.B. Rhodenizer, *A Handbook of Canadian Literature*. Ottawa: Graphic Publishers Ltd., 1930: 102.

alter-ego—firmly within a clan system, Montgomery consolidated a way of describing PEI life she had developed in “The Story Girl” books.

* * *

A brief comparison of the “Anne” and “Emily” series illustrates the “big difference” between L.M. Montgomery’s two most famous heroines.

Anne is outcast from the status quo by the alien circumstance of her origins. Having no family or tradition or PEI lineage to anchor her against criticism and flak, Anne cannot be accepted and understood by dint of her breeding. Even her creativity is curbed by her lack of “background”. Emily is raised and reprimanded by a thousand ancestors whose decisive influence—albeit one that would have turned the “true-blue Calvinists” (*ENM* 245) in their graves—is to mould her as a Canadian author. Their hard-edged discipline bursts her more romantic bubbles, and their legends centre her creative voice. Anne receives no constructive input from Matthew and Marilla Cuthbert, and must turn to neighbours for literary advice. As with Emily, Anne is counselled to write only of what she knows, but her dismal, rootless childhood, and low self-esteem, have not endowed her with the pride that enables Emily to interpret reality by means other than pure escapism. Even with maturity and contentment, Anne confines her writing to “pretty” “little things for children” (*AHD* 207, 159) and thus never rises above literary mediocrity.

Symbolically, Anne’s creative bond is shown to be with the Island’s natural environment and her first published story of independent authorship, is a fanciful garden dialogue.⁹⁶ Emily Byrd Starr’s first published (and critically acclaimed) story is set in Scotland, and reworks a Gaelic woman’s tale, told to Emily because she is a Highlander, a Presbyterian, and a seer (*EC* 200).⁹⁷

Anne Shirley’s blood family are more or less insignificant, both to her story and to the Cuthberts. The “little orphan from nowhere”—well, Bolingbroke, Nova Scotia⁹⁸—is known to be the only child of teacher parents, Walter Shirley and Bertha

⁹⁶ Anne’s first published story is a joint venture (although Anne is initially unaware of this) with Diana Barry: “Averil’s Atonement” (*Als* Ch. XII, XV).

⁹⁷ LMM’s first publication was a poem, based on a local legend, told to her by her Grandfather Macneill. (“On Cape Leforce”. *The Daily Patriot*, Nov. 26, 1890. Reprinted in F.W.P. Bolger. *The Years Before “Anne”*. Charlottetown: PEI Heritage Foundation, 1974.)

⁹⁸ LMM invented the name of this town. The editors of *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables* speculate that LMM was alluding to the first Viscount Bolingbroke, Henry St John [1678-1751] (*Annotated Anne* 85, 3n). Viscount Bolingbroke was a famous Jacobite sympathiser, who fled Britain on the death of Queen Anne (1714). Both Viscount *Bolingbroke* and George Savile, Marquess of *Halifax*, wrote political tracts, which may explain LMM’s substitution.

Willis, who both died of fever three months after her birth.⁹⁹ As her “[f]ather and mother had both come from far away places and it was well known they hadn’t any relatives living” (*AGG* 52-3) Anne has no extended family to support her, only inadequate, although well-meaning, neighbours. Raised in communities where her family is unknown, Anne remains ignorant of her roots (such as whether “far away places” were a hundred miles or several thousand distant) to the point of unconcern. Her return visit to Bolingbroke and the “weeny-teeny little yellow house” (*AI*s 52) in which she was born, proves that Anne’s quest for her birth family does not extend beyond knowing her parents: “I’ve *found* my father and mother [...] I’m not an orphan any longer” (*AI*s 178).¹⁰⁰

Emily Byrd Starr does not escape heredity with orphanhood. Emily is adopted into a “clan” and her understanding of “family” is broadened by this experience. Although Anne and Emily encounter similar problems when they are adopted by people old enough to be their grandparents, each is presented with a different framework for conformity. Elizabeth and Laura Murray foster links with their kin, and expect Emily to maintain established clan traditions of behaviour. Matthew and Marilla Cuthbert have no close family and, crucially, the Avonlea families that they (and Anne) associate with—the Blythes, the Barrys, the Lyndes—are the solitary representatives of their connection in a community populated by sprawling numbers of Bells and Pyes and Sloanes.¹⁰¹ For Anne, “community” rather than “clan” is the standard for belonging, and mechanism for control. Adopted by a couple with little family influence, Anne stands to be reared and judged by the whole of Avonlea.¹⁰²

The Cuthberts, whose Scottish heritage is both stated in *Anne of Green Gables*, and apparent in their most every thought and deed, do not bequeath their adoptive

⁹⁹ Anne’s mother’s birth-name is not revealed until *Anne of the Island*. The name Walter, surely, is an allusion to Walter Scott, beloved by LMM and Anne alike. (Walter Scott had a daughter called Anne.) Margaret Anne Doody states in her introduction to *The Annotated Anne*, that Walter Shirley was an eighteenth century hymn writer, whose “belted earl” brother was hanged for murder (*Annotated Anne* 28), but this seems an unlikely allusion for LMM to make. Shirley is a name with Scottish, and aristocratic, associations. Walter Scott wrote about an Anne [of Geierstein]. The heroine of Jane Austen’s *Persuasion*, is Anne Elliot; her father, Walter. Linda Hutton points out that LMM associated Shirley poppies (red-headed on willowy stems) with Myrtle Webb (*SJ* III [July 26, 1925], the girl adopted by the brother and sister, David and Margaret Macneill, who lived in the house now known as “Green Gables” (personal communication, Jack and Linda Hutton, Bala Museum, Ontario).

¹⁰⁰ Save the recurrence of the names Walter, Bertha, and Shirley for her own children, the Shirleys and Willises have no further role in Anne’s story.

¹⁰¹ Diana Barry’s Aunt Josephine plays an important role in *Anne* (and by bequeathing Anne money, also in *Anne of the Island*) but she lives in Charlottetown, not Avonlea. Anne and Diana travel to an Avonlea concert with Diana’s Murray cousins from Newbridge but their role is minimal and not part of any clan consciousness. Gilbert Blythe’s great-uncle Dave appears in *Anne’s House of Dreams*, his Aunt Mary Maria in *Anne of Ingleside*: again, neither live in Avonlea.

¹⁰² Marilla is pulled between her sympathy for Anne’s idiosyncrasies and her knowledge that the community disapproves of these displays, thus she consults Rachel Lynde, Miss Stacy, and Mrs Allan about Anne’s upbringing.

child any Cuthbert clan history. Emily's first impressions of the Murray phalanx in the flesh, and vice versa, serve to confirm to each that Emily is a Starr and not of their ilk. "Simple" Cousin Jimmy Murray alone disagrees and believes Murray depths lie under Emily's "skin deep" Starr. The "New Moon" trilogy works towards proving that Emily does indeed "bear the stamp of the breed" (*EQ* 178), both faults, and virtues, of which there are many, Douglas Starr's opinion notwithstanding. Anne is given no place in the Cuthbert genealogy. She is not allowed to call Marilla and Matthew aunt or uncle, mother or father, and never takes their name.¹⁰³ (Green Gables is inherited by Davy Keith, the Keith twins being the offspring of Marilla's third cousin.) Remaining a Shirley ensures that Anne retains her individuality and a nominal connection with her parents: however, in a community where family names are indicative of social position, that she is not a Cuthbert, in a place with no Shirleys, reinforces her "outsider" state.

Anne is actually adopted into a household. She may become as dear as "flesh and blood" (*AGG* 337) to Marilla, but never changes into a bona fide "Cuthbert", by inheriting stories or traditions, temperament or peculiarities.¹⁰⁴ When she leads the Queen's Entrance pass list, Mrs Rachel deems Anne a "credit to [her] friends" (*AGG* 301), thereat including Matthew and Marilla in this "friendly" circle. Anne's surname after adoption is "of Green Gables" quite as much as it is "Shirley": she calls herself "Anne of Green Gables" when she looks in the mirror (*AGG* 76), and introduces herself to Miss Josephine Barry with the same (*AGG* 181). *Anne of Green Gables* focuses on the bonds uniting Canadian neighbours and friends.

Gilbert's (an only child apparently) and Anne's children experience a different upbringing to that had by Montgomery's clan offspring. Blythe clannishness is something of repute in *Anne of Ingleside*, where it becomes Gilbert's reason for not turning the gorgonian Aunt Mary Maria ("her name should be Blight not Blythe" [*Aln* 62]) from the Ingleside door, but the Blythe clan themselves are seldom in evidence, especially in the naming of Anne and Gilbert's children.¹⁰⁵ Gilbert has a

¹⁰³ Orphans adopted into Cavendish families (there were seemingly nine in the Cavendish area in LMM's time [Fenner Scott Stewart. "Highlights of my supervising years at Green Gables." *Kindred Spirits*. Spring 1991]) appear to have taken the names of these families, e.g. a brother and sister from England (Barnardo children) Ray and Ellen, who were adopted into the families of J.C. Clark (Bayview) and Pierce and Rachel Macneill (Cavendish) respectively. Ellen Macneill was held by some in Cavendish to be a model for Anne (*SJ* II [Jan. 27, 1911] 40).

¹⁰⁴ An exception to this is Anne's use of her upbringing to vouch for her own tea-making skills to the sceptical Mrs Adoniram Gibson (*AWW* 88). Anne deliberately falls back on the culinary reputation of Marilla Cuthbert's mother (a Johnson).

¹⁰⁵ The Blythes are identified with certain clan characteristics: independence (*AGG* 341), obstinacy (*AHD* 260), keeping their word (*AHD* 13), a good constitution (*Als* 279), and setting "their affections too much on earthly things" (*Aln* 7).

hand in the naming of their mayfly child,¹⁰⁶ but Joyce's living siblings all take their names from Anne's affiliations: James Matthew (Jem), Walter Cuthbert, Anne, Diana, Shirley, and Bertha Marilla.¹⁰⁷ Partly Montgomery is keeping the "dear public" happy by solemnising the Green Gables connection, but adds to the implication that the only background and history the Blythe children inherit comes from their mother.

Thus when the Blythe siblings first meet the Meredith children, "the history of their little pasts" that they share is the story of "Avonlea, Green Gables, of Rainbow Valley traditions, and of the little house by the harbour shore where Jem had been born" (*RV* 39). Unlike Marigold, Emily, and Pat, the Blythe children inherit no specific ethnic legacy from their parents, however much they adopt a Scottish one from the Glen people. For the young Blythes, the past is a combination of world mythology (the Pied Piper, William Tell, Gelert¹⁰⁸) and the "spots of time" of their early lives. Any feelings of social superiority they harbour come not from clan pride, but from the respect meted to them, as children of the local doctor, by a Scottish-Canadian community.

Clan, genealogy, tradition, and Old World inheritances are important in the "Anne" series: their influence is central to community dynamics. However, Anne Shirley, unlike her author, has no clan background to speak of, to use as a resource (in bolstering pride, obtaining status, supporting identity) in her new homes.¹⁰⁹ (Conversely, being a "foreigner", only conjecture can be used against Anne, not the "proof" of known miscreant ancestors.) Montgomery used this outsider, with her non-partisan eye, to expose the flaws, and praise the virtues, of PEI communities much like her own Cavendish. In clan exposés, Montgomery employed insiders, who are unique, certainly, but sufficiently close to the family nucleus to understand it.

¹⁰⁶ Joyce Cavendish was one of Montgomery's early pseudonyms.

¹⁰⁷ Compare this with the Gardiner family's naming of Rachel in *Pat of Silver Bush*, Ch. 5 "What's in a Name?", a chapter title that is, incidentally, also used for the naming debate in *Magic for Marigold*.

¹⁰⁸ The Welsh legend of Beddgelert ("the grave of Gelert") was probably known to LMM through W.R. Spencer's popular ballad. GBM sent LMM a postcard of the Caernarvonshire village in 1904; LMM replied that she had discovered more about the legend from a Cavendish man of Welsh extraction, Mr Roberts. (Prince Llewelyn's dog, Gelert, was left to guard Llewelyn's baby son. When Llewelyn returned, he found the hound's jaws dripping with blood and, presuming that Gelert had eaten his child, killed the dog. However, the dog's dying cries awoke the child, who was wrapped in bedclothes, close by the body of a wolf, which the faithful hound had killed to protect Llewelyn's son.) This story of canine fidelity may well be an influence (in addition to Greyfriars' Bobby and Ulysses' Argos) on the "Dog Monday" story in *Rilla of Ingleside*.

¹⁰⁹ Gilbert acquires the doctor's practice in Glen St Mary through family influence, his great-uncle Dave being the previous incumbent.

Clan vs Community

L.M. Montgomery's novels fall into two categories—*community* novels and *clan* novels. Themes exploring the self-assurance consequent to autonomy, and the self-discovery that accompanies belonging, are common to all Montgomery's novels. Nonetheless, approaching her fiction to determine its Scottish context exposes divisions in Montgomery's descriptions of Prince Edward Island's historical and cultural milieu. In all her novels (including those ostensibly focusing on English-Canada families) the Scots-Canadian environment and atmosphere is the primary social, religious, and personal framework. All are set in villages, all feature extended families. But the central quests for autonomy and belonging are performed in the arena of *either* community or clan, *not* in both.

This is partly symptomatic of Montgomery's divided inheritance—not that of puritanism and passion, but of villager and clanswoman. Cavendish was a clan enclave. Belonging to the proud Macneills confirmed Montgomery as “born to the purple”, but brought with it prejudice that militated against her attempts to “fit in” to community life. Montgomery felt she had to “struggle against influences and traditions I was not to blame for”. Her Bideford year was her first experience of a life “unhampered by clan jealousy and inherited traditions of dislike and aversion and prejudice. I was a stranger and stood on my own merits or demerits. As a result I made friends everywhere and found myself popular and successful” (May 3, 1908: U.2). Yet Montgomery also derived an enormous sense of self-worth from clan traditions, and from clan prejudice when she meted it out. In Cavendish she often felt lonely and misunderstood, whence Anne Shirley. In the Macneill clan homestead she was partly alien, partly bearing the stamp of the breed, whence Emily Starr.

The community novel, *Anne of Green Gables*, sets wheels in motion for the format of that series. Davy and Dora Keith, Mr Harrison, Paul Irving, Mary Vance, Anne again in *Anne of Windy Willows*; all are strangers to the community. Whether set in Avonlea or Glen St Mary, the “Anne” books depict *village* life. The last, *Anne of Ingleside* [1939], ends with Anne Shirley Blythe's exclamation “What a family!” (*Aln* 252), but family dynamics truly play second fiddle to community dramas. *Jane of Lantern Hill* [1937] is classed with these eight “Anne” novels. Jane escapes her fearsome clan matriarch and finds autonomy through belonging to an Island community. There is no Kennedy or Stuart consensus, no Kennedy or Stuart tradition worth ascribing to. Jane *is* Jane with “Uncle” Tombstone, Mrs Snowbeam, and the Titus girls.

As inaugurated in *Anne*, where the Gillises talk about the Andrews to the Macphersons, the Sloanes malign the Bells, and everyone slanders the Pyes, these narratives unfold in a number of separate households, in a cluster of villages which share family names, ethnicity, worship, and social concerns.¹¹⁰ (Montgomery preferred to describe upwards of thirteen or fourteen “families in a country village”, rather than Austen’s recommended “three or four”.) The heroines (not only Anne and Jane, but others such as Marilla Cuthbert, Faith and Una Meredith, Rilla Blythe, and even the anti-heroine, Mary Vance) develop with the help of friends more than relatives, and their success or failure is judged by the community. These characters criticise and defy community behaviour, but little in their actions changes this environment permanently.

Extended families where “you can’t throw a stone but you hit one” (*AHD* 45) are a fundamental component of these Island villages. However, larger clans are often sneered at or mocked by the breeds outside the clan, on which the novels concentrate. The idiosyncrasies of Pyes, Bells, and Sloanes (or Flaggs, Reeses, and Clows), and even the sheer weight of their numbers, earmark them “mushrooms” compared to the “good old stock”. The Blythes, Lyndes, Barrys, and Cuthberts, are solitary families presumably because their worthy clansfolk have pursued glorious ambitions beyond the pioneer settlement.

Firstly the “Story Girl” books, and then *Emily of New Moon*, set a pattern for Montgomery’s eleven *clan novels*. These narratives primarily concern one extended family (or, in the case of *A Tangled Web*, two families) and the yardsticks for development and personal progress are clan traditions and values. The heroines (and a few heroes, Felix and Beverley King, for example) may challenge some aspects of clan behaviour, but do not radically undermine the clan standards that command their pride. Lessons learned from clan legends and from history are thus upheld. *Kilmeny of the Orchard* is included in this category, although it is more novella (or short-story) than novel. The plot hinges on heredity, and thus on clan.

Typically, these families experience a degree of separation from the main body of the communities they live adjunct to, physically and metaphysically. Accordingly, they suppose themselves older, wiser, and considerably more blessed than their neighbours, when they consider their neighbours worth (rather than their opinions) at all: “Aunt Elizabeth always contrived to give the impression that Butterworths did not exist. They might think they did, but the Murrays knew better” (*EQ* 234). An

¹¹⁰ e.g., the “Four Winds” books feature characters from the harbour, over-harbour, Glen St Mary, the Upper Glen, the Glen, and Harbour Head. All these villages feature in Ingleside gossip. In “The Blythes are Quoted” further communities are added to Ingleside’s locale.

exception to this may be the Stirling family in *The Blue Castle*, who exude feelings of superiority in some respects, but have branches in reduced circumstances. Unlike many “clan” heroines, Valancy does reject her family traditions on her journey to self-discovery.

Conclusion

L.M. Montgomery pledged that *Rilla of Ingleside* would be the last book about Anne, who “belongs to the green, untroubled pastures and still waters of the world before the war” (*SJ* II [Mar. 11, 1919] 309). Never mind that this allusion to the twenty-third psalm was to prove a premature dirge for Anne Shirley’s literary funeral: Montgomery declared these “simple tales” incompatible with the new world order inaugurated by the First World War. To Montgomery, the idyll of Avonlea, and its echoes in Glen St Mary, struck a discordant note in post-war, post-innocence Canada.

Montgomery’s use of the clan framework in the 1920s and 30s springs from new directions in her *pre-war* work. Nevertheless, war (and the devastating flu epidemic) catalysed the unravelling of a traditional social fabric. Prince Edward Island no longer had a pastoral and non-violent history: even idealised and innocent families like the Blythes of Ingleside were ravaged by war. *Rainbow Valley* is evidence enough that Montgomery could make war-time ripples in her own still ponds, but also indicates that “community” was no longer a safe womb in which to nurture fictional children. L.M. Montgomery’s return to community-based fiction in the mid-1930s, especially with *Jane of Lantern Hill*, may presage the further alteration of society by another global conflict.¹¹¹

The modernisation of PEI life was unavoidable but it was also conceivable that pockets of tradition remained in country homesteads. Lest such an approach seem hopelessly sentimental and escapist, “family” was also an avenue for discussing “modern” issues such as genetic heredity, post-war alienation, and child psychology. Thus there is a perceptible difference between an early clan novel such as *The Story Girl*, where there are no overtly hostile clan members, and clan legacies are hidden in hope chests, and a post-war clan novel such as *Emily’s Quest* (although the setting is

¹¹¹ Written in 1936, *Jane of Lantern Hill* confronts that year’s European problems: dictators and divorcées. Erika Rothwell terms *Jane* a “post-war” novel, but it is very much a “pre-war” novel set against a background of mounting tension about Fascist powers. (Erika Rothwell. “Knitting Up the World: L.M. Montgomery and Maternal Feminism in Canada.” *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* 133-144).

pre-war) where relatives are dangerous, and clan legacies lurk in “chromosomes”.¹¹² Montgomery’s attention seems increasingly drawn to the family partly in response to changing community dynamics in the post-war years.

Cavendish life in the 1920s and 30s was radically different to the 1880s’ life that Maud Montgomery knew and that had altered little in the preceding four generations. Once the preserve of the three clans, their prejudices and aversions, incomers with no historical investment were now in the majority: “[Cavendish] *has* changed sadly since those far-off days. The old families have died out” (*SJ* III [July 15, 1927] 344). Collective community ancestry disintegrated when Cavendish ceased to be an enclave. The “ceilidh” and the “literary” were no longer the only forms of entertainment: the advent of the motor car meant that Charlottetown was now easily accessible, not just the place for a biannual jaunt.¹¹³ Even the church of the clans’ forefathers had suffered a “disruption”: Cavendish Presbyterians voted in favour of Church Union in 1925.

In any case, L.M. Montgomery left Cavendish four novels into her literary career. Leaskdale and Norval were areas of Ontario with heavy Scottish settlement, but seem not to have captured Montgomery’s imagination greatly in this respect.¹¹⁴ She continued to set her books on the Island, using her wealth of memories, but increasingly explored Scottish heritage through *family* history and mythology. This direction distinguished her work from that of her American peers.¹¹⁵ Although there was probably a British inspiration here as regards juvenile antecedents, as Montgomery gained in literary confidence, and “Canadian Literature” took its place

¹¹² “Still, I rather wish that old Highland Scottish grandmother who passed that dangerous chromosome down to you had taken her second sight to the grave with her” (*EQ* 103). *Emily of New Moon* is set sometime in the late 1890s, *Emily Climbs* at the beginning of the twentieth century, for the death of Queen Victoria comes two years before Emily meets Mrs McIntyre (*EC* 204). There are no specific omens of approaching conflict but LMM may intend the inevitability of the war to undercut the formulaic happy ending of *Emily’s Quest*.

¹¹³ Automobiles were banned on the Island in 1908. In 1913, the New Automobile Act allowed for cars to travel on certain roads on certain days of the week, and these were extended in 1916. In 1918 these restrictions were eventually scrapped. See Deborah Steward. “The Island Meets the Auto.” *IM*. 5 [Fall-Winter 1978]: 9-14.

¹¹⁴ Norval was, incredibly, named by the early settlers—Loyalists from the Grampians—after the most famous line of John Home’s *Douglas*, “My name in Norval; on the Grampian hills ...” (*SJ* III 424n).

¹¹⁵ LMM was still vulnerable to American tastes in 1936. Her seventh “Anne” novel was published as *Anne of Windy Poplars* in the US, for it was thought American readers would confuse *Anne of Windy Willows* (Montgomery’s preferred title) with *The Wind in the Willows*. British editions of this novel also contained scenes felt “too gruesome” for American readers. Letter to GBM, dated Dec. 27, 1936, *My Dear Mr M* 180-181. British readers were held to be unacquainted with poplars, which must have tickled LMM, for one of her favourite war-poems was Bernard Freeman Trotter’s “The Poplars”: “And so I sing the poplars and when I come to die/ I will not look for jasper walls but cast about my eye/ For a row of wind-blown poplars against an English sky”.

as a cultural force, "clan" became the rock on which to found her Canadian books and her Canadian heroines.

In 1930, a newspaper reporter summarised L.M. Montgomery's opinion of the relationship between family history and Canadian identity. "People in the old days possessed individuality, while today things were quite standardized and human beings were much the same," she told the members of the Women's Canadian Club, continuing, "Those who knew such stories of the days gone by should make every effort to see they were kept alive, for if they did not, many little historical and romantic happenings would be lost forever".¹¹⁶ Tradition and history, as Montgomery viewed them, resided with the distinctive, romantic old families. But even among these clans Montgomery detected a coolness toward the past. As a story-teller, and a folklorist of sorts, Montgomery realised that urgency was of the utmost. Hence, in the aftermath of the Great War, Montgomery used her platform at literary events to urge readers, writers, and fellow-Canadians to preserve their *family* lore as a means of documenting social history. "Never mind if you think you cannot write," she told another audience. "Buy an exercise book and preserve [these tales]. Some day someone may come along with genius and those dry bones will then talk".¹¹⁷

¹¹⁶ Review of LMM's speech to the Women's Canadian Club, Prince Albert on Oct. 9, 1930. "Writer Tells of Old Times in Maritimes". Black Scrapbook 2, 1931-1937, LMM Collection, UG.

¹¹⁷ "Old-Timers' Stories Source for Author." Black Scrapbook 2, 1931-1937, LMM Collection, UG.

II.ii.

“Greats and Grands of Every Degree”

“I’m so tired,” sighed Cousin Ernestine Bugle, dropping into her chair at the Windy Willows supper-table. “I’m afraid sometimes to sit down for fear I’ll never be able to get up again.”

Cousin Ernestine [was] a cousin three times removed of the late Captain MacComber’s, but still, as Aunt Kate used to reflect, much too close . . .

Anne of Windy Willows 146

In 1935, L.M. Montgomery “succumbed at long last to the urgency of publishers and ‘fans’” (*SJ* IV [Mar. 9, 1935] 356), by returning to Anne Shirley’s story and the three year “gap” between the orphan’s engagement and marriage. Later Montgomery questioned whether she had “succeeded in recapturing the old spirit and atmosphere” with *Anne of Windy Willows*,¹ but the task was lucrative at a time when she was saddled with paying for her first mortgage and her sons’ education. There were even unforeseen dividends to be had: *Reader’s Digest* paid three dollars to quote Hazel Marr’s plea, “I was just moonlighted into thinking I loved him” [*AWW* 156].²

The plots of *Anne of the Island* and *Anne’s House of Dreams* dictate that this novel should be set in Summerside (PEI’s second largest town) where Anne is appointed school Principal. Montgomery never lived there,³ and this, together with the fact that *Anne of Windy Willows* is chiefly, like *Anne of Ingleside*, “just a series of disconnected stories”,⁴ lends the book a less sophisticated portrait of “place” than

¹ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 1, 1936, *My Dear Mr. M* 177.

² Letter to EW, dated June 18, 1937 [NAC].

³ LMM had spent the occasional night in Summerside, to catch the ferry for Pointe de Chêne in New Brunswick.

⁴ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 7-24, 1939, *My Dear Mr. M* 195. Part II.ii-iii of *AWW* was adapted from an early story, “The Little Fellow’s Photograph”, originally published in *Classmate*, Sept. 8, 1906. Other parts of this novel were published in instalments in *Family Herald* May-July, 1936, i.e. “The Man who Wouldn’t Talk”, “The Wedding at Poplar Point”, “The Gift of a Day”, “Everybody is Different”, “Miss Much-Afraid”, “The Westcott Elopement”, “A Tragic Evening”, and “A Day Off”. Twentieth Century Fox paid LMM \$150 to use the title “The Man Who Wouldn’t Talk” for a movie (Letter to EW, dated Feb. 13-27, 1940, [NAC]).

is found in Montgomery's other community novels. Nonetheless, *Windy Willows*, like the earlier "Anne" stories, is a book of shared location, not family ties. In fact, the novel mirrors Anne's first adventure: once again the displaced orphan arrives largely unknown, and partly unwanted, in a strange place.

This time, however, Anne is also an Island girl bearing tendrils which bind her to Summerside,⁵ but bringing a shady reputation into the bargain. A prominent local *clan* take a spite at her because "a third cousin of theirs applied for the Principalship, and they all think he should have got it" (*AWW* 9). This breeds a bitter, if short-lived, "feud", as the Pringles attack every chink in Anne's armour, even circulating a report that she is a "foundling" (26). L.M. Montgomery had written of many local family elites before but had never presented such a nasty, petty, and powerful clique. Anne routs the Pringles when she discovers Myrom Pringle was a cannibal: the clan (wrongly) consider themselves bribed into submission. The anthropophagous past comes to light in a diary, which Anne unearths for a local historian.⁶ Anne is asked to look for "any old diaries or maps or anything like that" when "visiting round in other people's homes" (51).

The belief that local history is found in "people's homes" is central in Montgomery's fiction. Anne learns about Summerside through its old families, even unto the third cousin. Her outsider perspective on "clan jealousy and inherited traditions of dislike and aversion and prejudice" forms an introduction to themes that emerge from novels where the "clan", and clan belonging, forms the primary focus.

The Summerside Ladies Summon the Clans

The Pringle "tribe" is bossed by *matriarchs*, the Misses Ellen and Sarah of "Maplehurst", the house-name indicating the pivotal role of the clan networks in Montgomery's maple-leaf land. The Pringles have been Islanders in excess of hundred years and boast of an ancestor who fought at the Battle of Minden (*AWW* 33).⁷ Cavendish lore held that Captain Winter was awarded Township 23 for his

⁵ Anne visits the Gibsons because they are acquaintances of Marilla (*AWW* 74), and knows Dr Carter—the beau of a Summerside girl—from Redmond College (*AWW* 66).

⁶ A sailor, Myrom (and crew) reputedly "et up Jonas Selkirk who had shot himself" (*AWW* 52). Poor Jonas' surname may be inspired by Alexander Selkirk, whose adventures, when fictionalised by Daniel Defoe in *Robinson Crusoe*, featured some frightening cannibals.

⁷ The Battle of Minden (1759) in Germany, part of the Seven Years War campaign, was notable for the fact that Lord George Germain refused to lead the cavalry charge that would have brought a decisive victory.

valour at the Battle of Minden (H.H. Simpson 148).⁸ If this was a persistent tradition, then presumably the Captain's bravery foreshadowed the choice of this particular battle. Lore appended to the "good old stock" in Montgomery's fiction frequently has its source in either her own clan stories, or in PEI tradition.

The first Pringle came from the "old country" (33), although which old country is never clarified. The name is a Scottish (Border) one, but the Maplehurst pound-cake recipe is *English* (27).⁹ In any event, that the Pringles are perhaps not Scots, and probably not Highlanders, does not preclude L.M. Montgomery from applying the term "clan" to them. Many of the characteristics she gave to her fictional clans, regardless of whether the families are Highlanders, or Scots even, are those associated, in history or in literature, with Highland clans.

What makes the Pringles a *clan*? Large numbers are obviously important. Summerside is "full of Pringles and half-Pringles" (9), ensuring that the family can have a self-contained existence. There is a chief who calls the shots. Even Miss Ellen "dance[s] to the piping" of Miss Sarah. The Pringles "keep tabs on each other and fight a good bit among themselves, but stand shoulder to shoulder in regard to any outsider" (19). In either event, loyalty to *name* is premium, be the threats external or internal. A "cabal" (25) is easily organised against Anne, who knows that the "enemy" without has no "chance against a clan like that" (34). The epigones cling to their more illustrious ancestors: the ladies of Maplehurst are giddy with "absurd pride" (53) in their father.

Yet even as Pringle menace rages, Anne feels she "could like them if they were not my enemies" (27). The outsider senses that the ladies have only "the memories by which they live and their pride in them" (35). There is nothing sinful in this pride itself, only its corruption, and the novel confirms that the Pringles are justified in their feelings of superiority. Anne thinks them "*delightful people*" (79). Once accepted by the phalanx, she gloats over them, "What a clan!" (6). Lest the reader doubt the Pringle worthiness, Anne affirms that their cliquishness is not to be classed with the machinations of Avonlea's extended family scourges, the Pyes and the

⁸ H.H. Simpson writes that Captain Winter (Simpson calls the Captain Robert, not William) named Cavendish for the Cavendish family, through whose influence his land grant was obtained. Andrew Hill Clark's list of PEI proprietors, states that Lot 23 was awarded, in the first instance, to Allan and Lauchlin MacLean, Lauchlin being secretary to the Earl of Shelburne, and also part owner of Lot 21. Major Allan MacLean was still listed as lot owner in 1775 (265). The land was sold or transferred to William Winter sometime before the 1798 census. The visit of a later member of the Cavendish family, the Duke of Devonshire (Governor General of Canada, 1916-1921) was fictionalised in *Magic for Marigold*.

⁹ This "English" may spring from the same vocabulary that made "Speaker" Macneill the first English child born in Charlottetown. The Lesleys are Scots, but Young Grandmother describes the clan as "English" when faced with the threat of the baby being christened with the French name, Robinette (*MFM* 14).

Sloanes (27, 79). Whatever high-jinks they get up to, however rude and beastly their warfare, the Pringles are dignified. The power of the chief is awe-inspiring, as is clan cohesion and the unilateral front that masks anything less than salubrious.

Summerside is an old community, and the memories of some residents stretch back to a time when the Pringles were “mushrooms” (198). Miss Valentine Courtaloe belongs to a family with a “terrible lot of funerals” in their annals. Guiding Anne around the Summerside cemetery,¹⁰ Miss Valentine exhumes the reputations of those buried there, including the Pringles. (Learning that Dan Pringle ate his wife’s hat [“Of course it was only a small hat—lace and flowers, no feathers” (46)] demystifies the clan.) The Courtaloe family take the palm for the earliest migration in Montgomery’s fiction, having come to the Island in 1760, from heaven knows where with a surname like Courtaloe.¹¹ Summerside’s social strata are differentiated by “origin” even after five generations. Only *good old* families are buried in this graveyard; “every Tom, Dick, and Harry is being buried in the new” (43). New families are the genealogical equivalent of the *nouveau riche*. Local elites have generations behind them. “Clan” is more than numbers, loyalty, and group identity: there must be an Island history and genealogy.

Custodians such as Miss Valentine Courtaloe are entrusted to share with outsiders the map of local affinities. Another North Shore exile, Mrs Adoniram Gibson from White Sands, has her own method for mastering her adoptive home. Mrs Gibson is a woman of whom it might be said, as of Lady Girnington in *The Bride of Lammermoor*, “an excellent person, excepting that her inveterate ill-nature rendered her intolerable to the whole world”. Certainly the whole world, excepting her late husband, is intolerable to her. Despite her own parental shortcomings, Mrs Adoniram judges everyone by their mother’s behaviour. (Not, as she virtuously tells Anne, that she “hold[s] with criticizing people [...] It ain’t Christian. Would you mind telling me is that all your own hair?” [88].) Eighty years old and invalided to a wheel-chair, Mrs Gibson uses the past to interpret a bewildering present.

Mrs Gibson “never liked Jim Gregor. His mother was a Tarbush” (81) and “never liked Maurice Hilton. His mother was a Crockett” (77). She doesn’t much like Louisa Hilton either, “but her mother was a Tackaberry” (86) which seems to compensate for some misdemeanours. Mrs Gibson is a proud octogenarian,¹² so

¹⁰ “[Y]ou have to know the ins and outs of the corpses to find a graveyard real enjoyable” (*AWW* 43).

¹¹ LMM also used the name Courteloe in *Magic for Marigold*. Abel Derusha’s mother was a Courteloe (“All born with hang-nails on their heels” [*MFM* 148]). As LMM had latterly come to believe the Penmans migrated came to PEI in 1758 this may have influenced the strikingly early choice of date.

¹² “The other evening Mrs Sloane was reading a newspaper and she said to Mr Sloane, ‘I see here that another octogenarian has just died. What is an octogenarian, Peter?’ And Mr Sloane said he

when Davy Ackman circulates a vicious rumour that she is but seventy-nine, she retorts by saying his “mother was a Watt. The Watts are always jealous” (88). She believes a neighbour who airs her spare-room bedclothes is not showing “hospitality; just a desire for a sensation. Her mother was a Carey” (89). Most interestingly, she thinks Anne can cook because “Marilla Cuthbert brought you up. Her mother was a Johnson” (89).

No-one, in Mrs Adoniram’s estimation, can overcome a bad mother. And even when she dislikes people, a good distaff side can override the prejudice. (In Scotland women were often known by their maiden names after marriage [like J.M. Barrie’s mother, Margaret Ogilvy] and Mrs Gibson may be preserving the tradition.) The individual can escape neither family name, nor ancestral behaviour, in this clan-centric world view. “Clan” is also responsible for physical inheritances well beyond what would be expected.¹³ Ernestine Bugle, cousin three times removed and more of Aunts Kate and Chatty, has supper at Windy Willows, although it “cannot be said that either of the widows had welcomed her very heartily in spite of the sacred ties of family” (146-7). Cousin Ernestine is known as “Miss Much-afraid” because she is constantly in fear (and hope) that a tragic fate awaits those she knows.¹⁴ Anything pleasant is a disappointment—that her neighbour’s “calceolaria” is a flower not a disease, for example (150)—for *her* world view holds that “you’ll be spared a lot of trouble if you die young” (152).

Miss Much-afraid regales Anne and the widows with the cheery advice she metes. She has told Martha MacKay that her rash must be measles and that, “[l]ikely they’ll leave you almost blind. Your family all have weak eyes” (147-8). She thinks it probable that Martha’s mother’s indigestion will prove to be a “*growth*”, and “if you have to have an operation and take chloroform [...] I’m afraid you’ll never come out of it [because] you’re a Hillis, and the Hillises all had weak hearts” (148). When Rebecca Dew laughs like a “hyenus” to hear that Jane Goldwin is afflicted with “an alibi”, Cousin Ernestine is much afraid that the widows will “have her on your hands yet. There’s an awful lot of weak minds among the Dews” (151). It is doubtful that Miss Bugle’s—“Bugle I was born and Bugle I will die. Marriage is a leap in the dark [...] and I ain’t going to be drug into it” (149)—neighbours pay any more heed to her bugle-song than the inmates of Windy Willows. But her type of woeful utterances on the gloomier side of heredity are a staple part of L.M. Montgomery’s fiction.

didn’t know, but they must be very sickly creatures, for you never heard of them but they were dying” (AA 25-26).

¹³ LMM took this to humorous lengths. Susan Baker, the Ingleside maid, despairs of her sister, Matilda, when the latter disgraces the clan by breaking her leg: “I do not know what to think of her. None of our family ever broke their legs before” (AHD 308).

¹⁴ Much-afraid is the daughter of Mr Despondency in Bunyan’s *The Pilgrim’s Progress*.

Lastly there resides in Summerside a clan whose hereditary curse has assumed Baskervillian proportions. The Tomgallon family claim the prestige of having a great-great grandfather who was "an officer in the British Army, and received a grant of land in Prince Edward Island for his services" (204).¹⁵ This family exceed the Pringles in Island longevity: they were the true "Royal Family" (198) in days gone by. Canada can breed its own aristocracy, and the description of Anne's visit to Tomgallon House, confers a very British, very noble identity on this clan. Miss Minerva Tomgallon is the "sole survivor of six generations" (198) of Islanders doomed by the Curse of the Tomgallons.¹⁶ Suicide, murder, resurrection, and hauntings are all part of the Tomgallons' "grim chronicle" (211): even Satan appears when a dance spills over into the Sabbath. Anne's night in Tomgallon House is more amusing than gruesome in actuality, and not a little pathetic for all Miss Minerva has left is her pride in the curse, but it gives an old-world flavour to small-town Canada. Montgomery was keen to write history into her Island chronicles: clans, with all their generations, could make that history dramatic.

The Community Stock

L.M. Montgomery's fiction sets "clan" at the cornerstone of Island identity, history, and social interaction, therefore the community novels are not without their clans. In general, however, the community novels do not explore clan *history*. *Anne of Green Gables* is set in a loose time-period, the "near-distant past" common to regional idylls.¹⁷ From *Anne's House of Dreams* on, dates were increasingly significant, as readers were drafted into the Great War. Later books (there are several inconsistencies) can place Anne Shirley's birth in 1869 and her arrival in Avonlea in 1880,¹⁸ therefore Matthew and Marilla Cuthbert were born in the 1820s.¹⁹ This suggests that the Cuthberts (and Johnsons?) came to Prince Edward Island at a later date than Montgomery's ancestors. Be that as it may, however, the story cares only that the Cuthbert siblings are the children of Scots immigrants, and that the

¹⁵ This is LMM's only semi-direct reference to the land lottery of 1767. The legend of the Townsend land grant is applied almost word for word to the Tomgallons, whose name may be an allusion to either one of two (or both) short story writers, Tom Gallon or Nellie Tom-Gallon.

¹⁶ Given Minerva's melodramatic family history, her first name most likely alludes to The Minerva Press and their ultra-sentimental novels, rather than the Roman goddess.

¹⁷ Some details in *Anne* point to the setting as the 1880s, others to the 90s. The annotations in *The Annotated Anne* provide the best illustration of this fluid historical framework, e.g. on matters of fashion, technology, and politics.

¹⁸ Anne is twenty-seven at the time of the Liberal landslide election victory of 1896.

¹⁹ Matthew is sixty when Anne arrives in Avonlea (*AGG* 15). Marilla is sixty in Ch. XXII of *Anne of the Island*, nine years after Anne comes to Green Gables.

Cuthbert homestead was built at the farthest reaches of Avonlea society. In contrast with the “clan novels”, which emphasise *continuity*, Matthew and Marilla do not live in the house their parents built.²⁰

“Uncle” Jerry MacPherson in “The Conscience Case of David Bell” (*Further Chronicles of Avonlea*) is a “stern, deeply religious Scotchman” (170), most likely intended as a clansman of the Avonlea Macphersons familiar from *Green Gables* and sequels: they certainly share enough of his religiosity to name one of their offspring Moody Spurgeon. But Uncle Jerry is as close as any of Avonlea’s residents come to having a *stated* old-world past.²¹ Their religion may be dyed-in-the-wool Presbyterianism, their mores be produced by Calvinism and the Shorter Catechism, their culture consist of “Scotch ballads” (AGG 303) and Burns, but the Avonlea residents do not muster the roll-call of their Scots ancestors. Many of their names have Scottish associations—Andrews, Bell, Barry, Cuthbert, Gillis—but they lack the ethnic extravagance of names like Macneill or Robertson, MacLure or Mackenzie. Only the Macphersons could really claim Highland antecedence.²²

Glen St Mary is a little more willing to flag its pioneers. Captain Jim tells the Blythe newly-weds the story of John Selwyn,²³ one-time Glen schoolmaster, and his bride, Persis Leigh, an English couple who migrated to PEI “almost sixty years ago” (AHD 48).²⁴ Persis had stayed in England to nurse a sick uncle. After his death she came to the Island to join her fiancé: “’Twasn’t no easy journey for a woman in them days. There weren’t no steamers, you must ricollect” (AHD 49). The voyage was to take a month: the *Royal William* was eight weeks late, thus the meat of Captain Jim’s story; the anguished wait, the vision, the reunion. This is no story of uprooted families on crowded, stinking vessels making a communal journey to a new life. This migration was individual, spirited, and romantic.

²⁰ Mrs Rachel tells the wild rose bushes that Matthew and Marilla were “grown up when the new house was built” (AGG 17). The old homestead was built by their father, and their mother planted its garden in her “bridal days” (AGG 335).

²¹ It is implied that Paul Irving’s grandmother is Scots-born: Malcolm MacPherson who moves to Avonlea in the story, “Aunt Olivia’s Beau”, certainly is, to judge by his (Highland) accent (*Chronicles of Avonlea*, pp. 141-159).

²² Gillis is a Highland name, and one which is associated in PEI with Catholic Gaels, but LMM’s novels do not attach this background to Ruby’s Presbyterian family. Elizabeth Waterston has suggested that the surname Lynde conflates the names of two Cavendish tribes, the Lairds and the Wyands (*Kindling Spirit*): perhaps the Avonlea Gillises and Pyes are two halves of the Scottish surname Gillespie?

²³ Selwyn is, of course, a Welsh name. The schoolmaster’s grandson is called Owen, also Welsh. John Selwyn has second-sight, which also places him in a Celtic camp. One of the largest families in the Glen have the Welsh name Reese.

²⁴ In this instance, the device of what might be termed “’tis sixty years since” seems more figurative than literal. LMM needs Captain Jim for a living link between John Selwyn and his grandson, but the story has the feel of a time before the 1830s.

The Cavendish clan litany is here in *Anne's House of Dreams*, adapted for the harbour community: "From the conceit of the Elliotts, the pride of the MacAllisters, and the vainglory of the Crawfords, good Lord deliver us" (AHD 45). But the novel has a narrow focus: Anne and Gilbert initially settle on an enchanted coastline isolated from nearby townships. The novel maps couples, not clans: Anne and Gilbert, Captain Jim and Lost Margaret, Leslie and Owen, and, comically, Miss Cornelia Bryant and Marshall Elliott, who cuts a dash as a zealot of a distinctly Scottish hue, refusing to trim either hair or beard while the Conservatives remain in power (a long eighteen years).²⁵ Gossip about local families is important—the new doctor and his wife must understand the harbour's hierarchies—but legends about their "origins" are not.

Families with old Border names (Elliott and Crawford) live alongside English Bryants and Bakers and Flaggs, and Highland MacNabs and MacAllisters. There are families who speak Gaelic, and old folk, like William MacAllister, who speak the "Doric" yet.²⁶ The Glen is even home to a scion of Douglasses, a name Montgomery felt, "reeks with romance—thanks I suppose to Scott's magic pen".²⁷ The Douglasses are a clan, where if "you touch one, you touch all" (RV 160). Mrs Alec Davis, *née* Douglas, is the *bête noire* of the Meredith children: Norman Douglas initially promises to be a worthy clansman, until Faith beards the Douglas in his hall. Red-whiskered, red-haired, and fiery-eyed, Norman Douglas reeks of brimstone rather than romance: if Montgomery is confounding her own desire for Scott-typed romance in Canada, she certainly seals it when Norman falls for an unlikely romantic heroine. Ellen West, later *Ellen Douglas* of course, is a middle-aged, massive-framed politico, and Anglican to boot.²⁸

Scots form a majority in the Glen, and Scottish tradition, superstition, customs, and culture abound. Community politics and Ingleside gossip prioritise family above the individual.²⁹ But L.M. Montgomery is not the annalist for these clans. Clan is an

²⁵ Marshall Elliott also has a propensity for singing "old Scotch ballads" (AHD 147) and dancing to fiddle music.

²⁶ e.g. "There's nae doot she was a Christian wumman, but she had the de'il's own temper" (AHD 141). Anne and Gilbert learn that, "nearly all the people over harbour from Glen St Mary are MacAllisters—as a local Frenchman says, "Dare's Neil MacAllister and Sandy MacAllister and William MacAllister and Alex MacAllister and Angus MacAllister—and I believe dare's de Devil MacAllister" (AHD 45).

²⁷ Letter to GBM, dated Aug. 23, 1905 [NAC].

²⁸ In LMM's short-story, "A Correspondence and a Climax" (reprinted in *Across the Miles*), Sidney Richmond (Sidney was LMM's favourite boy's name, although this Sidney is a girl) adopts the pen-name, Ellen Douglas.

²⁹ e.g. "That family of Elliotts has always been more stubborn than nateral" (AHD 86); "That family of Reeses were just vegetables. They went through the motions of living, but they didn't live" (RV 161); "she was a Dean, Dr dear, and the Deans were always high-spirited" (RI 180); "If you knew the

arbiter of social distinctions, but not *consciously* related to migration, pioneering, and foundation myths. These books radiate from homes with few local connections.³⁰ Indeed, Miss Cornelia (Mrs Marshall Elliott, after the “perambulating haystack” [AHD 318] loses his whiskers) and Susan Baker’s chatter is biased *against* the larger clans. There is something disgraceful about belonging to a “clan” of the Drew or Reese or Flagg ilk. Even the old Scots Elliots, Crawfords, and MacAllisters are regarded with a degree of suspicion: Dr Dave, Gilbert’s uncle, has had “a forty years’ feud with the over-harbour people” (AHD 45). Just what Miss Cornelia and Susan would make of the Lesleys or Penhallows is to be wondered at.

Jane of Lantern Hill is set in the mid-1930s, far from the time of Emily and Anne, and very far indeed from PEI’s pioneer days. Family names in Lantern Hill are more capricious than ethnographic: Garland, Snowbeam, Salt, Tunstone, Titus.³¹ By nomenclature, Jane has one of most Celtic pedigrees among Montgomery’s heroines—her mother is a Kennedy, her father a Stuart. Yet Jane’s family, on both its estranged sides, remain reticent about their roots, as well they might when even the recent past is shrouded in secrecy. However, when Jane helps her father unpack some heirlooms, she unearths an “early eighteenth century” hour-glass belonging to Andrew Stuart’s “great-grandfather [...] a U.E. Loyalist” (JLH 94).³² This time-piece is in the tradition of cargo carried by Montgomery’s fictitious emigrants. Although Jane lineage is left at this, it is noteworthy that Montgomery cares to establish it, even if only in passing. A Loyalist heritage consolidates her father’s heroism in the First World War.

The Superiority Complex

Family history provided entertainment in communities where story-telling was one of the few permissible social pastimes. Clan *profiles*, modified with successive generations in step with changing mores, were more than entertainment. Teaching

Coopers as well as I do you wouldn’t risk predictions on them. Don’t you know his own grandfather came back to life after they’d dug the grave and got the coffin” (Aln 155).

³⁰ As in Avonlea, Anne makes her best friendships with people outside the community’s most conspicuous extended family networks. All Leslie’s family are dead, as are Miss Cornelia’s. Jim Boyd and Susan Baker have never married. John Meredith is an incomer, the Wests are English church girls.

³¹ Conversely, the hills and farms at Lantern Hill are identified in line with Gaelic naming structures: “Big Donald’s hill . . . Little Donald’s hill . . . Old Man Cooper’s hill . . . Big Donald Martin’s farm and Little Donald Martin’s farm” (JLH 91). LMM’s grandfather and his cousin were differentiated as Big Donald Montgomery and Little Donald Montgomery (SJ IV 132).

³² LMM’s own UEL connections, or those of PEI-ers she knew, principally in Bedeque, were probably in her mind here.

lessons to descendants—the word “clan” comes from the Gaelic (*clann*) for offspring—these profiles demarcated the personality of the clan: character traits, probable legacies, behavioural standards, and possible taints. They explained long-held distinctions between clans and upheld hierarchies and rivalries. Lineage, family tradition, and clannishness were central to the community dynamic in church, politics, school, and social activity.

In L.M. Montgomery's fiction, a small band—variously described as “the chosen people”, “kindred spirits”, and “the race that knows Joseph”³³—are authorised as an “elite”. These people are not diverse. They share customs and culture, ethnicity and background. Certain traditions appear *repeatedly*, and articulate the ways of Scots-Islanders. For example, in *Magic for Marigold*, readers learn that, “At Cloud of Spruce, just as with the Murrays down at Blair Water, it was a tradition that dying people must be taken into the spare room” (*MFM* 22).³⁴ Here Montgomery situates New Moon and Cloud of Spruce in the same dimension, something no doubt delightful for children convinced of the heroines' real existence. More significantly, the Murrays and Lesleys are given identical traditions. Thus, a custom which could have seemed a Murray family peculiarity in the “New Moon” trilogy,³⁵ becomes, in all likelihood, a cultural throwback to the Scottish background that the Murrays and Lesleys share.

Across the sweep of L.M. Montgomery's novels, the superior social status of the Scots in Canada is repeatedly stressed. Beginning with dates for arrival, or the number of generations established in PEI, and moving through a number of recurring themes, such as heirlooms and romances, homesteads and religion, Montgomery introduces analogous criteria of what constitutes clan legend, merits clan pride, and augurs clan disgrace. Thereby she produces her historiography for the Island. Readers who eagerly bought each Montgomery book could not but be aware that her heroines share more than just PEI birth. Scottish roots are an essential foundation for their “kindred” qualities: their Presbyterianism the *sine qua non* of their election. Their Scots-Canadian identity, and the status it confers, are integral to family pride, and consequently to individual self-confidence, self-expression, and self-respect.

³³ In *Anne's House of Dreams*, Anne's catch-phrase “kindred spirits” was replaced by Miss Cornelia's “the race that knows Joseph”, which provoked a host of queries from readers anxious to know the origin of the phrase. LMM attributed it to Frede Campbell, who had culled it Exodus 1:8: “Now there arose up a new king over Egypt, which knew not Joseph”.

³⁴ The manuscript of *Magic for Marigold* shows that this line was an addition to the first draft of the text. (MS. CM.78.5.3. Confederation Centre of the Arts, Charlottetown, PEI.)

³⁵ “According to Cousin Jimmy, it was a New Moon tradition that when any member of the family was near death he or she was promptly removed to the spare room, to die amid surroundings of proper grandeur” (*ENM* 99).

Like her own clans, the principal families of her novels are proud to be descended from the Island's British pioneers. Allowing for their mutually dissimilar details, their clan histories are, in spirit, no different to Montgomery's. She had been taught that her ancestors were "above the common herd" (*SJ* IV 415). Such an upbringing established the credentials of the elite, and enforced judgements on who the common herd were.

* * *

"Just be saying a prayer for all poor orphans and be thankful ye've got a mother that has roots."

"Roots?"

"Sure and that's what's the matter wid yer Doreen Garrison. She hasn't a root to her. Nothing to anchor her down and hold her against the winds." (*PSB* 187)

In Montgomery's first real ventures into clan narratives the clan profile is less methodical than in later novels. The young King cousins' ancestors were Island pioneers, of course, and they came from Scotland, naturally, but dates and vessels remain a mystery. (As in life, Montgomery's fiction seldom turns to the whys of migration.) Although the cousins enthuse about family history they meet few older clan members, which may explain why stories of King pioneers are thin on the ground. Sara tells the "Tale of the Family Ghost" and "The Story of the Poet that was Kissed".³⁶ The first tale is placed "Long, long ago" in the "remote antiquity" of bygone generations. The second story's curiosity lies in the ongoing connection it reveals between the Kings and their Scottish kin. (Great-aunt Edith kissed a sleeping poet mistaking him for "a cousin they had been expecting from Scotland" [*TSG* 25].)

Sara Stanley does delve into local pioneer history. "How Betty Sherman Won her Husband", the romanticised Penman story, is ascribed here to the local Scots clans of Campbell and Fraser. "A Will, a Way, and A Woman" (*TGR* Ch. 2) relates a hundred years old tale of another unusual courtship, of a Carlisle couple also outside the King connection, Ursula Townley and Kenneth MacNair.³⁷ In *Our Magazine* the children go yet further into the past. "The Story of How Carlisle got its Name" (*TGR* 73) is adapted from a real-life legend about Hunter River.³⁸ The story of "Mrs

³⁶ Tales are told in the old family orchard, planted "sixty years since" (*TSG* 14), and certainly "Beverley" echoes the name "Waverley".

³⁷ Old Hugh, Ursula's father, like William "Speaker" Macneill, claimed he "knew every man, woman, and child" in the fledgling colony (cf. *SJ* IV 126).

³⁸ Alan Rayburn notes in *Geographic Names of Prince Edward Island* that Hunter River was named in 1765 by Samuel Holland, the Island's surveyor, for Thomas Orby Hunter, Lord of the Admiralty. Rayburn goes on to note that the local tradition that the river was named for a Fred Hunter who perished nearby is erroneous, the said Fred's death having occurred some fifty years after the community's foundation. "Carlisle" was so designated after a love-sick swain of that name died there:

Dunbar and the Captain of the *Fanny*" (*TSG* 64) is set in the gold rush of '49, and again was drawn from a well-known PEI fable.³⁹ Montgomery changed the names in this tragic love story—Alexander Campbell Irving and Eliza Clark become Alan Dunbar and Margaret Grant—but kept the ethnicity.⁴⁰

Given that Mary Lawson was the story-lady bequeathing many of these tales, rather more Macneill history might be expected. A botched Macneill "romance" lies behind the delayed wedding of Great-uncle Andrew King (*TGR* 95).⁴¹ The tombstone inscription of Great-grandfather King (*TGR* 139) belonged to a man called Truegard, buried in old pioneer graveyard at Park Corner.⁴² Truegard's widow had combined her own verse (and, indeed, prose) with Pope's "To the Memory of an Unfortunate Lady" for her husband's epitaph. For Great-grandfather King, Montgomery excised the Pope. Whether this makes the epitaph better or worse is hard to say.

But Aunt Mary's presence is stamped all over the books, in the clan's self-worthiness. The King family may not be expressly called "the chosen people", but "chosen" they are for all that. Here perhaps is true narrative purpose of the little friends, Peter Craig and Sara Ray. The King cousins may be very egalitarian in consorting with these less-fortunate, less-charismatic, less-loved, less-clannish children. Yet many incidents on the golden road serve but to illustrate the difference between the race that knows Joseph and that which does not. The cousins "think it's awful lucky we were all born into the same family" (*TSG* 18) and not into Sara's family, where there is never enough to eat.⁴³ Peter Craig is impoverished spiritually as well as bodily: unlike the elect King youngsters, he must chose his religion, being born into none. Peter and Sara Ray are the genealogical foils to the King cousins, the common face of PEI's common herd.

Presbyterianism notwithstanding, Emily Byrd Starr's Murray relatives do not share the Kings' egalitarianism. The Murrays of New Moon are an extreme case of

ostensibly nothing to do with Thomas Carlyle, then, but he may have been in Montgomery's mind as much as the English town.

³⁹ A story of the *Fanny*'s voyage, written by Stephen MacCallum, was published in a Charlottetown newspaper, *The Patriot*, on Sept. 5, 1892, and reprinted in *IM* 4 [Spring-Summer 1978]: 9-14.

⁴⁰ see Lorne C. Callbeck 148-149.

⁴¹ John Macneill, son of John and Margaret Simpson Macneill, received the wrong details of his own wedding and turned up a day late. He was sent packing, and remained single for thirteen years, until his fiancée (Sarah Dockendorff) consented to become his wife. LMM speculated: "Perhaps it took thirteen years for a Dockendorff to forgive. Or perhaps she had found out by that time she couldn't get anyone else" (*SJ* IV 125).

⁴² As with the Townsend stone, this tombstone can now be found in the Geddie Memorial cemetery at Springbrook.

⁴³ Mrs Ray keeps her pantry locked "for fear [the French help] will treat her friends" (*TSG* 162). LMM's step-mother did likewise (*SJ* I [Aug. 23, 1890] 30).

"the chosen people" (*ENM* 13). They are a race apart, ostracising the common herd and isolated from the community they live in, and presumably helped found. Before his death, *Douglas* Starr tells Emily that the Murrays "live up on the old north shore at Blair Water on New Moon Farm—always have lived there since the first Murray came out from the Old Country in 1790. The ship he came on was called the *New Moon*, and he named his farm after her" (*ibid.*).⁴⁴ The Murrays have "increased and multiplied and scattered all over", thus the "old stock" at New Moon is "pretty well run out". Grande-dames Elizabeth and Laura remain in single, childless blessedness, a condition local gossips ascribe to their "Murray pride" ("a byword along the north shore"). Emily's father (who despises the Murrays) admits "they had some things to be proud of [...] but they carried it too far".⁴⁵

Of course, Macneill pride was the antecedent for Murray pride (and also Lesley pride).⁴⁶ (Robert Chambers lists pride as the family characteristic attached to the Macneills in Scottish tradition.⁴⁷) "Miss *Pridey*" Starr's young schoolmates learn by rote that Emily's clan are "rotten with pride" (*ENM* 71). No community *drama* accounts for this opinion: it stretches back to the clan identity consequent to migration. Yet Macneill pride notwithstanding, L.M. Montgomery patently found John Macneill's *individual* migration inadequate agency for spawning the *clan* trait. When Emily is orphaned she loses her only spear-side relation and her clan profile belongs to the spindle. In adapting her personal ancestry for her literary double, Montgomery assigned all the relevant stories to one clan.

On her first Sunday at New Moon, Cousin Jimmy preaches the gospel of the homestead. Scot Hugh Murray and his *English* wife, Mary Shipley, were bound for Quebec, until the fates and a woman's will intervened.⁴⁸ Whereas Fox Point tradition remembers that Hugh Montgomery likely accepted his wife's obstinacy with good grace, New Moon lore says that Hugh Murray "coaxed and stormed and raged and argued—and even cried" (*ENM* 64). He came to love P.E. Island, but Mary's

⁴⁴ As noted in a short piece, "Edinburgh Emigrants: the Scottish Ancestors of L.M. Montgomery" (*Kindred Spirits* Autumn 1997: 17-18), "it is an intriguing thought that, if Montgomery had stuck to known fact, we might be reading about Emily of *Edinburgh* instead" (18).

⁴⁵ Both LMM and Emily bore their father's surname in the house of their mother's clan. The Macneills reputedly considered Hugh John Montgomery a less than desirable match for their daughter.

⁴⁶ "In *Magic for Marigold* the scene is laid in Harmony and the clan of which she is a member are 'the proud Leslies' [*sic*]. Of course I meant 'the proud Macneills' in so far as I meant anybody. As for Harmony I got the name off a P.E. Island map. I know nothing of the place and never knew anyone who lived there. But [a woman LMM met at a party] had lived there when a child and she told me there actually was a family of *Leslies* there *who were noted for their pride*. What a devilish coincidence!" (*SJ* IV [Oct. 11, 1930] 79).

⁴⁷ *Popular Rhymes of Scotland* 317.

⁴⁸ The Murrays have a long-standing feud with an Irish-Catholic family, perhaps accounting for the fact that Montgomery changed Mary MacShannon's supposed Irish origin to English for Mary Shipley. At any rate, English ancestors would likely have inspired more pride than Irish ones.

obstinacy “rankled”. Emily is taken to Mary Shipley’s gravestone, carved at Hugh Murray’s orders, with her defiant disembarking words, “Here I Stay”. “*That’s* how he got even with her,” Cousin Jimmy tells Emily, prefiguring the paths of revenge taken by Elizabeth Murray against her headstrong niece. While Emily has a grue about the heredity bequeathed her by such a spiteful ancestor, Cousin Jimmy carries the tale further from the Montgomery antecedent. The memorial had caused a local scandal, when “folks twisted it round to mean that old Hugh didn’t believe in the resurrection” (ibid.). From that day forward the horrified and humiliated Murrays carried no spite beyond the grave.

In 1795, Hugh had been joined by his brother William, and *his* wife Elizabeth Burnley. William Murray is bland, but his spouse is heir to Elizabeth Townsend. Being “scandalous homesick” (ENM 65) she refuses to take off her bonnet. As William and Elizabeth’s son married Hugh and Mary’s daughter, both the Murray wives were Emily’s great-great grandmothers, a Nancy and Betsy Penman inspired circumstance. Last of all, Emily learns that their neighbour, Dr Burnley, is a “forty-second cousin” of the family. His connection to the New Moon clan stretches back to the Old Country, where “he had a cousin of Mary Shipley’s for a great-something”. With pointed Murray pride, Cousin Jimmy observes, “his forebears came out after we did” (ENM 66).⁴⁹

L.M. Montgomery made interesting changes to her nursery tales. The date of 1790 comes from the year of Cavendish’s foundation, but is nearly twenty years after the Montgomery’s migration. With William, Montgomery attached continuing links with Scotland, and chain migration, to a legend which supported neither. Hugh Murray’s epitaphic vengeance, and the community reaction, adds comic flesh to the dry bones, but also matches the woman’s will with male tyranny, introducing a streak of one-upmanship into the Murray temperament.⁵⁰

Montgomery inspired a loyal readership who would read, reread, collect, and compare all her novels, thus her own handful of clan stories could have only one appearance in fiction.⁵¹ For her other novels, Montgomery either had to imagine new legends, or by-pass them altogether. So the Lesleys of Cloud of Spruce, although they share Murrays’ pride, have no migration legend to validate it. Perhaps, in the 1920s, the Lesleys did not need one to feel better than their neighbours. It is enough

⁴⁹ LMM appears confused in giving Emily a Burnley ancestor, and a Burnley best-friend, but making the blood connection between Emily and Ilse a Shipley inheritance; especially as Mary Shipley is English, and Ilse’s ancestors Scots.

⁵⁰ Hugh Murray was the name of the boy protagonist in Ralph Connor *Glengarry School Days*.

⁵¹ As the germ of the “New Moon” books was long-standing (around 1911) LMM may have prevented herself from recycling some clan lore in her novels from this early date.

for young Lesleys to know that the "good old stock" of Cloud of Spruce were descended from clansmen who migrated "from Scotland a hundred and forty years" ago (*MFM* 3).

In *A Tangled Web*, Montgomery made use of the most "romantic" aspect of her *English* ancestry. The history of Harriet Dark's jug is the history of the "Woolner" jug, and Woolner migration. The Darks come from "Aldboro" in England, making them a rare breed in Montgomery's fiction: people with an origin more specific than Scotland, England, Ireland, or just the "Old Country".⁵² The Woolner jug bore the words, "Harriet Kemp, Aldbro., 1826," (visible on a photograph of Montgomery with the jug [*SJ* IV 201]) an abbreviation (presumably) for Aldeburgh (in Suffolk). There are as many Darks as Penhallows in this novel, and Montgomery bungled the story, unless this was an extended family migration. Robert and Sarah Penhallow (a West Country surname) brought her sister's jug, full of blackcurrant jam to her new home in 1832.⁵³ (If this was to ward off scurvy, like the lemons Grace Marks' Irish family take on the Canada-bound ship in Margaret Atwood's *Alias Grace*, romantic tradition ignores it.⁵⁴)

The Darks and Penhallows are Islanders of a century's standing. Montgomery is not, however, putting the time-clock of pioneer days as far forward as that. (The Woolners must have seemed comparative newcomers on the North Shore.) For the migration of the pioneer Gardiners, Nehemiah and Willy, Montgomery went back to 1780. None of the families at the centre of Montgomery's clan novels share her prized 1770s migration, which may reveal not a little about the competitive spirit that accompanied pioneer lore. Montgomery may have been deliberately sanctifying her own history by post-dating its fictional counterparts.

Silver Bush, like New Moon and Park Corner, has its own graveyard full of the "greats and grands of every degree" (*MP* 13). Therein rest Nehemiah and his French Huguenot wife, Marie Bonnet, their son Thomas and the bride of his youth, Jane Wilson.⁵⁵ Also buried beneath the spruce boughs is great-great-great uncle Willy, the

⁵² Mistress McIntyre in *Emily Climbs* comes from near Balmoral. The Trevayne family in *A Tangled Web* name their house, Treewoofe, after "some old place" they had come from in Cornwall (*ATW* 81); an obvious antecedent here is the naming of "Park Corner" after the Townsend "estate" in Berkshire.

⁵³ As with Hugh and Mary Murray, LMM used the forenames (Robert, Sarah, and Harriet) of the original Woolner tale. In a twist to the original however, Harriet Dark died a year after the sailor lover who commissioned the jug was drowned. "Hearts *did* break a hundred years ago" (*ATW* 43) the Darks and Penhallows now tell.

⁵⁴ "My Aunt Pauline had given my mother three lemons, worth their weight in gold as she said it was well known they were good against the scurvy; and these I carefully preserved in case of need". Margaret Atwood. *Alias Grace*. London: Virago, 1997: 135.

⁵⁵ Mrs Nehemiah, like Elizabeth Campbell, watched four of her children die of "black cholera" (*PSB* 19).

"Weeping Willy" of clan disgrace, "who, when he first came to P.E. Island and saw all the huge trees that had to be cleared away, had sat down and cried" (*PSB* 11). A not uncommon reaction to the dense forestation that greeted fellow Scots when they landed at Point Prim or Malpeque it would seem: one chronicler of PEI lore refers to "the first Walker coming to this Island from the lush meadows of Annan, Scotland [who] viewing the giant maples and pines to be levelled [...] 'sat doon and grat'".⁵⁶

Judy Plum is a *bona fide* migrant, only out of Ireland these thirty years, seemingly, although her memories make it hard to imagine a time before she was part of the Silver Bush household. Judy's migration contains elements so prosaic they make her story appear almost convincing. Judy had worked firstly in Ireland, and then in England,

until a roving brother took a notion to go to Australia and Judy went with him. Australia not being to his liking he next tried Canada and settled down on a P. E. Island farm for a few years. Judy went to work at Silver Bush in the days of Pat's grandparents, and, when her brother announced his determination to pull up stakes and go to the Klondike, Judy coolly told him he could go alone. She liked "the Island." It was more like the Ould Country than any place she'd struck.

A journey from Australia to Maritime Canada may sound unlikely, and perhaps it is, but the community of New Zealand, PEI, was so-named when Islanders were emigrating to the Antipodes.⁵⁷ Judy's personal history provides a glossier view of Irish migration than the usual dose of squalid potato-famine victims, despite the poverty detectable in her chain of subsistence migration.

Out of Ireland, Judy brings a "cream cow" pitcher, a blue trunk, and a picture of three kittens. For Montgomery's Scottish emigrants two kinds of heirlooms endure. Their gardens and orchards are circled with hedges and blooming with flowers grown from old country slips and roots. Cloud of Spruce is hedged with Scottish thorns, as is the home of Marigold's Aunt Anne (*MFM* 28, 203).⁵⁸ No thorns without roses, and the Cuthberts have their Scotch rose-bush: the Wallaces in the story, "A Fortunate Mistake", the Gordons in "The Bride Roses", Jean, the Scottish servant in "A Garden of Old Delights"⁵⁹; all have brought roses. Roses are an English emblem to be sure, but white roses (like those brought out by the Cuthberts and the

⁵⁶ Carrie Ellen Holman. *Our Island Story*. Summerside, PEI: The Journal Publishing Co., 1955: 72. Holman continues, "and it is recorded that when Chief Justice Stewart arrived he remarked, 'Why was I sent here? To judge the trees?'".

⁵⁷ Alan Rayburn. *Geographic Names of Prince Edward Island*.

⁵⁸ LMM may have slipped up here, and told the same story twice.

⁵⁹ "A Fortunate Mistake" (first published Jan. 23, 1904; reprinted in *Across the Miles*); "The Bride Roses" (first published Oct. 1, 1903; reprinted in *After Many Days*); "A Garden of Old Delights" (*Canadian Magazine*, June 1910. Scrapbook 4, labelled "Early 1900s, after *Anne of Green Gables*". CM.67.5.20.).

Gordons) were adopted by the Jacobite followers of the outlawed Pretender, forced to meet *sub rosa*.

Silver Bush has "southernwood" from the "little Quaker Great-grand" which is still "slyly aromatic" (*PSB* 18). Bruce Marshall's mother brings ivy from England ("The Girl and the Wild Race", *TDS*), that ever-greens the gables of the family home. For agrarian migrants transporting seeds and so forth had a practical application, but Montgomery's purpose is chiefly symbolic. Plants are living links with the Old Country, which old families plant to tint their homesteads with a "touch of romance" ("A Garden of Old Delights"). Montgomery's Island flaunts its old-world flowers: "There grows a bonnie brier bush in our kail-yard, And white are the blossoms on't in our kail-yard", they might well sing.

Maud Montgomery looked out over the garden at the old homestead in Cavendish and saw blue flowers planted by her Grandmother Macneill from English seeds (*SJ* II [Aug. 20, 1911] 73). In the old Montgomery house at Park Corner, visitors can still see the "Townsend clock", rescued from the scuppered *Elizabeth* perhaps, or sent onwards from England at a later date. Time-pieces are valued possessions. Aunt Becky has a "solemn old grandfather clock that had ticked off the days and hours of four forgotten generations and was still ticking them off relentlessly for the fifth" (*ATW* 18). New Moon has a sundial that "Hugh Murray, had [...] brought out from the Old Country [...] There isn't as fine a one in the Maritime Provinces" (*ENM* 61). At Cloud of Spruce, "Old Grandmother had her clock in the corner by the bed—a clock that had struck for the funerals and weddings and comings and meetings and partings of five generations; the grandfather clock her husband's father had brought out from Scotland" (*MFM* 3).

The symbolism is stated explicitly: the clocks keep time between two worlds, and chime the continuity between old and new lives. Tales of emigration in Montgomery's novels were seldom bitter tales of hardship in Scotland, of long and dangerous voyages over stormy seas, of dispossession, distress, and disease. If this was the past, then it had been forgotten, the cracks pasted over with brighter times. Migration is centrally important to the reigning clans, a yardstick by which they claim their status, but only as that migration beats on in the rhythms of their Island history.

The Only Decent Things to Be

"You will be having Highlandmen for your forefathers?" she said, in an unexpectedly rich, powerful voice, full of the delightful Highland accent.

"Yes," said Emily.

"And you will be a Presbyterian?"

"Yes."

"They will be the only decent things to be," remarked Mrs McIntyre in a tone of satisfaction. (EC 200)⁶⁰

Margaret Bennett's research on Scots-Gaels in the Eastern Townships finds that, "In their collective memories, most families have retained only brief references to the actual migration". Although "[m]ost Quebecers of Hebridean descent know approximately when their forebears emigrated [...] [t]hey are largely concerned with events that occurred after their forebears settled".⁶¹ Foremost, Quebec Gaels cite the poverty and starvation of their migrating ancestors as "the most memorable factor to have affected their fate" (3).

Poverty and starvation were not tokens of clan fate for Montgomery, in life or in fiction. Superiority is the "memorable factor", a rank validated by settlement history. Reasons for leaving the "homeland" are irrelevant, poverty is immaterial. L.M. Montgomery would have heard the folklore of PEI's more famous large-scale migrations but, stirring as these stories were, they only skiffed her personal clan mythology. (Which is not to say that these stories are totally absent from her fiction. Their presence is veiled, an unwritten and unspoken past, but one that ripples through the annals of the parish.) Her family mythology taught L.M. Montgomery that all tangible links with the Old Country could vanish without dampening the clans' affection for this Old World past. Just because Scotland is rarely described with native know-how, does not make connection to Scottish culture and heritage any less heartfelt, nor identification with Scotland any less real.

Family pride, influence, and renown, are created when Scottish origins are *combined* with Canadian longevity. Scottish roots do not in themselves guarantee social prominence, nor shield the "upstarts of yesterday" from the scathing judgements of their fellow Scots. The Lesleys of Harmony seethe when their neighbours, the McAllisters, boast about a centenarian aunt because "[the McAllisters] were comparative newcomers, only three generations out from Scotland

⁶⁰ The "original" of this anecdote was a "characteristic" Frede Campbell remark: "When Jen [Fraser] and Frede first met at Macdonald [College] Frede looked at her across the room and said briefly, 'Maritime.' 'Yes,' said Jen. 'Presbyterian?' 'Yes.' 'Shake,' said Frede. 'They're the only decent things to be!'" (SJ III [Nov. 21, 1921] 26).

⁶¹ Margaret Bennett. *Oatmeal and the Catechism* 8.

when the Lesleys were five" (MFM 57)⁶². (Later *Highland* emigrants, like the McAllisters, were therefore considered lower in the social hierarchy.) Herein can be found a central anxiety of the colonial identity L.M. Montgomery described: proximity to the Old Country can diminish the experience of, and claim to, Canadian identity.

In no sense mourning exiles, these expatriates consider Prince Edward Island—the new “homeland”—the ideal place in which to live.⁶³ This attitude still prevails among the Scots-Islanders of the 1920s, when Pat Gardiner hears tell of “old Mr George McFadyen, who died four years ago and went to heaven. At first he couldn’t find any Islanders but after a while he found out there were lots of them, only they had to be kept locked up for fear they would try to get back to the Island” (PSB 165). Not even the young Pat is so naïve as not to wonder how Mr James Madison got word of that particular anecdote. But young children of Old World lineage were evidently being instructed in Prince Edward Island patriotism, and being assured that Providence vouchsafed the same. This provincial allegiance stems in part from the Islanders’ British Empire loyalties, often invoked in Montgomery’s novels at the expense of the United States.

Mrs Lynde vilifies “Yankees” more than most—“her husband had been cheated out of ten dollars by an employer for whom he had once worked in Boston and neither angels nor principalities or powers could have convinced Mrs Rachel that the whole United States was not responsible for it”—but this is only an idiosyncratic twist to a more wide-spread prejudice against “all people who had the misfortune to be born or brought up elsewhere than in Prince Edward Island” (AA 18). Rebecca Dew puts Jim Armstrong’s bad manners down to the fact that he “came from New Brunswick [...] He ain’t a real Islander; wouldn’t be such a crank if he was. We have our peculiarities, but we’re *civilised*” (AWW 119). Montgomery paints her Island as an earthly paradise, and her Island elites, no matter how she and others might see them, have the giftie for seeing themselves as an earthly elect. They are convinced that, albeit “a darn queer lot”, they are “the finest people ever happened” (ENM 62).

⁶² LMM may be intending to equate centenarian Christine McAllister in *Magic for Marigold*, with Mrs Roderick MacAllister, in *Anne’s House of Dreams* (Ch. 8), who also lives to be a hundred. Mary Vance also mentions an “Old Aunt Christina MacAllister”, an over-harbour woman with medicinal skills in *Rainbow Valley* (51) and *Rilla of Ingleside* (234).

⁶³ Will R. Bird wrote in 1959, “nowhere on earth are there good folk who can compare with the Islanders for clannishness and attitude in general that makes them almost a race apart [...] you sense that in their heart of hearts they feel sorry for your hard luck in not being born on the Island”. *These are the Maritimes*. Toronto: Ryerson, 1959; 192–193.

Not only does the belief that they now inhabit "the best part of God's earth"⁶⁴ influence how these immigrants think of Scotland, it strengthens the creed that emigration was divinely sanctioned. (Emily's maternal family thus had two ordained voyages, for it "was a clan byword that the Murrays had a boat of their own at the flood. No promiscuous ark for *them*" [EQ 40].⁶⁵) The "good old stock", the Island pioneers, were, if not quite nearer to God, certainly nearer than the hordes who followed. Of course, settlement, and the creation of new colonial hierarchies, could revise the most humble of migration histories, transforming the mushrooms into new Royal Families.

The social networks and communities in Montgomery's novels have *not* been transported intact from Scotland. As with Cavendish, the settlers of Avonlea, Blair Water, Harmony, and so forth, come to PEI at sundry times and in divers manners. Social sets and village hierarchies are outwardly Canadian-born, whatever Scottish or Old World biases may prejudice them. Montgomery's fictional families count time from their arrival in PEI, in figures of generations "out" from Scotland.⁶⁶ These families are sensible to the fact that the social fabric is founded around their PEI conduct, but there exists, in addition, a sometimes *unconscious* and unexpressed belief that later migrants from Scotland were not in the same class as those boasting six generations, and thus fated to lower status from the first.

Therefore, L.M. Montgomery's characters *consciously* use PEI history, not Old World structures, as the benchmark for status. Rhoda Stuart, would have Emily believe that she is "descended from the kings of Scotland" and that "if [her] father had his rights he would be on the throne of England" [ENM 74],⁶⁷ but Aunt Elizabeth tells Emily that "the Stuarts were not a family that the Murrays had ever associated with" [ENM 94], clearly not in this world but, possibly, in the last. Emily, albeit accidentally, is involved in another plot against the Stuarts when she visits Great

⁶⁴ Description of Cavendish and PEI by Bayview resident, John C. Clark, to the Cavendish Literary Society, Nov. 5, 1900. (Minutes of the Cavendish Literary Society, Feb. 19, 1886-Jan. 7, 1924. P.A.P.E.I. file 2412.)

⁶⁵ In *Cavendish: Its History, Its people*, H.H. Simpson quotes an article by the Rev. A. MacLean Sinclair, published in *The Celtic Review* of July 1909, which cited a volume on the genealogy of the McNeill clan by the McNeill of Barra, "Chief of the Clan McNeill of that day": "According to the Chief McNeill [the clan] were a sufficiently distinguished family at the time of the flood that, while Noah, his family and the animals occupied the ark they were able to have their own boat" (H.H. Simpson, 51). It is not improbable that LMM had read this article, or the McNeill volume, and been amused by it. (LMM's first cousin Murray Macneill, a professor of mathematics at Dalhousie, was mentioned as a distinguished clan member in this volume. Murray's daughter Janet married Peter Aitken, son of Lord Beaverbrook.)

⁶⁶ LMM's chief market was the United States—in spite of Mrs Lynde's swipes—and her repeated emphasis on the social clout of pioneers may have carried additional resonance in America, given the *Mayflower's* legacies.

⁶⁷ As Emily writes in her diary, "I wonder how Queen Victoria would feel if she knew that. It's very wonderful to have a friend who would be a princess if everyone had their rites" (ENM 84).

Aunt Nancy—Murray by birth, Priest by marriage—at Wyther Grange,⁶⁸ and breaks the “Jakobite glass”: “It was a glass *an old ansester* of the Priests had long ago in Scotland and it has a thistle and a rose on it and they used it to drink Prince Charlie’s health with and for *no other purpose*. It is a very *valewable airloom* and Aunt Nancy prizes it highly” (ENM 221).⁶⁹ Or not, as it turns out, for true to Murray clan form, Aunt Nancy doesn’t “care a hoot” about the Priests (and obviously the Stuarts) and is “tickled to think none of them can have [the heirloom] now and yet can’t pick a fuss with me over smashing it” (ENM 225).⁷⁰

* * *

The tentative allegiance of the Priests to the Catholic Stuartry aside, without doubt the only “decent thing to be” in L.M. Montgomery’s novels, is Presbyterian. Like Aunt Becky, Maud Montgomery was “*born a Presbyterian, lived a Presbyterian, died a Presbyterian*” (ATW 47), however much she objected to the austere Presbyterianism of the Macneill households, and cocked a snook at rigid orthodoxy in her fiction. Valancy Stirling is the only non-Presbyterian heroine in the novels, and she swiftly rejects her family’s Anglicanism in favour of Free Methodism.⁷¹ (Her employer, Abel Gay, an auld sinner convinced of his own election, is a poor advert for the church of Montgomery’s fathers.)

Mistress Margaret McIntyre’s contention that it is “decent” only to have Highlandmen for one’s forefathers is more complex. Had she met Pat or Marigold, not Highland-blooded Emily, her words might have fallen on stony ground. L.M. Montgomery predominantly used the term “Scotland” (her “ideas of Scottish geography [were] merely on broad general lines”⁷²) and conjecture is needed when questions of Highland and Lowland arise. For instance, Elizabeth and Laura Murray

⁶⁸ The name of Aunt Nancy’s house certainly sounds like something the Brontë sisters would invent (many critics have noted the several parallels between the “Emily” series and *Jane Eyre*): Wyther Grange was, however, a house near Charlottetown, PEI, the residence of Arthur W. Holroyd, according to Meecham’s 1880 atlas of the province (p. 49).

⁶⁹ The rose on the glass would seem proof positive that LMM knew the symbolism of the Cuthbert’s white rose-bush.

⁷⁰ As one would expect, PEI was reputed to have “visible and treasured links with the days of Prince Charlie. A lovely miniature on ivory encircled with the green garter and buckle he wore at Prestonpans is still in the possessions of the Hunt family and Hon. Allan Stewart of Strathgartney has among his treasures the antlers of a deer shot by the Prince”. Carrie Ellen Holman. *Our Island Story*. Summerside, PEI: The Journal Publishing Company Ltd., 1955: 81.

⁷¹ “a Free Methodist!” groaned Mrs Frederick—as if to be married by an imprisoned Methodist would have been a shade less disgraceful” (TBC 142).

⁷² Letter to GBM, dated Dec. 29, 1903, *My Dear Mr. M* 4. Presumably, LMM’s knowledge of Scottish geography improved after her honeymoon.

distrust the wraith of Emily's Highland ancestry, suggesting they are Lowlanders.⁷³ (In Scotland, the Murrays were Highlanders from Perthshire and Moray.) But in truth, Montgomery's Islanders mix "Highland" traditions and names with "Lowland" traits and language, often creating the "Mock Scots" heritage that Margaret Laurence describes. At several generations remove, Scotland could take on the mantle of story-book romance, combining say, Highland notions of kinship and hospitality with Calvinist Presbyterian religious fervour, the air of Border balladry and Lowland self-restraint.

Take *Kilmeny of the Orchard*, the least studied of Montgomery's novels, and the least loved.⁷⁴ ("Kilmeny brings on a bilious headache", the *Clarion* reviewer whined; and as Kilmeny warns her lover, Eric Marshall, of danger with the pantomime favourite, "*look behind you—look behind you*" [KO 126], he has a point.⁷⁵) The heroine's forename has a Lowland beginning in James Hogg's *The Queen's Wake*: Hogg [1770-1835] was the "Ettrick Shepherd" of *Noctes Ambrosianae*, and contributor to Scott's *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*.⁷⁶ "Una", Kilmeny's short-story prototype, was presumably also named for a maid in a poem, Edmund Spenser's *The Faerie Queen*. It seems not unlikely that Montgomery moved easily from one poem (twelve tales of adventure for Good Queen Bess) to another (seventeen songs for Mary, Queen of Scots), heightening the Scottish context as she did so.

By clan, though, Kilmeny is a Gordon. Although Gordon country was in Aberdeen and Banff (not strictly Highland) the clan were identified as Highlanders since the fourteenth century, and Jacobites besides.⁷⁷ George, the fifth Duke, raised the regiment of Gordon Highlanders, and the Gordon clan were famed for their fighters, whether Charles George Gordon holding the fort at Khartoum, or George Gordon, Lord Byron, son of Catherine Gordon of Gight, dying for Greek liberty on the shores of Missolonghi. All would have been familiar to Montgomery. She may

⁷³ Archibald Murray remarried a woman of Highland descent, thus Emily's ancestry. Given the numbers of Gaels in PEI it was presumably hard *not* to have Highlanders for ones forefathers somewhere along the line.

⁷⁴ LMM padded out the short-story, "Una of the Garden", with nature descriptions and such like, which "weakened the story very much" in her opinion. (Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 20, 1910, *My Dear Mr. M* 49.) Presumably Una was not a Gordon in the Garden, although the assonance suggests another root for the surname.

⁷⁵ The reviewer continues by writing that *Kilmeny* was "a childish and improbable story in commonplace language and a gushing manner". LMM transcribed this review for GBM's benefit, conceding rather sportingly, "I'm obliged to him for a good laugh" (*My Dear Mr. M* 52-53).

⁷⁶ Kilmeny was named for her grandmother "and she was called after a girl in a poem" (KO 50).

⁷⁷ Jean Dunlop. *The Clan Gordon: "Cock o' the North"*. Edinburgh: Johnston & Bacon, 1955. The Cock o' the North—also the title of a Gordon pipe tune—was a Gordon, the 2nd Earl of Huntley, or the 5th Duke of Gordon, depending on your era.

have wryly thought of the Rev Charles William Gordon ("Ralph Connor") then riding high in the best-seller lists. One of Montgomery's early mentors was a Gordon, Hattie Gordon, the schoolteacher in Cavendish from 1889 to 1892.⁷⁸

The name Gordon, along with those other first/ last names Douglas, Marshall and Fraser, appears several times in Montgomery's fiction.: Bluenose, Philippa Gordon, Anne's friend at Redmond; Pat's best-friend, Hilary Gordon. The Gordons with "The Bride Roses" (and a family feud) are Scottish. In the short-story, "White Magic", first published in 1921 (and set in 1840), Bruce Gordon (of Gordon Brae, Scotland!) whisks back from the Old Country to PEI, to claim a bride who finds the "wild, virgin" colony stiflingly dull.⁷⁹ This story is a muddled attempt at period drama, admittedly, but coupling Gordon with Bruce, identifies "Gordon" as a Highland name.

The Lindsay Gordons "never were and never will be" (*KO* 25) like their neighbours (Williamsons, Reids, Scotts, Martins, Fosters). Thomas and Janet Gordon left Scotland with their parents when they "were small children. [...] Mrs Gordon died a few years after they came out, and four years later James Gordon went home to Scotland and brought a new wife back with him" (39-40). The Gordon family have never felt the need to integrate themselves into Lindsay life: Margaret Gordon—Thomas and Janet's half-sister and Kilmeny's mother—turns her back on local lads, and marries a Nova Scotian. But Ronald Fraser already has a wife and pregnant Margaret returns to her family.⁸⁰ James Gordon slanders his daughter: Margaret Gordon fights back with unbroken silence; thus, the Gordons believe, the curse on her mute child.

This daughter is Kilmeny *Gordon*, not Kilmeny *Fraser*: the child of the clan not the father, perhaps only to be expected in light of the annulled marriage. The *unexpected* member of the Gordon clan is Neil Gordon. Neil's parents were "Italian pack-peddlers". His mother died in childbirth, his father "skipped clean out", and the baby was left at the Gordon place where he had been born. Truer to the "the sacred proprieties of hospitality" (*AIn* 55)—Highland hospitality perhaps—than their neighbours (Marilla Cuthbert tells Anne "never to let one of those Italians in the house" [*AGG* 247]) the Gordons adopt the baby and raise him as their own.

⁷⁸ LMM may not have known this, but Hattie's clan mythology linked her family to those Highland MacLarens Scott wished prosperity to in the introduction to *Rob Roy*. See, "Author's Introduction". Walter Scott. *Rob Roy*. London: Everyman, 1991: 390. (Personal communication from Beth Cavert through Mary Rubio.)

⁷⁹ "White Magic." *Woman's Century*. June & July, 1921, reprinted *Among the Shadows*: 287-303.

⁸⁰ Ronald had, allegedly, believed his first wife to be dead when he married Margaret.

L.M. Montgomery may have made her name describing the successful adoption of an alien child by an elderly brother and sister, but she was not about to go over old ground in *Kilmeny*.⁸¹ This unfolding plot is probably the closest readers come to knowing with certainty that Anne's background is Scottish. Marilla's neighbours are proved wrong in their fears about Anne: her "nice folks" were obviously spiritual kindred to Avonlea. Lindsay community thinks the Gordons "made too much" of Neil. They are angry that the child has not been put in an orphan asylum as they advised, and incredulous that he could be "baptized same as any Christian child" (24). (As an Italian, Neil presumably "belongs" to a different church.) In adulthood, breeding will out. A Highland diet of "oatmeal and the shorter catechism" (74) cannot cool his Latin hot-temper.

For Neil, the worst indignity comes when the woman he loves is wooed by a finer, whiter, pure-bred Scotch suitor. The people he has lived with for twenty-two years are insensitive to his rejection. Thomas Gordon chastises Kilmeny for being "too kind to the lad", but adds, "he's got presumptuous. He must be taught his place. I mistrust we have all made more of him than we should" (94).⁸² Montgomery's sympathy with Neil is never more than half-baked, as Neil's murderous axe-attack on Eric confirms. Neil's "place" is as a second-class citizen only and a farm-hand not a son, no matter what late admissions of love come from his guardians (128). He may bear the name Gordon, but he will never be Gordonised from head to foot. "[A]ll the restraint and training of his environment" cannot override his "Italian peasant" (83) nature.

"Restraint" and "training" are key in Scottish Presbyterian child-rearing and in the character of Montgomery's Gordon clan. The "Italyun" responds to neither and is plainly not of the elect. Eric's father describes Janet and Thomas as "rugged and grim"—like the Highland landscape perhaps—"of good stock and pith, native refinement and strong character" (133), recognition that the Gordons are hewn from similar rock to himself, and also that their neighbours are not. Importantly, Eric Marshall's Lowland Scots heritage is twinned with a Highland gene (6)—the part of him David Baker "mistrusts"—which turns him from dull to quixotic, from boy to man.

Highland by name, the Gordons have many Lowland streaks to their nature, such as their dialect, their emotional reserve, their dour practicality. But do they have a Highland line that becomes their mark of distinction? Rigid Presbyterianism is

⁸¹ Indeed, LMM thought that "critics will think I rush from one extreme to the other. In my first book I had a heroine who talked all the time. In my third book I have one who cannot talk at all". Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 20, 1910, *My Dear Mr. M* 48.

⁸² Thomas Gordon's "I mistrust" seems a Scoticism, meaning "I don't doubt".

neither a Highland nor a Lowland preserve, but there may be something in the Gordons' gloomy religion and mastering belief in predestination that is Highland for all that. Margaret Gordon's story is revealed in the chapter, "An Old Unhappy Far-Off Thing", a quote from William Wordsworth's "The Solitary Reaper". The Lake District poet remembered a Highland Lass singing in Gaelic as she worked in the fields, and imagined "the old unhappy far-off things and battles long ago" that she sang of.⁸³ The Gordons' story is the more "humble lay" of internecine feud, father pitted against daughter, but Montgomery may hint at something with the allusion.

Certainly in the Kailyard novels that held some inspiration for *Kilmeny*, Highland characters, like Donald Menzies or Lachlan Campbell in *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush*, are singled out for their fierce dogmatism in a community of Free Church dogmatists, and their spiritual seclusion and mysticism. The Gordons' seclusion springs only in part from their clannish retreat from the outside world when adversity comes to call. Their history and their fate are marked by their conviction in their personal connection to Providence, which enforces that isolation.

Clannishness

Although dislocated from their kin in Scotland, Montgomery's unfettered ancestors propagated families no less convoluted and no less clannish than those of migrants who left Scotland in extended family and community groups. Even young adventurers like John Macneill and William Clark were soon embroiled in complex connections. "Clanship" in Scotland, in its practical, political, and economic capacity, its fealty, and its military functions, had virtually disintegrated by the second half of the eighteenth century, but a diluted cultural resonance remained. Pioneer society in PEI was clearly different to Scotland, yet not completely alien, and it is plausible that the Island's isolation, for instance, as well as the large proportion of Gaelic immigrants, kept elements of clanship alive.

In *Clanship, Commerce, and the House of Stuart, 1603-1788*, Allan I. Macinnes appraises the structure, political and socio-economic vitality, and eventual demise of the clan system in the Scottish Gaeldom.⁸⁴ Macinnes takes the approach of "historical realism not literary romanticism", and his insights are informed by related disciplines such as sociology and social anthropology. He studies a world, a

⁸³ There is a resemblance between Kilmeny Gordon in the orchard with her violin, and Highland lass, Flora Mac-Ivor in *Waverley*, playing her harp, singing by the waterfall, and, thankfully, being interrupted by the timely intrusion of a Porlockian greyhound.

⁸⁴ Allan I. Macinnes. *Clanship, Commerce and the House of Stuart, 1603-1788*. East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 1996.

time, and circumstances far removed from Prince Edward Island, of course, but his synopsis of the traditional basis of clanship is a useful window through which to view Montgomery's fictional clans.⁸⁵ What is it about her Island families, other than their sheer weight of numbers, that makes them "clans"? What is the relationship between these networks of families and Scottish history and culture?

Macinnes defines clans as "territorial associations, composed of a dominant kin-nexus and satellite family groups [...] held together by the paternalism and patronage of their chiefs and leading gentry who maintained an ethos of protection within the localities settled by their clansmen" (24). Land ownership in Scotland was determined by heritable feu and in the Highlands was concentrated in the hands of a small group, the clan chiefs and the *fine* (the clan elite). The settlement of land was decided by family affinities, and ties of kinship were "supplemented by local ties of kindness and friendship between landowners, their tenants, followers and other associates" (2).⁸⁶

The "primary value of clanship was protection" (2). Each chief assumed a patriarchal role toward his kindred: "[t]hese traditional values were pre-eminently propagated though the tightly structured, if stereotyped, eulogies and elegies of the bardic schools from the high middle ages" (2). Because all the clan were considered part of one "extended common family" (3) the chief gained in virtue by granting hospitality and compassion on his distressed or needy clansmen. "Protection" could also be a matter of justice, and the chief and *fine* protected their clansmen in this respect in return for loyalty and deference. The chief and the clan elite fell heir to a hereditary authority: the trusteeship (*duthcas*) of clan tradition was in their hands. Genealogy was therefore valued, honoured, and cited, as connections were stated and authority asserted. Genealogical mythology projected admirable qualities on the chief and *fine*.

Contrary to one recurrent romanticism, the clans operated *within* the framework of the law, and had legal power of arbitration following territorial disputes or raids. Alliances were cemented by marriages contracted between chiefs and leading clan gentry, and supplemented by bands of friendship (contracts of co-operation) and fostering. Lower in the clan pecking order than the *fine* came the tacksmen, the lower gentry, who collected rent from the clansmen for the *fine*, and acted as estate-managers in their settlements. These same tacksmen, unwilling to take a nose-dive

⁸⁵ See also I.F. Grant. *Highland Folkways*. 1961, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1989: Ch. 2 "The Clans".

⁸⁶ Macinnes writes that in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries there were around fifty autonomous clans in Scottish Gaeldom.

socially when they were elbowed out of their traditional role, were a dynamic factor in migration from Scotland to the colonies.

Unlike Macinnes, L.M. Montgomery was seduced by "literary romanticism". Other fiction was as influential on her work as the historical reality of either Scottish or Canadian circumstance. Kailyard novels were largely unconcerned with clanship, although "the Laird" was invariably magnanimous and paternalistic.⁸⁷ General Carnegie in Ian Maclaren's *Kate Carnegie*, whose great-grandfather fought for "Charlie", maintains a closeness with his tenant and school-friend, Bell Robb. "[W]e were all Jock Tamson's bairns in those days," the General tells Kate, "and got our learning and our licks together, laird's son and cottar's daughter"⁸⁸; a method of child-rearing that owes something to Gaeldom's policy of fostering, and yet more to clanship's tenet that all, high and low, were conjoined in one family network. By contrast, Lord Rintoul in J.M. Barrie's *The Little Minister*, is "so little o' a Scotchman that he's no muckle better than an Englisher"⁸⁹; Nanny Webster is marked for the poor house because no clan network supports her when her brother is imprisoned.

These books were set in the mid-nineteenth century, when Culloden was a distant happening and the fighting days of the clans were over. For Scottish thrills and drama Montgomery turned to books set in the "romantic" heyday of the clans, amid warfare and feud, heroic victories and tragic defeats. Jane Porter's *The Scottish Chiefs* [1810], tells the story of William Wallace and Robert the Bruce with hectic stirring pace.⁹⁰ S.R. Crockett's *The Black Douglas*—"simply scrumptious"⁹¹—takes Scotland forward to the fifteenth century and fictionalises the Douglasses' feuds among themselves, and with the Scottish nobility, in James II's minority years. This book strengthened Montgomery's larder of romantic Douglasses: in John Home's *Douglas*, Walter Scott's *The Lady of the Lake* and *Marmion*, *Castle Dangerous* and *The Fair Maid of Perth*; "Douglasses of all colours", as Sellar and Yeatman would agree.

L.M. Montgomery adored, of course, Walter Scott's tales of battles long ago ("Splendid old Scott! His magic never fails" *SJ* I [Nov. 10, 1908] 342). *Rob Roy*

⁸⁷ see e.g. Lord Kilspindie in Ian Maclaren's *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* who intervenes when his tenants are menaced by an unsympathetic factor.

⁸⁸ Ian Maclaren. *Kate Carnegie and Those Ministers*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1896: 42.

⁸⁹ J.M. Barrie. *The Little Minister*. 1891. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1893: 278.

⁹⁰ LMM bought *The Scottish Chiefs* when she was eighteen (*SJ* I [Jan. 12, 1893] 88).

⁹¹ *SJ* I [May 28, 1899] 238. Rereading *The Black Douglas* in 1936, LMM thought it, "an old forgotten book that violates every canon of literature--except the all-important one. 'Thou shalt not write a dull book'" (Aug. 28, 1936: U.9).

[1817], one of the few novels permitted to sit on Macneill bookshelves,⁹² is set in the months surrounding the Jacobite Rising of 1715. English soldiers battled with the proscribed (in 1606) clan MacGregor, “so famous for their misfortunes, and the indomitable spirit with which they had maintained themselves as a clan, linked and banded together in spite of the most severe laws, executed with unheard-of rigour against those who bore this forbidden surname”.⁹³

For his first historical novel, Scott tackled the '45. Written between this, *Waverley* [1814], and *Rob Roy*, the action of Scott's Covenanter novel, *Old Mortality* [1816], encircles the Battle of Bothwell Bridge, whereafter Claverhouse, Bonnie Dundee, was “stirring about yet in the Highlands [...] wi' a' the Donalds, and Duncans, and Dugalds, that ever wore bottomless breeks, driving about wi' him, to set things asteer again”.⁹⁴ (Montgomery knew her Macaulay and would have remembered from his account of Killiecrankie, 1689, that Lowlander Claverhouse led the Highland clans against Lowland troops fronted by a Highland Mackay⁹⁵: another case of jumbled allegiances.) More even than these, Maud Montgomery “gloried” in *The Lady of the Lake* (“nourishment for heart and mind and soul” [*SJ* I (Jan. 14, 1900) 247]) and the rousing description of the Clan Alpine men summoned to battle by the Fiery Cross. These accounts of clan intrigue, loyalty, and bravery were far indeed from the domestic warfare of her novels, but they were powerful touchstones for her work nonetheless.

Few of Prince Edward Island's first proprietors improved or settled their land, although a small minority did exercise some paternalism toward the tenants they recruited, for example, John Macdonald, who arrived on St John's Island, via Boston, in 1773, with a boat of supplies for his Highlanders. Unlike Nova Scotia or Upper Canada, however, Prince Edward Island held no promise of free land. Highlanders could come to PEI, and attempt to reproduce the old community there, but land insecurities, and the constant threat of escheat, often put paid to long-term plans, and migrants scattered around the Island and off-Island.

Cavendish was settled by three families with three surnames, but in effect by one clan. The Simpsons and their in-laws leased several tracts of prime land on Lot 23, on which to found their settlement. In the first Island-born generation this hold on the land, and rule of the land, was consolidated as the children of the clan remained in the neighbourhood their parents had established. Although the Simpsons,

⁹² If so be it, the Macneills had bookshelves: the glass-doored bookcase was used as a china cabinet (see *SJ* I [Jan. 7, 1910] 374, [Mar. 26, 1905] 306).

⁹³ “Author's Introduction”. *Rob Roy* 386.

⁹⁴ Walter Scott. *Old Mortality*. London: Collins, nd. 406.

⁹⁵ T.B Macaulay. *A History of England from the Accession of James the Second*. See Ch. XIII.

Macneills, and Clarks had few rights of ownership, they appear to have exerted a degree of control over subsequent settlement, and expanded their sphere of influence into adjacent Bayview.

This clan were the dominant kin-nexus in the settlement's social institutions, particularly the church. They increased their local status by exercising political and judicial power in the Island's legislative bodies. Divisions existed between the founding families and other settlers—thus the litany—and with time, divisions were apparent in the dominant group itself, creating lower-status satellite groups. These ranks were visible at a social level—the successful, prosperous farmers lorded it over the “black sheep”—and at a religious one: the Presbyterians and the Baptists each thought themselves holier than the other. The Cavendish families fought with each other, liked to trump each other, yet supported each other in times of need, or when communal effort was required on the farm or in the home.

Such a clan could offer support and neighbourliness. As L.M. Montgomery knew only too well, it could also be an inescapable force; monitoring, chastising, anticipating an individual's fate by their forefathers' conduct. Montgomery appears to have perceived no dislocation between her perception of their *Lowland* origin, and the traditional equation of clanship with *Highland* society. Interestingly, she despaired that her Highland in-laws were “not remarkable for their clannishness” (*SJ* III [Apr. 14, 1923] 125). Clannishness for Montgomery was frequently an attribute, a source of security, a manifestation of care.

What's in a Name?

I was born and brought up in the very heart of three of our old “pioneer” clans, and I know them all from A to Z, as not even a lady who has spent two whole summers on the Island can do. I know their virtues and their faults . . . for even P.E. Island pioneers and their descendants have faults. I have a few myself. I know instances of tragedy and comedy beside which the fictitious incidents of my books pale into insignificance. I know their fierce spats among themselves and their equally fierce loyalty when any outsider attacks them. Nor does this date only to pioneer days. Last summer when I was on the Island I was regaled with an account of a recent “clan” row which both for tragedy and comedy surpassed anything I ever invented. Human nature does not change. It is the same now as it was in pioneer days.

In 1930, L.M. Montgomery launched this vitriolic attack in a Toronto newspaper on an “anxious lady from the States” and an “Insider” (an Islander) who had accused her of “laughing in her sleeves” at P.E. Islanders in *Magic for Marigold*.⁹⁶ “I am accused,” she barked, “of ‘caricaturing’ the Islanders [...] because one old lady says

⁹⁶ LMM, Letter to newspaper. Black Scrapbook 2, 1931-1937, LMM Collection, UG.

that she had twins twice to spite her mother-in-law. Could crassness and provincialism go further? One would suppose that even a person who was absolutely joke-blind could not take that seriously". She insisted that none of her characters were "drawn from life"—"I cannot help it if an occasional cap fits"—and reaffirmed her commitment to "write fiction . . . not history or biography" without fear of offending "the susceptibilities of visitors from 'the States' or even of ultra-thin skinned Islanders themselves".

Montgomery was outraged to find *Marigold's* portrait of an Island clan upbraided, and herself reproached for resorting to mawkish caricature. As L.M. Montgomery mounted her defence by claiming that *Marigold* was true to the Island "clan life" she knew, the novel merits a closer examination here, as perhaps her most representative portrait of an Island clan.

The first chapter is entitled "What's in a Name?". Juliet's question had been posed in Montgomery's work once before, when Anne Shirley doubted that the "skunk-cabbage" could ever smell as sweet as the "rose" (*AGG* 52). In *Marigold*, Montgomery took the question back to its original context: family feud. The Lesleys commune to pick a Christian name for Lorraine's child that is in keeping with Lesley "traditions". The satellite groups are mustered to Cloud of Spruce and each clansman claims a right to proffer his or her opinion. This call to arms extends to Salome Silversides, "one of the family", although she is only "a fourth cousin of Jane Lyle, who had married the step-brother of a Lesley" (9).⁹⁷ Each armed with prejudice, the resultant squabbles reveal what is in the name "Lesley", although it brings the clan no closer to naming the infant.⁹⁸ It little matters that the "good old stock" at Cloud of Spruce are on the wane, for there are bodies enough to present a formidable force at the clan "gathering".

The conclave is held at "the original Lesley homestead" (2), seat of the "dominant kin-nexus" (what Montgomery later describes as "the clique—a clan within a clan" [*ATW* 138]).⁹⁹ Literally (in what Aunt Josephine considers a profane description!) a *place aux dames* (*MFM* 14) those visiting Cloud of Spruce also have to make way for the ladies. Old Grandmother Lesley rules the roost over her

⁹⁷ This is reminiscent of Bailie Nicol Jarvie's claim of kinship with Helen MacGregor in *Rob Roy*: "My mother, Elspeth Macfarlane [...] was the daughter of Parlance MacFarlane, at the Sheeling o' Loch Sloy. Now this Parlance MacFarlane, as his surviving daughter, Maggy MacFarlane, alias MacNab, wha married Duncan MacNab o' Stuckavallachan, can testify, stood as near to your gudeman Robin MacGregor, as in the fourth degree of kindred" (291).

⁹⁸ The name Lesley recalls Leslie Moore. As a surname, it was not one that LMM often used in her work (see "A Strayed Allegiance" in *Along the Shore* for one example) nor one that would recall a particular Scottish memory, save perhaps of Alexander Leslie, Earl of Leven, or David Leslie, who lead the Covenanter armies against Montrose.

⁹⁹ The clan's Christmas reunions are held in a rotation of clan homes.

daughter-in-law and her granddaughter-in-law and rides rough shod over personal feelings. Only Uncle Horace (known as "Klondike" Lesley following his prospecting in the Yukon) flouts the clan rules openly. He is a traveller, an intellectual, and an iconoclast (or ikonoclast) who threatens to blast the Lesley traditions. Feminine power notwithstanding, Old Grandmother abhors the covert vanities of her clanswomen: Aunt Leah who manicures her nails and Aunt Myra who won't wear glasses. Worse still is Aunt Nina, who "wrote poetry and peddled it about the country" (13).¹⁰⁰

Old Grandmother's standards dictate clan identity by Scottish matter-of-fact, and a plain speaking that calls a spade a spade, and underclothes underclothes (14). The Lesley phalanx, excepting Klon, are neither intellectual nor erudite, and their sense of humour is woefully underdeveloped. Despite these similarities the clan have never "been known to agree on" (1) anything, except loving Marigold's father, and perhaps fearing Old Grandmother. Their squirls and hoots appear, on the surface, to be far from any ethos of "protection". Yet each conflict arises from Old Grandmother's protection of the clan name by holding the past in sacred trust. Like Aunt Becky Dark she is a harridan who nonetheless epitomises the clan spirit. (Old Grandmother, "liked people with a mind of their own—when they were dead" [17].)

Hence, for all their little "failings" and their hushed complaints, the Lesley satellite groups have an interest in supporting Old Grandmother's chieftdom. In the eyes of the world, her name is their name, and the image she projects and protects consolidates their superior social position. The Lesleys fight among themselves, but they unite behind the banner of propriety that waves before them in the wider world. Each clansman can be an Old Grandmother in miniature, shrieking in horror at Uncle Klon's unruly moustaches, or the thought that the name "Clementine" would make the Lesley baby the butt of local jokes ("That horrid old song, for instance—*Oh, my darling Clementine* [...] No, no, not for a Lesley" [12]). The Lesleys, like the Murrays, are "born to the purple" (*MFM* 1), and have set ideas about what makes "one of us" and "one of them".

Old Grandmother is larger than life and more than human. Like a Scottish clan chief of old she is a symbol, and her agency has a mystical edge. She is believed to have animal familiars, is suspected of making a "saint" of the Skinner doll, is a seer who predicts the hour of her death. She wants to see ghosts: she has "twins twice

¹⁰⁰ LMM may have had Cavendish poetess Elizabeth Newell Lockerby [1831-1884] in mind here. Lockerby, occasionally remembered now for her "epic", "George and Amanda" (see *The Wild Brier: or, Lays by an Untaught Minstrel* [Charlottetown 1866]), hawked her verse in PEI and beyond. LMM remarked, "[Elizabeth Lockerby] made a good thing out of it. I am afraid Heloise and Francesca would not have done that. But then they were not Scotch" (July 26, 1927: U.7.204).

just to spite" (71) her mother-in-law. Even after death she remains forceful: "Old Grandmother dead had somehow become a more potent influence in Marigold's life than Old Grandmother living" (78). Marigold's first-day nerves at school are concealed partly because "Old Grandmother would have scorned her for being frightened" (*ibid.*). Her sage advice will echo through Marigold's adult life.

Emily's forebears haunt her in a similar ways. Her ancestors "give [her] no peace" unless she aims "for the heights" (*EC* 99). When Emily flees Shrewsbury, school, and Aunt Ruth's spite, Cousin Jimmy's observes, "I don't think any of your grandmothers would have given up a chance for education so easily [...] Not on the Murray side anyhow":

[Emily] felt at once that when Cousin Jimmy, in that diabolical fit of inspiration, dragged her grandmothers in, everything was over but the precise terms of surrender. She could see them all around her—the dear dead ladies of New Moon—Mary Shipley and Elizabeth Burnley and all the rest—mild, determined, restrained, looking down with something of contemptuous pity on her, their foolish, impulsive descendant. (*EC* 152-153)

Mary Shipley and Elizabeth Burnley are "mythic personages" who bestow grit and determination, strength and stubbornness, on their descendants.

Old Grandmother makes a more concrete bequest. Marigold will inherit Cloud of Spruce, and the mantle of chieftainship.¹⁰¹ Young Grandmother—Marion Blaisdell—is not a true Lesley.¹⁰² (For that matter, Old Grandmother is no more a Lesley *in name* than her daughter-in-law.) Trusteeship of the clan, of both property and birthright, is passed to Marigold, "a thorough clansman [who] loved, without knowing she loved, all the old clan customs and beliefs and follies and wisdoms as immutable as the law of Mede and Persian" (*MFM* 109). (Were Marigold to die, rebellious Uncle Klon would inherit, perhaps one reason for his distracted grief when she is perilously ill.)

Marigold is "Sealed of the Tribe".¹⁰³ She is "born knowing" (42) her allotted caste: evidence indeed that she is the hereditary heir. Marigold hears all the "old clan history" (30) by the time she is six, but "the Old Country—that mysterious land across the ocean where the Lesley clan had its roots" (203) is out of sight in

¹⁰¹ Emily will not inherit New Moon, and rejects a marriage proposal from the male cousin who will. LMM was also passed over in favour of a male heir, and it still "rankled" in 1927 (*SJ* III [July 30, 1927] 349-350).

¹⁰² Blaisdell is a West Country name: Young Grandmother can make clotted cream. Marigold's mother is a Winthrop, and the daughter of a minister (the name would be associated with John Winthrop). Marion Lesley, bossed by Edith Lesley all her clan life, is not a fearsome matriarch and with the exception of the "Sylvia" episode, is seldom autocratic.

¹⁰³ This is a reference to the seventh chapter of Revelation, where the tribes of the children of Israel are sealed in the living God by four angels, further "proof" that the Lesleys consider themselves a chosen people.

"immemorial antiquity" (28). In the Lesley genealogy, Scotland is an echo, an Old World mythology that approximates to the Celtic mythology underpinning the genealogy of the Gaelic clan. Emily's Scottish past has faces in Hugh and William and Elizabeth. Marigold has no equivalent mythic personages. Although the Lesleys are akin to the Murrays, particularly in their shared pride,¹⁰⁴ with Marigold's "belonging" already secured, the novel makes a quest of "magic" (imagination, humour, devilment).

Emily faces constant opposition of a kind that Marigold only encounters once, when the key to the Magic Door is withheld. As chief-in-waiting, Marigold has power. Emily is a half-Starr among true Murrays, a dangerous cocktail of unknown chromosomes. Marigold is rarely chastised, never truly accused of unworthiness. Emily is consistently labelled disgraceful for doing things "a Murray would never have done" (ENM 36). She ignores the family feud with the (Irish-Catholic) Sullivans, for example, and has dealings with Catholic priests, "such as no good Presbyterian half-Murray of New Moon should have" (ENM 184). Worst of all, Emily has "an un-Murray-like habit" of writing stories: "No Murray of New Moon had ever been guilty of writing 'stories' or of ever wanting to write them. It was an alien growth that must be pruned off ruthlessly" (ENM 270).¹⁰⁵

Magic for Marigold offers different lessons on clanship. "Never mind the old traditions," Old Grandmother tells Marigold hours before her appointed time, "Traditions don't matter in a day when queens have their pictures in magazine advertisements" (MFM 74). Heeding her own words, Old Grandmother decides to "smash one tradition to bits" by dying in her own bed, and in so doing, smashes the connection between Cloud of Spruce in the twenties and New Moon of a generation or more before. Montgomery insisted that PEI clans were unchanged since pioneer times but they *do* change between *Emily* and *Marigold*. *Emily of New Moon* is a reflective look at Montgomery's childhood. *Magic for Marigold* is "a book of its times."¹⁰⁶ Set in the 1920s, it focuses on a child not so very different in age to Montgomery's own children.

Montgomery watched her sons for manifestations of "heredity". She looked eagerly for signs of her own creativity yet dreaded Ewan's instability would reappear

¹⁰⁴ Marigold is "Miss High-and-Mighty" (MFM 84) to her school peers, and one of the "bigotty Lesleys" (MFM 154).

¹⁰⁵ Elizabeth Epperly notes in her article "L.M. Montgomery Captures the Clan" (*Kindred Spirits* Autumn 1995: 14-15) that, "It is said on the Island that Montgomery's Aunt Emily Macneill (of the Malpeque Montgomerys) read some of *Emily of New Moon* and then flung the book across the room, exclaiming, 'she's put us all into one of her books!'" (15).

¹⁰⁶ Elizabeth Waterston. "Marigold and the Magic of Memory" *HT* 155.

in them.¹⁰⁷ Small wonder then, that *Marigold* unlike *Emily*, laughs a little at the ancestors, or leastwise shows that chances do exist for shaping an “un-inherited personality” (Waterston 1994, 158). Marigold visits round the satellite clan homes, many of which have a skeleton in the closet, a flaw which keeps them in their place of orbit round the old homestead. Aunt Stasia is a humourless “old fool” (108) whose husband was killed by a flash of lightening a few minutes after she was married. “No one in the clan” has much use that “solemn old ass” (17), Uncle Jarvis, who “was known to have got up in the middle of the night to dot an ‘i’ in a letter he had written that evening” (241). Marigold is not lacking in clan pride, nor is she loath to keep up family traditions, but her self-expression is given a long rein.

Reading beyond the ending, Marigold will grow up, marry (a doctor if she sticks with tradition), and have children at Cloud of Spruce, a Lesley no longer in name one presumes, but always a Lesley in spirit.

The Genealogical Tangle

The Highland clans had been disempowered and disassembled by the time (1771-1775) Maud Montgomery’s ancestors quit the Scottish homeland. Yet, describing his journey to the Western Islands in 1773, Samuel Johnson could still detect the cultural force of genealogy in Scotland’s far reaches:

The inhabitants of the mountains form distinct races, and are careful to preserve their genealogies. Men in a small district necessarily mingle blood by intermarriages, and combine at last into one family, with a common interest in the honour and disgrace of every individual. Then begins that union of affections, and co-operation of endeavours, that constitute a clan. They who consider themselves as ennobled by their family, who think highly of their progenitors, and they who through successive generations live always together in the same place, will preserve local stories and hereditary prejudices. Thus every Highlander can talk of his ancestors, and recount the outrages which they suffered from the wicked inhabitants in the next valley.¹⁰⁸

Pride, unity, co-operation, heredity, feud: all would remain powerful symbols of clanship in oral culture, in literature, and in the popular imagination. Set in “a small district” wherein lived “distinct races”, L.M. Montgomery’s novels provide a Canadian background for Scottish clan ways—whether determined by history or romance—to prosper in.

¹⁰⁷ Waterston speculates that Marigold’s “beaux”, Budge and Hip Price had antecedents in LMM’s children. Budge is small and imaginative, like Stuart. Hip is a precocious flirt like Chester, who was threatening to prove, as Hip did, that minister’s sons “are the worst sometimes” (*MFM* 238).

¹⁰⁸ Dr Samuel Johnson, *A Journey to the Western Isles of Scotland*. 1775. London: Philip Allan, 1925: 61.

Screeds of lore about the "greats and grands of every degree" fill L.M. Montgomery's fiction. Genealogies are preserved as a mark of distinction whereby clans boast of their ancestors and lineage, no matter how far the sons have degenerated from the sires. The Wilcoxes in the story "Retribution", "had been wealthy once and had looked down on the Bakers [...] They were poor now but they still looked down on the Bakers" (*TRY* 18). As T.C. Smout notes, "the pride of the whole kin in their good blood [...] could be quite divorced from their own economic position or social rank".¹⁰⁹ In "By the Rule of Contrary", Miss Susan Oliver can rebuke a taunt about her kin's poverty, by replying, "We come from a good family, though" (*Altar* 78).¹¹⁰

In a changing, modernising, and increasingly fluid world, family history was an anchor and a safeguard. The "mushrooms" might make good in worldly terms, but they were kept in their "place" by genealogy. Ancestors dictate election, on earth as it is in heaven. Never mind faith or good works, one profligate forefather can scupper four generations. "Does Mrs Alec Davis forget that her uncle on her mother's side was suspected of poisoning his wife" (*RV* 159), is a fairly typical jeer from the race that knows Joseph. In small districts, no chosen clan wanted their lineage tainted or corrupted by association with the unregenerate.

The longer the history, and the greater the ancestors, the better the family. The Gardiners claim an English "lady" as a "fourth cousin", although the Countess of Medchester, married "to the earl as is uncle av yer cousin Lady Gresham" (*MP* 65), belies the Gardiner image of the aristocracy when she visits Silver Bush ("did you notice how much she looked like Mrs Snuffy Madison?" [*MP* 77]). L.M. Montgomery could laugh at her own dubious aristocratic connection (and by default those anecdotally claimed by all Scots),¹¹¹ mimicking the Eglinton link in "A Patent Medicine Testimonial".¹¹² The Melvilles claim their "name dates back to the Norman conquest when a certain Roger de Melville [...] went over to England with William the Conqueror" (*ATO* 21). Murray and Prue Melville exploit their Uncle Abimelech's overblown pride by appearing in a medicine advertisement: lest they besmirch the family name with a repeat performance, he funds the education they covet.

¹⁰⁹ T.C. Smout. *A History of the Scottish People, 1560-1830*. 1969. London: Fontana, 1973: 36.

¹¹⁰ Originally published in *Farm and Fireside*, 10 July 1908.

¹¹¹ e.g. from *The Fortunes of Nigel*: "My father's calling is mechanical," said Margaret, "but our blood is not so! I have heard my father say that we are descended, at a distance indeed, from the great Earls of Dalwolsay." "Ay, ay," said Dame Ursula; "even so—I never knew a Scot of you but was descended, as you call it, from some great house or other".

¹¹² Originally published in *Star Monthly*, April 1903, 7-8.

Local stories and hereditary prejudices are preserved in two different forms. Miss Cornelia Bryant is a community "bard". She knows the "ins and outs" of her neighbours' ancestry and shares it with newcomers of her "race". Miss Cornelia's "outsider" lore is rarely praise and paean to the deeds of the clans. She sings genealogy in gossip, usually disparaging and sometimes malicious gossip, which counteracts hubristic pride and social pretensions. Old Grandmother, on the other hand, is a bard who exalts the family name, in public at least. Judy Plum goes one better, in public and in private. Like Edith Lesley, Judy has a mystical edge, not just because her "grandmother was something av a witch" (*PSB* 31). Judy appears to have always been around, has a memory for times she never lived through, and "[w]ith her flair for picking up tales and legends she knew more of the family history than any of the Gardiners themselves did" (*PSB* 5).¹¹³

Intermarriage extended the family network and influence.¹¹⁴ In Glen St Mary, "[Abner Cromwell] was married to Julia Flagg, whose mother was a Reese and her grandmother was a Clow, so they were connected with almost every family in Four Winds" (*Aln* 185). In the story, "The Doctor's Sweetheart", Bridgeport is a village where, "with all our little disagreements and diverse opinions, we are really all one big family, and everybody feels an interest in and a good working affection for everybody else" (*TDS* 73). Yet only rarely in Montgomery's fiction are "clan" and "community" synonymous in this way. More often there *are* clear rivalries and divisions between the settlements in one area (Avonlea, White Sands, Carmody, and Spencervale for example). These hierarchies and distinctions appear to date back to the first years of settlement and are enforced by clannishness.

Clannishness is not always the preserve of the biological family however. In the short story, "The Fraser Scholarship", a school bursary stipulates that preference will be given to pupils bearing the name Fraser, Campbell or McLean (*ATO* 181).¹¹⁵ Elliott Campbell wins the scholarship over his only real rival, Carl McLean.¹¹⁶ But Elliott's true surname is Hanselpakker: after his father's death he was raised by a kindly Scotchman called Campbell. Alexander Campbell married Mrs Hanselpakker

¹¹³ Although Judy is Irish, servants who take more pride in their employers' name than the family themselves have a foothold in Scottish culture. See e.g. Scott's *The Bride of Lammermoor*, and the measures Caleb Balderstone takes to convince outsiders that the Master of Ravenswood remains wealthy.

¹¹⁴ LMM may have lamented intermarriage between the Cavendish clans, but she could laugh at it in her fiction, e.g. from "The Pot and the Kettle": "You know all the Clarks think that it isn't really proper to marry anyone totally unrelated to you" (*TRY* 259).

¹¹⁵ Originally published in *Boy's World*, April 1905.

¹¹⁶ Carl is presumably short for Carlyle, as was the case with Montgomery's half-brother Carl, and the son of the Glen St Mary manse, Thomas Carlyle Meredith; given *the* Thomas Carlyle's struggles with the Everlasting No, an amusing choice of name for the son of a minister named John Knox.

and gave Elliott his "honest name" (*ATA* 183): in honesty Elliott feels duty bound to resign the scholarship (and in a typical Montgomery "twist" gets adopted by an estranged relative called Fraser¹¹⁷). There are several levels of clannishness in this story: the benefactor who thought only of Scots-Canadian children, old Alexander determined to have his name live in his adopted son, Mrs Fraser who assumes responsibility for her long-lost nephew.

L.M. Montgomery's fiction employs a number of Scottish surnames and clan-names, Highland and Lowland, reflecting the names she heard and read, although rarely the names of those she was connected to herself. Across her work there are Campbells and Macdonalds, Knoxes and Wallaces, Camerons and MacPhees, Maxwells and McGregors. In first names her characters range from traditional Scots, and often Highland, names (Angus, Malcolm, Jean, Janet) to romantic names (Leander,¹¹⁸ Valancy, Avery, Marcella) with a glut of Old Testament ones for the older generation (Levi, Jabez, Hiram, Zillah). There is even a Delilah, a small minx who is "very proud of her Biblical name" (*AIn* 227).

Clan name was of course the fathers' name, but often male forenames are also given to *female* children. "If Leander's name had been almost anything else she might have been named for her father," says Marigold's Great-Uncle Walter. "Roberta—Georgina—Johanna—Andrea—Stephanie—Wilhelmina—" (*MFM* 12). (Uncle Klon adds "Or Davidena" which puts paid to that suggestion.¹¹⁹) There may be something Scottish in this: there seems a connection between "tiny Gilbertine" (*AIn* 107) named for Dr Gilbert Blythe, and Gavinia in Barrie's "Sentimental Tommy" books, named after Gavin Dishart, the little minister. (Babies were often named for the doctor that delivered them, such "flattery" being a tried-and-tested way of avoiding medical bills.¹²⁰)

Montgomery's very best short story, "The Quarantine at Alexander Abraham's",¹²¹ takes as its heroine a strident man-hater christened Angelina

¹¹⁷ This "twist" is one of a type that Montgomery often employs, illustrating how looks, idiosyncrasies, life-patterns are replicated across the generations. These plot-lines also indicate that in times of poor communications and Westward expansion, it was easy to lose touch with one's kin.

¹¹⁸ Leander Lesley is a rare instance where LMM uses a family name for a character: her mother's brother was named Leander, also "after him who swam the Hellespont", by Speaker Macneill. LMM's Uncle Leander was "never over-grateful" for the appellation (*SJ* II [Oct. 18. 1913] 135).

¹¹⁹ Leander's daughter cannot be called Hero because Old Grandmother "had a dog called that once" (*MFM* 13). Aunt Jamesina in *Anne of the Island*, "was called Jamesina because her father, whose name was James, was drowned at sea a month before she was born" (*AIs* 84).

¹²⁰ See David Weale. *Them Times*. Charlottetown: Institute of Island Studies, 1992: "One old-time doctor said he always hated it when he heard that a boy child was being christened with his name. In his experience it meant he probably wouldn't receive his fee" (42).

¹²¹ Originally published in *Everybody's* in April 1907, this story was included in *Chronicles of Avonlea*.

MacPherson, who chooses to be called by her middle-name, Peter, after reasoning, "It was bad enough, but not so bad as Angelina" (CA 171). The reason for "Peter" probably explains a good many, less humorous examples of the same: "If I had been a boy my parents intended to call me Peter in honour of a rich uncle" (ibid.). Men invariably held the purse strings and a name-sake could commonly expect a bequest. Jacob Donnell in *Anne of Avonlea* is so-named for a rich bachelor uncle—who appalls the connection by making a late marriage and having children of his own—thus Mrs Donnell's decision to change Jake to St Clair (AA 48-9).

Such feuds—rarely involving physical contests and often rising from trivial things—are integral to clan identity in Montgomery's fiction. Gossip itself is a form of feud: if Montgomery's clans stop boasting of their own achievements, it is to gloat over the follies of others, with a victorious self-satisfaction that confirms their own election. Two neighbours in an early short story battle like geese about geese and in the resulting *mêlée*, "[e]very old family scandal for the last three generations was cast up . . . when it got to be a family affair people took it up. Somebody called it the 'Goose Feud' and the name stuck".¹²² Montgomery's "goose feuds" often have less identifiable beginnings: "Between the Hollands and the Pyes, root and branch, existed a feud that dated back for three generations. That the original cause of the quarrel was totally forgotten did not matter; it was a matter of family pride that a Holland should have no dealings with a Pye" ("In Her Selfless Mood" FCA 155).

Feuds are sometimes preserved only by the older clansmen: "There was an ancient feud between the two families that had died out among the younger generation, but was still potent with the older" ("Emily's Husband" TDS 42). All the preserved genealogies and clan pride in the world would not stop the offspring from becoming Canadians for whom the old feuds were a throwback to a forgotten age. For cantankerous characters, recognising some of their own clan traits in young fry sometimes overcomes feud and brings about reconciliation.¹²³

Stephen Leacock satirised many aspects of the "Scotch" story in "Hannah of the Highlands", and the Highland "feud"—"one of those painful divisions by which the life of the Scotch people is broken into fragments" (*Nonsense Novels* 98)—was an obvious target. Hannah McShamus talks to "a McWhinus, a thing that no McShamus had done for a hundred and fifty years" after a fight about how to achieve damnation had resulted in murder: "With each generation the differences between the

¹²² Published under the name "Maud Cavendish", "The Goose Feud" appeared in *Arthur's Home Magazine*, April 1907 (Scrapbook 7, labelled 1893-1896, CM. 67.5.13).

¹²³ In an early version of the Norman Douglas/ Faith Meredith encounter, fiery Daniel Dunbar is reunited with his estranged daughter Agnes, when Agnes's daughter gives vent to her own fiery temper, proving that she is, as the title of the story says, "The Chip of the Old Block". Originally published in the *Springfield Republican* 6 January 1907 (Scrapbook 8, unlabelled, CM.67.5.16.).

two families became more acute. They differed on every possible point. They wore different tartans, sat under different ministers, drank different brands of whisky, and upheld different doctrines in regard to eternal punishment" (99).

Unfortunately, Montgomery could write precisely the sort of risible story that Leacock mocked. "The Letters", published in *National Magazine* in November of 1910,¹²⁴ may even have been a direct antecedent for "Hannah of the Highlands" (published in 1911). "The Letters" is narrated by a woman but a stone's throw from Leacock's Marie Mushenough (a lampoon of Marie Bashkirtseff).¹²⁵ Isobel Shirley is a miserable portrait of a dutiful daughter, dutiful to a father whom, as Isobel wails, "had never forgiven me for two things. I had cost my mother's life and I was not a son to perpetuate the old name and carry on the family feud with the Frasers" (*ATM* 116). Isobel has such a sorrowful life that she "rather took a pride" in the feud, and finds it "good satisfying passion".

Old feuds demand unquestioning allegiance from the clansmen. Pride in the family name outweighs common-sense and practicality. Traditions are honoured no matter if they are irrelevant or if their origin has been lost in the mists of time. Isobel Shirley (whose tyrannical father has much in common with Leacock's Oyster McOyster) never explains the cause of the Fraser/ Shirley feud, only that the two races are enemies. But, predictably, Alan Fraser has fallen in love with Isobel at a chance encounter in their youth. Early seen unknown, their only love sprung from their only hate—of course—it is not too late for love to blot out the old feud forever (*ATM* 128). Slumpy, mushy, and ever so twee, "The Letters" makes roaring trade from several stereotypes of the "Highland Scotch" clan.

* * *

This overload of Scotch sentiment begs one last question: are *English* clans in Montgomery's fiction any different to their *Scottish* counterparts? The Darks and Penhallows and the Stirlings are purportedly English-Canadians. (Both novels for "grown-ups" shift from Scottish to English families.) On the face of it—the bossing, the carping, the tangled web of connections—there seems little in the name "English" or "Scottish".

¹²⁴ "The Letters" was later reprinted in *MacLean's* in 1915, and in *Across the Miles*.

¹²⁵ "Sorrows of a Super Soul: or The Memoirs of Marie Mushenough", *Nonsense Novels* 80-92. cf. Leacock's "I passed a flower in my walk today. It grew in the meadow beside the river bank. It stood dreaming on a long stem. I knew its name. It was Tchupvskja. I love beautiful names. I leaned over and spoke to it. I asked it if my heart would ever know love. It said it thought so" (81-82) with Montgomery's "The poor dead leaves—yet not quite dead! There was still enough unquiet life left in them to make them restless and forlorn . . . I felt sorry for the leaves as I watched them" (*ATM* 115).

The Stirlings are inter-dependent, they have a family ethos, they gather together for feast days, they have a long and exulted Canadian history. But the Stirling clan are prepared to quickly disown Valancy when she goes "dippy". As an "old maid" she was already by way of being a clan disgrace. In nursing Cissy Gay she becomes a social humiliation. Unlike Emily's Aunt Ruth, who defends her niece against community gossip (*EC* Ch. 21 "Thicker than Water"), the Stirlings concur with the community judgement on Valancy's conduct. They seek outside help, medical and spiritual, to bring her back to the fold. But Valancy cares little for family pride and the family name. She derives a righteous pleasure from openly and honestly mocking her relations. Valancy does not disown her mother entirely, but she asks God's forgiveness for obeying Mrs Frederick—and the Stirling family traditions—for so long (*TBC* 143).

The Darks and Penhallows of Bay Silver are Montgomery's most conspicuously interwoven clan: "In three generations sixty Darks had been married to sixty Penhallows" (*ATW* 1). The "resultant genealogical tangle" may be difficult to preserve, but Uncle Pippin swears he knows it from A to Z and Miller Dark is writing a history of the clan. The Darks and Penhallows are Presbyterian, and assured of their election ("A Penhallow couldn't go anywhere but to the right place" [95]). Ostensibly English, they have first names like Angus and Hugh and Pennycuik.¹²⁶ Aunt Becky reigns as chief. The clan are proud defenders of their race: "Peter Penhallow, meeting a fellow Islander somewhere along the Congo, slapped his face because the said Islander laughed over Thekla Dark having once flavoured some gingerbread with mustard" (34).

Peter Penhallow, however, has also tried his best to escape the clan. He travels the world in search of adventure and has a strong hatred for some of his fellow Penhallows, stemming from a feud over worried sheep and a hung dog. He thinks that his family are full of "sham", they "[h]ad to be, or they couldn't have carried on as a clan at all" (32). There are several similar indications that the clan influence is less than healthy. When Pennycuik tries to avoid matrimony, he growls "there were enough Darks and Penhallows in the world without his contributing to anymore [...] Better let the cursed breed die out" (165). The clan women in particular are stifled by traditional clan mores and long to escape these restrictions. Gay, Nan, Joscelyn, Donna, and Margaret all complain about the clan, and act counter to accepted clan propriety, consequences and chances of inheriting the jug go hang.

These rejections of clanship may reflect English origins, and different ideas of "clan" loyalty. But there are too many differences between *A Tangled Web* and

¹²⁶ A town near Edinburgh, Penicuik was at one time the charge of the Rev S.R. Crockett.

Montgomery's other work to give simple answers. It is set within a family with little indication that there is a world outside the family. *A Tangled Web* [1931] is a modern social comedy of manners about modern folks who own cars and have their moles removed by electrolysis. Its adult audience gave Montgomery a mandate to be a little more risqué, to find a few more skeletons in the clan closet that she had ever acknowledged before. A continent of readers familiar with novels like *Flaming Youth* and *Elmer Gantry* and *Strange Fugitive* (to name a few that Montgomery herself read) would hardly balk when they read that there was a stain on Uncle Pippin's birth ("Your mother always vowed you were Ned Penhallow's son, but I can tell you some of us had our doubts" [4]) or that Artemas Dark had committed "certain violations of his marriage vow of which everyone was aware" (56), or that there was it was "certain *some* Dark" fathered a "child down at the harbour" (24).

There is certainly no one thing about either Darks or Penhallows or Stirlings that marks them as English, just as Montgomery's Scots clans are less seldom specifically named as either Highlanders or Lowlanders than portrayed as just Scots. This may perhaps be ignorance on Montgomery's part, but it also reflects the fact that, after a hundred odd years of settlement, the ethnicity of P.E. Islanders was less easily differentiated. But as the above study shows, Scotland, in all its history and literary romance, prevailed as the dominant influence on family life in Montgomery's Prince Edward Island.

Conclusion

L.M. Montgomery thought her Island upbringing qualified her to fictionalise the Island clans. These clans were not replicated literally from life, but like her characters, were familiar "types"; generalised certainly, but still largely authentic. Montgomery's own clans were naturally the main inspiration. Consequently, the majority of her heroes and heroines are descended from Scottish pioneers whose early emigration, and subsequent Island history, established them as a chosen people. All belong to a "fine race", nationality as well as family. As they are also "not colorless or negligible", there is repeatedly a family legend that separates the elect clan from the reprobates in the common herd.

The Murrays of New Moon were closest in background and temperament to L.M. Montgomery's forebears. Macneill pride is reproduced, and Macneill Presbyterianism, but the oppressive regime is tempered by a redeeming Montgomery streak that generates in Emily a need to belong rather than to escape. Emily's clan

background fuses (as Kilmeny's does) Lowland and Highland influences to create an idealised and ideal Scottish heritage that allows for romance and passion as well as industriousness and level-headedness. Even where Montgomery's Islanders are nominally Lowlanders, or English even, Gaelic clanship and clannishness comes into play, partly no doubt due to the force of the Highland clan in the popular imagination.

However, the "Emily" trilogy is reflective, as much a part of the pre-war "still waters" as were Anne's early adventures. *The Blue Castle* and *Magic for Marigold* were distractions from the Emily books, and in each the study of clan covers un-Murray-like ground. Only by remaining in the bosom of her family does Emily find expression as a Canadian writer. Only by fleeing her family with a Canadian writer does Valancy discover herself, although the riches she accumulates reinstate her in the Family Bible (*TBC* 215). Marigold enjoys a greater degree of independence than Emily. In post-war Canadian society, affiliations to old world ways were thought out-moded and potentially stifling. "Clan" provides history, and also some romance, but clan bequests (like the Dark jug) are potential hazards. There is a fine line between spirited and tyrannous clan chiefs. Aunt Becky's death is witness to a regretted demise of the old ways ("You've always made history for us somehow" [*ATW* 75]) but also kick starts the younger clansfolk into an examination of what is meaningful. Envy and uncharitableness (250), the unpleasant face of clannishness, are dealt a blow when the heirloom is smashed.

Clan had always been double-edged in Montgomery's fiction, but the "Pat" books explore a new extreme. In a world where social structures are increasingly fluid, Pat becomes neurotic about protecting the Gardiner image familiar from Judy's mythology. Although Judy is a snob (she submits an account of the Countess of Medchester's visit to the local press) and an unreliable narrator, Pat joins her in "a silent rage" (*MP* 42) each time the Gardiner mystique and Silver Bush—like Jane Duncan's Reachfar, "the one unchanging place in a world of constant change"¹²⁷—are threatened. This is particularly pronounced in *Mistress Pat*, where the Binnie family symbolise the dissolution that old family oligarchies face in a democratic Canada. (May Binnie burns down Silver Bush.) Being part of "the good old stock" no longer guarantees social prominence, or even respect, for the Gardiners are considered "old-fashioned" by their neighbours (*PSB* 6). Montgomery does not undermine tradition itself, but Pat's nostalgia and conservatism are portrayed as not only out-of-step, but ultimately destructive.

¹²⁷ Jane Duncan. *My Friends The Miss Boyds*. 1959, London: Corgi, 1987: 212.

Montgomery preserved old world genealogy and family-lore in her fight against Canadian standardisation and Americanisation. But where all that remained of the glorious past was memory, the rulings of the “elite” could spill over into social fascism, as Anne finds in Summerside, where Sara Pringle dictates a totalitarian regime. Victoria Kennedy (*Jane of Lantern Hill*) is a menacing autocrat with none of Elizabeth Murray’s or Edith Lesley’s saving humanity. “Clan” in Montgomery’s fiction connects Scottish romance to Canadian history, but when another European conflict seemed likely, and her own sons were of an age to fight, Montgomery perceived both the threat of dictators and the threat of old alliances.

II.iii.

Love Thy Neighbour?

"For what do we live, but to make sport for our neighbours, and laugh at them in our turn?"

Jane Austen. *Pride and Prejudice*. Ch. 57.

"There can't be any doubt that the exhortation to love our neighbour as ourselves is a proper and edifying one; but it is a hard thing to do when one has a neighbour like Susanna Johnson."

L.M. Montgomery. "The After-Thanksgiving Story".¹

Mr Charles Macneill was by way of a "local joke" in Cavendish. Born in 1832, the son of a Perthshire native, Charles Macneill lived on the road that led east from central Cavendish. From this vantage point on a thoroughfare popular for "after-meeting drives", Mr Charles was well-placed to monitor comings and goings. But he also kept a "spy-glass" to help him in his surveillance, which he "invariably trained on everybody who walked or drove down the road". Thus the local joke, although L.M. Montgomery remarked with irritation that she "never went down that road in daytime without feeling that spy glass focused on the small of my back".²

In 1925, Montgomery transcribed Macneill's log-book into her journal. Mr Charles's diary could give the impression that he was a misanthropic character, venting spleen at nights while his grown-up children gallivanted to pie socials and I.O.F. meetings, Baptist prayers and "missions" to the "Scotch" or the "American Jews".³ By day, however, Charles Macneill was in the hub of Cavendish sociability,

¹ Originally published in *Epworth Herald*, 12 December 1908, Scrapbook 11, unlabelled, CM. 67.5.24.

² LMM transcribed Charles Macneill's diary into her journal in an unpublished entry of Mar. 1, 1925, pp. 242 to 327, and followed it with a commentary. The surviving entries of Charles Macneill's diary were kept Aug. 7, 1892-Mar. 15, 1893; Jan. 14, 1896-June 7, 1896; Feb. 6, 1897-Nov. 4, 1898. I am indebted to Dr Mary Rubio for the loan of copies of Charles Macneill's diary, LMM's annotations, and the diary kept by LMM and Nora Lefurgey.

³ See Macneill's diary entries, Feb. 24 1896, Feb. 13, 1897, Mar. 14, 1897. LMM writes, "[Charles Macneill] was always very satirical about his boys' little outings. He had an odd habit of writing that

calling on neighbours, sharing agricultural machinery, buying and selling and getting gain from crops and fish, livestock and labour. Montgomery appended a commentary wherein she recalled, "No one liked better than he to see folks drop in. He loved to talk to everyone, getting all the local news. You always heard all the local gossip at 'Charles's'. [The family] were not malicious. But they never read books or papers and their only amusement was their interest in the doings of their small world".⁴

Such "doings" as the Charles Macneills amused themselves over, of course, were the stuff of L.M. Montgomery's novels. She trains her "spy-glass" on Cavendish and Island communities like it, although she laughs at Mrs Rachel Lynde and her "all-seeing eye" (*AGG* 10) and characters like Selena Ford ("The Romance of Jedediah") whom "people said, had married James Ford for no other reason than that his house commanded a view of nearly every doorstep in Amberly" (*AMD* 50). Like Mr Charles, Maud Montgomery took an active interest in her neighbours, "even if" she, like him, "might write a sarcastic sentence about them in [her] diary that evening" (Mar. 1, 1925: U.6.), or sarcastic words in her fiction.

The Narrow Groove

The 1890s were a golden age in L.M. Montgomery's recollection, "a world where happiness reigned and problems were non-existent".⁵ She returned to this era often in fiction: the first five "Anne" books are set the last decades of the nineteenth century,⁶ *Emily of New Moon* in the 1890s, the "Story Girl" books and *Kilmeny* in a similar (although unidentified) period. As Mr Charles did not romanticise or edit for a potential audience, his 1890s' diary is an interesting companion piece to Montgomery's journals and fiction. Workaday and homely in detail, 1890s' Cavendish "lives again" in his commonplaces (Mar. 1, 1925: U.6.).

Presbyterian Mr Charles devoted most entries to his work-ethic. Each day is an inventory of tasks done, whether sowing hay seed, stumping trees, ploughing fields or feeding livestock. Other days, Charles would share threshing machinery, barter wood for apples, buy mackerel or codfish, sell pork or cow-hides. Montgomery recollected her own work in the fields, "I used to build a load [of grain] now and then

they had 'gone on a mission' to the Scotch or 'the American Jews' when they took some of their lady friends driving" (Mar. 1, 1925).

⁴ In actual fact, Mr Charles makes several references to reading newspapers—the *Guardian*, the *Patriot*, the *Montreal Witness*—in his diary.

⁵ Mar. 1, 1925: U.6. In the first two months of 1925 "[e]arthquakes—eclipse of the sun—disruption of the Presbyterian church" were "signs and wonders" (*SJ* III [Feb. 28, 1925] 220) portentous enough to send LMM scurrying back into the safety of nostalgia.

⁶ i.e. *Green Gables*, *Avonlea*, *Island*, *Windy Willows*, *House of Dreams*.

myself. Of course I never had much of this work to do but almost every summer there came an afternoon when rain threatened and men were scarce and 'we youngsters' were pressed into emergency service". She had also "done a little 'stooking'" in her time—building wheat into "stooks" in the fields⁷—and "tramped" straw in lofts or sheds.

In Montgomery's novels female children undertake certain farm chores. Emily takes charge of the cows, Anne likewise. Children earn "egg money" from the hens, Emily plants potatoes (*ENM* 178). However, Anne and her friends are never excused from school for an afternoon's haying. (When prim Diana cuts potato sets she does her "hands up in lemon juice and kid gloves every night" [*Als* 103].) In the First World War, Mary Vance and Susan Baker help stack grain, but genteel Rilla elects to work in the store, believing she would not "be much use in a harvest field [...] though lots of girls are" (*RI* 250). Jane Stuart alone among Montgomery's girl-heroines engages in a variety of farm labours—shingling barn roofs (*JLH* 181), driving in the hay (173), "bugging potatoes" (118)—but Jane belongs to a different age, and her friends are homely farmers, neither prim nor genteel.

Although *Anne of Green Gables* initially nails its agricultural colours to the mast—"Thomas Lynde [...] was sowing his late turnip seed on the hill field beyond the barn; and Matthew Cuthbert ought to have been sowing his on the red brook field" (*AGG* 2)—this farming life, like the life of the longshore fishermen, is a murmur in the background of Montgomery's fiction. She faithfully attends to matters of seasons and farming lore when writing her novels,⁸ but the hard graft of the farm rarely impinges on her heroines' romances. Readers would have only limited interest in tattie howking presumably. "Exciting" adults are those with other livelihoods: the blacksmiths, the medicine peddlers, the sea-captains.

Montgomery's revision of the relentless slog of rural life is also evident with regard to weather. Charles Macneill's diary may follow the Scottish tendency to look on the climatological bleak side, but persistent bad weather could raise the literary ire of a farmer forced to rise at two in the morning to save his crops from a sudden storm (Sept. 5, 1892). He regularly fought the elements, like the Cavendish residents who banked their houses with seaweed to insulate against the cold. In *Anne of Green Gables*, January weather does not prevent Marilla and the Lyndes from travelling to

⁷ The word "stooks" is a Scots term for shocks. For a description and pictures of hay stooking and stacking, see Alexander Fenton. *Country Life in Scotland: Our Rural Past*. 1987. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1991: 119-125.

⁸ LMM attained top marks in Agriculture at P.W.C. College (*SJ* 1 403n). Anne also studies agriculture and finds out "at last what makes the [Island] roads red" (*AGG* 161-162).

Charlottetown to see John A. Macdonald,⁹ nor Anne from crossing the snow-cruised fields to Orchard Slope. Fictional winter means sleigh rides and fur-robies and concerts and Christmas gifts; "the ploughed fields were stretches of snowy dimples [...] there was a crisp tang in the air that was glorious" (AGG 228). When the weather in Avonlea is atrocious, it is by way of a cataclysmic event, like Uncle Abe's storm in *Anne of Avonlea*.

Paradoxically, winter in Cavendish was a time of social activity: the Friday night Literary Society did not convene when farm-work occupied the light summer evenings. Chief among social delights were fund-raisers for various religious groups: Halifax College, Famine Funds, orphan homes, educating American children.¹⁰ As might be expected from Montgomery's fiction, where children invariably keep a "mite box" for "the heathen", foreign missions were the largest concern.¹¹ Children like Marigold or the King cousins were inveigled by visiting missionaries at special prayer meetings.¹² Pie socials, concerts, and what Mr Charles described as a "Tea Squall" (Mar. 20, 1896) combined charity with fun,¹³ by adding the spice of courtship.¹⁴ Thus Mr Charles's growls when his children betook themselves to church and Y.P.U., where Nora and Maud feigned to swoon over local bachelors.

Conflict between the old and young notwithstanding, these entertainments still met with marginally less hostility from Charles Macneill than did door-to-door "begging" missions. In a story like "By Grace of Julius Caesar",¹⁵ where two women doorstep their neighbours so the church can have new pew-cushions, or episodes such as Anne's and Diana's trip to the Newbridge road hunting up subscriptions for re-shingling and painting the community hall (*Anne of Avonlea* Ch. 6), Montgomery shows, no doubt from personal experience, that Mr Charles was not alone in begrudging the collector. "Folks are everlasting begging for money here," says J.A. Harrison, when he moves to Avonlea (AA 83).

⁹ The editors of *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables* point out that "No prime minister would choose to visit Charlottetown in the dead of winter, because of the danger of having the Strait freeze over and not being able to get out" (199n).

¹⁰ See entries dated Aug. 21, 1892, Mar. 13, 1897, Jan. 9, 1898, Jan. 10, 1898, respectively.

¹¹ This recalls Peter Craig's denominational dilemma; whether to collect for the Presbyterian or Methodist heathen (TSG 85).

¹² Less spiritual children, like Gwennie Vincent, were inspired only by the missionaries' "cannibal yarns" (MFM 142).

¹³ It seems that "socials" were also held to help local folk, such as one which raised forty dollars for Ewan J. Mackenzie (Feb. 9, 1897).

¹⁴ LMM termed pie socials—where the village men bid for pies baked by the girls—"the abomination of desolation" (SJI [Apr. 4, 1899] 236).

¹⁵ Originally published in *Red Book Magazine*, Jan. 1908, and *Canadian Magazine*, Sept. 1908, "By Grace of Julius Caesar" was reprinted in *The Doctor's Sweetheart*.

The Cavendish Presbyterian minister's charge also included Rustico, New Glasgow, and Stanley. Mr Charles's Sunday entries often record that his children drove to Rustico in the forenoon for preaching, returning to Cavendish for evening service.¹⁶ The life of a country minister in wintertime was hard when roads and weather were awful. Some Sundays Charles Macneill noted that the Island roads—just red earth after all and apt to turn sludgy—were so bad that even Cavendish kirk was inaccessible: "Stormy day. Nobody went to church to-day. Snowing very thick. Roads very heavy". This sheds a different light on rural worship than, say, Montgomery's Avonlea novels, where Mr Allan preaches "magnificent sermons" (*AGG* 286) each week, to his spring and sun-soaked parishioners. In real-life, "we went to church on Sunday night but Mr. Mac [Rev Major MacIntosh] did not come" (Mar. 3, 1903 NL), or "[i]t is pouring rain and we have no preaching anywhere within come-at-able distance" (Mar. 21, 1903 NL).¹⁷

Nora Lefurgey noted with a mocking sigh, "the only social function that Cavendish knows [is] a funeral" (May 6, 1903 NL). Mr Charles for one was more interested in funerals than weddings. Weddings had changed from the large affairs of the olden times to small family events by the 1890s.¹⁸ (At Montgomery's own wedding there were few guests.) With funerals, on the other hand, it was customary for all within get-at-able distance to pay their respects, and the status of the deceased was calculated by how many wagons turned out.¹⁹ Ewen C. Mackenzie netted forty-five wagons [May 4, 1896], Mrs George Houston about eighty-five, with three ministers officiating [Oct. 14, 1897]: to neither, then, came as many wagons as to Mrs Roderick MacAllister's "tremendous funeral" where "over one hundred and twenty carriages [joined] in the procession" (*AHD* 68).

There was little privacy surrounding death. Neighbours knew the circumstances—"Mrs Macneill was making [Big George Macneill] a drink when he fell over and expired. He never spoke after he fell" (Nov. 4, 1898)—and even the content of wills: "[Alexander Marquis Macneill] left the farm to John Franklin and

¹⁶ Other times Charles Macneill's children frequent the Baptist church in Cavendish, mid-week prayer meetings in either church, or an Anglican service. The one allusion to LMM in this journal occurs when she goes to the "English Church", at South Rustico where her Woolner great grandparents were buried.

¹⁷ These entries are from the diary kept by LMM and Nora Lefurgey (NL), 19 Jan. 1903 to 23 June 1903, preserved in the typescript of LMM's journals, pp. 113-147. LMM and NL lost contact when NL married and moved to Western Canada but their friendship resumed when NL moved to Toronto in 1928. In 1929 LMM referred to reading these old "comic" diaries over with NL (*SJ* III [Feb. 24, 1929] 390).

¹⁸ Walter Simpson, in "Cavendish in the Olden Times", describes an old-fashioned wedding as "a social affair [which] lasted two days", with everyone in the community invited.

¹⁹ Even in winter months, funerals took place quickly, between one and three days later after death. (Matthew Cuthbert was buried after two days [*AGG* 337].)

his money in the bank and stock to his wife" (Mar. 8, 1898). Gossip was rife. When James Laird died in January of 1898 there was "great consternation" in Cavendish for no will could be found (Feb. 3, 1898).

Gossip was rarely matters of state, however. Mrs Murray Robertson [Emily Woolner] told Charles the exciting news that she weighed 149 lbs (June 25, 1898). At times he appears to feel excluded from the female world of chatter: "There is a deputation of New Glasgow girls gone down to Alberts', Laura Houston and Jennie Stevenson. Business affairs of state" (Mar. 19, 1898). "Ma" [his wife] provoked his wrath if she kept stayed away from home, visiting their children, or putting "in a good half day talking" to Aunt Bell (Mar 11. 1898). He likely missed little. Montgomery made one list of "all the gossip in C.," namely "that Everett has got out again after his three days 'retreat' in bed, that Wilber 'sat out' Garfield last Saturday night at 'Hughie's', and that Mrs Will Sandy is hooking mats for Townsend, that Pierce and Albert have had a fight, that Neil S. has made an excellent choice, and that Nora's influence over Gordon is considered adverse to his spiritual life" (Mar. 28, 1903).

Hooking bees and so forth, were the female face of community co-operation. Only certain households had a sewing machine; many hands were needed to cut rags and hook rugs, to piece quilts on large wooden frames. For seasonal farm labour, Charles Macneill depended on local French-Canadians. Acadians fill Charles Macneill's diary, but in Montgomery's journals and fiction are but a fleeting presence. She was not impervious to the "romance" in her French-Canadian neighbours, reproduced in characters like Lazarre (*Magic for Marigold*) who comes from the Grand Pré of Longfellow's *Evangeline* (28).²⁰ However, Montgomery's fiction more often gives the impression that she, like Paul Irving's Scottish grandmother, believes "the French have to be kept in their place" (AA 189). Montgomery insisted that she, "always liked our French folk. They were generally a good-natured, happy-go-lucky obliging lot", but added, "the only thing I disliked was a certain smutty streak which was carefully concealed from our older people but was now and then allowed to peep out before us children".

Cavendish life was supplemented by the economic and social diversity of nearby towns and farther-away markets. Mr Charles was beset with eye problems, but had to trek to New Glasgow or Charlottetown for medical care. (This recalls

²⁰ See also, LMM's short-story, "Françoise", where a French-Canadian girl is wooed by an English man bent on seducing her, not marrying her: "Her beauty was of a more animated and delicate style than that of her compatriots—the traits of some old and forgotten ancestors in sunny France must have cropped out in Françoise." Published in *Waverley Magazine*, 14 July 1900. Scrapbook 2, labelled "Scrapbook 1898—Stories and Poems", CM.67.5.18.

Marilla Cuthbert's need to go to town to see a travelling oculist [AGG 342].) He regularly journeyed to Summerside or Charlottetown to lay in supplies of tea, sugar, beans, rice. Animals were taken to market in the larger towns with links off-Island, although butchers visited rural districts (Feb. 16, 1893), like Mr Shearer who buys Anne's rampant Jersey cow (*Anne of Avonlea*). If the Macneill men needed boots or suits, mending or buying, they went to Stanley Bridge. In dietary terms, the Canadian village was rich in resources. Of course turnips and potatoes and oats were plentiful, and little meat was consumed in ordinary households, but ducks and geese and chickens and fish, apples and pears and lemons and rhubarb,²¹ supplemented this traditional Scottish diet.

* * *

C. is a narrow farming settlement (for all the world like the "Drumtochty" of Ian McLaren's [*sic*] delightful stories in many of its characteristics) fronting on the Gulf of St Lawrence. It is about three miles long and one wide. The narrow homestead farms front onto the gulf and on each one is a house (*My Dear Mr. M* [Nov. 9, 1904] 6).

The Cavendish homesteads were principally linked by one road, running east to west, connecting the farm lands as they spilled south from the shore. Half way along its length was the Presbyterian church. With a road running north to south at this bisection, the kirk was at the centre of the settlement. The Baptist church was located at the reaches of Cavendish, a late-comer on a site where uncultivated land could be spared. The community hall was the only public building, churches aside, but folks foregathered to talk "local news" at the post-office, the forge at Hillman's, in the churchyards, and each other's homes.

As the original land holdings had been subdivided, close clansfolk lived near each other. Every household had a Scottish name and Scottish blood for their primary ancestry. The Mackenzies and Lairds were grouped in the east. The two Simpson and two Clark households lay westward near their Bayview kin. The Cavendish litany still had some resonance, but in the 1890s the Macneills greatly outnumbered the other clans.²² Among the founding families sufficient time had passed to create divisions, exacerbated by political differences and, most obviously, by the religious schism. Although most settlers were farmers, snobbery was prevalent. Newer immigrants living on the farmlands that skirted the original land-holdings faced some discrimination and many value-judgements. The surrounding area was home to many French-Canadians, poorer than their Scots neighbours, who hired out as labour on the

²¹ The rhubarb may have been used as a medicine—it is a purgative—not a foodstuff.

²² There were two Macneill clans: LMM and Mr Charles were not blood-relatives. LMM's Great-aunt Helen (sister of Alexander Marquis Macneill) was Charles Macneill's mother.

larger farms, and were particularly visible in the fishing industry that supplemented the agricultural economy.

The “community” encompassed several North Shore settlements—Cavendish, Bayview, Rustico, Mayfield, New Glasgow, Stanley²³—linked by road and by parish. Horse-drawn sleighs or wagons were the main mode of transport—the nearest railway station was ten miles distant at Hunter River—which restricted travel in winter, when worship and “socials” were cancelled, and labour was hindered. In the summer months the rural world expanded. Fishing and sailing broadened the horizons. Trips to Charlottetown and Summerside, for business and for pleasure, became more frequent. Although many settlers had relocated to more distant parts of the Island, or to mainland Canada and the United States, just as many had stayed in the North Shore area, creating the impression of a fairly static world.

Church concerts, imported newspapers and periodicals, the Literary Society and lending library, kept alive local intellects nurtured in the village school and Island colleges. Yet Cavendish also had its share of “clodhoppers” (a term Montgomery used) and local residents were wise to the mental deficiencies of their neighbours. Indeed, Cavendish folks were duty bound, by religion, by convention, and by sheer nosiness, to monitor the intellectual, spiritual, and moral behaviour of others. Little remained secret. This undoubtedly created an atmosphere of tension and suspicion, in addition to one of genuine concern, but gossip and rumour were also at the heart of a vigorous oral culture.

Cavendish was conservative in practice and in outlook. The Presbyterians and Baptists fought with each other over points of faith but there was a Christian consensus on acceptable behaviour. Nevertheless, life in the 1890s was on the verge of change. In 1890, Cavendish folks marked their centenary at a party where “[n]othing occurred to mar in any way the pleasure of the day. Not a loud word was heard, not a sign of intoxication to be seen”.²⁴ Walter Simpson’s history for *The Prince Edward Island Magazine* [1899-1900] consummated this local celebration in their own golden past.²⁵ This was a time to take stock, and to view the community’s early days as an age that was passed. As the community changed from a settlement of Scots immigrants, to a settlement of Islanders, to a settlement of Canadians, new

²³ In *Anne of Green Gables*, Hunter River became Bright River, Stanley became Carmody, Rustico became White Sands, New Glasgow became New Bridge. See Wendy E. Barry. “The Geography of *Anne of Green Gables*.” *The Annotated Anne* 415-418.

²⁴ Cited from newspaper report by H.H. Simpson, *Cavendish: Its History, Its People* 146.

²⁵ “Cavendish in the Olden Times.” *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. Dec. 1899 (Vol. 1:10), Jan. 1900 (Vol. 1:11), Apr. 1900 (Vol. 2:2), May 1900 (Vol. 2:3) and July 1900 (Vol. 2:5).

identities were born. This engendered conflict between generations and between genders, as old customs and beliefs were questioned.

The Brier Bush Garden

Cavendish was no more an “idyll” than anyplace else: people behaved badly toward each other, tragedies occurred, life could be boring, oppressive, and narrow. More people than Montgomery had to “struggle against influences and traditions” they were not responsible for. Yet L.M. Montgomery’s community fictions are repeatedly classed as “regional idylls”, wherein all things work together for good.²⁶ Janice Kulyk Keefer finds a “corrective subtext to the Avonlea idyll” (195) in the first two-thirds of *Anne of Green Gables*, but deems the rest of the series, “with few exceptions complacently idyllic” (198).²⁷

Margaret Atwood describes Avonlea as “simply reality edited”.²⁸ But there is little of the “simple” about L.M. Montgomery’s editing. Atwood continues:

[Montgomery] was determined to write from what she knew: not the whole truth perhaps, but not a total romanticization either. Rooms and clothes and malicious gossip are described much as they were, and people talk in the vernacular minus the swear words—but then, the people we hear speaking are mostly “respectable” women, who would not have sworn anyway. This world was familiar to me through the stories told me by my Maritime parents and aunts: the sense of community and “family,” the horror of being “talked about,” the smug rectitude, the distrust of outsiders, the sharp division between what was “respectable” and what was not, as well as the pride in hard work and respect for achievement, all are faithfully depicted by Montgomery (224).

Montgomery tamed the world she grew up in, but also twisted it, exaggerated it, romanticised it, made it more exciting, although never so much so that it ceased to be a recognisable “real” Canadian scene. Atwood responds to an environment she identifies as Maritime, but it clearly has discernible Scottish roots.

L.M. Montgomery declared that she would never write “a problem novel for four reasons. The first reason is that a problem novel never yet solved any problem; the second is that most folks have problems enough in their own lives and want something different when they seek a little rest and relaxation in a book; and the third and fourth reasons are—I don’t want to”.²⁹ Yet, although Montgomery repeatedly

²⁶ e.g. T.D. MacLulich. “*Anne of Green Gables* and the Regional Idyll”. *Dalhousie Review* 63.3 [1983]: 488-501.

²⁷ Janice Kulyk Keefer. *Under Eastern Eyes: A Critical Reading of Maritime Fiction*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1987.

²⁸ Margaret Atwood. “Revisiting Anne”. *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* 222-226.

²⁹ Newspaper article, “I Dwell Among My Own People.” Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

set her face against modernist writers and gritty realism, Anne Shirley learns not to “write anything but what might happen in Avonlea” (*AGG* 291). Montgomery thought *Canadian* literature should be realistic, neither grim nor over-ornate (no “flowery passages” [*Als* 111]). Emily receives similar advice: “Don’t be—led away—by those howls about realism. Remember—pine woods are just as real as—pigstyes—and a darn sight pleasanter to be in” (*EQ* 31).³⁰

Here Montgomery echoes a journal entry she made in 1928 after reading a Canadian “problem” novel—or, as she termed it, “sex novel”—Morley Callaghan’s *Strange Fugitive*:

Callaghan’s idea of “Literature” seems to be to photograph a latrine or a pigstye [*sic*] meticulously and have nothing else in the picture. Now, latrines and pigstyes are not only malodorous but very uninteresting. We have a latrine in our backyard. I see it when I look that way, and I also see before it a garden of color and perfume—over it a blue sky—behind it a velvety pine caressing crystal air—a river of silver and aquamarine—misty hills of glamour beyond. These things are as “real” as the latrine and can all be seen at the same time. Callaghan sees nothing but the latrine and insists blatantly that you see nothing else. If you insist on seeing sky and river and pine you are a “sentimentalist” and the truth is not in you (*SJ* III [Dec. 30, 1928] 387).

This is reminiscent of an opinion of “literature” expressed by the Rev John Watson:

There are such things as drains, and sometimes they may have to be opened, but one would not for choice have one opened in his library . . . We believe that the surest test of a good novel is that it leaves a pleasant flavour behind.³¹

Rev John Watson [1850-1907], better known as “Ian Maclaren”, James Matthew Barrie [1860-1937], and Rev Samuel Rutherford Crockett [1860-1914], are regarded as the principal exemplars of the “Kailyard School”: a group of novelists “editing” Scottish reality in the 1880s and 90s.³²

Ever since George Douglas Brown created his embittered portrait of Scottish rural life in *The House with the Green Shutters* [1901] “to show the dogs” who wrote such “sentimental slop” what he “thought of them”,³³ nadirs of the Kailyard genre,

³⁰ Paradoxically, LMM makes good use of pig-sties. Davy Keith makes Dora walk along the pig-pen fence, “I fell off into the pig-pen and my dress got all dirty and the pig runned right over me” (*AA* 79). Dandy Dark loses the name of the Dark jug’s new owner when he is feeding his pigs.

³¹ See Thomas D. Knowles, *Ideology, Art and Commerce: Aspects of Literary Sociology in the Late Victorian Scottish Kailyard*. Gothenburg Studies in English 54, 1983: 11. Knowles cites Maclaren’s quote from K. Graham’s *English Criticism of the Novel 1865-1900* [1965].

³² The term “Kailyard” was first applied to these authors by J.H. Millar, in an 1895 article, “The Literature of the Kailyard” published in *New Review*; although Millar, author of *A Literary History of Scotland* [1903], credited W.E. Henley for “this happy nickname”. See George Blake, *Barrie and the Kailyard School*. London: Arthur Barker Ltd., 1951: 17. The word kailyard is sung in the Jacobite air which Maclaren’s *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* [1895] takes as its epigraph.

³³ George Douglas Brown to Ernest Barker, 1901. Cited in Dorothy Porter’s introduction to *The House with the Green Shutters*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985: 12.

like Crockett's *The Lilac Sunbonnet* [1894] or Barrie's *Margaret Ogilvy* [1896], have been easy (and valid) targets. Some critics have derived enormous pleasure from laughing at Kailyard. George Blake's *bon mot*, "It is hard for any reasonably literate adult of the mid-twentieth century to read *The Lilac Sunbonnet* without nausea" (Blake, 47-8), echoes Wilde's famous opinion of Little Nell's death. Others, more disagreeable, think these books "awful",³⁴ indeed offensive, in their "exploitation of a cheap whimsicality about bairnies and heroes in homespun".³⁵

These Scottish novelists have come into the critical firing-line more than Montgomery, but her books are not shielded from similar charges. Artistic integrity as defined by the setters of literary canons, deems realism good, idealism bad. But L.M. Montgomery considered her own books to be realistic, not falsely idealistic, and certainly not untruthful. Likewise, some protested that the bucolic Kailyard world was not false to Scottish scene and character. William Robertson Nicoll claimed these "idylls do not pretend to give a full chronicle of life. They try to seize the moments at which the hidden beauty of the soul leaps into vision. They do not take in the whole circumference of truth, and they do not profess to take it in. But they included a far wider area than is ever compassed by cynicism".³⁶

In recent years there has been some reassessment by critics who have expelled Barrie, Crockett, and Maclaren from the "Kailyard School", and examined each author individually. Cairns Craig considers J.M. Barrie's "Thrums" books "part of new, popular, essentially working-class literature of the cities".³⁷ Far from signalling a low-point in Scottish literature, the fact that "Scotland should have been so successful in producing this new popular literature (Barrie's *The Little Minister* was three times made into a Hollywood movie) was testimony not to its dearth of culture, but precisely to the long and vital tradition of working-class literature in one of the most literate countries in the world".³⁸ Ian Campbell argues that Kailyard fiction actually "agrees to imitate reality" although "within bounds. It agrees to allow

³⁴ Ian Carter. "Kailyard: The Literature of Decline in Nineteenth Century Scotland". *The Scottish Journal of Sociology*. 1.1 [Nov. 1976]: 1-13. Carter asks, "Why [...] did so many people buy so many copies of such awful novels?" (2).

³⁵ Kurt Wittig. *The Scottish Tradition in Literature*. Edinburgh, London: Oliver and Boyd, 1958: 254.

³⁶ William Robertson Nicoll. "*Ian Maclaren*": *Life of the Rev. Dr. John Watson, DD*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1908. Cited in, William Donaldson. *Popular Literature in Victorian Scotland: Language, Fiction and the Press*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1986: 147. Nicoll, editor of *The British Weekly*, encouraged Crockett, Maclaren, and Barrie to publish their sketches, so naturally leapt to their defence.

³⁷ Cairns Craig. *Out of History: Narrative Paradigms in Scottish and British Culture*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1996: 107.

³⁸ LMM saw a stage version of *The Little Minister*—probably Barrie's 1897 dramatisation of his novel—in 1901 [Dec. 27, 1901: U.2] and the Hollywood version [1934], starring Katherine Hepburn as Babbie, in 1936 [March 31, 1936: U.9].

life to be shown in variety—a certain variety, shying away from some subjects, compensating by emphasis on others”.³⁹

Elizabeth Waterston, comparing Scottish and Canadian regional idylls, describes the pig-sty/ pine-tree dichotomy in terms of “Canadian Cabbage, Canadian Rose”. The juxtaposition of the brier bush in the cabbage-patch gives authors a choice when “transmuting” life into fiction: “should the artist fix his eye on the kail, the rank unpoetic reality of subsistence living? Or should he focus on the rosebush, the touch of sentiment, or romance, of perhaps hopeless aspiration?” (93).⁴⁰ Waterston finds plenty Kailyard “nonsense” in Canadian books by Robert Knowles and Ralph Connor, but also detects “a good deal of kailyard still in [Canada’s] best writers, Laurence and Munro and Mitchell and Ross and Buckler. Canadian cabbage, Canadian rose—and somewhere in the same garden a Canadian style is grown” (101).

* * *

... the greatest evil which has inflicted Scotland of late has been the rise of the so-called Kail Yard School of Fiction. It is already virtually dead. But it has accomplished in its short reign immeasurable harm. Hypocrisy and hysterics are an abomination in religion, but when they enter popular literature they are even worse [...] when [the Scotsman] began to spout cheap sentiment to his neighbours, he became an object of ridicule to the serious-minded. When he began to grow enthusiastic over and self-conscious of what he should simply have lived, namely his religious beliefs and character, he came down from his unconscious dignity of centuries and became a very commonplace buffoon in the hands of Ian Maclaren and his ilk, who made a burlesque of what the Scotsman might have been at his worst.

William Wilfred Campbell. *The Scotsman in Canada*, 1912.⁴¹

The brief reign of terror waged at the hands of Ian Maclaren and his ilk was at its fiercest in the mid-1890s, yet clearly potent influence enough in 1912 for Wilfred Campbell [1858-1918] to thunder against it. He attacks the Kailyard writers for undermining the achievements of Scots abroad, by turning Scottish “personality” into a joke. Campbell’s anger is linked to the phenomenal success of these novels in North America. With *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* topping US best-seller lists in 1895, and *Kate Carnegie and Those Ministers* [1896] rating a respectable seventh the following year,⁴² Kailyard fiction, to Campbell’s mind, had given a global readership a ridiculous caricature of Scotsmen. The Kailyard novelists were an invading force,

³⁹ Ian Campbell, *Kailyard*. Edinburgh: Ramsay Head Press, 1981: 101.

⁴⁰ Elizabeth Waterston. “Canadian Cabbage, Canadian Rose.” *Twentieth Century Essays on Confederation Literature*. Ed. Lorraine McMullen. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1976: 93-101.

⁴¹ William Wilfred Campbell. *The Scotsman in Canada. Vol. I Eastern Canada*. London: Sampson Low, Marston & Co., Ltd, 1912: 24-25.

⁴² Lists taken from A.P. Hackett. *Fifty Years of Best Sellers*. New York: R.R. Bowker, 1945, as cited in Knowles, 233. *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* was tenth on the list for 1896; J.M. Barrie’s *Sentimental Tommy* was the ninth best-seller.

sweeping aside the carefully honed “un-get-at-ableness” of generations with their burlesque exposés.

However, Thomas Knowles argues that an established taste and market for a certain “Scotland” existed *before* the Kailyard phenomenon. Their depiction of local colour was not revolutionary, but the natural heir to a British literary tradition of a century and more’s standing.⁴³ In his seminal study, *Kailyard* [1981], Ian Campbell retraces this tradition to the Scottish Enlightenment and Henry Mackenzie’s *The Man of Feeling* [1771]. Works such as this eighteenth-century “Sentimental” school novel, and John “Christopher North” Wilson’s *Lights and Shadows of Scottish Life* [1822], introduced many of the conservative values and rural themes later identified as “kailyard”: they expressed “a desire not to mirror reality, but to make possible the maximum sympathetic response not according to verisimilitude, but by a calculated *distortion of verisimilitude* on lines tacitly agreed between authors and audience” (40). Campbell detects these themes in works by John Galt, James Hogg, J.G. Lockhart, George Macdonald, and crucially, Walter Scott, for his poems and novels were critical in promulgating (and exporting) a particular vision of Scotland and Scottish history.

Campbell’s study is not really about Barrie, Crockett, and Maclaren, but it does isolate and explain “definitions of the [Kailyard] genre” (12). Kailyard is “rural fiction about rural concerns” (13). The environment—a small town or village, or preferably a “loosely scattered rural community” (86)—is narrow: there is little outbound travel; communities are invariably at the end of the railway branch line; there is “an almost oppressive knowledge of community affairs” (87); anything from “away” is alien. These novels are seldom set in the present; the narrative “in general belongs to the past and stops within living memory” (*ibid.*). Old and vanished values are thus resurrected and preserved.

The characters are working people, of limited experience and limited aspiration, but convincingly realistic nonetheless. The laird, the doctor, and the ministers plural, stand apart from the common herd. Although there is stasis, and innovation is discredited, change is permissible through education or self-help: “lads o’ pairts” become men of ability. There are few female characters, and few opportunities for women to change their lot, although some women enter domestic service in the cities (usually to their moral or physical undoing).⁴⁴ As this suggests, Kailyard novels preach traditional Christian values, and traditional rural values wherein the minister is

⁴³ See Knowles, Ch. 3 “The Rise and Fall of the American Kailyard 1891-97: Popular Acclaim, Critical Comment and Ideological Context”: 66-97.

⁴⁴ e.g. Lily Grant in Maclaren’s *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* [1895].

revered and the city deplored as godless. Although Kailyard novels indulge in the pathos of a few tragic stories, the overall moral balance dictates that good endings come to good people.

Campbell concludes that Kailyard writers expanded their models from Scottish fiction “into an immensely popular version of Scottishness, and [...] brought a version of Scotland to millions”. This is indisputable. What puzzles critics more is *why* this literature proved so popular, although critics, like George Blake, who dismiss kailyard as “bad” literature are reluctant to concede its good points. Partly these books were attuned to long-cherished tastes, and to new tastes in general popular literature of the time. As Ian Carter suggests, Ian Maclaren’s books may even have “exploited the potential of tourism” (Carter, 5) in Scotland. In North America, Kailyard fiction touched a nostalgic nerve with emigrant Scots, who relived the rose-tinted past these novels evoked. In Canada, as Ian Campbell suggests, the existing taste “made it easier for the kailyard to find a ready market there, indeed to propagate imitation Kailyard in places like Ontario where Scottish settlement was heavy” (115).

* * *

L.M. Montgomery was in her early twenties when she first encountered the Kailyard.⁴⁵ In the mid-1890s she also celebrated her first *commercial* success—“A Baking of Gingersnaps” was published in the *Ladies' Journal* in July 1895.⁴⁶ That September, Montgomery entered Halifax Ladies' College. On 29 November 1895, she presented a paper on “Ian MacLaren” [*sic*] to Dalhousie University's Philomath Society, when lovers of learning heard also from “Crockett on Crockett” and “Simpson on Barrie”. Her essay for this “Scotch Authors” evening is not extant, but a college review praised it as “well written” and “read with the enthusiasm the subject demanded”.⁴⁷ As to content, the columnist recorded, “[t]he writings of this author draw forth eulogy rather than criticism. Miss Montgomery's paper proved to be no exception to the rule, and many fine points were brought out”.⁴⁸

Presumably Montgomery eulogised Maclaren then, as she did ten years later, for “the sweetness and pathos of the tales—simple, wholesome tales, like a sweep of

⁴⁵ LMM first read Barrie's *A Window in Thrums* in 1898, *Tommy and Grizel* in 1902. She reread the latter in 1904, by which date she was also acquainted with *Sentimental Tommy* and *The Little Minister*.

⁴⁶ Published under the name “Maud Cavendish”, Scrapbook 7, labelled “1893-1896”, CM.67.5.13.

⁴⁷ LMM reflected, “There was a big turnout of students and I was a little nervous, but I think I got on all right—at least, folks appear to think I did” (*SJ* I [Dec. 1, 1895] 149).

⁴⁸ Memorabilia scrapbook (unlabelled) CM.67.5.15.

upland wind or the tang of a fir wood on a frosty night" (Nov. 8, 1905: U.2). She was consistently charmed by Maclaren's work, and still sounding his praises in the 1930s, at the expense of *The House with the Green Shutters* ("the people in the *Bonnie Brier Bush* are nearer to real people as I have found them" [June 17, 1939: U.10.]) and Sinclair Lewis's *Elmer Gantry* [1927].⁴⁹ Maclaren's novels, unlike much modern "nauseous sex stuff" (SJ III [Jan. 8, 1923] 109), left her feeling clean.

Crucially, L.M. Montgomery also felt *homesick* when reading Maclaren's "Scotch" stories. She claimed, "[t]hese tales of Scottish life have oddly the same flavour as the Cavendish of my childhood, the memory of which is like a silvery moonlight in my recollection. *The atmosphere was the same, the background very similar*" (SJ IV [Jan. 24, 1932] 162, my italics).

Montgomery was often dazzled by the "silvery moonlight" of an "agonising nostalgia" that mellowed her recollections of her Cavendish childhood. However, she was also quick to recognise and scoff at crass sentimentalism, suggesting that the "sweetness and pathos" she admired in Maclaren sprang from their mutual perspective on Scottish life and character (at home or in exile) and not from "cheap whimsicality". Given that she saw the Cavendish world of her youth reflected in Drumtochty, and set her own fiction in rural North Shore communities much like Cavendish, readers might expect some similitude between Drumtochty and Avonlea, for instance, or Drumtochty and Glen St Mary.

Contemporary reviewers were awake to this resemblance. "L.M. Montgomery has done for Prince Edward Island what 'Ian Maclaren' did for 'Drumtochty'", enthused one glowing notice for *Further Chronicles of Avonlea*, "It is no small achievement to create so interesting and charming a figure as Anne of Green Gables and to people the region about Avonlea with real characters".⁵⁰ Montgomery's short-story collections in particular invited Kailyard comparisons; they were episodic, and having no juvenile heroine, were understood to appeal to a general audience. Thus, a review of *Chronicles of Avonlea*, from a critic clearly familiar with Montgomery's work, declared, "[w]hat James M. Barrie has done for Kirriemuir (Thrums) with its Auld Licht weavers, and John Watson for Logiealmond (Drumtochty) in the Perthshire glen, Miss Montgomery has done for Prince Edward Island", by plunging her readers "at once into the romance of the region, the common drab of its everyday activities and its tragedies".

⁴⁹ "It is odd to imagine 'William Maclure' [*sic*] and 'Elmer Gantry' in the same world. Yet they both exist. But it is a great deal pleasanter to read about Maclure" (SJ IV [Jan. 24, 1932] 162). cf. letter to EW, dated July 16, 1933 [NAC].

⁵⁰ *Christian Endeavour World* (Boston), May 27, 1920. Review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

This reviewer continued, "There is something suggestive of [Barrie and Maclaren] in her work. Anne Shirley, the Story Girl, Kilmeny, to mention no others, have a Barriesque flavor about them, and the pen pictures of those down East farmers and their wives are not unworthy of being placed alongside the characters that figure in *The Bonnie Brier Bush*".⁵¹ With some modesty, Montgomery noted a link between the "Thrums" books and her own: "Barrie has to a superlative degree the power of creating atmosphere and character, so that his books give us the sensation of reading about people and places we have known well, and consequently have all the charm of a newsy letter from home. In a smaller degree I have the same knack myself and that is why my books are liked" (*SJ* III [Apr. 14, 1923] 125).

L.M. Montgomery and the Kailyard authors cultivated a common subject matter—the annals of a parish—from their Scots-Presbyterian background. At times, Montgomery's novels (like Kailyard books) are "amusing little stories of bucolic intrigue as seen through the windows of a Presbyterian manse" (Blake, 13), albeit a Canadian manse with the outlook of a minister's wife. Montgomery, Barrie, Maclaren, and Crockett all had a literary apprenticeship in journalism: in writing for periodicals they were well versed in "adherence to an established formula" (Campbell, 23), conforming both to house-style and reader expectation when selling early stories. Their novels were all deemed "wholesome", and met the demand for "a pleasant relief from the society novel and the modern thriller".⁵² (Or as *Punch* put it, in badly scanned verse: "In dull days of sensational horrors, and wild, would-be humorous hums,/ What delight to fly darkness, and watch the 'Auld Licht,' from a 'Window in Thrums!'/ Let pessimists potter and pule, and let savages slaughter and harry;/ Give me *Hendry* and *Tammis* and *Jess*, and a smile and a tear born of Barrie".⁵³)

Montgomery still read Barrie and Maclaren long after their novels were fashionable or popular. She elegised "JMB", dubbing *Sentimental Tommy* [1896] "one of the most delightful books ever written".⁵⁴ Barrie's Kailyard novels were "bound up with memories of [...] girlhood" (*ibid.*). Picking up a Barrie book, or a novel by Ian Maclaren, transported Montgomery back to "the Cavendish of my childhood. There was the same tang and charm and simplicity in people, place and religion. One had a sense of 'time to grow'" (*SJ* III [Jan. 8, 1923] 109). *The House*

⁵¹ *Boston Herald*, 1912. Review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁵² *ibid.*

⁵³ Advertising notice appended to J.M. Barrie. *A Window in Thrums*. 1889. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1894.

⁵⁴ LMM wondered, in view of Barrie's successful second career as a dramatist, whether "anyone but myself reads [*Sentimental Tommy*] nowadays" (June 21, 1937: U.10).

with the *Green Shutters* had no such effect, for it went “to extremes. There could not anywhere be a group of people so hopelessly mean and sneaking and abominable” (June 17, 1939: U.10). “Too much black for the white it in,” as George Douglas Brown said himself.⁵⁵

* * *

In April 1904 Maud Montgomery reread *Tommy and Grizel* (Apr. 20, 1904: U.2). In November 1905 she reread (and cried over) *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* (Nov. 8, 1905: U.2). The planning, plotting, and writing of *Anne of Green Gables* was encircled by the Kailyard. These books were perhaps instrumental in evoking some memories of girlhood and would certainly have bolstered Montgomery’s confidence in the regional material she used for her first novel. These books did not solely appeal to Montgomery because they were Scottish, for she felt that Barrie (like Burns⁵⁶) touched “common places” (*SJ* I [July 10, 1898] 223). But the characterisation of Scottish rural folk, and the atmosphere of Scottish rural communities, did speak to her of her own community’s past.

Anne Shirley puts down roots in two Island communities: Avonlea and Glen St Mary. Both are narrow, rural settlements, although Glen St Mary, with its own railway station, has more links with the outside world than does Avonlea, eight miles from Bright River. The people make their living from farming, and from the sea, as their fathers and mothers did before them. Both settlements are tight-knit, meaning that acceptance is difficult for strangers to win, yet when won can prove unconditionally supportive. Avonlea has one Presbyterian church. Glen St Mary is more diverse, yet, portrayed from the Presbyterian perspective of Miss Cornelia Bryant, often demonstrates scant respect toward other denominations and their ministers. No doctor is much in evidence in Avonlea, but in Glen St Mary Gilbert Blythe and his family meet with due deference: “The Upper Glen people especially seemed really to believe that [Gilbert] could raise the dead, and only refrained because it would be crossing the purposes of the Almighty” (*AI* 102).

Until *Rilla of Ingleside* the “Anne” books were set in the past, the near past of living memory. The small cast of characters are well-developed and realistic. But unlike her Kailyard antecedents, L.M. Montgomery was interested in women’s lives

⁵⁵ Introduction, *The House with the Green Shutters* 16.

⁵⁶ “Burns was of humanity, be it whatever nationality it will. He gave voice to the song that sings itself in all human hearts, whether in Scottish braes or Canadian prairies, and this is why we of this New World, remote from him in time and space, love him so well and so understandingly” (*My Dear Mr. M* [Aug. 23, 1905] 12).

and articulated the choices and chances open to women, as well as the restrictions they faced.

Cabbage Patch Kids

"How dare you!" she cried, stamping her foot; and they quaked like malefactors.

J.M. Barrie. *The Little Minister*⁵⁷

"I hate you," she cried, stamping her foot on the floor [...] "How dare you say I'm freckled and red-headed"

Anne of Green Gables 81

Babbie, the "Egyptian" heroine of *The Little Minister*, is another credible antecedent for Anne Shirley. Aside from their stamp of fiery temper, both Babbie and Anne grow up as orphans, and are reared by elderly Scots people of a different background and culture to themselves. Both girls make a stir in the small, rural communities where they are the feared outsider. The presence of each calls into question the community's Presbyterian, indeed Christian, codes. Finding support in Avonlea wanting, Matthew and Marilla adopt an orphan to offset the hardships of old-age. Babbie intervenes to save Nanny Webster from the poor house when the minister and the doctor have surrendered to presiding Fate. And both Babbie and Anne end up married to respected pillars of the community—Babbie to Gavin, the little minister, Anne to Gilbert, the prospective village doctor—becoming more conventional, less questioning, and less endearing in the process.

For Anne, marriage is several books away, and *Anne of Green Gables* ends with the orphan's exuberance subdued not silenced. Rev Mrs Allan most resembles Rev Mrs Gavin Dishart: the former is as shadowy a presence in *Anne of Green Gables* and *Anne of Avonlea* as Babbie after marriage is, in *Sentimental Tommy* and *Tommy and Grizel*. Mr and Mrs Allan, like Gavin and Babbie, meet with disapproval from the prudish Presbyterian community because their love is demonstrative: "Mrs Lynde says [...] she doesn't think it right for a minister to set his affections so much on a mortal being" (AGG 236). Mrs Allan is mature and sensible but claims she "was a dreadful mischief when she was a girl and was always getting into scrapes" (AGG 241). Mrs Dishart continues to dash over the Presbyterian traces, letting her son read Walter Scott "story-books" that her husband disapproves of.⁵⁸

Unfortunately for readers, Anne's wish to be "a little like Mrs Allan when I grow up" (ibid.) is granted ten-fold. But to give Mrs Allan her due, in the narrow

⁵⁷ J.M. Barrie. *The Little Minister*. 1891. London: Cassell and Company, 1893: 145.

⁵⁸ J.M. Barrie. *Sentimental Tommy*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1896: 230.

world of Avonlea she is by way of being unconventional and progressive. Flirting with Cavendish's new minister, and perhaps thinking of *The Little Minister* as she wrote *Anne of Green Gables*, Montgomery combined a dream of her own future with Barrie's loveable heroine when designing Mrs Allan. She is an inspirational Christian woman who is also spirited and individual.

Montgomery may also have had Babbie in mind for Philippa Gordon, an unconventional, wealthy, devilish girl who marries a committed, idealistic Presbyterian minister.⁵⁹ Admittedly Montgomery could draw some inspiration from her own life on this front, but the related story, "Four Winds", conveys a pronounced Barriesque flavour.⁶⁰ Alan Douglas is a little minister whose mother's portrait hangs on his study wall. ("A mother is the best thing in the world," [165] declares Alan, a dose of schmaltz Margaret Ogilvy's son would adore.) Alan's relationship with an outsider, Lynde Oliver, meets with disapproval in *Four Winds*. He faces particular opposition from one parishioner, Isabel King, as does Gavin from Rob Dow. Lynde and Babbie feel the truth of their histories will kill their little minister's love. Each minister risks his life in saving his supposed rival from drowning.

Babbie aside, there were few heroines to be gathered in the Kailyard: meek girls such as Elspeth Sandys stand in opposition to Montgomery's plucky, resourceful, feisty *Canadian* heroines. Presbyterian upbringing notwithstanding, Montgomery's young female characters experience a greater degree of freedom than do their Scottish counterparts. Their stories often follow the bumpy road to marriage, but Montgomery's heroines have too much self-assurance to go insane for love as does Tommy's Grizel.

Community in *Anne of Green Gables* has been oft-debated, and well-debated.⁶¹ Elizabeth Waterston notes several links between *Anne of Green Gables* and its Kailyard antecedents: Matthew Cuthbert's white brier bush (*Kindling Spirit* 51); the "touch of Scottish sentiment drawn from the Scottish literary heritage of Burns and Barrie" in Gilbert Blythe's characterisation (*ibid.* 46); Anne's idealised return from the city to the country (*ibid.* 4). *Anne of Green Gables* studies Avonlea from the

⁵⁹ Elizabeth Waterston argues that there is also much of Babbie in Valancy Stirling (personal communication).

⁶⁰ Originally published in *Housewife*, October and November 1908. Reprinted in *Along the Shore* 141-188.

⁶¹ See Susan Drain, "Community and the Individual in *Anne of Green Gables*: The Meaning of Belonging," *Such a Simple Little Tale* 119-130; T.D. MacLulich, "Anne of Green Gables and the Regional Idyll"; Mary Rubio, "Anne of Green Gables: The Architect of Adolescence," *Such a Simple Little Tale* 65-82; David Weale, "No Scope for Imagination: Another side of *Anne of Green Gables*," *IM* 20 [1986]: 3-8.

Green Gables' perspective. The community is described as Anne's new eyes see it, as she (as a child) meets it, and as Matthew and Marilla re-view it.

Anne of Avonlea redirects this gaze. The second "Anne" book has in general not been regarded highly. Critics, if not fans, think Anne more trite and less outspoken than before, and find little development in her character.⁶² If the charm of the first book for a reader lies chiefly in Anne then *Anne of Avonlea* would be a little disappointing. Elizabeth Epperly writes that *Avonlea*, "is a busy story, almost as though Montgomery is trying to distance us from the fact that Anne is not learning or growing or really thinking. We welcome the activities of other characters" (*Fragrance* 52). In fact L.M. Montgomery most likely *intended* her readers to welcome other characters, for *Anne of Avonlea* opens the perspective to other sides of community life.

For this reason there is much in *Anne of Avonlea* that deserves reappraisal. Anne Shirley now belongs to adult Avonlea, and her later adventures examine the Scots-Canadian adult world more closely. The atmosphere and characterisation of Kailyard books emanates largely from the old folks and the Auld Lichts. L.M. Montgomery detected the flavour of her Cavendish girlhood in Maclaren's novels—her girlhood was spent in the home of elderly, traditional people. There were many youngsters in Cavendish, but the hardy North Shore farmers lived well into their eighties, and still dictated the community mores in their old age. In the 1880s and 90s, Cavendish "atmosphere" lay with those whose connection to Scotland was the strongest.

* * *

The ways of Avonlea may be "staid and settled and grooved" (*AHD* 62) but Montgomery's way of writing about Avonlea was not. Although the second book opens only a few weeks after the first closes, Mrs Rachel soon arrives to spill the beans on the "many strange people rushing into" Avonlea (*AA* 17). The first of these, Mr J.A. Harrison, is a hard-hitting contrast to Matthew Cuthbert. "[P]urple with rage" (12) and stammering what pass for obscenities at the new pedagogue, James A. shows that Avonlea's men are going to be a different quantity this time around. In *Anne of Green Gables*, the community women are much more voluble than the silent men they live with. Mr Harrison lives apart from his wife (this is not revealed until Ch. 25), is more than capable of doing his own talking, and keeps a parrot to do his

⁶² e.g. Gillian Thomas. "The Decline of Anne: Matron vs. Child."; Elizabeth Epperly. *The Fragrance of Sweet Grass* Ch. 2; Genevieve Wiggins Ch. 3.

swearing by. (Not, as Margaret Atwood writes, that there is much swearing in Avonlea, and certainly they lack Thrums's portmanteau "Dagont".)

Anne of Green Gables envisages a feminised world. There are new female characters in *Anne of Avonlea*, Lavendar Lewis and Charlotta the Fourth, for instance, and Dora Keith. However, the fact that Dora is a weak character and listless human-being compared to her twin brother,⁶³ attests that this is a book where the male of the species are deadlier in wit, and livelier in personality. Mr Harrison, Davy Keith, Anthony Pye, and Jake Donnell are all fiery fare and fun. Even minor characters like Uncle Abe, Stephen Irving, and his fanciful son, have something to offer. In *Anne of Avonlea*, L.M. Montgomery gives a voice to the community's other half. As a result, Avonlea became more realistic, less idealistic, and more clearly identifiable with real Canadian communities like Cavendish, and male-oriented Scottish fictional communities like Drumtochty.

A division is established between "Feminine Avonlea" (11) and Mr Harrison's male house-keeping schedule. The women are set up, aided, and abetted in their censorious gossip by the hired boy, who "started the stories" about the unwashed dishes and poor housekeeping in the first place. John Henry avers that he would have starved had not his mother sent him back on Mondays with a "basket of 'grub'", a comic echo of the rural Scottish lads who made off to university in the city with a bag of oats to see them through term. Mr Harrison, to collective female dismay, is impervious to gossip and to castigation. The minister leaves well alone: James A.'s morals are not in question (as yet). In the good book of Feminine Avonlea, however, a man who needs no woman about the place, and will not give money to the heathen, is patently a "crank" (10) and not of the local elect.

As with "Posty" in Maclaren's *The Days of Auld Lang Syne*, James A. is "past redemption", but immensely likeable for all that, and intentionally so. Posty, like Abel Gay in *The Blue Castle*, blithely rebuffs the attempts of minister and congregation to sober him.⁶⁴ Yet neither is "Feminine Avonlea" entirely in the wrong: through Anne, Mr Harrison learns that even Mrs Lynde has her good points. Like

⁶³ In *Anne of the Island*, Dora does manage to outsmart Davy in the matter of the "gentleman cat" (AIs 94).

⁶⁴ Both Abel and Posty have stages of drunkenness. Posty has three moods, "the positive, when he was a man of few words; the comparative, when he was cheerful, and gave himself to the discussion of doctrine; and the superlative, when he had been tasting freely, and retired for medication (*The Days of Auld Lang Syne* 196). Abel has four: "the theological stage of drunkenness—which always followed the sentimental maudlin one, and preceded the roaring, blasphemous one. The eloquently prayerful one, in which he realised himself temporarily and intensely as a sinner in the hands of an angry God, was the final one" (TBC 76).

Milton, an incomer to Drumtochty, Mr Harrison comes to admire his new community, even if its ethics are at variance with his own.⁶⁵

Montgomery would read countless reviews where Avonlea was hailed as an *ideal* place: the first chapter of *Avonlea* deliberately confounds this. The young members of the Debating Club (presumably an equivalence of the Cavendish Literary Society) contrive to get up a Village Improvement Society. Elizabeth Epperly finds the narrator in *Anne of Avonlea* “positively preachy” (*Fragrance* 49), but Montgomery is having considerable fun by writing that “an ideal Avonlea existed in [Anne’s and Gilbert’s] minds, if nowhere else” (19). The *Green Gables*’ narrator always laughed at Anne’s romantic excess, but in *Avonlea* there is less sympathetic counterbalance.⁶⁶ Anne is a ridiculous figure on the golden picnic, dancing in galoshes while her friends unsuccessfully attempt to understand her poetic ramblings. Anne and Gilbert want to improve Avonlea *the place* not Avonlea *the people*, but their practical efforts illustrate that Avonlea the place *is* Avonlea the people. What use is it to re-shingle and paint the community hall, if the Pye family, true to form, will botch the job?⁶⁷

“To herself, or to her particular cronies, she might admit that there were some small imperfections, easily removable, in Avonlea and its inhabitants” (34); to Mr Harrison, Anne admits no such thing. When the orphan was the outsider, the patriarchal institutions of church, politics, and school were imperfect. With male outsiders on the firing-step, shots are aimed at female targets or cohorts of female power. Anthony Pye challenges the competence of “girl teachers” (50). Paul Irving’s upbringing by a old-fashioned Scottish grandmother endorses his need for a father, although we might also doubt the father who left an imaginative child in the care of a “robust, matter-of-fact Scotch” woman (295).⁶⁸ Jacob Donnell’s insistence that he is “Jake” not “St Clair”, and a carpenter not a college professor in the making, contests his mother’s affectation and ambition. “Mr Davy Keith” (73) asserts his presence at otherwise feminine Green Gables with a series of little manly projections (including spitting) wherein Mr Harrison is his role model.

Not all these objections are upheld. Anthony Pye learns respect for Miss Shirley, although she must compromise her principles to win it. *Anne of Avonlea*

⁶⁵ *ibid.*, Ch. IX “Milton’s Conversion”.

⁶⁶ Anne hair is called “auburn” by “her friends” (9), but the narrator wickedly surrounds the snippet with “red sandstone”, “red poppies”, and a “cherry orchard”.

⁶⁷ Mrs Rachel Lynde has little faith in A.V.I.S. because village improvement is a “Yankee” scheme: LMM may have spun the story from EM’s successful endeavours at “improving” the Cavendish graveyard, “from the jungle it once was into the orderly, well-cared for place it is today” (*SJ* III [July 21, 1923] 138).

⁶⁸ This is also the case with Little Elizabeth in *Anne of Windy Willows*.

teaches that hard and fast rules do not work, especially with children. Davy and Dora Keith are six-year-olds when they come to Green Gables, and at an earlier stage in their “training” than Anne was. That Marilla will not let the twins start school until they are seven (100) recalls, ironically, the old Jesuit maxim, “give me a child for the first seven years . . .”. Training for young Presbyterians began in the *home*, with porridge for breakfast, “a hymn, a catechism question, and two Bible verses every Sunday” (137). Dora is innately conventional and swallows the “good, old-fashioned methods of diets and morals” (150) unquestioningly. Davy is a little sinner who debates this teaching, often to good purpose. Whereas aesthete Anne undermines Mr Bentley and Superintendent Bell on points of delivery, through the mouthpiece of Davy, Montgomery challenges Presbyterian doctrine, or leastwise the validity of impressing such doctrine on small children.

Avonlea Presbyterians would have told children they tolerated no back-talking. But just as Marilla must chase imaginary pesky hens out of pansy beds to avoid laughing with Davy’s minor insurrections, paying lip-service to “good old ways” (137) of child-rearing causes practical problems. Marilla warns Davy that “something dreadful” (98) will happen to him if he omits to say his prayers. She “heard a minister say it to a child once” (100) and takes recourse in Calvinist notions of fear and punishment when bamboozled by Davy’s persistent scepticism. As said dreadful thing fails to materialise, Davy concludes that Marilla tells “whoppers”. Montgomery exposes the absurdity of making small children learn the catechism by rote. Davy labours under the misapprehension that he will eat jam in Heaven—located upwards, as he believes, in Simon Fletcher’s attic—because God “makes preserves and redeems us” (136).⁶⁹ As Montgomery recalled of her own instruction in the Shorter Catechism, “I did not understand the meaning of half I learned and it was never explained to me” which thankfully meant “We did not comprehend the real meaning of the terrible answers [about ‘election’ and ‘predestination’] we so glibly recited” (*SJI* [Jan. 7, 1910] 378).

Old-timers like Mrs Lynde believe that “a judgement” (*AA* 50) will fall on sinners.⁷⁰ When “Providence” is tardy in such matters—tardier than Mrs Lynde would be were she omnipotent—her faith in the methods of the Almighty is temporarily shaken, but never her faith in her own right to judge her neighbours. Maclaren’s and Montgomery’s Presbyterian characters frequently refer to the “tempting’ o’ Providence” and to those who have “flown in the face of Providence”,

⁶⁹ This anecdote, like others in *Anne of Avonlea* and *Anne of the Island*, first appeared in LMM’s “Cynthia” column for the *Halifax Echo*. See Scrapbook Three, CM.67.5.19.

⁷⁰ cf. *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* Ch. III, “A Manifest Judgement”.

stock Scottish phrases, perhaps, for those who flout predestination. Davy, for all his sensation-searching, is probably not unelect, but he does lack the “instinct” (AA 97) to determine right from wrong. For young children, Presbyterian lessons—from a Sunday School superintendent who believes himself, “a vile worm and a miserable sinner and guilty of the blackest ’niquity” (AA 202)—are confusing and breed fantastic ideas (“when you’re punished for a thing you don’t have to repent of it” [AA 104]). Even in adulthood, it seems wisest to pursue Jane Andrews’ course. She “believed everything she had been taught [and] never thought about heaven any more than she could help” (AA 126).

Davy responds to instruction in a time-honoured Scottish fashion: inquiry, debate, examination. Given his intelligence, it is strange he is not scented out as a “lad o’ pairts” destined for vocational heights, if not, granted, the ministry. Kailyard’s image of the cultivation of scholars from a humble Scottish village school has been an enduring one (the first story in *The Bonnie Brier Bush* is “A Lad o’ Pairts”).⁷¹ Anne dreams of the “famous personage” budding in one of her (male) pupils. Paul Irving is the most promising of Avonlea’s young fry (he will become a famous poet [RV 26]) although there is some local debate as to whether Paul is a genius or a “queer genius”, that is, an eccentric.⁷² Avonlea knows not what to make of either variety—unlike Thrums, where Tammas Haggart devises a home for geniuses of Rabbie Burns’ line⁷³—but the suspicion Rachel Lynde feels toward Stephen Irving suggests that those who leave the rural community for intellectual pursuits or financial gain are not unreservedly welcomed on their return. Mrs H.B. Donnell has high ambitions for her son, but is instantly recognised in Avonlea as a sham for insisting “the correct pronunciation of our name is *Donnell* . . . accent on the last syllable” (48). Not if you’re Mrs Rachel Lynde, or any plain-speaking Scot, it’s not. “The name is *Donnell* and always has been” (50).⁷⁴

Anne aims to add “beauty to life” (66-67) and day-dreams of being “a great prima donna or a Red Cross nurse or a queen” (91). Anne has (temporarily) resigned some of her ambitions to stay in Avonlea. Nonetheless, Diana Barry (the surname is surely an allusion to J.M. Barrie) is more involved in the female rural life than Anne,

⁷¹ Gilbert Blythe is a definitive lad o’ pairts, being rural-born, self-funding, and having high-ideals. He becomes a doctor, a vocation somewhere between minister and college professor in Scottish hierarchies of merit. (Of his sons, Jem Blythe wants to be a doctor, Walter a professor of English, which leaves Shirley for the ministry.) The money-minded Murrays think that, “a lawyer would be quite a thing to have in the family coming in a good third to minister and doctor” (EQ 118).

⁷² “‘Anne says Paul is a genius,’ said Mrs Sloane. ‘He may be. You never know what to expect of them Americans,’ said Mrs Andrews (AA 293).

⁷³ *A Window in Thrums* Ch. XVII.

⁷⁴ The name was most likely always MacDonnell (an Ulster name) or the Scots MacDonald (or Donald) that Mrs H.B. has anglicised.

whether she is cutting dress material (91) or courting Mr Wright. Lacking opportunity for development, Anne remains a girl, whereas Gilbert grows up. This is not a novel to encourage a lass o' pairts (although Anne will go to college). The Avonlea old guard are willing to employ "girl" teachers, but educating girls past school level is not something they truly countenance. Mrs Harmon Andrews believes that, as Anne will doubtless marry Gilbert Blythe when he graduates, there is no justification for her further education (292). Women like Miss Sarah Copp and Miss Lavendar Lewis live through a stifled spinsterhood. (As Charlotta the Fourth concedes, "there's many a worse thing than a husband" [303].)

But Diana was always a more commonplace girl than Anne: her intellect is limited, her grammar suspect, her imagination cramped, her figure apt to bulge. In *Anne of Avonlea* these differences become more pronounced, as do wider gaps in Avonlea society, between affluent and poor, industrious and shiftless, elect and damned. In *Anne of Green Gables* the Pyes and Sloanes were lower on the social scale than the Gillises and Barrys and Blythes, but the Cottons and Boulters of *Avonlea* are horses of a different colour. Davy Keith makes particular friends with Milty (short for Milton presumably) Boulter, the kind of child Anne would have been forbidden to play with. (Milty Boulter is "awful proud of his mother 'cause folks say she could scratch a living on a rock" [44 280].) As Davy is being trained to be an Avonlea farmer only (he is the boy Green Gables needed all along) he associates with a cross-section of the male population, bringing another side of village life under the gaze.

As Tammas Haggart, the Thrums's "humorist", concedes, "humour's what gies the nip to speakin'".⁷⁵ Rachel Lynde is often witty, as is Marilla Cuthbert. But the wit and humour in *Anne of Avonlea* rests mainly with the men. The Village Improvers get many a "nip" when they begin "educating public sentiment" (21):

Mr Elisha Wright was reported to have said that a more appropriate name for the organization would be Courting Club. Mrs Miriam Sloane declared she had heard the Improvers meant to plough up all the roadsides and set them out with geraniums. Mr Levi Boulter warned his neighbours that the Improvers would insist that everyone pull down his house and rebuild it after plans approved by the society. Mr James Spencer sent them word that he wished they would kindly shovel down the church hill. Eben Wright told Anne that he wished the Improvers could induce old Josiah Sloane to keep his whiskers trimmed. Mr Lawrence Bell said he would whitewash his barns if nothing else would please them but he would *not* hang lace curtains in his cow-stable windows. Mr Major Spencer asked Clifton Sloane, an Improver who drove the milk to the Carmody cheese factory, if it was true that everybody would have to have his milk-stand hand-painted next summer and keep an embroidered centre-piece on it (53-54).

⁷⁵ *ibid.*, 38.

Notably only one humorist is a woman (although a woman coined them all). The A.V.I.S. is a standing target for hardworking farmers, who view the society as namby-pamby, and have a long-held Puritanical scorn for frivolity. There is identifiably Scottish tang to their “bars”. Their humour is gentle and thoughtful, but with an edge of sarcasm. The Avonlea men ridicule anything they do not entirely trust.

Women’s groups like the Sewing Circle, the Foreign Missions Auxiliary, and the Ladies’ Aid are visible in all Montgomery’s work. There are also informal meetings of women in most chapters, each illustrative of patterns in women’s lives. Spaces where men assemble are less evident. As their witticisms show, the old Avonlea farmers are linked by vocation and values. No doubt they share and talk about work, as Charles Macneill and his cronies did, but readers are given only glimpses of this. Matthew Cuthbert tells Peter Morrison at William J. Blair’s Carmody store that he is going to sow his turnip seed (*AGG* 10). (The male community are also quick to rally round, and to scavenge, when Matthew Cuthbert dies.) In the short-story “The Girl and the Wild Race”,⁷⁶ the news that Judith will marry the first man who asks her is swiftly disseminated from the local store (*TDS* 53).

When Uncle Abe’s “predicted” storm comes off, to the making of his local reputation as a prophet, Abe “went out to the blacksmith’s forge early in the morning and spent the whole day there” (*AA* 248); not to get his horses shod, but because he can have his “hour of triumph” where his male cronies meet. Hillman’s forge in Cavendish presumably performed a similar function. In *Emily of New Moon*, Lofty John announces at the smiddy that he intends to cut down his grove (*ENM* 166), knowing that the forge is “the clearing-house of local news” and the tidings will be carried to the Murrays.⁷⁷ The expression is George Blake’s, and Blake described equivalent places in Kailyard fiction where men gather to “watch what was going on, speculate on motives, exchange small rumours, pass on malicious gossip” (Blake, 97). Montgomery’s fiction contains far fewer male gossips than female gossips, but gossip, and malicious gossip, is by no means a female preserve.

But what of Kailyard’s stock-in-trade of pathos for the tragic dead? Most of Montgomery’s “Anne” novels have a body somewhere about the place: Ruby Gillis in *Anne of the Island*, Joyce in *Anne’s House of Dreams*, Walter in *Rilla of Ingleside*. Readers were presumably still reeling after Matthew Cuthbert’s premature exit, and death in *Anne of Avonlea* is less sudden or shocking as a result of this perhaps.

⁷⁶ Originally published in *Era*, January 1904. Reprinted in *The Doctor’s Sweetheart* 48-57.

⁷⁷ see also *A Tangled Web* 203, 211.

Davy's and Dora's mother and then their uncle die offstage. Thomas Lynde's passing is signalled from chapter eight. When he dies, the news circulates that he is "gone", echoing the coronach "He is gone on the mountain" from *The Lady of the Lake*, and reminiscent of the language for death in Drumtochty, where "no one died [...] 'he slippit awa'".⁷⁸ "Nearly everybody in [Mirabel Cotton's] family has died," (211) a circumstance that gives her a certain prestige in the school-yard, particularly as the ghost of an uncle walks the family home (much to Dora's nocturnal terror). Uncle Abe's storm kills Ginger the parrot, and Mr Harrison's grief is as heart-rending as his wife's jubilation is heart-felt.

There is one other death in *Avonlea*, in a story of the past, thirty years old. "Everybody has forgotten" about Hester Gray, except Diana Barry it seems, and the telling of her tragedy adds a pathetic interlude, and a "birthday gift" in Kailyard wrapping for Anne Shirley. Hester Murray was a Bostonian girl who yearned for the country. She married an Avonlea man, Jordan Gray. Settled on the Island, she planted a little garden at the edge of Avonlea, and there after four years she withered and died. Anne cries—naturally—to think of Hester falling gently "asleep" among the roses. Geordie Hoo, Maclaren's archetypal lad o' pairts, also returns to the country from the city to die, and sits in his mother's garden "wrapped in plaid beside the brier bush whose roses were no whiter than his cheeks".⁷⁹ Nauseous, no doubt, as any reasonably literate adult of the twenty-first century would agree. But Montgomery's antecedents are clear.

* * *

Contemporary reviewers thought *Chronicles of Avonlea* particularly "Neo-Kailyard", and certainly some of the twelve stories hit sentimental lows. Some laud the rural lifestyle and morals over those of the city. "Old Man Shaw's Girl" is standard Kailyard fare. Old Man Shaw is expecting his daughter Sara from Montreal. A rich aunt has taken her to the city for a "good" education on the proviso that Sara (sentimentally nick-named "Blossom" by her father) will be sent back to White Sands after three years. Old Man Shaw is an unambitious dreamer uninterested in profit; in local opinion he is "shiftless" (126). His neighbours, in the shape of Mrs Peter Blewett (the "gimlet" who tried unsuccessfully to adopt Anne Shirley) doubt that Sara will be happy in the country after the bright-lights. Sara however has pined

⁷⁸ *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* 181-182. Aunt Becky's self-penned mock obituary cuts a swathe through such evasion, "I shall not pass away or pass out or pay my debt to nature or depart this life or join the great majority or be summoned to my long home. I intend simply and solely to die" (ATW 46).

⁷⁹ *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* 32.

for her father. Montreal has been “splendid” (139) but she craves the simple country life. When she returns the white rose-bush in the garden blossoms.

Montgomery adapted the framework of “Little Joscelyn” for several of her early pot-boilers: a person leaves the rural community, finds fame and fortune, but remains true to rural virtues. Joscelyn boarded with Aunt Nan in Avonlea for a summer when she was a child. Years later, she is a celebrated chanteuse and Aunt Nan yearns to hear her sing, but Nan’s fussy, authoritative in-laws refuse to take her to a concert where Joscelyn is performing. However, the hired boy schemes to bring Joscelyn to Gull Point Farm, where she sings for an old woman “wise in the lore of all things simple and good and true” (106). Joscelyn performs a famous melody, but also sings a hymn for Aunt Nan, “The Sands of Time are Sinking”. (They are indeed sinking fast for Aunt Nan, who dies before the story is out.)

Both these stories depart from the Kailyard by including uncharitable and unadmirable county folk. Old Man Shaw and Aunt Nan are ridiculed by their neighbours and relatives for being old-fashioned and failing to keep up with progress. The false snobbery and ersatz rural economy of Aunt Nan’s relatives are worse than any vices of city living. They fail to appreciate Aunt Nan’s simplicity. The girls who have gone away remain true to the homely values they were taught on the North Shore.

Nancy Rogerson also returns to Avonlea from Montreal, after twenty years in exile, to find the love that has eluded her in the city.⁸⁰ “The End of the Quarrel” is a variation on a standard Kailyard adaptation of the prodigal’s return. Nancy Rogerson is not a prodigal in the conventional sense, although it could be said that she has squandered her prospects of becoming a wife in becoming a city nurse. Nancy learns the lesson, like Flora Campbell in *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush*, “You are not forgotten or cast off . . . you are missed”.⁸¹ J.M. Barrie in *A Window in Thrums* created a model prodigal son in the shape of Jamie McQumpha, seduced by a “leddy in London” into forgetting his mother in Thrums. Montgomery’s Canadian prodigals are more likely to have embezzled money, as does the title character in “An Afternoon with Mr Jenkins” for example, or to have failed in fortune-hunting, like Ralph Walworth, “The Prodigal Brother”.⁸² Ralph is welcomed back into his family nonetheless. Mr Jenkins finds redemption in the homeland for past sins.

⁸⁰ Country life and country people are congenial for love, as American Anthony Sherman finds out when persuaded by Anne Shirley to get involved in “The Hurrying of Ludovic”.

⁸¹ *ibid.*, 153. Another prodigal son in Maclaren’s work is Charlie Grant in *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* Ch. X “Oor Lang Hame”.

⁸² “An Afternoon with Mr Jenkins”, originally published in *Family Herald* Aug. 2, 1933, reprinted in *The Road to Yesterday* 1-15. “The Prodigal Brother”, originally published in *Ram’s Horn* May

Another related story is "A Golden Wedding" (*After Many Days*).⁸³ Lovell Stevens travels east to his home town, having made a fortune out west. He finds that Aunt Sally and Uncle Tom, the couple who raised him after his father's death, have had their home repossessed and their furniture auctioned because they cannot pay the mortgage. Now they live in the poorhouse. Lovell has never been well-regarded by Tom's and Sally's neighbours, but he pays off the debts these neighbours were too poor to cover. This story is not a typical North American mortgage pot-boiler, though. Aunt Sally's real anguish is that she wants to celebrate her golden wedding anniversary in her old home. Lovell contrives to get back Aunt Sally's furniture with the help of the neighbours: "Most of it was bought by folks living handy and I don't believe one of them would refuse to sell it back" (154).

This recalls Ian Maclaren's story, "For Conscience Sake" (*The Days of Auld Lang Syne*) where the neighbours replenish Burnbrae's home with his old furniture bought at the rump of his property.⁸⁴ At the original dispossessing sale, the Drumtochty people have bid over the odds to ensure that Burnbrae realises adequate funds. In "Pa Sloane's Purchase" (*Chronicles of Avonlea*) a similar community spirit prevails, "The bidding on the various poor articles of household gear put up for sale was not brisk, but had an element of resigned determination. Carmody people knew that these things had to be sold to pay the debts, and they could not be sold unless they were bought" (185). In this story death rather than a mortgage occasions the sale, but several of Montgomery's stories are hostile to landlords, mortgage-holders, and big business.

The longest chronicle of Avonlea is the story of "Old Lady Lloyd". She too is the victim of "capitalism". The Lloyd family fortune was lost after her father was deliberately given bad business advice by his nephew. Said nephew, Andrew Cameron, "had meant well by his uncle at first, and what he had finally done he tried to justify to himself by the doctrine that a man must look out for Number One" (56). Old Lady Lloyd is proud. Rather than admit her poverty to her neighbours she has them believe her a miserly recluse. This changes when Sylvia Gray, the daughter of Old Lady Lloyd's childhood sweetheart, arrives in Spencervale. Margaret Lloyd scrimps and scrapes her already meagre funds to (anonymously) shower Sylvia with gifts.

1906, reprinted in *After Many Days* 91-98. In the same collection, see also "Robert Turner's Revenge" and "After Many Days" for adaptations of this theme.

⁸³ Originally published in *American Messenger* June 1909.

⁸⁴ Farmers in Kailyard fiction, following a Scottish custom, are usually known by the name of their farm. There is no evidence of this practice in Cavendish—farms seldom had names, indeed to name one's farm was considered a "piece of affectation" (*TGR* 163)—or in Montgomery's fiction.

Working in secret to benefit one's neighbours, even if it meant the community formed a false impression of you, was a favourite of the Kailyard, and played with Scottish character stereotypes of meanness and reticence. In *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* the Drumtochty people think Drumsheugh a miser, indeed he is "a byword at kirk an' market for nearness".⁸⁵ In actual fact, he has given all his money, anonymously, to help his unrequited love, Marget Hoo. Maclaren's moral is clear. As William MacLure tells Drumsheugh, "ye're the maist accomplished leear 'at's ever been born in Drumtochty, an' . . . the best man a' ever saw".⁸⁶

The *Chronicles of Avonlea*, "Aunt Olivia's Beau", "The Quarantine at Alexander Abraham's", "The Courting of Prissy Strong", and "The Winning of Lucinda" are all tales where older women find love and romance and second chances: not the sort of story written by the Kailyard men, for in Drumtochty, "Ye can hae little rael pleasure in a merrige".⁸⁷ The last of these stories, originally published as "A Case of Atavism", sees Lucinda Penhallow cursing her fiancé Romney when he drops her a stream.⁸⁸ Some women *do* swear in Avonlea it seems, although Lucinda's "*You d——d idiot!*" (123) belongs to Thrums's Hanky School of "Stroke" swearing.

Chronicles of Avonlea includes two religious stories. In "The Miracle at Carmody", Judith Marsh, a long-standing atheist, has a damascene conversion when her crippled sister Salome walks unaided for the first time in fifteen years, after defying Judith's ban on church attendance.⁸⁹ In "Each in His Own Tongue", the Rev Stephen Leonard is a strict Presbyterian minister who forbids his orphan grandson Felix Moore to play the fiddle, because Felix's vagabond father was a violinist. But Mr Leonard's religion is inadequate to the task of comforting a dying prostitute, terrified that God will not forgive her sins. Only Felix's violin-playing can convince Naomi of God's forgiveness: the violin "[speaks] to her in a tongue she can understand" (90). The Rev Leonard learns that there is a "Christ in [Felix's] violin as well as a devil" (94).⁹⁰

The Carmody doctor finds a sound medical explanation for Salome's recovery, but Judith, all faith at last, believes that "God has worked it to prove His existence to me, and I accept the proof" (222). "Each in His Own Tongue" has a less orthodox grounding. The prostitute is a sympathetic figure (but not a caricatured "tart with a

⁸⁵ *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* 157

⁸⁶ *ibid.*, 162.

⁸⁷ *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* 41.

⁸⁸ Lucinda's maternal grandfather, Absalom Gordon, had a 'habit of swearing', thus the case of atavism.

⁸⁹ The Miracle at Carmody should be that the child *Judith* and *Salome* adopt escapes a beheading.

⁹⁰ Passages from this story were read at Montgomery's funeral (personal communication, Jennie Macneill).

heart") and her death-bed is not "sentimentalist". Montgomery could and did write her fair share of mawkish death scenes, in particular those which followed after the pattern of Jamie Soutar's end in *The Days of Auld Lang Syne*. Jamie keeps a "tryst" with an old love when he dies. The same idea, indeed the same wording, is to be found in "The Girl at the Gate": "We made a death-bed tryst of it" (AMD 82). Dog Monday makes a "tryst"—the word itself is chiefly used in Scots not English—with Jem. Captain Jim in *Anne's House of Dreams* keeps a tryst with Lost Margaret when he crosses the bar.

* * *

L.M. Montgomery's "Avonlea" books are witty, mercurial, at times tongue-in-cheek, proto-feminist, questioning, unconventional, even rebellious; not adjectives generally applied to Kailyard novels, even by their defenders. Yet, Avonlea and Drumtochty are geographically, demographically, and culturally alike, in part because they are drawn from similar "real-life" places. Barriesque characterisation and atmosphere is likewise discernible in Avonlea, despite the obvious dissimilarities between the "Thrums" world of poor hand-loom weavers and the relatively prosperous agricultural landscape of PEI. These comparisons illustrate probable areas of cultural transfer from Scotland to Canada, in religion, child-rearing, community dynamics, education, and so forth.

However, the tremendous commercial success of these Scottish regional idylls in North America begs the question of whether Montgomery edited the Cavendish world to harmonise with the public taste for Kailyard. Many of the *Chronicles of Avonlea* were written before *Anne of Green Gables*, when Montgomery was more compliant with the house-style of the various magazines and periodicals she submitted stories to. These publications were often intended for a rural and religious readership (*American Agriculturist*, *Farm and Fireside*, *Christian Endeavour World*⁹¹) each receptive to fiction in the wholesome Kailyard style. Readers of Kailyard would have certain expectations from material which posited rural and religious subjects against a Scottish, or Scots-Canadian, background. Kailyard

⁹¹ These stories were revised by LMM to included references to Anne and Avonlea. Original publication details: "Little Joscelyn." *Christian Endeavour World*. 1 Sept. 1904; "The Hurrying of Ludovic." *Canadian Magazine*. May 1905; "Aunt Olivia's Beau." *Designer*. June 1905; "Ol' Man Reeves' Girl" (i.e. "Old Man Shaw's Girl"). *Farm and Fireside*. 15 June 1905; "A Case of Atavism." *Reader*. Nov. 1905; "Pa Rudge's Purchase" (i.e. "Pa Sloane's Purchase"). *Christian Endeavour World*. 22 Feb. 1906; "The Quarantine at Alexander Abraham's." *Everybody's*. April 1907. "The End of a Quarrel." *American Agriculturist*. 20 July 1907; "The Courting of Prissy Strong." *Housewife*. July 1909. "Miracle at Mayfield" (i.e. "The Miracle at Carmody"). *Christian Endeavour World*. 28 Oct. 1909. "Each in His Own Tongue." *Delineator*. Oct. 1910.

fictional communities reflect reality within *bounds*—no latrines, no pig-sties; for roses not cabbages—set by Scottish style. Was Montgomery's editing also set by Scottish antecedents?

At times, Montgomery's short-stories and "Anne" novels appear to echo, even imitate, Kailyard fiction, although she looked to the better parts for inspiration. Maclaren's patch was particularly fertile for Montgomery, for all that her enthusiasm for ministers and dominies was more subdued. As Elizabeth Waterston notes, Montgomery generally followed Kailyard authors in a "subtle way", tucking "irony [...] into subtexts little perceived by her early readers" (312).⁹² There is less sentiment and less pathos in Montgomery's fiction: although set in the (recent) past, the Avonlea books do not have a nostalgic reflective tone that laments a disappearing ways, like *A Window in Thrums*, although they have gained one in recent years. This said, there is much in *Anne of Avonlea* or *Anne of Green Gables* that follows the Kailyard model in terms of the characterisation of the older (and more Scottish) generation. Most of the male old guard would feel perfectly at home in Drumtochty. If Maclaren had given more Drumtochty women a voice, would there not have been a Mrs Harmon Andrews (especially as she appears in *Anne of the Island*⁹³) among them?

Winds of Change

There is a little of Jamie Soutar in Captain Jim: both are gentle men and chivalric defenders of insulted womanhood.⁹⁴ Strong though Scottish customs and beliefs in Glen St Mary are, however, they are seldom Kailyard-esque traditions. In the loneliness that follows her school- and college-friends' weddings, Anne feels "that she herself somehow belonged only in [the] past years and had no business in the present at all" (*Als* 275). Marriage and the move to Glen St Mary bring Anne's world nearer the present again. These books are initially *set* in the past but increasingly the war-torn reality of life from 1914-1918 seeps into the narrative. With this a growing Canadian consciousness is imported. There is a Scottish consciousness in Glen St Mary too, but tradition engages with a changing world wherein Canadian patriotism

⁹² Elizabeth Waterston. "Scottish Women Writers Abroad: The Canadian Experience," *A History of Scottish Women's Writing*. Ed. Douglas Gifford and Dorothy McMillan. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1997: 309-315.

⁹³ Jane Andrews gets married to a millionaire, but Mrs Harmon tells Anne, "Jane isn't a bit proud. She just means to associate with her old friends the same as ever" (*Als* 274).

⁹⁴ Jamie rescues Lily Grant, Captain Jim "will never allow a word against any woman to be said in his presence" and defends an insulted longshore girl (*AHD* 92).

is key. There is escapism to be had in these books, but also metaphors for the present. Elements of the “regional idyll” persist in the “Glen” books, but a strong ironic subtext de-sentimentalises the community.

For all that Montgomery acknowledged that “Cavendish is to a large extent *Avonlea*” (*SJ* II [Jan. 27, 1911] 38)—a strange way of expressing it for *Avonlea* appears the original—Glen St Mary is to a large extent Cavendish. When Montgomery first wrote of *Avonlea* she was living in Cavendish, which restricted the inclusion of material that mimicked local people and concerns (thus surnames were dissimilar, clan networks less oppressive, religious worship unified). Geographically, “New London harbor” was Montgomery’s inspiration (*SJ* II [July 21, 1917] for *Four Winds*,⁹⁵ but the use of the Cavendish litany, and thus some local dynamics, suggest Cavendish was the primary antecedent. Elizabeth Epperly considers *House of Dreams* to be “a passionate celebration of home” (*Fragrance* 75). (The first Glen St Mary chapter is entitled, “The Homecoming”.) With New London for her views, Montgomery was coming home to her birthplace in Clifton. Settled in Ontario she was also coming home in imagination to Cavendish, but now enjoyed an outsider’s greater freedom of expression in writing about it.

This freedom is established gradually, and related in part to the mandate the First World War gave Montgomery to widen the parameters of the “Anne” genre.⁹⁶ *Anne’s House of Dreams* has a uncommonly small cast. Anne and Gilbert have settled two miles from Glen St Mary in a sparsely populated part of the countryside. Anne makes little effort to meet other village people—unlike the minister’s wife, it seems not incumbent on the doctor’s wife to do so—and here we may detect the start of her hauteur.⁹⁷ Nonetheless, through those they do meet, Anne and Gilbert are inducted into the ways of their new home. In contrast to *Avonlea*’s unity of enterprise and experience, Glen life is marked by complex divisions.

Four Winds has a “tang of romance and adventure” brought by the sea. “There was always a certain sense of things going to happen—of adventures and farings-forth [...] the sea called ever to the dwellers on the shore, and even those who might not answer its call felt the thrill and unrest and mystery and possibilities of it” (*AHD* 62). The “winds of change” blow over Glen St Mary, carrying the scent of other

⁹⁵ Readers are seduced by the rules of a fictional world. If *Avonlea* was Cavendish, just as Maud was Anne, then that Anne travels sixty miles from *Avonlea* to *Four Winds Harbour*, means Montgomery had another community in mind.

⁹⁶ See Edwards & Litster, Appendix B.

⁹⁷ In Anne’s favour it should be noted that she is twice pregnant in this novel and restricted in her wanderings.

lands and other lives, broadening the horizons. Life at the House of Dreams is the narrowest Anne has experienced socially. But the House of Dreams is also a brief idyll only, quickly “out-grown” (341). It is a false idyll too, a bewitchment. The “coast” is “enchanted” (205) and Anne must learn through Leslie’s hardship that she is wrong to presume, “Elsewhere in the world human passions might set at defiance human conventions and laws—but not *here*” (226).

Leslie lives with a man who proves to be another man—the identical cousin of her husband, the better half of a double cousinship (276). *Anne’s House of Dreams* is a book of duality, a doubleness of both complements and opposites. The land is split from the sea. The land-lubbers feel the pull of the sea, the ships are guided by Captain Jim’s lighthouse, the longshoremen and women make their living by both. There are communities of harbour and over-harbour. Self-righteous feuding is waged by one on the other, but the people worship together, keep company together, and come to each other’s aid. There are two churches, Presbyterian and Methodist. Never the twain may meet in Miss Cornelia’s aspect, but she is expressly an extreme case who cleaves all the men from all the women into the bargain. Miss Cornelia has the “bitterest tongue and the kindest heart in Four Winds” (46), she “personate[s] the comedy that ever peeps around the corner at the tragedy of life” (231), she divides the world into “the race that knows Joseph” and that which does not. Hot-temperers fly in bipartisan politics, Grit and Tory. Marriage (as Gabriella Åhmansson terms it) is portrayed as “heaven and hell”.⁹⁸ Perhaps all this is magic worked by Anne’s twin *lares et penates*, Gog and Magog, one looking leftward, the other looking right.

Some of this is Cavendish reasserting itself; the religious breach, the panorama of east and west unfolding. Some of this is friction where the pre-war setting meets the war-time composition. In this sense, duality becomes the manifestation of Montgomery’s confused and displaced position in the changing world. Where romance and realism engage, *Four Winds* offers Anne the boundless possibility of romance through the sea, and stifles her with the conventions binding adult life. Where tradition meets progress, duality is the playground of Canadian identity: colony or nation. The double-sided, double-edged world of *Anne’s House of Dreams* creates mystery and illusion. Nothing is quite what it seems and even a man-hater gets married.

The Ingleside cat in *Rilla* is the spitting Stevensonian “Dr-Jekyll-and-Mr Hyde”. Duality, as John Herdman notes, lies “deep in the [Scottish] national psyche

⁹⁸ *A Life and Its Mirrors* Ch. 8.

and history".⁹⁹ Scott's *Waverley* [1814] explores historical aspects of this, with Edward Waverley pulled between Highland and Lowland landscapes, Jacobite and Hanoverian causes. Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* [1824] and RLS's *The Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* [1886], are the definitive nightmare visions of duality induced in large part by the Calvinist doctrine of predestination and Scottish hegemony on double predestination. L.M. Montgomery was not following Stevenson and Hogg into terror in her books, nor was her portrait of the Glen St Mary community, even at its Calvinist worst, quite so perverted as Burns' "Holy Willie's Prayer", or later, John Buchan's *Witch Wood* [1927]. Still, this Scottish psyche was clearly a Scots-Canadian psyche too, and it seems that in the horror of war, Montgomery returned to predestination in search of explanation.

This said, *Anne's House of Dreams* does embrace the possibility of horror in a vision that owes something to Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein*. Miss Cornelia rants about the Methodists, and extols the Presbyterians, but far from revering the Presbyterian minister, dismisses him as "a reverend jackass" (73).¹⁰⁰ To this end, *Anne's House of Dreams* focuses on medicine rather than religion, and specifically on scientific progress. Dr Gilbert Blythe brings modern ideas to the Glen, and takes risks in new experiments on his patients (64). For Gilbert, medicine is a weapon in the fight between good and evil: he is called to battle the "Great Destroyer" (ibid.). Gilbert's experiments are successful and he meets with the same awe that William MacLure inspires in Drumtochty. Like MacLure, Gilbert inherits his practice, and the trust of its patients, from a relative. MacLure is also hailed as a tool of the Almighty: by the Drumtochty folk, that is, not, like vainglorious Gilbert, by himself. MacLure and Gilbert tackle cases where all hope is lost.

But William MacLure is an old and a traditional man, more like Gilbert's Uncle Dave in truth, than Gilbert himself. Gilbert is accused by his wife of cruelty, unreasonableness, and meddling when he elects for *intervention* in the case of Dick Moore, Leslie's "mentally deficient" (208) "husband". Anne charges that "modern doctors are entirely too fond of making experiments with human flesh and blood" (254). Gilbert puts the patient first, unlike Anne, who is motivated by a desire to shield Leslie from the man that Dick Moore was, and could become again, were he restored to health. Gilbert is proved right when trephining unmask the presumed

⁹⁹ John Herdman. *The Double in Nineteenth-Century Fiction*. Basingstoke: Macmillan Press, 1990: 16.

¹⁰⁰ Unlike Mrs Allan, the Glen minister's wife is praised for dressing gaily: "when she has to live with a face like [her husband's] she needs something to cheer her up" (ibid.).

sinner as an innocent double. His success is endorsed by Bible sanction: "Ye shall know the truth and the truth shall make you free".

This plot has several messages to Montgomery's war-time readers, not least among them to endorse Canadian involvement—and perhaps even encourage American *intervention*—in the European conflict. It seems important that in the debate surrounding Gilbert's decision he is backed by Captain Jim, whereas Anne is flanked by Miss Cornelia. The women are emotional, and protective of their friend. Captain Jim may patronisingly think them a "mite illogical" (261), but their "female" logic, and choice of heart over head, is not truly undermined. Montgomery validates Anne's demonstrative child-rearing, and ridicules "Sir Oracle"—author of a book that implores mothers not to talk "baby talk" to children—as a cold-blooded theorist (312). Gilbert and Captain Jim view their decision, and in turn Leslie's, as a matter of duty. Attempting to cure Dick—to seek the truth—is their duty, and is proved the right course to follow. But Anne and Miss Cornelia are also correct—not in predicting the outcome—but in feeling that the pursuit of duty is painful, and likely to bring horror and suffering.

Dr Dave, on the other hand, objects to the operation because it is "new-fangled surgery" (256): Dave Blythe would most likely accuse Gilbert of meddling with predestination. He is a traditional rural doctor, out-of-step with his grand-nephew's ideas and with progress. Rural and traditional, conservative also: words which bring commendation in the Kailyard. Not so here. Gilbert's education in Kingsport (based on Halifax, NS) and medical knowledge in Montreal are paths to the future. Old-timers may scorn, but they are out-moded, and out-of-place in the new Canada, as are traditions of *laissez-faire*, non-intervention, of resigning oneself to Fate. God works through science to bring new destinies. To adapt a quotation, "Perhaps", as Mrs Lynde would say, "everything is foreordained and it was bound to happen anyway". But if this is the case, Gilbert finds it "nice to think one was an instrument used by predestination" (AA 306).

"Ah whiles hae ma doobts about the meenister"

Rainbow Valley finds the Blythes ensconced in Glen St Mary proper. Anne and Gilbert have returned from Europe, and their six children have been restored to Ingleside from their holiday homes. Susan and Miss Cornelia converge at Ingleside to meet Anne's demands for the news and gossip she has missed: "tell me everything that has happened while we've been away—*everything*—who has got born, or

married, or drunk; who has died, or gone away, or come, or fought, or lost a cow, or found a beau" (*RV* 4). Or been damned, she might have added. Anne gets more than she bargained for when Susan tells her that Mrs Harrison Miller over-harbour has tried (unsuccessfully) to hang herself, in a bid to escape her husband. Harrison Miller is beset by either "religion" or "cussedness", no one knows which, and "growls at everyone because he thinks he is fore-ordained to eternal punishment. And then there are days when he says he does not care and goes and gets drunk" (5).¹⁰¹

Patently a belief in predestination continues in the Glen St Mary psyche that runs deeper than Mrs Rachel Lynde's oft-quoted beliefs in fore-ordination¹⁰²: in *Rainbow Valley* folk are preoccupied with matters of election, punishment, and hell. Not, however, in the sense that they are plagued by fears for their *own* immortal souls. Gossip about parishioners convinced of their damnation—and indulging in sinful dissipation—is entertainment for an evening in May. Harrison's condition, in any case, is recognised as a mental illness. This recalls Rose Douglas in *Anne's House of Dreams*, who succumbs to the "religious melancholy [that] ran in her family. Her father worried so much over believing that he had committed the unpardonable sin that he died in the asylum" (*AHD* 244). In Island communities where old school Calvinists had preached "that blasphemous old idea of a 'hell of fire and brimstone'" (*SJ* II [Sept. 1, 1919] 326), religious melancholia was a not infrequent consequence. L.M. Montgomery believed that a sermon caused her own husband's "delusion—as such sermons have been responsible for many tortured hearts and souls" (*ibid.*).

Religion in the Kailyard is Free Kirk, strict and sober certainly, but democratic with a hearty belief in salvation through faith and good works. Calvinism and Predestination are primarily associated with Highlanders and the Highland environment.¹⁰³ When an incomer, Milton, arrives in Lowland Drumtochty, the natives are agog to discover his religion, Auld Kirk or Free. But Milton draws succour from neither church, thanks to his belief in predestination. As he explains to Jamie Soutar, "we're a' here on probation [...] few are chosen—juist a handfu' here an' there; no' on account o' any excellence in orrsel's, so we maunna boast". ("Verra comfortin' for the handfu'", replies the cynic.) Milton is scandalised that Mr Carmichael preaches, "we were a' God's bairns". "What think ye o' that?—nae

¹⁰¹ This branch of the Millers, according to Susan, are not "sound in [their] intellect". Harrison's grandfather went insane, pursued by imaginary black spiders.

¹⁰² e.g. "It really is almost enough to make one believe in ill-luck, though Mrs Lynde says there's no such thing, because everything is foreordained" (*AA* 207).

¹⁰³ Rev Ian Carmichael described a condition called "the gloom": "It comes on quite suddenly, and is quite a spiritual matter—a cloud which descends and envelops the soul. While it lasts a Highlander will not laugh or sing; he will hardly speak, and he loses all hope about everything. One of our men has the gloom at a time, and then he believes that he is . . . damned. I am speaking theologically". *Kate Carnegie and Those Ministers* 143.

difference atween the elect an' the ithers, nae preeveleges nor advantages! It's against baith Scriptur an' reason".¹⁰⁴

For a lull of two years, "Milton counted Drumtochty as an outcast place, because they did not speak about the affairs of the life to come, and Drumtochty would have nothing to do with Milton, because he was not straight in the affairs of the life which is now" (328). But when Milton is taken badly ill, his Drumtochty neighbours complete his farm-work. Milton concedes that "it's mair than . . . a'wud hae dune for them" (331). Before he came to Drumtochty, Milton had the "misfortune [...] tae mix wi' fouk that coonted words mair than deeds, an' were prooder tae open a prophecy that tae dae the wull o' God. We thocht that oor knowledge was deeper an' oor life better than oor neeburs" (335). Of course, in the idyll that is Drumtochty, Milton discovers "true" men and "true" religion and is brought "into the way of righteousness".

In *Rainbow Valley*, Glen St Mary plays host to a similar battle, wherein malicious words, contrived to prophesy the fate of the unelect amongst one's neighbours, are pitted against the "true" and "righteous" path of neighbourly deeds.

The Rev John Knox Meredith and his four children are incomers to the Glen. Mr Meredith's theological fitness is never questioned by his parishioners—he is widely admired by a community that values the delivery of their Sunday sermon—but he nonetheless offends on three fronts. In his absent-mindedness he makes gaffes contrary to expected ministerial propriety. In his spirituality he looks not to the ways of his household so the manse is dirty and his children unkempt. He has (unwittingly) duped a congregation who believed him to be married, and to their horror, he appears inclined to remain a widower. In the Glen's estimation, a minister should be decorous and worthy of reverence, a living embodiment and expression of their orthodox faith. As the flock have chosen him for their shepherd, visible faults in the minister are a personal and congregational insult. Worse, these faults may give ground to rival denominations seeking to assert superiority over the Presbyterians.

Jerry, Faith, Una, and Carl Meredith do not confine themselves to merely three affronts. They are badly dressed and go barefoot. Over the course of the novel the young Merediths break a series of behavioural and doctrinal rules. They play in the Methodist graveyard and attend Methodist prayer-meetings. Believing it to be Saturday, Faith and Una clean the manse on Sunday, in full view of a church elder. Faith then testifies in church that their Sabbath-breaking was a mistake, and in a post-confession fit of bedevilment dares Walter Blythe to join her in riding pigs

¹⁰⁴ *The Days of Auld Lang Syne* 321-322.

down the Glen street.¹⁰⁵ Faith stands meekly by while a visiting minister's coat-tails go up in flames (he has eaten her pet rooster) and Carl takes a frog to Sunday School. They hold a praying competition in the graveyard and a tea-party on the tombstones. Faith goes to church bare-legged, then explains herself, insulting several local families as she does so, in a letter to the local press. Next the graveyard is stage to a concert, with the Merediths' rendition of *Polly Wolly Doodle* running in synch with Deacon Baxter's prayer at the Methodist meeting next-door. Carl throws an eel in Mrs Carr's buggy when she calls him a varmint.

Each of these transgressions creates local scandal and fuels local gossip. The community expects a standard of conduct from the minister's children as justification of their social position. Understandably, ministers' children are believed capable of better behaviour than the children of ordinary mortals; not so understandably, some think ministers' children *innately* superior; "I do not think *any* minister's son would eat blueberries that grew on the graves of dead people" (125), says Susan. The Meredith children confound Glen conventions from the outset. The community reaction, principally the female half it must be said, is to tut-tut and stare, twit and scold. The children are allowed to continue in torn clothes and poor nutrition. The community quickly decides that Faith "is a holy terror for mischief" (12), and that the Merediths "have plenty of original sin in them" (74). Even Aunt Martha's poor old cat "is as full of the Old Nick as he can be stuffed" (13). At first these remarks are facetious, made by characters like Susan Baker whom readers trust. But steadily Glen St Mary opinion becomes censorious and cruel.

In part the parishioners fear that the Merediths' performance will cause the Presbyterian church to flounder. Not only do they feel exposed to Methodist scorn, they have a very real concern that financially their church cannot afford to lose the offended members. Presbyterian solidarity requires unity in condemnation (among themselves that is, not in front of the Methodists.) But the elect "old grannies" (276) also derive *pleasure* and *entertainment* from the children's escapades: pleasure, that is, in having something to be scandalised about. Their gossip is self-fuelling, and they seek more and more dynamite. Little the Meredith children do is interpreted positively, leastwise not outside the Ingleside veranda, where Anne makes a private defence of the children. Anne's imaginary plea to the Glen begins, "'Dear Christian friends'—with marked emphasis on 'Christian'" (277). The charge is unequivocal:

¹⁰⁵ James Mackay, in his biography of Burns, refers to Jane and Betty Maxwell, the daughters of Sir William Maxwell of Monteith: "the Maxwell girls were high spirited tomboys who often scandalised genteel Edinburgh society by their boisterous antics. On one memorable occasion Betty and Jane rode down the High Street on the back of pigs, turned loose from a neighbouring enclosure". James A. Mackay, *R.B.: A Biography of Robert Burns*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1992: 272.

those who criticise the Merediths, or apologise for the Merediths' behaviour shamefacedly, are not behaving like Christians.

Yet Anne is not Christian enough herself to offer practical help to the Merediths, or to give her neighbours an *actual* dressing-down. L.M. Montgomery was clearly tired of her famous heroine, for she has little part in this novel, but she seems likewise tired of describing "idylls". Avonlea women would gibe at the young folk disapproving-like, but Mrs Harmon Andrews and Mrs Jasper Bell (like Charles Macneill) are merely well-trained in a Scottish pessimism concerning youthful peccadilloes and would, for example, "have defended [Anne] as their own young had anyone else attacked her" (*AHD* 12).

Compared to Avonlea, Glen St Mary seems an "outcast" place. A starving, abused child arrives in the neighbourhood and no-one, saving the little Merediths, will take her in. "I think every one hereabouts who wants a home child has one", (81) says Miss Cornelia, safe in the knowledge that only the prospect of free labour would induce anyone to adopt a child. And so it is proved, for when Una asks Miss Cornelia to "take" Mary, Miss Cornelia's first thought is that she is "quite able to do all the work" (92) herself. As Faith writes in her letter to *The Journal*, "No child ought to go without shoes and stockings in a Christian community before the snow is all gone" (268). The local ladies are too busy knitting for the foreign heathen to practise Christianity closer to home. Were John Knox Meredith a different man, he would surely thunder against the monstrous regiment of women in his parish.

The Meredith children have been brought up in a house where "Love is the only law" (30). They have a secure faith, and believe that if you are good—"go to church and Sunday School and read your Bible and pray every night and give to missions"—"you'll go to heaven and if you're bad I guess you'd rather go to hell" (52). Until they arrive in the Glen they think themselves *good* children. Now, despite the fact that they go to church and Sunday School and so forth, they are constantly told they are *bad* children. In response, they ask for forgiveness from the community by explaining their actions. When this fails, they punish themselves—physically.

Perhaps their acquaintance with Mary Vance has imprinted violence on their impressionable young minds. Certainly, when their father admonishes them with gentle words it does not register as a reprimand: the Glen has schooled them into expecting a "combing down or pitching into" (285) each time they err. The Merediths punish themselves by "fasting" (Una is rendered unconscious) or by sitting outdoors in the cold wet terrible night (Carl almost dies of double pneumonia). Although this last incident brings out the congregation in force with "nourishing things" (311) for the patient, true good deeds are deferred until the minister has satisfied local

convention by taking a wife. Only then do the "Ladies' Aid [...] clean the manse from top to bottom" (338).

Scottish-Presbyterian reverence for ministers may answer for the Ladies' Aid's delayed intervention. (Miss Cornelia earns no respect from Susan for upbraiding the minister as if he was "any common person" [81].) Whatever the reason or excuse, Glen St Mary is clearly in danger of becoming like the over-harbour settlement Mary Vance escaped from, where "everybody's business is nobody's business" (80). Mrs Wiley whipped and starved Mary in plain view of her neighbours, yet no steps were taken to stop her. Mary Vance is to be pitied, she has "a little forlorn soul, stumbling in darkness and ignorance, beset by terror and compassed about with difficulties too great for it to grapple in its unequal struggle with a big indifferent world" (60). But Mary is also a gossipy little girl, boastful and sometimes intentionally cruel. Mary in *Rilla*, set some eight years later, is an unpopular bragging nag. Montgomery's message is unmistakable. If the adult community fail to guard "a' God's bairns", physically and spiritually, these bairns will grow into nasty adults. Miss Cornelia can be a carping and relentless woman, and so in turn becomes the child she adopts.

The Glen St Mary Presbyterians, like Milton in *The Days of Auld Lang Syne*, are forgetful of the life which is now. Mrs Leander Crawford "cries over every affecting thing the minister says. But you do not often see her name on a subscription list [...] Tears come cheaper" (124). Although Mrs Alec Davies is meant for a despicable interfering woman, her offer to adopt Una makes her one of the few Glen people to propose a practical solution. She does not want Una for a skivvy, but as a daughter and heir. There is no doubting she would make a terrible mother, and when Mr Meredith rejects this modest proposal her vengeance knows no bounds, but her intervention deserves some respect. Perhaps there is something in the Douglas blood. Mrs Alec's clansman Norman is, after his run-in with Faith, the most vocal supporter of the Merediths, and has no truck with the community's desire to "tame" them (276).

Norman Douglas knows first-hand about bitter tongues. He is not a *victim* of gossip, but he is a target, for reasons that the Merediths would be familiar with. Norman is a bit of a reprobate. He is not labelled a crank, like J.A. Harrison, but an "old pagan" (173). The Glen and Norman have a mutual theological quarrel. Miss Cornelia hopes that Norman's belief that there is no hell will be rectified on his death (162)! In fact, readers never find out if Norman Douglas has committed any actual unpardonable sin. He is, perhaps, the community bogie-man, a warning to youngsters of the perils of unconventionality. At any rate, Susan and Miss Cornelia believe Norman is "sure to go to hell" (175) and are thrilled about it, for he justifies them in

their own election. Norman may not believe in the bad place, but he likes to hear a “rip-roaring sermon on hell [...] the more brimstone the better. I like ‘em smoking” (179). Indeed, he goes to the manse and “bellows arguments on predestination with Mr Meredith” (311), whether for or against, or merely to goad the “parson”, is anyone’s guess.

Readers are evidently intended to like Mr Meredith. Yet it is hard not to concur with Mrs Alec Davies when she calls him, “A pretty father you, to talk of loving and caring for your children!” (149). Given that he leads his motherless children into starvation and sickness one can imagine the woeful state of his pastoral care. He is as guilty of failing his children as the community. *Rainbow Valley* ends “happily”, in that Mr Meredith finds himself a wife, and his children a mother, but there is little feeling that Glen St Mary has learned any lessons. The book closes with Walter’s vision of “The Piper”, foreshadowing the irresistibly fascinating and menacing call to arms followed by the boy-soldiers of the Great War. Partly drawn from the Pied Piper of Hamelin,¹⁰⁶ “The Piper” recalls another community where the adults use false words, betray trust, and as a result, lose their children. “Britain, and Canada, and much of Europe”, as Elizabeth Epperly notes, “failed to heed warnings about the Kaiser of Germany, and hundreds of thousands of young men and women were forced to pay for their elders’ mistake (*Fragrance* 103).

To her conscious mind, L.M. Montgomery always described the First World War as a struggle between God and evil. Written throughout 1917 and 1918,¹⁰⁷ *Rainbow Valley*, prepares the way for the soldiers and martyrs and nurses and home-front stalwarts—the heroes and heroines—of *Rilla*. But *Rainbow Valley* presents a more complex world order than that of black and white, of the good child and the bad child. In so doing the novel appears to relay Montgomery’s subconscious fears about the war, and her Christian doubts. The portrait of John Meredith—a spiritual father but a negligent father—questions the Father who allows monstrous war to happen when He professes to love and care for His children, whence Norman Douglas’s riddle on omnipotence: “Can God make a stone so big He couldn’t lift it Himself?” (183). Her apparent doubt in a loving God threw Montgomery back on her childhood days of the Shorter Catechism. If war was foreordained, and everything down to predestination, then God had some “Great Plan” in mind (*SJ* II [Mar. 16, 1917] 212) and war was justified. Were God not omnipotent, then war was the culmination of the evil that men do (cf. *SJ* II [Feb. 3, 1920] 371-372).

¹⁰⁶ See Owen Dudley Edwards. “L.M. Montgomery’s *Rilla of Ingleside*: Intention, Inclusion, Implosion”. *HT*. 126-136, especially 135-136.

¹⁰⁷ LMM finished *Rainbow Valley* on Dec. 24, 1918.

In February 1920, the war over and won, Montgomery wrote that she believed “in an God who is good but not omnipotent” (ibid.). Although *Rainbow Valley* was not completed until after the armistice was signed, her beliefs seem less concrete when the conflict still raged. Indeed, as she wrote to MacMillan in January 1917 (when work on *Rainbow Valley* began), “I have come to believe, as the straitest Presbyterian of them all, that everything is foreordained and will come to pass . . . all that *comes* to us, whether of happiness or sorrow, is foreordained, I believe, and therefore to be accepted without rebellion. I could never have believed or assented to this before the war”.¹⁰⁸

Even the act of writing *Rainbow Valley* engages in the debate. Montgomery, the author, knew that the war was foreordained for these Island people, and that her characters were predestined to endure it. As she created Anne’s sweet little children and their friends, she knew that she would send the race that knows Joseph into the hell of the trenches. This was part of her great plan for the “Anne” series, no doubt, but also the precursor to the first book she wrote “with a purpose” (*SJ* III [Sept. 3, 1921] 17).

Wi’ a Hundred Pipers

Jem departed whistling “Wi’ a hundred pipers and a’ and a’,” and Walter stood for a long time where he was [...] War was a hellish, horrible, hideous thing.

Rilla of Ingleside 29

Will they a’ return to their ain dear glen,
Will they a’ return, our Hielan men,
Second-sichted Sandy looked fu’ wae
An’ mithers grat as they march’d away
Wi’ a hundred pipers an’ a an’ a’.

Lady Nairn, “Wi a’ Hundred Pipers” ¹⁰⁹

Rilla of Ingleside opens in June 1914, when “[p]eople have almost forgotten what imps of mischief [the Meredith children] once were” (*RI* 11). Not quite forgotten, then, because nothing ever *is* forgotten in these tight-knit Island communities, and patently Glen St Mary when it remembers, remembers the childish mischief and not adult mischief-making. Norman Douglas is still an “old pagan” but “fire” has not yet descended “from heaven” (64) on his flame-haired head, much to Susan’s disappointment. Thus, at the outset it seems the community has changed little with the passing years: indeed it is important that continuity is established given what is

¹⁰⁸ Letter to GBM, dated Jan. 18 1916 [NAC].

¹⁰⁹ Alexander Gardner. *The Songs of Scotland*. 3rd ed. Paisley, London, 1893: 552.

to come. Folk still go to church on Sundays to hear Mr Meredith preach, and call out Dr Blythe when they are sick. Mrs Marshall Elliott, although now rather old, still pops over to Ingleside to hear the news. Gossip remains strong and vigorous, and probably even malicious too, as the scandals concerning Whiskers-on-the-Moon, a supposed German sympathiser, will bear out.

The loving God, on the other hand, has become a laughing-matter. Susan recalls that Cousin Sophia and she “quarrelled when we were children over who should get a Sunday School card with the words ‘God is Love,’ wreathed in rosebuds on it, and have never spoken to each other since” (16). Predestination wins out, and the foreordained comes to pass: with the declaration of war Montgomery’s young Canadians perceive the threat of German colonisation. The Piper comes, taking first Jem Blythe and Jerry Meredith, later Walter Blythe and Kenneth Ford (Leslie’s son), Carl Meredith and Shirley Blythe, and scores of other Island men to battle. As the Glen St Mary people are thrown into the war on the home-front, the community gains a new unity, or perhaps rediscovers an old one. The women organise a Red Cross branch, the men a Patriotic Society. Ingleside knits socks, hems sheets, learns to “save and serve” and “do their bit”. Congregations pull together, and Cornelia, for the first time in her life, sets foot in a Methodist church: “It took no less that a world conflict to bring that about” (202).

L.M. Montgomery’s “purpose” with *Rilla* was “to reflect the life that we lived in Canada during [the] four years of war” (*SJ* III [Sept. 3, 1921] 17). To a large degree this is achieved by depicting the round of life in Canada, where the advent of “the war news” was the day’s most important event. Montgomery’s war-experiences in Ontario were her primary source material here, although to judge from her journals she exaggerated the practical and patriotic zeal of her Leaskdale neighbours. *Rilla* emphasises the development and triumph of a national Canadian consciousness. Rilla Blythe and Walter Blythe are symbols of this. Rilla’s growth from dependent girlhood to independent womanhood is emblematic of Canada’s rise from colony to mature nation. Walter Blythe embodies every Canadian soldier. His fate is the “one death, in which Canada’s 50, 000 dead will be subsumed”,¹¹⁰ just as his war poem, “The Piper” is “an epitome of all the pain and hope and pity and purpose of the mighty conflict” (196).

But as Elizabeth Epperly points out, the book’s true hero is Susan Baker, the Ingleside maid. Indeed, as Owen Dudley Edwards argues, it is old, unbeautiful, uneducated Susan, and not young and pretty Walter and Rilla, who represents

¹¹⁰ Owen Dudley Edwards, op. cit., 127.

Canada and the patriotic Canadian fighting spirit in *Rilla*.¹¹¹ Susan Baker is a woman of simple ways and simple faith. She does not *believe* that victory will come, she *knows* it, and her fail-safe convictions steel the Ingleside household when other hopes and resilience have gone. Anne and Gilbert Blythe, for all their education and intellect and middle-class values, prove inadequate to the struggle. Gilbert in particular seems old and bent and broken in spirit. No surprise, then, to find the scientific doctor back in Avonlea when Rilla's war-baby is taken dangerously ill. Into the breach steps Mary Vance with a remedy learned from an old Scots woman, Aunt Christina MacAllister. Gilbert is apt to scorn "old wives' remedies" (236), and does so on his return, but the old ways have undoubtedly saved Jims's life where Gilbert has not.¹¹²

Understandably, this novel questions where "progress" has brought the world. Mr Meredith preaches a "sound and orthodox" (195) Christian view of the war, the tenor of which is that "there are things too little as well as too great for [man] to apprehend" (*ibid.*). Rev Meredith has faith that "in the end His purpose will be fulfilled", but this belief is not shared unreservedly in Glen St Mary. Only a "pagan" like Norman Douglas can stop Mr Pryor's pacifist prayer, for he alone lacks the "born-and-bred conviction that no disturbance must ever be made in a church, no matter what the provocation" (204). More to the point, Gertrude Oliver trusts to her prophetic dreams and to superstition rather than Presbyterian orthodoxy. Montgomery gave to Gertrude her own war-time dreams—which often came "true" (after some interpretation)—as well as her own "heretical" doubts (*ibid.*). Walter's portentous, inexplicable visions come to pass. Most of all, Ingleside folks, and readers, learn to trust in Jem's little dog, not government telegrams or even in faith that good will win out. Dog Monday is possessed by a strange intuition concerning Jem and Walter, which wins even the sceptical Gilbert Blythe's fidelity.

When Walter is killed in action at Courcellette, Monday howls a dirge from the train station where he awaits Jem's return. The banshee allusion is apposite for Montgomery probably intended to link these prophesies and visions to the Islanders' old world heritage, whether Scottish or Irish.¹¹³ For all that *Rilla of Ingleside* is a portrait of an united Canadian community in war, there is a crucial Scottish streak to the narrative. Montgomery resurrects the Scottish fighting spirit long dormant in these peaceable, pastoral Scots-Islanders.

¹¹¹ *ibid.*, 132.

¹¹² Notably, in spite of her love for the doctor, Susan keeps her own "cure for rheumatism" about the house, which the neighbours borrow when Gilbert's medicine proves too expensive (*RI* 306).

¹¹³ Meg Conover [Ch. 7] is the first prominent Irish personage in the "Anne" series. She is a vulgar woman who drinks and smokes.

In part this is the heroic, romantic legacy of Walter Scott. Fifteen-year-old Rilla greets the war in a flurry of italics, truly believing with Ellen Douglas (Scott's Ellen Douglas that is!) that her brother Jem "goes to do what I had done/ Had Douglas' daughter been his son" (55 cf. *The Lady of the Lake* IV.x.30-1). When Walter conquers his hatred of violence and enlists, he tells Rilla that he does not fear death: "Comes he slow or comes he fast/ It is but Death who comes at last" (142 cf. *Marmion* II.xxx.11-12). Importantly, these are the words, not of a warrior, but of a woman, Constance de Beverley, a nun who disguises herself as a page. Walter is strangely sexless, convinced by his fears that he "should have been a girl" (59).¹¹⁴ Gertrude Oliver's final dream of victory comes with the plea, "Sooth was my prophecy of fear/ Believe it when it augurs cheer" (285 cf. *The Lady of the Lake* IV.xi.13-14.)

This citation of *Marmion* recalls *Rainbow Valley*, wherein Walter's early poems were partly written in imitation of Scott's epic tale of Flodden Field. Back yet further, Anne Shirley had marched the Green Gables' cows home from pasture to the strains of the battle canto—"The stubborn spear-men still made good/ Their dark impenetrable wood" (AGG 260 cf. *Marmion* VI.xxxiv.12-13)—a turn of pace that makes one rather sorry for the cows. In school, Anne learns *Marmion* by rote, an education presumably shared by her children. Small wonder then that, when face to face with warfare, with terror and with impotence, these Islanders draw strength from their Scottish martial heritage.

Scott's poems did not side-step death, and both *Marmion* and *Roderick Dhu* fall in battle, but his descriptions of warfare in a romantic landscape were a cleaner, more decent vision than the grim and inconceivable realities of the Western Front. As Paul Fussell reminds us, the Great War began in innocence—for the innocents if not for the war-makers—with warfare the stuff of literary memory; chivalric, feudal, romantic.¹¹⁵ Thus the irony of the First World War, and in part the irony of gung-ho Jem greeting the gathering storm-clouds with a whistle of, "Wi' a hundred pipers and a' and a'". The Piper will lead his brother into death, while his "mither" sits at Ingleside asking, "Will they a' return to their ain dear glen?"

There are visible ranks of "Hielan' men" among the Glen battalions, many more than had made their presence known in other Four Winds' books: Laurie MacAllister enlisting aged only sixteen, Angus Mackenzie joining him although every day of fifty-five (209), Roderick MacCallum writing letters home in Gaelic from his German

¹¹⁴ For a pertinent discussion of LMM's characterisation of Walter Blythe, see Benjamin Lefebvre. "Walter's Closet." *CCL* 94 [Summer 1999]: 7-20.

¹¹⁵ Paul Fussell. *The Great War and Modern Memory*. 1975. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1977: especially, 18-29.

prison camp (214). Many of these characters come from the “Upper Glen”—the Glen high lands—and it seems that Montgomery was situating a settlement of Highland Scots there. The Glen even has a “Second-sighted Sandy”. Highland Sandy is a prominent force in the novel, although seldom “fu’ woe”. Instead he presides over the war-torn community with the air of the last minstrel, galvanising the thoughts of the Glen folk.¹¹⁶ In August 1914, when Glen St Mary foregathers to talk of war, old Highland Sandy “hurled anathemas at the Kaiser across all the acres of his farm” (61). Like Dr Blythe and the Rev Meredith, Highland Sandy is too old to fight at the front, and must “do his bit” with the women at home. He curses the Kaiser to the four winds, and appraises the menace of the foe: “there is no doubt that the Kaiser is the Anti-Christ spoken of in Revelations” (182).¹¹⁷

The spectre of “The Piper” becomes the leitmotif of *Rilla of Ingleside*. The phantom piper is conjured by Walter when war is announced (44). “The Piper” is the title of Walter’s three verse war poem, and symbolic of the faith kept between the dead and living armies, in the same way that red poppies are invoked by John McCrae. (“In Flanders Fields” was the antecedent for Walter’s poem, its message, and its impact.) With his death, Walter joins the “shadowy host” that trail the Piper across the Western Front (223). Walter Blythe’s vision is explicitly inspired by Browning’s Pied Piper, but Montgomery probably had other pipers in mind, from Pan himself, to Peter Pan, Kenneth Grahame’s Piper at the Gates of Dawn,¹¹⁸ and the piper mascots of Scottish and Canadian regiments, who led their troops “over the top”.¹¹⁹ Skirling bagpipes seem closer to the “wild” music that ends *Rainbow Valley* (340), and the “weirdly” piped music Walter hears before death (223), than do the “sweet soft notes” of Browning’s pipes.

Highland Sandy seems a home-front version of the Piper’s Scottish traits. Never more than an incidental character, Sandy nonetheless commands an authority over the community. His comments and “quaint phrases” appear to tap a vein of truth and perfectly express the things that cannot be said by non-Highlanders who lack his poetic oral heritage. He enters the text at certain critical moments: skirling

¹¹⁶ Highland Kitty performs a similar role in *Anne of Ingleside*.

¹¹⁷ Susan Baker does not agree with Highland Sandy on this occasion, thinking it “too great an honour for [the Kaiser]” (*RI* 182).

¹¹⁸ “O, Mole! The beauty of it! The merry bubble and joy, the thin clear happy call of the distant piping! Such music I never dreamed of, and the call in it is stronger even than the music is sweet! Row on, Mole row! For the music and the call must be for us”. Kenneth Grahame. *The Wind in the Willows*. London: Methuen, 1970: 132.

¹¹⁹ Not only were the pipers heading the troops, Lloyd George commented that Canadian valour and distinction at Courcelette marked them out as “storm troopers; for the remainder of the war they were brought along to head the assault in one great battle after another”. Cited in Kenneth McNaught. *The Pelican History of Canada*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1982: 213.

anathemas when the war breaks out, leading the charge of “Anti-Christ” when the Parliament Building in Ottawa burns and Ingleside rages, sounding the lament for Gilbert’s distress as his third son enlists (241), and gathering the village “in a low” (260), that is, in a flame, for the “Conscription Election” of 1917. Sandy is not present before the war, and, like “Dr Jekyll-and-Mr Hyde”, is unheard of after the peace. During the war years, however, his anger, his theology, his humour, and his sympathy, head the home troops in battle.

Canada’s allegiance to the Empire was paramount in a book which openly criticised US neutrality. Jem is an Empire boy raised on Henty books and Kipling, as is apparent from his idealistic adventurism and bellicose leadership.¹²⁰ (Jem marshals the regimental Good Conduct Club.¹²¹) Walter, too, has his share of idealism, but these ideals are inspired by *adult* poetic idylls. Walter is a soldier-hero whose “cowardice”, courage, and fate, predict the psychological impact of the war on Canadians, and on Canada. Jem’s imperialism does not prepare him for the reality of war,¹²² and he is noticeably “faded” and “grey” on his return from overseas (314). In death, Walter’s boyishness is preserved, and in turn immortalised in “The Piper”. The Scottish spirit of this poem—in its imagery and *McCrae* antecedent—suggests that although post-war Canadian national maturity and independence would “fade” Empire connections, the strength of Scottish ties would remain inspirational.

Conclusion

L.M. Montgomery ranks for me, far and away above Sir Gilbert Parker or Ralph Connor or Charles G.D. Roberts as an interpreter of Canadian life as a realist. I do not say that she tells a better story than these eminent authors, nor that her style is more pleasing (though it is so far as the first two are concerned), but she knows the Canadian people better, gets far closer to their hearts, sees more clearly their faults and their excellencies than they do [...] she presents Canadian life in her stories as it is lived and as we plain ordinary, everyday Canadians live it and see it lived all about us.¹²³

In imagination, L.M. Montgomery never left the Island. She continued to translate her early background and childhood into fiction, continually delighting the readers who had first adored the “sylvan glories” of Anne’s Avonlea. For many of these

¹²⁰ Jem, short for James, is christened James Matthew after Captain Jim and Matthew Cuthbert, but the name is also suggestive of *James Matthew Barrie*.

¹²¹ Jem gets his idea from “a story-book” (*RV* 247). Jem’s literary influences are very *Boy’s Own Paper* in comparison with Walter’s.

¹²² “[The Glen people] don’t realise yet what it is that has broken loose—I didn’t when I first joined up. I thought it was fun. Well, it isn’t” (*RV* 118).

¹²³ Austin Bothwell, review of *Rainbow Valley* (np, 1919). Clippings scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

readers, Prince Edward Island is a bucolic island paradise offering security, happy-endings, and escapism. For others, Prince Edward Island is an island of adventures: not quite a Coral Island or a Treasure Island perhaps, but nonetheless a place that can bewitch with the promise of magical and surprising events, shock with freak coincidences, thrill with childhood terrors. Between paradise and adventure, her Island is also a realistic representation of ordinary Canadian life and ordinary Canadian people that, contrary to one reputation, keeps pace with the winds of change.

Small and intricate, isolate and sea-girt, Cavendish was a traditional conservative community. In people, place, and religion, in custom and in culture, the Scottish roots of the community were still pronounced after a hundred years of settlement. Psychologically, this bequeathed a divided inheritance, which inspired the underlying tensions in Montgomery's fiction: the Presbyterians valued academic and intellectual pursuits but frowned upon creativity; the Scots were the product of a violent, dramatic, "romantic" history, but denied the legitimacy of many emotional expressions; the Scots-Canadian community carped and criticised its own, but would defend the same from hostile outsiders. These contradictions sit uncomfortably with many of Montgomery's young or rebellious characters, and demarcate arenas of conflict.

These tensions become more conspicuous in L.M. Montgomery's First World War triptych. In the Avonlea books, the rural people can be abrasive, unfair, stupid even—and are therefore gently mocked and subtly undermined—but are generally "good" folk. In the moral balance, rural concerns, optimism, ministers and teachers, lads and lasses o' pairts and sentimental moments, the Avonlea books evoke a Scottish sensibility partly founded in the Kailyard. Montgomery continued to invoke Scotland and the Scottish psyche as a conduit when writing of Anne's and Gilbert's new home. Yet, these influences engage with a world at war, not in peace, even where the setting belongs to the "green, untroubled pastures and still waters of the world before the war".

Anne's House of Dreams plays with duality, women's will, and God's will. *Rainbow Valley* carries on the theme in a bleaker vision where issues of predestination govern a world where the outbreak of war is foreordained. In *Rilla of Ingleside* a Piper removes young men to the Old World, and a Highlander animates the Islanders. In each of these books, L.M. Montgomery explores the growth of national identity in Canada as it is played out in a small and increasingly realistic Canadian neighbourhood. There is something of the idyll in all these books—in the charm of the coastline, the shelter of the valley, the home-fires of Ingleside—but a

forceful and ironic anti-idyll revises the golden age. The green gables do not quite give way to green shutters, but the Glen St Mary books plant a few “unpoetic realities” in the brier bush garden, indicative of Montgomery’s emergent post-war and “Canadian style”.

III.i.

“Matters of Predestination”

Ewan has been very miserable today and made a mess of preaching. But he did well to preach at all. Yet he is always better when he forces himself to do his work. When he gives himself over to inactive brooding it intensifies his conviction of his “lost” condition.

A curse on the devilish theology that implanted such ideas in his consciousness!
(*SJ* III [Mar. 9, 1924] 168).

“I’ll never, never, *never* marry a minister, no matter how nice he is.”

Rainbow Valley 163

In a short article, “The Religious Thought of L.M. Montgomery”, church historian Gavin White makes the curious observation that, “there is very little religion in [Montgomery’s] books” (84).¹ That is, he claims, for someone whose juvenile life was proscribed by the local elders, who always attended Sunday service, and who married a Presbyterian minister, “church-going” and “sermons” are conspicuously absent from Montgomery’s fiction and journals.

Inevitably, this overview is limited to a brief summary of Montgomery’s personal belief system, and White glances only fleetingly at her books. His purpose is to demonstrate that Montgomery was neither a “religious genius” (87) nor a radical thinker. She might have circumvented Presbyterian observance and direction, but “hammered [...] out on her own” an essentially “mature and balanced Christian faith” (84), which embraced some Transcendentalist thought and essentially rejected Predestination, however much she latterly accepted “fate”. Stuart Macdonald for one testified (with chagrin perhaps) to his mother’s orthodoxy: “She was very religious although in rather a rigid way, and although in her writings she gave the impression of broad tolerance of human weaknesses, she did not condone any such elasticity in herself or in her family” (Gillen, 190).

¹ Gavin White. “The Religious Thought of L.M. Montgomery.” *HT* 84-88.

Still, White's essay is unsatisfactory in its approach to L.M. Montgomery's fiction. Anne Shirley's and Mrs Rachel's combined critical talents catechise many a minister and his sermon and, as the preceding analysis of *Rainbow Valley* suggests, religion (including church attendance, worship, and preaching) is central to many of Montgomery's stories and novels.²

White's summation is valid in one respect. In 1923, when the Canadian General Assembly voted preliminarily in favour of Church Union, L.M. Montgomery was sufficiently inelastic about Presbyterianism to wish she "were free to go over to the Anglican communion" (*SJ* III [June 12, 1923] 132).³ She thought her "fathers' church"—a "stately" church with a "noble history and inspiring traditions"—had "been forced to commit suicide" (*ibid.*). Yet, keen as Montgomery's feelings about the Union "crisis" were, her dramas are immune to the disruption. (Captain Jim goads Miss Cornelia with rumours of Methodist and Presbyterian union [*RV* 14], but in a turn-of-the-nineteenth-century setting.⁴) No congregation in Montgomery's fictional communities worships in the United Church of Canada, and her post-union families remain Presbyterians. An independent Presbyterian church survived of course (and Ewan Macdonald remained a Presbyterian minister) but it is nonetheless striking that Montgomery omits the 1920s' religious turmoil from her fiction, given its significance in her own story.

Montgomery's books, then, appear to preach a broader *tolerance* than she personally felt, while simultaneously reinforcing her *intolerance* of other Protestant denominations through her tacit refusal to give voice or credence to the union debate. They explore denominational rivalries in Canada, but not the ways in which these rivalries were instituted and overcome in the changing *national* religious climate.⁵

² For another interpretation of LMM's approach to religion in her fiction, see Rosemary Ross Johnston. "'Reaching beyond the Word': Religious Themes as 'Deep Structure' in the 'Anne' Books of L.M. Montgomery." *CCL*. 88 [Winter 1997]: 7-18. Johnston argues that LMM encodes these books "on the fundamental tenet of the religious philosophers, that God is the ground of all meaning. In *Anne of Green Gables*, God is love, in *Anne of Avonlea* God is truth, in *Anne of the Island*, God is the eternal reality, in *Anne's House of Dreams* God is a goodness that can only be sought through faith" (17).

³ "I would feel more at home in [the Anglican church] than I can ever feel in 'the United Church of Canada'" (*SJ* III [June 12, 1923] 132). This sentiment may have anticipated the Stirling family's Anglicanism, and Jane Stuart's baptism in the "Anglican Church in Charlottetown" (*JLH* 72).

⁴ Rilla notes in her diary, "[Miss Cornelia] used to be so bitterly opposed to Church Union. But last night, when father told her it was practically decided, she said in a resigned tone: 'Well, in a world where everything is being rent and torn what matters one more rending and tearing? Anyhow, compared with Germans, even Methodists seem attractive to me'" (*RI* 261).

⁵ LMM noted that James Fraser, editor of the *New Glasgow Chronicle* (Nova Scotia), inferred from *Rilla* that LMM was a Unionist. She cites from his review: "Possibly if there were more prayers and less stories in the Unionist minister's [*sic*] homes there would be less desire to throw away the church of their fathers—less of the spirit of Babel and more of Christ" (*SJ* III [Jan. 6, 1922] 36). Possibly such criticism steered LMM away from the topic of Union.

Montgomery describes Canadian Presbyterianism and Canadian ministers⁶—to be sure, many, like Ewan Macdonald, were trained in Scotland—yet within a pre-union Presbyterian framework, whenever the actual setting. Furthermore, this religion is chiefly influenced by *Scottish* Presbyterianism. Faith is by no means sacrosanct, and disputes rage between old and new school theologies, but these debates are no different to, and are probably initiated by, Scottish ones.

The Calvinist Macneills

L.M. Montgomery's religious thoughts were directed in the first instance by her experiences in the Cavendish kirk, where Scots-Canadian old-timers still held sway. In the nineteenth century, as Gavin White notes, the "major issue [of Presbyterian debate] was Predestination" (84)—*single predestination* (that God marked the elect), and *double predestination* (that God also chose those who were damned). Janice Kulyk Keefer argues that "Calvin's skeleton does not exactly rage in the closets of Green Gables",⁷ but Calvin's bones *do* rattle in Montgomery's fiction. One enduring impact of Ewan Macdonald's "inactive brooding" on his wife's writing (and analysis of it) is to focus attention on this peculiar legacy.

The "Calvinist Macneills" are a byword in biographies of L.M. Montgomery and critiques of her fiction. Although the tag partly comes from an equation of Calvinism with Presbyterianism, it is also linked to the family's supposed *behaviour* (if not to their faith exactly).⁸ Indeed, it is largely Montgomery's picture of the harsh rule meted by her Macneill *grandparents* that has fixed the image of a *clan* of "Calvinist Macneills". (Subsequent commentators follow Montgomery in glossing over the fact that Grandmother Macneill was Anglican by birth, for all that she attended the Presbyterian church.⁹) "Calvinism" is a cultural marker denoting the polarisation of the stern and plain-spoken "Scottish" *grandfather* from the gay and imaginative Canadian granddaughter.

⁶ Rev James Perry, the native of Glen St Mary who goes on to eat Faith Meredith's rooster, may be LMM's idea of a quintessentially Canadian minister. He is neither the kindly quiet figure (e.g. Rev Gavin Dishart) or thundering preacher (Rev John Knox) familiar from Scottish tradition, but "tiresome, pompous (*RV* 203), "oily, complacent" (205).

⁷ *Under Eastern Eyes* 195.

⁸ The Montgomery family have acquired neither religious epithet. Three of the eleven Macneill households in Cavendish c. 1890 were Baptists.

⁹ The nearest English church to Cavendish was at South Rustico, where LMM's Woolner great-grandparents are buried. Hugh John Montgomery's step-mother, Louisa Cundall, "was a strict 'Church of England' woman and always went to her own church, never having aught to do with the Presbyterian church where Grandfather was a staunch elder" (*SJ* IV [June 2, 1931] 133).

Montgomery's stories often grapple with matters of predestination, but her characters are specifically demarcated "Calvinists" (as opposed to Presbyterians) only in extreme circumstance or under provocation. ("Infidel" Dean Priest's sneer at the "true-blue Calvinists of New Moon" is a case in point.¹⁰) Although Montgomery described Alexander Marquis Macneill's rigidity, dourness, and severity with considerable force, she was close-mouthed about his brand of Presbyterianism, save to say that the Macneills were "Puritan" (*SJ* I 213). Despite her circumspection, this portrait has in turn been accommodated within, and somewhat smothered by, the mantle of Scottish Calvinism. (Naturally, she readily raises Calvin's theological spectre with reference to her husband.) As Puritanism and Calvinism are not synonymous, and each term is fraught with stereotype, some clarification is required concerning religious practice in Cavendish.

John T. McNeill dedicates *The History and Character of Calvinism* [1954] to the memory of his father, "William Cavendish McNeill, 1849-1928, an exemplar of Calvinist faith and virtue".¹¹ In his preface McNeill gratefully recalls, "At the age of ten I was induced by my father to memorize the Westminster Assembly's Shorter Catechism". As the name indicates, William Cavendish McNeill belonged to the north shore clan, being a nephew of Alexander Marquis Macneill.¹² Apropos, James Macneill, Grandfather Macneill's brother, is described by their sister Mary Lawson (in her sketch of the family) as "saved" (*SJ* IV 418). Montgomery thought the impetus for this comment lay in James' intermittent church attendance: "This was a terrible thing in the eyes of his generation and perhaps Aunt Mary wanted to throw a defiance in the teeth of anybody who might infer from it that his future fate was dubious. A Macneill *must* be 'saved' even if he were not wholly orthodox" (*SJ* IV 128).

Both sources imply that Alexander Marquis Macneill and his siblings—the second Canadian-born generation—were schooled by preachers and parents in Scottish Calvinist doctrine. White argues that, given "Scottish Presbyterianism had begun to move away from Predestination in the 1830s, and by the 1870s this was largely accomplished except in the Highlands [and Islands]", L.M. Montgomery was

¹⁰ As Dean Priest is regarded by the clans of Murray and Priest as unelect (both his physical handicap as well as his unconventional lifestyle are "signs") he has a personal interest in marking the New Moon folks' as Calvinists. Rumours are also circulated by Old Kelly that "whin [Dean] was being christened he rached up and clawed the spectacles off av the minister. So what wud ye ixpect?" (*EC* 41). Although nominally a Protestant, Old Kelly is Irish, and casting up supposedly bad baptismal behaviour in later life seems a Catholic cultural inheritance.

¹¹ John T. McNeill. *The History and Character of Calvinism*. New York: Oxford UP, 1954: Preface.

¹² William Cavendish Macneill was the son of Alexander's brother Thomas and his wife (and cousin) Charlotte Simpson. W.C Macneill married Emily Lavinia Macneill. The family did not remain in Cavendish.

“probably not taught [predestination]; in fact, she probably heard sermons rejecting it” (84).¹³ However, as Montgomery was raised by her grandfather [b. 1820], not her parents, this must be a matter for contention. Certainly she recited the Shorter Catechism at home and in Sunday School—as do her fictional youngsters—even if the lessons therein had a limited theological impact (*SJI* [Jan. 7, 1910] 378). In any event, to hear predestination lambasted from the pulpit was not to have it renounced on the homestead, especially in Presbyterian congregations where men and women reserve the right to judge that their minister’s “theology is not sound” (*EC* 26).¹⁴

This said, in Montgomery’s youth and young womanhood, Cavendish was a community in religious transition. The foundation of the Baptist church in 1869 had at first been divisive and bitter, but younger Presbyterians began to attend Baptist meetings as well as their own in the Rev J.C. Spurr’s ministry (1885-1896), and consequently some, if not all, rancour diminished. On the other hand, the older Presbyterians frowned upon such “gadding”, if Charles Macneill’s comments are typical. Alexander Marquis Macneill despised Baptists enough for Montgomery to know she was flouting family convention by agreeing to marry her Baptist cousin, Edwin Simpson (*SJ I* [Feb. 2, 1897] 179). In Montgomery’s hands, incidentally, Baptists not Presbyterians are mocked for their strictness.¹⁵ Scandalised by the fact that the Presbyterian minister conducts her sister’s marriage ceremony when the groom (whom she disapproves of) is up a step-ladder, Emmeline Strong transfers allegiance to the Baptist church: “‘I am very sorry,’ [Rev Mr Leonard] said in that gentle, saintly way of his, ‘for the Baptists’” (“The Courtship of Prissy Strong” *CA* 205).

The face of the traditional Presbyterian service had also changed. The old church was demolished in 1899, and a new building erected on land donated by Alexander’s son, John Franklin Macneill.¹⁶ “Human hymns” gradually replaced psalms, and organ music was introduced.¹⁷ A look at Montgomery’s fiction shows

¹³ The Presbyterian minister in Cavendish in LMM’s formative years was Rev W.P. Archibald (minister 1878 to 1896) from Upper Musquodoboit, Nova Scotia.

¹⁴ cf. “I don’t believe any but fools enter the ministry nowadays,” [Mrs Lynde] wrote bitterly. “Such candidates as they have sent us, and such stuff as they preach! Half of it ain’t true, and, what’s worse, it ain’t sound doctrine” (*Als* 41).

¹⁵ e.g. “we went over to the party but I can’t say I really enjoyed it. Alf [Simpson, LMM’s Baptist cousin] doesn’t dance—thinks it the unpardonable sin, I believe” (*SJ I* [Mar. 15, 1897] 182).

¹⁶ There was a lengthy squabble over the site of the new church (which opened in 1901) fictionalised in *Anne’s House of Dreams* 138-139.

¹⁷ Walter Simpson’s history of Cavendish describes a traditional Presbyterian service, which “began with a long selection from the Scotch version of the Psalms which was fitted to such old standard tunes as ‘Coles Hill’, ‘Irish’, ‘Bangor’ or ‘Old Hundred’” for “there were no ‘human hymns’ allowed in these times” (“Cavendish in the Olden Times.” *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. Vol. 2:3 [May 1900]). Organ music was not played in the Cavendish church until 1896: LMM

that not all old-timers were as magnanimous as the psalm-loving narrator of "The Trouble in the Bend Choir", who concedes, "if other folks want hymns, let 'em have hymns".¹⁸ In contrast, "[Franklin Westcott] has never gone to church since hymns came in" (*AWW* 185) and "When we got the organ up at the Glen church old Elder Richards bounced up from his seat the minute the organist began to play and scuttled down the aisle and out of the church at the rate of no-man's-business." (*AHD* 148).¹⁹ As this comic image suggests, fundamentalists did not necessarily command respect. The younger generation lacked social clout, but could undermine and ridicule their elders covertly. A running joke in Maud Montgomery's and Nora Lefurgey's comic diary, for example, is Mrs Ewen J. Mackenzie's old-fashioned habit of referring to Saturday as the "Sabbath eve".²⁰

As regards "Sabbath" observance, a sober image exists of Scots-Presbyterians tramping to the kirk both morning and evening, and spending the interim in quiet (and gloomy) reflection with their Bible and tracts. (Lucy Woolner Macneill was fond of "reading hymns and crying over them" in the fading Sunday light [*SJI* (Jan. 20, 1907) 328].) Sundays in Cavendish generally followed this pattern,²¹ but the reputedly dour congregations were periodically inspired by evangelical preachers. In 1902, Montgomery laughed to recall a recent series of revival meetings in the Cavendish Baptist church, which initially created a stir among the local youth, and latterly a stir among the elders when the Baptist preacher was unmasked a Presbyterian (*SJI* [Nov. 30, 1902] 283).²² No such chicanery surrounds the Rev Geoffrey Mountain in "The Conscience Case of David Bell". This revivalist's visit to Avonlea, with the accompanying "emotional services, public testimonies, and religious excitement", is welcomed by "the majority of the congregation, including the minister" (*FCA* 171) who all crave "religious dissipation".

In this story, L.M. Montgomery depicts such emotionalism as anathema to the "sturdy soul" of an orthodox (and presumably Calvinist) Scotsman, "Uncle" Jerry

played the organ and married the minister, thus following in the matrimonial footsteps of the previous organist, Mabel Simpson, and Rev Major MacIntosh.

¹⁸ Originally published in *Household Guest* (no date available), Scrapbook 6, labelled "Stories and Poems late 1890s early 1900s", CM. 67.5.17.

¹⁹ cf. also "Whin they voted in church to set for prayers d'ye think me fine Geordie wud do it? Not be a jugful. Stiff as a ram-rod wud he stand up, wid his back to the minister, and his legs a yard apart and glare over the congregation" (*PSB* 112).

²⁰ In LMM's fiction, characters who say "Sabbath" are harsh, uncompromising, and unsympathetic, like Aunt Mouser (*AWW* 107) or the Woman who bullies Little Elizabeth (*AWW* 50).

²¹ As Paul Irving reflects, on life with his Scotch grandmother, "Sunday is a very long day on the shore road" (*AA* 282).

²² This episode is adapted for *Anne's House of Dreams*, where the evangelist, to Miss Cornelia's consternation, is a Methodist claiming to be a Presbyterian. Methodists rejected Predestination, perhaps the root of Miss Cornelia's intolerance.

MacPherson. On the Island, as Montgomery knew, frenetic conversions and passionate preaching were associated with the “McDonaldite” church, a congregation comprising chiefly of Highlanders, under the ministry of the Rev Donald McDonald [1783-1867], a stern Calvinist and millennialist.²³ Montgomery described the McDonaldites to George Boyd MacMillan thus:

[They] are principally noted for “the works,” a very strange manifestation of psychic excitement that comes over them in preaching. They will go through the wildest contortions, some of them impossible in a normal state, yet no injury ever results. They cannot resist the impulses of this strange power and the scenes at a McDonaldite sacrament are wild in the extreme. Outsiders are often affected, even the most skeptical—and frequently take “the jerks” as bad as the sect themselves.²⁴

This fervour is reminiscent of The Great Awakening of the American colonies in the 1730s and 40s. Having said that worship in Cavendish was primarily directed by Scottish Presbyterianism, there is patently a discernible American influence.²⁵

Methodist George Whitefield, the cross-eyed English charismatic who (with Jonathan Edwards) spearheaded this Awakening, was one of Maud Montgomery’s early religious “heroes”.²⁶ At the age of nine or so she piously recorded in her diary, “I wish I were in heaven now, with mother and George Whitefield and Anzonetta B. Peters” (*SJI* [Jan. 7, 1910] 376). Anzonetta R. Peters is the child-heroine of a ghastly little American volume celebrating the saint-in-miniature’s “conversion” and early death.²⁷ (Emily Byrd Starr, like Montgomery, is inspired to imitate Anzonetta’s habit of quoting hymn verses at the drop of a hat [*ENM* 89].) A picture of George Whitefield hangs in the spare room at Green Gables (*Als* 10).²⁸

The New England Primer and the Peep of Day series (Methodist Sunday school tracts by Mrs Favell Lee Mortimer, issued by the American Tract Society of Boston²⁹) are Marilla Cuthbert’s favoured tools of religious education—alongside the

²³ see David Weale. “‘The Minister’: The Reverend Donald McDonald.” *IM*. 3 [Fall-Winter 1977]: 1-6; M. Lamont. *Rev. Donald McDonald: Glimpses of His Life and Times*. Charlottetown: Murley & Garnhum, 1902. Before his death, McDonald had around 5000 adherents in 12 congregations.

²⁴ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 19, 1906, *My Dear Mr. M* 22-23. Miss Cornelia refers to this sect in *Rilla of Ingleside*: “Her brother Amos was a Macdonaldite [*sic*] in religion. I am told he used to take the jerks something fearful” (*RI* 161). Interestingly, LMM makes no concession here to non-Island readers unacquainted with the McDonaldite church.

²⁵ cf. LMM’s account of the evangelist American preacher, B. Faye Mills’ visit to the Big Brick Methodist Church in Charlottetown in 1894. LMM reports that 2700 people attended his farewell service (*SJI* [May 2, 6, 7, 1894] 105).

²⁶ We might say of George Whitefield, as Philippa Gordon does of Charlie Sloane, “He must have done something dreadful in a previous existence to be punished with such eyes” (*Als* 60)!

²⁷ *The Young Disciple; or, a Memoir of Anzonetta R. Peters* was written by the Rev John A. Clark, one time rector of St. Andrew’s Church, Philadelphia, and published by the American Tract Society in New York.

²⁸ When Mrs Rachel Lynde moves into the Green Gables’ spare room, George Whitefield (and the Duke of Wellington) are “relegated to the upstairs hall” (*Als* 11).

²⁹ see *The Annotated Anne* 100.

catechism—reflecting Montgomery's personal early instruction. These American books (the Maritime provinces had close trade and communication links with the eastern States) were often Calvinist in their teaching, just as "go-preachers"³⁰ often sought to distinguish the chosen from the unregenerate through dramatic conversion experiences. (Avonlea's would-be minister, Moody Spurgeon Macpherson, is named for two evangelists, American-born Dwight Lyman Moody [1837-1899] and Charles Haddon Spurgeon [1834-1892] an immensely popular English Baptist [and Calvinist] preacher.)

The doctrine of predestination may have been shaken, but an ideological legacy endured. Documenting her youthful spiritual struggles, L.M. Montgomery recalled that an overpowering dread of hell—which (in line with the straightest Calvinist preaching) she "implicitly believed to be a lake of fire and brimstone, haunted by the devil and all his angels"—made her desperate "to be a Christian" (*SJ I* [Oct. 7, 1897] 196). In 1897, aged twenty-two, she had ceased to believe in many of the church's teachings, but had "not yet formulated any working belief to replace that which I have outgrown" (*SJ I* 197). Her subsequent theological dilemmas, such as her attempts to reconcile the horrors of the Great War with God's supposed omnipotence, were affected by the Calvinist-Presbyterian belief in foreordination. Montgomery certainly hammered out her own faith, but this process (in life and in literature) entailed analysing, overcoming, and sometimes accepting the teachings of her (grand)fathers' church.

In Montgomery's fiction, unquestioning fundamentalists are often ridiculed, as is the case with Mrs Dan Pringle, who was "Seventy to a day when she died": "Folks say she would have thought it wrong to die a day older than threescore and ten, because that is the Bible limit" (*AWW* 46). Nevertheless, for Montgomery's *ordinary* Scots-Islanders, the Bible is the supreme authority (itself a central tenet of Calvinism) and "choice" is worked out through Biblical interpretation, not philosophical abstraction. (Sara Ray's mother, for example, refuses to be photographed, "owing to an exceedingly strict interpretation of the second commandment" [*TGR* 178].³¹) Ministerial (and parental) direction is efficacious—*someone* "trained up" Elizabeth Murray to think "it was wicked and sinful in anyone to play cards, dance, go to the theatre, read or write novels" (*ENM* 270)—but not unassailable.

³⁰ cf. "Elder Robinson did not approve of the revivals conducted by itinerant evangelists . . . 'go-preachers' he called them" (*MP* 110).

³¹ cf. "I *must* knit on a Sunday at last. I have never dreamed of doing it before, say what might be said, I have considered it was a violation of the Third Commandment. But whether it is or whether it is not I must knit to-day or I shall go mad" (*RI* 273).

If Montgomery, “Surrounded by ministers [...] seems to have made little real use of anything they said,” (84) as Gavin White argues, then it was only after much consideration. As she gleefully told a ministerial conclave, she was brought up to believe “that the ministers were just a little below the angels”; although she cheekily added, “with the exception of the one I married”.³²

Nothing But Dyspepsia?

Presbyterianism is recognised to have had a positive impact on many aspects of Scotland’s culture, education, law, and politics.³³ However, where *Presbyterianism* is deemed to bequeath egalitarianism, extemporising, deliberation, and so forth, *Calvinism*, although the basis for Scottish Presbyterianism as trumpeted by John Knox, is frequently isolated as an overwhelmingly dour force in the Scottish psyche. In particular, the doctrine of predestination induces fear and suspicion, and its nascent double standards breed the hypocrisy personified by James Hogg’s Robert Wringhim. Yet, as Robert Burns’ attack on the Presbytery of Ayr (“Holy Willie’s Prayer”) illustrates, justified sinning could be a subject not only for ironic satire, but for unabashed humour.

L.M. Montgomery had reason enough to find predestination no laughing matter. The extent to which Calvinist theology coloured her early life is debatable, but her married life was certainly darkened by it. However, Rev Ewan Macdonald’s wrestle with “devilish theology” (and Maud Montgomery’s twenty-year battle with his delusions) did not curb her author’s sense of the comic potential in Calvinism (and in ministers). In fact, the troubles at the manse were probably an added incentive for her to satirise morose Calvinist doctrine. (Rev Macdonald did not, it seems, read his wife’s novels.) Moreover, in 1934, when Montgomery was in an “agony of mind” (*SJ* IV [Nov. 30, 1934] 327) caused in large measure by Ewan Macdonald’s latest mental relapse, she described a married couple (in *Mistress Pat*) who separate due to their irreconcilable views on predestination.

At first, the secret past of the hired man at Silver Bush, Josiah Tillytuck, seems a re-run of the James A. Harrison story from *Anne of Avonlea*. Everyone believes Tillytuck is a bachelor until his estranged wife, a medical potions’ travelling-agent from “Novy Scoshy” (*MP* 226), arrives on the Island. Fifteen years before, Jane

³² Newspaper article, “Famous Writer Speaks Before Local Audience”, reviewing LMM’s address to Presbyterian ministers and their wives in Hamilton, Ont., date unknown. Black Scrapbook 1, LMM Collection, UG.

³³ see Mary Henley Rubio. “Scottish-Presbyterian Agency in Canadian Culture.” *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* 89-105.

Maria Tillytuck, a grim and humourless “bean-pole” (229), ordered Josiah “to go” because “he didn’t . . . and wouldn’t believe in predestination” (227). Mrs Tillytuck does not object to Tillytuck’s tall-tales, nor to his drinking sprees:

it was Josiah’s theology. At first I thought it was just indigestion but when I realised he meant it my conscience wouldn’t stand for it. He said that there never was an Adam or Eve and he said the doctrine of predestination was blasphemous and abominable. So I told him he had to choose between me and modernism (229).

Marigold Lesley’s Calvinist Uncle Jarvis thinks that “[i]t was flying in the face of God to take aspirin” (*MFM* 248).³⁴ With Jane Tillytuck, L.M. Montgomery unmask a new comic hypocrisy. Mrs Tillytuck is a fundamentalist Calvinist who daily interferes with the purposes of the Almighty by selling “[a]ll kinds of pills and liniments, tonics and perfumes, face creams and powders” (226).

This plot diverges from the Mr Harrison antecedent when Tillytuck refuses to be reunited with his wife. If he is (for once) to be believed, there was little love lost on his part in the first place, and “no living” (230) with his wife’s theological temper. Despite Mrs Tillytuck’s obvious poverty and sadness, Silver Bush condones Josiah’s repudiation of his marriage vows, as Montgomery perhaps did, having bid Ewan Macdonald “to go” (to Homewood Sanatorium) in the summer of ’34.

Tillytuck indulges in “sly orgies” to get “full” (228), partly to escape his wife’s theological carping. In *The Blue Castle*, Abel Gay (a Scot to judge by his “old tartan cap” [*TBC* 49]) drinks for another reason: “There’s too much hell here—entirely too much hell. That’s why I get drunk so often. It sets you free for a little while—free from yourself—yes, by God, free from Predestination” (79). “Roaring” Abel does not go to church as he is “sure of his election”. (“What’s the use of going to church when it’s all settled by predestination?” [76] he demands of the confounded Presbyterian minister.) The Deerwood community “cannot understand why the judgement of the Lord has not fallen upon that man long ere this” (49). Given that Abel’s wife has died young (mainly as a result of Abel’s “goings on” [76]) as has his grandchild, and his only child, Cissy, is set soon to follow, it is easy to find “judgements” in Abel’s vicinity. The local saints must hope that Providence will eventually target Abel’s own person, and meanwhile they visit their own judgements on his daughter (an unwed mother) by refusing to soothe her plight.

³⁴ cf. Calvinist Aunt Elizabeth fights the doctor’s recommendation that Emily’s foot be amputated: “it was not the Lord’s will as understood by the Murrays, that people’s limbs should be cut off” (*EQ* 62). Uncle Jarvis is preoccupied at the Lesley conclave with hopes that “Leander’s baby was an elect infant” (*MFM* 17). He later objects to one of Marigold’s friends, as “She is plainly not of the elect and she is too wicked for you to play with” (*MFM* 248).

Yet, Abel's presumed election is not wholly convincing.³⁵ He is not a jubilant sinner, nor is he a reluctant saint: both seem incompatible with his final stage of drunkenness, when "he realised himself temporarily and intensely as a sinner in the hands of an angry God" (76). ("Sinners in the Hands of an Angry God" was the title of Jonathan Edwards' most famous sermon, which urged the trespassers of 1741 toward repentance.) Like Harrison Miller in *Rainbow Valley*, Abel may in fact drink to escape fore-ordination, and the prospect of his own damnation. With this in mind, Abel is clearly not a comic character, but Montgomery uses his lack of hypocrisy to comic effect. Like Norman Douglas he is a plain-speaking, passionate Scot who scares his prissy, canting neighbours with his volatility and sharp common sense.

Although comic, the characterisations of Abel Gay and Norman Douglas, like Holy Willie, yield sobering implications. Montgomery *could* employ a lighter touch, and the leap from Presbyterianism to peculiarity is often purely humorous. William Cowan from Markdale was a "very wild, wicked young man" who "laughed at everything religious, even the devil" (*TSG* 226)! Forgetting the Sabbath to go fishing, William was accosted by a "tall, and black, and hairy" shape, that clapped him on the shoulders, and said "Good sport to you, brother" (226):

He was never known to laugh again, or even smile. He became a very religious man, which was a good thing, but he was dreadfully gloomy and thought everything pleasant sinful. He wouldn't eat any more than was actually necessary to keep him alive. Uncle Roger says that if he had been a Roman Catholic he would have become a monk, but, as he was Presbyterian, all he could do was turn into a crank (*TSG* 227).

Crankiness (a crank is not so much a faddist as just plain cross) and Scottish Presbyterianism go hand in hand, especially where the faithful think it their "Christian duty to be a little miserable and cantankerous all the time" (*Shadows* 239)

Old-school ministers—"A common man would be queer, but when it's a minister, it's eccentric" (*TSG* 98)—are particularly woebegone: "'What I had against Mr Dawson,' said Miss Cornelia, 'was the unmerciful length of his prayers at a funeral. It actually came to such a pass that people said they envied the corpse'" (*Aln* 184). In *The Story Girl*, the "chiels" take "mental notes" on the Carlisle Presbyterian minister, to emulate his skill in "the art of preaching a sermon".³⁶ Theologically they may be flummoxed by what they hear, but the young cousins

³⁵ Use of the name Abel, given its Biblical antecedent, suggests that LMM marks Abel Gay as a righteous man in contrast to the local Cains, as is also the case with Abel Blair in "Each in His Own Tongue" (*CA*). In this short-story, Abel and Naomi should be damned under Calvinist codes, but each is redeemed through *music* (and fiddle-music at that), itself anathema to many stricter Presbyterians.

³⁶ LMM heightens the Scottish context here, by paraphrasing Burns' "On Captain Grose's Peregrinations through Scotland": "A chiel's amang ye takin' notes".

learn “just how you should throw back your head and clutch the edge of the pulpit with both hands” (*TSG* 182) when extemporising.

Peter Craig is subsequently inspired to deliver a “sermon” of hell-fire and brimstone, which drives Sara Ray into hysterics, and the grown-ups into apoplectic rage. Felix expresses the cousins’ confusion: “I heard Uncle Alec tell a story about being nearly frightened to death when he was a little boy, by a minister preaching on the end of the world; and he said, ‘That was something like a sermon. You don’t hear such sermons nowadays.’ But when Peter preaches just such a sermon, it’s a very different story” (*TSG* 190). This seems to suggest that Island Presbyterianism was indeed (as in Scotland) no longer terrifying vile worms and miserable sinners into good behaviour with “smokin’” sermons. Yet the children detect a hangover from this preaching in style and delivery.

In the story, “The Strike at Putney”, the Putney women stop “interfering” in church “business”—fund-raising, church-cleaning, choir-singing and so forth—when the local elders try to prevent a visiting female missionary from speaking in the church pulpit. Their insurgency triumphs, of course, although the truly subversive aspect to this tale was that Montgomery delivered it up to her own elders (it first appeared in the Cavendish Literary Society newspaper.³⁷) However, in Montgomery’s fiction, female solidarity in the face of old-school theologians is more usually enacted in the domestic arena:

[Mr Lowder] used to preach terrible gloomy sermons. They bristled with doctrine until the points fairly stuck into you. Jim says he was a minister of the old school. But I’ve always insisted it was nothing but dyspepsia. Mrs Lowder was a dreadful poor cook and Mr Lowder suffered for it. When he preached a sermon more old scholarly than usual I knew Mrs Lowder’s Saturday baking of bread had been sour.³⁸

If porridge and the shorter catechism were the foundation of traditional diet and morals, to this practical and iconoclastic female outlook, mere *dyspepsia* was the basis of the “doctrine of reprobation”: “when [the Deacon] is a little under the weather his prayers are just like the old lady who said, ‘The Universalists think all the world is going to be saved, but we Presbyterians hope for better things’”.³⁹

³⁷ Minutes of the Cavendish Literary Society, Mar. 6, 1903, P.A.P.E.I. 2412. The story was published in the *Western Christian Advocate* in September 1903, and reprinted in *Against the Odds*.

³⁸ “The Trouble in the Bend Choir”, published in *Household Guest* (no date available). Scrapbook 6, labelled “Stories and Poems late 1890s early 1900s”, CM. 67.5.17. cf. “All heresy is just bad thinking, and that comes from bad health, and the foundation of health is food [...] You see, if a man’s digestion is good he takes a cheerful view of things; but if he is full of bile, then he is sure that everybody is going to be lost except himself and his little set, and that’s heresy. Apologetics is just dietetics” (Ian Maclaren, *Kate Carnegie* 106).

³⁹ “The Deacon’s Painkiller” *Shadows* 45. cf. “We are having a dismal two days’ northeast storm of wind and rain and my religion at present is Calvinistic to the back bone. I feel exactly as the old lady

It is noteworthy that the vast majority of Montgomery's Calvinists and cranks, whether represented seriously or comically, are men. Obviously only men could be ministers and elders, but in Montgomery's hands, women often side-step the theological implications of predestination. In female gossip and chatter, "foreordination" is semi-secularised into "fate", and cited in relation to "trivial" concerns, from husbands—"You didn't imagine then that you would marry him." 'Oh, well, that's another instance of predestination,' laughed Anne" (*AHD* 8)—to body weight: "Stoutness and slimness seem to be matters of predestination" (*AHD* 7).

Predestination lingered in the vocabulary (foreordination offset the superstitious, and heretical, notion of "luck"⁴⁰) but these comments suggest that the younger generation were apt to by-pass the dyspeptic's gloomy outlook. Anne's authority on predestination is Rachel Lynde, Avonlea's unofficial preacher, but Anne fringes Mrs Lynde's conventional teaching with an edge of frivolity. In such cases, "predestination" is an anchor, giving people a sense of place and the fitness of things. Through their belief that Providence predestines all *earthly* events (which is not to say they countenance the doctrine of reprobation) some of Montgomery's characters accept unpleasant circumstance as their fate: "It's nice to be able to lay the blame of everything on predestination," said Pat ruefully (*MP* 257-258).

The Chosen Sample

"You can never go to heaven if you haven't committed sins, because you can't repent of them and be forgiven."

Magic for Marigold 208

In 1919, *Rainbow Valley* was hailed as "a pretty story", "a constant delight", "a homey charm", and "a wholesome romance".⁴¹ Favourable contemporary reviews consistently support L.M. Montgomery's reputation as an author of wholesome "idylls"—even where her skill as "an interpreter of Canadian life as a realist" is acknowledged—with all the connotations of Christian rectitude that this implies. Mary Rubio notes that Montgomery minimised the risk of offending her cross-denominational readership by using "subtle" techniques to "sport with religion in her

did who said, 'The Universalists think all the world is going to be saved but *we Presbyterians* hope for better things" (Letter to EW, dated June 28, 1905, *The Green Gables Letters* 33).

⁴⁰ cf. "It really is almost enough to make one believe in ill-luck, though Mrs Lynde says there's no such thing, because everything is foreordained" (*AA* 207).

⁴¹ Various reviews of *Rainbow Valley*. Clippings scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

books", putting her "most partisan remarks" into the mouths of comic characters.⁴² This is largely true, but Montgomery's criticism of the canting Islanders who renege on good works in *Rainbow Valley* is hardly subtle. Like Rachel Lynde, Montgomery could put "a whole sermon, text, comment and application into six words, and throw it at you like a brick" (AA 82). When Una assures Mary that, "The Bible tells us to be kind to everybody", Mary replies, "Does it? Well, I guess most folks don't mind it much then. I never remember of anyone being kind to me before" (RV 58).

Rainbow Valley is "a pretty story" in that it ends happily, whatever unpretty intrigues get us there. Initially, when their judgements are humorous, the local "sermon-tasters" could come from the wholesome Kailyard world. (Of the leet preaching for the Glen call, Mr Folsom was "too dark and sleek" [9], Mr Rogers' delivery was undone by Caleb Ramsay's sheep's "ba-a-a" [a ram's say?], Mr Stewart "talked in grunts" [9], Mr Arnett "couldn't preach *at all*" [9], Mr Pierson picked a text that abetted a local joke,⁴³ and Mr Newman "had too large a family" [10].) Even the heresy hunt instigated against the Merediths (their behaviour, if not their beliefs, is heretical to the religious community) finds an antecedent in the Kailyard, in the censorious attitude Thrums assumes when Gavin's marriage to "the Egyptian" is discovered. For all its nastiness and cliquish introspection, Glen St Mary, through its Scottish antecedents, offers scope for happy endings.

The war environment undoubtedly gave Montgomery licence to import violence, hatred, and spite into the homey charm of the "Anne" genre, but these evil doings were not unknown in Montgomery's work *per se*. The 1903 short-story, "Min", is played out in Rykman's Corner, a community that for meanness, narrowness, gossip, and hypocrisy could rival George Douglas Brown's "Barbie".⁴⁴ As Buchan would later do in *Witch Wood*, Montgomery transports a young, idealistic minister to a village where the locals "saints" (*Shadows* 139) indulge in devilish behaviour. Allan Telford's two-years' ministry has been a failure: the locals resent "his small innovations on their traditional ways of worship" (131), while, for his

⁴² "L.M. Montgomery: Scottish-Presbyterian Agency in Canadian Culture": 94. This policy was not always successful. Another contemporary review of *Rilla* picked up on the anti-Unionist subtext (which LMM denied was there): "The author had a 'dig' at the Pope because he was a Pacifist, so 'Whiskers on the Moon' had that consolation if he knew of it, which was not likely [...] This poor old Elder being a Liberal and opposed to church union placed him in the same category as the benighted Roman Catholic Conovers over at the 'Cove'". Clippings scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁴³ i.e. "[W]hen he announced 'I will lift my eyes to the hills' *he* was done for. Everyone grinned for everyone knew that those two Hill girls from the Harbour Head have been setting their caps for every single minister who came to the Glen for the last fifteen years" (RV 10).

⁴⁴ This story was originally published in *American Home* in December 1903. LMM may have intended to convey an American setting: there is certainly no indication that Rykman's Corner is in Prince Edward Island.

part, he snobbishly “held himself above” them. Rykman’s Corner is “a festering hot-bed of gossip and malice”; the local store, “the habitat of all the slanderous rumours and innuendoes that permeated the social tissue of the community” (132). Isaac Galletly fans “into an active blaze all the smouldering feuds of the place” (133).⁴⁵

In Isaac’s censorious opinion, Min Palmer is “the worst woman in Rykman’s Corner—or out of it” (134). Min was always “odd”, “saucy”, “wild”, and “queer”, so her shotgun wedding to a worthless scamp, Rod Palmer, came as no surprise. Their child was born a “cripple” and “There’s no doubt ’twas a judgement on her” (136) for her pre-marital abandon.⁴⁶ Rod’s father had wanted his son to marry Rose (Old Palmer’s adopted child) and thus Rose and he both resented Min. Rose married Osh Fuller and gave birth to a girl, but Osh died soon after. These unhappy people were briefly housed under one roof, but first Min was widowed, then Rod’s father died, supposedly intestate. The crippled child inherited by default and the women held an unstable truce in the old Palmer house. The story starts with Isaac’s glad tidings that the inevitable battle has come to pass and Rose has been cast out. Rev Telford feels duty bound to intercede, although Isaac warns him that Min (a non-worshipper and possible non-believer) has a reputation for man-handling ministers.

Allan suspects that Min’s “sins on a grand scale were less blameworthy than the petty vices of her censorious neighbours” (136), and “that this woman had nothing in common with the narrow self-righteous souls of Rykman’s Corner” (137). (This ministerial revelation is somewhat complicated by Alan’s sudden and passionate epiphany of love for Min.) Min dies violently in this story, but not before she confesses to Allan that she has hidden the will Old Palmer made in Rose’s favour. Min asks for God’s forgiveness, and to Allan’s mind (as well as the narrator’s) Min is deserving of salvation: “Who shall say that her remorseful cry was not heard, even at that late hour, by a Judge more merciful than her fellow creatures?” (144). Although Min’s nature was “warped and perverted” (137) by her environment, she originally had equal potential for good, which love and *ministerial* direction might have fostered. Importantly, Allan finally rejects the opportunity to transfer to a town church (and more “modern” congregation), electing instead to remain in the community he has hitherto failed.

Min’s self-righteous neighbours are Calvinists who vouchsafe the “judgements” of Providence. More explicitly than in *Rainbow Valley*, the “chosen sample” are

⁴⁵ The name Isaac Galletly recalls Davie Gellatley, the “innocent” of Tully-Veolan in Scott’s *Waverley*. Isaac is certainly a fool, but the resemblance ends there.

⁴⁶ cf. “The black tragedy of it appalled him—the tragedy of that merciless law, the most cruel and mysterious thing in God’s universe, which ordains that the sin of the guilty shall be visited on the innocent” (KO 113).

invigorated (and justified) by manifestations of the devil in their midst. Censoriousness in Glen St Mary is in female hands, and its undeniable cruelty is somewhat mitigated by the domestic focus. Rykman's Corner is a man's reich, and Isaac is "that most despicable of created beings, a male gossip" (133). Women's gossip can also be despicable, but is often neutered by charges of trivia that male gossip escapes, particularly when, as in this case, Isaac's opinions bolster local dogma. The minister is less powerful than Isaac, and less powerful than the congregation, who repulse his "tirades" against "pen sins" they consider insignificant to their eventual fate. Allan refuses to share in the Holy Willies' prayer, but does not become a spiritual guide to his flock until Min's last minute repentance convinces him that human agency carries force.

Both in the unfavourable (and unwholesome) portrait of the local "bodies", and in its assertion that its "heroine" was not foreordained saved or damned, "Min" is a clear indictment of Calvinism. Yet this story does not depict "people as basically good and free",⁴⁷ nor does it question God's power to determine Min's fate after death. (This is a far cry from the Merediths' "if you're good you'll go to heaven and if you're bad I guess you'd rather go to hell".) Despite its outré finale in a surfeit of sentiment such as sad-eyed "cripples" and silky-headed dogs are wont to produce, "Min" is an early example from Montgomery's fiction of the double-edged legacy of Scottish Presbyterianism.

* * *

Ties with Brown and Buchan situate "Min" in the tradition of Scottish stories that upturn rural idylls to expose the Presbyterian community's corrupt underbelly. Anti-idylls are certainly not unique to Scotland—Nathaniel Hawthorne subjects New England Puritanism to the same scrutiny—but the Scottish psyche, specifically the duality thought inherent in Scottish national identity, lays fertile ground for tales of contrasted and divided communities, faiths, and selves. G. Gregory Smith's phrase "Caledonian antisyzygy" (describing the "zigzag of contradictions" animating Scottish literature⁴⁸) refers to a multitude of Scottish dualisms and opposites, in politics and geography, language and religion.⁴⁹ Calvinism, or rather the perversion of

⁴⁷ Gavin White argues, "L.M. Montgomery not only rejected the doctrine [of Predestination] but went to the other extreme, in depicting people as basically good and free. This is a theme, perhaps the main theme, in all her books" (84).

⁴⁸ see G. Gregory Smith. *Scottish Literature: Character and Influence* [1919].

⁴⁹ Many of these oppositions are to be found in Canada, and the Canadian literary imagination. As Elizabeth Waterston explains, "[Scottish] values are powerful here as a heritage from a day when Scottish threads were the strongest interweavings of the Canadian fabric, and also as a continuing, inevitable and appropriate response to an environment similar to Scotland in geographic forms, in

Calvinism, bequeaths its own set of contradictions to the Scottish literary imagination. Trevor Royle finds these contradictions manifest in tales of corrupt or stern fathers and male authority figures, in tales of hypocrisy, or of duplicity, like *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde*.⁵⁰

Fathers, however, are generally absent or dead in L.M. Montgomery's fiction: attendant fathers, like Douglas Starr and Andrew Stuart, are idealised portraits. (In this matter, Montgomery's jumbled feelings about Hugh John Montgomery come to the fore.) Stern, authoritarian Alexander Marquis Macneill is invariably garbed in feminine attire where he appears in his granddaughter's writing, and matriarchs like Elizabeth Murray and Marilla Cuthbert embody much of his harshness, although little of his cruelty: nominal patriarchs like Matthew Cuthbert and Cousin Jimmy Murray are benign and somewhat emasculated. The fictional patriarch more obviously emerging from the leaves of Scottish tradition is Peter Kirk, whose epitaph is delivered in *Anne of Ingleside*. Peter was "a tyrant and a bully" (*AI* 199) who abused his wives and alienated his only son. (John Gourlay in *The House with the Green Shutters* may be an antecedent.) Montgomery's use of the surname Kirk is a clear indictment of the Scottish church, as is the "pack of lies" the Glen minister delivers as a funeral oration: "To hear Peter Kirk called an affectionate father and a tender husband, a kind neighbour and an earnest Christian was, [the congregation] felt, a misuse of language" (*AI* 198).

Like Anne Shirley, Montgomery was "especially interested in twins" (*AA* 15), in the early years of her literary apprenticeship at least. Many of her pot-boilers turn on "freak resemblances" (*AHD* 276) that engineer a ruse or effect family reunions. Twins and look-a-likes are standard devices from the princes and paupers of literature, and there is little of the double or split identity in them.⁵¹ The story of Dick and George Moore from *Anne's House of Dreams*, and the cleft of the sinner from the saint through Captain Jim's and Gilbert Blythe's intervention, has a stronger Scottish heritage, as noted in Part II. Intriguingly, Montgomery's story "Aunt Susanna's Birthday Celebration" (published in 1905) centres on star-crossed lovers named Anne and Gilbert.⁵² Anne's surname is Douglas, and Gilbert's (or Gil's

climate, and in politico-sociological structures" ("The Lowland Tradition in Canadian Literature" 231). LMM does not really engage with the 'bicultural strains' in Canadian identity as they relate to the Francophone/ Anglophone divide.

⁵⁰ *The Macmillan Companion to Scottish Literature*. London: Macmillan, 1983: 56.

⁵¹ Rosamond Bailey argues that Mary Vance is Anne Shirley's "double" ("Little Orphan Mary: Anne's hoydenish double." *CCL*. 55 [1989]: 8-17). See also Litster and Edwards, Appendix B.

⁵² "Aunt Susanna's Birthday Celebration", originally published in *New Idea Woman's Magazine*, Feb. 1905, reprinted in *Across the Miles*. In the same collection, see also "Anna's Love Letters" (pub. Jan. 1908), for characters called Anna Williams and Gilbert Murray (although this Gil eventually marries Anna's sister Alma).

rather) is Martin⁵³; Gil-Martin being evil's alias in Hogg's *Justified Sinner*. Gil Blythe is no Gil-Martin (although both are cast as agents of a supernatural power) but there are some parallels between Montgomery's and Hogg's narratives. Hogg's George Colwan is killed in a fight; George Moore forgets his identity in a brawl (a death of sorts) whereby his double, Dick Moore, is assumed to fill his place. Wringham's written confession is found in his pocket. Captain Jim finds a pocketed letter he presumes delivers the truth about the amnesiac's identity.

Montgomery played with the Jekyll and Hyde theme⁵⁴—or its Deacon Brodie antecedent⁵⁵—in the short story “Some Fools and a Saint”, written in 1924 (*SJ* III [June 10, 1924] 188), and published in 1931.⁵⁶ By day, Alice Harper, a bedridden invalid, makes such a valuable contribution to church work that she is known as “the angel of Glen Donald” (221). By night (it is unmasked) she is the sprightly and devilish genius behind a series of “hauntings” designed to wreak revenge on her family for childhood insults. By fooling everyone into thinking she is paralysed when she is not, Alice Harper can be two people, one a great power for good, the other a great power for evil. Alice the sinner is invigorated by mischief. But as the old minister of Glen Donald reflects, her alias as the saint, “may have been a real side of her nature” (262). The plot is partly inspired by another (and unlikely) Scottish source. Alice's trick of making the sound of a ghostly cradle by rocking a loose floorboard is reminiscent of the silver tray rocked by invalid Sam'l Fletcher to haunt his servants in “The Ghost Cradle” chapter of *A Window in Thrums*. Sam'l leads a double life and Jess can “scarce believe 'at that guid devout-lookin' man could hae been sae wicked” (104).

⁵³ At one stage, LMM's Gil Martin is described as “a blithe man who had not heard any evil tidings” (*ATM* 94), perhaps the impetus for the change from Gil Martin (with its evil tidings) to Gilbert Blythe.

⁵⁴ LMM wrote to EW, “Have you ever read *Dr. Jekyll and Mr Hyde* by Stevenson? It is well worth reading and enforces a strong lesson. If it ever comes your way, read it” (Letter dated, Mar. 7, 1905, *The Green Gables Letters* 24-25).

⁵⁵ Deacon William Brodie was an Edinburgh town councillor by day, and a burglar by night. He was executed (on gallows he designed) in 1788. RLS and W.E. Henley used Deacon Brodie as the subject of their play, *Deacon Brodie, or The Double Life* [1880].

⁵⁶ Originally published in the *Family Herald* May, June 1930. This story was revised by LMM for inclusion in “The Blythes are Quoted” (although it was not reprinted in *The Road to Yesterday*) and appears without these revisions in *Among the Shadows*, 219-263.

The Test of Martyrdom

There was no peace in Avonlea for the unregenerate

"The Conscience Case of David Bell" *Further Chronicles of Avonlea* 168

Valancy had long ago decided that she would rather offend God than Aunt Wellington, because God might forgive her but Aunt Wellington never would.

The Blue Castle 6⁵⁷

The rubric of the Good Conduct Club decrees that children who defy community propriety should be physically punished. This misguided club is, however, short-lived, and adult (as well as ministerial) authority is soon reinstated. L.M. Montgomery's short-story, "The Price" [1930], is a later study with a self-punitive bent.⁵⁸ Christine North is a young Harrowsdene woman, judged to be vain, selfish, and thoughtless by the female "Calvinistic prude[s]" she lives amongst. Montgomery's portrait of Christine is double-edged: she *is* all that the rigidly righteous accuse her of, but is also kind, sensitive, and passionate. However, Christine is "abnormally proud" and cannot bear "to be looked down upon" (*AMD* 124). Unlike Murray or Lesley pride, Christine's pride does not ennoble; rather, it drives her to self-immolation on a scale which makes a Sunday School picnic of the Merediths' torments: "Christine would have gone to the stake in the olden days, not for her religion, but for the dread of the contempt she would incur from her co-religionists if she proved too weak for the test of martyrdom" (124).

Christine believes herself to be a murderess after she administers, in a daydream of vanities, a lethal dose of sleeping pills to her beloved cousin Agatha. Rather than expose her scarlet letter to the eyes of a judgmental world, Christine elects to save face and "atone" for her carelessness "by life long penance" (134). Vowing "I will not have life myself" (135), she resigns narcissism, social amusements, and love, and replaces these pleasures with activities (like reading the Bible) she has formerly despised. Thereby Christine discovers she has a gift for atonement and pursues this "craving for remorse" (137) for fourteen years. Then, finding that she has grown contented in this narrow groove, child-hating Christine decides "to make herself miserable" (141) by adopting an ugly, scarred boy, Jacky. When Jacky almost dies of an appendicitis the following year, Christine realises that she loves him. She cannot renounce him as she has other joys, but "neither could she keep him with her guilty

⁵⁷ Valancy's sentiments seem to echo Elizabeth I's words to Lady Nottingham (in romantic legend at least): "God may forgive you, Madam, but I never can!". See Lytton Strachey, *Elizabeth and Essex*. 1928. London: Penguin, 1950; 208.

⁵⁸ Originally published in *Chatelaine* March 1930. Reprinted in *After Many Days* pp. 121-147.

secret. One must be surrendered" (143). Christine eventually confesses her sin to her ex-fiancé (the doctor who saves Jacky) only to learn that the tablets given to Agatha all those years before were harmless.

"The Price" is not one of Montgomery's better stories (there are unfortunate shades of Leacock's "Guido the Gimlet"⁵⁹) but nonetheless deserves attention. The moral, as the title indicates, is that Christine's price has been worth paying. Christine North confronts her devils in the wilderness, and matures from a foolish girl to a rounded woman through leading a purified life. Yet there are darker murmurs beneath this simple Christian message. Christine loses faith in herself after Agatha's death, which is replicated in her distrust of male authority (as represented by the doctor) and her inability to confess to God. Whether she expects forgiveness from God or the doctor is moot, but ultimately she fears the judgement of the Calvinist community more than either power. In some respects, Christine may view the consequences of her sin as a divine judgement upon her, perhaps even a sign of her own damnation, for she accepts this fate without rebellion. Yet she correctly judges that if she outwardly leads a Christian life she can keep face, escape censure, and remain one of the "elect". For fifteen years, despite her Bible readings and monastic code, Christine lives out a faith wherein her neighbours are the supreme authority.

In "The Price" murder will out. In "A Commonplace Woman"—probably Montgomery's final piece of fiction for it is her only story set during the Second World War—a real murder remains hidden. Great-aunt Ursula Anderson, the commonplace woman of the title, is dismissed by her supercilious family as "a tiresome old woman, who had never been of the slightest importance to anyone" (*TRY* 373). Ursula's eighty-five years of dull spinsterhood have been tinted by no visible dramatic or gossip-worthy events. As her bored and heartless family gather downstairs at the family home to await Ursula's imminent death, her great-nephew and niece, peeved that social propriety deems their presence there, deny any connection to Ursula's forgotten age: "People of her generation accepted everything as the will of God, didn't they? They just vegetated" (381).

Downstairs the family debate "Osler's theory that everyone should be chloroformed at sixty" (380). Upstairs the dying woman reviews her secret life. She may never have married but she has been loved, by a famous English artist whose child she bore. Ursula was not "led astray", nor was she guilty: "I knew what I was

⁵⁹ Stephen Leacock. "Guido the Gimlet of Ghent: A Romance of Chivalry." *Nonsense Novels* 42-50. Guido the Gimlet and Isolde the Slender "though they had never met, cherished each the features of the other" (45). They live only for each other, Guido killing Saracens, Isolde rejecting suitors, but when they eventually meet, they discover they have been carrying miniatures of the wrong people, and all their actions have been for nothing.

doing—and I'm not sorry" (392). A kindly aunt in Ursula's confidence looked after her during her pregnancy, and oversaw the adoption of Ursula's daughter by a well-to-do, childless couple, the Burnleys. Afterwards, Ursula became a seamstress, working for the Burnleys, and then for her own daughter, Isabel, after Isabel's marriage to Geoffrey Boyd, an adulterous, alcoholic, abusive cad. When the Burnleys lost their fortune, Boyd schemed to divorce Isabel and take their child. Ursula learned of his plan, and to protect her daughter and grandson, murdered Boyd by pushing him down a flight of stairs. Like Christine, Ursula did not confess at the time. Unlike Christine she does not confess later, nor does she repent: "*One should repent at the last, according to all accounts, but I don't. It was just a natural thing to kill him—as one might kill a snake*" (401).

"A Commonplace Woman" stakes a claim as L.M. Montgomery's most radical story, but is also consistent with a trend in her later work toward narratives of revenge. In "Retribution" Clarissa Wilcox confronts a dying (or possibly dead) David Anderson with the sins he has committed against her sister, his wife.⁶⁰ In the story of Peter Kirk's funeral, Clara Wilson publicly catalogues his abuse of her sister Amy, his first wife, to an audience including Peter's second, equally (or more) abused wife, Olivia. These female pairs—Ursula Anderson and Isabel, Clarissa and Rose Wilcox, Clara and Amy, Clara and Olivia—one half victim, the other half avenger, merge as subject and story-teller, to expose corrupt marriages. In "Retribution" and the Peter Kirk story, local gossip superficially undermines Clarissa's and Clara's motivation with talk of scorned love. But Montgomery does not add a similar subtext to the mother-daughter partnership in "A Commonplace Woman", thus some of its radicalism.

In *Anne's House of Dreams*, Gilbert Blythe intervenes to bring truth, and thus salvation. Ursula does not believe Isabel's persecution is the will of God, nor does she trust that Providence will step in to save her daughter. Whereas Gilbert thinks of himself as an "instrument" of the Almighty and of predestination, Ursula makes no such claim, and does not fight for truth. Truth would not free Isabel from her monstrous husband as it does Leslie Moore—the apathetic community is already aware of Geoffrey Boyd's "goings on". Upstairs, Ursula pleads a convincing case for eradicating dictators, from a deep-seated and primordial revulsion rather than scriptural writ. Downstairs the young doctor (with the surname *Parsons*), worried only about his fee, thinks there is no reason for him to enlist in this new conflict when "there were plenty of ne'er-do-wells" (371) to go to war. L.M. Montgomery

⁶⁰ "Retribution" is also included in the MS of "The Blythes are Quoted", and is reprinted in *The Road to Yesterday* 17-36.

made only two journal entries after the outbreak of the Second World War, and sent only short notes to her correspondents.⁶¹ However, the story of “A Commonplace Woman” suggests that at this time, Montgomery—convinced she would not recover from her physical and nervous ailments—was revising her thoughts on God and war, good and evil, fate and intervention.

Conclusion

“It seems to me [...] that a funny story is funnier when it is about a minister than it is about any other man. I wonder why”

The Golden Road 138

In only one of L.M. Montgomery’s five hundred short-stories is the role of the narrator given to a minister. If the Rev Mrs Allan in *Anne of Green Gables* represents the minister’s wife L.M. Montgomery imagined she could become given an almost ideal congregation, the Rev Mr Crandall in “The Man Who Forgot” is an altogether more realistic portrait of both a Presbyterian congregation and the incumbent of a Presbyterian manse. As we might expect from an author who had felt the pinpricks of parochial duty for some twenty years (“Damn Mrs George Davis!” [*SJ* III 92]) the Rev Mr Crandall has ambivalent feelings toward some of his parishioners, a struggle to stop himself swearing, and an uneasy disdain for the ultra-devout that puzzles him.⁶² He is also the type of minister who tackles congregational disputes and petty squabbles by preaching sermons directly to the guilty parties. Montgomery likewise could use her fiction to “preach” at those who offended her own codes of belief, although her stories are seldom “preachy”.

L.M. Montgomery’s faith and religious thoughts were orthodox in many respects, but were also fluid, organic, and double-edged. No doubt the more austere aspects of Presbyterian worship and faith in Cavendish were gruelling, but church-life was a social amusement that she eagerly embraced, and religious debate provided a stimulating intellectual pursuit. After her marriage, Montgomery was a hard and committed worker for the churches in Leaskdale and Norval. Yet she was an irreverent Mrs Reverend—when her parishioners were out of earshot—and saw the funny side of religious pomposity or prudishness. (Montgomery was much amused

⁶¹ With regard to the war, LMM wrote to GBM on Aug. 27, 1940, “I very often wonder what God can be thinking about!!!” (*My Dear Mr M* 202).

⁶² e.g. “I ought to have liked Gordon: he was the most faithful member of my adult Bible class. He had always been what is called ‘religiously inclined,’ which shouldn’t have been a count against him in a minister’s eyes” (261). “The Man Who Forgot”, originally published in the *Family Herald* June 1932, reprinted in *After Many Days* 255-279.

at a Toronto missionary meeting, where the godly of certain surnames grouped under a sign labelled “H—L !!!!!!!”.⁶³) Despite her own queer citations of providence, she battled Ewan Macdonald’s religious melancholia, and consistently attempted to mollify his “phobias” by dismissing as nonsense his theological conviction in predestination.

During the First World War, and in her war novels, L.M. Montgomery fought predestination, deciding in the final analysis that God was “good but not omnipotent”. Throughout the post-war years, and into the period where a second war seemed increasingly likely, Montgomery continued to hammer out her beliefs on foreordination. In 1933 she wrote that she had “come to believe absolutely [in predestination]. We all walk our appointed ways” (*SJ* IV [Nov. 25, 1933] 235). (This statement followed a list of the “ifs”—the what-might-have-beens—of her life.) However, it is not certain what Montgomery meant by this in a *theological* sense. In her fiction, she takes a stand against predestination, and explicitly attacks the hypocrisy that Calvinism bred in Scots-Canadian culture. But like Pat Gardiner, Montgomery found comfort in the notion that all events, whether bad or good, were part of a divine plan, even where the tactics for that strategy were left in human hands.

Lastly, although Scottish Presbyterianism unquestionably exerted great influence upon the shape of Canadian Presbyterianism, it is important to bear in mind that the Presbyterian Church in Canada embraces a local dimension and character. As the disputes over Church Union were to demonstrate, Canadian Presbyterians were not possessed of one frame of mind. Nor were Presbyterian congregations immune to vying with one other for superiority in matters of ministers, preaching, faith, and good works, in local feuds that doubtless reflected secular, political, and perhaps long-held ethnic animosity, or in contests between town and country.

The resulting idea of the “chosen” congregation underpins L.M. Montgomery’s “The Strike at Putney”, for example, when the women’s resistance not only threatens the local “elderocracy”, but the exalted status the Putney church claims in the wider community:

The church at Putney was one that gladdened the hearts of all the ministers in the presbytery whenever they thought about it. It was such a satisfactory church. While other churches here and there were continually giving trouble one way or another, the Putneyites were never guilty of brewing up internal or presbyterial strife.

⁶³ Apr. 29, 1926: U.7.43-44. This experience probably inspired the Lesley’s abortive attempt to name the new baby after the missionary cousins in the connection: Harriet Ellen Louise Lesley.

The Exeter church people were always quarrelling among themselves and carrying their quarrels to the courts of the church. The very name of Exeter gave the members of the Presbytery the cold creeps. But the Putney church people never quarrelled.

Danbridge church was in a chronic state of ministerlessness. No minister ever stayed in Danbridge longer than he could help. The people were too critical, and they were also noted heresy hunters. Good ministers fought shy of Danbridge, and poor ones met with a chill welcome. The harassed Presbytery, worn out with "supplying", were disposed to think that the millennium would come if ever the Danbridgians got a minister whom they liked. At Putney they had had the same minister for fifteen years and hoped and expected to have him for fifteen more. They looked with horror-stricken eyes on the Danbridge theological coquetries.

Bloom Valley church was head over and heels in debt and had no visible prospect of getting out. The moderator said under his breath that they did over much praying and too little hoeing. He did not believe in faith without works. Tarrytown Road kept its head above water but never had a cent to spare for missions or the schemes of the church (*ATO* 231).

At the grassroots and daily level, the cast each church assumes reflects the strengths or weaknesses of the minister and his sermons to some degree, but as L.M. Montgomery's stories demonstrate, the local people themselves, in their quarrels and convictions, prayers and fund-raising, duties and judgements, are actively involved in (and often prescribing) the character of Canadian Presbyterianism.

III.ii.

“Onward into Fairy Land”

And for companions [Emily] had all the fairies of the countryside—for she could believe in them here—the fairies of the white clover and satin catkins, the little green folk of the grass, the elves of the young fir trees, sprites of wind and wild fir and thistledown.

Emily of New Moon 5

I heard mother and father talking of what I was to be when I became a man. I want always to be a little boy and to have fun; so I ran away to Kensington Gardens and lived a long time among the fairies.

J.M. Barrie. *Peter Pan: or, The Boy who Would Not Grow Up*.¹

The child in Robert Louis Stevenson's 1885 verse, who looks out from the cherry-tree, "To where the roads on either hand/ Lead onward into fairy land",² embodies a changing perspective in British juvenile literature. Although many eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century writers and educators disapproved of fairy-tales and make-believe, didactic and pious stories for children were increasingly outmoded from *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* [1865] on.³ To new eyes, "fairyland" was a welcome and fanciful delight outside the bourne of time and place. Fabulous creatures (that often originated in mythology) walked through secret countries.⁴ Writers like George Macdonald, C.S. Lewis, and J.R.R. Tolkien, summon fantastic beings on strange terrain. Others, like E. Nesbit and, to a lesser extent, J.M. Barrie (Pan's magic

¹ J.M. Barrie. *Peter Pan: or, The Boy who Would Not Grow Up*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1928: 31. LMM nick-named a young Chester "Peter Pan". Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 16, 1913 [NAC].

² "Foreign Lands". Robert Louis Stevenson. *A Child's Garden of Verses*. 1885. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1963: 24-25. The Muskoka landscape inspired LMM to quote these lines in 1922 (*SJ* III [July 31, 1922] 63).

³ For an overview of changing trends in nineteenth-century juvenile literature see Cornelia Meigs. ed. *A Critical History of Children's Literature*. New York: Macmillan, 1953; Part II (by Anne Eaton). Also J.S. Bratton. *The Impact of Victorian Children's Literature*. London: Croon Helm, 1981.

⁴ cf. "Most of us, I suppose, have a secret country but for most of us it is only an imaginary country. Edmund and Lucy were luckier than most people in that respect. Their secret country was real. They [...] visited it [...] not in a game or a dream, but in reality". C.S. Lewis. *The Voyage of the Dawn Treader*. 1952. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1970: 11.

is initially unleashed in Kensington Gardens⁵) add supernatural creatures to a realistic world.

L.M. Montgomery's Canadian books follow a different road to fairyland. Children like Emily and Marigold peer around the "thin curtain" (*ENM* 6) that separates the commonplace from the imaginative world, but their "fairylands" are seldom tramped by fairy feet. Instead, these spaces represent artistic creativity and an escape from dour Presbyterianism. Montgomery was not a fantasist, nor do "really truly" (*ENM* 48) fairies like Tinker Bell (however many human traits Pan's companion displays) materialise in her fiction. While Emily's Wind Woman may be inspired by Macdonald's North Wind, she lacks the original's voice. Marigold's friend Sylvia is a dryad of sorts, but ultimately imaginary.⁶ This said, neither familiar spirit is wholly divorced from mythology, and their bewitching influence is far from harmless in the watchful eyes of clan and community. To Young Grandmother, Marigold's fancies are "unchristian" (*MFM* 79). Emily's flights on the wind inspire a poem of "sheer Paganism" (*EC* 261).

British writers like Carroll and Nesbit shared with Montgomery a commitment to "fun for fun's sake" (*SJI* [Aug. 23, 1901] 263) in juvenile stories. But British and Canadian ideas of the "fun" to be had from fairyland diverge where questions of credulity arise. The fantastic beasts and talking fairies of British tales are real, both to the children in the story, and to child readers. Montgomery's fiction is not only firmly grounded in reality, the checks and balances of a sceptical adult world intercede. Where the Bastables of Lewisham and Lewis's Pevensies are left to their own devices, or consort with co-conspiratorial adults, Montgomery's imaginative children (excepting perhaps the King cousins) frequently have their fairy kingdoms dissolved by the prosaic routine of rural life, or the reprimands of their elders.

Under austere Presbyterian codes, fairyland is a throwback to an "unchristian" age, but is also deemed ignorant and, worse, papist. Orthodox characters such as Elizabeth Murray and Marilla Cuthbert have no literary heritage in fairyland, and do not acknowledge their Scottish cultural heritage in this regard. Yet, Anne Shirley can believe in ghosts because some ostensibly "respectable people" (members of the kirk, that is) believe in them:

"Charlie Sloane says that his grandmother saw his grandfather driving home the cows one night after he'd been buried for a year. You know Charlie Sloane's grandmother wouldn't tell a story for anything. She's a very religious woman. And Mr Thomas'

⁵ The Kensington Gardens' fantasy first appeared in JMB's *Little White Bird* [1902], which LMM "liked [...] very much, but not, on the whole so well as his other books". Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910 [NAC].

⁶ The name Sylvia derives from the Latin (*silva*) for wood, thus Sylvia means "living in the woods".

father was pursued home one night by a lamb of fire with its head cut off hanging by a strip of skin. He said he knew it was the spirit of his brother and that it was a warning he would die within nine days. He didn't but he died two years after, so you see it was really true" (*AGG* 189).

As is ever the case, Anne's attempts to invest Avonlea with "romance" are stalled by Marilla's sensible (and bald) counterbuff: "There are no such things as ghosts" (189).

The imagined inhabitants of the Haunted Wood—"the ghost of a little murdered child haunts the corner up by Idlewild [...] there's a headless man stalks up and down the path and skeletons glower at you between the boughs" (188)—are recited by Anne with a Burnsian gusto ("And thro' the whins, and by the cairn,/ Where hunters fand the murder'd bairn;/ And near the thorn, aboon the well,/ Where Mungo's mither hang'd hersel"). Anne makes it back over the log bridge without being grabbed and resolves to be contented with sober reality thereafter (as Tam might resolve to stay shy of the inn). However, the incident of "a good imagination gone wrong" is no more a plea for an end to superstition than "Tam o' Shanter" is a pro-temperance diatribe. Both are cautionary tales, but ones where repeating "wicked nonsense" (*AGG* 189) is entertaining.

L.M. Montgomery's "fairylands" combine boundary territories of imaginative escape with hidden worlds of traditional belief. Fairies (and other supernatural forces) rarely have more substance than the less-than-kindred spirits of the Haunted Wood. Like Anne's "white things" they are drawn partly from a literary imagination (the headless man recalls Irving's "Legend of Sleepy Hollow") and partly from lore (often with Scottish antecedence) already present in the rural world. Although some pillars of the community outwardly renounce this heritage, superstition, spoken and unspoken, exists across the social hierarchy. As city-girl Hazel Marr tells Anne when she supposes herself betrayed, "I felt instinctively the first time I saw you that you were *dangerous*. That red hair and those green eyes" (*AWW* 163).⁷

⁷ Judy Plum has no time for red-heads: "I niver cud be knowing what the trustees mint be hiring ould Arthur Saint's girl for a tacher, wid her hair the colour av a rid brick" (*PSB* 98).

The Coming of the Fairies

There are no ghosts in Canada! [...] The country is too new for ghosts.⁸

"If there was anything we could do to prevent it," sobbed Pat.
Judy shook her head.

"But there isn't . . . not in Canady innyhow. That's the worst av a new land where nather God nor the devil have had time to be getting much av a hold on things."

Pat of Silver Bush 132

Gillian Avery argues that home-grown American fairy-tales are scarce partly because, "with the honourable exception of Santa Claus who accompanied the Dutch settlers to New Amsterdam, the 'little people' invoked or feared by the cottager in the Old World did not follow him when he emigrated", and "native myths and legends were little known" (132) among the European settlers.⁹ L.M. Montgomery paid only lip service to native myths,¹⁰ but as her characters often summon the "little people", Avery's assessment does not appear to hold good for eastern Canada. Like their neighbours to the south, many Canadian colonists depicted their new home as a virgin land (and some were haunted by the "lack of ghosts" there) but the old folk beliefs of other British settlers took root in the new world (with some modification). There has been no comprehensive study of fairy-lore in Prince Edward Island,¹¹ but recorded folklore, like a changeling story from King's County,¹² or the superstitions and supernatural accounts that abound in local histories, show that PEI immigrants were no different in this respect.

Much British fairy-lore is predicated on the interaction between mortals and fairies, whether this relates to human families whose fate depends on the tutelage of ancestral fairies, or fairies who yearn to claim human children as their own.¹³

⁸ Susanna Moodie. *Roughing it in the Bush*. London: Virago, 1986: 251.

⁹ Avery notes that "Washington Irving's Rip Van Winkle tells the village children stories of ghosts, witches and Indians—not fairies" and suggests that the "monarchical tradition in the fairy-tales of the Old World" was problematic for the story-tellers of the American republic (*Behold the Child* 132). Katharine Briggs, however, notes one well-known American fairy-emigration story, "Aye George we're Flitting" (*A Dictionary of Fairies, Hobgoblins, Bogies, and other Supernatural Creatures*. London: Allen Lane, 1976: 7).

¹⁰ Sara Stanley has one "Indian" story in her repertoire. LMM read the poetry of Mohawk writer, Pauline Johnson ("Tekahionwake"), and was acquainted with "Grey Owl", although this nature writer was not in fact an Indian, but an English remittance man, Archibald Stansfield Belaney [1888-1938]. Both wrote for a non-native audience.

¹¹ For fairy lore (largely Irish in origin) in Newfoundland, see Barbara Reiti. *Strange Terrain: The Fairy World in Newfoundland*. St. John's, Nfld.: Institute of Social and Economic Research, 1991.

¹² G.F. Owen. "Kelly's Fairy." Originally published in the Charlottetown *Examiner* Jan. 7 1893, reprinted in *IM*. [Fall-Winter] 1976: 30-31.

¹³ Katharine Briggs notes that although "fairies appear to have an independent existence [...] from time to time we come across extraordinary examples of their dependence on humanity" (96). For example, "The eagerness of fairies to possess themselves of human children is one of the oldest parts of fairy beliefs" (*A Dictionary of Fairies*).

Logically, as these traditional British beliefs were not acculturated to native legends, this interdependency denied the existence of “British” fairies in Canada prior to British settlement.

Scottish-born PEI poet, John Hunter Duvar [1830-1899],¹⁴ spun his best-known verse from a fairy exodus. His Byronic *The Emigration of the Fairies* follows the fairies across the Atlantic from *England* to “Their New Home” at Hernewood (Duvar’s Fortune Cove estate).¹⁵ Although Hernewood is initially “just the spot for fairy raids” as it is “Not yet infested by the human race”, the fairies’ perpetuity is actually granted by a harmless human eccentric:

Under this guiding and paternal care
The Fairy Folk have grown and multiplied,
And in their New Home, wilder, not less fair
Than their old English haunt, they now abide,
And have resumed their frolicsome old habits—
As lithe as squirrels and as smug as rabbits.

Duvar’s fairies have no alternative to emigration (they are cast adrift on the last remaining part of England); a neat metaphor for the displacement of Duvar’s fellow-Scots if he intended it.

Following in this Island tradition, L.M. Montgomery’s fiction also affirms that the Island fairies were British colonists, not Canadian natives. When Joe Gardiner tells his credulous sister Pat that “there are no fairies in P.E. Island” (the sceptical *could* argue that Canada was without old world trappings) Judy Plum meets this challenge to her dominion:

“The things Joe do be saying make me sometimes think the b’y don’t be all there. Wasn’t there folks coming out to P.E.I. from the Ould Country for a hundred years, me jewel? And don’t ye be belaving there’d always be a fairy or two, wid a taste for a bit av adventure, wud stow himself away among their belongings and come too, and thim niver a bit the wiser?” (*PSB* 18).

The Weed Man in *Magic for Marigold* spins a similar web of journeying sprites for Marigold and Gwennie: “Here’s the old Malloy place. Used to be a leprechaun living there—the Malloys brought him out from Ireland among their bits of furniture, ’twas said. Guess ’twas true. Never heard of any native leprechauns in Prince Edward Island” (*MFM* 150-151). As might be expected from the tenor of her own family

¹⁴ John Hunter (the Duvar was a later addition) was born in Newburgh and worked for some time in Halifax, Nova Scotia. In 1857, he and his wife, Anne, moved to PEI: Duvar commanded the Prince County militia and was Dominion Inspector of Fisheries.

¹⁵ *The Emigration of the Fairies* was originally published with *De Roberval, A Drama* [1888]. Quotations are taken from selections printed in A.J.M. Smith. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and History Anthology*. 3rd ed. Toronto: W.J. Gage, 1957: 114-118. The name “Hernewood” most likely refers to *Herne* the Hunter, a spectral hunter of medieval legend.

history, Montgomery diverges from Duvar in casting her fairies as controllers of their destiny.

Here L.M. Montgomery's fictional fairies also depart from British tradition in one vital respect. Stowaways hiding amid furniture and belongings are *small* fairies, not the full-grown creatures of folk memory.¹⁶ In Scottish lore, fairies were Luciferian fallen angels, who concealed themselves underground in fairy hills.¹⁷ L.M. Montgomery's tiny Island fairies are easily camouflaged (and clipped) in gardens and hedgerows. At Cloud of Spruce, "[e]lves dwelt in the currant bushes and Little Green Folk lived up in the old beech-tree" (*MFM* 64). Even after a hundred years of European agricultural settlement the Island was not without its wild and lonely places, but there were far fewer than in the Scottish Highlands say. To prevail in a rural landscape, which in Montgomery's fiction is predominantly cultivated, traditional fairy-lore is subject to some adaptation.

"Diminutive" fairies first leapt from the Elizabethan and Jacobean imagination, then were neutered and sugar-coated in Edwardian hands. Barrie's perennially popular *Peter Pan*, for instance, enshrines perennially popular sentimentality: "when the first laugh broke into a thousand pieces they all went skipping about, and that was the beginning of fairies. And now when every new baby is born its first laugh becomes a fairy" (32).¹⁸ This kind of prettification did not go unchallenged. In Kipling's *Puck of Pook's Hill* (a life-long favourite with Montgomery) the People of the Hills scoff at the literary fairies who are "made-up things [...] little buzzflies with butterfly wings and gauze petticoats, and shiny stars in their hair, and a wand like a school-teacher's cane for punishing bad boys and rewarding good ones" (14).¹⁹

Nonetheless, "airy, tenuous, pretty creatures without meat or muscles, made up of froth and whimsy",²⁰ were favourites with children, and with the adults who rationalised these beings within a moral framework. For example, L.M. Montgomery's poem, "Work-with-a-Will and Lazy Bones" introduces two

¹⁶ Fairies in British folk tradition are regularly the same size as humans and seldom smaller than "a child of five". See Alan Bruford, "Supernatural Beliefs," *The New Companion to Scottish Culture*. Ed. David Daiches. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1993: 319.

¹⁷ LMM had visited Tomnahurich ("the hill of the fairies") in Inverness, therefore was probably aware of this lore.

¹⁸ Barrie later showed in *Mary Rose* [1924] that he could add an air of Highland superstition and a fey heroine to a fairyland of both malevolent and benevolent force. (LMM considered the play "the most fascinating and yet the saddest thing I have ever read". Letter to EW, dated June 18, 1937 [NAC].)

¹⁹ Rudyard Kipling, *Puck of Pook's Hill*. 1906. London: Macmillan, 1965. See also K.M Briggs, *The Fairies in Tradition and Literature*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1967. Implicit in Puck's jibe is criticism of children who read such tales, in much the same way as Nesbit's Oswald Bastable bemoans his peers who read pious works.

²⁰ *A Dictionary of Fairies* 167.

“brownies”—“Lazy Bones”, the “useless elf”, and “Work-with-a-Will”, the “brisk little elf”.²¹ Neither is really an elf (or brownie) at all, rather a peg on which to hang a (Presbyterian) lesson about the efficacy of hard work.²² One need look only to the Cottingley fairy photographs to see the appeal of such “buzzflies” to the people-at-large. In 1917, Elsie Wright and Frances Griffiths, captured the flower-fairies at the bottom of their Yorkshire garden on camera.²³ The plates came to the attention of E.L. Gardner and Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, and were published with the latter’s essay, “Fairies Photographed: An Epoch Making Event”, in the Christmas 1920 edition of *The Strand*. (It sold out within three days.)

Collecting further photographs in *The Coming of the Fairies* [1922], Conan Doyle expressed the hope that, “[t]he thought of [fairies], even when unseen, will add a charm to every brook and valley and give romantic interest to every country walk. The recognition of their existence will jolt the material twentieth-century mind out of its heavy ruts in the mud, and will make it admit that there is a glamour and a mystery to life” (41).²⁴ Grieving for a son killed in the Great War, Conan Doyle was willingly beguiled by spiritualism and spirit photography.²⁵ The phantasms at Cottingley had scant resonance with folklore, but seized a psychological moment in a society wearied by conflict and seeking otherworldly interventions. In one of the many “fairy” debates that filled their long correspondence, L.M. Montgomery recommended *The Coming of the Fairies* to George Boyd MacMillan.²⁶

Montgomery “always revelled in the legends of fairies and elves”,²⁷ but often bewitched her younger readers with dreams of flower-fairies. An early short-story,

²¹ See Scrapbook Eight, labelled “wine album”, CM.67.5.16. In this use of brownies LMM may have been influenced by the hugely popular series of Brownie books by Canadian-born, Scots-descended, Palmer Cox [1840-1924]. See Avery, *Behold the Child* 143-144.

²² i.e. “Now don’t you think it’s the strangest thing,/ Since each may choose for himself,/ That some of us harbor Lazy-Bones/ Instead of the smarter elf?/ So strange and foolish that, lass and lad,/ Let us make up our mind to-day,/ That we’ll have no other than Work-with-a-Will/ To go with us on our way”.

²³ The authenticity of the photographs was debated for many years: the hoax was admitted in the late 1980s. (The “fairies”, sporting figure-hugging outfits, butterfly wings, and bobbed hairstyles, were paper cut-outs.) The Cottingley incident was the subject of two 1997 movies; *Fairytale* and *Photographing Fairies*, the latter based on the 1995 novel by American author Steve Szilagy.

²⁴ Arthur Conan Doyle. *The Coming of the Fairies*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1922.

²⁵ Conan Doyle published several books on spiritualism, including *The Case for Spirit Photography* [1922], *The Spiritualist’s Reader* [1924], and *The History of Spiritualism* [1926], as well as stories reflecting his beliefs, such as *The Land of Mist* [1926].

²⁶ Letter to GBM, dated Apr. 24, 1927 [NAC].

²⁷ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 15, 1905 [NAC]. LMM thanked GBM for sending her articles on “superstitions” from his paper (*Alloa Journal and Clackmannanshire Advertiser*). These were likely similar to “The Fairy Lore of Erin” (published in the *Alloa Journal*, Feb. 22, 1908), an article on Irish fairy superstitions—banshees, Pookas, and Ponkeens—reprinted from the *New Ireland Review*. In 1936 the Scot and the Scots-Canadian were still trying their best to believe that fairies existed (See letter to GBM, dated Dec. 27, 1936 [NAC]).

"The Butterfly Queen", belongs squarely with the "painty-winged [...] impostors" (14) sneered at by Kipling's Puck.²⁸ Her verse seems especially inspired by the poetic associations of fairy "drool". (Montgomery unselfconsciously "weens" that, "The winds are out among the firs/ With the sound of goblin dulcimers".²⁹) In *The Golden Road*, Sara Stanley shares similar "pretty" stuff the Awkward Man relates about pixie babies rocked in tulip cup cradles. Sensible (and dull) Felicity interjects severely, "the Awkward Man says what isn't true" (*TGR* 89-90). No matter how innocuous flower-fairies were, anything of imagination compact remained potentially sinful.

Thus Pat Gardiner is cautioned that it "isn't right to tell fairy tales, not even that there is a Santa Claus" (*PSB* 162). Uncle Edward tells Sara Stanley there are no fairies: "He is a minister, so, of course, I knew he spoke the truth". Sara adds, "It was his duty to tell me, and I do not blame him, but I have never felt quite the same to Uncle Edward since" (*TSG* 42).³⁰ Ministerial disapproval is to be expected. *Adult* Anne meets opposition from another quarter however. Susan Baker scolds her for poeticising about "the Green folk": "if you mean fairies, the less truck you have with them the better, in my humble opinion, Mrs Dr dear, even if they existed, which they do not".³¹ Mrs Anthony Mitchell quibbles with Anne for planting a rowan tree at the *edge* of the Ingleside garden: "Whyn't you have it planted by the front door? It would keep the fairies out".³² Anne protests capriciously that she "wouldn't want to keep the fairies out": Mrs Mitchell tells Anne that she personally doesn't believe in fairies, "but if they did happen to exist I've heard they were pesky mischievous"

²⁸ "The Butterfly Queen", first published in *New Idea Woman's Magazine* August 1905. Bertha frees a gorgeous butterfly that her brother Tom has captured. Bertha's Uncle Jack tells her butterflies "are fairies in disguise"; this particular beauty turns out to be the Fairy Queen, as Bertha discovers when another fairy takes her to a fairy (and brownie) conclave called to decide Bertha's reward.

²⁹ "A June Evening" (*CM*.67.5.11). See also "The Wild Places" (published in *Saturday Night* 20 Aug. 1932, reprinted in Ferns & McCabe, *The Poetry of L.M. Montgomery* 47): "these wild places hold their own/ Boon myths of faun and goblin still,/ And have a lingering good-will/ For folk in green if truth were known".

³⁰ LMM may have known that Scotland's most famous fairy-lore collector was a minister, the Rev Robert Kirk of Balquhider, who was "taken" by the fairies in 1692. (Conan Doyle refers to Kirk's treatise, *The Secret Commonwealth* [1691], as does Scott in *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* [1830].) Kirk describes fairies as "of a middle Nature betwixt Man and Angel, as were Dæmons thought to be of old; of intelligent studious Spirits, and light changable Bodies (lyke those called Astral), somewhat of the Nature of a condensed cloud, and best seen in Twilight". *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies*. 1691. Stirling: Eneas Mackay, 1933: 67.

³¹ "The Blythes are Quoted." Edited typescript p. 112 (XZ1 MS A098002 UG).

³² Red-berries trees, particularly the rowan, were used in Scotland to guard against fairies and more commonly, witches: "Black luggie, lammer bead, Rowan-tree and red thread, Put witches to their speed" (Chambers 328). Graveyards in PEI, including that in Cavendish, often have rowan trees planted around them: the site of the old Macneill home in Cavendish has several old rowan trees nearby.

(*Aln* 113). Mrs Anthony Mitchell is a (comically) vulgar woman, but in this exchange it is Anne whom Montgomery mocks.

In Montgomery's fiction, fancy faces a two-pronged attack. Predictably, given the solemnity of Scottish Presbyterianism, the stricter sort view fairyland as a wicked distraction and damaging pursuit. In these instances, Montgomery pleads the case of the imaginative child, by supporting the contemporary taste for miniature and benevolent fairies in juvenile literature and the popular imagination. (*Emily*, *Marigold*, and *Pat* were all written post-Cottingley.) But pretty sentiment in an adult is set upon by other adults versed in, and made superstitious by, traditional fairy-lore (despite their spoken incredulity). Although Montgomery, like Anne, wrote poems about "green folk", she appears to side here with Anne's detractors. It is notable that the incidents mentioned belong to works—*Anne of Ingleside* and "The Blythes are Quoted"—written after Anne's integrity had taken a backslide during the First World War, and Susan Baker emerged as a new Canadian heroine.

For Fear of Little Men

I used to believe wholeheartedly in fairies when I was a child and there was nothing made one so resentful as having that belief inexorably wrested from me by maturity. I'd love to believe in them yet if I could.

L.M. Montgomery.³³

Fanciful fairylands are chiefly the domain of children, although markedly not *all* children. Gwendolen Lesley throws scorn on the Weed Man's leprechaun yarn and knows "nothing whatever about the dryads that lived in the beech clump or the wind spirits that came up the harbour on stormy nights" (*MFM* 143). In the words of Paul Irving, Avonlea's fey anima to macho Davy Keith's matter-of-fact philosophy, many people "do *not* understand things so there is no use telling them" (*AA* 110). In Anne's eyes, Davy may not have "a particle of imagination" (*AA* 176), but he *does* inhabit a world tinged by folklore, even if he fails to recognise it as such. When Davy's seeds won't grow, Milty Boulter convinces him that, "I must have planted them in the dark of the moon and that's the whole trouble. [Milty] says you must never sow seeds or kill pork or cut your hair or do any 'portant thing in the wrong time of the moon" (*AA* 242).³⁴ Here a direct connection is made between social class

³³ Letter to GBM, dated Apr. 7, 1904 [NAC].

³⁴ cf. "[I]n many parts of the Highlands, it is believed to be lucky to cut one's hair when the moon is waxing". I.F. Grant. *Highland Folkways* 355.

and superstition, for the Boulters are conspicuously one of Avonlea's poorest families.

Fairyland can be escapism for lonely and unhappy children, or the abandon of a sheltered childhood. In either case, doubt and disbelief set in when schooldays begin. Pat accepts Judy's teaching that babies spring from parsley beds, but her brother Sidy who "had been to school [...] knew just what that parsley bed yarn amounted to" (*PSB* 26). The one-room schoolhouse brought children of all ages together, and dreamy youngsters had a rude awakening at the hands of older or less refined comrades whose elders taught cruder lessons. This led to bullying of course, a subject Montgomery does not shy from, but it also brought to whimsical fairylands that which was ambiguous, frightening, or malicious even. In other words, children who imagined innocent fairylands experienced the inroads of superstitions largely initiated by adults. The Haunted Wood is terrifying because "trustworthy" adults sanction the terror.

Some grown-ups (Blair Stanley, Lorraine Lesley, Douglas Starr) endorse "froth and whimsy"—to encourage creative expression, not because they believe in fairies. With fairy folklore, adults are the creators, patrons, and defenders. On the one hand, instilling in children a "fear of little men" was a form of control. Strange or scary stories, especially those with a local setting and genealogy, were warnings more than amusements. On the other hand, traditional lore was a vital part of community culture, and supported behavioural custom in daily life or in rites of passage. As her books were aimed at and read by a general audience, and describe adult networks as well as child-life, L.M. Montgomery was not confined to whimsy. Her upbringing among Scots-Canadians, as well as her readings of Scottish literature, supplied access to a folklore that could provide both structure and symbolism.

* * *

Up the airy mountain,
 Down the rushy glen,
 We daren't go a-hunting
 For fear of little men;
 Wee folk, good folk,
 Trooping all together;
 Green jacket, red cap,
 And white owl's feather!

William Allingham, "The Fairies" [1850].³⁵

Across the pool of Montgomery's fiction bubbles of traditional belief surface, and the generic term "fairy" bursts into specific fairy types. It is impossible to conclude that these episodes are witness to the migration of Scottish lore, but Montgomery clearly intends that her readers should make this assumption.

The short-story, "The Waking of Helen", is an early and malevolent tale.³⁶ Robert Reeves, an artist, boards for the summer with the Angus Frasers.³⁷ Their gloomy and superstitious niece Helen leads Reeves to a local haunt, the "Kelpy's Cave", which Reeves considers fit setting for a kelpie painting, with Helen—hair wrapped about her and "seaweed clinging to it"—as model and muse. This mermaid-like icon of the kelpie is blasted by Helen, who thinks instead "it is a wild, wicked little sea imp, malicious and mocking and cruel, and it sits here and watches for victims" (*Shore* 247). In this she is proved correct, for Reeves almost falls prey to the kelpie (or the tide) and, when Helen finds her love for Reeves unrequited, the kelpie (or suicide) claims her.

The Lowland Scottish kelpie might be somewhat discomposed to find himself in sea-water, not in his natural river habitat.³⁸ Yet Montgomery was faithful in describing a masculine, dangerous, and predatory being (although not equine) and may have adapted her sources to suit the Island location.³⁹ Vigilance was required in coastal communities where fast-changing tides brought dangers, and the sea-kelpie appears a variant designed by the local Scots settlers (like the Frasers) to keep

³⁵ See Arthur Quiller-Couch. *The Oxford Book of Victorian Verse*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1912: 420-421.

³⁶ Originally published in *Waverley Magazine* Aug. 31, 1901, and reprinted in *Along the Shore*.

³⁷ Apart from the first instance, where he is Robert Reeves, LMM refers to this character "Reeves" throughout the story, probably by mistake.

³⁸ This said, the Highland *Each Uisge* lived in lochs, the Orcadian Tangie in the sea, and the Shetland Nyuggle in fresh-water, so there was clearly a Scottish precedent for environmental variation in this type of water-horse (see Bruford, 320).

³⁹ Katharine Briggs notes in *A Dictionary of Fairies*, that the kelpie "could assume human form, in which he appeared like a rough shaggy man" leaping "leaping up behind a solitary rider, gripping and crushing him, and frightening him almost to death".

children (and dawdling lovers) from the shore. In this case, the kelpie legend is reinforced by oral history: "Once, long ago" (247) a local girl had drowned in the cave the week before her wedding. The premarital timing is apt, for Helen's waking is sexual one. When the hour comes, but not the man, she chooses a fairy lover.⁴⁰

Mortals who pine for fairy-folk are a staple part of fairy-lore. Sinister forces stir at Cloud of Spruce in the four months when Marigold is nameless. The time between birth and baptism traditionally leaves babies vulnerable to "fairy theft" and to a diagnosis of "changeling" where unaccountable illness or disability are manifest in postnatal days.⁴¹ When the Lesley baby is attacked by a mysterious blight, "wasting away to skin and bone" (*MFM* 21), the clan watch out for death "signs". (Salome Silversides contends that evil fates were courted by holding the conclave on a Friday [19].⁴²) The Lesleys never say that Marigold is a changeling *in so many words*, but later Young Grandmother fears the neighbours will think Marigold "is not all there" (81).

Marigold is eventually restored to health, but spiritually she remains in fairyland. Lorraine thinks Marigold's fancies are the comforts of a lonely child,⁴³ but Young Grandmother finds them "positively wicked": "That 'dance of the fairies' they saw. Fairies! That's why she's afraid to sleep in the dark. Mark well my words, Lorraine, it will teach her to lie and deceive" (80). When Marion Lesley withholds the key of the "Magic Door" to "fairyland, where there was no such thing as time" (90), Marigold grows "thin and pale" (93) and "pined and paled more visibly every day" (94). In her absent dream, she cares not for food, or pretty clothes, or toys, or saying her prayers. This physical and spiritual decline recalls both little Bridget in William Allingham's poem,⁴⁴ and Christina Rossetti's "Goblin Market",⁴⁵ although

⁴⁰ "The hour's come, but not the man": this famous motto for Ch. 4 of Scott's *The Heart of Midlothian* comes from a poem entitled "Kelpie":

⁴¹ See Susan Schoon Eberly. "Fairies and the Folklore of Disability". *Folklore*. 99.1 [1988]: 58-77. Mary Ann McClenahan thinks Sally Hughes is a changeling because she has a lisp (*PSB* 152-153). Jims, Rilla's war-baby, is likened to a changeling in his "scrawny, yellow, ugly" phase (*RI* 174). When Valancy rebels, her Uncle Benjamin thinks of "[t]hose yarns—you know—of fairies taking babies out of their cradles" (*TBC* 143).

⁴² Friday is traditionally the unluckiest day of the week: a good example of a superstition with a Christian origin (Good Friday). Anne learns that Aunt Chatty would never have accepted her as a boarder at Windy Willows had she arrived on a Friday (*AWW* 10).

⁴³ Lorraine tells Marion that Leander Lesley himself had three imaginary friends: "Mr Ponk lived in the well and Mr Urt in the old hollow poplar-tree and Mr Jiggles 'just roamed about'" (*MFM* 80).

⁴⁴ i.e. "They stole little Bridget/ For seven years long;/ When she came down again/ Her friends were all gone./ They took her lightly back,/ Between the night and morrow,/ They thought that she was fast asleep,/ But she was dead with sorrow".

⁴⁵ i.e. "when the noon waxed bright/ Her hair grew thin and grey; wasting/ She dwindled, as the fair full moon doth run/ To swift decay and burn/ Her fire away". William Michael Rossetti. ed. *The Poetical Works of Christina Rossetti*. London: Macmillan, 1904: 5.

Rossetti's goblins are brutal, Sylvia is benign, and it is Young Grandmother who is cruel.⁴⁶

As the title of her third published novel indicates, L.M. Montgomery was also drawn to the motif of James Hogg's "Kilmeny". Hogg's heroine is transported from berry-picking to a land of spirits. After a brief earthly return she is eventually restored to this "fairyland".⁴⁷ In Montgomery's short-story "The Closed Door", four children cross through the "door" connecting reality to a strange world where stalks a spirit "like a beautiful fallen angel" (*Shadows* 29).⁴⁸ Ralph Kilbourne is dead, but this is no simple ghost story. One of the children is reminded of "a poem that spoke of a land 'where the wind never blew'" (27), that is, of Hogg's "Kilmeny". As with Judy Plum's stories of a "Green Harper [...] who harped people away to Fairyland whether they would or no" (*PSB* 65) and a "little girl who was playing in a bush [...] and was lured away to fairyland by exquisite music", "The Closed Door" seems a variation of lore and balladry where mortals are seduced, tricked, or permitted into fairyland.

Montgomery was probably familiar with the Scottish ballad of "Tam Lin", an elfin lover won back by a mortal woman from the fairy queen's captivity. She certainly knew Scott's ballad of "Alice Brand" (*The Lady of the Lake* IV.xii-xv) wherein Alice frees her brother Ethert from "the joyless Elfin bower" of the Fairy King. John Keats is another relevant antecedent, and Dean Priest thinks his first encounter with Emily will leave him alone and palely loitering: "Have I been tricked into meddling with fairies, and will I discover presently that twenty years have passed and I am an old man long since lost to the living world with nothing but the skeleton of my dog for company" (*ENM* 237). Dean may jest, but learns to his peril that men cannot fall under the thrall of a belle dame sans merci and escape unscathed.

Not surprisingly, Montgomery's love for Walter Scott—an avid collector and exponent of fairy-lore and superstition—influenced the supernatural manifestations in her own work. Sylvia is a Little White Girl (*MFM* 34),⁴⁹ Walter Shirley names a birch-tree dryad "The White Lady" (*AIn* 119), and Emily Byrd Starr pens an epic

⁴⁶ It is noteworthy that Marion Lesley's psychologist friend, Dr Adam Clow, ascribes Marigold's languor to "suppressed desire" for Sylvia and for fairyland (97).

⁴⁷ Princess Varvara swears "there is a kind of berry—if you eat them you can see fairies and talk to them" (*MFM* 121). Many of the fairy encounters that Reiti documents occur when Newfoundlanders are berry-picking.

⁴⁸ "The Closed Door", in common with the majority of the ghost stories reprinted in *Among the Shadows*, was written late in LMM's career, and in this case was originally published in the *Family Herald* June 1934.

⁴⁹ Like Marigold, Anne imagines a white-clad wild plum tree girl (*AGG* 29) when she arrives in Avonlea, but substitutes dim Diana Barry for this potential imaginary friend. In Scotland the name Diana is synonymous with Titania.

called “The White Lady” (*ENM* 154).⁵⁰ But for the Haunted Wood, Anne Shirley conjures “a white lady who walks along the brook just about this time of night and wrings her hands and utters wailing cries. She appears when there is to be a death in the family” (*AGG* 188).

Anne has absorbed so much Scott in her formative years that there is a fine line between where he stops and she begins. (A quintessentially Anne-ish statement such as her reply to Mrs Barry’s “How are you?”—“I am well in body although considerably rumped up in spirit, thank you ma’am” [*AGG* 102]—is a steal from *Rob Roy* and Owen’s reply to a similar greeting—“Pretty well in body, I thank you Mr Jarvie [...] but sore afflicted in spirit” [201].) The White Lady of Avonlea has a forerunner in the White Lady of Avenel,⁵¹ the spectre in Scott’s *The Monastery* [1820].⁵² This White Maiden is sighted sitting under “a tree, weeping, wringing her hands” (98) and “is aye seen to yammer and wail before ony o’ [the Avenel] family dies” (86).⁵³

Anne imagines a ghost, but both white ladies resemble the Irish Banshee (*Bean Si*, fairy woman), “who wails only for members of the old families [...] The Banshee has long streaming hair and a grey cloak over a green dress”.⁵⁴ (Fairy or ghost, Irish apparitions double as “white ladies”.⁵⁵) In Montgomery’s stories *dogs* howl like banshees (or like a “brood of banshees” if particularly vociferous⁵⁶) and the analogy is one that is accessible yet frightening, especially for readers familiar with *The Hound of the Baskervilles*. Dog Monday both wails like a banshee (*RI* 86) and howls a dirge when there is a death in Blythe family (*RI* 218). Monday is not prophetic exactly, although when he does nothing in the night-time his silence lets Ingleside

⁵⁰ LMM’s short-story, “The Tryst of the White Lady” (published in *Maclean’s* August 1922) features a “white lady” ghost. The appearance of Isabel Temple’s spirit is thought to drive one Temple man in every generation mad. (Isabel had been shot by her jilted lover. As “Jarback” Temple’s crude Aunt Catherine observes, “I dunno what she’s sich a spite at us for—there’d be more sense if she’d haunt the Mortons, seein’ as a Morton killed her” [*Shadows* 277].)

⁵¹ My thanks to Don from Texas and Gabrielle Ceraldi, who first mooted this connection on the “Kindred Spirits” e-mail list.

⁵² Coleman Parsons describes the White Lady of Avenel as “a mixture of elemental sprite, castle spirit and attendant spirit, goblin and brownie—poetry, terror and burlesque” (op. cit. 161).

⁵³ Walter Scott. *The Monastery*. London: Daily News Ltd., 1901. In the preface to *The Monastery*’s sequel, *The Abbot* [1820], Scott noted that he had “struck” out the White Lady, fearing that she was not to public taste, which “gives little encouragement to those legendary superstitions, which formed alternately the delight and the terror of our predecessors” (*The Abbot*. London: Daily News Ltd, 1901).

⁵⁴ *A Dictionary of Fairies* 15-16. In the Scottish Highlands, *Bean-Nighe* (or Little-Washer-by-the-Ford) “washes the grave-clothes of those about to die”. Compared to her Irish counterpart, the *Bean-Nighe* (sometimes the ghost of a woman who died in childbirth) is hideous and terrifying, having “only one nostril, and large protruding front tooth and long hanging breasts”.

⁵⁵ *ibid.* 160. Colman Parsons writes that “white ladies” in England and Wales are merely “white garmented spooks”.

⁵⁶ See “How Don was Saved” (*Shore* 115).

know Jem lives (RI 280). There is a fusion here of Banshee and Barguest, the black dog who announces death.⁵⁷ Walter's Piper could stake a claim as a Banshee (albeit male). He appears to Walter before death, pipes shrieking weirdly in a wail of sorts.

However, the piper is also a "tall shadowy form" (RI 223), a grey ghost akin to the Highland *Bodach Glas*. (Colman Parsons notes that "The Montgomeries, Earls of Eglinton, were visited by a Bodach Glas on the eve of family disasters" [75], a nice connection to L.M. Montgomery's supposed kin, if she knew of it.⁵⁸) The most famous fictional *Bodach Glas* (again, a being both tutelary and predictive) appears to Fergus Mac-Ivor (*Waverley*) in the hours before his execution. Fergus's reaction, "Why should I fear him, I thought—tomorrow, long ere this time, I shall be as immaterial as he" (454) appears to prefigure Walter's final letter to his youngest sister: "I *had* seen him—and I knew what it meant—I knew that I was among those who followed him [...] And Rilla, I'm not afraid" (RI 223).

* * *

Old Aunt Sally says, "When folks dream o' fire at night
It's a sign they're going to be mixed up in a fight,
An' when you feel a shiver an' a crawlin' in yer spine,
Someone's walkin' on yer grave, an' that's another sign:
An' if you rock the cradle when the baby isn't in it,
The chile'll get as sick as death that very blessed minute."
That's the way she talks.⁵⁹

L.M. Montgomery. "Old Aunt Sally".⁶⁰

Conan Doyle's need to find "a glamour and a mystery" beneath twentieth-century materialism recalls L.M. Montgomery's desire to combat Canadian standardisation by preserving the country's old world heritage. If literary precursors can be found for the fairies above, other superstitions in Montgomery's fiction hail from this folk heritage. Island memoirs such as Walter Shaw's *Tell Me the Tales* [1975] and David Weale's *Them Times* [1992] support the Pendergasts' (authors of *Folklore Prince*

⁵⁷ cf. "Judy used to tell of [a place] in Ireland that was haunted by the ghost of a black dog who bayed at the door before a death" (MP 116)

⁵⁸ The *Bodach Glas* is different to the wraith, the apparition of a living person. Emily's wraith prevents Teddy Kent from sailing on the ill-fated *Flavian*. In LMM's fiction, the moment of bodily death can send forth an apparition, e.g. Lazarre's grandmother (MFM 36-37) and Christine Latham in "The House Party at Smoky Island" (*Shadows*). LMM was possibly influenced by Scott's *The Bride of Lammermoor* and old Alice's wraith. (The incident in Ch. 5 of this novel, where Lucy is saved by Ravenswood from a rampaging bull may prefigure Perry's rescue of Emily from a similar fate.)

⁵⁹ In Scotland, as Margaret Bennett explains, there are two "strangely opposed beliefs regarding rocking an empty cradle. Some believe that *If you rock the cradle empty/ Then you shall have babies plenty*, while others hold the exactly opposite belief—that rocking the empty cradle thoughtlessly [...] is an ill omen of the child's death" (*Scottish Customs* 74).

⁶⁰ See Scrapbook eight, labelled "wine album", CM.67.5.16. The metre of this poem recalls James Whitcomb Riley's "Little Orphant Annie".

Edward Island [1974]) conclusion: "Our Celtic forebears handed down to our pioneers a belief in forerunners and superstitions. In almost every death that occurred somebody would have had a premonition of the sad event, a bright light beaming in the back field with no possible natural source; a star shooting across the sky; a dog barking in an unusual way; a bird coming into the house; a picture falling from the wall".⁶¹

L.M. Montgomery's stories are likewise scattered with superstitions surrounding death. Judy Plum is frequently assailed by "signs", although she seldom reveals their nature. Others are less reticent. Aunt Chatty is upset by "a diamond-shaped crease" in a sheet that "foretells a death in the household". [AWW 35]⁶² Judy Pineau, Mrs Ray's drudge, believes that "three lighted lamps on [the] kitchen table [is] a sure sign of a funeral" (TGR 161). Roosters crowing, dogs barking, stars falling, and bells ringing, are all forewarning knells.⁶³ Aunt Louisa (a professed Christian) trusts that Mr Carpenter (whom she calls a pagan) "can't die till the tide goes out" (EQ 30). Both Old Grandmother Lesley and Aunt Nancy Priest have the grim reaper at their command. "And did you ever see one who died when there was no window or door open," asks Susan Baker, adding for sceptical Gilbert's benefit, "you may call it a superstition but take notice from now on".⁶⁴

Most of these superstitions are held by "old wives" outside the local elite. The Sparhallows and the Burnleys (pioneer families) in the story "White Magic" are "above believing in [...] nonsense" like witchcraft (*Shadow* 293). Emily knows that "it would not do for a New Moon person to believe in ghosts" (ENM 156) and Pat Gardiner's Bay Shore relatives "thought it was kind av a disgraceful thing to have a ghost in the house" (PSB 57). This suggests that Montgomery's "chosen" clans repudiated superstition (at least openly). Although Montgomery set store by dream-lore, especially in the post-war years, and had her pet eccentricities—never to sit thirteen at a table, for example, an acceptable superstition given its Christian

⁶¹ James and Gertrude Pendergast. *Folklore Prince Edward Island*. np. [1974]: 40. Walter Shaw. *Tell me the Tales*. Charlottetown: Square Deal, 1975. David Weale. *Them Times*. Charlottetown: Institute of Island Studies, 1992. See also Susan J. Hornby, ed. *Belfast People: An Oral History of Belfast Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown, PEI: Tea Hill Press, 1992.

⁶² cf. "when Flora said she had found a diamond-shaped crease in a clean tablecloth—a sure sign of death in the year—Klondike insulted her" (MFM 2). For all the superstitions listed see, Iona Opie and Moira Tatem. *A Dictionary of Superstitions*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1989.

⁶³ e.g. "She heard the rooster crow at twelve last night, and she firmly believes it to be an omen of death to someone of her household" ("Two Summers", *Waverley Magazine*, 5 October 1901, Scrapbook 6.); "He had had a death-bell ringing in his ear for three days" (ATW 4); "Walter remembered hearing old Aunt Kitty say that when a star fell some one died" (AIn 47).

⁶⁴ "The Blythes are Quoted", original typescript (XZ1 MS A0980001 [UG]). cf. also LMM's poem, "A Parting Soul" (Ferns and McCabe 99): "Open the casement and set wide the door/ For one out-going".

foundation (the last supper)—her journals reveal surprisingly little about the folk beliefs present in her own clans and community.

As an author (and a reader) Montgomery appreciated superstition's "romantic" potential: in recounting "a tragic bit of local history" in her journal, she remarked, "The old superstitions may have been foolish indeed but with what drama they invested life" (*SJ* III [July 11, 1927] 340-341). Importantly, the specific history referred to here is a drama from a *Highland* locale (Kinross, PEI). Visiting Ewan's sister in 1927, Montgomery was told of the brutal murder of a Lyndale woman seventy-two years before.⁶⁵ The local people gathered, including the suspected woman, and all had to "lay his or her hand on the dead body and swear innocence". Montgomery observed, "those old Highlanders retained old customs and superstitions generations after they had died out elsewhere".⁶⁶ (Andrew Macphail [1864-1938] includes this story in his posthumously published *The Master's Wife* [1939], an account of his childhood in nearby Orwell.⁶⁷) When repeating the story for MacMillan, Montgomery added, "I myself have seen two old beldames who had the 'second sight'".⁶⁸

Given the context, it seems likely that these women were also Highlanders. As Emily Byrd Starr (of Highland descent) and Aunt Kitty MacGregor are both "reported to have 'the second sight'" (*Aln* 36)—as is Judy Plum's Irish grandmother—Montgomery clearly (and not incorrectly) considered such "superstitions" a Celtic legacy. Again, this places second sight, and related "foolish" beliefs, outside the ken of the Lowland environment Montgomery was purportedly raised in. The Cavendish landscape could offer "fairylands" in the woods and barrens, and Cavendish people doubtless had their superstitions, but the sober community lacked potential for superstitious drama, and the Presbyterian stalwarts disdained the credulity that supported it. No doubt there was an original for Charlie Sloane's grandmother somewhere in Cavendish, but plenty of Marilla Cuthberts to chime in with "Fiddlesticks!" (*AGG* 188).

⁶⁵ The murder of Ann Beaton in Lyndale Hollow actually occurred in 1859. See Murdoch Lamont. "The Lyndale Mystery, or Goblin Hollow". *The P.E.I. Magazine*. IV.9 [Nov. 1902]: 320-323; Maida and Roy Campbell. "The Murder at Goblin Hollow." *IM*. 2 [Spring-Summer, 1976]: 33-35.

⁶⁶ The body of a murder victim was believed to bleed when touched by the murderer. Although LMM clearly associates this superstition with Highlanders, it is known in other cultures. Cf. e.g. "Pity there was not a word of truth in that superstition about bodies bleeding when touched by the hand of the right person; you never got a sign out of bodies". Charles Dickens. *Our Mutual Friend*. 1864-64. London: Penguin, 1985: 69.

⁶⁷ Stephen Leacock quipped, "If there had been no Westminster Catechism Andrew would have invented it" ("Andrew Macphail". *Queen's Quarterly*. 45 [Winter 1938] 445-452). LMM met Andrew Macphail ("a strange-looking man—looks like a foreigner" [*SJ* II 15]) at a reception held at the Orwell homestead in 1910 in honour of Earl Grey. Macphail's father migrated to PEI in 1832.

⁶⁸ Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 6, 1928, *My Dear Mr. M* 133.

Maud Montgomery, like Anne, could scare up terrors enough despite these codes. The dread of her youth, outlandish Mag Laird, was branded a *witch* when fictionalised as Peg Bowen in the “Story Girl” books.⁶⁹ Peg was one of the few characters Montgomery admitted she drew from life, but in truth there is something of Scott’s Meg Merriles (*Guy Mannering*) in this portrait. Meg is a Gypsy, Peg “roams all over the country and begs her meals” (*TSG* 19). Both see into the future—Peg predicts Olivia King’s marriage and the return of Peter’s father⁷⁰—although Meg is more sibyl than witch. (Good Presbyterians could legitimately believe in witches: “They had certainly existed once. The Bible said so” [*PSB* 79-80].⁷¹) Ultimately, however, Peg’s witchcraft is a superstition only children believe in, and even then, the commonplace Canadian setting confounds the “magic”: “There may be some [witches] somewhere in the world, but it’s not likely that there are any here right in Prince Edward Island” (*TSG* 19).⁷²

In her wise and sensible twenties, Anne Shirley condescendingly decides, “I believe I rather like superstitious people. They lend colour to life. Wouldn’t it be rather a drab world if everybody was wise and sensible—and *good*? What would we find to talk about?” (*AWW* 35). Those children who travel onward into fairyland are clearly “superior” to their unimaginative peers, but when the whole community is examined, and “fairyland” embraces manifold superstitions, judgements are less absolute.

Juvenile fairylands are creative (like Emily’s) and magical (like Marigold’s). Where the fairies have a discernible literary basis, be this in British children’s stories or Scottish books and ballads, the story inherits a romantic (often fancifully so) or mystical depth. Like Walter Scott or James Hogg, Montgomery could use mystery, make-believe, and superstition to good effect, as is seen most obviously with Dog Monday, be he Banshee or Barguest. Although talk of kelpies, brownies, and white ladies signals the cultural heritage and identity of the community or clan, and adds to the realist texture of the “local color” picture, it also imports “ghosts” to the

⁶⁹ “[Mag Laird] smoked a pipe and told extraordinary tales of her adventures in various places. In her earlier years her life was far from being moral, but she could hardly be held responsible for her actions. Her family relations were respectable people but Mag was an Ishmaelite from her cradle. Occasionally she would come to church, stalking unconcernedly to a prominent seat. She never put on hat or shoes on such occasions but when she wished to be especially good she powdered her face, arms and legs with flour” (May 7, 1911: U.3.181-182).

⁷⁰ The Kings can explain the first prediction, “she likely heard that from someone. Grown up folks talk over things long before they tell them to their children”, but the second mystifies them because Peter’s father “never told a soul he was coming till he got here” (*TGR* 98).

⁷¹ The orthodox can also believe in dream-lore, “having Biblical warrant for the same” (*ATW* 121).

⁷² cf. “Aunt Hazel says there aren’t any such things as witches, ‘specially in Prince Edward Island” (*PSB* 2).

Canadian environment. The old world heritage thus makes ordinary life *extraordinary*.

Highland (or occasionally Irish) superstition also lends this extraordinary quality to the rural world. However, both these ethnic groups are distanced from the rural elite,⁷³ and their folk beliefs are anachronistic in the modernising nation, as is more visibly the case with those settlers not attached to a specifically Celtic heritage. The superstitious Boulter of Avonlea are invested with neither romance nor drama—quite the reverse; their moon-lore confines them to a low social position, for the family are a throwback to a credulous past the Cuthberts, Blythes, and Barrys have renounced. Montgomery's stance is ambiguous: superstition and folk belief make the drab world (whether the mundane farming environment or the materialistic twentieth century) colourful and fantastic, yet conversely underscore a *real* world of class divisions and fractured Canadian identity. Considering herself part of Island and Lowland Scots-Canadian prime stock, L.M. Montgomery was more Cuthbert than Boulter, more Blythe than MacGregor, and more wise than “foolish”, no matter what superstitions she latterly had personal faith in.

Conclusion: The Strange Case of Judy Plum

Robert Louis Stevenson was initiated by his nurse “Cummy” into a world of superstitions as well as Calvinist dreads.⁷⁴ Pat Gardiner, by contrast, learns few lessons from Judy Plum concerning the “Good Man Above” (*PSB* 76), but the Irish maid-of-all-work at Silver Bush is a self-proclaimed font-of-all-wisdom on the Good Folk. Theoretically Judy Plum should be key to the study of L.M. Montgomery's fairylands. In fact, Judy's stories best illustrate not folk-belief but folklore gone awry. Although Judy belongs to the servant class and a credulous commonalty, she is also the archetypal fairy-tale nursemaid—sagacious, powerful, and more dependable than parental figures—and thus personifies both the realistic implications and romantic possibilities of superstition. In the end, however, each device is overwhelmed by her cod Irish aura. With Judy Plum, Montgomery exploits a trend for Irish figures in popular novels and drama, but this characterisation also exposes the mechanical lengths Montgomery could go to when importing Celticism into her stories.

⁷³ Highlanders are often an underclass in LMM's novels: Gay Penhallow has a prissy aversion to “dreadful old Mrs Fidele Blacquiere down at the harbour and old moustached Highland Janet at Three Hills, who were always smoking big black pipes like the men” (*ATW* 21).

⁷⁴ See Frank McLynn. *Robert Louis Stevenson: A Biography*. London: Hutchison, 1993.

The Irish never wield a strong presence in Montgomery's fictional Island communities. Meg Conover in *Rilla*, Father Cassidy and Lofty John Sullivan (both in *Emily of New Moon*) have only minor roles, as does the "witch" Mary Ann McClenahan, Judy's countrywoman in *Pat of Silver Bush*. The character of Mary Hamilton in the short-story "Here Comes the Bride" is typical of the rest, saving the priest.⁷⁵ She has a ham accent, a dishevelled appearance with kinks of disorderly conduct, and an exaggerated pride in her own low status, fuelled further by the patronage of her affluent Canadian employers.⁷⁶ "Ould Mollie Hamilton" sits in her "place" (*TRY* 313) at the back of the (Presbyterian) church with Susan Baker, and chews over gossip she can comfortably share with those of her own "class" (320).

Although there were a number of Irish (Catholic) settlers in the neighbouring lot to Cavendish (at Hope River⁷⁷), Montgomery seldom came into contact with them. Nevertheless, contemporary reviewers of *Pat of Silver Bush* were agreed that Judy Plum was a broth of a maid and so thoroughly realistic that she "must be a person that the author has known long and well" (*SJ* IV [Sept. 23, 1933] 230). Montgomery sniggered in her journal, "I never know anyone in the least like her" (*ibid.*), and indeed Judy does seem "purely imaginary", imported from an Irish Brigadoon (and Brogueadoon). Rubio and Waterston suggest that Judy's accent reflects a "contemporary fashion intensified by the popularity of J.M. Synge, Sean O'Casey, and the travelling Abbey Theatre" and "also, perhaps, the fact that many Norval settlers were of Irish or Scots-Irish descent" (*Writing a Life* 93).⁷⁸ L.M. Montgomery had earlier (and perhaps more formative) viewings of Irish (melo)dramas: Dion Boucicault's *Arrah-na-pogue* [1864], for example, which played in Charlottetown in 1893.⁷⁹

However dubious her authenticity, Judy fits the popular image of a blarney-blessed Irish person, who treasures a wealth of quaint sayings, legends, and superstitions. This literary figure is usually a Roman Catholic and, officially, Judy

⁷⁵ No original publication details available. The story, which consists in part of unspoken thoughts, was judged "too confusing" by *Cosmopolitan* [US] in May 1936, but LMM received a cheque from her US agent for the story that December (see MS. of *Jane of Lantern Hill*, p. 59, 291 verso). The character of Mary Hamilton was originally (and Oirishly) Nora Connor (*ibid.* p. 273 verso). A later version of "Here Comes the Bride" was included in the MS of "The Blythes are Quoted", and published in *The Road to Yesterday* 289-327.

⁷⁶ One member of the bridal party reflects, "Jim's family have always made an absurd fuss over Mary, or Mollie as they call her sometimes. Why, when Jim got his first car, nothing would do Mary but she must learn to drive it, too [...] I'm told she's been fined for speeding times out of number. Oh yes, Irish for a thousand years!" (*TRY* 299-300). The climax of this story comes when Mollie free-wheels her runabout through streets broad and narrow (well, the highway and the Narrow road! [322]).

⁷⁷ Local surnames include, Pendergast, Murphy, McCann, Fleming, Caughlan, Reid, Canning, Cullen, Delaney, Mahoney, and Higgins (see Cavendish property map 1880, H.H Simpson, *Cavendish: Its History, its people*).

⁷⁸ LMM attended a production of O'Casey's *Juno and the Paycock* in February 1938.

⁷⁹ LMM commented, "I laughed and cried and enjoyed it enormously" (*SJ* I [Dec. 2, 1893] 97).

Plum is a Protestant.⁸⁰ But as Judy herself admits, she is only a “Presbyterian as much as an Irish body can be [...] Sure and I cud niver be a rale Presbyterian not being Scotch” (42). Montgomery was perhaps refuting any conclusions readers might draw about Judy from her stagy *Catholic* inflection. Yet, like Judy’s picture of “King William riding his white horse over the Boyne” (28), her declaration seems but “Presbyterian” window-dressing. Her Latin invocation, “*D.V.*” (*PSB* 27, 39), is surely a Catholic inheritance,⁸¹ and her (adult) fairy-beliefs ally her to superstitious Catholic characters like Lazarre, the French-Canadian choreman at Cloud of Spruce.⁸²

Like her siblings and father before her, Pat is raised on Judy Plum’s “traditional” Irish fairy stories. But Judy Plum says “a leprachaun [*sic*] touched [Pat] the day she was born wid a liddle green rose-thorn [...] So she can’t ever be just like other folks” (*PSB* 2). Judy avowedly knows “all about leprachauns and banshees and waterkelpies and fascinating beings like that” (2), but Judy Plum says fairies ride “on bats” (14). Judy cautions the children to speak with deference of the “Good Folk” (3),⁸³ and leaves out milk every night for the fairies: “There’s no knowing what bad luck we might be having if we forget it. Sure and we know how to trate fairies at Silver Bush”.⁸⁴ But Judy Plum tells Pat that children who forget to say their prayers might be cursed by a “banshee”, as happened to a “liddle girl” in Ould Ireland, and “[i]very time she tried to laugh she cried and ivery time she tried to cry she laughed” (*PSB* 19).

Plainly Judy knows very little about such fascinating beings, for Irish banshees do not hex children for their lack of piety, any more than Irish leprechauns say their blessings with flowers. Occasionally Judy’s stories encompass traditional belief and lore: her tale of the enchanted looking-glass, for example, has resonance in several

⁸⁰ There is no indication as to where, if anywhere, in Ireland “Castle McDermott” is situated. LMM’s knowledge of Irish geography was presumably limited: her proposed honeymoon trip to Ireland and the Lakes of Killarney was cancelled (*SJ* II [Sept. 18, 1911] 80).

⁸¹ *D.V.*, *Deo Volente*, God willing. Notably, Presbyterian Pat has to ask Judy what the phrase means (*PSB* 39).

⁸² In *Magic for Marigold*, the French-Canadian blacksmith, Phidime, is a “grim black ogre of fairytales” (141) reputed to eat “a baby every other day” (36). (Blacksmiths were traditionally thought to be taught their arts by the fairies.) The two other superstitious characters in this novel are non-Presbyterians: Granny Phin (an Episcopalian) and the Weed Man (a Baptist).

⁸³ An old Scottish rhyme warns, “Gin ye ca’ me imp or elf, / I rede ye look weel to yourself; / Gin ye ca’ me fairy, / I’ll work ye muckle tarrie; / Gin guid neibour ye ca’ me, / Then guid neibour I will be; / But gin ye ca’ me seelie wicht, / I’ll be your freend baith day and nicht” (Chambers, 324). As Walter Scott explains, “to speak either good or ill or the capricious race of imaginary beings, is to provoke their resentment [...] secrecy and silence is what they chiefly desire from those who may intrude upon their revels or discover their haunts” (*The Monastery* 62).

⁸⁴ Spilling milk or meal on the ground to appease the fairies was a Scottish practice (milk would seep down to subterranean fairies) that migrated to Canada. See Margaret Bennett, *The Last Stronghold: The Scottish Gaelic Traditions of Newfoundland*. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1989: 124. Judy leaves the milk in saucers, apparently for fairies, but really for cats.

cultures. The account of “a rare useful, industrious creature” that haunted Castle McDermott, only to vanish “the day the old lord left a bit of money on the kitchen dresser for him” (*MP* 4), is superficially a ghost story, but dafting aside the fact that he is a daytime-worker, Judy’s “ghost” has all the hallmarks of a brownie, a familiar fairy from *Scottish* Border lore.⁸⁵ In general, Judy *invents* her own brand of fairy rules, then instructs the Gardiner children by them. Judy does not truly believe what she preaches, of course, as is typical of the adults who talk “nonsense” in L.M. Montgomery’s stories. Unfortunately, Judy’s nonsense is not garbed in the guise of whimsy (like that of the Awkward Man) but in the guise of *tradition*, tradition that is furthermore implied to have an actual basis in Irish folk culture.

The characterisation of Judy Plum falls at the hurdle of phoney tradition. Although Montgomery clearly intends Judy for an old world guide and story-teller in the mould of her own Aunt Mary Lawson (a Story Girl grown old) by shaping Judy from a culture that was alien to her, Montgomery sacrificed credibility. No doubt she meant for readers to like Judy. Ultimately, though, Judy Plum is a familiar stock jovial, witty, superstitious Irish Catholic (whatever she might say to the contrary) down to the black bottle of whiskey she keeps in the pantry (for medicinal purposes [*PSB* 84]).

Quite why Montgomery chose to go down this particular Celtic route is another issue. She declared Pat to be “more myself than any of my heroines” (*SJ* IV [Dec. 3, 1932] 211) but her own childhood had no Irish muse. The “Pat” books are the last clan novels, and Pat’s Scottish roots are more muted than those of Emily or Marigold. Sixteen novels into her literary career, L.M. Montgomery had perhaps tired of, or exhausted, her gamut of Scottish matriarchs, Scottish seers, and Scottish clans. If nothing else, the bogus Judy Plum goes to show that Montgomery’s foot was on her native heath in Scotland, and not in the Emerald Isle.

* * *

Superstitious belief and Presbyterian faith co-exist in Montgomery’s Scots-Canadian communities. In the rural world, seeds are planted in the right moon, “a green Christmas meant a fat grave-yard” (*PSB* 88), and even a cynic like Gilbert Blythe jokes about carrying cold iron to ward off witches.⁸⁶ For adults, fairyland and

⁸⁵ Brownies “come out at night and do the work that has been left undone by the servants. [...] Any offer of reward for its services drove the brownie away: it seemed to be an absolute taboo” (*A Dictionary of Fairies* 45-46). LMM had perhaps read Hogg’s *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* [1818].

⁸⁶ i.e. “if Captain Jim keeps apparitions like that [Marshall Elliott] down at this point I’m going to carry cold iron in my pocket when I come down here” (*AHD* 81-82); cf. “There were no witches, Emily knew—but she thrust her hand into her pocket and touched the horseshoe nail” (*ENM* 210).

superstition sometimes create conflicts of faith. Marigold Lesley is raised by Scots-Canadians where clan pride is concerned, but her fey nature, although a manifestation of the “other side” of the Lesley clan’s Scottish heritage, threatens the probity established by clan traditions. On another level, Susan Baker draws a distinction between Walter Blythe’s poetic talk of “little Men in Green” and his talk of “the Olden Gods”: fairies may pass muster, but “You can never convince me that Walter was a pagan. He went to church and Sunday-school every Sunday and liked it”.⁸⁷

E. Holly Pike describes Mr Carpenter’s destruction of Emily Starr’s “pagan” poem as “an order to limit herself to her own culture rather than explore a foreign one” (73).⁸⁸ Emily’s background is Christian, but it is also Scots (and Highland-Scots). Her dalliance with fairyland should therefore be a legitimate and not entirely “foreign” excursion, but Mr Carpenter perceives a collision here between her background, and the regional fiction genre Emily, a Canadian author, is trained to write in.

It seems that L.M. Montgomery shared his doubts as to the role of fairyland in regional novels, especially those that appealed to both child and adult readers. Where British children’s books are influential, Montgomery follows their road to fanciful and juvenile fairylands, but stops short of fairy manifestations. Where Walter Scott is her model, she introduces elements of traditional belief, but snobbery and suspicion undermine the status of the believers. L.M. Montgomery interprets Canadian life as a realist, but readers may also detect shades of auctorial regret, when glamour and mystery fail to materialise in the Canadian setting.

⁸⁷ “The Blythes are Quoted.” Edited typescript p. 342-343 (XZ1 MS A098002 [UG]).

⁸⁸ E. Holly Pike, “(Re)Producing Canadian Literature: L.M. Montgomery’s Emily Novels”. cf. *EC* 255-257. In this passage (an extract from the heroine’s diary) Emily refers to goblins, fairies, and satyrs as well as the Wind Woman, and decides “I don’t believe the woods are ever wholly Christian in the darkness” (256).

IV.i.

“As the Scots would Say”

Wee, crimson-tippet Willie Wink,
Wae's me, drear, dree, and dra,
A waeful thocht, a fearsome flea,
A wuthering wind, and a'.

Sair, sair thy mither sabs her lane,
Her een, her mou are wat;
Her cauld kail hae the corbies ta-en,
And grievously she grat.

Ah me, the suthering of the wind!
Ah me, the waesome mither!
Ah me, the bairnies left ahind,
The shither, hither, blither!

Susan Coolidge. *What Katy Did at School* [1873].

Rose Red's touching verse impresses the members of the Society for the Suppression of Unladylike Conduct. To be sure, not even the author understands the semantics: “‘Mean?’ said Rose, ‘I’m sure I don’t know. It’s the kind of thing that people read, and then they say, “One of the loveliest gems that Burns ever wrote!” I thought I’d see if I couldn’t do one too. Anybody can, I find: it’s not at all difficult’”.¹ “Scotch” words have “sentiment” independent of meaning, which “Burns’ worship” in North America attuned readers to. Rose writes no “Willie brew’d a peck o’ maut,” however. Her waesome mither was made to mourn, for with Rose’s vocabulary only a pathetic outcome is feasible: “My piece is an affecting one. I didn’t mean it, but it came so. We cannot always be cheerful” (ibid.).

“A Scotch Poem” may not have been “cheerful”, but affecting (and affected) Scots vocabulary was a tried and tested way of adding cheer to writing for children and adults. Coolidge’s fellow-American, Kate Douglas Wiggin, also had her fun with Scots in *Penelope’s Experiences in Scotland* [1898], a mock travelogue recounting the

¹ Susan Coolidge. *What Katy Did at School*. London: Andrew Dakers Ltd., nd: 92.

adventures of three American women in the land o' cakes.² Keen to be mistaken for natives, they out-Scotch the Scotch. Linguistically, this culminates in poems describing their sorrowful departure from "Auld Reekie".³ Firstly, they "write some verses in good plain English". Then begins the translation into Scots:

we were to take out all the final g's, and indeed the final letters from all the words wherever it was possible, so that *full*, *awful*, *call*, *ball*, *hall*, and *away* should be *fu'*, *awfu'*, *ca'*, *ba'*, *ha'*, *an' awa'*. This alone gives great charm and character to a poem; but we were also to change all words ending in *ow* to *aw*. This doesn't injure the verse, you see, as *blaw* and *snaw* rhyme just as well as *blow* and *snow*, beside bringing tears to the common eye with their poetic associations. Similarly, if we had *daughter* and *slaughter*, we were to write them *dochter* and *slauchter*, substituting in all cases *doon*, *froon*, *goon*, and *toon*, for *down*, *frown*, *gown*, and *town* (149-150).

Snaw, an' slauchter, an' froon, an' fu' adequately sum up their Scottish experiences.

The gamut of tartanry is ridiculed further when the women add "atmosphere" to their verse by weaving in a "list of Scottish idols": "thistle, tartan, haar, haggis, kirk, claymore, parritch, broom, whin, sporran, whaup, plaid, scone, collops, whisky, mutch, cairngorm, oatmeal, brae, kilt, brose, heather" (150). Salemina and Francesca are unable to incorporate both common-sense and these idols into their verse so Penelope wins the day with, "An American Girl's Farewell to Edinburgh, the muse being somewhat under the influence of the Scottish ballad".

The audience of Scotch males live up to their stereotypical humourless reputation—"I remember reading of some one that said it needed a surgical operation to get a joke into a Scotsman's head [...] What beats me, Maggie, is how you could insert a joke with an operation"⁴—and mistake the "burlesque intention" of such affecting lines as:

So fetch me tartan, heather, scones,
An' dye my tresses red;
I'd deck me like th' unconquer'd Scots
Wha hae wi' Wallace bled.
Then bind my claymore to my side,
My kilt and mutch gae bring;
While Scottish lays soun' i' my lugs

² Kate Douglas Wiggin. *Penelope's Experiences in Scotland, being extracts from the commonplace book of Penelope Hamilton*. 1898. London: Gay and Bird, 1901. LMM read this book in 1904, describing it as "a delightful little story—very humorous" (Letter to GBM, dated Apr. 7, 1904 [NAC]). She was particularly amused by spats/ romance between Salemina and "a most conservative" Presbyterian minister, the Rev Macdonald: LMM was flirting with her own Rev Macdonald at the time.

³ Penelope orders porridge in the plural pronoun for breakfast: Francesca outmanoeuvres her by asking for "howtowdy wi' drappit eggs, or her favourite dish, wee grumphy wi' neeps" (35).

⁴ J.M. Barrie. *What Every Woman Knows*. 1908. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1918: 70. Sydney Smith, a founding member of *The Edinburgh Review*, was responsible for the original: "It requires a surgical operation to get a joke well into a Scotch understanding. Their only idea of wit . . . is laughing immoderately at stated intervals".

McKinley's no my king,— (152)

Penelope is politely rebuked by one guest for combining a (woman's) mutch with a (man's) kilt, but the Rev Mr Macdonald springs to her defence: "Don't pick flaws in Miss Hamilton's finest line! That picture of a fair American, clad in a kilt and mutch, decked in heather and scones, and brandishing a claymore, will live for ever in my memory. Don't clip the wings of her imagination! You will be telling her next that one doesn't tie one's hair with thistles, nor couple collops with cairngorms" (153).

Both Wiggin and Coolidge took their fun from a fashion for all things Scottish (while ironically exploiting it). Coolidge parodies Burns; Wiggin's "Scotch" is under the influence of her Kailyard contemporaries (indeed Penelope compares her observations with Maclaren's characterisations⁵). Significantly, both writers affirm that these popular literary fashions meant North Americans could write in Scots (or *faux* Scots) by obeying a few easy rules of spelling, vocabulary, and pronunciation. Dilettante American poets with a moderate knowledge of Scottish balladry could compose "affecting" verse in Scots. These books would have appealed to L.M. Montgomery's readership, who can be presumed to be similarly conversant with the humorous and poetic potential of Scots words.

Scotch Idols and Idylls

Robert Burns' dialect verse and Walter Scott's dialogue had an enduring and widespread appeal in North America, to Scots emigrants and others. The writing of James Hogg, "Christopher North", and John Galt was also successfully exported. By Montgomery's time, Scots—or the literary "broad Doric tongue" that passed for Scots⁶—was an old chestnut, recycled in newspapers and novels to tickle the ribs of English-speaking readers, and even the Scots themselves.⁷ As Kailyard authors proved, with their Lowland vernacular "suitably tailored and annotated for the south",⁸ the Scots language could also be an agency for wit and for pathos, indeed a symbol of all that was lo'esome about the canny, sonsy, pawky Scotch.⁹ The Scots

⁵ e.g. "[Mrs McCollop] is thus a complete guide to the Edinburgh pulpit, and when she is making a bed in the morning she dispenses criticism in so large and impartial a manner that it would make the flesh of the 'meenistry' creep were it overheard. I used to think Ian Maclaren's sermon-taster a possible exaggeration of an existent type, but I see that she is truth itself" (110).

⁶ from John Mollison. "Reminiscent". *The P.E.I. Magazine*. II.7 [Sept. 1900]: 231-2, an article which gives some examples of linguistic confusion consequent to the "broad Doric tongue" in PEI.

⁷ See William Donaldson. *Popular Literature in Victorian Scotland: Language, Fiction and the Press*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1986.

⁸ T.D. Knowles. *Ideology, Art and Commerce* 57.

⁹ A chapter of *The Bonnie Brier Bush* is devoted to "The Cunning Speech of Drumtochty".

dialect expressed thoughts too deep for tears—even “educated” English-speaking Scots revert to dialect come emotional times—with a richness of vocabulary felt woefully lacking in the south.¹⁰

Kailyard antecedents are discernible in L.M. Montgomery’s fiction. As Kailyard “atmosphere” is partly conveyed through cunning speech and lilting brogue—indeed Scots dialect was a signature of the genre—Montgomery might be expected to follow these writers into the heather on this front. An example exists which affirms this, emphasising that caution is required where Scottish lilt in Montgomery’s work are ascribed to direct cultural transfer. In his *Dictionary of Prince Edward Island English*, T.K. Pratt records non-standard words that are used, or were used, in the “folk speech” of the Province.¹¹ Pratt cites Montgomery’s writing as evidence for some fifty words in the PEI vernacular, most of which derive from British words. In several cases Montgomery’s usage, usually in fiction, is Pratt’s only source.

“Spleet-new” is a dialect form of the Scottish “split new”, meaning “brand new”. When Emily Byrd Starr receives her first copy of *The Moral of the Rose*, her narrator gloats, “[t]here lay her book. *Her* book, spleet-new from the publishers” (EQ 181). As Emily’s literary career maps Montgomery’s, it is no surprise that “spleet-new” is also used in *The Alpine Path* when Montgomery hails her first copy of *Anne*. However, if Pratt had consulted Montgomery’s journals, and the diary entry she allegedly transcribed into her autobiography, he would have found therein that her “book came today, *fresh* from the publishers” (SJ I [June 20, 1908] 355, my italics).

The Alpine Path has a Scottish bias. The “Emily” books celebrate the heroine’s Scottish roots. Did Montgomery, then, delve into her personal heritage to find a Scots word better suited to the occasion? Almost. That is, Montgomery turned to her literary heritage, and to JMB. She wrote to George Boyd MacMillan in 1910:

Do you know, I found a phrase in your letter that proved quite illuminating—“split new”. In Barrie’s books I had often seen the phrase “spleet-new” and though I knew from the context that it must mean what we call “brand new” I did not know what significance “spleet” could have. I realise now that it must be a dialect form of your “split” and the significance is obvious.¹²

¹⁰ Sentimental Tommy loses an essay competition in over-long deliberations as to which Scots words best describes a middling full church (*Sentimental Tommy* Ch. XXXVI).

¹¹ T.K. Pratt, *Dictionary of Prince Edward Island English*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1988.

¹² Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910 [NAC]. See e.g. *A Window in Thrums* 21: “Ay, they’ve a wardrobe spleet new”.

"We"—in Cavendish, the Island, Canada?—did not say "spleet-new". If L.M. Montgomery used Scots dialect expressions in life it would not be surprising given her background and reading. Nor would it be remarkable if she *deliberately* inserted the Scots vernacular into her fiction, even that intended for a juvenile audience, as the Coolidge demonstrates. What is curious is that with "spleet-new", Montgomery chose a Scots word that she did not understand until she was thirty-five, and then only when a Scot explained it to her.

Montgomery did not "invent" the Scottish elements in her work, but she did adapt her style to public taste or commercial demands, and stress some facets of her heritage and background over others. This example indicates that Montgomery employed Scots dialect words for a purpose in her writing, whether to proclaim her own Scottish lineage, or that of her fictional Islanders, or to add an affecting sentiment. Notably, Montgomery unlike Barrie—"When Janet sped to the door her 'spleet new' merino dress fell"¹³—did not enclose the Scots phrase in inverted commas denoting outlandishness.

* * *

This example inevitably challenges the "authenticity" of other dialect words in L.M. Montgomery's novels. The documentation of "spleet-new" through its personal etymology is almost unique and conclusions must be tentative. Broadly speaking, however, words derived from the Scots vernacular in Montgomery's writing fall into three categories.

Firstly, Montgomery repeated many Scots words—"wee sma's", "sonsy", "dour", "canny", and "bonny"—which are well-known and would be immediately recognised as Scots non-Scots readers. These words are accessible, and would rarely breed confusion. In fiction, they may register a character with Scottish ancestry, but do not create serious linguistic or ethnic divisions. Because these words have a widespread usage, it is fairly immaterial whether Montgomery acquired them from life or literature. The opportunities for each would have been plentiful, and "anyone" would find it "not at all difficult" to insert them into conversation.

Additional Scots words originate in Montgomery's upbringing. She linked particular phrases to her Grandfather Macneill. Montgomery noted that he "was fond—far too fond—of teasing people—'giving them bars', as he called it" (*SJI* [Jan. 7, 1910] 383), "bar" being Scots for "jest". In childhood, Montgomery learned from him the expression "giff-gaff" (give and take): "a polite way of expressing the old

¹³ J.M. Barrie, *Auld Licht Idylls*. 1888. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1892: 106.

Scotch proverb, 'If you'll scratch my back I'll scratch yours'" (Dec. 19, 1919: U.4.498). These phrases "smack of the heather" but neither is repeated in her fiction. Both were perhaps beyond the comprehension of readers, even in context (thus her translation for journal "readers"). Other words like "dyke",¹⁴ "apple-ringie" (southernwood), or "skiff"¹⁵ relate to the natural landscape. In fiction, they are used in various ways: "dyke" without any indication that it is Scots¹⁶; "apple-ringie" because "it sounds so much more poetical than southernwood" (*TSG* 221)¹⁷; and "skiff"—enclosed in italics—as part of the elderly Cousin Jimmy's vocabulary, not young Emily's (*EQ* 182).¹⁸ Pratt records that British words relating to plants, weather, or agriculture are the most likely to survive in PEI's farming communities.¹⁹

In the third category come vernacular words probably unfamiliar to many readers, and known to others only from Scottish readings. Included here are words like "kittle cattle" (*Als* 251, *ATW* 23, *RI* 136), "weather gaws" (*MFM* 158), "bawbees", "stravaging" (*PSB* 31, 42),²⁰ "smeddum" (*RV* 173, 177), "scunner" (*AHD* 242), "threep" (*ENM* 20), "fey" (*EQ* 28, *MP* 165)²¹, and "snood" (*AGG* 250).²² These words are not translated in the text. "Fey" is the only above term used by the narrator and thus comes in parenthesis: in *Emily's Quest* Montgomery precedes the term (as applied to the fatally ill Mr Carpenter) with, "As the Scots would say, he was 'fey'". Characters using these words might be *older* (Miss Cornelia Bryant ["scunner"], Susan Baker ["kittle cattle"]), *countrified* (Abel Derusha ["weather

¹⁴ LMM wrote that "the custom" of building stone dykes was "brought out from Scotland" to PEI (Mar. 1, 1925: U.6). As Margaret Bennett notes, most boundary fences in Canada and the US were made from the timber which surrounded the settlers. (LMM refers to pole and longer [snake] fences, stump fences, picket or pitchpole fences, board fences, as well as the more modern barbed wire fences [Mar. 1, 1925: U.6].) Bennett concludes that Highlanders erected "laboriously built stone wall[s] [...] as a matter of course, just as their forebears had done for generations" (*Oatmeal and the Catechism* 62).

¹⁵ Snow can "skiff", that is, lightly cover, the ground. Charles Macneill uses the word "dyke" (indeed, he build~~s~~one) and also "skiff" (scift), in his diary (Dec. 13, 1897).

¹⁶ see e.g. *ATW* 87, *AWW* 15, *Aln* 12.

¹⁷ Beverley King knows the name "apple-ringie" is Scottish. In a prototype short-story for this novel, some children learn the name from their Scottish servant, Jean, who talks in Scots throughout (e.g. "Get awa' wi' ye into the floor garden—that's the proper place for bairns").

¹⁸ *Emily's Quest* was written after LMM transcribed Charles Macneill's diary into her journal.

¹⁹ see T.K. Pratt, *Dictionary of Prince Edward Island English*, and also Pratt's, "The Proverbial Islander". *IM* [Fall-Winter] 1981: 8-11.

²⁰ LMM may have thought this word was Irish: it is used by Judy Plum.

²¹ This word, used by the narrator, is in inverted commas in *Mistress Pat*, and is italicised in the short-story, "The Tryst of the White Lady" (*Shadows* 280).

²² This word, for a kind of hair-band, is not Scots, but carried a special significance in Scotland where the snood was a badge of virginity (and in Ireland—"softly to undo the snood/ That is the sign of maidenhood"—James Joyce, "Chamber Music XI"), whence Burns' "Sae Fair Her Hair": "Down amang the broom, the broom,/ Down amang the broom, my dearie,/ The lassie lost a silken snood,/ That cost her mony a blirt and blear ee".

gaws”]), or *uneducated* (Ellen Greene [“threep”]²³), and not just “regular ‘Scots wha hae’”²⁴ like Norman Douglas (“smeddum”).

None of these words appear in Montgomery’s journals or correspondence. She may have heard them from Cavendish people, but more likely read them, and like Anne Shirley with her “snood”, used them to render a prosaic situation—a bad hair day—“so romantic” (*AGG* 250). Anne’s unvarnished upbringing is unlikely to have introduced “snood” into her vocabulary. Anne’s (and Montgomery’s) use of the word is probably an inheritance from Scott, or Burns, or possibly James Hogg’s “Kilmeny”: “Where gat you [...] That bonny snood of the birk sae green?”²⁵ The kailyard is another potential source for these words, and Montgomery would have read in *Auld Licht Idylls* for instance that, “They’re kittle cattle, the women”.²⁶ Half the Kailyard’s residents were “fey” at one time or another (on account of the “hoast” no doubt). Most of these words are to be found in Burns.²⁷

The minutes of the Cavendish Literary Society (est. 1886) reveal Burns worship amongst the local literati.²⁸ Each year, near 25 January, Burns’ celebrations were held.²⁹ The Bard’s poetry comes a close second to the Bible in Montgomery’s fiction.³⁰ Even those of little education and culture, like Susan Baker, can quote Scotland’s laureate: “Ah, well, man was made to mourn, Mrs Doctor dear. That sounds as if it ought to be in the Bible, but they tell me a person named Burns wrote it” (*AHD* 308). “Auld Lang Syne” is sung to mark the end of the Murray clan gathering at Christmas (*ENM* 238) and the end of the children’s summer in *The Golden Road* (*TGR* 211). It is quoted when Anne visits Captain Jim for the last time (but not when they celebrate New Year). Montgomery liked to allude to particular Burns lines, introducing another Scottish “voice” to her writing.³¹

²³ Elizabeth Epperly finds in Ellen’s use of the word “threeped” a “small comic echo” of *Jane Eyre* and Hannah’s comment that the Rivers sisters “never fell out nor ‘threaped’” (*Fragrance* 257), but Montgomery and Brontë employ different definitions of the words: Montgomery refers to a persistent nagging, Brontë to bickering.

²⁴ e.g. “Grandpa kept us straight in essentials, and was pretty indulgent, though he detested my slang and what he called Win’s ‘Yankee twang.’ Grandpa was a rabid old Scotchman, and one of the regular ‘Scots wha hae,’ and he hated anything that didn’t smack of the heather” (LMM. “Our Practical Joke”. *Golden Days*. 8 August, 1896. Scrapbook 1, labelled “Stories 1890s”, CM.67.5.14).

²⁵ These lines are quoted in *Kilmeny of the Orchard* Ch. 13.

²⁶ Barrie, *Auld Licht Idylls* 221

²⁷ see J.B. Reid. *A Complete Word and Phrase Concordance to the Poems and Songs of Robert Burns*. Glasgow: Kerr & Richardson, 1889.

²⁸ Minutes of the Cavendish Literary Society, Feb. 19, 1886-Jan. 7, 1924. P.A.P.E.I. file 2412.

²⁹ As LMM was born on St Andrew’s Day, and Frede Campbell died on 25 January, the two most important days for Scots abroad are marked for LMM by other events, and it is rare for LMM to refer to Burns’ Day in her diary, although she regularly celebrated it.

³⁰ When Anne boards with Janet Sweet she has “a picture of Robby Burns standing at Highland Mary’s grave” over her bed (*Als* 224).

³¹ e.g. “To a Louse” *Als* 274; *EC* 67: “A man’s a man for a’ that” [changed to “a cat’s a cat”] *EC* 119; “To a Mouse” *SJ* I [Dec. 26, 1909] 364; *SJ* IV [Jan. 31, 1932] 163: “A’ the airts the wind can

When Miss Cornelia Bryant takes “a scunner” at an Evangelical preacher, Susan Baker denounces Russians as “kittle-cattle”, or Ellen Greene tells Emily, “I’ve always threeped at your father to send you to school”, readers are not meant to conclude these characters were *born* in Scotland.³² *Descendants* of Scottish immigrants fill L.M. Montgomery’s Canadian communities. Scots dialect is only sporadically interspersed in English speech, and appears as a surviving remnant of a language no longer in common parlance. Nevertheless, Scots words attest to the ethnic heritage of the community or clan, and form a guide to class. Mrs Blythe would never use harsh words such as “smeddum”, “scunner” or “pernickety”. Conversely, “wee sma’s”, “snood”, and, obviously, “ingleside”, drop into her (increasingly) contrived conversation because of their symphonious association with a “romantic” Scotland.

The Scots vernacular, like rural phrases and accents, heightens the texture and realism of Montgomery’s fictional speech patterns, and augments the spirit of place, *even* when these words were not in actual usage in PEI. When Scots dialect comes in single spies, it is seldom “affecting” stuff and thankfully without the symbolic import of Kailyard’s battalions. Barrie, Maclaren, and Crockett have been derided for their “compromising” use of Scots, and accused of simplification, even exploitation, in making this speech accessible. Montgomery’s *sparse* use of dialect reflects the Canadian setting of course, but deviates from the Kailyard pattern by omitting a gloss. Perhaps neither she, nor her various publishers, saw any need for these few words to be marked or interpreted. Thomas Knowles comments that the reading public had increasingly accepted (indeed, admired) Scots dialect in fiction by the mid-1890s (33-34). Certainly, Montgomery was not prepared to talk down to her readers, even the youngest among them, by offering cutesy explanations.

blow” (*RV* 137); “Holy Willie’s Prayer” (*AI*s 274); “Epistle from Esopus to Maria” (*TSG* 41); “Address to the Deil” (*TGR* 189); “On Captain Grose’s Peregrinations through Scotland” (*TSG* 198), “The Cotter’s Saturday Night” (*SJ* II [Dec. 22, 1919] 359); and “Tam o’Shanter”, “Rantin’ Rovin’ Robin”, and “Highland Mary” (all July 30, 1911: U.3): “Oh, whistle and I’ll come to you, my lad” [*EC* 122, 178].

³² The name Bryant is common in the south-west of England, particularly Devon and Cornwall. As many PEI settlers from these areas were Methodists, LMM may have been making sly fun of Miss Cornelia, and her fanatical prejudice.

The Broad Doric Tongue

Janet and Thomas Gordon in *Kilmeny of the Orchard* are plucked from the Kailyard for planting in Canadian soil. Like most of Ian Maclaren's women (excepting the "sermon-taster" Elspeth Macfadyen perhaps) Janet is domesticated and docile. Although he has silent phases, Thomas can "floor [the schoolteacher] any time in argument" (KO 93) with the kind of Scots intellect commonplace in Drumtochty, and reputedly "brought to so fine an edge by the Shorter catechism that it could detect endless distinctions, and was ever on the watch against inaccuracy".³³ The Gordons reveal rare flashes of Scots dialect ("lassie", "bonny"): their roots are discovered in the "terrible word[s]" they don't say, like "love" for example, which "Scotch reserve balked stubbornly at" (KO 89).³⁴

However, when Janet tells the "master" how Old James Gordon slandered Kilmeny's mother with "a hard name" (KO 110) she switches into a Scots *accent* to quote her father's words. Margaret had remained silent even when James was "deein'" (111). He was contrite: "Poor lass. She isna to blame. But I canna go to meet her mother till our little lass has forgie'n me for the name I called her [...] Since she winna come to me I must e'en go to her" (111-112). This passes for Scottish pronunciation after a fashion, or after Penelope's fashion. (From the good, plain English, the *v*'s were removed, and the final *g*'s, and all the *ot*'s became *a*'s.) Those who knew Maud Montgomery often recall that she spoke aloud when composing "talk" for her novels,³⁵ and it seems likely that she would have "talked out" James's words to render them "authentic".³⁶

As Janet and Thomas Gordon *are* so "Scotch" in many respects, awash with "unsmiling dourness" (84), "theological volumes" (85), and a "crochet antimacassar with a lion rampant in the centre" (118), it may be that Montgomery chose not to

³³ Ian Maclaren. *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* 179.

³⁴ cf. "As to 'the name of the unimaginable sweetness' which warned Emily that she was falling in love with Teddy, your question is difficult to answer because it's really one of the things one can't generalise about. It was once *my* experience. Yet, I can't say whether all or many girls experience just that particular sensation because I've never discussed it with any other girl—being 'too Scotch' yet for that, even after five generations" (Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 6, 1928 *My Dear Mr. M* 132).

³⁵ see "Memories of Silver Bush". *Kindred Spirits*. [Winter 1990-1991]; Margaret H. Mustard. *L.M. Montgomery as Mrs Ewan Macdonald of the Leaskdale Manse, 1911-1926*. Leaskdale: St Paul's Presbyterian Women's Association, 1965. A 1931 radio broadcast of Montgomery reading her poems "on the air" (SJ IV [Feb. 27, 1931] 108) has not survived.

³⁶ Amusingly, LMM didn't know how to pronounce "Kilmeny", and had to ask GBM to advise: "By the way, can you tell me the proper pronunciation of 'Kilmeny.' Is it 'Kil-menny'—or 'Kilmeeny.' Nobody on this side of the Atlantic seems to know, and she gets both. When people ask me, 'How is the name of your heroine pronounced?' I have to admit that I don't know myself. And how they *look* at me". Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910, *My Dear Mr. M* 54-55.

fuss over Scottish pronunciation when the occasional “bonny” and “lassie” would suffice. These words, combined with repeated references to their Scottish origins, *are* enough in this novella to separate the Gordons from their Island neighbours like the Williamsons, who speak with uneducated ’tish’ts and ’taints. Similarly, Old James Gordon’s Scottish accent places him in the “romantic” past of family legends and thereby links both his volatile outburst and pitiful contrition with his Scottishness.

Thomas Knowles argues that although Kailyard dialect is tailored and annotated, it nonetheless emphasises “national, regional or class separateness” (33–34). In *Kilmeny of the Orchard*, accent and dialect divide sections of the community (and periods of history). Elizabeth Epperly describes *Kilmeny* as an “affirmation of middle-class values” and the middle class’ “conception of its own new order of chivalry and righteousness” (*Fragrance* 228–229). Eric Marshall, the son of a one-time farmer now department store magnate, is certainly richer than the farmers whose children he teaches. However, Epperly determines Eric’s social class partly because he is “educated in the liberal arts [and] trained to achieve” (*ibid.*), as if a college degree and ambition were the preserves of the rising middle-class only.

If *Kilmeny* is related to its Kailyard context, and to Scottish educational practice, Eric is, rather, a typical lad o’ pairts. He goes his own gait, drees his own weird (*KO* 5), and rejects many of the snobbish assumptions made of Islanders by his father and Mr Marshall’s low-born protégé, David Baker. (Incidentally, the phrase “dree one’s weird”³⁷, was another Scotticism [or “Walter Scotticism”] that Montgomery employed despite being initially ignorant of its meaning.³⁸) *Kilmeny* Gordon is a match for Eric, not because she spawns middle-class chivalry, or because each is the graceful offshoot of farming stock, but because both are descended from worthy Scottish immigrants. The Marshalls’ education and business flair are one manifestation of this. The Gordons’ simplicity, honesty, “native refinement and strong character”—and their use of Scots in contrast to the grammatical abuses of their neighbours—are another.

With *accent*, however, L.M. Montgomery was not really propagating imitation Kailyard in Canada. There is a vast difference between her work and that of “Ralph

³⁷ The *Shorter OED* defines this phrase as “submit to one’s fate”, and notes that it is used “as an archaism, following use by Sir Walter Scott”. The *Scottish National Dictionary* gives examples from *The Fortunes of Nigel* and *The Fair Maid of Perth* as well as *The House with the Green Shutters*. The phrase was also used in LMM’s journals (*SJ* I [June 30, 1897] 194) and *Rainbow Valley*: “Carl must dree his weird alone” (*RV* 307).

³⁸ In childhood LMM read a story, “The Dreeing of the Weird”, but “hadn’t any idea what the title meant and nothing in the story explained it” (*SJ* II [Jan. 14, 1914] 124).

Connor" [1860-1937].³⁹ Connor's "Glengarry" books centre on the manse, the schoolhouse, and the farmhouse. Sentimentalism is *de rigueur*: mothers die, grown men are humbled, bairnies learn wisdom, and God shines His beneficent light over all.⁴⁰ The Ontario township, however, is chiefly populated by Highlanders. Gaelic words occasionally appear in the text (with explanation or even pronunciation included⁴¹) but the Highlanders' speech is for the main part, very precise, quasi-Biblical English,⁴² very different to the double *ss*'s, and *f*'s for *v*'s familiar from Kailyard.⁴³

This Highland backdrop did not prevent Connor from dallying with the vogue for Lowland vernacular. Mrs Finch in *Glengarry School Days* [1902] is a Lowland woman. When first met she is healthy and speaks English ever so wisely, like everyone else. But as she begins to head inexorably toward death her tongue reverts to "her native speech" (199), for "[w]hen Mrs Finch was greatly moved she always dropped into her broadest Scotch" (209).⁴⁴ Her "triumphant deathbed scene" (319) is recounted by the dominie, to his uncle: "She put out her hand for mine, and said [...] 'Mr Craven, I give you a mither's thanks and a mither's blessing for a' you have done for ma laddie'", Mr Craven adding, in case his uncle was slow on the uptake, "She was Lowland Scotch, you know" (318). And yet another Kailyarder greets a tragic end.

L.M. Montgomery confessed herself to be "no admirer of Connor, in defiance of his success and popularity", judging his novels to owe their sales "to their emotion and melodrama".⁴⁵ The Kailyard stood similarly indicted, but there is still a

³⁹ For an interesting comparison of Kailyard women and Connor's women see Glenys Stow, "Astride a Galloping Pony: Scottish-Canadian Womanhood in Ralph Connor's Neo-Kailyard Novels", *British Journal of Canadian Studies* 7.1 [1992]: 49-58.

⁴⁰ cf. Marianne McLean, *The People of Glengarry*, for Glengarry, Ontario settlement patterns and several references to Connor's Glengarry books.

⁴¹ e.g. "Farquhar McRae, 'Little Farquhar,' or 'Farquhar Bhég' (pronounced 'vaick'), as he was euphoniously called" (*Glengarry Days* 274).

⁴² e.g. "But if I might ask, without being too bold, what is the particular duty to which you are referring." "You may ask, and you and all have a right to know, for I am about to visit upon my son his sin and shame". Ralph Connor. *Glengarry Days* [i.e. *Glengarry School Days*]. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1902: 132.

⁴³ e.g. "It iss all wrong that they hef been going these last years; for they stand to sing, and they sit to pray, and they will be using human himes". Ian Maclaren. *Kate Carnegie and Those Ministers* 50.

⁴⁴ Mrs Finch's reversion might be less laughable than we first suppose. In *The Surgeon of Crowthorne*, a biography in part of the Scot, James Murray, of OED fame, Simon Winchester notes that while Murray's wife was dying, "she lapsed into the broad Scots dialect of her childhood, and abandoned the more refined tones of a schoolteacher" (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1998: 34).

⁴⁵ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 29, 1916 [NAC]. Rev Gordon published three novels prior to *The Man from Glengarry: Beyond the Marshes* [1897], *Black Rock* [1898], and *The Sky Pilot* [1899]. Carl F. Klinck notes that the combined sales for the first three "Ralph Connor" novels were well in excess of 5 million (*Literary History of Canada, Vol. I: Canadian Literature in English*. 2nd edition 1976. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1977: 336).

difference between Mrs Finch, and, say, Jess McQumpha. Mrs Finch's return to the vernacular does not seem born of any literary purpose beyond inflicting additional torments upon the poor reader. Jess speaks in one dialect throughout *A Window in Thrums*, and her final days are not without humour as she abandons her "ambeetion to hae thae stuffed-bottomed chairs" (204). But Jess's death is also a dividing line between the old days starting at the bottom of the brae and a new industrial age. In *Kilmeny*, different accents signal the stages in transition between an immigrant and a naturalised Canadian society, while simultaneously extolling the virtues of a Scottish pedigree.

* * *

Charles Macneill's diary demonstrates that Scots words—"calie", "braws", "sweeties" and others⁴⁶—were still in use in Cavendish in the 1890s. On the other hand, the majority of Cavendish people did not have "broad Doric" accents, to judge by the cases where Montgomery named those who did. Montgomery refers to James McKinstrie, who "was born in Scotland and never lost the Lowland 'brogue'. He had considerable native intelligence but was entirely uneducated. In short, he might have stepped out of one of Scott's novels" (Mar. 1, 1925: U.6).⁴⁷ ("Old McKinstrie"—a Richard Moniplies of sorts—was famed in Cavendish for his queer sayings: he claimed he "made his own iodine out of strong tea and baking soda"⁴⁸!)

James McKinstrie was the model for old Mr Forbes in *The Story Girl* (May 23, 1911: U.3.185-186):

"Long ago they didn't have any choir in the Carlisle church—just a precentor, you know. But at last they got a choir, and Andrew Macpherson was to sing bass in it. Old Mr Forbes hadn't gone to church in years, because he was so rheumatic, but he went the first Sunday the choir sang, because he had never heard anyone sing bass, and wanted to hear what it was like. Grandfather King asked him what he thought of the choir. Mr Forbes said it was 'verra guid' but as for Andrew's bass, "there was nae bass aboot it—it was just a bur-r-r-r the hale time."

If you could have heard the *Story Girl*'s "bur-r--r-r!" Not old Mr Forbes himself could have invested it with more Doric scorn. We rolled over in the cool grass and screamed with laughter (*TSG* 104).

⁴⁶ Mr Charles uses the word "calie", Jan. 22, Mar. 11, 1898: "braws", June 17, 1898: "sweeties" July 17, 1898. He repeatedly used the word "mind" for remember, and uses the word tea [for a meal] in the plural, e.g. "we had our teas" (Feb. 16, 1896).

⁴⁷ James McKenstry (the name is spelt a variety of ways) was born 22 December 1815 and died 4 July 1905 (Cavendish Presbyterian/ United Cemetery Lot 23-1. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society). As he retained a Scottish accent he was probably a relatively late migrant to the Cavendish area. He had a son called James, thus his tag of "old McKinstrie", no doubt.

⁴⁸ May 23, 1911: U.3.185. This anecdote was conferred on "old Mr James MacPherson" in *The Golden Road* (*TGR* 45). Old McKinstrie's dismissive comment on Henry Drummond's *Natural Law in the Spirit World* provided the original of Miss Cornelia's: "I can read sense, and I can read nonsense, but that book is neither one nor the other" (*AHD* 166-167).

Mr Forbes is a model example of Montgomery's Lowland Scots-born characters. The Scot is old (or dead), often from the poorer farming class, and is the subject of a humorous anecdote turning on "Scotch" temperament, peculiarity, Doric tongue or all three. The people telling and hearing the anecdote, although they may be quite young, relate culturally to it, and require neither translation, nor explanation of Scotch idiosyncrasies. The anecdote has a root in real-life, although in this case the connection to Walter Scott is pertinent.

Chief among the King cousins' delights is Mr Scott, a Presbyterian divine of ample proportions, who "was too fat to get in at the door of [the pulpit], and had to h'ist himself by his two hands over it, and then whispered to the other minister so that everybody heard him: '*This pulpit door was made for speerits*'" (TSG 39). Based on the Rev Mr Sprott, an "old Scotch minister of Nova Scotia", this eccentric character appeared in tales told by Alexander Marquis Macneill.⁴⁹ The story of the narrow, "wine-glass" pulpit door belonged to Cavendish lore. Other tales repeated in the "Story Girl" books were Nova Scotian anecdotes, introduced to Cavendish folklore through Maritime connections.⁵⁰ For the Kings it is important that the long-dead Mr Scott was their local minister because Sara's stories are sparked by local setting.

The cousins are surrounded by Scottish accents. They are used by adults to reassure: when Cecily poisons herself with cucumbers and milk, the doctor tells her, "As old Mrs Fraser says, 'It's no deidly'" (TSG 163).⁵¹ In *Our Magazine*, the little Kings even go so far as to mimic newspaper "funny paragraphs", which hinged on stock types like the stoical or parsimonious Scot, for example: "Old Mr McIntyre's son on the Markdale Road had been very sick for several years and somebody was sympathetic with him because his son was going to die. 'Oh,' Mr McIntyre said, quite easy, 'he might as weel be awa'. He's only retarding buzziness'" (TGR 208).

⁴⁹ May, 23, 1911: U.3.182. Mr Sprott's daughter married Dr Murray, a Cavendish minister (1850-1877). In "The Old Minister in the Story Girl", A. Wylie Mahon expanded further upon the Scots-born Rev John Sprott, reputedly a friend of T.C. Haliburton. Interestingly, Mahon pulled many of his anecdotes from an article by LMM's Uncle Leander Macneill (also a Presbyterian minister, firstly in Nova Scotia, then Newfoundland, then New Brunswick [SJ II (Oct. 18, 1913) 134-137]). The Rev Leander's article may have been among LMM's sources. (A.W. Mahon. "The Old Minister in the Story Girl". *Canadian Magazine*. March 1912: 452-54. Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG).

⁵⁰ e.g. the Rev Scott thought the Presbytery that requested his retirement was not following God's will, but the instructions of his ministerial rivals, "the McCloskeys and the devil" (TSG 105).

⁵¹ The combination was "deidly" for US President Zachary Taylor, who succumbed to cholera morbus (in July 1850) after (reputedly) imbibing milk and cucumbers.

Montgomery had a fondness for such jokes herself, as her memorabilia scrapbooks reveal,⁵² and reproduced some for her *Echo* column.

When Sara Stanley repeats the story of "How Betty Sherman Won a Husband" to Mr Campbell, "an old miser, and curmudgeon" (*TSG* 51), she charms him, partly by dramatising the Scots voices of the Island pioneers, "angry or tender, mocking or merry, in Lowland and Highland accent" (57). Donald Fraser, the Lowlander, sings "Annie Laurie", is bold and brave, and hoodwinks the gullible Highlander by exploiting his taste for whisky. Neil Campbell, the Highlander, is glib and has a fierce temper. Donald's Lowland tushery bears little resemblance to the Lowland accents of literature, or, indeed, life: "May your sleep be long and sweet, man [...] and as for the waking, 'twill be betwixt you and me" (54). Highlander Neil Campbell is no less confused syntactically: "It is laughing at me all over the countryside and telling that story, that Donald Fraser will be doing, is it?" (56), and Betty Sherman speaks in similar Wardour Street English.⁵³ Wherever, if anywhere, Donald's dialect *does* come from, it speeds up his speech, whereas Neil's diction is slowed; the Lowland hare outsmarts the Highland tortoise. Community folk-lore—and this story "had once been published in a Charlottetown paper" (56)—reinforced national stereotypes.

Sara brings to life a number of Scottish characters, telling their stories for entertainment, but also because as PEI folklore *and* King family history, they bridge the gap between "them times" and now. As is typical with folk-tales, all are told of someone's grandfather, or of somewhere nearby, and are all the more credible for this.⁵⁴ Unlike Pat Gardiner, who is told by her great-great-aunt Hannah that she is, "nae beauty" (*PSB* 60), the Kings do not have living relatives who speak in Scots. Lowland Scots voices are part of their personal cultural inheritance and Scots-

⁵² e.g. "An old Scotch fisherman was visited during his last illness by a clergyman, who wore a close-fitting waistcoat, which buttoned behind. The clergyman asked the old man if his mind was perfectly at ease. 'Oo, ay, I'm a' richt; but there's just ae thing that troubles me, and I dinna like to speak o't.' 'I am anxious to comfort you,' replied the clergyman. 'Tell me what perplexes you.' 'Weel, sir, it's just like this,' said the old man, eagerly. 'I canna for the life o' me mak oot hoo ye manage tae get intae that westkit'". Clipping from the *New York Observer*, memorabilia scrapbook, labelled "Late 1890s, early 1900s", CM.67.5.12.

⁵³ In the first published version of this story, "A Pioneer Wooing"—originally published in *Farm and Fireside* September 1903 (Scrapbook 3, unlabelled, CM.67.5.19)—the Betty Sherman character is identified as a U.E. Loyalist. All three characters use almost exactly the same words as they do in *The Story Girl*.

⁵⁴ see Joyce-Ione Harrington Coldwell. "Folklore as Fiction: The Writings of L.M. Montgomery". *Folklore Studies in Honour of Herbert Halpert*. Ed. Kenneth Goldstein and Neil Rosenberg. St John's, Nfld: Memorial U of Newfoundland, 1980: 125-135. Coldwell comments that, "offering a part as proof of a whole" is "a technique frequently encountered in the narratives of oral tradition" (129-130). When Dan refuses to believe the Story Girl's yarn about the devil walking in a local copse, his sister Cecily counters, "I don't see how you can help believing it [...] It isn't as if it was something we'd read of or that happened far away. It happened just down at Markdale, and I've seen that very spruce wood myself" (*TSG* 227).

Canadian cultural environment, but the Doric “burr” and Doric wit belong in the romantic past. In L.M. Montgomery’s fiction individual Lowland dialect words linger, but Lowland Scots accents come only from the old and the rustic. Even where these folks were based on real people, the literary fashion for Scots can mean they become caricatures and “lovely gems” of Scotch associations.

Montgomery’s heroines are Canadian. They rarely use dialect words (and use only romantic ones) and the text suggests they have Canadian accents. Yet they understand and connect with Scottish voices because they are raised in Scots-Canadian clans and communities. When Marigold is left in charge of cake-baking,⁵⁵ the narrator comments, “If Marigold had been asked if she could cook she might have answered like canny Great-Uncle Malcolm when asked if he could play the violin. ‘He couldna’ say. He had never tried’” (*MFM* 223). Malcolm Lesley is Scots by name, by description (canny), and by accent: a thrice deliberate attempt to endow Marigold with Scots forbearance in a crisis.⁵⁶ By language readers know these young folks are Canadian, but through local dialect the characters grasp their Scottish heritage.

Montgomery may have celebrated the inner lives and inner voices of her heroines, but her books are driven by the diverse talk and gossip and poetry of the community. As James A. Harrison is forced to admit when he moves to PEI, “I never was much of a talker until I came to Avonlea and then I had to begin in self-defence or Mrs Lynde would have said I was dumb and started up a subscription to have me taught sign-language” (*AA* 84). If only Mrs Rachel had been around for Kilmeny Gordon!

Highland Sandy and the “Twa Talks”

Although the names McIntyre and Macpherson are Highland ones, Montgomery generally demarcates Highland characters expressly.⁵⁷ Sara’s anecdotes about bona fide Highlanders have a different linguistic emphasis to those about “the Scotch”: “When [Julia Stanley] resigned [as teacher] the trustees had a meeting to see if they’d

⁵⁵ LMM used the same story in *Emily of New Moon*: in both cases the heroine proves herself to be a bona fide clan member by her ability to cook in the best clan tradition.

⁵⁶ The anecdote is not original, and it is likely that LMM first met it in *The Pickwick Papers*: “there is an old story—none the worse for being true—regarding a fine young Irish gentleman, who being asked if he could play the fiddle, replied that he had no doubt he could, but he couldn’t exactly say for certain, because he had never tried”. Notably, LMM improves on her antecedent, by swapping the talkative Irishman for a cursory Scot, honing the response to a comical seven words.

⁵⁷ Cavendish had Macneills, McKinstries, Mackenzies and McLures for “Mcs” and “Macs”. There had once been McKays, from Errebol [Eriboll], Durness in Sutherlandshire (Cavendish Presbyterian/United Cemetery Lot 23-1. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society).

ask her to stay and raise her supplement. Old Highland Sandy was alive then and he got up and said, 'If she for go let her for went. Perhaps she for marry'" (*TGR* 45). As Ian Finlayson writes, "the comical Highlander 'Sandy' was as much a figure of fun and ridicule in Lowland Scotland"—and presumably among Scots abroad—"as the Irish 'Paddy': neither could be relied upon for intelligence or industry" (116).⁵⁸

L.M. Montgomery expressed a fair share of racial prejudice,⁵⁹ and toyed with the "Paddy" caricature in her writing on several occasions,⁶⁰ for example, in the Story Girl's conundrum about the Irishman, the pig, and the pail of mush (*TSG* 99) or "the Irishman who said he wished the man who begun work had stayed and finished it" (*TGR* 3). Mrs Lynde remarks that, "[a] body can get used to anything, even to being hanged, as the Irishman said" (*AGG* 12).⁶¹ There are few comparable tales of anonymous Scots. When Drowned John interrupts Aunt Becky, she snaps back, "Courtesy costs nothing, as the Scotchman said" (*ATW* 47); but English Aunt Becky is perhaps more willing to throw a punch at the miserly Scotch. (As Rachel Lynde's wisecrack is an Irish bull, Becky Dark's must surely be a "Highland cow".) In the main, L.M. Montgomery's Scottish and Highlander characters—even those called "Sandy"—are not apocryphal. Readers are meant to believe that, unlike the indolent Irishman, these characters actually live in PEI.

Indeed, "Old Highland Sandy" was based on "an old Scotch man down at Kinross". Montgomery recorded with comic regret, "[w]hen I wrote the book I was blissfully certain that the old fellow was dead and buried these many years. This summer I discovered to my dismay that he is still living" (Sept. 27, 1913: U.3.377). "Old Highland Sandy" only appears once in *The Golden Road* so Montgomery likely lamented using an attributable anecdote, not a Highlander called Sandy, of which there were, of course, a multitude in PEI. Ewan Macdonald's sister, Christie, lived in Kinross and Montgomery undoubtedly learned about Highland Sandy's regrettable longevity when visiting Christie in July 1913. Quite how she came across his "Perhaps she for marry" in the first place is another matter: perhaps from her husband?

⁵⁸ Ian Finlayson. *The Scots*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987.

⁵⁹ LMM shared lodgings briefly with Irish Catholics, Mr McMann, "a very rough and boorish sort of person" (*SJ* I 106), and his wife "an odd-looking personage" (107). This "terrible couple" (108) lived up to stereotype by fighting continually. The belligerent Irish stereotype also crops up in LMM's fiction: "If that jug doesn't set everybody on their ears in a month's time, may I fight with Irishmen to the end of my life" (*ATW* 66).

⁶⁰ e.g. "By what some Paddy has called a 'Herculeaneum effort' I kept this rash vow but it was the hardest thing I ever did in my life" (LMM and NL's diary, June 19, 1903): "Some Paddy" changed to "somebody" when LMM used the malapropism in *Anne of Avonlea* (117).

⁶¹ cf. *SJ* I [Nov. 18, 1901] 270.

Maud's initial impression of Ewan is preserved in the diary she kept with Nora Lefurgey. Nora cattishly remarked that Maud "has taken up church work since the young ministers have struck the place" (25 June 1903). Maud wrote, with a degree of ham, "we had a Highlander to preach for us and he was 'chust lofely' [...] My heart pitty-patted so that I could hardly play the hymns" (21 June 1903). Ham or not, three years later, Maud Montgomery recalled similar first impressions of Ewan Macdonald: "His people were Highland Scotch and although he was Canadian born he had a pronounced but not unpleasing Scotch, or rather *Gaelic*, accent" (*SJI* [Oct. 12, 1906] 320, my italics).

Ewan's father, Alexander Macdonald [1833-1914] emigrated from Kilmuir, Skye to PEI, with his parents, Alexander and Catherine, in 1841. Ewan's mother, Christie Cameron [1834-1920], was also of Skye extraction; her parents, Ewen and Ann (Macdonald) Cameron migrated to PEI in 1829.⁶² Alexander Macdonald settled in Valleyfield, a community in the Belfast area founded by Skye-Islanders the previous year.⁶³ Ewan Macdonald was one of ten children with mixed and widespread fates. Five siblings (Katie, Annie, Christie, Rhoderick, and John) stayed in PEI⁶⁴; Angus became a prosperous doctor in Indiana; Flora lived in Boston; Alexander and Donald moved to Montana—where Alexander mysteriously disappeared after a suicide threat (*SJIV* 266).

Between 3 October 1896 and 16 January 1897, *Mac-Talla* (a Nova Scotian Gaelic newspaper) carried a descriptive account of the Island, by Jonathan Gillis MacKinnon. MacKinnon visited Valleyfield where he noted that the population were, "as Gaelic [...] as any to be found in Canada. [...] There is nobody in these places, among the youth at any rate, who cannot speak English, and there is only the odd exceptional individual who cannot speak Gaelic, clearly and fluently" (10).⁶⁵ In 1977, the Belfast Historical Society embarked on a project to record the memories of twenty-seven elderly residents (born between 1883 and 1915) from the Belfast area.⁶⁶ Several informants remembered a similar Gaelic/ English bilingualism in their

⁶² Malcolm A. Macqueen writes in *Hebridean Pioneers* (Winnipeg, 1957): "Perhaps in the history of Belfast [PEI] no family was more highly esteemed than the Camerons of Point Prim" (35). Christie's brothers, Roderick and Alexander, were master mariners.

⁶³ Around two thousand Gaels left Skye for PEI between 1839 and 1841. See Mike Kennedy, Ch. 8: "Their Doom is Just and Righteous and for the Benefit of Society".

⁶⁴ T.K. Pratt notes that LMM's brother-in-law, Roddy, i.e. Roderick Macdonald, was known locally as "Roddy Spreck"—to distinguish him from the many other Roddy Macdonalds one presumes—on account of his father's freckles, spreckled being a Scots-PEI term for freckled (Pratt, 144).

⁶⁵ Jonathan MacKinnon. (trans. Norman Macdonald) "A Tour to Prince Edward Island." *IM*. 12 [Fall-Winter 1982]: 7-10.

⁶⁶ Susan J. Hornby, ed. *Belfast People: An Oral History of Belfast Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown, PEI: Tea Hill Press, 1992. Several of the recorded interviews were not used in the final book: tapes of all interviews are held in the P.A.P.E.I.

youth, although as Gaelic was increasingly used as a code between adults, fewer children were taught to speak, let alone read, the language.⁶⁷

Ewan Macdonald belonged to an Island community where the old Gaelic heritage mingled with an English-speaking milieu and the Macdonald family were Gaelic speakers. A Cavendish resident, Annie Laura Toombs Moore [b. 1898] remembers that the Rev. Macdonald would visit her Scots-born, non-English speaking grandmother, and that the pair “would have a field day talking in Gaelic. He could even pray in Gaelic” (12).⁶⁸ Although Ewan was clearly a fluent English-speaker, and was educated in English-speaking establishments,⁶⁹ it is also plausible that his circumstance caused a certain degree of cultural dislocation.⁷⁰ Even where later praise of Ewan was fulsome, his taciturnity was remarked upon.⁷¹ He was remembered as languid compared to Maud: “She would get impatient because he spoke very slowly, and she would be way ahead of him before he got around to his point”.⁷² The image of Ewan as a “plodder” (Gillen 129) was doubtless exacerbated by the presence of his energetic, sparkling, witty (and famous) wife, for he was, by all accounts neither stupid, nor solitary.

Montgomery herself wrote that Ewan was “not an intellectual man and had no culture in spite of his college education [...] he possessed no fluency of speech; he was somewhat shy and awkward in society with a very narrow conversational range” (ibid., 321). (She curiously never refers to his bilingualism.) All these observations conform to the stereotype of Gaels as stupid, slow, and lethargic “Sandys” and this prejudice may have been at work when Ewan Macdonald was described. (A similar Lowlander might perhaps have been praised as deep, or brooding, or reserved.) To Montgomery the “Highland Scotch” were a cultural “other”, not quite Canadian, and

⁶⁷ see also John Shaw. “Gaelic in Prince Edward Island: A Cultural Remnant”. Final Report. (Sponsored by the Institute of Island Studies, UPEI and the Celtic Studies Committee. Compiled, Summer 1987.)

⁶⁸ Sandy Wagner, “Almost a Century.” *Kindred Spirits*. Autumn 1995: 12-13. Annie Moore is the mother of Jennie Moore, who, with her husband John Macneill (great-grandson of Alexander Marquis Macneill) owns and runs the site of L.M. Montgomery’s Cavendish home.

⁶⁹ EM was educated at P.W.C., Charlottetown, and became a schoolteacher (PEI schooling was in English by this time) before he began studying for the ministry, firstly at Pine Hill Seminary, Halifax (S/I II [Sept. 1, 1919] 323), then at the United Free Church College in Glasgow (Gillen, 90).

⁷⁰ John Shaw’s report finds evidence of a bumpy language transition from Gaelic to English: a “man in describing his responsibilities at home is reputed to have said, ‘I have two blind mans on my hands and one of them is a woman’”.

⁷¹ e.g. Margaret H. Mustard describes EM as “of Scottish descent and very discreet” *L.M. Montgomery as Mrs Ewan Macdonald of the Leaskdale Manse, 1911-1926*. Leaskdale: St Paul’s Presbyterian Women’s Association, 1965: 2.

⁷² Words of a “relative” of LMM, cited in Gillen (129). A member of EM’s congregation recalled that he had tried “to make Scottish oatcakes when he was alone in the Manse on one occasion; no recipe tried by Maud had succeeded in satisfying him” (128): another example, perhaps, of their different Scottish heritages.

marked partly by their “chust lofely” diction. In this sense, her descriptions of Ewan, the Highlander she knew best, prefigure her fictional “Highlanders”. It may be, however, that Montgomery associated (however unconsciously) her husband’s theological bent, his distracted aspect, his conversational troughs, and his intellectual lows, with his being a Highlander.

* * *

L.M. Montgomery was raised in a predominately English-speaking and possibly self-consciously Lowland-Scots Canadian community. Even so, the area housed a mixed population: there were pockets of Irish, French, English, and perhaps even Welsh settlement.⁷³ Hugh John Montgomery’s store in Clifton held accounts for *twenty-six* William McKays, a reminder of the area’s Gaelic heritage.⁷⁴ Montgomery’s Cavendish journals, however, rarely offer observations on this ethnic mélange. She was more likely to pass remark on PEI’s diversity when she journeyed *from* Cavendish. She spent the Easter holidays of 1894 with Mary Campbell in Darlington (Lot 31). Recalling a prayer meeting in nearby Brookfield, Montgomery recorded:

an old patriarch got up and began to pray in Gaelic and at the same time a cat began to yowl weirdly outside and I had the time of my life to keep from laughing. One was about as intelligible to me as the other. You can’t imagine how funny it sounded (Mar. 28, 1894: U.1).

In March 1905, Montgomery repeated this tale to George MacMillan, boasting, “I shall *never* forget the first time I heard Gaelic ‘as she’s spoken’”.⁷⁵

Montgomery might *never* forget, but she did make interesting revisions for MacMillan’s benefit. The cat transmogrified into a dog, and thus into a banshee of sorts. She herself became a “fifteen year old schoolgirl”—she was actually nineteen—“very apt to see the funny side of everything”.⁷⁶ Montgomery was in a tricky

⁷³ LMM refers to a local Welshman, Mr Roberts. LMM’s Uncle William S. Macneill (who freed PEI from the “tyranny of landlordism”) was married to a Welsh woman, Ann Maria Jones, and lived in neighbouring North Rustico.

⁷⁴ LMM recorded: “To differentiate so many of the same name nicknames were resorted to, some of which were ludicrous enough. ‘Geordie Bain’, ‘Geordie Squires’, ‘Geordie Bush’, and ‘Geordie Creek’ were all legally George McKay. Sandy Long Jim and Sandy Big Tom were others. They were never spoken of in any other way. It is a matter of record that a minister in Clifton once gravely called upon ‘Alexander Big Jim’ to lead in prayer! And Alexander Big Jim as gravely complied. Nobody even smiled” (SJ I [Jan. 7, 1910] 373). LMM must have realised that these were Gaelic naming patterns: “Sandy Big Jim” (i.e. Alexander the son of Big James) reappears in the Balmoral congregation in the tale of “The Woman who Spanked the King” (EC 202).

⁷⁵ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 15, 1905 [NAC].

⁷⁶ “I thought I had never heard anything so funny and we girls laughed, I regret to say, until the seat shook under us” (ibid.).

position with MacMillan concerning her age, but there is less reason to think she was upholding her original “whopper”, than that she was embarrassed by her juvenile behaviour, especially when trying to impress MacMillan with “Highland Scotch” tales.⁷⁷ The incident shows that Montgomery was ignorant of Gaelic in Cavendish, although this did not prevent her from seeing the joke in parroting it. Importantly, Mary Campbell laughed at the Gaelic language when visited by her English-speaking friends.⁷⁸

In June 1900, Mary Campbell married a “big, quiet, stolid-looking Highlander”, Archie Beaton.⁷⁹ As noted in Part I, Montgomery was baffled and intrigued by Archie’s mother’s Gaelic. (Montgomery’s term “fearful gibberish” echoes Colonel Talbot’s comment when he pillories Highlanders in *Waverley*.⁸⁰) Montgomery was “in misery” because she did not understand old Mrs Beaton, and bemused that “a child of only three years” could.⁸¹ Amid the clichés and cultural supremacism, however, Montgomery made important observations on changing language usage. Montgomery’s fictional Highlanders similarly teeter along the thin line separating stereotype from social insight. Montgomery’s subterfuge when writing to MacMillan in 1905 was a sign that her attitude to Gaelic changed with time: that which was ridiculed in “girlhood” was later recognised as part of Canada’s romantic heritage.

Montgomery used the name “Beaton”—which many readers would not recognise as a Gaelic surname⁸²—in “The Beaton Family Group”.⁸³ The doctor patriarch of this family gathers his wife and four of their children—a fifth child, Alec,

⁷⁷ LMM did not try to tell GBM about her visit to Darlington, two years later, when she and her cousin Lucy Macneill had “laughed ourselves sick to hear Mary mimicking old Gaelic women talking” (June 8, 1896: U.1).

⁷⁸ Mary’s father, Donald E. Campbell, according to his obituary, was born in Scotland in 1840 and migrated to PEI with his parents that year. Memorabilia scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG.

⁷⁹ At the wedding ceremony, the Campbells’ dog had a fit and made “the weirdest, most unearthly noises” (*SJ* I [Aug. 5, 1900] 252), possibly the reason why LMM was confused as to whether a dog or a cat yowled outside the Darlington church, and surely a forerunner of Sir Wilfrid Laurier’s fit during Miranda’s and Joe’s wedding in *Rilla of Ingleside*. LMM later described it as a wedding after “the Highland fashion” because Scotch was imbibed (*SJ* II [Sept. 4, 1919] 342).

⁸⁰ *Waverley* 374. “Let [the Highlanders] stay in their own barren mountains, and puff and swell, and hang their bonnets on the horns of the moon, if they have a mind; but what business have they to come where people wear breeches and speak an intelligible language?—I mean intelligible in comparison to their *gibberish*, for even the Lowlanders talk a kind of English little better than the Negroes in Jamaica” (my italics).

⁸¹ Letter to GBM, dated Mar. 31, 1930 [NAC]. LMM and GBM shared an interest in xenoglossia. GBM told LMM a story of a Polish girl who could speak Gaelic without having been taught it (many Scots migrated to Poland), and in this letter LMM recounted a yarn about a woman of Spanish ancestry who spoke Spanish when she was delirious, although she had not learned the language.

⁸² Beaton (also Bethune and others) derived from the Gaelic *beatha* (life), the Beatons being the hereditary doctors of the Lords of the Isles.

⁸³ Published in *The Canadian Courier*, Jan. 9, 1915 (Scrapbook 8).

“left home in a red-hot Highland rage” some years previously—for a family photograph. The developed print shows Alec’s face. Mrs Beaton, who had “a touch of mysticism in her face—her inheritance from her Gaelic forefathers”, thinks Alec must be dead: her husband also “thought, like his second-sighted forefathers, that it was a sign”. Their son Norman, wiser in his generation, firstly “thrilled to the seeming supernatural”, but when his “shrewd” (and Canadian) “common sense had reasserted itself”, finds Alec at a hotel where he had decamped after visiting the homestead and strolling accidentally into shot. Norman urges Alec to come home, foreseeing that their “father would be the first to run and fall on [Alec’s] neck—the Highland blood for you”.

“The Beaton Family Group” is a standard pot-boiler, with little to resurrect it now, in truth, saving the Highland family.⁸⁴ The Beatons embody a glut of Highland stereotypes: they are passionate, wrathful, mystical, melancholic, superstitious, and clannish, thus entirely unbelievable. It is not, hopefully, a serious attempt to write insightfully of Highlander-Scots in PEI, although once again it portrays a transitional generation, sharing some parental traditions and rejecting others. As Highland communities in PEI were foreign to Montgomery, she was always in danger of succumbing to popular stereotype. However, Montgomery the story-teller was attracted to odd sayings and individuals, legends and folk-lore, which could bring more interesting Highland characters into her fiction.

* * *

Montgomery’s most studied portrait of a Highlander is Mistress Margaret McIntyre (*Emily Climbs* Chs. 13-15).⁸⁵ Prior to emigration, this woman worked at Balmoral Castle, where she had occasion to spank the disobedient Prince Bertie. (Queen Victoria surprised Mrs McIntyre by telling her she “did right”, and Prince Albert joked about the “laying on of hands” [204].) “[T]wo years” after Victoria’s death, Mistress McIntyre can now boast that she spanked the king. The background to this episode may have been suggested by Lytton Strachey’s *Queen Victoria* [1921], a

⁸⁴ LMM was a keen photographer and wrote several short stories where the narrative depends on a “kodak”, including, “Detected by the Camera” [1897]; “Why Mr Cropper Changed his Mind [1903]; “Frank’s Wheat Series” [1905]; “The Jenkinson Grit” [1905]; “The Little Fellow’s Photograph” [1906]—afterwards cannabalised for *Anne of Windy Willows*; “A Girl and a Picture” [1907]; “The Girl who Drove the Cows” [1908].

⁸⁵ In one of the most bizarre pieces of criticism on LMM’s work, Edward Anthony, swears that LMM penned a collection of short stories called, *The Woman Who Spanked the King*, omitted “from most bibliographies”, because its existence would prove LMM to be “a spokeswoman for the peculiar tendency” of flagellation through her “constant [...] references to corporal punishment”! Edward Anthony. *Thy Rod and Staff*. London: Little, Brown & Co., 1995 (Ch. 6).

book Montgomery was reading in June 1923 when writing *Emily Climbs*.⁸⁶ She would have learned therein that Bertie was a difficult and indolent child, fussed over by indulgent parents (165-166). Montgomery appears to resolve that Edward VII would have benefited better from Highland homespun wisdom (and punishment) than pampering.

Emily meets Mrs McIntyre when she and Ilse are storm-stayed while subscription-hunting. Emily wakes to find sitting beside her an old woman “wearing over her thick grey hair a spotless white widow’s cap, such as the old Highland Scotchwomen still wore in the early years of the century” (EC 199). Although disappointed to find that Emily does not have “the twa talks! I will be meaning the Gaelic” (201),⁸⁷ Mistress McIntyre shares her story with her “predestined listener” (210). Emily promises to write and publish the story, not in the “proud words” (205) that Mrs McIntyre imagines, but exactly as it has been told. Montgomery tells the story in long *ss*’s, soft accents (*f*’s for *v*’s, *p*’s for *b*’s) and future tenses,⁸⁸ the standard transcription of Highland speech patterns familiar from Ian Maclaren and others. This style can, admittedly, be rather overwhelming, as Montgomery struggles to preserve tenses, repeated *oh yesses*, and *sense*.

Montgomery complicates matters further by incorporating Lowland Scots dialect into Mistress MacIntyre’s conversation: “I will be hearing Clara skirling in the night [...] the Wilsons will always be making a stramash over everything” (205). It is even so with “Highland Sandy” in *Rilla of Ingleside*. L.M. Montgomery seems confused as to Highland Sandy’s background. When he coins the “quaint” expression, “your house will be seeming very big the day” (RI 241), his personal version of “your house is left unto you desolate” tugs Gilbert’s heart-strings because it differs from the platitudes his English-speaking neighbours offer.⁸⁹ Likewise, Sandy’s

⁸⁶ Strachey cites Queen Victoria’s, *Leaves from the Journal of Our Life in the Highlands*, and the monarch’s reference to gifting red flannel petticoats to Mrs P. Farquarson, and old Kitty Kear. Lytton Strachey. *Queen Victoria*. 1921, London: Chatto & Windus, 1931: 170. LMM replicates this by telling that when Mistress McIntyre left for Canada, she was presented with “a silk petticoat [...] a fery fine petticoat of the Victorian tartan” (EC 204) by the Queen, notably upgrading the petticoat to flaunting silk, although Mrs McIntyre is too proud of it to wear it as anything but a shroud.

⁸⁷ “That iss a pity, for my story will not be sounding so well in the English—oh no” (EC 201). John Shaw records that there is “a widespread and possibly accurate piece of storytelling folklore [...] frequently encountered among Cape Breton reciters” that “stories sound better in Gaelic” (John Shaw, “Gaelic in Prince Edward Island”).

⁸⁸ “I will be getting fatter and fatter all the time now, but I wass fery slim and peautiful then—oh yess, it is the truth I will be telling you though I will be seeing that you are laughing in your sleeves at me” (EC 201).

⁸⁹ In much the same way, “Aunt Highland Kitty of the Upper Glen” casts a shadow back on the Blythes’ happy summer, when Anne remembers the Highland woman’s aphorism, “the same summer will never be coming twice” (AI 195). (Older women in PEI communities were often referred to as “Aunt” by everyone: LMM’s Grandmother Macneill was “Aunt Lucy”; a Cavendish woman, Sarah Adelaide Clark, was even called “Aunt Pet” on her tombstone.)

phrases “get in a low” (*RI* 260) and “cootie sarks” (for “certain Red Cross garments known by the charming name of ‘vermin shirts’” [*RI* 176]) are noteworthy in the annals of Ingleside because they are non-standard English. But in these last two cases, Montgomery was again putting Lowland Scots words in the mouth of a Highlander. “Cootie sark” puns with “cutty sark”, famously roared out in the haunted kirk by libidinous Tam o’ Shanter. (Perhaps this is the real reason that, in Susan’s “opinion, ‘cooties’ and ‘sarks’ were not proper subjects for young girls to talk about” [176].)

For all that this unobtrusive character has a certain effectiveness, he conforms with Knowles’ description of “the Scottish comic, Harry Lauder, with his Lowland accent and Highland garb adapted for the English audience” (232, n.135). (The only Montgomery character to wear Highland garb, “kilts” [in the plural] is junior Lothario, Hip Price, in *Magic for Marigold*.⁹⁰) Glen St Mary’s Highland Sandy is not a Sandy-esque figure of fun, but his characterisation does confuse Scottish heritages, making for “mock Scots” once more.

As established in Part II, Montgomery intended this novel to convey a strong Scottish spirit. The MacCallums from the Upper Glen receive a letter from their son, Roderick, a prisoner of war in Germany:

He wrote that he was being very kindly treated and that all the prisoners had plenty of food and so on, till you would have supposed that everything was lovely. But when he signed his name, right in between Roderick and MacCallum, he wrote two Gaelic words that meant “all lies,” and the German censor did not understand Gaelic and thought it was all part of Roddy’s name. So he let it pass, never dreaming how he was diddled (*RI* 214).

Ingleside revels in Roderick’s outsmarting of the Hun.⁹¹ It seems not improbable that this story may have had an antecedent in the First World War lore of PEI. Whatever its basis, when the Gaelic language helped the war effort, Montgomery no longer felt inclined to laugh at its strangeness. With the MacCallums, and later, Mrs McIntyre, Montgomery showed Gaelic usage (when coupled with fluency in English) to be positively advantageous. Roderick MacCallum is lauded as an heroic example of Highland “cleverness”—a far cry from Neil Campbell—an archetypal wily Gaelic hero who diddles the brute force of his enemy with cunning.

⁹⁰ “It was rather unfortunate that Hip should have selected that day for appearing out in kilts. He had thin legs” (*MFM* 239). In a short story, “Two Summers”, the days of youth are referred to as “the days of kilts and mud pies”: these two examples may infer that the only kilt-wearing LMM saw was by young boys. “Two Summers”. *Waverley Magazine*, 5 October 1901, Scrapbook 6, labelled “The Blue Album: Stories and Poems late 1890s early 1900s”, CM.67.5.17.

⁹¹ Oddly, neither narrator nor Ingleside spares a thought for the MacCallums, who now know their son is mistreated and starving in a German prison.

As the Scottish immigrant population died out, Scots voices ebbed in Canada. Conversely, in the late nineteenth century, Scots dialect and accent realised a new vigour (and often a trite symbolism) in popular literature. L.M. Montgomery's fiction attests to the dying tradition of spoken Scots in PEI, by giving these accents to incidental (mainly elderly and legendary) characters only, but her work is also not immune to exploiting some stereotypes through these voices. Often they convey humour and "great charm and character"; thankfully she avoids the worst pitfalls of the Kailyard genre and its imitators, by seldom coining "affecting" prose designed to bring "tears to the common eye" through "poetic" associations. The speech patterns of Scots-Islanders are replicated to some extent, as is also true of her ruralisms, French-Canadian accents, and thick Irish brogues. L.M. Montgomery collected local sayings in her journals and repeated them in her stories.⁹²

The Highland accents and instances of Gaelic in her fiction also owe something to Island patterns. But Montgomery's experience (both personal and literary) of each was more limited, despite her marriage to a Gaelic-speaking Highlander and the visits to her Highland-Canadian in-laws on each trip "home". Sandy in *Rilla* and Margaret McIntyre are somewhat more realistic than some of her Highland characters. Where they take advantage of stereotypes, they opt for the positive (romantic, mystical, oratorical) end of the spectrum, not negative associations of stupidity and laziness. Whereas at nineteen she had found Gaelic (and perhaps the Gaels) queer, funny, and quaint, with maturity (and writing success) Montgomery partially recognised each as a colourful part of Island diversity and blended Canadian identity.

Conclusion: The Strange Case of Judy Plum (II)

Every village has its own little unwritten history, handed down from lip to lip through the generations of tragic, comic and dramatic events. They are told at weddings and festivals, and rehearsed around winter firesides.

Rilla of Ingleside 202

When James A. Harrison starts talking "in self-defence" he is understandably resisting Rachel Lynde's singular meddling, but also the combined attempts of "feminine Avonlea" to prattle him into conformity. The Avonlea women are not a homogenous social unit, and marked class divisions abide, but they nonetheless share a collective interest in exchanging grim stories and planning retaliatory lines of

⁹² e.g. Charles Macneill's "she-weasels" (*EQ* 29), "too many bushels for a small canoe" (*PSB* 31), and Charles' dim-witted son Russell's "generous purpose horse" (*Als* 189), "information of the lungs" (*TSG* 39 cf. Jan. 28, 1912: U.3).

attack.⁹³ In fiction, L.M. Montgomery infrequently describes village-wide female gatherings like the Putney congress or the quilting bee in *Anne of Ingleside*,⁹⁴ but smaller-scale gossip-mongering is an everyday pursuit in community dialogue and introspection.⁹⁵ "News" circulates in Chinese whispers, butchering accuracy as it travels: "Tommy Spencer in Carmody disappeared mysteriously forty years ago and was never found . . . or was he? Well, if he was, it was only his skeleton" (*AI* 31).

Small stories, whispered hints, shared jokes, and dark mutterings shape this oral narrative, an alternative reading and alternative history of the local world that can be both conservative in its censoriousness, and rebellious in its female alliances and male-female battles. Spurred on in part by Patricia Meyer Spacks's pioneering work,⁹⁶ feminist critics now extol women's gossip both as influential discourse and as a flowering of female creativity and power. Gossip carries particularly well in Scotland where oral narratives play an significant cultural role. Segmented stories and chatter are woven by Scottish literary women like Elizabeth Hamilton, Catherine Sinclair, Margaret Oliphant and O. Douglas (Anna Buchan) into the fabric of their novels. In Canada, L.M. Montgomery joins the ranks of Nellie McClung, Jean McIlwraith and May Agnes Fleming, in propagating a tradition for recording the minutiae of women's lives and conversations, which other Canadian writers of Scottish descent, Margaret Laurence and Alice Munro included, sustain.⁹⁷

Furthermore, as noted in Part II, L.M. Montgomery's fiction also offers up male gossips or raconteurs, and male talking shops, where men derive strength, solidarity, and recreation from "idle tales". Again, Scottish oral and, in turn, literary traditions wield their influence here, in characterisation and in situation, from Walter Scott's Andrew Fairservice (*Rob Roy*) and Richard Moniplies (*The Fortunes of Nigel*), to the Kailyard Free Kirk men, who exchange news and views in the churchyard after service. Maclaren's male blethers evidence a particular Scottish humour; George Douglas Brown's Barbie "bodies" display Scotland's ever-present other face in their darker, humourless edge.

⁹³ See also Diane Tye. "Women's Oral Narrative Traditions as Depicted in Lucy Maud Montgomery's Fiction, 1918-1939" in *Thomas H. Raddall Symposium No. 2, Acadian University 3-6 October 1991: Atlantic Literature and Culture, 1918-1939*. Ed. Gwendolyn Davies. Fredericton, NB: Acadiensis Press, 1993.

⁹⁴ For a discussion of the latter, see Jennie Rubio. "Strewn with Dead Bodies: Women and Gossip in *Anne of Ingleside*" *HT*. 167-177.

⁹⁵ Mary Rubio writes that, "Montgomery embeds secondary fictions throughout her surface narrative to create a distinctively layered structure which replicates the oral gossip of female gatherings" (20). Mary Rubio. "Subverting the trite: L.M. Montgomery's 'room of her own'." *CCL*. 65 [1992]: 6-39.

⁹⁶ Patricia Meyer Spacks. *Gossip*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1985.

⁹⁷ For an introduction to Scottish influences in Canadian women's fiction, see Elizabeth Waterston. "Scottish Women Writers Abroad: The Canadian Experience" in *A History of Scottish Women's Writing*. Ed. Douglas Gifford and Dorothy McMillan. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1997: 309-315.

If the female world of tattle and tales was a refuge from patriarchal authority, the *entire* Presbyterian community, Scots or Canadian, felt themselves invested with the authority to police their neighbours' behaviour. Yet, gossip was also an *escape* from austerity and probity for all, a flash of justifiable "wickedness". Where dialogue thus functions as community entertainment, men and women play a symbiotic role. Maud Montgomery praised her Aunt Mary Lawson as a keeper and sharer of stories, but was herself equally keen to preserve the recollections of her Grandfathers Montgomery and Macneill, and reproduce in print the latter's gift of the gab. Just as Island writer Sir Andrew Macphail communicates the tone of the Highland Scots community of Orwell partly through repeating domestic narratives (learned from his Lowland mother, the eponymous master's wife⁹⁸) L.M. Montgomery weaves her fictional community histories from unwritten village chronicles.

Readers of *Pat of Silver Bush* were familiar with Judy Plum's flair for oratory. The arrival of a new handyman (in *Mistress Pat*) adds another dimension to this art, by pitting the story-teller against the teller of stories (that is, fibs). The sparring partnership between Judy and Josiah Tillytuck demonstrates the spoken word's vitality in community entertainment and local history, and is witness to a strong Celtic component in this folkway. (Tillytuck's ethnicity is not stated, but there are hints aplenty, for he is a tartan-clad [MP 21] Nova Scotian Presbyterian who plays the fiddle and has a fondness for drink.) When Judy hears that Tillytuck is reputedly "peculiar", it becomes clear that they are two sides of one coin: "people do be saying that I'm a bit that way mesilf, so there'll be a pair av us" (MP 17-18). Yet they also stand in opposition to one another—the rarefied air of Judy's kitchen is immediately punctured when Tillytuck introduces his dog, Just Dog, with, "He's had mange and distemper once each and worms continual" (21), earning the unspoken accusation from Judy that Mr Tillytuck is a "bit too glib wid [his] tongue" (22).

In *Pat of Silver Bush*, Judy's stories, whether set in Castle McDermott or the North Glen, nurse a local dimension relayed in an ageless style. Often Tillytuck magnifies and modernises this scope with the scale of his so-called "ups and downs" (or "traggedies"):

"Escaped from the Titanic for one thing."

"Oh!" Cuddles and Pat were all eyes and ears. This was exciting. Judy gave her soup a vicious swirl. Was she to have a rival in the story telling art?

"Yes, I escaped," said Mr Tillytuck, "by not sailing on her" (MP 23).

⁹⁸ The Macphail family's migration history is not unlike that of Ewan Macdonald: both family patriarchs were brought to the same district of PEI, at a young age, by their parents, within ten years of each other. Andrew Macphail's father was born in Scotland in 1830.

Although Cuddles harbours vain hopes that Tillytuck's grandfather was indeed a pirate ("Why, he was only a minister" scoffs his fundamentalist wife [228]) his yarns are rarely believed. Still, his impeccable veracity is not adequate reproach, for Judy's fears that the Nova Scotian interloper is "poaching on her preserves" (24) are never fully conquered. Faced with Tillytuck's dramatic panache, Judy ups the ante with mention of a local uxoricide. When he out-gruesomes her again, Judy complains, "it didn't use to be manners, taking yer story right out av yer mouth" (26).

As verbal duellists Judy and Tillytuck appear to compete for a prestige not afforded them in the Gardiner household by their menial vocations. But Judy is outwardly unwilling to play the game. She begins to police herself, withholding her recollections until Tillytuck is out of earshot and thus unable to inject his person into her narrative. She guards, for instance, her tale of a man who "jumped into his bid one night and found a dead man atwane the shates", because "if Tillytuck was here he'd be saying he was the dead man" (50). As Cuddles grasps when Judy seethes after a more successful interpolation on Tillytuck's part, "You're just a bit peeved at Tillytuck because he tried to cap your stories." Judy retorts, "It isn't a chanct I do be having wid Tillytuck [...] I stick to the truth but he do be making things up as he goes along" (MP 53-4). Readers who have endured Judy's fairy yarns might disagree with her self-analysis: this said, for all her not-so-hushed complaints, Judy ultimately admires Tillytuck, perhaps because she is now audited and applauded by a peer.

Tillytuck tells tales, and yet more tales—"symbolically speaking"—when challenged. Rather than merely indulge in his role as a scapegrace-cum-liar, however, Tillytuck seems to throw down the gauntlet to "Mistress Plum", urging her to battle in bardic joust with a distinctly Gaelic flavour. Tillytuck demonstrably hails from a Scottish heritage where the value of the story develops as successive narrators attempt to surpass each other, in drama, in emotion, and in oratory skill. This is also a feature of Irish traditional story-telling, hence Judy's refusal to compete publicly potentially constitutes another chink in her Celtic persona, and might be interpreted as a later admission from Montgomery (following praise for *Pat of Silver Bush*) that Judy's credentials as an Irish bard are phony. Nonetheless, Tillytuck's verbiage transforms Judy's narrative art and, to some extent, responses to it. With Tillytuck passing "from the annals of Silver Bush", story-evenings in the kitchen suffer, because they have been energised and amplified by "the rivalry in tale-telling" (232).

L.M. Montgomery was raised by relatives who valued stories and ceilidhs, in a home that doubled as the local post-office and thus a meeting-house for neighbours sharing neighbourhood chat. As her adult journals show, oral story-telling was also an

ongoing feature of clan gatherings, be this “clan” a group of Sutherlands and Montgomerys brought together in 1931 (*SJ* IV [Sept. 6, 1931] 147-148), some Cavendish old-timers bandying “jokes and insults” in 1929 (*SJ* IV [Oct. 3, 1929] 14-15), or old Prince Albert schoolfriends reuniting in 1930 (*SJ* IV [Oct. 3, 1930] 70-71). On this last occasion, Maud Montgomery “capped” (*SJ* IV 71) Laura Agnew’s Spoonerism,⁹⁹ and in much the same way as anecdotes of east and west met there in Saskatoon, it little matters that Judy and Tillytuck live in different provinces until mid-life. Nor, indeed, is gender more significant in paving common narrative ground, than an old-world talent for spinning yarns. Still, Judy Plum, despite her professed Celtic pedigree, needs to learn the art of giff-gaff (as the Scots would say) when peddling her talents in this arena.

⁹⁹ Notably LMM’s story was decidedly more risqué than Laura’s. The latter was repeated in *A Tangled Web*, but LMM’s could only have “immortality” in her journal, “for it would not ‘do’ anywhere else” (*SJ* IV 71).

IV.ii.

“Heather doesn’t grow in America, does it?”

We have beautiful roads [in Ontario]—and beautiful landscapes. But they want the indefinable charm that haunts—and is the very soul—of P.E.I. roads and scenes.

I have often tried to define the difference but I can never think I have succeeded. It is too elusive—too subtle. Is it the touch of austerity in the Island landscapes that gives it its distinctive beauty? And whence comes this austerity? Is it from the fir and spruce? Or the glimpses of the sea? Or does it go deeper, to the very soul of the land? For lands have personalities, as have human beings.

Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 13, 1913 *My Dear Mr. M* 68-69

The very spirit of romance seems to haunt that lovely sheet of water surrounded by firs [...] the scene on the card might have been taken as well from a P.E.I. landscape as a Scottish one.

Letter to GBM, dated Nov. 29, 1906 [NAC]

Readers at home in the traditions of Scottish writing will hear a comic note in the closing bars of the prelude to *Sunset Song* [1932].¹ With tongue-in-cheek,² but eye on the road that leads north in the popular and literary imaginations, James Leslie Mitchell [1901-1935] situates the Mearns scene of 1911 in its contemporary fictional landscape:

the new minister [...] was to say [Kinraddie] was the Scots countryside itself, fathered between a kailyard and a bonnie brier bush in the lee of a house with green shutters. And what he meant by that you could guess at yourself if you’d a mind for puzzles and dirt, there wasn’t a house with green shutters in the whole of Kinraddie.³

As green shutters suggest, Reverend Stuart Gibbon—“clansman” of Mitchell’s *nom-de-plume*, Lewis Grassie Gibbon—potters and pules at the parish’s illusive “sylvan glories”. Fair sozzled and sobbing after a licentious jaunt to Aberdeen, the young

¹ Ian Carter also draws attention to this allusion. See “Kailyard: The Literature of Decline in Nineteenth Century Scotland.” op. cit.: 1.

² Tom Crawford notes that this reference was “[n]ot a ‘despicable literary in-joke’, as one critic has called it, but a conscious craftsman’s pointer to his intentions”. Lewis Grassie Gibbon. *A Scots Quair*. Ed. and Intro. Tom Crawford. Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1995: 261.

³ Lewis Grassie Gibbon. *Sunset Song*. 1932. Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1993: 24.

minister rails at “bloody Kinraddie”, the “rotten kailyard” (84), the over-worthy, and, he thinks, hypocritical, morality of his parishioners.

If, to his outside (and wandering) eye, Kinraddie is a censorious beast begot from Scotland’s *regional* idylls and anti-idylls, then Chris Guthrie—the heroine of *Sunset Song* and the two sequels that comprise *A Scots Quair*⁴—“exhibits the most positive, the most enduring aspects of the *national* character”.⁵ Stephen Mowat, the English-educated Segget mill-owner, sees in Chris, “Scotland herself”.⁶ Her second husband, a newer Kinraddie minister,⁷ feels likewise; not because he quails, like Mowat, before her proud stature, but because she “hide[s] away the great things [as] Scots folk had always done”.⁸ Where the Kinraddie farmers are perhaps unaware of their connection to Scotland’s exportable mythology, Chris Guthrie (later Tavendale, Colquhoun, Ogilvie) reflects on and puzzles out her link to the land and those who work it. Chris “is representative, not of Scotland as an abstraction, but of the Scottish *people*”⁹—whether from rural Mearns, Segget town, or Duncairn city—from the “pre-war still waters”, through the bitter years of conflict, to the inter-war depression.

Gibbon revises the sentimentality of his kailyard predecessors, but owes these writers a debt as well, for his trilogy traces a changing *nation*, and laments a changed nation, in fictionalised *local* scenes. In a thematic essay exploring the national identity conveyed in Scottish writing after 1700, Roderick Watson discerns “two major national literary revivals”, which drew their inspiration from a popular quest to find “a sense of who [the Scots] were and what it was to be Scottish” (99).¹⁰ Watson argues that, prompted by the “cultural, political and economic unease” which followed the Act of Union [1707], Scots sought “a revived sense of [...] ‘voice’ and ‘place’ as things that make us ‘different’ from the English, or which claim their own special status among the cultures of the world at large” (ibid.).

Watson defines “voice” as “a characteristic mode of discourse—as if spoken”, and focuses, at one level, on “the role of Scots, and especially vernacular Scots, as a matter of personal, and then national identity”, but also on “the telling cultural and

⁴ i.e. *Cloud Howe* [1933] and *Grey Granite* [1934]. The three novels were first collected as *A Scots Quair* in 1946, and reset and reprinted in 1950.

⁵ Tom Crawford. “Introduction.” *Cloud Howe*. xi (my italics).

⁶ Lewis Grassie Gibbon. *A Scots Quair*. op. cit. *Cloud Howe* 105.

⁷ Rev Gibbon “and that thin bit English wife of his and their young bit daughter” emigrate to New York after the First World War: “there’d be far more room and far less smell [without the Gibbons], [Kinraddie] folk said” (*Sunset Song* 251).

⁸ *Cloud Howe* 139. Rev Robert Colquhoun jokes, “*Oh Chris Caledonia, I’ve married a nation!*” (ibid.).

⁹ Tom Crawford. “Introduction.” *Cloud Howe*. xi.

¹⁰ Roderick Watson. “Dialectics of ‘Voice’ and ‘Place’: Literature in Scots and English from 1700,” *Scotland: A Concise Cultural History*. Ed. Paul H. Scott. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1993: 99-125.

national preference for the speech act (as a guarantee of some sort of authenticity), over the written text, even if that speech act is, paradoxically, written down" (100). With "place", he examines the rise of "a sense of communal identity through geography and history, or rather how these factors have been re-imagined by successive creative writers" (100), pre-eminently Sir Walter Scott. Watson describes *A Scots Quair* as "a *tour de force* of 'voice' and 'place'" where "individual stories and communal history, become one and the same" (118). The themes of voice and place—which Part IV of this thesis borrows for its title—are therefore "inextricably and creatively interfused" (112).

Following confederation, and more visibly after the First World War, Canadian writers embarked on a similar quest, seeking both to differentiate the cultural life of Canada from that of the powerful southern neighbour, and to redefine the colonial identity in new national terms. In turn, the most influential Canadian critics, also emphasise the re-imagining of "place", namely, the response of artists to an imposing environment, when canonising Canadian Literature. Set in tame, pastoral landscapes where garrisons and survival have no place, L.M. Montgomery's fiction stands outside this received literary nationalism, and has been classified, often dismissed, and at times maligned, as predominantly *regional*, marked (or marred) by its colonial tone.¹¹ But Montgomery, for her part, was proud to be a best-selling novelist of *Canada*. Furthermore, her growing involvement in *national* fora suggests that both she and her Canadian readers thought her novels articulated a national experience and national sense of identity.

With this in mind, Montgomery's strategies for re-imagining the "personality" of Prince Edward Island, in addition to defining the province's claim to a "special status" at home and abroad, suggest a developing bond between regional and national narratives. Tom Crawford writes of *Sunset Song*, that it "celebrates a nation through its region; its farm folk are of the Mearns, but they are also typical Scots: their words are felt as Scots words, not as those of a regional dialect".¹² Similarly, L.M. Montgomery increasingly furnishes a "typical" Canadian story from her provincial (not to say parochial) upbringing. And just as her stories give "voice" to Canadian diversity in a context that nonetheless reflects Scots literary trends, so her sense of "place" is partly fathered in Scotland. A rose-bush blooms in the lee of a house with green gables and, if Avonlea's menfolk are less rotten than Barbie's perhaps, Glen St Mary can demonstrably dig dirt of its own. This Scottish heritage is, as always,

¹¹ For a thought-provoking study of LMM as a Maritime writer see, Janice Kulyk Keefer. *Under Eastern Eyes: A Critical Reading of Maritime Fiction*, op. cit.; also, Frances M. Frazer. "Island Writers," *Canadian Literature*, 68-69 [Spring-Summer 1976]: 76-87.

¹² Tom Crawford. "Introduction," *Sunset Song* viii.

integral to the Canadian spirit Montgomery celebrates, but does not preclude the search for “Canada herself” in books which, like Gibbon’s, follow the lives of girls and women through changing times.

Haloed by Old Romance

It would, of course, have been more romantic if she had had consumption or brain fever or angina pectoris. But a veracious chronicler can only tell the truth. Donna Dark had measles and almost died of them.

A Tangled Web 136¹³

To open “The Unfurrowed Field” of *Sunset Song* is to read a history that stretches back to the “days of William the Lyon, when gryphons and such-like beasts still roamed the Scots countryside” (1). A rich mythology sleeps in the soil, briefly roused when Kinraddie’s Standing Stones are resurrected to honour the war dead, “*the Last of the Peasants, the last of the Old Scots folk*” (256). Colquhoun’s unique memorial is an unexpected sight (and unexpected use of donations) in a community that looks only for the generic “stone angel, with a night-gown on” (253). As “The Flowers of the Forest” rings out over the unfurrowed fields at sunset, a lament sounds not only for the fallen, but for the “desolation” wrought by “great machines” (256), and the crofting life that is disappearing. The dormant legends thus represent the Scotland that Ewan Tavendale and others died for, and also the hope that, even in a transformed landscape, a national spirit lingers to combat the coming greed and pride and fortune-hunting.

In contrast to this, L.M. Montgomery’s fiction, although it builds from community and clan legends, chiefly portrays the *land* itself as mythological barren ground. Mr Carpenter may give Emily a final piece of literary advice that concedes a little to Canadian romance (“don’t—tell the world everything. That’s what’s the—matter—with our—literature. Lost the charm of mystery—and reserve” [EQ 31]¹⁴) but Montgomery repeatedly reaps imaginative and artistic dilemmas from the supposedly unhistoric landscape. As she told her Scottish correspondent in 1910, “Canada is a very beautiful land; but her lovely scenes are not haloed by old romance and consecrated by ‘unhappy far-off things,’ as are yours”.¹⁵ Montgomery’s ideas

¹³ In this attempt to be a veracious chronicler, LMM appears to laugh at her own romantic tendencies, given that Ruby Gillis dies of consumption, Valancy Stirling thinks she has angina pectoris, and Valancy’s family think she has a brain fever.

¹⁴ Mr Carpenter’s final piece of advice to Emily—and his dying statement—is “Beware—of—italics.” (Aunt Louisa Drummond will swear to her cronies that, “Graceless old Mr Carpenter had died laughing—saying something about Italians” [EQ 32]!)

¹⁵ Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 1, 1910 [NAC].

of “place”, and of ideal place, were visibly coloured by Scotland’s “romance”; indeed, Scotland, “the most delightful and interesting land on earth” (*My Dear Mr. M* 2), was the benchmark in such matters.

This view was shaped by “re-imaginings” of Scotland’s past. Mary Rubio observes that L.M. Montgomery “loved Sir Walter Scott’s romanticization of Scotland’s history” (*HT* 7), and certainly his writings always held an “immeasurable superiority” (*SJ* III [May 8, 1921] 5) for her over “glittering, empty modern fiction” (*SJ* I [Nov. 10, 1908] 342). What is more, Rubio posits that Montgomery “dreamed of doing for Prince Edward Island what [Scott] had done for his landscape” (*ibid.*). In terms of visitor appeal, Montgomery appears to have succeeded, for her writing has popularised the Island in much the same way that Walter Scott’s prose and poems popularised the Highlands in his own time. In fact, Montgomery’s pastoral landscapes have had the greater impact, for not only is almost all literary tourism in Prince Edward Island a response to her books, from 1937 on, better sectors of the tourist and heritage industries have tried to preserve the Island as her books describe it.

But Walter Scott’s landscapes are more than just aesthetically pleasing. As well as awakening readers at home and abroad to the beauty, austerity, and majesty of the Scottish Highlands and Lowlands, Scott, like the Rev Colquhoun, re-animated the history and the mythology that “consecrated” the land. Scotland’s scenery, split between rugged grey mountains and rolling green hills, mist-shrouded heaths and clear-water lochs, exists in his writing as a metaphor for the country’s turbulent past, its contradictions, its steadfastness, and its mysteries. His was therefore a Romantic vision, and a literary re-interpretation, yet Scott successfully instilled in others his keen national pride, and thus fuelled national confidence, especially when “battles long ago” like the ’45, could be sung without denting Scotland’s new-found respectability.

In Cavendish, Montgomery occasionally chanced upon natural wonders that looked “like a bit out of one of Walter Scott’s poems”, such as “a great deep gash cut right down in the heart of the woods, with steep banks fringed with ferns and birches, and an amber-tinted brook brawling along the bottom” (May 2, 1903: U.2). She called this gully, “the Devil’s punch bowl”, a fairly Scotticised, and certainly Scottish, choice.¹⁶ But the “punch bowl” itself was a “queer enough freak” (*ibid.*), far from typical of the farming landscape. Although Rubio rightly detects some other-worldliness in L.M. Montgomery’s Island, in “ocean mists” that suggest “a world of

¹⁶ On her honeymoon LMM observed, “The Devil [...] seems to have a vast deal of property in Scotland. Everywhere we find places called by his name” (Aug. 13, 1911: U.3.228).

unseen beings and mysteries beyond human understanding" (*HT* 7), these are but glimpses of the realm beyond the common day. A blooming and cultivated panorama more generally unfolds. If the Island landscape is a metaphor for Island identity, then in it we see the practicality and the gentility of the settlers, and a history that predominantly speaks of hard-work.

In Avonlea, Scott's words are invoked for "the native heath" of English literature (*AGG* 320), the "tangled web" of deceit Anne weaves when she dyes her hair (248), the "foeman worthy" (279) in the schoolhouse. In the case of this academic rivalry a fighting spirit is appropriate, but when Anne recites *Marmion* in the lane, she must "shut her eyes that she might better fancy herself one of that heroic ring" (261). There is a wide (and comic) breach between the romantic Scottish past that Avonlea's young folk exult in and the placid tenor of their surroundings. (In light of this, the war-time Scott allusions in *Rilla of Ingleside* are doubly significant.) Montgomery could not access rich historical pageants from Prince Edward Island's past, and dramas, until the First World War, were of familial not national significance; there were no wandering heroes like Edward Waverley and no vast landscapes for them to wander through in any case. But nor for that matter did L.M. Montgomery ever express a desire to write historical novels, for all her regrets about Canada's "dull" history (*ENM* 243).

The mainland could, of course, offer vastness, "With promontory, creek and bay" (*The Lady of the Lake* I.xiv.12), as Montgomery quoted in her early portrait of Saskatchewan, "A Western Eden", which ended "with a flowery peroration on the country as a whole" (*SJ* I [June 6, 1891] 92). Similar panoramas, whether in the western provinces, in Ontario or Quebec, animated Canadian works that were indebted to Scott: *Les anciens Canadiens* [1863] by Philippe Aubert de Gaspé,¹⁷ John Richardson's *Wacousta; or, The Prophecy* [1832], and Isabella Valancy Crawford's "Malcolm's Katie" [1884].¹⁸ Cultural models from Scotland, like Scott's historical nationalistic novels, adapted well to Canadian events (*Wacousta* recounts the Pontiac uprisings of 1763, *Les anciens Canadiens* the battle for the Plains of Abraham) and Scott's huge sales were an added inspiration to impoverished authors like Crawford. Canadian writers, writing in French or in English, could patriotically cast Canadian history in a legendary mould, and find in their homeland a suitably romantic and imposing backdrop.

¹⁷ See John Lennox. "Les anciens Canadiens: Aubert de Gaspé and Scott." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 39-48.

¹⁸ See Elizabeth Waterston. "The Lowland Tradition in Canadian Literature." op. cit.; also *Rapt in Plaid* (U of T Press, forthcoming).

It is another matter to argue that L.M. Montgomery's peaceful regional setting is misplaced in the canon of Canadian Literature. There is more to Scott's Scotland than romantic landscapes, grand struggles, and great men, and Montgomery could emulate Scott in other ways, by constructing national identity from the folk of the nation and their connection to "the very soul of the land". Like Scott, Montgomery valued ordinary people in the telling of history, and preserved items of local lore, belief, dialect, and anecdote, the minutiae of daily life. Her stock of rural men and women also owes a debt to Scott, for both writers create incidental characters as memorable as their protagonists, with which to offset dramatic or psychological tension. Scott and Montgomery, and also Lewis Grassie Gibbon, attempt to capture a world on the brink of change, whether the change of the near or more distant past. It would, of course, have been more romantic were Prince Edward Island's transformations marked by battles and bloodshed, but as *A Scots Quair* demonstrates, a national story could also flourish from a domestic and regional narrative.

Patently Montgomery could feel artistically stifled by "Unmagical Canada". But just as Anne Shirley is "much comforted by the romance of the idea of the world being denuded of romance" (*Als* 277), the dearth of "old romance" does not spell a death of romance *per se*. L.M. Montgomery's Canadian books are realistic after a fashion, but unquestionably breed "romance" for readers, in creating worlds outside ordinary life within the map of ordinary life. As this suggests, the relationship between romance and realism in her fiction is a complex and often paradoxical one. She may have bemoaned Canada's lack of old ghosts when writing to George Boyd MacMillan, but her stories frequently advocate a rejection of literary, and ultimately false, romance in favour of the truer romance that exists in real life, if only one has the vision to see it. In this respect, Montgomery's philosophy owes much to Wordsworth, and his desire to throw "a certain colouring of imagination" over "incidents and situations from common life".¹⁹

So when Pat and Rae learn that "some say [their Great-aunt] Martha died of a broken heart and some from wearing too thin stockings in the wintertime" (*MP* 62) the lesson is typical of a pattern in L.M. Montgomery's fiction, and of the humour which strips romance.²⁰ If there is a Canadian cynicism at play here, it is one that seems directed by a Scots-Presbyterian distrust of imagination, emotion,

¹⁹ William Wordsworth. Preface to *Lyrical Ballads, with Pastoral and other Poems* (1802). *The Oxford Authors: William Wordsworth*. Ed. Stephen Gill. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987: 596-7.

²⁰ cf. e.g. "the Story Girl told us a tragic tale of old Charlottetown and a governor's wife who died of a broken heart in the early days of the colony. 'They say that story isn't true,' said Felicity. 'They say what she really died of was indigestion'" (*TGR* 48).

spontaneity, and frivolity. It is also characteristic of Montgomery's fiction that neither the romantic nor the cynic wins out—as Judy Plum tells the Gardiner sisters, “Ye can be taking the romantic or the sinsible explanation, whichever’s suiting you best” (ibid.).

* * *

“Speaking of romance,” said Priscilla, “we’ve been looking for heather—but, of course, we couldn’t find any. It’s too late in the season, I suppose.”

“Heather!” exclaimed Anne. “Heather doesn’t grow in America, does it?”

“There are just two patches of it in the whole continent,” said Phil, “one right here in the park, and one somewhere else in Nova Scotia, I forget where. The famous Highland regiment, the Black Watch, camped here one year, and, when the men shook out the straw of their beds in the spring, some seeds of heather took root.”

“Oh, how delightful!” said enchanted Anne.

Anne of the Island 62-63²¹

In 1993, Gabriella Åhmansson interviewed Astrid Lindgren [b. 1907], the Swedish creator of “Pippi Longstocking”, another carrot-haired, loquacious heroine. Both women grew up reading L.M. Montgomery’s novels, and in this conversation compared their childhood reactions to the “Anne” books. (*Anne på Grönkulla*, the first foreign translation of *Anne of Green Gables*, was published in Swedish in 1909.) Although their impressions stemmed partly from minor adaptations made by the original translator,²² neither Swede had thought of Prince Edward Island as “a foreign country [nor of] the landscape as being specifically Canadian” (18). They strongly identified with Anne’s Island, believing it similar to their own home, in climate and in landscape; thus, in answer to Anne’s nationalistic pity “for people who live in lands where there are no Mayflowers” (AGG 184), Lindgren remarked, “A farm is a farm and a cow is a cow, wherever you are. And after all, Mayflowers grow in Sweden too” (HT 21). North American mayflowers (the trailing arbutus) do not in fact grow in Sweden. Nevertheless, as heralds of the spring in Montgomery’s Island communities, they transport well to Lindgren’s native Småland, where similar spring flowers replace winter snows.²³

²¹ LMM also told this story to GBM in a letter dated Mar. 15, 1905 [NAC].

²² Gabriella Åhmansson. “Mayflowers grow in Sweden too”: L.M. Montgomery, Astrid Lindgren and the Swedish Literary Consciousness.” HT. 14-22. Åhmansson notes, for example, that the translator, Karin Jensen, substituted coffee for tea, the former being the more common drink in Swedish farmhouses. Some Swedish flower names were also substituted in place of North American ones.

²³ Åhmansson points out that, “Lindgren read the Swedish translation where mayflowers were translated into spring flowers generally. One of the first flowers to bloom in profusion in early spring in Scandinavia is a small white flower called ‘vitsippa’ a member of the primrose family. Since the description of the mayflowers make them sound as if they were identical with ‘vitsippa’ it seems to a Swedish reader that they are in fact the same, despite the fact that the faulty translation of ‘mayflower’ into ‘vitsippa’ appears just once” (personal communication). The trailing arbutus was not introduced

These “pink and white stars of sweetness” (AGG 184) also figure prominently in Anne Shirley’s personal history, from Avonlea schooldays to Glen St Mary middle-age, where her sons, and then Bruce Meredith, gather mayflowers in an annual ritual.²⁴ Most readers would associate the mayflower with the Pilgrim Fathers.²⁵ Far fewer would recognise mayflowers as a Canadian laurel—the provincial emblem of Nova Scotia.²⁶ Bearing the motto, “We bloom amid the snow”, mayflowers were an appropriate corsage for Montgomery to pin to Anne Shirley, given the colourful impression the Bluenose orphan makes on the frosty inhabitants of Avonlea. However, for all that Montgomery’s stories of “simple P.E.I. farming settlement[s]” strike a universal chord,²⁷ such Canadian motifs—with the exception of the ubiquitous maple leaf—are often unfamiliar to foreign readers, just as Canada’s history is known principally where it touches British or American events. Montgomery may not make concessions for non-Canadian readers, and they will learn about Canada through her books, but clearly home-grown Canadian symbols had a limited potential for conveying national identity abroad.

Scotland’s flowers, by contrast, speak an internationally recognised language. Heather, lucky or otherwise,²⁸ is a staple ingredient in Scotland’s spirit of place, in the landscape of heather-purple hills, the history of these highlands and heaths, and the “romance” that blossoms from it.²⁹ If, on one level, Phil’s legend of the Black Watch secures a “special status” for Nova Scotia in the Canadian mythology, the regiment’s legacy also invests the cultivated landscape of Kingsport’s public park with the wilder spirit of Scottish martial heroism.³⁰ Heather is a token of another “home” across the water, of the Scottish seeds Canadian ways have grown from, and of the history these countries share. Discovering that heather grows “in America”

to Great Britain until 1736 (see Mrs M. Grieve. *A Modern Herbal*. 1931. Chatham: Cresset Press, 1994: 53, 229).

²⁴ See S/I [May 13, 1890] 20 for details of a “mayflower picnic” in Cavendish.

²⁵ John Greenleaf Whittier praised the mayflower as “the first flower that greeted the Pilgrims after their fearful winter” (see “The Mayflowers” and also “The Trailing Arbutus”. *The Poetical Works of John Greenleaf Whittier*. London: Frederick Warne and Co. 1891: 379, 516.) Presumably the mayflower was so-named for the Pilgrims’ ship, not solely the time of blossoming.

²⁶ *The Annotated Anne* 225.

²⁷ LMM was continually surprised by her appeal to a culturally disparate readership. When a Dutch teacher in Java dramatised *Anne* with her pupils, Montgomery exclaimed, “Fancy little ‘native’ girls dressed up as P.E. Islanders!” (Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 10, 1929 [NAC]).

²⁸ cf. LMM’s comment, “Isn’t there a pretty superstition of some kind connected with white heather? I am not sure about it but I think it is that white heather is only for queens to wear and that if anyone who is not a queen wears it she will have ‘a queen’s sorrows without a queen’s joys,’ or something of that kind” (Letter to GBM, dated Sept. 16, 1906 [NAC]).

²⁹ When sent a spray of heather by GBM, LMM commented, “I felt as if I were gazing at the spirit of Scottish song incarnate” (Letter to GBM, dated Dec. 3, 1905 [NAC]).

³⁰ Chester Macdonald was a member of the 48th Highlanders, “joining it at college as his way of taking physical culture” (Letter to EW, dated Feb. 13-27, 1940 [NAC]). The UG collection of LMM’s photographs includes a snap of Chester kilted in his regimental dress.

too, is naturally enchanting for Anne. Canadians versed in the stock “list of Scottish idols”, like these college-friends,³¹ recognise heather as an auld acquaintance, akin to the Scotch, and possibly Jacobite, roses of Avonlea.

Kingsport is “full of curious relics, and haloed by the romance of many legends of the past” (35), an echo from Montgomery of her words to MacMillan when describing the difference between their homelands, although a contradiction of the sentiment therein. Understandably, we might expect Anne to be duly enchanted by her college-town, discovering at last the old “romance” of place that she often finds is elusive in staid and sensible Avonlea.³² But as the novel’s title makes clear, Anne of Green Gables consolidates her belonging to the whole province in *Anne of the Island*, requiring apparently a rejection of her birthplace into the bargain: “one’s native shore is the land one loves best, and that’s good old P.E.I. for me” (30). No sooner has she taken the road from her adoptive home than Anne decides she is “Island to the core” (42). In this respect, Anne’s spurning of Royal Gardner—“The Gardners are among the richest, bluest, of Bluenoses” (199)—is not merely a rejection of false romance, but of a marriage that would end her Island days.

Royal Gardner embodies the ideal husband Anne has long dreamed of, as Kingsport initially promises to be the mythology-rich setting both Anne and her creator yearn for. L.M. Montgomery’s purpose with *Anne of the Island*, however, is to tread on Anne’s dreams, leastwise the misplaced ones of girlhood. Anne chooses the boy-next-door over Prince Charming and the Island over Nova Scotia, for all the latter’s “special status”. The book is not openly critical of Nova Scotia—far from it—but Kingsport’s halo of romance slips more than a little under the “sensible” gaze. It is interesting therefore to observe that Kingsport’s romance “hearkens back to early Colonial days” (35): “[i]t’s a nice old burg” (13), Gilbert tells Anne, with a hint of the pomposity that dogs his adulthood, an arena for “battles long ago” between settlers and Indians, British and French troops, the British *Shannon* and the American *Chesapeake* in the War of 1812.³³ The name of “Kingsport” reflects this British heritage, just as the name “Bolingbroke” did. Magical Canada this may be, but it is a magic conjured by Old World “gods”, or generals at least.

L.M. Montgomery shows little interest in portraying Prince Edward Island as a “mock” romantic Scotland. No matter how much she, like Anne Shirley, was loath to

³¹ Philippa and Priscilla, of clans Gordon and Grant respectively.

³² e.g. “Avonlea is the dearest place in the world, but it isn’t quite romantic enough for the scene of a story” (*Als* 112).

³³ Some two years after the publication of *Anne of the Island*, on 6 December 1917, Halifax was devastated by an explosion caused when a munitions ship collided with a freighter in Halifax harbour (cf. *MP* 33). The Halifax explosion is the pivotal event in Hugh MacLennan’s *Barometer Rising* [1941].

let “the sun rise and set in the usual quiet way without much fuss over the fact” (*Als* 115), Montgomery also recognised the absurdity of filtering rural Prince Edward Island life through the lens of high-blown or chivalric romance, thus the “Averil’s Atonement” debacle. Yet the thirst for “romance” that literature instils can be partly sated by the beauty of the Island landscape and the old world origins of the Island settlers, even where the more “superstitious” parts of this heritage are undermined by sceptics blind to the charms of their surroundings. Avonlea’s victory over historic Kingsport indicates that, despite Canada’s romantic shortcomings, the old land does not steal a march on the new. There were many Scottish romances that took root in Canada as the Black Watch’s heather did, but Montgomery moves beyond nostalgia for this colonial past.

Anne of the Island was the first “Anne” book written in Ontario. The fissure between Montgomery’s old and new lives was reinforced by the war that broke out part way through the writing of “Anne III”. If we read the Glen St Mary novels as a war trilogy, then in several respects, *Anne of the Island* forms a bridge to it, by killing some of the old idyll and Anne’s taste for sentimentality. It is apparent from this that the Island changes in L.M. Montgomery’s fiction, reflecting the growing sense of nationhood, of course, but also the changing techniques writers could use to convey national identity. To examine her evolving sense of who Canadians were and what it was to be Canadian, the remainder of this section looks briefly at the ways in which Montgomery defines “place”—on regional, national, and artistic fronts—at four different stages of her literary career and Canada’s history.

“East is East . . . ”

I found the *illustrations* [in a British edition of *Anne of Green Gables*] very interesting. They had such an *English* atmosphere. And yet, in spite of that, they were curiously much more akin to P.E. Island than the more outwardly similar ones in the U.S. editions.
Letter to GBM, dated Jan. 28, 1935 [NAC]

As noted in Part I, Margaret Atwood terms literature as “a map, a geography of the mind”, whereby “members of a country or culture” learn “who and where [they] have been”. Before coming to Prince Edward Island, Anne Shirley learns (by word-of-mouth presumably) that the province is “the prettiest place in the world” (*AGG* 24), and although she agrees, Anne endeavours to prettify the landscape further by renaming the scenery that it might better make her “imaginings come true” (24). Given her monochromatic childhood, in a “little clearing among the stumps” and a series of nondescript towns, Anne colours her new surroundings with a literary

palette—Willowmere, Idlewild, Violet Vale—that unveils Wordsworth, Scott, and Tennyson as her early foster-fathers (befitting the “English” atmosphere of the British illustrations). She reads the *Island* through romantic poetry, and hides her bleaker experiences under plain wrappings.

Still, the abuses Anne has suffered are actually all too transparent and readers must dwell on them even if Anne does not. *Anne of Green Gables*, like *Anne of the Island*, is not a concerted attack on Nova Scotia, but in plotting the shift from a Canadian hell to a Canadian heaven, and a Canadian prison to a Canadian haven, it inevitably suggests that the contrasts within Canada are more than scenic, and distinctions of temperament are drawn between the two Maritime provinces, shared Scottish heritage notwithstanding. In this way the novel celebrates the region at the expense of the nation, no matter that Prince Edward Island was dubbed “the Cradle of Confederation”.³⁴ Here Montgomery no doubt reflects the pride of Islanders in their independent achievements and character, and the physical separation of an island that, at the time of nation building, was “practically isolated from the mainland for five months of the year”.³⁵

L.M. Montgomery’s earlier writings, before she became a mainlander-of-sorts, periodically focus on the theme of Canadian “difference”, although more usually by exploiting an east-west divide, as “The Genesis of the Doughnut Club” does.³⁶ Aunt Patty has lived in the “big, breezy golden west” (*ATO* 49) for five years, keeping house for her brother. There she is also a moral guardian to the young men who have left the traditional guiding influence of “home and mother” (50). Following her brother’s death, however, Patty seems fated to return east to the “little pinched-up village where everyone knew more about you than you did about yourself” (49). As a farewell to her “boys” she plans “a real old-fashioned Thanksgiving dinner such as they used to have at home” (52). One boy asks if he can invite his uncle, and Patty agrees, before discovering that said uncle is none other than, “Joseph P. Nelson, the millionaire railroad king” (54).

Aunt Patty frets over what a rich and travelled man will think of her humble fare. But dyspeptic Mr Nelson eats an unholy amount of doughnuts and returns the next day to appoint her as head-chef of a new restaurant providing traditional food—not “hotel fare and fancy fol-de-rols with French names” (56)—for down-east businessmen like himself. The resulting “Doughnut Club” is so successful that a

³⁴ The Charlottetown Conference (September 1864) brought together leaders from the three Maritime Provinces for talks that set on course the events that led to Canadian Confederation in 1867.

³⁵ F.W.P. Bolger, *Canada's Smallest Province*, op. cit. 136.

³⁶ “The Genesis of the Doughnut Club”, first published in the *Epworth Herald*, 23 November 1907. Reprinted in *Against the Odds*: 49-56.

“Scotch” peer who dines there swears, “it was the only satisfactory meal he’d had since he left the old country” (56). Aunt Patty has no desire to return east where she will always be known as the “old maid sister” (49), and in this respect, “The Genesis of the Doughnut Club” not only promotes the west as a land of opportunities for gaining riches and social advancement, but as a place where wide-open spaces inspire a freedom of expression and action and individuality not countenanced in small, hedged-in eastern townships.³⁷

On the other hand, the West is also held to place far fewer checks on behaviour, and virtue is apt to slide there unless held in check by forces of tradition—“good, old-fashioned methods of diets and morals” (AA 150)—that are bred in the east.³⁸ L.M. Montgomery personally admired many aspects of the west, and briefly considered moving to Saskatchewan before her step-mother’s true colours were revealed, but her fictional Islanders often voice grave doubts that anything good can come out of the west (saving young Lochinvar!). Such indictments invariably come from old folks distrustful of anything “from away”. Given the large out-migration of Islanders—in fiction as in life—these comments are clearly not enough to stop young, adventurous people going west, but contain forcible moral judgements nonetheless. When Jane Andrews moves to Winnipeg, Rachel Lynde patently detects an ulterior motive: “Can’t get a beau in Avonlea, that’s what [...] Says she thinks she’ll have better health out West. I never heard her health was bad before” (AIs 99). Island to the core, Mrs Lynde scornfully concludes that the West’s “only recommendation is that men are plenty and women scarce” (99).

With Anne, Gilbert, Charlie and Moody in Nova Scotia, the Echo Lodge folks in Boston, and the Spofford girls trotting the globe, *Anne of the Island* is a book of comings and goings. Skirting the shadow of change, however, there are shining constants, and Mrs Samson Coates (clanswoman of the Barrys, Wrights, and Pyes), albeit a new (and fleeting, she is dead by Ch. 28) resident in Avonlea, rules among them. Commonly known as Aunt Atossa (a name presumably inspired by Pope’s second *Moral Essay*, “To a Lady”³⁹) this sour, unpleasant woman is, on the surface,

³⁷ “Tannis of the Flats” as published in *Further Chronicles of Avonlea* also juxtaposes east and west, but the Avonlea sections of this story were “crude interpolations” added by the Page Co. in order to capitalise on the “Anne” association (see Anita Webb’s copy of *FCA*, with LMM’s marginalia, LMM Collection [UPEI]).

³⁸ Commenting on the upbringing of the nation’s youngsters, LMM remarked, “I do think it very likely that the west is worse than the east in this respect—more lawless, more unbridled, less restrained by the conventions that older—and wiser—lands have set up to safeguard their youth” (Letter to EW, dated Oct. 17, 1923 [NAC]).

³⁹ Pope’s character Atossa—“Offend her, and she knows not to forgive; Oblige her, and she’ll hate you while you live” (l. 137-8)—was based on Katherine, Duchess of Buckinghamshire (*The Poems of Alexander Pope*, Ed. John Butt. London: Methuen & Co., 1985: 564n). Atossa, wife of Darius and mother of Xerxes, appears in Aeschylus’ *The Persians*.

a pariah—Diana's father flouts the laws of hospitality by refusing to house his aunt and she is universally disliked. Yet there are many similarities of opinion between Aunt Atossa ("she always knew everything about her neighbours" [212]) and Rachel Lynde (an "[a]wful old gossip" [161]). Atossa certainly takes a leaf from the latter's book when twitting Anne about her looks: "Your nose is freckling scandalous. My, but you *are* red-headed! Well, I s'pose we're all as the Lord made us!" (104).

Aunt Atossa's aversions typify the old-guard's prejudices—she hails from nearby Spencervale—a smarting condemnation of over-gentle airs assumed in lieu of hard-work, a distrust of female education and glossy magazines, a rousing reproof for anything from "away" and from the United States in particular. Aunt Atossa lays the blame for Ruby's consumption firmly at America's door: "I always knew Ruby'd get something, gadding off to Boston last fall for a visit. People who ain't content to stay home always catch something" (103). For her part, prurient Mrs Lynde associates Boston with sensational murder trials, and thinks that, "The States must be an awful place" (55). Charlotta the Fourth—at least before she marries a Yankee bricklayer—"doesn't like Boston at all" (71). Montgomery did like Boston (Ewan's sister Flora lived there) and we may detect in these comments, not a fit of pique directed at Boston itself, but at her Boston publishers.

Furthermore, in that mapping Scotland's identity is often an exercise in describing the "things that make us 'different' from the English", so definitions of Canadianness are squarely rooted in drawing character distinctions between Canada and the United States. Although L.M. Montgomery's publishers (Stokes of New York after Page) were American companies, pejorative statements about America, subtle and not so subtle, surface throughout her writing, from the Avonlea books to *Jane of Lantern Hill*, where America is held accountable for the "divorces" that might prevent Jane's parents reuniting: "Jane wished peevishly that the United States would keep their divorces at home" (*JLH* 130). The ideological contrasts between the two countries are captured when Rachel Lynde scolds a school principal who has foolishly decided that Windy Willows will be a "bit cramping after the freedom of Patty's Place": "Freedom!" Mrs Lynde sniffed. "Freedom! Don't talk like a Yankee, Anne" (*AWW* 15). Plainly, Mrs Rachel's Scottish heritage does not include John Barbour's "fredome is a noble thing".

Mrs Lynde repeats the sentiment of her hostility toward the West here, but where western "freedom" is encouraged by an untamed landscape, American freedom is political and rebellious and republican and more sinister in Canadian eyes for this.

(Queen Victoria is subject to an occasional gibe in Montgomery's fiction,⁴⁰ but only Gwennie Lesley outs herself as a republican, although, unversed in political terminology, she says she is a Democrat!⁴¹) Rachel's warning to Anne correlates to the warning Emily receives from Mr Carpenter about the dangers of becoming "Yankeefied" and thus losing her "Canadian tang and flavour" (*EC* 315). Charlotta the Fourth returns from Boston worried that she talks "with a Yankee accent [...]" They said I did at home, but I thought likely they just wanted to aggravate me" (*Als* 185). Charlotta is quick to point out that the Yankees are "real civilised"—American readers could not be insulted wholesale—but from all these cases it would seem that changing your Canadian voice, be it your accent, your diction, or your literary style, is a traitorous pursuit.⁴²

None of these judgements comes without a counterpoint, and Montgomery's Islanders can see themselves as they think others see them. Before she leaves for college, the Avonlea biddies persuade Anne that she is fated to be "a humiliated country girl, shuffling through Redmond's classic halls in copper-toed boots" (22). She feels "green, and provincial" (31) when she disembarks, while at registration Priscilla feels like nothing more than a "potato-fed Islander" (37). Of course, the "Spud Island" girls are none of these things, and make their mark in the classic halls, but they feel visibly vulnerable and "countrified" in a mainland city setting. This identifies another tear in the national fabric—the split between town and country—although one that is obviously far from unique to Canada. L.M. Montgomery, like her kailyard predecessors, generally lets the rural world seize the moral high ground, from her early pot-boilers, where it is a favourite plot device, to *A Tangled Web*, where city-girl, Nan Penhallow, is superficial, vain, and cruelly derisive about her country cousins.

The insulated perspective is common to all Montgomery's Island communities, but particularly strong in Avonlea, where few outside events encroach on Island life. *Anne of the Island* takes Anne off-Island, yet confirms the opinion that "'home' must always be the loveliest spot in the world, no matter what fairer lands may lie under alien skies" (13). But if Anne learns no unexpected lessons here, there are other revelations in this book. The Avonlea chapters from "The Round of Life" to "A Dream Turned Upside Down", as well as being a model example of L.M.

⁴⁰ e.g. "Doesn't [Queen Victoria] look like somebody's old cook with a lace curtain on her head?" (*MFM* 126). As a girl, LMM had been chastised for describing the Queen as "a fat common looking old woman" (*SJ* III [June 28, 1923] 133-134).

⁴¹ "Well, it's something that doesn't take stock in kings and queens, anyway. I forgot the right word" (*MFM* 162).

⁴² cf. "A Scot who returns to Scotland with his accent changed is thought to have changed everything else—he is regarded with deep suspicion". Ian Finlayson. *The Scots*. op. cit. 113.

Montgomery's romance or realism debate, bring this self-declared Island girl into a national scene, when Anne's "romantic" story, "Averil's Atonement", is rejected out-of-hand by *Canadian Woman* magazine. Presumably no right-thinking Canadian woman would be interested in Anne's drivel, for now in her twenties she is still addicted to the "romance" that stirred the Story Club, but kind-hearted Diana likes it and thinks, strangely, the editor must be "prejudiced against anyone who isn't a Yankee" (114).

Diana helps christen the story's chore boy Robert Ray (so nearly Rob Roy).⁴³ Anne concocts the others herself, and as she chooses the names before the games, must find a fabulous plot for the likes of Maurice Lennox and Perceval Dalrymple to stroll through. Set among "rich city people" she knows nothing about, talking "high-flown language" (112), the only part that rings true is a cake-baking scene. As "Averil's Atonement" is patently not "Canadian Literature" in any sense, we might therefore question Anne's ability to interpret the country she lives in. Although the story is eventually published countrywide to advertise a Montreal firm's baking powder, it is only after Island-born Diana tinkers with the narrative (no matter that Aunt Atossa insists "nobody born and bred in Avonlea would [take to writing novels]" [143]). Anne never learns to write Canadian books and remains a literary outsider: marriage unfortunately does not "cure" her of romance, as Mrs Rachel hopes (*AHD* 20).

David Weale remarks on the "wonderful irony" that, Anne Shirley, "who represents for many the very essence of Island life, is actually the embodiment of traits which were little esteemed in that society. She was, geographically and spiritually, the girl from away" (3).⁴⁴ In this respect, readers must remove Anne—and her romancing—from Avonlea to see it as a typical Island community. Then again, Avonlea is Cavendish only in that it is pruned down, if not branched out exactly, and the Avonlea people show little interest in staking a claim as "typical" Canadian villagers, stressing instead their dissimilarity to other North Americans, to venerate their own special status, to be sure, rather than upset the national identity. Oddly enough, Anne is also a *Canadian* icon. In Anne, L.M. Montgomery captures something of the national character, perhaps, but it often seems that Anne exhibits, not her connection to the land or the people, but her connection to a literary romance that fails to speak to or about Canadians.

⁴³ Owen Dudley Edwards makes the *Rob Roy* connection in "L.M. Montgomery's *Rilla of Ingleside*: Intention, Inclusion, Implosion", adding that Diana Barry's first name is most likely an allusion to *Di Vernon*, the heroine of that novel (op. cit. 129).

⁴⁴ David Weale. "No Scope for Imagination: Another Side of *Anne of Green Gables*". *IM*. 20 [Fall-Winter 1986]: 3-8.

Go West, Young Man

"Well, Mattha, what do you think of the Highlands?"

"No very much," said Mattha, lighting his pipe. "Scenery an' history. Imph. Folk cannae get muckle o' livin' oot o' scenery an' history. Although, mind ye, it's gey interestin' tae think o' that pare sowl Prince Chairlie makkin' his last staun' jist ower the dyke there."

Jane Duncan. *My Friend Monica* [1960]

Borderer Sir Walter Scott may have made a "muckle o' living" from the scenery and history of the Highlands, but in Mattha's practical Lowland orbit, ordinary people who work the land are phlegmatic about the romantic past. L.M. Montgomery thrilled to the sound of the Highland pipes, and thought Scottish history "gey interestin'", but for the most part her Scots-Canadian characters are more concerned with the here and now; hence in her early fiction, the round of daily life remains largely untouched by national (let alone international) dramas, past or present. The First World War broadens this perspective. As Islanders join the Canadian (and Allied) cause their national identity is enlisted. The outside world is summoned onto the Island horizons, bringing a new language with it, and a new "west"—the Western Front—enters their vocabulary. Had Avonlea's young men "gone west", they would likely have found themselves in Aunt Patty's care: when Walter Blythe "goes west" he dies.

In pre-war Scotland, there was an established, if uninspiring, convention for depicting a Scots village, set in large measure by the success of kailyard authors abroad. The story goes that:

whether Drumtochty was a typical Scots village or not, no Scots village should be represented except as more or less like Drumtochty, and that a Scots novelist dealing with Scots life should not portray anything that was sensual, base, coarse, cruel, cynical, profane, or even passionate. The treatment might be romantic, sentimental, moralistic, fanciful, or humorous, but it must be essentially respectable [...] and it must not cast grave aspersions upon the character of the Scots people.⁴⁵

Clearly, readers were thought to equate the Scots village with the character of the Scots people-at-large, and patriotic writers were expected to sketch their country accordingly. These old conventions were moribund, however, in 1914, when suddenly "individuals were challenged by events larger than themselves".⁴⁶ No work

⁴⁵ William Power. *Literature and Oatmeal: What Literature Has Meant to Scotland*. London: George Routledge & Sons, 1935: 161-162.

⁴⁶ Roderick Watson. "Dialectics of 'Voice' and 'Place'." op. cit. 112.

of fiction that had any pretensions to verisimilitude could ignore the war, nor the passions, base or honourable, that it invoked. Villages like Kinraddie moved Scottish regional literature beyond the old conventions to a new sense of place.

Before the war, George Douglas Brown and John Macdougall Hay depicted Scots villages “as appalling microcosms of all that is mean, petty and cruel in the human spirit”.⁴⁷ Barbie and Brierton invert the Drumtochty exemplar, but in hands like Lewis Grassie Gibbon’s, the village can be a more balanced microcosm of the outside world, national character or human spirit, and still flout the cosy convention. Of course, this approach is not a Scottish preserve, nor is it found only in regional narratives, and the same idea surfaces, for example, in Agatha Christie’s Miss Marple stories.⁴⁸ St Mary Mead’s scandals and passions are clues on the road to solving bigger crimes. There seemingly “is a great deal of wickedness in village life” (52) but Jane Marple gets equal detective mileage from rogue District Nurses and fraudulent pension claims.⁴⁹ Although in this English village secrets are kept that a Presbyterian kirk session would expose, L.M. Montgomery—an enthusiastic Christie fan⁵⁰—adopts a similar technique in transposing the world’s problems to the Canadian village, reaching a peak when the world’s problems catalyse into world war.

If the archetypal Home Counties village summons up a rose-tinted image of bicycles, small railway stations, and ducks on the village pond, the corresponding Scots village has a dour hue (even when it is an idyll) framing old stone churches and schoolhouses and ministers in black robes. The English village, for all its buried secrets, is built upon an even plane where the national past is always at hand, as Tess and Angel find when they strike immutable Stonehenge at the end of *Tess of the d’Urbervilles*. The archetypal Scots village is cut-off, circled, and hidden by mountains or hills, where history strikes you rather than you it, a feature central to the Lerner and Loewe musical about *Brigadoon* [1947], the shadowy Highland village that appears from the mists only once in a hundred years.⁵¹ The names St Mary Mead and Glen St Mary embody a contrast of place—the level grassy meads of

⁴⁷ Roderick Watson. Introduction. Nan Shepherd. *The Weatherhouse*. Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1988: vii. Watson refers here to *The House with the Green Shutters* and Hay’s *Gillespie* [1914].

⁴⁸ The character of Jane Marple first appeared in *The Murder at the Vicarage* [1930].

⁴⁹ Agatha Christie. *The Thirteen Problems*. 1932. London: Pan, 1961. For these examples, see “The Blue Geranium” and “The Companion”.

⁵⁰ LMM considered Agatha Christie to be the finest contemporary writer of mystery stories, and was particularly impressed by *The Murder of Roger Ackroyd* [1926] (Letter to GBM, dated Apr. 24, 1927, NAC). The collection of LMM’s personal library at UG includes several Christie novels from the 1920s and 30s.

⁵¹ When *Brigadoon* transferred from Broadway to Hollywood in 1954, it was filmed in a studio, apparently (and perhaps apocryphally) because no Scottish location could be found that looked “Scottish” enough.

England as opposed to the enclosed intricate glens of Scotland (or Canada)—that reflects national character.

By name, Avonlea is a little piece of England, the River Avon, the meadow (lea), even if there is a “Celtic undersong” in the almost anagram of “Avalon”,⁵² and a Scottish echo of “Up the river and o’er the lea”.⁵³ By name, L.M. Montgomery’s war-time Canadian village stands on the Scottish side of the border: Glengarry, Glenfinnan, Glenmartin, Glencoe—all can be found on the map of Prince Edward Island, the Scottish words rolled onto the gentle arable landscape by Scottish settlers keeping a piece of home. The Island landscape in Montgomery’s fiction is rarely grey or imposing or frightening. The seascape, by contrast, is all of these things, and in the Glen St Mary books, especially *Anne’s House of Dreams*, girdles the harbour community as the mountains would. The sea simultaneously “surrounded [Anne] and called to her” (*AHD* 62), cocooning her in its stiller moments and stirring her to fly “into the heart of [its] storms” (63).

So having said that the tale of the home of dreams (in which the Blythes will never use any baking powder except Rollings Reliable!) narrows Montgomery’s cast, it broadens the Island horizons, literally and literarily. Wise at last to her own authorial limitations, Anne begins to search for “a master of a vigorous yet subtle style, a keen psychologist, a born humorist and a born tragedian” (159) to write Captain Jim’s “life-book”. She thinks initially of American-born Paul Irving, but a Toronto journalist is “predestined for the part” (222). Owen Ford is John Selwyn’s grandson, thus his kismet, but his mainland birth may also be a factor, likewise his conviction that the beautiful Island setting can inspire the “great Canadian novel” that “allures—and beckons—and recedes” before him like the sea (206). Island-mainland alliances reign in this novel, as the Montreal cure of Dick Moore illustrates. Captain Jim’s sea-stories, woven with a “thread of romance”, become the best-selling “novel of the year” (220). Owen fords the water, and travels east to marry Leslie West (later Moore, Ford).⁵⁴ Leslie, although like Chris Guthrie in some respects, is not “Canada herself”, but a bridge to Canada in suffering and in war, a taste of the tragedies to come, when war-time composition turns to war-time setting.

Flora Klickmann [1867-1958], an English author (possibly with German ancestry⁵⁵) whom Montgomery much admired, wrote a series of autobiographical

⁵² Margaret Anne Doody. Introduction to *The Annotated Anne* 30.

⁵³ James Hogg, “A Boy’s Song”; although it is certain that Anne Shirley would be glad there is no “way for Billy [Andrews] and me”!

⁵⁴ This pattern is replicated in *Rilla of Ingleside*, where the Fords’ son Kenneth, “a Toronto boy” (36) becomes engaged to Rilla Blythe.

⁵⁵ See David Lazell, *Flora Klickmann and Her Flower Patch*, published privately, 1976.

books, beginning with *The Flower-Patch Among the Hills* [1916], about her holiday home in the Wye Valley, to where she escapes from wartime London.⁵⁶ Parts of *The Flower-Patch* are similar to Montgomery's *Rilla of Ingleside*,⁵⁷ in that they concentrate on women's committees, women's action, and the co-operation (and disagreements) between neighbours. Klickmann's books, however, are journalistic, upper-middle class, pious, and seldom very interesting where they steer away from the village matters upon which her work and Montgomery's share common ground.

L.M. Montgomery did not draw parallels between their work—quite the reverse:

British women seem to excel in this kind of book. We have nothing like it on this side of the water. I've always been haunted by a desire to try my hand at such a book but I suppose I never shall. Anyhow, I couldn't have the background here that is ready to the British writer's hand. One has to have ghosts and old gods.⁵⁸

Klickmann includes practical gardening tips, like another favourite writer of Montgomery's, Elizabeth von Armin [1866-1941], the author of *Elizabeth and her German Garden* [1898]. In truth, one has to look hard for evidence of "ghosts and old gods",⁵⁹ and harder still to find more than superficial links between Klickmann's England and Montgomery's Canada in war. Klickmann's war happens within earshot but her stiff-upper lip psychology means that for the most part the conflict might be in another time and place, and there is little seriousness and much clumsiness in her approach: even the reports of the death of the "Village Hero" have been greatly exaggerated.

As the Flower Patch is a retreat, the war is something that hits home only occasionally in sporadic Zeppelin raids: it is not the consuming obsession we find in *Rilla of Ingleside*. L.M. Montgomery's novel reflects her overwhelming personal anguish, but the devastating impact of the war on the Glen St Mary people is akin to the impact witnessed in Gibbon's *Sunset Song* and *The Weatherhouse* [1930] by Nan

⁵⁶ LMM was sent several volumes in the "Flower Patch" series by GBM, including *The Flower-Patch Among the Hills* [1916], *Between the Larch Woods and the Weir*, and *The Trail of the Ragged Robin* [1921].

⁵⁷ LMM may not have read these books until 1923 (*SJ* III [Feb. 18, 1923] 116). LMM's journal entry is, however, confusing: she writes that she has spent the evening reading her Xmas book from GBM, *The Flower Patch*, for the first time, but concludes with a reference to the *Flower Patch* series, implying that GBM sent her a later book in the series and that she was already familiar with the first.

⁵⁸ Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 18, 1923, [NAC]. *The Girl's Own Paper*, under Klickmann's editorship recommended the "Anne" books for their "unusual background" which made "a pleasing change after the conventional stories of English schoolgirls that are always with us" (*The Girls' Own Paper*, XXXI [1910] 298). Klickmann edited this magazine from 1908-1930, and included LMM's books on her lists of recommended reading for girls.

⁵⁹ Interestingly, in one of her chapters of whimsy, "The Little People of the Streams", Klickmann compares her talk of fairies in the river with a similar Canadian account. Flora Klickmann. *The Flower-Patch Among the Hills*. 1916. London: Religious Tract Society, 1923: 234-5.

Shepherd [1893-1981], where Scottish communities are transformed completely by the war. Flora Klickmann's whimsies are unrepresentative of contemporary English war-fiction, but with the retreat overlooking Tintern Abbey (immortalised by Wordsworth) they survey English romance, and a certain English character at odds with the working-class focus of Gibbon and Shepherd. With Anne and Gilbert retreating to the background and Susan Baker in the fore, *Rilla* shares this focus, and "aristocracy is the enemy"⁶⁰: ordinary Canadian and Scots people endure and suffer in the same way, as their nations do; both countries bear heavy sacrifices (Canada and Scotland lost a disproportionate number of men) and forgo their isolation.

And so we return to the description of Susan Baker—"elderly, maternal [...] unattractive, working-class, resourceful, self-reliant"—as "Canada herself".⁶¹ The sight of Susan "standing on a load of grain, her grey hair whipping in the breeze and her skirt kilted up to her knees" (251), is similar to the closing shot of Chris Guthrie on the stony hillside in *Grey Granite*, and just as elemental. Susan also prefigures Miss Barbara in *The Weatherhouse*, dancing a Highland fling by herself in the kitchen:

How much of the character of the land had not gone into this vigorous measure, which a hard-knit woman of fifty five was dancing alone on her kitchen floor in the middle of a world war (56).

Garry Forbes, back from the trenches, walks to Knapperly, through the long martial history of the vast landscape around him. Witnessing Miss Barbara's dance, he tries to "reconcile his aunt's vivid enjoyment of the moment with the dark truth he had been thrust upon in his walk that evening where time and the individual had ceased to matter" (58). Susan in the fields is Susan to the core, but "the spirit that animated her gaunt arms was the self-same one that captured Vimy Ridge and held the German legions back from Verdun" (251). Susan makes decisions, not through education, but by instinct and gut-feeling, like the Canadian "fools" (242) who seized Vimy Ridge.

Susan is not a conventional heroine, being "neither a beautiful or romantic figure" (251), but her previously comically idiosyncratic voice increasingly becomes the true voice of ordinary Canadians in *Rilla*. Before the conflict starts Susan is uninterested in any news but the "Jottings from Glen St Mary" (7). When the initial shock of Jem's enlistment is still strong, Susan feels it is "indecent" that "an honest, hard-working, Presbyterian old maid of Glen St Mary" should be dragged into "a war thousands of miles away" (62). But as the long weeks of 1915 wear by, Susan admits, "There was a time [...] when I did not care what happened outside of P.E.

⁶⁰ Owen Dudley Edwards, "L.M. Montgomery's *Rilla of Ingleside*," op. cit. 132.

⁶¹ *ibid.*

Island, and now a king cannot have a toothache in Russia or China but it worries me" (172). She later trusts the French, although they are (as Cousin Sophia says) "furriners" (214), and even becomes "interested in a Yankee election" (229). Susan ceases to be a laughable maid-of-all-work, and transforms into "a perfect dynamo of patriotism and loyalty and contempt for slackers of all kinds" (258): "She was one of those women—courageous, unquailing, patient, heroic—who had made victory possible" (286).

Not only is the outside world brought into PEI's language, rural, insignificant Glen St Mary is thrust onto the world stage, as Walter Blythe's little verse becomes "the one great poem of the war" (196). Yet "The Piper" aside, this is not a war of written words, saving scriptural writ, or of Canadian literature (this would come when the hurly-burly's done). Indeed, written words, notes, are linked scathingly with Woodrow Wilson, the hesitant American President who is "anathema in [Susan's] kitchen" (127): appropriately Kitchener is her hero! ("Two things I never did, Mrs Dr dear, were write letters and read politics" [RI 116].) Susan *speaks* for Canada, as she does to the Victory Loan Campaign meeting, and when words fail her, she wields her kitchen implements. The union prayer-meeting where Norman Douglas speaks out, will be remembered in "unwritten history", the "oral annals" (202) of the community. The war adds new international chapters to the regional narrative and legends of battles now consecrate the very soul of the land.

Cairns Craig argues that the Scottish community reunites with "a grand general narrative" (30) in the First World War, and that the war becomes the "focus of so many Scottish narratives because it is the moment when the historical is reintroduced to the historyless Scottish environment" (48).⁶² Similar forces are astir in Montgomery's narratives, and none of the books written subsequent to *Rilla of Ingleside* are free from the weight of the First World War no matter when they are set. Walter Blythe "died for Canada" (RI 268) and with him, in some senses, dies the British romantic tradition that inspired him to write poetry in imitation of Wordsworth, Scott and Tennyson in the first place. "The old world is destroyed" (RI 316), and if Rilla Blythe "must live for [Canada]" (268), it is a Canada quite different from the country her mother grew up in. "The historical" as Cairns Craig writes, had come back, to Canada as to Scotland, "in a terrifying and alienating form" (48).

⁶² Cairns Craig, *Out of History: Narrative Paradigms in Scottish and British Culture*, op. cit.

East, West, Hame's Best

Humorous and dramatic by instinct, the comedy and tragedy of life enthralled her, and demanded expression through her pen [...] She knew that a hard struggle was before her; she knew that she must constantly offend her Blair Water neighbours, who would want her to write obituaries for them, and who, if she used an unfamiliar word, would say contemptuously that she was "talking big" . . .

Emily's Quest 8

Although L.M. Montgomery dryly remarked to Ephraim Weber in 1917, "I should hardly call my productions literature—Canada, you know, has no literature!!",⁶³ her attitude altered after the war's conclusion. As E. Holly Pike points out, Montgomery "was actively involved in associations of Canadian authors [the CAA and Canadian Book Week], and was visiting other women writers ['Marian Keith', 'Anison North'] on her trips to Toronto" (66).⁶⁴ Pike situates Montgomery in the school where her own tastes inclined, in a poetic, romantic tradition of Canadian literature (with Roberts and Carman and Logan) that was polarised (by critics and by the authors themselves) from the Canadian modernist and realist writers, who did "not concern themselves too much with Canadian identity" (66). With the "Emily" books of the 1920s, Pike argues, Montgomery became an active participant "in serious literary debate", by setting her own Canadian literary canon (the romantic poetry of Carman, Pickthall, F.G. Scott) and by arguing that a "successful Canadian author" (74) could bloom from this heritage. In so doing, L.M. Montgomery, like Mr Carpenter, rejects "the howls about realism".

Emily's first published book, *The Moral of the Rose* is, like *Anne of Green Gables*, an immediate publishing success. (Although Cousin Jimmy sends the manuscript out on Emily's behalf it is probably safe to assume there were no intrusions of baking powder into the narrative!) Given that the "Emily" trilogy is set before the war, with the second two books placed in the first decade of the twentieth century, *The Moral of the Rose* is presumably published at the same time as *Anne of Green Gables*. But the "Emily" books were composed in a different literary environment, when literary nationalism was more hotly debated and literary fashions had more or less forgotten the sentimental kailyard writers that inspired *Anne*. Unsurprisingly for a character who is a projection of her own literary self, Emily Byrd Starr seems to be writing the fiction that L.M. Montgomery herself wrote. *The*

⁶³ Letter to EW, dated Nov. 25, 1917 [NAC].

⁶⁴ E. Holly Pike. "(Re)Producing Canadian Literature: L.M. Montgomery's Emily Novels." op. cit.

Moral of the Rose is a community novel, although in its focus on the Applegaths it is also a novel of clan. (It does not seem, however, that Emily is writing *Emily of New Moon*. Were this the case, Montgomery would be bypassing modernism for post-modernism!) Thus Pike argues, the “Emily” books constitute Montgomery’s defence for her *own* books to be deemed serious Canadian Literature.

The Moral of the Rose deserves closer attention here, for in the context of this focus on place, it would appear that Montgomery’s attitudes to region have changed very little if Emily’s novel is another *Anne*. The Island that Emily lives in is different to Anne’s Island, and not just because it is terrifying and alienating at first. Although both girls live out their childhoods in the last two decades of the nineteenth century, the rural world changes fundamentally. Old ways and new ways are visibly cleaved from each other in the “Emily” books; the Murrays are looked down upon for being old-fashioned, as the Gardiners later are in an *inter-war* setting, when Judy’s traditional cheeses and hooked mats are something that American tourists gloat over and Canadian neighbours disdain. *New Moon*, in the eyes of outsiders, is trapped in its own “romantic” history. The Murrays have rejected modernisation as Emily rejects modernism, but, crucially, the Murray clique is also dying out.

Emily Byrd Starr’s “flash” seems inspired by William Wordsworth’s *The Prelude*.⁶⁵ The title she chooses for her novel most likely has its source in Tennyson’s “The Day-Dream”, a poem Montgomery often quotes⁶⁶:

So, Lady Flora, take my lay,
And if you find no moral there,
Go, look in any glass and say,
What moral is in being fair.
Oh, to what uses shall we put
The wildweed-flower that simply blows?
And is there any moral shut
Within the bosom of the rose?

Were Emily sticking to her source, then it would “cramp” the rose “to hook it to some useful end”.⁶⁷ The rose would be beauty for beauty’s sake, the novel, sketches of country life with no intrinsic moral or greater purpose, and certainly not a “problem novel”.

⁶⁵ i.e. “Even forms and substances are circumfused/ By that transparent veil with light divine;/ And, through the turnings intricate of verse,/ Present themselves as objects recognised,/ In flashes, and with glory not their own” (Book 5, l. 603-607).

⁶⁶ see e.g. the motto of *Anne of the Island*: “All precious things discovered late/ To those who seek them issue forth,/ For Love in sequel works with Fate,/ And draws the veil from hidden worth.”

⁶⁷ Tennyson. “The Day-Dream.” *Tennyson: A Selected Edition*. Ed. Christopher Ricks. Harlow: Longman, 1989: 168-179.

Montgomery's use of quotation and allusion is complex, and here readers must recall Emily's reaction to *The Idylls of the Kings*:

I like some things in them but I detest Tennyson's *Arthur*. If I had been Guinevere I'd have boxed his ears—but I wouldn't have been unfaithful to him for Lancelot, who was just as odious in a different way. As for Geraint, if I had been Enid I'd have bitten him. These "patient Griseldas" deserve all they get. Lady Enid, if you had been a Murray of New Moon you would have kept your husband in better order and he would have liked you all the better for it.

Prose and poetry are different mediums, but it seems that Emily may mock Tennyson with her choice of title, and "hook" in a moral of her own. When a critic writes that, "To review a book of this kind is like attempting to dissect a butterfly's wing or strip a rose of its petals to discover the secret of its fragrance", Aunt Elizabeth sniffs, "Too high-falutin'" (EQ 192). (Killingly, Montgomery culled Emily's reviews, good, bad, and awful, from her own.⁶⁸)

From Aunt Elizabeth's personal standpoint, the moral, or at least the "final judgement", is that she "never could have believed that a pack of lies could sound as much like the real truth as that book does" (193). (She recognises the Blair Water neighbours in it. Aunt Elizabeth, as Flora Post would say, is the "Dominant Grandmother Theme" common to rural fiction.⁶⁹) Janet Royal, whose advances Emily has rejected by refusing to move to New York, tells her, "Your story is like a wild rose, dear; all sweetness and unexpectedness, with sly little thorns of wit and satire" (EQ 189). (This recalls, once more, the Cuthbert roses which are "sweet on their thorny stems".) It seems that Emily has in fact had a chance to leave a childhood "full of poetry and steeped in romance" in order "to grow and develop and be [her]self" *without* "the training that only a great city can give" (EC 309).

Emily's novel is published by an American firm. When Emily insists to Miss Royal that PEI *can* furnish material for fiction, she makes a direct comparison with New York: "As for material —people *live* here just the same as anywhere else—suffer and enjoy and sin and aspire just as they do in New York" (320). The Applegaths are Emily's answer to the Big Apple, and if their clan name suggests apple gatherers at all, it could be that there's more than a little sin in the garden province. That Emily has an American and not a Canadian publisher is true to Montgomery's career and true to the literary climate in which Montgomery's heroine

⁶⁸ cf. EQ pp. 189-193 and SJ IV [Mar. 1, 1930] 36-43.

⁶⁹ cf. When Flora Post encounters Mrs Starkadder for the first time she realises that she is "the Dominant Grandmother Theme, which was found in all typical novels of agricultural life". Stella Gibbons. *Cold Comfort Farm*. 1932. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1956: 60.

was writing, where she must worry that “the fatal Prince Edward Island postmark” (*EQ* 160) will always condemn her work.

In this fear we see another side of the literary debate Montgomery is engaged in. There is a contest between romance and realism, to be sure, but Emily’s own thoughts about romance are far from clear cut, as the title of her novel indicates. Emily’s own “romantic” ending with Teddy Kent has a false ring to it. Added to this Emily craves the approval of Dean Priest, a wounded man, alienated from both clan and community, and thus a modernist character as well as a modernist critic. Emily actually seems out to prove *two* things, not only that Canada can produce its own literature as America can, but that Canadian *national* literature can come from the *province* of Prince Edward Island. (“I can see to the stars” [*EC* 321], cries Emily in a moment of Wildean fervour, from her gutter in *New Moon*.) This civil war is a more silent one than the vocal American-Canadian battles, but it seems noteworthy that Emily is never encouraged to move to Toronto or Montreal, nor does she ever seriously consider these moves herself. In the “Emily” trilogy, Montgomery seems to plead two causes for the writer of regional fiction: that their books were worthwhile as literature and that they were also representative of national life.

Epilude: A Song Before Sunset

Morning comes at last, be the night ever so long. The day that was to be such a marvellous day for Jane began like any other [...] The sun rose without any unusual fuss.
Jane of Lantern Hill 60

Vacationing in Prince Edward Island in the fall of 1936, L.M. Montgomery “found Cavendish, or part of it, in the shadow of a great oncoming change”.⁷⁰ More than one familiar face was missing forever from the church pews, and the round of life had taken its toll on the worn-out farmhouses and farmlands. The coming change she wrote of, however, was not the prospect of further deterioration as the old clans died out, but the proposed National Park on the North Shore. The Dominion Government planned to develop a conservation area in every Canadian province and chose this Island location partly for the shoreline’s natural beauty, and partly to honour Montgomery’s books. The Macneill house that inspired *Green Gables*, the Dryad’s Bubble, Lover’s Lane, and the “Haunted Wood” below the site of the old school, were targeted for preservation, “the woods and paths and dykes would be kept just

⁷⁰ Letter to GBM, dated Dec. 27, 1936, *My Dear Mr. M* 181.

as they were" (ibid.), the places Montgomery loved would be saved from desecration, or so the Island's Premier assured her at any rate.

This holiday was Maud Montgomery's penultimate trip to the Island, and she feared that it might be her last.⁷¹ In the summer months before she left for the Island, with Toronto in the grip of a terrible heat-wave,⁷² she began work on what would be her penultimate novel, *Jane of Lantern Hill*, the story of a Toronto girl who returns to the Island for the first time since babyhood. Unlike Anne, Jane (thirty years but only a letter apart) has not heard that PEI is "the prettiest place in the world"; patronising Cousin Phyllis tells her, it is "quite a pretty place" (*JLH* 49), but Jane can see very well from the map that it is "a desolate little fragment in the jaws of Gaspé and Cape Breton" (46), with "such an awful lot of water round it" that her best-friend Jody worries about Jane "falling over the edge" (51). Snobbish, citified, Grandmother Kennedy does not doubt but that Victoria (as she calls Jane) is going to live in "some kind of a hovel" (50), and when Jane returns three months later—taller and rosy and confident and smitten—she snips, "Victoria has gone quite P.E. Island," [...] much as if she had said, "Victoria has gone quite savage" (146).

Victoria Moore (later Anderson, Kennedy) has as much time for "rural activities" (145) as she has for granddaughters who loiter in kitchens talking to servants. Her daughter Sylvia and son-in-law David are less dismissive of the Island, for they occasionally holiday there, "in a big hotel on the north shore" (49), whence their little Phyllis's knowing but condescending perspective. In *Anne of Green Gables*, "heaps of Americans" (56) stay out their summers in the White Sands hotel. Thirty years and more later, Canadians themselves are the tourists, and city-born Canadians mock the Island life and Island people. At this stage, L.M. Montgomery seems poised for a rerun of the country or city debate, and readers would expect that once more the Island will prove to be, not only the prettiest place in the world, but morally superior, truer to the values that true Canadians hold dear, "the land of dreams among". And in many senses this is indeed the case: Jane Stuart wisely chooses to ignore her maternal clan and their traditions, and falls in love with her birthplace and its beauty in her own individual way, not by fussing over sunrises, but responding to the "freedom to grow" that she finds there.

Yet the very fact that the sun *can* rise without any unusual fuss is a hint that Montgomery's sense of place has changed here, and, in *Jane of Lantern Hill*, this

⁷¹ cf. In her copy of Barrie's *Mary Rose*, LMM underlined the heroine's parting remarks on the strange island: "Don't you think the sad thing is that we seldom know when the last time has come" (XZ1 MS A 094007, LMM Collection, UG). LMM vacationed in PEI again in September 1939.

⁷² LMM told GBM that there had been 300 deaths in Toronto due to the heat-wave that summer (Letter to GBM, dated Dec. 27, 1936 [NAC]).

development again has a literary front. Jane's father, an Islander, is a writer. He dabbles in stories and poetry, but when we first meet him he is making a living-of-sorts (not a "muckle o' livin'") from freelance journalism, selling political articles, "The Peaceful Readjustment of International Difficulties", "The Consequences of Confederation in Regard to the Maritime Provinces", to the Toronto-based *Saturday Evening*.⁷³ As a character Andrew Stuart grows out of the other Canadian authors in Montgomery's fiction: he is part Owen Ford, part John Foster, part Walter Blythe, with perhaps just a touch of Emily Starr. In this respect, he is a wholly Canadian figure, not a Scott or a Burns or a Barrie, despite his Scotch name. Andrew Stuart is a war-veteran, an honoured Canadian hero no less, and seems to stand at the vanguard of the new national literature L.M. Montgomery prophesied would come after "some great crisis of storm and stress" has "fused [Canada's] varying elements into a harmonious whole". With his psychological war wounds, his alienation, and his recurrent creative block, Andrew Stuart might even be a modernist hero, albeit saved by the love of a child.

At the end of *Jane of Lantern Hill* we do not find the newly reunited Stuart family settling down to rural Island life. We leave them instead planning a trip to Boston where "dad" can seek out a book contract, planning a flit to Toronto where he has taken an editorial job, and planning to buy a family home there, a home on the banks of the Humber that Jane has already chosen. Only their summers will be spent in Prince Edward Island. The Stuarts will never be "tourists", but in their decision to keep Lantern Hill as a "holiday" home, there is a profound shift in Montgomery's thinking. Notably all the Lantern Hill neighbours are poor, working-class farmers, not the chosen people of earlier times, reflecting the impact of the "hungry thirties" on Island life which Montgomery witnessed in 1936. Andrew Stuart needs to earn a "healthy salary" (216), and no matter how "gey interestin'" and inspirational the rural scenery is, the city offers greater opportunities. The Stuarts find a balance between the city and the country, and in this harmonious balance we can detect a new Canadian unity, a new nation as a whole.

L.M. Montgomery was planning "Jane II" in 1939, although none of these plans survive.⁷⁴ As *Jane of Lantern Hill* ends with no romance to be continued saving Jane's love for her Toronto home of dreams, it is fascinating to speculate what Montgomery had in store for her readers, and likely that "Jane II", *Jane of Lakeside*

⁷³ *Saturday Night* published LMM's final poem, "The Piper", on 2 May 1942, eight days after her death. They had received the poem—written to answer reader demands for Walter's verse (although it is a poor attempt at replicating it)—three weeks beforehand.

⁷⁴ See April 17, 1939: U.10 and letter to EW, dated Feb. 13-27, 1940 [NAC].

Gardens perhaps, might have been a celebration, not of the Island this time, but of the city that was Montgomery's own "Journey's End".

CONCLUSION

Road from the Island

Being a Scottish Highlander I have the characteristic long memory of my race so that, mentally, I trail behind me a complex tangled web of association and near superstition. I try very hard to be realistic but in spite of this I am easily led away into enchantment ...

Jane Duncan. *My Friends the Macleans* [1967]

"I think there are two kinds of true things," the Story Girl protests, when Felicity's cynicism tarnishes another golden legend, "true things that *are*, and true things that are *not*, but *might* be" (TSG 126). The roads of Maud Montgomery's Island story, and the paths to her personal, clan, community, regional, and Canadian identity, are paved with variegated truths. In turn, a "complex tangled web of association and near superstition" trails behind—and often navigates—the corresponding identities her stories explore. L.M. Montgomery's fiction maps her Canadian experience from an Island cradle to the shadows of an Island grave, but "enchantment" ever peeps around the corner at the realism of life. At times, as with Jane Duncan, such enchantments are Highland legacies: where they are not, a marked Scottish bias invariably characterises them. Not always Lowland by default, these ancestral echoes may reverberate with tones more "mock Scots" than "real Scots", but are vital in understanding Montgomery's work nonetheless. Giving due recognition to stories that are not true, but might be, has been one aim of this study.

L.M. Montgomery's writing now sustains its own mythology. Thriving heritage and tourist industries spring from the Avonlea stories, which are read as period pieces descriptive of Canada's late-Victorian age, thus promulgating the era's endlessly appealing material culture. Simultaneously, and somewhat contradictorily, Avonlea appears untouched by time and by progress, thus enchanting in its rural simplicity. The character of Anne Shirley, in particular, has assumed a new life independent of Montgomery's books, an estrangement that regularly betrays the fate Montgomery apparently intended for her most famous creation. In her first (and

presumably not last) small-screen incarnation of the new century, Anne crossed to the Great War battlefields to rescue Gilbert, missing-in-action.¹ Such pluck is no doubt true to the Anne-aged-eleven that readers love most, but destroys *Rilla*'s historical context, Montgomery's chronology, and, what is more, the realistic portrayal of adult Anne's sworn conventionality.

This magic door to the enchantment of bygone days is integral to L.M. Montgomery's continuing appeal. To include her books in an iconography of Victoriana, however, is to ignore developments in Montgomery's literary style, and to lose sight of the world she lived and wrote in. To maintain her book sales, she paid close attention to literary trends and to newer writers, even those she scorned. Although she was conservative in many respects and regretted some of the moral, spiritual, and temporal changes she witnessed, she embraced other transformations, and technological developments such as the motor car, the radio, and the cine-camera. Until the outbreak of the Second World War shattered her faith in the new world order, Maud Montgomery was a modern woman who bought and sold stocks and shares, and a modern author who could write with an eye to the movie industry and the blossoming career of Shirley Temple.² Within these changing times, the First World War was a watershed: a second aim of this thesis has been to emphasise the importance of the conflict to Montgomery's life and art.

Montgomery was a realist, then, for all her enchantments, and it is this realism, in situation, in characterisation, and especially in humour, which helps ensure the longevity of her fiction and inspires new academic study. For every Montgomery story that extols old-fashioned values and old-fashioned hearts and old-fashioned romance, another exists to snap its fingers at hypocrisy, take a pop at patriarchy, and pull a face at puffed-up pride.

¹ Sullivan Films Inc.'s "Anne of Green Gables: the Continuing Story" screened in Spring 2000.

² A letter to LMM from Ann Elmo, her literary agent in New York, dated Oct. 19, 1935, reads: "Your idea of submitting 'Tomorrow Comes' to Mr Zanuck is a good one. I have a copy of the story which I will send to Hollywood. I will also see about 'Magic for Marigold' and I am sure that the Stokes Co. will not object to our trying it as a vehicle for Shirley Temple" (see MS. "Jane of Lantern Hill" CM.67.5.3, p. 291 & 292 verso).

Thistle-pricks and thistle-down

Friend o' mine, in the year oncoming
I wish you [...]

A goodly crop of figs to gather,
With a thistle or two to prick and sting;
Since a harvesting too harmless is rather
An unadventurous thing.

L.M. Montgomery. "I Wish You."³

Founded in 1827 by Scotsmen John Galt and William "Tiger" Dunlop, the Ontario town of Guelph, through its university, is home both to the L.M. Montgomery Collection and to an extensive Scottish Archival Collection. To affirm the association between the two, and "signal Montgomery's identification with her Scottish heritage" (HT 6), the title *Harvesting Thistles* was chosen for a book of re-evaluations of Montgomery's writings, published in 1994 by the Guelph-based Canadian Children's Press. Scotland's national emblem was appropriate here on several counts. In the first instance, as editor Mary Rubio observes, one of the John Foster volumes fuelling Valancy's latent rebelliousness in *The Blue Castle* is named *Thistle Harvest*.

In adapting the Bible verse "Do men gather grapes of thorns, or figs of thistles" (Matthew 7:16) for the title of this Canadian nature book, and for the sentiment expressed in the poem cited above, L.M. Montgomery intended "thistle harvest" to mean "something a little different from the harvest of respectability etc. we all hope to gather—something a bit unexpected and out of the commonplace to give a tang to our conventional and well-ordered lives".⁴ Montgomery plants unexpected stings in the well-ordered, respectable communities she writes of, thereby adding an unconventional tang and bite to the potentially pedestrian literary conventions she writes within. Rubio states that "Montgomery's own books [...] are books which amuse and soothe, but are also filled with subversive, prickly shafts" (HT 1-2), and this view is supported by recent reappraisals, which have in turn harvested a mature and complex literary reputation for L.M. Montgomery from the stings of faint praise that were formerly her portion from academic quarters.

Yet, for all the signals of Scottish "character" that thistles evoke, be these plants "stubborn, prickly, hardy" or "tenacious" (HT 6)—and counter to Rubio's hope that *Harvesting Thistles* would garner interest in L.M. Montgomery's Scottish heritage—this aspect of her work has not been addressed in any complexity.

³ *The Poetry of L.M. Montgomery* 107. This poem of New Year greetings was written in 1928.

⁴ Letter to GBM, dated Feb. 10, 1929 [NAC].

Primarily Montgomery's writing has been considered for its relevance to schools of feminist and literary theory, and only recently assessed in a cultural, that is Canadian cultural, context. This thesis is the first full-length study to evaluate the impact of the Scottish diaspora in Canada through Montgomery's writing, within a framework that is historical, literary, and cultural. It also identifies deep-seated Scottish roots beneath both the pungent thistle stings *and* the respectable crop of figs.

Still, to stress, or indeed prioritise, L.M. Montgomery's (and PEI's) Scottish antecedents when reading her fiction is not to carve new ground. Just as early buyers thought her books fit reading for adults as well as juveniles, so early reviewers, critiquing partly for this adult readership (and for adult buyers), were quick to identify and keen to emphasise Montgomery's Scottish credentials; in genre, in subject matter, and within a Scots-Canadian literary tradition. Notices from both sides of the pond refer to her "Scotch-Canadian" villages,⁵ to her characters' Scottish lineage (Marigold Lesley was billed as a "loveable young person of Scottish descent"),⁶ and Scottish temperament (Norman Douglas was evidence of "a sound old Adam stock in the kailyards of the Dominion").⁷ In the earliest days of a self-consciously national literature,⁸ L.M. Montgomery was banded with writers like Ralph Connor, Marian Keith, and Nellie McClung, whose "Canadian" style was felt inseparable from the "Scotch blood in their veins".

In 1924, for example, Canadian academic, Archibald MacMechan [1862-1933]—L.M. Montgomery's English professor at Dalhousie⁹—surveyed her novels for *The Head-Waters of Canadian Literature*.¹⁰ Identifying some of the emerging faces in the new national literature, MacMechan linked "a parson in Winnipeg"

⁵ A review of *Anne's House of Dreams*, published in the New York Evening Post, Sept. 22, 1917, was entitled, "A Scotch-Canadian Village" (review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG).

⁶ Unidentified review of *Magic for Marigold*, dated 1929 (review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG).

⁷ Morning Post, 24 Dec. 1921. *The Scotsman* noted in reviewing *Rilla of Ingleside* (3 Dec. 1921) that the novel was set in "a glen somewhere in Canada, where most of the names of places and persons speak of Scottish origins" (review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG).

⁸ The earliest article of this type is E.J. Hathaway. "The Trail of the Romanticist in Canada." *Canadian Magazine*. 34 [April 1910]: 529-537, where LMM is the only PEI writer referred to. J.D. Logan & Donald G. French in *Highways of Canadian Literature* [1924] offered a three-page synopsis of LMM's fiction, but, unlike their analysis of Marian Keith, did not refer to her Scottish background. Two other professorial-authored survey books of Canadian Literature appeared in the era: Lorne Pierce's *Outline of Canadian Literature* [1927] and Rhodenizer's *Handbook of Canadian Literature* [1930].

⁹ MacMechan judged LMM's poem (written under the name "Belinda Bluegrass"), "Which Has More Patience—Man or Woman", worthy of the five dollar first prize in an *Evening Mail* competition (*SJ I* [Feb. 15, 1896] 157-158). He also admired LMM's first essay for him, "My Earliest Recollection" (*SJ I* 146), and her Senior English exam paper (*SJ I* 160).

¹⁰ Archibald MacMechan. *The Headwaters of Canadian Literature*. 1924. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1968.

(Ralph Connor) with a “girl in a quiet hamlet in Prince Edward Island” (191), as “their Scottish atmosphere” is of “special significance” to their books. Furthermore:

Both writers are of Scottish descent. Gordon [“Ralph Connor”] is a minister, and Miss Montgomery married a minister. In all they write the influence of the minister is either actual or implied. This means that Scottish religious and social ideals have been brought to this country by the immigrants from Scotland; and they have had no small or trivial influence in the up-building of the new country (212-213).¹¹

Although MacMechan judged that *Anne of Green Gables* “just misses the kind of success which convinces the critic while it captivates the unreflecting general reader” (211), he recognised that “*Anne of Green Gables* and its fellows meet more nearly the common and reasonable requirement of ‘being true to life’ than the Canadian stories of either Gordon or [Gilbert] Parker” (212). MacMechan, of course, despite his condescension, was right to detect “Scottish religious ideals” in Montgomery’s writing, even if the view of congregations and clerics delivered from *her* Presbyterian manse was not always as he supposed it.

Undoubtedly, contemporary reviewers of Montgomery’s books gathered these flowers of Scotland not only because the Scots in Canada were a particularly visible force, but because Scotland and Scottish culture carried globally-familiar connotations of wholesomeness, strength, integrity, romance, and so forth, thistle-down that was valued all the more by those general readers, whether reflecting or unreflecting, sickened or bored by modernist literature. Today these attributes still appeal, and for similar reasons, even if they are less often recognised as Scotland’s legacies.

* * *

The ties that seemed to bind authors together in the 1920s have weakened and now L.M. Montgomery is more often linked with North American children’s writers, or Canadian women writers, than she is with “the parson in Winnipeg” whose novels she largely disdained. That new areas of study have opened, and forgotten or discarded works written by women or for children have been rehabilitated, obviously contributes to this shift in emphasis. Another factor is that, as MacMechan predicted in 1924, the “permanent value” (209) of Connor’s “facile fiction” to most readers and many students has proved slight, possibly due to literary snobbery akin to that expressed by MacMechan. As Montgomery’s writing also faces such prejudice it may additionally indicate that Connor’s version of the Scots-Canadian

¹¹ LMM commented in response that, “‘marrying a minister’ had absolutely no influence in any way upon my writings” (SJ III [Feb. 1, 1925] 217). As *Rainbow Valley* focuses on an absent-minded minister with few artificial social skills, her statement appears inaccurate.

world is an out-moded vision that dates his work in ways that Montgomery's version does not. Just as the idyllic Scottish kailyard novels are out-of-print and off the literary canon (although this may be changing) so Connor's Glengarry novels in particular are tainted by a sentimentality that seems to pander indeed to "cheap whimsicality about bairnies and heroes in homespun".

MacMechan does not test the "Scottish atmosphere" reproduced by Ralph Connor and L.M. Montgomery, but an obvious distinction between the two authors is that Connor describes Highland-Canadian communities, and Montgomery writes predominantly of Lowland-Canadian villages where Highlander characters are uncommon. Moreover, Connor's Highlanders appear but little changed, either in lifestyle or in identity, by their migration to Ontario's boundless lake or the wilder western settlements. A similar scenario emerges from J.K. Galbraith's memoir of his Elgin County boyhood. The Canadian economist (educated in Guelph, much to his displeasure) recalls a Scotchier-than-thou attitude amongst his family and neighbours: "[w]e referred to ourselves as Scotch and not Scots. When, years later, I learned that the usage in Scotland was different it seemed to me rather an affectation" (12).¹² The potential for a new Canadian identity is rejected here in favour of a self-consciously old "Scotch" one, as Galbraith's observations on nomenclature, farming, education, money, religion, and more education bear out.

Galbraith's Ontario township was populated by Highlanders cleared from their homes in Scotland as late as the 1830s.¹³ Galbraith and Connor, and also PEI's Sir Andrew Macphail, gathered thistle-down from their upbringing in Highland settlements that encouraged chain migration to Canada from Scotland and thus retained Gaelic language, customs, and culture over the generations. Scottish folkways were more subtle and subdued in the north shore Island village where L.M. Montgomery was raised. In this respect, her ancestors' early migration proved critical to the "up-building" of Canadian identity, likewise Cavendish's isolated and exclusive foundation. Those who arrived in the community after 1790, from families outside the original elite, were often distrusted. (As Rachel Lynde comments on a similar influx, "I don't know what Avonlea is coming to, with so many strange people rushing into it. It'll soon not be safe to go to sleep in our beds" [AA 17].) Those who arrived in Cavendish and never lost the "brogue"—like eccentric "Old

¹² John Kenneth Galbraith. *The Scotch*. Toronto: Macmillan, 1964.

¹³ J.K. Galbraith. *A Life in Our Times: Memoirs*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1981. Galbraith notes that the first of his clansmen to migrate was reputedly born in Argyllshire in 1771, and died in 1874, but that "some later research by a clan historian suggests that if these dates are accurate, he was born a year or two before his parents first met" (1-2); thus proving an old saw that family trees are bound to be questionable about the roots.

McKinstrie"—were cut from a different cloth and conspicuous as old world souvenirs.

Cavendish was not any less "Scottish" in composition than Connor's "Twentieth", Galbraith's Port Talbot, or Macphail's Orwell. It was, however, more distant from Scotland than these places, in time clearly, but perhaps in affiliation. Montgomery's Macneill, Simpson, and Clark contemporaries were proud of their Scottish heritage, but lived at four generations and a hundred years remove from Scotland. Valleyfield, where Ewan Macdonald was raised, was established in 1840. In that year, Cavendish clocked up its first half-century. The first school was established in 1814 and, after years of travelling miles to worship, Cavendish's first church opened its doors in 1832. Montgomery's protagonists identify themselves, not as "Scotch", but as Islanders, Maritimers, Canadians. Thus, Ilse Burnley, whose Great-aunts live in Scotland, can refer to a "Scotchman up at Malvern who said he never got drunk, but the whiskey always settled in his knees" (*EC* 277), inferring that his ethnicity sets him apart from herself. The Burnleys and the Murrays, the Gardiners and the Lesleys, are proud of their Old Country roots, but celebrate these in Canadian contexts.

* * *

The man from Malvern is one of the small handful of characters Montgomery expressly labels as "Scotch" or Scottish, one reason why modern readers, especially those unfamiliar with some intricacies or stereotypes of Scottish manners, could conceivably overlook the extent to which the Scots and Scottish culture permeate her Canadian books. Reactions to this Scottish colour may also vary across the generations. Child readers of *The Story Girl* will doubtless think Old Mr Forbes' Scottish "bur-r-r" (104) as funny as the young King cousins do. Adult readers will find a different humour in old Mr McAllister's verdict that Marigold's unhandsome "Aunt" Ellice is "a useful wumman—a verra useful wumman" (*MFM* 187-188), or in Miss Cornelia's scathing attack on the "Highland Scotch family of MacNabs back of the Glen" who have "twelve boys and the oldest and the youngest are both called Neil—Big Neil and Little Neil [...] I s'pose they ran out of names" (*AHD* 291-292).¹⁴

Perceptions of Scotland, and of her national character, also change with time or in export, and the Scottish elements in Montgomery's work have not been immune to

¹⁴ Galbraith writes that amongst the Highland-Scots, "to call a son something other than John was to combine mild eccentricity with unusual imagination" (*The Scotch* 15). As Dr Seuss puts it, "Did I ever tell you that Mrs McCave/ Had twenty-three sons and she named them all Dave" ("Too Many Daves"). See Donald Hall. *The Oxford Book of Children's Verse in America*. New York: Oxford UP, 1985: 254).

modern, and caricatured, revision. For instance, one episode of the television show, *Road to Avonlea* (a series purportedly inspired by the “spirit”—and initially the story-lines—of the “Story Girl” books and Avonlea chronicles) features a “burring” Scotch hotelier, Simon Trevayne, who tries to serve haggis at the weirdly Americanised “Avonlea Founders’ Day” banquet. “The Scots are red-haired miserly barbarians,” his offended French chef shouts at him, “their music is dreadful [...] The men wear skirts like women”. Trevayne, complete with tartan neck-tie, his Cornish surname no sticking point, eventually triumphs over the Gallic epicure. He and his half-brother Andrew, dressed in kilts, pipe in and declaim the “Great Chieftain o’ the Puddin-race”. In the “wee sma’s”, the Scotsmen drink whisky together, and gloat over family feuds.

Burns Societies and Caledonian Clubs thrived in PEI by the second half of the nineteenth century. Frequented by Scotiphiles and expatriates (mostly Highlanders in PEI and mostly men) such organisations were critical in keeping traditions alive and promulgating a vibrant Scots identity in Canada.¹⁵ Hugh John Montgomery, as F.W.P. Bolger observes, “was always appreciative of the ‘Scottish blood’ that pulsed through his veins. Shortly after he settled in Prince Albert, he organised a meeting of the ‘Sons of Scotland,’ and, under his chairmanship, an organisation, called the ‘St. Andrew’s Society of Prince Albert,’ was formed”.¹⁶ Yet, as the stage-managed (by Walter Scott) visit of a bekilted George IV to Edinburgh in 1822 epitomises,¹⁷ a fine line separates patriotism and tartanry, particularly in popular culture, or where, as Ian McKay argues, politics and tourism are the guiding lights.¹⁸ Another aim of this study has been to show that the greater part of L.M. Montgomery’s work bypasses the clamjamphrie of kilts and haggis, Burns and bagpipes, lairds and “wee drappies”, which *Road to Avonlea* exploits. Like her father, L.M. Montgomery was proud of her Scottish blood, but was also “being true to life”, daily life, that is, in her fiction. The “Daughters of Scotland” her stories revolve around have little experience of pageantry, plaiding, and pibrochs.

If her fiction, then, has been subject to occasional tartanism when translated into other media (as it has been, more frequently, to sentimentalism) it is important to note that Montgomery might not have been properly horrified by this. In the 1930s, Scotland was a cinematic favourite, and movies such as René Clair’s *The*

¹⁵ See Susan Hornby, *Celts and Ceilidhs: A History of Scottish Societies on Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: The Caledonian Club, 1981.

¹⁶ *The Years Before “Anne”* op. cit. 64.

¹⁷ See John Prebble, *The King’s Jaunt: George IV in Scotland, 1822*. London, 1988.

¹⁸ Ian McKay, “Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954,” *Acadiensis*, XXI.2 [Spring 1992]: 5-47.

Ghost Goes West [1935], which opens in a pseudo-Highland mishmash of pipe bands, kilts, warfare, family feuds, curses, and superstition, were favourites with North Americans, including Maud Montgomery herself.¹⁹ She also enjoyed the “wonderful pageant” of *Mary of Scotland*, with a miscast Katherine Hepburn in the title role (Hepburn also played Babbie in the 1934 Hollywood version of *The Little Minister*²⁰) although, admittedly, “its distortion of history vexed [her] intolerably” (Apr. 7, 1937: U.10).²¹

Island Magic

With the conservatism of the clan all around her, hedged in by its traditions, its old world customs and beliefs, [Marigold Lesley] still retains a fanciful streak of her own, that gets her into many escapades fraught with all kinds of danger, but finally brings her safely through them all.²²

Perth-born, Glasgow-raised, and border-spirited, John Buchan served as Canada's Governor General (under the title Lord Tweedsmuir of Elsfield) between 1935 and his death in 1940.²³ In September 1937, he delivered a speech in Charlottetown, later published under the title, *Island Magic*.²⁴ Meeting Islanders while touring Canada, Buchan had been “deeply impressed with their passionate affection for their place of origin” (29), and now asked, “What is it about an island that makes its inhabitants regard it with peculiar pride?” (29). Buchan argued that an island, like a favourite childhood haunt, inspires “local patriotism” because it has “clear physical limits” enabling “the mind [...] to grasp it and make a picture of it as a whole” (30). As people move from their “islands” to larger spheres, these treasured places become

¹⁹ “It was very funny and I forgot myself for a while and enjoyed it” (May 11, 1936: U.9). The 1935 UK movie—scripted by Robert E. Sherwood, directed by René Clair, produced by Alexander Korda—starred Robert Donat as the ghost and as the modern-day Glourie, Donald.

²⁰ *The Little Minister* [1934], directed by Richard Wallace, produced by Pandro S. Berman for RKO. LMM commented that the movie was “the usual travesty of the book, but interesting and amusing in itself and Katherine Hepburn made a good ‘Babbie’” (Mar. 31, 1936: U.10).

²¹ *Mary of Scotland* [1936], directed by John Ford, produced by Pandro S. Berman for RKO. The main distortion of history the movie makes is to stage a meeting between Mary and Elizabeth I.

²² Review of *Magic for Marigold*, published in *The Pioneer* of Allahabad, 23 March 1930 (review scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG). The review continued, “The author has a remarkable insight into the youthful mind, and while this book can be read with real pleasure as a novel, it is also in some respects an object lesson to parents—almost a study in child psychology”.

²³ LMM met John Buchan at a reception in Government House, Ottawa, in November 1935, the month that he and Lady Tweedsmuir took up residence there (see Susan Tweedsmuir, *John Buchan By His Wife and Friends*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1947: Ch. XIV). LMM commented that she had “found a very moderate pleasure in [John Buchan’s] books” and that “he is nothing to look at—a small, weazen-faced man. Lady T. is sonsy and fair and pleasant-faced but no beauty. The whole affair bored me horribly and I was thankful when I got away” (Nov. 26, 1935: U.9). The collection of LMM’s personal library at UG contains Buchan’s 1932 biography of Sir Walter Scott.

²⁴ Lord Tweedsmuir. *Canadian Occasions*. Toronto: Musson Book Co., 1940.

“the fixed point from which we adjust ourselves to the rest of the world” (30). As the British Crown’s representative in the Dominion, Buchan encouraged other patriotisms, to Canada, indeed to humanity, and believed those who hailed from Scotland owned a special “gift for uniting the narrower and wider patriotisms” (32).

Maud Montgomery lived thirty-one of her sixty-seven years on the Canadian mainland, but her fiction, journals and correspondence corroborate John Buchan’s sentiment that, with island people, it is “to an island that our hearts return” (29). She was led away into enchantment by the pines over Russells’ Hill in Norval, and the Ontario landscape is impressed on her writing, most obviously in *Jane of Lantern Hill* and *The Blue Castle*; but just as Valancy Stirling truly discovers belonging on the lake island of Mistawis, so L.M. Montgomery chiefly beholds the Island in her literary dreams. Moreover, Montgomery, whether a bequest of her Scottish blood or not, unites her Island patriotism with her Canadian patriotism, on a personal level certainly, but also in her stories. For Montgomery, her own beloved Island was a national as well as a local treasure, and its people personified the spirit Canadians could be most proud of.

For this reason, L.M. Montgomery’s Ontario life is a road not taken in this thesis, despite the ongoing impact of Scottish settlement in that province. In much the same way as Montgomery returned from her trip to the old homeland proclaiming her love for the new, so taking the road from the Island to Ontario fixed the Island, not only as her home, but as the place from which to grasp and interpret the changing world. As this thesis demonstrates, distance lends more than enchantment to the view. Although Montgomery romanticises the Island and its mythology to some extent, she also acknowledges that these traditions, in clan and in community, offer a hedge of protection that places limits on independence. If the commonplace environment is shaped by “old world customs and beliefs” then the “fanciful streak” that turns her islands of calm into islands of magic, escapade, and adventure shares this old world heritage. Valancy’s copy of *Thistle Harvest* heralds a journey beyond respectability, beyond local mores, beyond order, beyond tradition.

L.M. Montgomery therefore invoked the Island to represent all that was best, in her opinion, about Canada, as well as some Canadian foibles. But if, as today’s Governor-General, Adrienne Clarkson, has argued, “her people *are* Canada”, then these are Canadians of a special hue, principally Scottish immigrants, loyal, honest, God-fearing, proud. Montgomery’s is a selective vision and the Canada she describes is mainly white and Protestant and English-speaking. Yet this world remains relevant to Canadians today, whatever their background, partly because Montgomery’s bias

illustrates the role of the Scots in shaping the nation newer immigrants were drawn to and came to belong to.

* * *

"Mustn't it be splendid to be remarkable and have compositions written about you after you're dead."

Anne of Green Gables 219

Although L.M. Montgomery reminded Ephraim Weber that *Anne of Green Gables* was "not pretending to be of any intrinsic interest to adults",²⁵ adults have always read Montgomery's work, and those who come to her books in childhood seldom lose their early interest and affection. Mary Rubio and her daughter Jennie followed Montgomery's honeymoon route through Scotland, and found that in all the places they visited, Scots were familiar with Montgomery's books. During my research I have met many adult fans, from the woman for whom I tracked down a copy of *Jane of Lantern Hill* (reading it again she remembered why it was her favourite book in childhood) to the time I visited an Edinburgh book shop, and chatted to a gaggle of elderly women all of whom still read Montgomery. This was not an *Anne of Green Gables* conversation, as so many are. One woman championed the "Emily" books over all others. Another, whenever she tired of modern books, would pick up her copy of *The Blue Castle*.

Reading *Anne of Green Gables* is a rite of passage now, as reading *Ivanhoe* was for Montgomery and her peers.²⁶ *Anne* transcends national boundaries, "ranges across the cultural landscape", surfaces in strange places. In her autobiography, *To the Is-land* [1983], New Zealand author Janet Frame recalls that she at first "condescended" to read L.M. Montgomery's books, but then thrilled to Anne's imagination. *Anne of Green Gables* is shelved among the books of Daisy Goodwill's lifetime in American-Canadian Carol Shields' Pulitzer Prize winning, *The Stone Diaries* [1993]. "Anna Green Gables" belongs on an inventory of famous Annas, in Nick Hornby's English-blokeish paean to list-making, *High Fidelity* [1995]. *Anne of Green Gables* is comfort-reading for the stalked small-town schoolgirl at the centre of Stephen Dobyns' American thriller, *The Church of the Dead Girls* [1997]. Initially jealous of his wife's attachment to the "Anne" stories—"No books were ever as good as these"—the speaker in Scot Robert Crawford's poem, "*Anne of Green Gables*", comes to learn, as Elizabeth Waterston discerns, "that he loves his wife

²⁵ Letter to EW, dated Mar. 2, 1908, *The Green Gables Letters* 61.

²⁶ An early LMM short-story, "The Quest of a Story", follows the adventures of a brother and sister who have read only half of *Ivanhoe* and need to find the remainder (*Youth*, Oct. 1902. Scrapbook 6. Labelled "Stories and Poems late 1890s early 1900s." CM. 67.5.17).

partly because she has learned to love beauty, and beautiful language, through her immersion in Montgomery's writing".²⁷

L.M. Montgomery's garrulous heroine continues to "talk" to readers the world over and occupies her own unique place in the popular imagination. In addition, through her exploits and enthusiasms, her love of nature and of home, "the diamond in the coronet" has gained fame beyond its Island shores and Canada's bounds. Having launched a television series and musical of her own, Emily Starr now looks set to do for aspiring authors what Anne Shirley did for red-heads. Inasmuch as Anne's scarlet tresses are a flowering of her Scottish blood, Emily's Scottish birthright roots her Canadian spirit. To this end, the overall aim of this study is to trace in Montgomery's writing the role of Scotland in the "up-bringing" of both province and nation. In L.M. Montgomery's words of celebration that open this thesis, and in the echo of those words below, the character of Prince Edward Island trails with Old Country echoes that could eulogise Scotland as well as Canada. If this picture is wholesome, romantic, bucolic, spirited, and replete with true things that only might be, then this, too, is a reflection of Montgomery's Scotland, as is the edge of wit that underpins it.

The people I know and love best [...] live in a land where nature is neither grudging nor lavish; where faithful work is rewarded by competence and nobody is very rich and nobody very poor, where everybody knows all about everybody else, so there are few mysteries; where there is always someone to keep tabs on you and so prevent you running amuck with the Decalogue; where the wonderful loveliness of circling sea and misty rivers and green, fairy-haunted woods is all around you; where the Shorter Catechism is not out of date; where there are still to be found real grandmothers and genuine old maid aunts; where the sane, simple, wholesome pleasures of life have not lost their tang [...] where loyalty and upright dealing and kindness of heart and a sense of responsibility and a glint of honor and a little decent reserve—great solvents of any and all problems if given a fair trial—still flower freely on the fine Old Country stock.²⁸

²⁷ Elizabeth Waterston. "The Poetry of L.M. Montgomery." op. cit. 84.

²⁸ LMM. "I Dwell Among my Own People" (memorabilia scrapbook, LMM Collection, UG).

Bibliography

ARCHIVAL SOURCES

PUBLIC ARCHIVES OF PRINCE EDWARD ISLAND, CHARLOTTETOWN, PEI

Minutes of the Cavendish Literary Society, Feb. 19, 1886-Jan. 7, 1924. Accession: 2412.

Letter from LMM to Muriel Smith, 20 July 1917. Accession: 2541/ 133a.

Letter from LMM to Muriel Smith, 12 June 1918. Accession: 2541/ 133b.

Cavendish Presbyterian/ United Cemetery Lot 23-1. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society

Malpeque Princetown Presbyterian Cemetery, Lot 18-2. Transcript: Prince Edward Island Genealogical Society.

CONFEDERATION CENTRE OF THE ARTS. CHARLOTTETOWN, PEI (CONFEDERATION MUSEUM PERMANENT COLLECTION)

MS. *Magic for Marigold*. CM. 78.5.3.

MS. *Jane of Lantern Hill*. CM. 67.5.3.

Scrapbooks of Stories and Poems. (Tabulation from Russell et al).

CM. 67.5.11. Labelled "1930s." (Scrapbook 5).

CM. 67.5.13. Labelled "1893-1895." (Scrapbook 7).

CM. 67.5.14. Labelled "1890s." (Scrapbook 1).

CM. 67.5.16. Unlabelled. (Scrapbook 8).

CM. 67.5.17. Labelled "Stories and Poems late 1890s early 1900s." (Scrapbook 6).

CM. 67.5.18. Labelled "Scrapbook 1898—Stories and Poems." (Scrapbook 2).

CM. 67.5.19. Unlabelled. (Scrapbook 3).

CM. 67.5.20. Labelled "Early 1900s, after *Anne of Green Gables*." (Scrapbook 4).

CM. 67.5.24. Unlabelled. (Scrapbook 11).

Memorabilia Scrapbooks.

CM. 67.5.12. Labelled "Late 1890s, early 1900s."

CM. 67.5.15. Unlabelled.

Scrapbooks housed at New London Birthplace Museum

1903-1907. (Scrapbook 9).

1904-1907. (Scrapbook 10).

1905-1916. (Scrapbook 12).

UNIVERSITY OF GUELPH
(L.M. MONTGOMERY COLLECTION)

Handwritten Journals of L.M. Montgomery, 10 vols, dated Sept. 21, 1889-Mar. 23, 1942. XZ5 MS A001.

Four Scrapbooks of clippings, programs and other memorabilia, compiled by L.M. Montgomery ca. 1910-1936. XZ5 MS A002.

Scrapbook of Reviews from Clipping Service, 1910-1935. XZ5 MS A003.

Edited Typescript of Journals, ca. 1940. XZ5 MS A021.

Typescripts of "The Blythes are Quoted." XZ1 MS A098001/ XZ1 MS A098002.

Letter from L.C. Page, 8 April 1907. XZ1 MS A098012.

Letter from the secretary of Mark Twain, 3 October 1908. XZ1 MS A098013.

Letter from Mary Lawson to Harold MacDougall. XZ1 MS A098018.

Letter from L.M. Montgomery to Eva Macneill, 30 March 1913.

Commonplace Book of Clara Woolner Macneill. XZ1 MS A098022.

Book Sales Record Book, 1908-1942. XZ1 MS A098042.

Book Price Record Book, 1908-1942. XZ1 MS A098043.

NATIONAL ARCHIVES OF CANADA

George MacMillan Papers. MG 30, D 185. (Letters to George Boyd MacMillan from L.M. Montgomery.)

Ephraim Weber Paper. MG 30, D 53. (Letters to Ephraim Weber from L.M. Montgomery.)

GENEALOGICAL ARCHIVES

International Genealogical Index. Compiled by the Church of the Latter Day Saints (National Library of Scotland).

The Island Register <<http://www.isn.net/~dhunter/index.html>>

L.M. MONTGOMERY'S FICTION (in order of original publication)

- Anne of Green Gables*. 1908. London: George G. Harrap, 1925.
Anne of Avonlea. 1909. London: George G. Harrap, 1931.
Kilmeny of the Orchard. 1910. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1987.
The Story Girl. 1911. London: George G. Harrap, 1949.
Chronicles of Avonlea. 1912. London: George G. Harrap, 1949.
The Golden Road. 1913. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1987.
Anne of the Island. 1915. London: George G. Harrap, 1935.
Anne's House of Dreams. 1917. London: George G. Harrap, 1927.
Rainbow Valley. 1919. London: George G. Harrap, 1940.
Further Chronicles of Avonlea. 1920. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1987.
Rilla of Ingleside. 1921. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1993.
Emily of New Moon. 1923. London: George G. Harrap, 1933.
Emily Climbs. 1925. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1990.
The Blue Castle. 1926. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1988.
Emily's Quest. 1927. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1990.
Magic for Marigold. 1929. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1988.
A Tangled Web. 1931. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1988.
Pat of Silver Bush. 1933. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1988.
Mistress Pat. 1935. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1988.
Anne of Windy Willows. 1936. London: George G. Harrap, 1949.
Jane of Lantern Hill. 1937. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1989.
Anne of Ingleside. 1939. London: George G. Harrap, 1949.
The Road to Yesterday. 1974. Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1993.
The Doctor's Sweetheart, and Other Stories. Selected by Catherine McLay. 1979.
 Toronto: McClelland-Bantam, 1993.
Akin To Anne: Tales of Other Orphans. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1988. Toronto:
 McClelland and Stewart, 1992.
Along the Shore: Tales by the Sea. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1989. Toronto: McClelland
 and Stewart, 1990.
Among the Shadows. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1990. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart,
 1994.
After Many Days: Tales of Times Passed. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1991. Toronto:
 McClelland and Stewart, 1992.
Against the Odds: Tales of Achievement. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1993. Toronto:
 McClelland and Stewart, 1994.
At the Altar: Matrimonial Tales. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1994. Toronto: McClelland and
 Stewart, 1995.
Christmas with Anne, and Other Holiday Stories. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1995.
 Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1995.
Across the Miles: Tales of Correspondence. Ed. Rea Wilmshurst. 1995. Toronto:
 McClelland and Stewart, 1997.

L.M. MONTGOMERY'S NON-FICTION

- The Alpine Path: The Story of My Career*. 1917. Toronto: Fitzhenry, 1974.
- The Green Gables Letters: From L.M. Montgomery to Ephraim Weber 1905-1909*. Ed. Wilfred Eggleston. Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1960.
- L.M. Montgomery's Ephraim Weber: Letters 1916-1941*. Ed. and intro. by Paul Gerard Tiessen and Hildi Froese Tiessen. Waterloo, ON: mlr editions canada, 2000.
- My Dear Mr. M: Letters to George Boyd MacMillan from L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Francis W.P. Bolger and Elizabeth R. Epperly. 1980. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1992.
- The Poetry of Lucy Maud Montgomery*. Selected and intro. by John Ferns and Kevin McCabe. Markham, ON: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1987.
- The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery, Volume I: 1889-1910*. Ed. Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 1985.
- The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery, Volume II: 1910-1921*. Ed. Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 1987.
- The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery, Volume III: 1921-1929*. Ed. Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 1992.
- The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery, Volume IV: 1929-1935*. Ed. Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 1998.
- The Watchman, and Other Poems*. 1916. London: Constable, 1920.

SECONDARY SOURCES ON L.M. MONTGOMERY

- Åhmansson, Gabriella. *A Life and its Mirrors: A Feminist Reading of L.M. Montgomery's Fiction*. Vol. 1. Uppsala, Sweden: U of Uppsala, 1991.
- Åhmansson, Gabriella. "Mayflowers grow in Sweden too": L.M. Montgomery, Astrid Lindgren and the Swedish Literary Consciousness." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 14-22.
- Atwood, Margaret. "Revisiting Anne." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 222-226.
- Bailey, Rosamond. "Little Orphan Mary: Anne's hoydenish double." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 55 [1989]: 8-17.
- Barry, Wendy E., Margaret Anne Doody, and Mary E. Doody Jones. *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables*. New York, Oxford: Oxford UP, 1997.
- Berke, Jacqueline. "'Mother I can Do it Myself!': The Self-sufficient Heroine in Popular Girls' Fiction." *Women's Studies*. 6.2 [1979]: 187-203.
- Bolger, F.W.P. *The Years Before "Anne"*. Charlottetown: PEI Heritage Foundation, 1974.
- Bruce, Harry. *Maud: The Life of L.M. Montgomery*. Toronto: Seal Bantam, 1992.
- Careless, Virginia. "The Hijacking of 'Anne'." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 67 [1992]: 48-55.
- Chapman, Ethel. "The Author of Anne." *MacLean's Magazine*. 32 [October 1919]: 102, 104, 106.
- Clarkson, Adrienne. "Foreword." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. ix-xii.
- Classen, Constance. "Is *Anne of Green Gables* an American Import?" *Canadian Children's Literature*. 55 [1989]: 42-50.
- Coldwell, Joyce-Ione Harrington. "Folklore as Fiction: The Writings of L.M. Montgomery." *Folklore Studies in Honour of Herbert Halpert*. Ed. Kenneth Goldstein and Neil Rosenburg. St John's, Nfld: Memorial U of Newfoundland, 1980. 125-135.
- Cowan, Ann S. "Canadian Writers: Lucy Maud and Emily Byrd." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 1.3 [Autumn 1975]: 42-49.
- Drain, Susan. "Community and the Individual in *Anne of Green Gables*: The Meaning of Belonging." *Such a Simple Little Tale: Critical Responses to L.M. Montgomery's Anne of Green Gables*. Ed. Mavis Reimer. 119-130.
- Edwards, Owen Dudley. "L.M. Montgomery's *Rilla of Ingleside*: Intention, Inclusion, Implosion." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 126-136.
- Edwards, Owen Dudley and Jennifer H. Litster, "The End of Canadian Innocence: L.M. Montgomery and the First World War." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 31-46.
- Epperly, Elizabeth R. "L.M. Montgomery and the Changing Times." *Acadiensis*. XVII.2 [Spring 1988]: 177-185.
- Epperly, Elizabeth R. *The Fragrance of Sweet Grass: L.M. Montgomery's Heroines and the Pursuit of Romance*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1992.

- Ferns, John. "'Rainbow Dreams': the poetry of Lucy Maud Montgomery." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 42 [1986]: 29-40.
- Fredeman, Jane Cowan. "'The Land of Lost Content: The Use of Fantasy in L.M. Montgomery's Novels.'" *Canadian Children's Literature*. 1.3 [August 1975]: 60-70.
- Gammel, Irene and Elizabeth Epperly. eds. *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1999.
- Gerson, Carole. "'Dragged at Anne's Chariot Wheels': L.M. Montgomery and the Sequels to *Anne of Green Gables*." *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada*. 35.2 [Fall 1997]: 143-159.
- Gillen, Mollie. *The Wheel of Things: A biography of L.M. Montgomery, author of Anne of Green Gables*. Don Mills, ON.: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1975. rpt. Halifax, NS: Goodread Biographies, 1983.
- Hamilton, Kathleen and Sibyl Frei. *Finding Anne on Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown, PEI: Ragweed, 1991.
- Johnston, Rosemary Ross. "'Reaching beyond the Word': Religious Themes as 'Deep Structure' in the 'Anne' Books of L.M. Montgomery." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 88 [Winter 1997]: 7-18.
- Katsura, Yuko. "Red-haired Anne in Japan." *Canadian Children's Literature* 34.5[1984]: 57-60.
- Lefebvre, Benjamin. "Walter's Closet." *Canadian Children's Literature* 94 [Summer 1999]: 7-20.
- Litster, Jennifer H. "An Annotated *Anne*: The History and the Dream." *Canadian Children's Literature* 88 [Winter 1997]: 61-73.
- Little, Jean. "But what about Jane?" *Canadian Children's Literature*. 1.3[Autumn 1975]: 71-81.
- McCabe, Kevin. "Lucy Maud Montgomery: the person and the poet." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 38 [1985]: 68-80.
- McCune, Greg. "Japanese couples wedded to Canada's island classic." *The Guardian*. July 18, 1995.
- MacLulich, T.D. "L.M. Montgomery's Portraits of the Artist: Realism, Idealism, and the Domestic Imagination." *English Studies in Canada*. 11.4 [1985]: 459-473.
- MacLulich, T.D. "*Anne of Green Gables* and the Regional Idyll." *Dalhousie Review* 63.3 [1983]: 488-501.
- Mahon, A.W. "The Old Minister in the Story Girl." *Canadian Magazine*. [March 1912]: 452-54.
- Mustard, Margaret H. *L.M. Montgomery as Mrs Ewan Macdonald of the Leaskdale Manse, 1911-1926*. Leaskdale, ON: St Paul's Presbyterian Women's Association, 1965.
- Pike, E. Holly. "(Re)Producing Canadian Literature: L.M. Montgomery's Emily Novels." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 64-76.
- Reimer, Mavis. *Such a Simple Little Tale: Critical Responses to L.M. Montgomery's Anne of Green Gables*. Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, 1992.
- Ridley, Hilda M. *The Story of L.M. Montgomery*. 1955. London: George Harrap & Co., 1956.

- Ross, Catherine Sheldrick. "Calling back the Ghost of the Old-Time Heroine: Duncan, Montgomery, Atwood, Laurence, and Munro." *Studies in Canadian Literature*. 4.1 [1979]: 43-58.
- Ross, Catherine Sheldrick. "Readers Reading L.M. Montgomery." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 23-35.
- Rothwell, Erika. "Knitting Up the World: L.M. Montgomery and Maternal Feminism in Canada." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 133-144.
- Rubio, Jennie. "'Strewn with Dead Bodies': Women and Gossip in *Anne of Ingleside*." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 167-177.
- Rubio, Mary. "Subverting the trite: L.M. Montgomery's 'room of her own'." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 65 [1992]: 6-39.
- Rubio, Mary. "*Anne of Green Gables*: The Architect of Adolescence." *Such a Simple Little Tale: Critical Responses to L.M. Montgomery's Anne of Green Gables*. Ed. Mavis Reimer. 65-82.
- Rubio, Mary Henley ed. *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery, Essays on Her Novels and Journals*. Guelph, ON: Canadian Children's P, 1994.
- Rubio, Mary and Elizabeth Waterston. *Writing a Life: L.M. Montgomery*. Toronto: ECW Press, 1995.
- Rubio, Mary Henley. "L.M. Montgomery: Scottish-Presbyterian Agency in Canadian Culture." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 89-105.
- Russell, Ruth Weber, D.W. Russell, and Rea Wilmshurst. *Lucy Maud Montgomery: A Preliminary Bibliography*. Waterloo, ON: U of Waterloo Library, 1986.
- Sorfleet, John R. *L.M. Montgomery: An Assessment*. Guelph, ON: Canadian Children's Press, 1976.
- Squire, Shelagh J. *Tourist Development and a Literary Landscape: L.M. Montgomery's Prince Edward Island*. Ottawa, np., 1988.
- Thomas, Clara. "Anne Shirley's American Cousin: *The Girl of the Limberlost*." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 58-63.
- Thomas, Gillian. "The Decline of Anne: Matron vs. Child." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 1.3 [Autumn 1975]: 37-41.
- Trillin, Calvin. "Anne of the Red Hair: What do the Japanese see in Anne of Green Gables?" *The New Yorker*. August 5, 1996: 56-61.
- Tye, Diane. "Women's Oral Narrative Traditions as Depicted in Lucy Maud Montgomery's Fiction, 1918-1939." *Thomas H. Raddall Symposium No. 2, Acadian University 3-6 October 1991: Atlantic Literature and Culture, 1918-1939*. Ed. Gwendolyn Davies Fredericton, NB: Acadiensis Press, 1993.
- Wachowicz, Barbara. "L.M. Montgomery: at home in Poland." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 46 [1987]: 7-36.
- Waterston, Elizabeth. "Lucy Maud Montgomery." *The Clear Spirit: Twenty Canadian Women and Their Times*. Ed. Mary Quale Innes. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1966.

- Waterston, Elizabeth. "Marigold and the Magic of Memory." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 155-166.
- Waterston, Elizabeth. *Kindling Spirit: L.M. Montgomery's Anne of Green Gables*. Toronto: ECW Press, 1993.
- Waterston, Elizabeth. "The Poetry of L.M. Montgomery." *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture*. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 77-84.
- Weale, David. "No Scope for Imagination: Another Side of *Anne of Green Gables*." *The Island Magazine* 20 [Fall-Winter 1986]: 3-8.
- Weber, Ephraim. "L.M. Montgomery as a Letter Writer." *Dalhousie Review*. [Oct. 1942]: 300-310.
- Wiggins, Genevieve. *L.M. Montgomery*. Twayne's World Authors Series. New York: Twayne Publishers, 1992.
- Wilmshurst, Rea. "L.M. Montgomery's use of quotations and allusions in the 'Anne' books." *Canadian Children's Literature*. 56 [1989]: 15-45.
- White, Gavin. "The Religious Thought of L.M. Montgomery." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Ed. Mary Henley Rubio. 84-88.

WORKS CITED

- Adams, Ian and Meredyth Somerville. *Cargoes of Despair and Hope: Scottish Emigration to North America, 1603-1803*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1993.
- Alexander, Flora. "The Idea of the Highlander in *The Diviners*." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 83-90.
- Anthony, Edward. *Thy Rod and Staff*. London: Little, Brown & Co., 1995.
- Atwood, Margaret. *Survival: A Thematic Guide to Canadian Literature*. Toronto: Anansi Press, 1972.
- Atwood, Margaret. "Canadian Monsters: Some Aspects of the Supernatural in Canadian Fiction." *The Canadian Imagination: Dimensions of a Literary Culture*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 1977. 97-122.
- Avery, Gillian. *Behold the Child: American Children and their Books*. London: The Bodley Head, 1994.
- Barrie, J.M. *A Window in Thrums*. 1889. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1894.
- Barrie, J.M. *Auld Licht Idylls*. 1888. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1892.
- Barrie, J.M. *The Little Minister*. 1891. London: Cassell and Company, 1893.
- Barrie, J.M. *Sentimental Tommy*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1896.
- Barrie, J.M. *What Every Woman Knows*. 1908. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1918.
- Barrie, J.M. *Peter Pan: or, The Boy who Would Not Grow Up*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1928.
- Barrie, J.M. *Mary Rose*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1924.
- Beck, Boyde. *The Isle of Contentment: The Scots on PEI*. Charlottetown: Prince Edward Island Museum and Heritage Foundation, 1991.
- Bennett, Margaret. *The Last Stronghold: The Scottish Gaelic Traditions of Newfoundland*. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1989.
- Bennett, Margaret. *Scottish Customs from the Cradle to the Grave*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992.
- Bennett, Margaret. *Oatmeal and the Catechism: Scottish Gaelic Settlers in Quebec*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1998.
- Beveridge, Craig and Ronald Turnbull. *The Eclipse of Scottish Culture: Inferiorism and the Intellectuals*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1989.
- Bird, Will R. *These are the Maritimes*. Toronto: Ryerson, 1959.
- Bitterman, Rusty. "Agrarian Protest and Cultural Transfer: Irish Immigrants and the Escheat Movement on Prince Edward Island." *The Irish in Atlantic Canada, 1780-1900*. Ed Thomas P. Power. Fredericton, NB: New Ireland Press, 1991. 96-106.
- Blake, George. *Barrie and the Kailyard School*. London: Arthur Barker Ltd., 1951.
- Bolger, F.W.P. *Canada's Smallest Province: A History of Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: PEI Centennial Commission, 1973.
- Bratton, J.S. *The Impact of Victorian Children's Literature*. London: Croon Helm, 1981.
- Briggs, Julia. *A Woman of Passion: The Life of E. Nesbit, 1858-1924*. London: Hutchison, 1987.
- Briggs, K.M. *The Fairies in Tradition and Literature*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1967.

- Briggs, Katharine. *A Dictionary of Fairies, Hobgoblins, Bogies, and other Supernatural Creatures*. London: Allen Lane, 1976.
- Brown, George Douglas. *The House with the Green Shutters*. 1901. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985.
- Buchan, John. *Witch Wood*. 1927. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1988.
- Buchan, John (Lord Tweedsmuir). *Canadian Occasions*. Toronto: The Musson Book Company Ltd., 1941.
- Bumsted, J.M. "The Stewart Family and the Origins of Political Conflict on PEI." *The Island Magazine*. 9 [Spring-Summer 1981]: 12-18.
- Bumsted, J.M. "Highland Emigration to the Island of St John and the Scottish Catholic Church, 1769-1774." *Dalhousie Review*. 58 [1978]: 511-527.
- Bumsted, J.M. "Lord Selkirk of Prince Edward Island." *The Island Magazine*. 5 [Fall-Winter 1978]: 3-8.
- Bumsted, J.M. "Captain John MacDonald and the Island." *The Island Magazine*. 6 [Spring-Summer 1979]: 15-20.
- Bumsted, J.M. "Settlement by Chance: Lord Selkirk and Prince Edward Island." *The Canadian Historical Review*. LIX.2 [June 1978]: 171-188.
- Bumsted, J.M. "Sir James Montgomery and Prince Edward Island, 1767-1803." *Acadiensis*. VII.2 [Spring 1978]: 76-102.
- Bumsted, J.M. "Scottish Emigration to the Maritimes, 1770-1815: A New Look at an Old Theme." *Acadiensis*. X.2 [Spring 1981]: 65-85.
- Bumsted, J.M. "'The Only Island There Is': The Writing of Prince Edward Island History." *The Garden Transformed: Prince Edward Island, 1945-1980*. Ed. Smitheram, Vernon, David Milne, and Satadal Dasgupta. Charlottetown: Ragweed Press, 1982. 11-38.
- Bumsted, J.M. "The Patterson Regime and the Impact of the American Revolution on the Island of St. John, 1775-1786." *Acadiensis*. XIII.1 (Autumn 1983): 47-67.
- Bumsted, J.M. *The People's Clearance 1770-1815: Highland Emigration to British North America*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1982.
- Bumsted, J.M. *Land, Settlement, and Politics on Eighteenth-Century Prince Edward Island*. Kingston & Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 1987.
- Burnett, Frances Hodgson. *A Little Princess*. 1905. Harmondsworth: Puffin, 1985.
- "M. A. C." "The Lord Selkirk Settlers in P.E. Island." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine* [1902-1903].
- Callbeck, Lorne C. *The Cradle of Confederation: A brief history of Prince Edward Island from its discovery in 1534 to the present time*. Fredericton, NB: Brunswick Press, 1964.
- Cameron, V.R. *Emigrants from Scotland to America, 1774-5*. Baltimore, 1965.
- Campbell, Duncan. *History of Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: Bremner, 1875.
- Campbell, Ian. *Kailyard*. Edinburgh: Ramsay Head Press, 1981.
- Campbell, Maida and Roy. "The Murder at Goblin Hollow." *The Island Magazine*. 2 [Spring-Summer, 1976]: 33-35.
- Campbell, William Wilfred. *The Scotsman in Canada. Vol. I Eastern Canada*. London: Sampson Low, Marston & Co., Ltd, 1912.
- Carter, Ian. "Kailyard: The Literature of Decline in Nineteenth Century Scotland." *The Scottish Journal of Sociology*. 1.1 [Nov. 1976]: 1-13.

- Calder, Angus. *Revolving Culture: Notes from the Scottish Republic*. London: I.B. Tauris, 1994.
- Chambers, Robert. *Popular Rhymes of Scotland*. Edinburgh, 1870.
- Chevalier, Tracy. ed. *Twentieth Century Children's Writers*. Chicago and London: St James Press, 1989.
- Christie, Agatha. *The Thirteen Problems*. 1932. London: Pan, 1961.
- Clark, Andrew Hill. *Three Centuries and the Island: A Historical Geography of Settlement and Agriculture in Prince Edward Island*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1959.
- Connor, Ralph. *Glengarry Days* [i.e. *Glengarry School Days*]. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1902.
- Coolidge, Susan. *What Katy Did at School*. London: Andrew Dakers Ltd., nd..
- Craig, Cairns. *Out of History: Narrative Paradigms in Scottish and British Culture*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1996.
- Craig, David. *On the Crofters' Trail: In search of the Clearance Highlanders*. 1990. London: Jonathan Cape Ltd., 1993.
- Crawford, Isabella Valancy. *Old Spookses' Pass and other Poems*. Toronto, 1884
- Daiches, David ed. *The New Companion to Scottish Culture*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1993.
- Davies, Gwedolyn. "Capturing the British Literary Market: Marshall Saunders and Late Nineteenth-Century Canadian Writing." *Imperial Canada, 1867-1917*. Ed. Colin M. Coates. Edinburgh: Centre of Canadian Studies, 1997. 166-176.
- Davies, Gwedolyn. "Margaret Marshall Saunders: Making Regionalism International." *Literature of Region and Nation*. Ed. Winnifred M. Boggaard. Saint John, NB: SSHRC/ U of NB, 1998. 143-156.
- Devine, T.M. "Landlordism and Highland Emigration." *Scottish Emigration and Scottish Society*. Ed. T.M. Devine. Edinburgh. John Donald, 1992. 84-103.
- Dickens, Charles. *Our Mutual Friend*. 1864-65. London: Penguin, 1985.
- Dobson, David. *Dictionary of Scottish Settlers in North America, 1625-1825 Vol. II*. Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing, 1984.
- Donaldson, Gordon. *The Scots Overseas*. London: Robert Hale, 1966.
- Donaldson, William. *Popular Literature in Victorian Scotland: Language, Fiction and the Press*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1986.
- Douglas, Thomas, Earl of Selkirk. *Observations on the Present State of the Highlands of Scotland, with a View of the Causes and Probable Consequences of Emigration*. 1805. Edinburgh: Constable, 1806.
- Doyle, Sir Arthur Conan. *The Coming of the Fairies*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1922.
- Duncan, Jane. *My Friends The Miss Boyds*. 1959. London: Corgi, 1987.
- Dunlop, Jean. *The Clan Gordon: "Cock o' the North"*. Edinburgh: Johnston & Bacon, 1955.
- Dunn, Charles W. *Highland Settler: A Portrait of the Scottish Gael in Nova Scotia*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1953.
- Fenton, Alexander. *Country Life in Scotland: Our Rural Past*. 1987. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1991.
- Finlayson, Ian. *The Scots*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987.

- Fletcher, J.H. "A Reckless Adventure." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. 1:7 [Sept. 1899]: 255-258.
- Flinn, Michael. *Scottish Population History from the Seventeenth Century to the 1930s*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1977.
- Flint, Kate. "Arthur Hughes as Illustrator for Children." *Children and their Books: A Celebration of the Work of Iona and Peter Opie*. Ed. Gillian Avery and Julia Briggs. 1988. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990. 201-220.
- Forrester, Wendy. *Great Grandmama's Weekly: A Celebration of The Girls' Own Paper. 1880-1901*. Guilford: Lutterworth Press, 1980.
- Foster, Eldon and Evelyn. *French River and Park Corner History, 1773-1973*. n.p.: Coronation Women's Institute, 1973.
- Foster, Shirley and Judy Simons. *What Katy Read: feminist re-readings of "classic" stories for girls*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1995.
- Frazer, Frances M. "Island Writers." *Canadian Literature*. 68-69 [Spring-Summer 1976]: 76-87.
- Frye, Northrop. "Conclusion." *Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English*. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1965. 821-849.
- Frye, Northrop. *The Bush Garden: Essays on the Canadian Imagination*. Toronto: Anansi Press, 1971.
- Frye, Northrop. "Haunted by Lack of Ghosts: Some Patterns in the Imagery of Canadian Poetry." *The Canadian Imagination: Dimensions of a Literary Culture*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 1977. 22-45.
- Fullerton, Rev T.F. "Precis of the History of the Presbyterian Church in Prince Edward Island." *Past and Present of Prince Edward Island*. Eds. D.A. MacKinnon and A.B. Warburton. Charlottetown: B.F. Bowen & Co., nd.
- Fussell, Paul. *The Great War and Modern Memory*. 1975. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1977.
- Galbraith, John Kenneth. *The Scotch*. Toronto: Macmillan, 1964.
- Galbraith, J.K. *A Life in Our Times: Memoirs*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1981.
- Gardner, Alexander. *The Songs of Scotland*. 3rd ed. Paisley, London: np., 1893.
- Geras, Adèle. "Just Wild About Harry." *The Scotsman* 8 July 1999: 13.
- Gibbon, Lewis Grassie [James Leslie Mitchell]. *Sunset Song*. 1932. Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1993.
- Gibbon, Lewis Grassie [James Leslie Mitchell]. *A Scot's Quair*. 1946. Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1995.
- Gibbons, Stella. *Cold Comfort Farm*. 1932. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1956.
- Grahame, Kenneth. *The Penguin Kenneth Grahame: The Golden Age, Dream Days, The Wind in the Willows*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1983.
- Grahame, Kenneth. *The Wind in the Willows*. 1908. London: Methuen, 1970.
- Grant, I.F. *Highland Folkways*. 1961. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1989.
- Greenhill, Basil & Ann Giffard. *Westcountrymen in Prince Edward's Isle: A Fragment of the Great Migration*. 1967. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1975.
- Grieve, Mrs M. *A Modern Herbal*. 1931. Chatham: Cresset Press, 1994.
- Hall, Donald. *The Oxford Book of Children's Verse in America*. New York: Oxford UP, 1985.
- Harvey, D.C. ed. *Journeys to the Island of St. John, or Prince Edward Island, 1775-1832*. Toronto: Macmillan, 1955.

- Hathaway, E.J. "The Trail of the Romanticist in Canada." *Canadian Magazine*. 34 [April 1910]: 529-537.
- Herdman, John. *The Double in Nineteenth-Century Fiction*. Basingstoke: Macmillan Press, 1990.
- Holman, Carrie Ellen. *Our Island Story*. Summerside, PEI: The Journal Publishing Company Ltd., 1955.
- Holman, H.T. "The Prince Edward Island Magazine." *The Island Magazine*. 2 [Spring-Summer 1976]: 18-19.
- Hornby, Susan. *Celts and Ceilidhs: A History of Scottish Societies on Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown: The Caledonian Club, 1981.
- Hornby, Susan J. ed. *Belfast People: An Oral History of Belfast Prince Edward Island*. Charlottetown, PEI: Tea Hill Press, 1992.
- Hunter, James. *A Dance Called America: The Scottish Highlands, the United States and Canada*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1994.
- Johnson, Samuel. *A Journey to the Western Isles of Scotland*. 1775. London: Philip Allan, 1925.
- Jones, Orlo and Douglas Fraser. "Genealogy: Those Elusive Immigrants, Part Two." *The Island Magazine*. 17 [Summer 1985]: 32-37.
- Kennedy, Michael. "Emigrants on the Edinburgh, 1771: A New Passenger List for Prince Edward Island." *The Island Magazine*. 39 [Spring-Summer 1996]: 39-42.
- Kennedy, Mike. *Is Leis an Tighearna An Talamh Agus An Lan (The Earth and all it Contains Belongs to God): The Scottish Gaelic Settlement History of Prince Edward Island*. PhD Thesis, U of Edinburgh, 1995.
- Kielly, G. Harry. *History of the Montgomery Settlers and others at Stanhope—Covehead—Brackley Pt., 1770-1970*. Stanhope, PEI: Stanhope Women's Institute, 1970.
- Kipling, Rudyard. *Puck of Pook's Hill*. 1906. London: Macmillan, 1965.
- Kipling, Rudyard. *Rewards and Fairies*. 1910. London: Pan, 1986.
- Kirk, Robert. *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies*. 1691. Stirling: Eneas Mackay, 1933.
- Klickmann, Flora. *The Flower-Patch Among the Hills*. 1916. London: Religious Tract Society, 1923.
- Klinck, Carl F. *Literary History of Canada, Vol. I: Canadian Literature in English*. 2nd edition 1976. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1977.
- Knowles, Thomas D. *Ideology, Art and Commerce: Aspects of Literary Sociology in the Late Victorian Scottish Kailyard*. Gothenburg Studies in English 54, 1983.
- Kulyk Keefer, Janice. *Under Eastern Eyes: A Critical Reading of Maritime Fiction*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1987.
- Kulyk Keefer, Janice. "Writing and Fathers and Daughters and Death." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 148-162.
- Lamont, Murdoch. "The Lyndale Mystery, or Goblin Hollow." *The P.E.I. Magazine*. IV.9 [Nov. 1902]: 320-323.
- Laurence, Margaret. *The Diviners*. 1974. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1988.
- Laurence, Margaret. *Heart of a Stranger*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1976.
- Lawson, James P. "The Princetown Pioneers, 1769-1771: The Anatomy of a Migration." *The Island Magazine*. 38 [Fall/ Winter 1995]: 7-14.

- Lawson, James P. "Passengers on the 'Alexander'." *The Island Magazine*. 29 [Spring-Summer 1991]: 34-39.
- Lazell, David. *Flora Klickmann and Her Flower Patch*. published privately, 1976.
- Leacock, Stephen. *Nonsense Novels*. 1911. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart (New Canadian Library), 1969.
- Leacock, Stephen "Andrew Macphail." *Queen's Quarterly*. 45 [Winter 1938]: 445-452.
- Lennox, John. "Les anciens Canadiens: Aubert de Gaspé and Scott." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 39-48.
- Lewis, C.S. *The Voyage of the Dawn Treader*. 1952. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1970.
- Lockerby, Earle. "'The Princetown Pioneers' Re-Visited." *The Island Magazine*. 39 [Spring-Summer 1996]: 43-44.
- Lockerby, Elizabeth N. *The Wild Brier: or, Lays by an Untaught Minstrel*. Charlottetown, PEI: G. Bremner, 1866.
- Logan, J.D. & Donald G. French. *Highways of Canadian Literature: A Synoptic Introduction to the Literary History of Canada (English) from 1760-1924*. 1924. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1928.
- Lurie, Alison. *Don't Tell the Grown-ups: Subversive Children's Literature*. London: Bloomsbury, 1990.
- Lynch, Michael. *Scotland: A New History*. 1991. London: Pimlico, 1992.
- MacDonald, Ann-Marie. *Fall on Your Knees*. London: Jonathan Cape Ltd., 1996.
- MacDonald, Edward. "The Yankee Gale." *The Island Magazine*. 38 [Fall-Winter 1995]: 17-25.
- MacDonnell, Margaret. "Bards on the 'Polly'." *The Island Magazine*. 5 [Fall-Winter 1978]: 34-39.
- MacDonnell, Margaret. *The Emigrant Experience: Songs of the Highland Emigrants in North America*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1982.
- MacEwen, Andrew B.W. "The 'Falmouth' Passengers." *The Island Magazine*. 10 [Fall-Winter 1981]: 12-19.
- McGuigan, Peter. "Tenants and Troopers: The Hazel Grove Road, 1865-68." *The Island Magazine*. 32 [Fall-Winter 1992]: 22-28.
- MacInnes, Allan I. *Clanship, Commerce and the House of Stuart, 1603-1788*. East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 1996.
- Mackay, Iain R. "Glenalladale's Settlement, Prince Edward Island." *Scottish Gaelic Studies*. 10 [1965]: 16-24.
- McKay, Ian. "Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954." *Acadiensis*. XXI.2 [Spring 1992]: 5-47.
- Mackay, James A. R.B. *A Biography of Robert Burns*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1992.
- MacKinnon, Jonathan. (trans. Norman Macdonald). "A Tour to Prince Edward Island." *The Island Magazine*. 12 [Fall-Winter 1982]: 7-10.
- Maclaren, Ian. *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush*. 1894. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1895.
- Maclaren, Ian. *The Days of Auld Lang Syne*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1895.
- Maclaren, Ian. *Kate Carnegie and Those Ministers*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1896.

- McLean, Marianne. *The People of Glengarry: Highlanders in Transition*. Montreal: McGill-Queens UP, 1991.
- MacLennan, Hugh. *Scotsman's Return, and Other Essays*. London: William Heineman Ltd., 1961.
- MacLeod, Alistair. *The Lost Salt Gift of Blood*. London: Flamingo, 1993.
- MacLeod, Anne Scott. *American Childhood: Essays on Children's Literature of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries*. Athens, Georgia: U of Georgia P, 1994.
- MacLulich, T.D. *Hugh MacLennan*. Boston: Twayne World Authors Series, 1983.
- MacLulich, T.D. *Between Europe and America: The Canadian Tradition in Fiction*. Toronto: ECW Press, 1988.
- McLynn, Frank. *Robert Louis Stevenson: A Biography*. London: Hutchison, 1993.
- MacMechan, Archibald. *The Headwaters of Canadian Literature*. 1924. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1968.
- McNaught, Kenneth. *The Pelican History of Canada*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1982.
- McNeill, John T. *The History and Character of Calvinism*. New York: Oxford UP, 1954.
- Macphail, Andrew. *The Master's Wife*. Montreal: Jeffrey Macphail & Dorothy Livesay, 1939.
- Macqueen, Malcolm A. *Hebridean Pioneers*. Winnipeg: np., 1957.
- McShannock, Robert H. *McShenoig-McShannon of Southend and Campbeltown: A Study of Our Family*. published privately, 1986.
- MacTaggart, Charles. "The Lowland Church of Campbeltown from its foundation in 1654 till the Disruption." Reprinted from *The Campbeltown Courier*, December 3, 1924.
- Malpeque and its People*. Summerside, PEI: The Malpeque Historical Society, nd.
- Meigs, Cornelia ed. *A Critical History of Children's Literature*. New York: Macmillan, 1953.
- Miller, Karl. *Doubles: Studies in Literary History*. 1985. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987.
- Mollison, John. "Reminiscent." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. II.7 [September 1900]: 231-2.
- Montgomery, R.C. *Down the Years with the Montgomerys*. published privately, nd.
- Montgomery, Thomas Harrison. *Genealogical History of the Family of Montgomery including the Montgomery Pedigree*. Philadelphia: private circulation, 1863.
- de Montgomery, B.G. *Origins and History of the Montgomerys*. Edinburgh, London: William Blackwood, 1948.
- Nesbit, E. *The Wouldbegoods*. 1901. Harmondsworth: Puffin, 1975.
- Nicholson, Colin. "'There and not there': Aspects of Scotland in Laurence's Writing." *Critical Approaches to the Fiction of Margaret Laurence*. Ed. Colin Nicholson. London: Macmillan, 1990. 162-176.
- Opie, Iona and Moira Tatem. *A Dictionary of Superstitions*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1989.
- Parsons, Coleman O. *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1964.
- Patterson, James. *History of the County of Ayr*. Ayr: John Dick/ Paisley: Robert Stewart, 1852.

- Patterson, Rev. John. *Missionary Life Among the Cannibals: being the life of the Rev. John Geddie, D.D., First Missionary to the New Hebrides*. Toronto: James Campbell & Sons, 1882.
- Pigot, F.L. *John Stewart of Mount Stewart*. Summerside, PEI: Prince Edward Island Heritage Foundation, 1974.
- Power, William. *Literature and Oatmeal: What Literature Has Meant to Scotland*. London: George Routledge & Sons, 1935.
- Pratt, T.K. "The Proverbial Islander." *The Island Magazine*. [Fall-Winter] 1981: 8-11.
- Pratt, T.K. *Dictionary of Prince Edward Island English*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1988.
- Pendergast, James and Gertrude. *Folklore Prince Edward Island*. np. [1974].
- Proulx, E. Annie. *The Shipping News*. 1993. London: Fourth Estate, 1994.
- Rayburn, Alan. *Geographic Names of Prince Edward Island*. Ottawa, 1978.
- Reid, W. Stanford, ed. *The Scottish Tradition in Canada*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1976.
- Reiti, Barbara. *Strange Terrain: The Fairy World in Newfoundland*. St. John's, Nfld.: Institute of Social and Economic Research, 1991.
- Rhodenizer, V.B. *A Handbook of Canadian Literature*. Ottawa: Graphic Publishers Ltd., 1930.
- Richards, Eric. *A History of the Highland Clearances. Volume II: Emigration, Protests, Reasons*. London: Croon Helm, 1985.
- Robertson, Ian Ross. "Highlanders, Irishmen, and the Land Question in Nineteenth Century Prince Edward Island." *Comparative Aspects of Scottish and Irish Economic and Social History, 1600-1900*. Ed. L.M. Cullen and T.C. Smout. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1977. 227-240.
- Robertson, Ian Ross. *The Tenant League of Prince Edward Island, 1864-1867: Leasehold Tenure in the New World*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1996.
- Robson, W.W. "E. Nesbit and *The Book of Dragons*". *Children and Their Books: A Celebration of the Work of Iona and Peter Opie*. Ed. Gillian Avery and Julia Briggs. 1989, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990. 251-270.
- Royle, Trevor. *The Macmillan Companion to Scottish Literature*. London: Macmillan, 1983.
- Saxton, Martha. *Louisa May*. London: Andre Deutsch, 1978.
- Scott, Paul H. ed. *Scotland: A Concise Cultural History*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1993.
- Scott, Walter. *Waverley*. 1814. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1994.
- Scott, Walter. *Old Morality*. 1816. London: Collins, nd.
- Scott, Walter. *Rob Roy*. 1817. London: Everyman, 1991.
- Scott, Walter. *The Abbot*. 1820. London: Daily News Ltd., 1901.
- Scott, Walter. *The Monastery*. 1820. London: Daily News Ltd., 1901.
- Sellick, Lester B. *My Island Home*. Windsor, N.S.: Lancelot Press, 1973.
- Sharpe, Errol. *A People's History of Prince Edward Island*. Toronto: Steel Rail, 1976.
- Shaw, John. "Gaelic in Prince Edward Island: A Cultural Remnant". Final Report. Sponsored by the Institute of Island Studies, UPEI and the Celtic Studies Committee. Compiled Summer 1987.

- Shaw, Walter. *Tell Me the Tales*. Charlottetown: Square Deal Publications, 1975.
- Shepherd, Nan. *The Weatherhouse*. 1930. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1988.
- Simons, Judy. *Diaries and Journals of Literary Women from Fanny Burney to Virginia Woolf*. London: Macmillan, 1990.
- Simpson, Harold H. *Cavendish: Its History, Its People: its founding families, Simpsons, Macneills, Clarks and their Kin*. Nova Scotia: published privately, 1973.
- Simpson, Walter. "Cavendish in the Olden Times." *The Prince Edward Island Magazine*. Vol. 1:10 [Dec. 1899], Vol. 1:11 [Jan. 1900], Vol. 2:2 [Apr. 1900], Vol. 2:3 [May 1900] and Vol. 2:5 [July 1900].
- Smith, A.J.M. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and History Anthology*. 3rd ed. Toronto: W.J. Gage, 1957.
- Smout, T.C. *A History of the Scottish People, 1560-1830*. 1969. London: Fontana, 1973.
- Sobey, Douglas ed. "A Journey Across Lot 13 in 1793." *The Island Magazine*. 42 [Fall-Winter 1997]: 25-34.
- Spacks, Patricia Meyer. *Gossip*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1985.
- Staines, David. "Introduction: Canada Observed." *The Canadian Imagination*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1977.
- Stevenson, Robert Louis. *A Child's Garden of Verses*. 1885. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1963.
- Steward, Deborah. "The Island Meets the Auto." *The Island Magazine*. 5 [Fall-Winter 1978]: 9-14.
- Stewart, Chester B. "Roadblock 1810." *The Island Magazine*. 13 [Spring-Summer 1983]: 14-18.
- Stow, Glenys. "Astride a Galloping Pony: Scottish-Canadian Womanhood in Ralph Connor's Neo-Kailyard Novels." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 49-58.
- Strachey, Lytton. *Queen Victoria*. 1921. London: Chatto & Windus, 1931.
- Thomas, Clara. "Margaret, Morag, and the Scottish Ancestors." *British Journal of Canadian Studies*. 7.1 [1992]: 91-101.
- Tweedsmuir, Susan. *John Buchan By His Wife and Friends*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1947.
- Warburton, A.B. *A History of Prince Edward Island*. St John, N.B., 1923.
- Waterston, Elizabeth. "Canadian Cabbage, Canadian Rose." *Twentieth Century Essays on Confederation Literature*. Ed. Lorraine McMullen. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1976. 93-101.
- Waterston, Elizabeth. "The Lowland Tradition in Canadian Literature." *The Scottish Tradition in Canada*. Ed. W. Stanford Reid. 203-231.
- Waterston, Elizabeth. "Scottish Women Writers Abroad: The Canadian Experience." *A History of Scottish Women's Writing*. Ed. Douglas Gifford and Dorothy MacMillan. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1997: 309-315.
- Watson, Roderick. *The Literature of Scotland*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1984.
- Watson, Roderick. "Dialectics of 'Voice' and 'Place': Literature in Scots and English from 1700." *Scotland: A Concise Cultural History*. Ed. Paul H. Scott. 99-125.
- Watkins, Vernon. foreword to *The Golden Age and Dream Days*. New York: Signet Classics (The New American Library), 1964.

- Weale, David. "'The Minister': The Reverend Donald MacDonald." *The Island Magazine*. 3 [Fall-Winter 1977]: 1-6.
- Weale, David. *Them Times*. Charlottetown: Institute of Island Studies, 1992.
- Whittier, J.G. *The Poetical Works of John Greenleaf Whittier*. London: Frederick Warne and Co. 1891.
- Whyte, Donald. *A Dictionary of Scottish Emigrants to Canada Before Confederation*. Vol. I & II. Toronto: Ontario Genealogical Society, 1986.
- Wiggin, Kate Douglas. *Penelope's Experiences in Scotland, being extracts from the commonplace book of Penelope Hamilton*. 1898. London: Gay and Bird, 1901.
- Wiggin, Kate Douglas. *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm*. 1903. London: A & C Black, 1929.
- Withers, Charles. "The Historical Creation of the Scottish Highlands." *The Manufacture of Scottish History*. Ed. Ian Donnachie and Christopher Whatley. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992: 143-156.
- Wittig, Kurt. *The Scottish Tradition in Literature*. Edinburgh, London: Oliver and Boyd, 1958.

Appendix A

An Annotated *Anne*: The History and the Dream

JENNIFER H. LITSTER

CCL 88 [Winter 1997]: 61-73.

First it was Alice, then Lolita, and now, some ninety years after her first appearance, the adventures of another little girl have been annotated. It will come as no surprise to those who have read *Anne of Green Gables* (1908), loved *Anne* and, of late, studied *Anne*, that L.M. Montgomery's most famous novel should merit such annotated attentions, however modest and erroneous the author's description of her work as 'such a simple little tale' (*SJI* [Oct. 15, 1908]: 339). The overnight success and massive popularity of this tale of an orphan girl who 'wasn't a boy' left Montgomery as 'surprised' as the three principal adult protagonists in the novel itself, and, as that success became sequel-demanding, even more often 'properly horrified.'

As Margaret Anne Doody's introduction to *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables* reminds modern readers, the classification of *Anne* as a children's book was not contemporaneous with its publication. It was originally marketed at and read by a general audience, including 'grown-ups' conversant with E. Nesbit, Mark Twain, and Kenneth Grahame (*Anne* 11). Judging from the size and the price (\$39.95 Cdn), this annotated version is also aimed at adults, not first-time and younger readers.

In truth *Anne of Green Gables* partly owes its publication to that appeal to adults. After her manuscript had been rejected by four publishing firms, Montgomery consigned the novel to 'an old hat box in the clothes room' (*SJI*: 331), but unearthing it during a later rummage and turning the pages once more, she found it 'rather interesting' and, as she wrote to her pen-friend Ephraim Weber, was thus 'not without hope that adults may like it a little.'¹ Indeed Montgomery was much less modest in describing her 'best-seller' to the budding writer Weber (to whom, as well as to her Scots friend George Boyd MacMillan, she was always ready to impart advice on literary work). 'Yes,' she wrote, 'I took a great deal of pains with my style. I revised and re-wrote and altered words until I nearly bewildered myself.'²

Montgomery's bewilderment, like as it is to Alice's confusion over words in Looking-Glass Land, is not her only link with Carroll.³ *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* (1865) broke with the convention of moralism in children's fiction in favour of entertainment. When Alice tumbles into Wonderland she recalls such pious tales and the 'unpleasant' things that happen to the children therein 'all because they

would not remember the simple rules their friends had taught them' (*Alice* 31), only to find out that these rules have very little bearing at the bottom of a burrow or through the looking glass of her next adventure. Anne, too, encounters and adapts to a new set of rules in Avonlea, just as the good Mrs Rachel comes to understand that '[t]here was no ciphering [Anne] out by the rules that worked with other children' (*Anne* 325). As we learn in the introduction to *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables*, Montgomery's first published novel was written as a reaction to her truly 'first' novel, *A Golden Carol*, modelled on the Pansy books of Isabella Alden and 'intended...for a "Sunday School Library book"' (*SJ* III: 240). It was rejected by two religious publishing houses and Montgomery burned the manuscript. Prof. Doody rightly attributes much of Anne's success to the fact that 'it is not a work of shallow optimism or conventional piety' (*Anne* 11). Rather, through its heroine, Anne questions the very Sunday-school values upon which such works as *A Golden Carol* were founded.

Montgomery admired juvenile fiction which was "fun for fun's sake" with no insidious moral hidden away in it like a spoonful of jam' (*SJ* I: 263). The fun in *Anne of Green Gables*, demonstrative of Montgomery's skills in storytelling and humour, is essential to the book's popularity. This is especially important with regard to annotation. Martin Gardner in his introduction to *The Annotated Alice* cites G.K. Chesterton's warning on the dangers of Alice scholarship: '[s]he has not only been caught and made to do lessons; she has been forced to inflict lessons on others. Alice is now not only a schoolgirl but a schoolmistress' (*Alice* 7). The annotator must therefore tread carefully, making the necessary explanations, for as Gardner writes, 'no joke is funny unless you see the point of it' (7) but avoiding the distortion of 'fun for fun's sake' into fact for fact's sake. (In one way the annotators of *Anne* have their task made easier. The reader already knows from *The Later Adventures of Anne* — as Montgomery wanted the sequel to be known — that Miss Shirley makes a charming school teacher.) *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables* will therefore stand or fall by how much the annotators add to the fun and how palatable their lessons are.

Unlike *The Annotated Alice*, *The Annotated Anne* offers more than just text-side notations for those who, like Davy Keith, 'want to know.' Under the direction of three editors (Margaret Anne Doody, Mary E. Doody Jones and Wendy Barry) the text of *Anne of Green Gables* has been revised, adjusting variants between the published editions of 1908 (American edition), 1925 (British edition) and 1942 (Canadian edition) and largely remaining faithful to Montgomery's hand-written manuscript. A chronology of the major events in L.M. Montgomery's life precedes the text, along with Professor Doody's introduction which describes the genesis of *Anne* and offers a stimulating analysis of the novel, in part expanding on ideas raised in her recent work, *The True Story of the Novel*. The story is followed by textual notes and short articles on topics which establish the socio-historic and material culture background of *Anne*. Essays on the role of elocution and use of literary allusion in the novel benefit from the inclusion of recitation pieces and songs, many of which would be unknown to modern readers and difficult to trace. Some early reviews of the book, from the North American and British press, are also appended.

As if to answer Alice's query of 'what is the use of a book...without pictures or conversations?' *The Annotated Anne* is illustrated lavishly throughout with scenes from the novel (as conceived by artists of 1908, 1931 and 1933) in addition to

photographs (many from Montgomery's personal collection held in the University of Guelph archives) and drawings which correlate to historical details and geographic settings. In their Preface the editors state their hope that through these various means the reader 'will get a good idea of the world that Anne lived in, as well as a greater understanding of the book's nature and meaning. Above all, we want the reader to enjoy the encounter with Anne herself, and to feel the realities of Montgomery's imagined Avonlea' (*Anne* vii). *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables* runs to some 500 pages yet, astonishingly, lacks an index. Thus, what should be one of its merits — the distribution of information around the book so that the reader is like Mrs Rachel, not overburdened with perception — becomes a deficiency, with this material becoming difficult to retrieve on subsequent readings.

The wisest decision that the editors of *The Annotated Anne* make is not to construct a precise dating structure for events in the novel. As Virginia Careless notes in her review-article, 'The Hijacking of Anne' (a sane and informative work from which *The Annotated Anne* draws wisely and well), although datable events are part of the narrative structure in the Anne series, often they are contradictory and inconsistent. Actual events such as the Liberal election victory in 1896 (*Anne's House of Dreams*) or World War One (*Rilla of Ingleside*) give conflicting 'birth-dates' for Anne, themselves at odds with other details, such as clothing, hairstyles and so forth. In any case, as *Anne of Green Gables* was written as an isolated work, incidents in the later books are not indicative of the time-scale in the first. Virginia Careless (along, she writes, with Parks Canada) situates the events of the first *Anne* book largely in the 1880s: the editors of *The Annotated Anne* have stretched this forward to embrace an imagined setting of the 1890s. Although, as we learn from the essay on orphans, Marilla Cuthbert's casual word-of-mouth application for a boy could legally have been made only anterior to 1882 (*Anne* 428), such details as the visit of Premier Macdonald (1890), the electrification of Charlottetown (1885), harness racing at the Charlottetown exhibition (1890) and the telephone system on P.E.I. (acts in 1885 and 1894) justify them in so doing. Although this policy is not specifically referred to by the editors, the ethos behind it informs both the text-side notes and appended essays. This methodology performs two functions. Firstly, as Professor Doody notes in her essay on 'Homemade Artifacts and Home Life,' *Anne of Green Gables* 'carefully registers a world in transition' (*Anne* 441): 'On the one hand, [Montgomery] understood well the delightful effect that descriptions of the simple life might have on readers. Yet even though she was truly recording the life that she herself knew at the time of writing, and had known in girlhood, that life was already partaking of the appeal of the pastoral' (*Anne* 442).

Unlike some of the 'regional idylls' with which her work is compared, or the fiction of the Scottish Kailyard School which she admired and was influenced by, Montgomery's novels are realistic in their documentation of change.⁴ The cultural clash which stimulates much of the narrative in *Anne of Green Gables* is symbolised in the first chapter by Matthew Cuthbert's horse-and-cart drive to collect the orphan who has arrived by rail. The commercialisation of Anne all too often ignores this realism in favour of the simple and the pastoral, a pitfall *The Annotated Anne* avoids. Secondly this technique, in preventing Anne from becoming too real, keeps Montgomery's artistry alive. *The Annotated Anne* marries factual detail with symbolic meaning, from the choice of flowers in the Barry garden (red flowers for passion, white for purity and death) to the dishes that grace the supper table at

Green Gables. Thus the reader, unlike Marilla, is drawn from the concrete into the 'dubious' paths of the abstract, and is all the better for it.

There is unfortunately a great deal too much of the dubious in the abstract of Montgomery's life which starts this volume. Some of these mistakes may be production errors with events filed under the wrong years: *Anne of the Island* was completed in 1914, not 1913; Ewan's bad mental relapse, the completion of *Emily Climbs* and commencement of *The Blue Castle* belong to 1924 not 1925; *Pat of Silver Bush* was published in 1933 not 1932; the 'talkie' of *Anne of Green Gables* was made in 1934 not 1936. Others may be typographic. The dates given for Maud's arrival in and departure from Prince Albert, the birth of David Bruce Montgomery, the election of 1917 and the church union vote of 1925 all conflict with those recorded in Montgomery's journals. The chronology is confused over Montgomery's stories commissioned by *The Delineator*, making it unclear that the stories requested in 1924 are not those completed in 1925 nor those the ones rejected in 1927. The 1924 stories were about Emily, the 1925 stories about Marigold and it was a further set of Marigold stories that were returned by the new and more fashionable *Delineator* editor. Maud's friendship with her cousin Frede Campbell (b. 1883) did not develop in 1892 but in 1902, as Montgomery (b. 1874) clearly states in her journal (*SJ* II: 302). Montgomery began recopying these journals in 1919, not in 1930. The significant event of that later year was Montgomery's trip west which is omitted from this list, as is the death of her beloved cat 'Good Luck' in 1937. Friendships relevant to *Anne of Green Gables* are ignored: Nate Lockhart who 'warbled the bars in a popular school song -- and looked straight at me when he sang it!' (unpublished journal entry, February 11, 1932), cf. *Anne* 218, and the 'kindred spirits' (*SJ* I: 36), Will and Laura Pritchard. (Anne's phrase 'creepy crawly presentiment' [*Anne* 339] owes its origin to Laura Pritchard [*SJ* I: 55]).

To turn to the text itself, the first difference that the readers of *Anne* will note is the split of the familiar one-sentence first paragraph into two sentences, in line, as a textual note confirms, with the original MS punctuation. Further to this note, there is no commentary on what amounts to a massive and, dare I say, retrograde, change. Although the editors note that for many of the variants between editions, the 1925 British edition agrees with the manuscript, and therefore Montgomery was probably involved in correcting the British proofs, they do not posit the conclusion that she had approved this change, for the first paragraph appears as one sentence in the 1925 edition, as in all others published. Indeed, as Elizabeth Epperly notes, the first paragraph is a 'lengthy imitation of the twists of road and stream it describes and also a mimicry of Rachel Lynde's relentless questionings and vigilance' (*Fragrance* 19). To break this paragraph disturbs that flow. Thankfully most alterations to the text as previously published are those of punctuation and hyphenation. No explanation of Montgomery's notation and revision system is given, despite the fact that this system is constantly referred to, although readers are pointed in the direction of Epperly's essay, 'Approaching the Montgomery Manuscripts.' Space and common-sense disallow a complete delineation of additions to the first draft of the text, and the editors do well to focus much of their attention on additions covering many of the phrases that we now most associate with Anne, illustrating the development of her character in Montgomery's mind over the course of the novel's composition.⁵ Sadly, for what should be a definitive edition of the text, a couple of errors have crept in: Anne's soul is reportedly 'wondering,' not, as it should be,

'wandering' (*Anne* 59); and Mrs. Spencer becomes Mr. Spencer (*Anne* 94) mid-scene. As one would expect, the text-side notations cover points of historical interest, relate the fictional incidents to Montgomery's life and the Prince Edward Island setting and explain words and expressions which may now be unfamiliar.⁶ The vast majority of these notes are informative and well-researched and therefore require no further comment from a reviewer, save to point out that the editors have particularly excelled in identifying Montgomery's legion of literary quotations and allusions, expanding on the late Rea Wilmshurst's initial paper on the subject.⁷ However, it is unfortunately incumbent on the reviewer to point out errors and in so doing, I wish to stress that with some 450 notations, mistakes are few and far between.

In attributing Mrs Lynde's statement, 'A body can get used to anything, even to being hanged, as the Irishman said' to a proverb 'about immunity to pain being based on proximity to it' depending on 'a familiar prejudicial belief that the Irish are particularly prone to criminal activity' (*Anne* 42, n.11), the editors are doubtless identifying a common prejudice, but not one that is being expressed in this case. Mrs Rachel's statement is not a proverb but an example of an 'Irish Bull,' that is, an oxymoronic statement, thus the presence of the Irishman. A body couldn't get used to being hanged for obvious reasons.

Annotations covering the visit of John A. Macdonald (misspelled 'MacDonald' in the notes) are muddled. Firstly, the editors cite Virginia Careless as their authority for dating this visit, ignoring Montgomery's meeting with the Premier in that year (*SJ* I [Aug. 11, 1890]: 25). They fail to mention that Montgomery was, by inclination and by birth, on Mrs Lynde's side in politics (or rather Mrs Lynde was on hers!) until Montgomery cast her first vote in 1917, pro-conscription and thus anti-Laurier. This rather contends with their claim that '[m]ost of the English-speaking people of P.E.I. would have been on the Premier's side (i.e. Conservative) in political matters' (*Anne* 199, n.1), as do election figures from P.E.I., which, although obviously not divided along linguistic lines, show a pretty even split between those voting Conservative and Liberal.⁸ The derivation of the term 'Grit' (*Anne* 202, n.9) is correctly attributed to the phrase 'clear grit' but with no indication that the Clear Grits were a political party who, along with the Parti Rouge and the Reformers, were gradually drawn under the 'Liberal' banner. The slang term 'Grit' for Liberal thus has an earlier genesis than 1884.

Anne's reference to fictional characters who 'lose their hair in fevers or sell it to get money for some good deed' (*Anne* 291, n.10) is rightly annotated by a reference to Jo March in *Little Women* and interestingly by one to Pat Gardiner in Montgomery's *Pat of Silver Bush*. Just as right would have been a reference to Montgomery's short story 'Her Pretty Golden Hair' (*Philadelphia Times* March, 1899) which draws heavily on the Alcott antecedent. A more interesting reference to a character who loses hair in a fever would have been to Montgomery's 'Mary Ethel's Apology' (published in *Household Guest* Dec. 5, 1909: date of composition unknown) in which a red-haired hero called Gilbert, whose girlfriend dislikes his scarlet tresses and breaks off their relationship, loses his hair in a brain-fever after which it grows in auburn. Mary Ethel then apologises and marries Gilbert, although his mother won't believe the minx didn't return purely because Gilbert's hair was now auburn, until Mary Ethel gives birth to a red-haired child! Of interest here is that a male character has the reviled red-hair. Montgomery had teased a Cavendish school boy (not a Prince of Wales College boy as noted in *The Annotated Anne* 29) named

Austin Laird, about his red-hair, calling him 'The Boy with the Auburn Hair' in verse and 'Cavendish Carrots' in the school-yard (unpublished entry Feb. 17, 1893).⁹ In addition, Montgomery's friend Will Pritchard had red hair. Given these male red-haired antecedents, we might once more ask of Anne Shirley why she wasn't a boy.

The notes assert that the name of the Cuthbert's hired boy, Jerry Buote, would be pronounced 'Boot' by the English speakers of Avonlea (*Anne* 82). 'Buote' was a surname among French-Canadians in the Cavendish area and Montgomery's journals contain a specific reference to the phonetic pronunciation as 'Be-ot,' just as Gautier was rendered 'Goachy' and Blacquiére 'Blackair' (unpublished entry March 1, 1925): the property map for Cavendish in 1880 (again reliant on phonetics) lists one Peter Beott.¹⁰ The editors speculate that the area of French settlement near Avonlea, the Creek, may be based on French River near Clifton, P.E.I., without reference to 'Toronto,' the French settlement near Cavendish, from where Montgomery hired Judy Gallant ('Gallong') when she visited Boston in 1910.

While rightly drawing attention to the prejudices of the Scots in Avonlea toward their French neighbours (and that these were a reflection of attitudes in P.E.I.), the editors offer an unsubstantiated claim that '[t]here is a long history of conflict between the French and Scottish settlers of Prince Edward Island' (*Anne* 45). This rather gives the impression of a series of running battles between the two emigrant groups and that the Scots, Auld Alliance notwithstanding, were the worst of the British nations in the offence. (The one incident of 'conflict' that comes to mind from P.E.I. history was the Belfast Riot of 1847, a fight between Scots and Irish settlers.)

In another case, the editors explain the term 'high dudgeon' as meaning 'very angry, offended, or resentful, from dudgeon, the handle of a knife or dagger, thus, to be "in high dudgeon" is to be ready to draw your dagger' (*Anne* 128-9, n.5). This is to conflate two unrelated meanings of dudgeon which have different etymologies. Wendy Barry adds insult to injury by finding a home for this distorted meaning in 'the Highland Scots' clannish and sometimes contentious culture' (*Anne* 420). Doubtless many high dudgeons were grasped in P.E.I. when the Scots put the boot in the French.

The essays which follow the main text are, with one exception, informative, well-researched, nicely illustrated and with the inclusion of recipes, fun. Essays covering aspects of material culture such as food preparation, gardens, and homecraft are placed within a general context that embraces not only the Prince Edward Island setting but also the influences on the province from the eastern U.S. seaboard and the British Isles. Others, as well as some textual notes, could have benefited from a closer examination of the Cavendish community where L.M. Montgomery was raised. The social mainstay (outside church) of Montgomery's teens and twenties, the Cavendish Literary Society (surely a base for the Avonlea Debating Society), passes without mention in favour of a mystifying reference to 'brass bands, orchestras, step-dancing competitions, French ballads and ... toe-tapping fiddle playing' (*Anne* 452). Many of these activities would have been anathema to the Presbyterian residents of Cavendish: to the Baptists even worse.

It would have emphasised the importance of education to know that the first school was founded in Cavendish in 1814, only 24 years after the Scottish Simpson, Clark and Macneill families first cleared land for settlement. The essay on the 'geography' of *Anne* comes without a map of the Island or of the Cavendish area.

Montgomery's decision to create a religiously homogenous community when she came from one that was divided, often bitterly so, might have been addressed. (This may result from the same purpose that Mary E. Doody Jones identifies for the exclusion of pets and named animals in the book (*Anne* 424) —Montgomery's desire to focus reader attention on Anne.)

Another thing that should be noted about these essays is that each comes with a list of 'Further Reading.' This is a misnomer. Although these lists may reflect works consulted or cited, they are often comprised of inaccessible material (legislative acts, periodicals, out-of-print books) which would not qualify as 'further reading' for the average, non-academic, reader.

The exception to these generally informative essays relates to 'The Settlers of P.E.I.' The subtitle, 'The Celtic Influence in Anne,' is the first of many mistakes. What the author is actually alluding to is the Scottish influence in Anne, or at a stretch the Irish influence, not the Welsh, or Cornish, or Breton French influence, all of which are embraced in the term 'Celtic.' No distinction is made between Highland and Lowland (or more correctly, Gaelic and non-Gaelic) Scots. Although correct in stating that '[m]any factors contributed to the Scots' departure from their homeland' (*Anne* 419), the author situates these reasons primarily in the Highland Clearances and the expulsion of a sick and poverty stricken tenantry whose culture had been systematically undermined. First, the Highland Clearances Barry wrongly places solely in the late eighteenth century. Secondly, such an analysis pays no heed to serious scholarly work on migration from Scotland to Canada and P.E.I. Early migrants (pre-1815), including L.M. Montgomery's ancestors, were generally from the higher socio-economic groupings who were able to pay their own passage. (Legislative measures in 1803 from a home government fearful of depopulation greatly increased this cost.) To concentrate on a stereotype of victimised Highlanders is to ignore voluntary migration and research which shows the Gaels and other Scots to be neither poor nor desperate, but making a positive rejection of social changes in Scotland in favour of continuing their traditional way of life in North America.¹¹ Widespread poverty and the largest clearances were a feature of post-1820 Scottish history.

The reason I stress this point is that the positive reasons for migration have to be recognised in order to understand the psychology both of Montgomery and her novels. The Murrays and the Lesleys consider themselves 'chosen people' and among these fictional Scots there are levels of caste, dependent on wealth, 'breeding,' and generational distance from the Old Land. The resulting frictions between families are part of the community structure of Blair Water and Glen St. Mary and of course Cavendish itself. When Anne Shirley arrives in Avonlea she enters a 'chosen community,' self-appointed as superior to anything from the United States or Britain. But as the novel shows, in the stale religion and sour gossip, that community is limited. Matthew's infirmity and Marilla's failing eyesight are offset by the outsider Anne, not by caring friends. Far from representing 'clannishness' (*Anne* 421), Matthew and Marilla have no family (until, that is, the appearance of the Keith twins in *Anne of Avonlea*). They are the last of their clan in Avonlea (as are the Lyndes and the Blythes) and the inter-familial squabbling rather puts pay to any wider definition of what constitutes 'clan.'

Anne of Green Gables focuses on a child, yet conversely discusses the problems of growing old. Although Barry's essay hints at Anne's dual presence as a

cultural complement to Avonlea as well as a cultural 'other' (determining the novel's eventual harmony as well as its battles), it is inserted in a fanciful commentary on Anne's 'Celtic' inheritance of a belief in the supernatural. (Incidentally, to call Anne a 'changeling' is risky, given that the lore arises from the need to find cause for deformed or mentally defective children.)¹² The role of the Scots in founding educational policy and the Scottish content of that curriculum is noted, and the schools of Anne's native Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island teach the same texts.¹³

Anne embodies a heritage that Avonlea has lost, not one that it has never known. This point is raised by Professor Doody in her introduction, when she writes that 'Avonlea has partly lost sight of its own identity and inheritance, and thus some of its vision' (*Anne* 30).¹⁴ Anne's outbursts take Matthew and Marilla emotionally back to their childhood: her passionate conversation reminds Matthew of the merry-go-round ride of his 'rash youth' (*Anne* 57); her volley of insults at Mrs Lynde recalls to Marilla the sting of being called a 'dark homely little thing' (*Anne* 117). The process of Anne's acceptance at Green Gables is complete when Marilla shares the story of her youthful romance with John Blythe. By focusing on the stereotypes of Anne's Scottish 'otherworldliness' and its conflict with Marilla's Scottish 'hardheaded practicality,' the essay undermines this earlier observation. For example, it is stated that Marilla keeps her kitchen in the way of her Scottish-born mother and grandmother before her (*Anne* 421). Yet the text-side notes and appended essays rightly show the twin influences of British and North American custom in the Green Gables kitchen. Matthew is more aware than Marilla of his cultural heritage (he loves their mother's Scotch rose-bush) and Anne is instantly accepted in his affections.¹⁵ Marilla is emotionally stifled and thus further removed from this heritage, which is why the novel focuses on her co-learning with Anne. If Anne's red-haired presence is indeed a hint that she is 'fairy bred,' then the distrust the Avonlea residents initially feel toward her is testament to their own belief in the supernatural, all good Scots knowing with Mrs Anthony Mitchell that fairies are 'pesky mischievous' (*Anne of Ingleside* 113).

To call for a more detailed analysis of Cavendish and its settlers may appear to contradict my earlier praise for the editorial decision to concentrate on the periodisation of historical detail. The editors are correct in so doing, for this general context keeps the fictional character Anne within the imaginary landscape. But the editors have also chosen, and again rightly so, to make links between the fictional world of Anne and L.M. Montgomery's life and background. With the publication of Montgomery's journals, interest in her life rivals interest in her heroines and although there are obvious dangers in too much biographic identification, this analysis can be worthwhile, productive and informative.

However, *The Annotated Anne* can be too selective in the information it presents. For example, several references are made to Montgomery's removal from school in Prince Albert, as this neatly fits into a discussion of how the education of boys was prioritised over that of girls. Conversely, her maternal grandparents are praised for their support of her education (thus Matthew and Marilla's support of Anne). Yet the Macneills had also withdrawn the young Maud from school, not because her help was needed in the home, but due to a petty and bitter feud with a Cavendish schoolteacher, Izzie Robinson.¹⁶ To include one example without the other is to distort Montgomery's life to consolidate a theory about her fiction.

Cavendish is Avonlea in more than geography. Much of Montgomery's success lies in her realistic portraits of both character and environment. Such skill is the product of careful observation and this book would have benefited from a more specific look at that Cavendish Montgomery saw and fictionalised. Although strong on Montgomery's upbringing within the Macneill household, there is really very little of the Cavendish community in the references *The Annotated Anne* makes to Montgomery's life: the settlers, religions, ethnicity, and dynamics that went into Montgomery's first novel. If Anne is *of* Green Gables, she is also *of* Avonlea.

In answer, then, to the stated aims in the Preface, the reader is perhaps lacking some of the realities of Montgomery's imagined Avonlea, but the editors have largely succeeded in the task of teaching about Anne's world without denuding it of romance. By such means as the identification of songs and thus Montgomery's ironic twists in contrasting Anne's style of rendition with the songs' subject matter, modern readers can fully appreciate, perhaps for the first time, Montgomery's literary skill. The joke has been explained and is funnier for the explanation.

Uncovering that the 'physical' model for Anne was the scandal-surrounded chorus girl Evelyn Nesbit opens up a tantalising question: was Montgomery really ignorant as to identity of the girl in the picture? Largely, the notes and essays are deftly handled and should appeal to a broad audience, to fans of Anne and to scholars. In short, *The Annotated Anne* should ensure that *Anne of Green Gables* is never dismissed as a 'simple tale' again. The marriage of the history and the dream — of Montgomery's realities and Anne's imagination — is reminiscent of Whittier's reflective poem 'Snowbound' and his description of the aunt who:

Called up her girlhood memories,
The huskings and the apple-bees,
The sleigh rides and the summer sails.
Weaving through all the poor details
And homespun warp of circumstance
A golden woof-thread of romance.

NOTES

¹Letter to Weber dated May 2, 1907 (Eggleston 51). Montgomery's description of the genesis of this novel bears more than a passing resemblance, perhaps suspiciously so, to Walter Scott's account of writing *Waverley*.

²Letter to Weber dated September 10, 1908 (Eggleston 73).

³The comparison of Marilla to the Duchess in Wonderland in her fondness for inculcating a moral (*Anne* 106) is the most obvious textual reference to Carroll's works in *Anne of Green Gables*, although, as the editors of *The Annotated Anne* note, the presence of Tiger-lilies in Diana's garden may in part owe their origin to *Through the Looking Glass* (*Anne* 138). Notably, Anne ignores Marilla's moral on Diana ('she is good and smart, which is better than being pretty') and tells instead of the mirror-girl, Katie Maurice, who she had hoped would lead her through the bookcase (Anne's bookish 'looking-glass' conversely following Marilla's rule on smartness rather than the mere vanity of prettiness) 'into a wonderful place, all flowers and sunshine and fairies' (*Anne* 107). Alice's dismissal of the wonderland characters with, 'You're nothing but a pack of cards' (*Alice* 161) is echoed in Anne's new-found (after Marilla tells her she can stay) inability to identify with another looking-glass alter-ego, Lady Cordelia Fitzgerald (both

Alice and Anne like 'pretending to be two people' [*Alice* 33]), 'You're only Anne of Green Gables' (*Anne* 109). Although taken from the name of Montgomery's imaginary friend, Anne's looking-glass girl, Katie, neatly echoes Alice's Looking-Glass cat, Kitty: more to the point Anne's bosom-chum Diana echoes Alice's closest real-world friend, Dinah. Both little girls experience problems with bottles and cakes which contain curious ingredients. Both encounter contrary, if not contrariwise, twins. Both experience a world where one talks to flowers (and as the editors of *The Annotated Anne* deftly note, Mrs Rachel's address to the wild-rose bushes in the first chapter of *Anne of Green Gables* is a neat link between the outwardly dissimilar matriarch and orphan [*Anne* 436].) Both girls have problems with Sir Isaac Watt's verse 'Against Idleness and Mischief': Alice cannot remember the words and her 'How doth the little crocodile' (*Alice* 38) is now more famous than the poem it parodies; when Anne imagines that she is a bumble bee, her goal is not to 'improve each shining hour' but to drowse lazily in an apple blossom (*Anne* 108). Alice wonders what she'd look like as a snuffed out candle (*Alice* 32): Anne is compared to one (*Anne* 80). Both little girls get very angry when their hair is criticised, Alice's by the Mad Hatter (*Alice* 94), Anne's by Mrs Rachel (*Anne* 114) and call their assailants 'rude.' Both *Anne of Green Gables* and *Through the Looking Glass* contain characters who get annoyed with others who won't argue back: Alice with her kittens, 'How can you talk with a person if they always say the same thing' (*Alice* 341); Marilla with Matthew: 'I wish he was like other men and would talk things out...But what's to be done with a man who just looks?' (*Anne* 82). For links between Carroll's work and *Emily of New Moon* see Robin McGrath, 'Alice of New Moon: The influence of Lewis Carroll on Emily Byrd Starr,' in *Canadian Children's Literature* 65 (1992): 62-67.

⁴Elizabeth Waterston, in her study *Kindling Spirit: L.M. Montgomery's 'Anne of Green Gables'* (ECW Press, 1993) points out that the Cuthberts' white Scottish rose bush recalls the title of Ian Maclaren's Kailyard novel, *Beside the Bonnie Brier Bush* (1894). Montgomery re-read this novel in November of 1905. Her choice of title, in format corresponding to earlier works such as *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm* and *Mrs Wiggs of the Cabbage Patch*, may also be a conflation of Hawthorne's *The House of the Seven Gables* and George Douglas Brown's attack on the pastoralism of the Kailyard School, *The House with the Green Shutters* (1901). *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables*, while strongly defending the right of Anne to be regarded as a general rather than a children's book, does not contextualise the novel with the contemporaneous regional idylls (from both sides of the Atlantic) which were also intended for general circulation.

⁵Margaret Anne Doody's introduction lists the additions 'You could imagine you were dwelling in marble halls, couldn't you?'; 'I've got all my worldly goods in it, but it isn't heavy' and 'It wouldn't be half so interesting ... there'd be no scope for imagination then, wouldn't there?' as examples of 'Montgomery's growing recognition that it is a characteristic of Anne-speech to draw the interlocutor in with interrogatives asking for agreements at the end of sentences' (*Anne* 21).

⁶As goes with the territory, some explanations seem unnecessary: the need to include the chemical formula for strychnine seems somewhat superfluous (47) — and worrisome too, lest any homicidally-inclined orphan girls be around, that's what! — and no great intelligence is required to work out that currant wine is wine made from currants (186), a carpet bag is a travelling bag made from carpet (52) or that a foreign missionary is one who missions in foreign lands (54).

⁷Rea Wilmshurst, 'L.M. Montgomery's Use of Quotations and Allusions in the "Anne" books,' *CCL* 56 (1989): 15-45. It is a testament to Montgomery's literary complexity rather than the editor's negligence that there are perhaps some twenty allusions not referred to in the annotations, e.g. Marilla looking 'things not lawful to be uttered' (*Anne* 214. cf. II Corinthians 12:4); Anne's vow 'as long as the sun and moon should endure' (*Anne* 140. cf. Psalm 72:5); 'the risk of dashing her brains out' (*Anne* 232. cf. William Shakespeare, *Macbeth* I.vii.58) and perhaps the chapter title 'An Epoch in Anne's Life' finds its origin in *The Pickwick Papers* ch. 12 'Descriptive of a very important proceeding on the Part of Mr Pickwick; no less an Epoch in his Life than in this History.' (Montgomery re-read *Pickwick* in 1905.) Only one quotation (although I

have my doubts as to whether the 'tramp of alien feet' [*Anne* 362] has its origin in L. Morris's "An Ode to Free Rome") is wrongly attributed. The first two lines of the poem Julia Bell sends to Anne (*Anne* 194), identified as 'probably a keepsake verse,' are actually Mrs Child's (more famous) misquotation of a couplet from Macdonald Clarke's *Death in Disguise*: 'Whilst Twilight's curtain, gathering far,/ Is pinned with a single diamond star.' [Eds.note: Rea Wilmshurst privately published a more extensive list of identified quotations before her death.]

⁸In 1882 52% of the P.E.I. electorate voted Liberal, 48% Conservative. These figures were replicated in 1891, the election year closest to John A. Macdonald's visit to P.E.I. Indeed, looking at voting figures from 1878 to 1900, the Conservatives only took a greater share of the vote in 1878 (57% to the Liberal 43%). Figures from Hugh G. Thorburn. *Party Politics in Canada*. (3rd ed.) Scarborough, Ont.: Prentice-Hall, 1972.

⁹Elizabeth Waterston notes in *Kindling Spirit* that Austin Laird's father had reputedly been in love with Maud Montgomery's mother: 'a base for the story of lost love told by Marilla' (46).

¹⁰This map can be found in Harold H. Simpson's *Cavendish: Its History, Its People*. Published privately, 1973.

¹¹See J.M. Bumsted, *The People's Clearance 1770-1815: Highland Emigration to British North America*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1982. Marianne McLean, *The People of Glengarry: Highlanders in Transition*, McGill-Queens UP, 1991. Mike Kennedy, *Is Leis an Tighearna An Talamh Agus An Lan (The Earth and all it Contains Belongs to God): The Scottish Gaelic Settlement History of Prince Edward Island*. (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1995.)

¹²Montgomery does use the term 'changeling' with reference to two characters: Jims in *Rilla of Ingleside*, who is 'scrawny, yellow and ugly' and Valancy in *The Blue Castle*, who is considered insane by her relatives.

¹³The pupils of these schools would, unlike the editors of *The Annotated Anne* it seems, have known that Thomas Campbell's 'Hohenlinden' takes a battle between the French and Austrians as its subject matter, not 'the defeat and oppression the Scots suffered at the hands of the English' (*Anne* 457).

¹⁴One scholar holds that Cavendish was settled by Highland-Gaels but that Gaelic culture was probably lost within two generations [Kennedy 168]; at any rate, Montgomery describes the residents as Lowland Scots in a letter to MacMillan [*My Dear* 6].

¹⁵This in itself argues for an interpretation of the novel wherein Matthew and Marilla are treated as separate people. Taking this back to Montgomery's life, *The Annotated Anne* (and they are not alone in this fault), classifies Alexander Macneill and Lucy Woolner as the 'Calvinist' Macneills, emphasising their puritan 'Scottish' traits. Lucy Woolner was of course English (she only left England when she was twelve) and Anglican by birth. We do not know the extent to which she embraced her husband's religion and should be wary of treating them as a unit in this respect.

¹⁶This fight prejudiced Alexander Macneill against female teachers. He would not let Maud borrow a horse so she could attend interviews by school trustees when in search of a teaching post.

WORKS CITED

- Bolger, F.W.P., and Elizabeth R. Epperly, eds. *My Dear Mr. M: Letters to G.B. MacMillan*. Toronto: McGraw, 1980.
- Careless, Virginia. "The Hijacking of 'Anne'." *Canadian Children's Literature* 67 (1992): 48-55. (Review of *The Anne of Green Gables Treasury*. Carolyn Collins and Christina Wyss Eriksson. Toronto: Viking, 1991.)
- Carroll, Lewis. *The Annotated Alice. Alice's Adventures in Wonderland and Through the Looking Glass*. Edited with an Introduction by Martin Gardner. London: Penguin, 1970 (Revised edition).
- Doody, Margaret Anne. *The True Story of the Novel*. New Brunswick: Rutgers UP, 1996.

- Eggleston, Wilfred, ed. *The Green Gables Letters from L.M. Montgomery to Ephraim Weber 1905-1909*. Toronto: Ryerson, 1960.
- Epperly, Elizabeth R. "Approaching the Montgomery Manuscripts." *Harvesting Thistles: The Textual Garden of L.M. Montgomery*. Guelph: Canadian Children's Press, 1994: 74-83.
- Epperly, Elizabeth R. *The Fragrance of Sweet Grass: L.M. Montgomery's Heroines and the Pursuit of Romance*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1992.
- Montgomery, L.M. *The Annotated Anne of Green Gables*. Edited by Margaret Anne Doody, Mary E. Doody Jones, and Wendy Barry. New York: Oxford UP, 1997.
- Montgomery, L.M. *Anne of Ingleside*. London: Harrap, 1949.
- Montgomery, L.M. *The Selected Journals of L.M. Montgomery. Volume I (1889-1910), Volume II(1910-1921), Volume III (1921-1929)*. Edited by Mary Rubio and Elizabeth Waterston. Don Mills, Ont.: Oxford UP, 1985, 1987, 1992.
- Montgomery, L.M. Unpublished journals. Ms XZ5 MS A001. L.M. Montgomery Collection. U of Guelph, Guelph, Ontario.

Appendix B

The End of Canadian Innocence:
L.M. Montgomery and the First World War

OWENDUDLEY EDWARDS and
JENNIFER H. LITSTER

L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture. Ed. Irene Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly. 31-46.

When Marilla Cuthbert surprises Rachel Lynde by telling her that she is adopting a 'born Canadian' orphan, the Canadian setting of *Anne of Green Gables* should be identified for those readers unilluminated by the references to the Gulf of St Lawrence and Nova Scotia. By her prejudice against Barnardo boys, who are not 'native born,' Marilla also makes a surprisingly definitive statement of Canadian nationality for a character whose parents were born in Scotland and who lived on an island only recently and reluctantly confederated into the Dominion.¹ Anne's being twenty-seven at the time of the Liberal victory in the federal election of 1896 puts her birth date at 1869. Her appearance as an eleven-year-old at the beginning of *Anne of Green Gables* thus comes in 1880, only seven years after Prince Edward Islanders belatedly gathered under the Canadian banner.² But L.M. Montgomery's early novels seldom show avowed statements of cohesive Canadian identity: loyalty is more often given to home, to community, and to the Island itself, frequently coupled with an air of personal or collective superiority that works against other villagers, villages, cities, and provinces. Ties remain strong with the country and culture of origin, principally Scotland, but also England and Ireland; hostility and suspicion toward the United States is prevalent from a cast list who have 'no truck or trade with the Yankees.'

Such mixed loyalties reflect Canadian problems in these early years of nationhood: debates over the extent of Canadian involvement in the Boer War had illustrated both the troublesome relationship with the expansionist British Empire and the differing allegiances of Anglophone and Francophone Canadians; anti-American feeling was powerful factor in Laurier's defeat in the reciprocity election of 1911. The advent of the First World War, which brought massive Canadian aid to the British Empire and the Allied countries, contrasted with initial United States' neutrality but was by no means indicative of a new Canadian cohesion, as the largely ethnic divisions over conscription in 1917 would show.³

Montgomery herself had no doubts as to where Canadian loyalty should lie in 1914. Responding angrily to a claim by her pen-friend Ephraim Weber that the

conflict was 'a commercial war and utterly unworthy of one drop of Canadian blood being spilt for it,' Montgomery wrote that 'it is a death-grapple between freedom and tyranny, between modern and mediæval [*sic*] ideals [...] between principles of democracy and militarism.'⁴ Although this reasoning could have appropriately been used by those who had left the tyrannies of the mother country in search of a new freedom in North America, Montgomery countered these objections to British imperialism by recourse to what she saw as a shared ideological heritage.

Conversely, and belying this equation of British with Canadian values, she felt the sacrifices and bloodshed of war would forge real Canadian unity for the first time and produce in their wake great Canadian literature.⁵ For Montgomery, war began with the death (actually stillbirth) of her second child, Hugh, and claimed her closest friend, Frederica Campbell MacFarlane, to the flu epidemic in its wake. Montgomery's four novels written during the war and its immediate aftermath examine the ideology behind Canadian involvement in the war, express Canadian hostility at American neutrality, reflect the alterations in Canadian society resulting from the war, and witness radical changes in Montgomery's own literary style.

Montgomery's War Novels

Taking up work on her sixth Anne book, which followed the fortunes of the Blythe family and Glen St Mary community through the years of the First World War, L.M. Montgomery somewhat paradoxically wrote in her journal that *Rilla of Ingleside* would be the last of that series as Anne 'belongs to the green, untroubled pastures and still waters of the world before the war' (*SJ* 2:309). Anne's shadowy presence and near neurasthenic condition in this novel are indeed indicative of her comparative uselessness and inappropriateness (certainly in contrast to her youngest daughter and maid) in this crisis. Montgomery, describing herself as writing with a purpose for the first time, would seem to be quite deliberate in her intention of conveying the full horror of the war by visiting its ravages on a heroine associated in the public mind both with the isolated regional idyll and peaceful pastoralism.⁶

Certainly Montgomery makes a huge chronological leap between *Rainbow Valley* and *Rilla of Ingleside* (as evidenced in their mutual discrepancies over Anne's children's ages), breaking with the close sequential nature of earlier Anne books in order to write of the war while the experiences were still fresh. However, only the first two Anne books were written in the pre-war still waters; although set years before the shadow of conflict fell, *Anne of the Island*, *Anne's House of Dreams* and *Rainbow Valley* are all to some extent influenced by the war. From an examination of these three earlier novels the implication is that Montgomery was moving as determinedly toward war as the arming European nations.

When Britain declared war on 4 August 1914, Montgomery was part-way through writing 'Anne III,' perhaps making Ruby Gillis her first war casualty. Certainly Montgomery's initial shock and distress are reflected in Anne's bitterness of soul at the end of her college days and in Gilbert's near-tragic illness. *Anne of the Island* closes the Avonlea part of Anne's life; its sequel removes her from an environment where 'people grew up and married and settled down where they were born, or pretty near it,' (*AHD* 13) to a more global outlook: 'Stella is in Vancouver and Pris is in Japan, and Miss Stacey [*sic*] is married in California, and Aunt Jamesina has gone to India to explore her daughter's mission field in spite of her

horror of snakes' (*AHD* 13). In *Anne's House of Dreams*, which takes lines by Rupert Brooke for its motto, the global war's influence is more explicit than in *Anne of the Island*. Through the character of Leslie Moore, the blood-red poppies at her waist and her decision to allow Gilbert to seek a cure for her husband, Montgomery explores the ideology of the conflict. The poppies would be associated by readers with John McCrae's 'In Flanders Fields' (first published on 6 December 1915), the antecedent of Walter Blythe's 'The Piper.' (This early allusion to 'In Flanders Fields' may indicate that Montgomery was planning, in 1916, to take the Blythe family through the war itself, using McCrae's poem as a recurring symbol in future volumes.) Leslie's reasons for supporting Gilbert's interference, dreadful to herself though its potential consequences are, seem an instructive statement of the North American view of intervention in European war, written as *Anne's House of Dreams* was with Canada in the war on Britain's side and the United States still out. This said, the First World War impinged on *Anne of the Island* for the writing of thirty chapters or less; neither that book nor *Anne's House of Dreams* straddled a long period of wartime in the making, however cataclysmic those first months.

Rainbow Valley, on the other hand, was written from 19 January 1917 to 24 December 1918, by far the longest wartime span—approximately 660 days (the armistice coming on 11 November 1918)—and as such must surely reflect the impact of the war on the ordinary processes of life. To say this is not to ignore the fact that *Rainbow Valley* is given the specific task of showing wartime's youthful heroes preparing for a life of sacrifice that awaits them; they do not know of this preparation, but the reader does. Any adult reader of *Rainbow Valley* when it was published just after the war's end must surely have deduced that Jem and Jerry Meredith would volunteer and fight, and probably that Walter would be killed.⁷ Walter's visions of the Piper directly prefigure his reluctance to volunteer and his eventual decision to enlist. The growing authoritarianism of Jerry in particular and Jem to a lesser extent is both witness and prophecy to the rise of a Canadian officer class; Jerry's dragooning of his own siblings into general fast, and a vigil in the rain for Carl, results in illness for Una and near-death for Carl, an all too accurate symbol of the ludicrous and worthless sacrifices officers demanded of their men, frequently to no military purpose beyond some ideal of discipline, or image, or *esprit de corps*. Officers in the armed forces of all belligerent countries sacrificed many lives in ill-judged strategy and tactics. But whether Montgomery's Jerry was intentionally or unwittingly used to symbolize this or nor, she knew the value of her work as witness to the militarization of Canadian society and did that work well. God help the recruit who served under the real-life versions of Jerry Meredith, who drives his brother to double pneumonia three chapters after he has starved his sister into unconsciousness. When his brother is dying, Jerry, 'wild with remorse, refused to budge from the floor of the hall outside Carl's door' (*RV* 205), thus exacerbating the problems of nursing the patient; self-indulgent interference with medical attention for the troops was yet another way in which officers could keep themselves in the limelight and their troops at risk. Jem Blythe plays the role of the general behind the lines who formulates the imbecile strategies to start with—it is he who devises the regime of self-accusation and punishment ('The Good Conduct Club') that proves so dangerous to the mental and physical health of the Meredith children. But if Jerry flings himself into subsequent starring roles of self-reproach, Jem shows not the faintest trace of responsibility for inaugurating such a dangerous policy. At the end of the book he is

lusting to be 'a great, triumphant general. I'd give *everything* to see a big battle' (*RV* 224). And *everyone* too, no doubt. It might be a vision of the youth of Field-Marshal Douglas Haig.

Conclusions of this kind require vigilance regarding possible confusion of pre-war and wartime phenomena, of observation *versus* derivation. Canadian literature is perpetually open to influence from the United States and the United Kingdom, conscious and unconscious, positive and negative. Montgomery probably owed more to the United States than to Great Britain in originally studying the form in female children's literature. The historian must be careful that what seems observation of things Canadian is not derivation from things North American. The forceful cultural, political, and international divergence of Canada and the United States, strongly exacerbated and in some respects inaugurated by the First World War (especially during U.S. neutrality), would have thrown Montgomery more directly back on British models, especially when these house Canadian perceptions of their own.

Rainbow Valley, in particular, seems to reflect British literature for children. But much of this as available in Canada would be immediately pre-war; and what might be seen as militarization born of the First World War could be the more leisured recycling of imperial patterns of children's fiction with special reference to the Boer War. For Jem and Jerry this does not matter; the characters are sketched too lightly, and their activities are too obviously local, particularistic, and manse-related to owe much to British conventions. The self-punitive feature may certainly be Scottish, but what is important is that this sort of thing surfaces in Montgomery's wartime writing, irrespective of its alleged time of happening being pre-war. For that matter, *Rainbow Valley* suggests a much more obsessively censorious adult community than is present in most of Montgomery's locations. There is always a thin line between criticism—frequently carping—and censure, but censure clearly takes over in *Rainbow Valley*. No doubt this stems from Montgomery's sensitivity as a minister's wife, aware of her manse being under public scrutiny and its incumbents theoretically under danger of dismissal by the community (whether formally, or informally, by congregational decline, financial decrease, and so forth). But the war evidently increased mutual social criticism and censure in Canada and moved it from a way of life into an agenda for conformity.

Walter's Altar

The most dramatic impact of war on Montgomery's characters is obviously the case of Walter Blythe, emblematic of Canadian youthful sacrifice in *Rilla of Ingleside* and overshadowed throughout *Rainbow Valley* with that inevitable destruction. Walter's fate in *Rilla* is impressive in its honest acknowledgement of Canadian cruelty to persons of conscience in wartime—as well as idealism and sacrifice. *Rilla of Ingleside*—and only *Rilla of Ingleside*—makes posterity understand why the most popular poem of the First World War should have been the work of a Scots-Canadian. As literature, 'In Flanders Fields' cannot compete with the works of Rosenberg, Owen and Sassoon, and others; but they cannot compete with it as the perennial popular lament, perhaps the most popular latter-day bardic lament to haunt our century. John McCrae died (of pneumonia in military hospital in France) on 27 January, 1918. Even if McCrae was in Montgomery's mind for his death as

well as his poem, Walter had no such passive fate: representing Canada's war dead, he had to die by the violence he had hated yet adopted.

The *Rilla of Ingleside* Walter remarkably combines both the idealized Canadian war bard dying among his countrymen (as his ancestral bards died among their clansmen) and the sensitive artist in a crass, conformist, crusading climate, thus combining both realism and romanticism. The *Rainbow Valley* Walter is much more disturbing and, initially, much more contrived. Although he plays a much fuller part in *Rainbow Valley* than any of his siblings, he has but a few scenes centre-stage and still fewer where we see things through his mind. Montgomery had written some stories from boys' standpoints, and in portraying imaginative boys, particularly Paul Irving in *Anne of Avonlea*, she succeeds best with them as male Annes. Walter has some of Anne, but he is a much more introverted figure.

Montgomery uses the very popular convention of pre-war British stories whereby the 'muff' or 'duffer' proves to be of even more sterling stuff than the associates who taunt him. P.G. Wodehouse satirized the 'Not Really a Duffer' type in his last school story, *Mike* (1909; ch. 40), but unlike him, Montgomery had no interest in defying and deriding the 'coward' genre conventions at this juncture. She had the same purpose as so many of his immediately pre-war colleagues; the boy reader, usually less athletic and foolhardy than his Philistine fellows, would be encouraged to discover stories of supposed cowards proving heroes whence he might prove himself instead of shrinking from armed service; the girl reader might learn similar career lessons but above all must encourage boys to prove themselves heroes even when others called them cowards. Even the most unpromising prospects for future cannon-fodder required the instilment of confidence. Future wars were expected by pre-1914 scribes for children, but it was assumed they would be fought by volunteer armies, especially among the potential officer class for whom these authors wrote. In one respect the stories were usually cowardly themselves; they failed to show an actual human coward overcoming fear, merely an apparent coward gaining self-confidence.

Walter is a sophisticated case, in that he is an aesthete revolted by pain, suffering, and squalor, even by vituperation. This last is certainly exacerbated by resentment at feminization, when Walter's school colleagues taunt him with the name 'Miss Walter.' But he finally challenges Dan Reese to fight, as vengeance for the charge that Anne 'writes lies' (ignoring the possible compliment to her powers as a creative artist) and that Faith is a pig-girl and a rooster-girl. It seems important that Walter could avoid combat, given the truth of the insults, but that once he decides to fight he will not temporize, however justly.⁸ Dan compounds the insults by promising to 'smash [his] sissy face' (*RV* 121). Montgomery grants Walter verbal retaliation in one particular; he calls Dan 'a coincidence' (*RV* 120). This is charming self-indulgence; accusation of resort to coincidence was a particularly rude term of critical derision against popular authors of fiction, especially in this period.⁹

But Montgomery's primary motive was to inspire the courage of her Canadian readers for an actual war (who knew how long it would last?), where her exemplars had merely encouraged theirs for a potential one. By showing Walter's terror on the night before the fight—'Would it hurt much? He was terribly afraid that it would hurt. And would he be defeated and shamed?' (*RV* 122)—Montgomery greatly improves on her sources by seriously addressing the psychology of fear (within limits—Montgomery could not, after all, discuss what her beloved Macaulay

describes as the ‘knees’ being ‘loosened with dismay’). In its nature it is closer to the realism of writing during the First World War than to the pump-priming of heroics before it. But what actually happens at the fight reads like a cross between Roman war-fever and homicidal mania; it is a kind of literary assurance to the fearful that when the challenge comes they will be appropriately insane. Dan strikes Walter: ‘Walter reeled a little. The pain of the blow tingled all through his sensitive frame for a moment. Then he felt pain no longer. Something, such as he had never experienced before, seemed to roll over him like a flood. His face flushed crimson, his eyes burned like flame. The scholars of Glen St Mary school had never dreamed that “Miss Walter” could look like that. He hurled himself forward and closed on Dan like a young wild cat.’ The scene is inspired partly by Macaulay’s “Horatius,” after Astur wounds Horatius:

He reeled, and on Herminius
He leaned one breathing-space;
Then like a wild cat mad with wounds,
Sprang right at Astur’s face.

The fight’s continuation may derive from another quarter: ‘There were no particular rules in the fights of the Glen school boys. It was catch-as-catch can, and get your blows in anyhow. Walter fought with a savage fury and a joy in the struggle against which Dan could not hold his ground. It was all over very speedily. Walter had no clear consciousness of what he was doing until suddenly the red mist cleared from his sight and he found himself kneeling on the body of the prostrate Dan whose nose—oh, horror!—was spouting blood.’ George Bernard Shaw’s new work, *Androcles and the Lion*, was published in the September 1914 issue of *Everybody’s* magazine.¹⁰ In this play, Ferrovius, the converted Roman strong man ‘whose sensibilities are keen and violent to the verge of madness,’ is non-combatant because of his Christian faith but remains fearful that ‘the warrior’s faith, the faith in fighting’ (Act 2) will overwhelm his vow to turn the other cheek. When he and his fellow Christians are driven into the arena, the frenzied Ferrovius kills, afterwards crying, ‘there was blood behind my eyes, and there’s blood on my sword. What does that mean?’ (Act 2). Shaw sees the fate of Ferrovius as Mars triumphing over Jesus. Montgomery had no intention of allowing Christian scruples to come in the way of the god of battles, and Walter, leaving the field of slaughter, meets the Reverend John Meredith, who assures him that he was justified in avenging insulted ‘womenkind’. If Montgomery was inspired by *Androcles and the Lion* it was a fascinating case of the perversion of a source’s message.

Rainbow Valley also confronts cowardice and its replacement courage on the part of girls, specifically Faith and Una Meredith. Faith is the straightforward one, trying to recruit Norman Douglas to offset financial losses to her father’s church. It is superficially a rerun of Anne’s initial two interviews with Mr Harrison but has a harder and deeper psychology: ‘Lacking her crimson cheeks she seemed meek and even insignificant. She looked apologetic and afraid, and the bully in Norman Douglas’ heart stirred’ (RV 122). This is a sharp reversal of another quotation of military interest but anti-war authorship, John Greenleaf Whittier’s ‘Barbara Frietchie.’ When ninety-year-old Barbara shakes the Stars and Stripes over the heads

of the Confederate forces marching in the street below her house and tells them to shoot her but spare the flag, Stonewall Jackson is moved.

The nobler nature within him stirred
To life at the woman's deed and word.

Montgomery produces the converse. It is not until Faith attacks Douglas with a violence quite unparalleled elsewhere in the saga that he is brought round to her: 'I am not afraid of you. You are a rude, unjust, tyrannical, disagreeable old man. Susan says you are sure o go to hell, and I was sorry for you, but I am not now. Your wife never had a new hat for ten years—no wonder she died. I am going to make faces as you whenever I see you after this. Every time I am behind you you will know what is happening. Father has a picture of the devil in a book in his study, and I mean to go home and write your name under it. You are an old vampire and I hope you'll have the Scotch fiddle!' (RV 114-15). This conquers Norman Douglas. It is symbolic that the only two characters who appreciate the menace of the Kaiser are bullies themselves: Norman Douglas and Ellen West. It is also significant that they want to be defeated. Montgomery was too simple in the ways of international diplomacy to realize the Kaiser was actually in the German peace faction, but she seems unconsciously to have picked up on the point. Consciously, she was as hang-the-Kaiser as anyone. Una has to make her self-conquests over fear to confront people whom, with reservations, she likes, but who have the potential to cause her injury: Mrs Marshall Elliott, to get her to adopt Mary Vance although she might whip up further public hostility to the Merediths, and Rosemary West, who might prove to be a cruel step-mother.

The wartime lessons are simple enough. War demands that if necessary, women face hostile criticisms for their outspoken demands on behalf of the needs of the war. The war effort may leave women vulnerable to the accusation that their behaviour is unfeminine, but they must not be distracted from their primary targets by opposition of that kind. The war requires alliances with what seem censorious or contemptuous seniors or superiors. It may mean the sacrifice of valued freedoms for the duration of the conflict; Canada has to curb its increasing independence from Mother England and accept more stringent control, even if it makes for a kind of Stepmother England.¹¹

Mary Vance: The Impact of War on Montgomery's Fiction

The most drastic assertion in *Rainbow Valley* of the changes wrought by war is the violence done not only to the *Anne* genre but to the whole tradition of orphans in Montgomery's work. The story of Mary Vance seems a deliberate violation of almost all the *Anne* conventions, as though war demanded a break with the pretty literary past. Mary Vance is an anti-Anne, a Mary v Anne (easily handwritten as 'Mary Vance').¹² *Anne of the Island* gives us our fullest glimpse of Anne's parents, and the reader is assured as to their devotion to each other, their child, and their profession. Mary Vance is acknowledged to be from the same orphan asylum as Anne, but:

'I was two years in the asylum. I was put there when I was six. My ma had hung herself and my pa had cut his throat.'

'Holy cats! Why?' asked Jerry.

'Booze,' said Mary laconically.

'And you've no relations?'

'Not a darn one that I know of. Must have had some once, though. I was called after half a dozen of them. My full name is Mary Martha Lucilla Moore Ball Vance. Can you beat that? My grandfather was a rich man. I'll bet he was richer than *your* grandfather. But pa drunk it up and ma, she did her part. *They* used to beat me, too. Laws, I've been licked so much I kind of like it.' (RV 33)

This was very strong meat for Montgomery's infant readers, however desirable warnings against drink might seem.¹³ Prohibition legislation in both Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island had preceded the war, but its enforcement was heavily tightened up in wartime; by the time of writing and, indeed, setting *Rainbow Valley*, Montgomery had an argument for making her youthful readers propagandists against liquor, and she was evidently prepared to use war feeling on the question to justify propaganda without gloves.

Yet the violence goes well beyond the occasion. One has the sense of Montgomery enjoying the mandate war had given her to shatter her own delicate conventions. Walter is not alone in being forced to confront the ugly. Little bourgeois children can no longer have their imaginary playmates limited in their misfortunes. Anne tells Marilla in the fifth chapter of *Anne of Green Gables* that Mrs Thomas 'had a drunken husband,' but we learn no more of him until he fell under a train, presumably with the assistance of alcohol; Marilla notes that Anne's had been 'a starved, unloved life [...] a life of drudgery and poverty and neglect; for Marilla was shrewd enough to read between the lines of Anne's history and divine the truth' (49). There is no reading between the lines for the reader who meets Mary Vance, as far as the suicides, the booze, and the child-beatings are concerned.

The revolutionary impact of war on the *Anne* genre becomes almost cruel in its reversal of the convention when Mary Vance is adopted by Miss Cornelia, and is promptly reformed into an atrocious little gossip, snob, and general harbinger of doom. Miss Cornelia was a highly entertaining character in *Anne's House of Dreams*; in *Rainbow Valley* she is revealed as a nasty, abrasive, censorious trouble-monger occasionally silenced by Anne (whose own kind thoughts for the young manse children are never converted into practical assistance). Mary Vance enters her new world of security and prosperity, and promptly produces a junior version of its endless carping. The book is an almost openly contemptuous protest at the community's incessant backbiting of the manse children, when no one in the community would think of going down to the manse and doing a hand's turn to clean the place, supervise the family diet, watch over the health of its members, and make new clothes for the children. If Anne or Miss Cornelia had anything constructive to add to their observations, they could intervene in the cause of the motherless Merediths' well-being. But they will not—Anne possibly because of the dangers to the doctor's practice and Miss Cornelia because she has built her feminism on negative principles. Miss Cornelia's bluff is called by Una to the extent of making her adopt Mary Vance; but the effect is to make Mary Vance the repository and deployer of all the vicious lynch-mob responses to the family who saved her from starvation and return to the slave-auctioning orphanage. It is as though Mary Vance's conformity to Miss Cornelia's world is mockingly telling us what would have happened to Anne had she swallowed the value system of Marilla and Mrs Rachel

Lynde without question or alternative. Montgomery frequently makes gossip highly entertaining; the war seems to have encouraged her to show its aridity and destructiveness. Even nature grows more hostile in *Rainbow Valley*: 'the little path was shadowy and narrow. Trees crowded over it, and trees are never quite so friendly to human beings after night fall as they are in daylight. They wrap themselves away from us. They whisper and plot furtively. If they reach out a hand to us it has a hostile, tentative touch. People walking amid trees after night always draw close together instinctively and involuntarily, making an alliance, physical and mental, against certain alien powers around them' (*RV* 89). The trees become a metaphor for the supposedly benevolent community.

Trees—'forests ancient as the hills'—are an integral part of the heaven Walter Blythe imagines after reading Coleridge's description of the garden surrounding Kubla Khan's 'stately pleasure dome.' In keeping with that poem's ominous predictions, Walter has visions of a Piper—drawn partly from Montgomery's Scottish ancestral voice—which would be recognized by adult readers of *Rainbow Valley* as 'prophesying war'. Walter has four visions of the Piper, two in *Rainbow Valley* and two in *Rilla of Ingleside*, the final one just hours before his death when he is piped 'west'. His siblings fail to understand the import of these visions; Di associates the Piper with the wonderful things that may await the children who follow; Jem, hypnotized by the 'brave days of old' (*RV* 224) sees but the glorious heroism of legend.¹⁴

The only child who recognizes the terror in Walter's visions is Mary Vance. Each time the Piper comes, it is Mary whose response captures the full import: first she admonishes him by saying 'You give me the creeps. Do you want to set me bawling?' (*RV* 55); then she protests 'I hate that old piper of yours' (*RV* 225). When news of war hits Glen St Mary in *Rilla of Ingleside*, Walter again sees the Piper, a vision prompted by Mary's question, 'What does it matter if there's going to be a war over there in Europe? I'm sure it doesn't concern us' (*RI* 33). And again Mary 'felt uncomfortable,' although her socialization into the adopting community is by now so complete that she can utter only 'Fancy now!' to those fears. That Mary Vance is the sole character who understands what Walter's visions signify (often more than Walter himself does) is surely a result of her personal experience of terror and violence. (Adults do not witness Walter's visions or, it would seem, listen to any talk of them.) The manse children, although they know grief, have no comparable experience. The children of Ingleside at this stage belong with their mother in the pre-war still waters (Di specifically links her interpretation of the Piper to her mother's [*RV* 55]). But Mary Vance is scarred and therefore scared. Ultimately, Mary seems the necessary, if not altogether welcome or wanted, link between the romantic (and untruthful) past and the violent upheaval of the future.

Conclusion

Elizabeth Epperly has written that *Rainbow Valley* is imprinted with 'love of Canada and pride in the maple leaf'. The *maple* grove is the place next to Rainbow Valley (itself the heaven of Mary Vance's imagination) that the children love most. But Canada had changed since Marilla Cuthbert declared her preference for a Canadian-born orphan and L.M. Montgomery's wartime novels reflect this dramatic change. The First World War brought large-scale violence into Canadian history and culture

for the first time. Unlike in the histories of the countries of origin for Canada's immigrant population and of the United States, war or frontier violence had not played a major role in the forging of national identity in Canada—in as much as one had been created—during settler history; this fact was especially true for Prince Edward Island, where even nature (consistently portrayed as the 'enemy' in Canadian fiction) was devoid of much of its hostility.

From Anne's 'Book of Revelation' in *Anne of the Island*, where the 'air throbbed with the thunderous crash of billows on the distant shore' (AI 235),¹⁵ through the tragic and death-filled history of Leslie Moore in *Anne's House of Dreams*, to the mania of Walter's fight with Dan Reese and the horror of Mary Vance's childhood in *Rainbow Valley*, Montgomery was widening the parameters of her fiction to include the new reality and the new Canada that war had created. That *Anne's House of Dreams* turns on a plot where a woman shares board, and may—for all that we are ever told—have shared bed, for fourteen years with a man she believes to be her husband but who is not, shows the extent to which war was breaking fictional constraints and how far Montgomery's work had moved from *Green Gables*.

To import the language of Henry F. May, the First World War brought the end if Canadian innocence: Montgomery's revisionist history of the Hopetown orphan is one example of this dramatic change; the possibility of increased suffering for Leslie Moore if Dick is restored to his former and hideous self is another. With war came the death of innocence and the death of innocents; conversely, and with an optimism the innocent Anne of *Green Gables* would have admired, Montgomery also encodes in the pain of this 'death-grapple' the birthpangs delivering a new country and a new art.

NOTES

We are grateful to Mary H. Rubio and Elizabeth R. Epperly for their help with this work. This essay is reproduced here as an appendix with kind permission of Owen Dudley Edwards.

¹ Despite this first chapter reference to Canada, Montgomery joked in her journal, 'Geography is not a strong point with some critics.' She went on to list various locations identified as the setting for her books: 'The scene is laid in Nova Scotia'; 'A girl adopted into a New England family'; 'rural life in New England'; 'The country of the novel is New Brunswick'; 'This detached portion of land near Newfoundland'; 'A story of life in a Breton fishing village'; 'The scene is laid in Scotland'; 'A play of American farm life'; *Western Canada* is a charming setting for this story'; 'a story of American girlhood.' (1 March 1930)

² These dates are calculated from an event in *Anne's House of Dreams*, although this 1869 birth-date for Anne contradicts that arrived at by using the dates of actual events given in *Rilla of Ingleside*. *Anne of Green Gables* is not specifically dated: some events place the setting in the 1880s, others in the 1890s. After initially refusing the 1864 Quebec Resolutions for Confederation, a decision which had widespread public support, Prince Edward Island joined the Dominion in 1873, a reversal due in large part to the costly program of railway building in the colony. Marilla's patriotism may partially result from the distance between the novel's time of setting and composition, but it also shows her to be mildly more broad-minded than Mrs Rachel, who distrusts anything from off-Island, including, of course, Anne herself.

³ Changing her loyalties from Liberal to Conservative in the election of 1917 and abandoning her long-held admiration for Sir Wilfrid Laurier, Montgomery wrote to Weber 'I am now forced to believe that he had failed his country and lined himself up with Catholic Quebec and Bourassa' (25 Nov. 1917). This anti-Catholicism is repeated in a letter written to Weber between 25 September

and 22 October 1922: 'You say that you do not fear a Quebec regime. I wish I could share your optimism. I know what the Catholics on P. E. Island are and they get their inspiration from Quebec.' Montgomery draws a strange allegiance between the Catholics of PEI, many of whom shared her Scottish heritage, and the French Canadians of Quebec. (In *Rilla of Ingleside*, Susan Baker makes a disparaging comment about the Pope's proposals for peace.)

⁴ Unpublished letter to Ephraim Weber, 12 Jan. 1916. Weber was at this time living in Chicago, Illinois; Montgomery continued to argue with him about the war into the 1920s.

⁵ In a journal entry of 27 August 1919 (SJ 2: 339-40), Montgomery quoted an article on Canadian literature she had written in 1910: 'I do not think our literature is an expression of our national life as a whole. I think this is because we have only very recently—as time goes in the making of nations—had any real national life. Canada is only just finding herself. She has not yet fused her varying elements into a harmonious whole. Perhaps she will not do so until they are welded together by some great crisis of storm and stress. That is when a real national literature will be born. I do not believe that the great Canadian novel or poem will ever be written until we have some kind of baptism by fire to purge away all our petty superficialities and lay bare the primal passions of humanity.' Montgomery raised the question of the literary effects of the war in her letters to both Weber (25 Nov. 1917) and George Boyd MacMillan (16 Oct. 1914).

⁶ '*Rilla of Ingleside* came today—my eleventh book! It looks very well. I don't suppose it will be much of a success, for the public are said to be sick of anything connected with the war. But at least I did my best to reflect the life we lived in Canada during those four years. It is dedicated to Frede's memory. I wish she could have read it. It is the first one I have written with a purpose' (SJ 3: 17).

⁷ Despite the references to the First World War in *Rainbow Valley*, few contemporary reviews mention this background. These reviews (preserved in Montgomery's clipping scrapbooks) are largely positive; one reviewer speculates that his/her favourable opinion is 'perhaps [...] because [Montgomery] has succeeded in keeping the excellent Anne almost entirely out of it, and has dealt with wicked people' (Review by 'I.W.L.', *Evening Transcript* [Boston], 1919).

⁸ They are truthful insults in that Faith has ridden a pig, and forced Walter to do so, and her pet is a rooster.

⁹ 'Coincidence' was surely a term of critical derision that could have been levelled at the Dick/George Moore plot in *Anne's House of Dreams*. Given that Anne's fictional writing is otherwise of little account in the books about her after *Anne of the Island*, it seems possible Montgomery was mentally allowing Walter to fight one of her own ruder reviewers.

¹⁰ Montgomery was certainly familiar with this magazine: her short story, 'The Quarantine at Alexander Abraham's' was published in the April 1907 issue of *Everybody's* and she made it clear in a letter to George Boyd MacMillan that she considered this acceptance a literary triumph (unpublished letter date 29 Nov. 1906). Montgomery owned several volumes of G.B. Shaw's plays (now held in the University of Guelph's collections), including *Androcles and the Lion*.

¹¹ Arguably, the war had the reverse effect, Prime Minister Borden gaining admission to the Imperial Cabinet and winning higher consultative status than ever before, but the magnitude of this gain was evident only to a few.

¹² The name may have its source in the poem 'Mary Vance' by Norman Gale: see his *Collected Poems* (1914). See also Bailey's examination of Mary Vance as 'Anne's hoydenish double' (CCL 55).

¹³ Anne accidentally intoxicates Diana in *Anne of Green Gables* and is ostracized by Mrs Barry in consequence until she saves her younger daughter from a providential attack of croup (echoed in *Rilla of Ingleside* when Mary Vance, disliked by Rilla, saves Rilla's young protégé Jims [202]). But Montgomery's telling of the story goes against Mrs Barry, and the incident draws Marilla still closer to Anne.

¹⁴ As we have noted, the language of Dan Reese and Walter's fight is partly influenced by 'Horatius,' yet the mania in evidence is far removed from the romanticized 'brave days' and as such is part of the complex portrait of chivalric codes in *Rainbow Valley*. (For a discussion of chivalry in this novel see Epperly, 'Chivalry and Romance'.)

¹⁵ This is an echo of Montgomery's statement that the war 'seemed to break over the world like a thundercloud' (*My Dear* 71).